



International Labour Organization

iTrack

Evaluation

ILO EVALUATION

- **Evaluation Title:** [Employment Creation for Youth to Build Sustainable Peace in The Gambia](#)

- ILO TC/SYMBOL: [GAM/18/01/JPN](#)
- Type of Evaluation : [Final](#)
- Country(ies) : [The Gambia](#)
- Date of the evaluation: [4 October 2019](#)
- Name of consultant(s): [Emil Krstanovski, ILO Internal evaluator](#)
- Indication of the main P&B(s) that have been assessed by the evaluation: [Outcome 1](#)
- Indication of the main SDG(s) assessed by the evaluation: [SDG 8 and SDG 5](#)
- ILO Administrative Office: [ILO Country Office for Senegal, Cabo Verde, the Gambia, Guinea and Guinea-Bissau](#)
- ILO Technical Backstopping Office: [ILO Country Office for Senegal, Cabo Verde, the Gambia, Guinea and Guinea-Bissau](#)
- Date project ends: [30 September 2019](#)
- Donor: country and budget US\$ [Japan; 1mil USD](#)
- Evaluation Manager: [Ricardo Furman](#)
- Key Words: [employment](#) [intensive investment](#); [young women and men](#); [reconstruction](#); [skills](#); [OSH](#); [entrepreneurship](#); [Do-Nou technology](#); [The Gambia](#)

This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the Regional Evaluation Officer.

Table of Contents

LIST OF ACRONYMS	4
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
1. INTRODUCTION.....	16
2. BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT	16
2.1. The Gambia context.....	16
2.2. Gambia commitment to Decent Work agenda	17
2.2.1. Decent Work Country Programme	17
2.2.2. International Labour Standards.....	17
2.3. Project background	17
2.3.1. Project objectives	18
2.3.2. Project beneficiaries.....	19
3. EVALUATION BACKGROUND	19
3.1 Evaluation objectives	19
3.2. Scope and clients of evaluation	19
4. EVALUATION APPROACH, METHODOLOGY AND METHODLOGICAL LIMITATIONS	20
4.1. Evaluation criteria and questions.....	21
5. FINDINGS	23
5.1 Relevance and Strategic Fit.....	23
5.2. Validity of design.....	25
5.3 Project effectiveness.....	27
5.4 Efficiency and management arrangements	36
5.5 Impact orientation and sustainability	37
Gender equality assessment	38
6. CONCLUSIONS	39
7. LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES	40
7.1 Lessons learned	40
7.2 Good practices.....	41
8. RECOMMENDATIONS.....	41
ANNEX 1 Terms of reference for the evaluation.....	44
ANNEX 2 Data collection worksheet	57
ANNEX 3 Documents reviewed	61
ANNEX 4 List of the people interviewed.....	61
ANNEX 5 Photos of sings posts at construction sites.....	63

ANNEX 6 Photos Sami Karantaba.....	64
ANNEX 7 Photos Kotu	66
ANNEX 8 Photos Gunjur	68
ANNEX 9 Lesson Learned	69
Annex 10 Good Practice	71

LIST OF ACRONYMS

DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
DWT/CO	Decent Work Team and Country Office
EIIP	Employment Intensive Investment Program
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GTTI	Gambian Technical Training Institute
HQ	Headquarters
ILO	International Labour Organization
LDC	Least Developed Country
MOTIE	Ministry of Trade, Industry, Regional Integration and Employment
NDP	National Development Plan
NRA	National Road Authority
OSH	Occupational safety and health
RO	Regional office
SGD	Sustainable Development Goal
SIYB	Start and Improve Your Business
TOR	Terms of Reference
ToT	Training of Trainers
UN	United Nations
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

INTRODUCTION

The final evaluation of Project “Employment Creation for Youth to Build Sustainable Peace in The Gambia“ was carried out by Emil Krstanovski, ILO internal evaluator. The evaluation was managed by Ricardo Furman, Senior monitoring and Evaluation Officer in the ILO RO-Africa.

BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT

The Gambia is an ILO member since 29 May 1995. It has ratified only nine ILO conventions, including the eight fundamental conventions and one technical Convention, which will enter into force on 09 November 2019 (Maritime Labour Convention).

Project background and objectives

The project aimed at building sustainable peace by creating employment opportunities for young women and men in infrastructure construction works, supported by skills training and entrepreneurship support.

The project gave a specific focus on employment creation in infrastructure construction works, which can provide a large number of employment opportunities immediately for both skilled and unskilled people. The project also ensured to select infrastructures that directly contribute to the agriculture, tourism, or fishery sector, which are the drivers of the economic growth, and to promote the use of locally available materials. It also considered making the project impact sustainable by not only offering employment opportunities to respond to this urgent need but also providing skills training and entrepreneurship support. Furthermore, the project underlines creating decent employment by promoting occupational safety and health (OSH) as well as equality and mutual understanding through encouraging the inclusiveness of returnees and women.

Evaluation purpose

The overall purpose of this final evaluation is to promote accountability and strengthen learning among the ILO and key stakeholders.

The evaluation used a mixed methods approach (e.g. document analysis, interviews, focus groups, and direct observations) to ensure the validity and reliability of the findings. In addition, it used a participatory approach by involving ILO key stakeholders such as beneficiaries, ILO tripartite constituents, ILO staff and strategic partners. The interviews (face-to-face and through Skype) were carried out in September and October 2019. The mission to The Gambia took place in September 2019 and included 14 interviews with the local stakeholders, 2 focus group discussions and 3 field visits to the construction sites in Kotu (4.09.2019) , Gunjur (10.09.2019) and Sami Karantaba (11.09.2019).

The evaluation was carried out in adherence to the ILO’s policy guidelines for results-based evaluation.

The evaluation applied the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Development Assistance Committee (DAC) evaluation criteria, namely, the relevance of the project to needs, the validity and coherence of the project design, the project's efficiency and effectiveness, the impact of the results and the potential for sustainability.

FINDINGS

Relevance and Strategic Fit

The project is entirely relevant to the Government development goals and it directly contributes to the achievement of The Gambia National Development Plan (NDP) 2018-2021, especially the priorities on empowering youth and investing in people; building infrastructure and modernizing agriculture, agribusiness and fisheries; and making private sector engine of growth and job creation. Project addressed the need of the Gambian people by providing income, delivering training to increase their employability, and supported country development by construction work in support of tourism, fisheries and agriculture sector. It involved young people, including women, persons with disabilities and returnees as vulnerable groups.

Project activities contributed to the Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 8: “Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all”, by creating job opportunities and decent working conditions for the youth. The project action was especially focused on results contributing to the target 8.6 to “substantially reduce the proportion of youth not in employment, education or training”, target 8.8 “protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for all workers, including migrant workers, in particular women migrants, and those in precarious employment”. Additionally, the project contributed to SDG 10: “Reduce inequality within and among countries”; and to SDG 5: “Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls”, by planning and effectively ensuring active and significant participation of young women in all the trainings and in the infrastructure works.

The project objectives and activities fit in the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2017 -2021 and especially contribute to the UNDAF Strategic Result 2 on Human Capital Development and its Outcome 2.5 “Women and youth empowerment promoted to reduce gender disparities, gender-based violence, and access to decent employment opportunities and ensure effective participation in national development.

The project was developed and implemented in line with the commitments under the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) 2015-2017 (extended to 2018), especially under the Priority Area 1: Decent and productive Employment for Sustainable Growth and Poverty Reduction.

Validity of design

Evaluation found that some of the constituents are not satisfied with the consultation process during the project design phase and that they were included only when the project document was in its final stage, limiting their opportunities to influence it. However, all the constituents expressed satisfaction with their involvement during the project implementation.

The project has a clear focus on the creation of immediate job opportunities for young women and men through labour intensive work in the small scale infrastructure, in a combination with the skills training and entrepreneurship support, as the sustainability element of the project. Gender aspect is taken fully into consideration in the project document and there is one key indicator of success directly linked to the percentage of women involved in the programme. Despite the traditional understanding of the role of the women in infrastructure works, the project set a commendable target of 30% for women involved in the programme.

The project's original duration of 12 months was very ambitious and unrealistic, which lead to its extension to 18 months.

The project document included a sustainability strategy, which was reinforced by the exit strategy for young women and men included certification of the young persons engaged in the project, adaptation of the Do-Nou technology and developing of training curriculum by the Gambian Technical Training Institute (GTTI).

The project document elaborates very well the risks and assumptions for the successful implementation of the project, and the project implementation proves that some of them had a critical impact on the project delivery, particularly delay in administrative and financial management, delay in implementation works and incoherent strategies and support with other agencies.

Project effectiveness

The evaluation assessed the extent to which expected outputs and outcomes were achieved, the timely delivery of outputs, as well as the quality and quantity of outputs delivered. The evaluation also assessed the unintended results of the project.

The ILO has successfully applied Employment Intensive Investment approach and has created employment for 397 young women and men (192 women, 35 returnees and 11 persons with disabilities) during the implementation of the labour intensive construction works. Taking into consideration the local needs and the potential impact on the three target economic sectors (agriculture, tourism and fishery), construction and reconstruction works were carried out in the areas of Kotu, Gunjur and Sama Karantaba. These works resulted in a fully reconstructed promenade road and access road in Kotu and fully reconstructed road to fish landing site in Ganjur. Due to the late start, which was the result of delay in contracting of local service provider and subsequent delay in the payment to the contracted company, the construction works on expansion and revitalization farming center in Sami Karantaba faced delay.

The project focus on labour intensive works was coupled with a strong emphasis on the working conditions and building of the preventive culture on OSH. For that, the project worked with stakeholders on the national level, providing tools and knowledge on OSH, which was successfully replicated through training of 397 persons engaged in the construction works in the project. Manual on OSH in small construction sites was developed and published, providing a tool for future construction works, as well as for OSH inspection visits.

The project also contributed to increasing the employability of young women and men by providing them with skills that can be used in the labour market and giving them initial impetus to start their own business. 249 young women and men gained skills in Do-Nou technology and 225 of them on entrepreneurship. Young women and men benefiting from this training established two construction companies, one in Kotu (CODEM) and one in Gunjur (GURRA), which could potentially provide stable employment and income for them.

Overall achievements of the project are:

- 397 young women and men provided with job (192 women, 35 returnees and 11 persons with disabilities), engaged for at least 20 working days.
- 249 young women and men trained on the job training for use of Do-Nou technology for in Kotu and Gunjur (112 women, 10 persons with disabilities, 35 returnees)
- 397 young women and men trained on OSH in Kotu, Gunjur and Sami Karantaba (192 women, 35 returnees and 11 persons with disabilities)
- 225 young women and men trained on entrepreneurship in Kotu and Gunjur (118 women, 25 returnees, 10 persons with disabilities)
- 55 persons (11 women) trained as trainers on OSH
- 60 persons in 9 construction companies received training on OSH
- Reconstructed 2.5 km road in Gunjur
- Reconstructed 1.2 km promenade road and access road in Kotu

According to the project document, the project had 6 key indicators of success. The following table shows the achievement of the project's stated targets.

	INDICATOR	TARGETS	ACHIEVEMENT	Comments
1	Young women and men directly employed in infrastructure construction works for agriculture, fishery, and tourism sectors.	500	397	The indicator corresponds to Outcome 1 of the project. The project reached 79.4% of the planned target.
2	Decent work is promoted through: - OSH manual for construction work, - trainers' training on the	1 OSH Manual 3 ToT on OSH 3 OSH inspections	1 OSH manual 2 ToT 0 OSH inspections 1 Role model construction site	The indicator corresponds to Outcome 2 of the project. The project target was partially reached. It developed OSH manual, 2 out of 3 planned ToT, had 1 role model construction site and did not realize planned inspection visits. Lack

	Occupational Safety and Health (OSH), - OSH inspection at the construction sites - role-model construction site for the Employment-intensive approach and OSH application.	1 role model constructions site		of staff and proper equipment for OSH inspections of the Labour Department was the main reasons for not carrying out the inspection visits as planned with the project.
3	Percentage of Women in the overall number of programme beneficiaries.	30%	48.4%	The indicator corresponds to the overall involvement of the women in the project, under the three outcomes. The project exceeded the target and 48.4% of beneficiaries were women. The project inclusive approach and engaging of the national authorities in the recruitment process for construction works resulted in an almost equal number of women and men on the construction works. The project effectively advertised equal possibilities for employment and skills training, especially for women and returnees. This represents even bigger success because it happened in a sector that is traditionally dominated by male workers.
4	Percentage of Returnees, migrants and refugees in the overall number of beneficiaries.	20%	8.8%	The indicator corresponds to the overall involvement of the returnees, migrants, and refugees in the project, under the three outcomes. The project did not reach the target, as only 8.8 % of the beneficiaries were returnees, migrants and refugees. Lack of reliable data on returnees and failure to establish the planned partnership with IOM on identifying returnees resulted in a lower number of returnees engaged in the project activities.

5	The training module for construction works is developed and trainers training is organized.	1 training module 1 ToT	Training module on Do-Nou adapted and 4 Gambian engineers trained as trainers	The indicator corresponds to Outcome 2. The project target was fully reached. Do-Nou training module was adapted by the contracted company for construction works in Kotu and Gunjur and 4 Gambian engineers who were trained as trainers provided training and supervised the work of 249 young women and men engaged in Kotu and Gunjur.
6	There is an extension of entrepreneurship support in the construction sector after given contributions.			Not applicable as it is not clear what is the target and what are the measurement criteria.

The project followed all the rules for donor visibility and the donor was visible on all the products of the project, as reported by all the beneficiaries.

The construction works were fully completed in Kotu (promenade road) and Gunjur (road to fish landing site), while the reconstruction of the farming center in Sami Karantaba was not completed.

Unintended results: Benefiting from the skills acquired and inspired by the entrepreneurship training, two construction companies were established by young women and men, including returnees and persons with disabilities. The companies are a model of inclusiveness, with women as Executive Directors.

Efficiency and management arrangements

The Project was under the overall guidance of the project steering committee (PSC), which comprises of the ILO representatives and 11 members from the national stakeholders. Unusually for the ILO, the PSC was not tripartite and did not include members from the trade unions. It was overwhelmingly composed of Government officials. Ten of these members were representative of different state institutions and one of the Gambia Chamber of Commerce and Industry (GCCl).

National project staff was important for the successful implementation of the project activities, but it seems there was not very good coordination between the members of the project team and the Dakar office, causing delays in the support received from the Dakar office. Disbursement of funds and other support functions has not been always timely and delays in payments to the contractors caused delays in the implementation of activities. The national project team did not manage to build an effective relationship with other important actors in the area, like UNOPS and IOM.

The project has mostly delivered in accordance with available funds, but the disbursement level of around 81% on 17 September is an indication that the complete delivery was possible with less funding and the project might have been over-budgeted.

Impact orientation and sustainability

Employment and income provided to the 397 persons were very important to the young women and men, as an immediate answer to their difficult situation in the Gambian labour market. That employment opportunity, although short in duration and unable to provide long term solutions, has offered them job experience and new skills, improving their employability and chances to get a permanent job.

Two companies established by the young persons who benefited from the project show their eagerness to work and earn. They demonstrate the benefits of the training provided in the project. However, their motivation needs to be met with further support, both in terms of capacity building and provided opportunities.

There is a clear impact of the reconstructed Gunjur access road on the increase of fish processed through the fish landing site. Maintaining this road by the national authority after the project end will ensure sustainability of the action taken and can ensure growth in the quantity of the fish processed through this fish landing site.

As reported by the hotel association and birdwatcher association in Kotu, the reconstructed promenade road (together with the access road), will enhance the tourist offer in the Kotu area, by being used for bird watching or walks by the tourists. It was not clear who will maintain the promenade road after the project end and that is very important for the sustainability of the project result.

Farming center, if fully finished and operational, will increase production and productivity using sustainable land and water management practices to address hunger and food security needs; research and development and extension to ensure that farmers have access to the latest technologies, irrigation, seeds, and other inputs to enhance productivity.

Gender equality assessment

Interview data and project figures shows that the project promoted gender equality through fair and equal access to project activities and benefits. In total, 192 women and 205 men got employment on infrastructure works. Having in mind that construction work is a male-dominated sector, these figures represent the big success of the project. Regarding the participation of women in the various trainings, the project also performed very well, with 47% women participants.

The project management and the steering committee didn't have a good gender balance, which was mirrored in the interviews, except in focus group discussions, in which the gender balance was achieved.

CONCLUSIONS

Conclusions have been drawn on the basis of the totality of evidence available to the evaluator.

Relevance and strategic fit

- 1) The project was highly relevant for Gambian youth, in the context of the high unemployment rates, lack of jobs and income and the overall state of fragility.
- 2) The project is fully aligned with the national priorities, set in the NDP 2018-2021 and in line with ILO global mandate, DWCP priorities and UNDAF.

Validity of design

- 3) The project has a clear goal, well defined outcomes, outputs, and activities. Not all indicators of success are well defined.
- 4) Although the consultations during the project design phase did not fully involve the national stakeholders, the project received full support from them during implementation, including from the government, local authorities, trade unions, employers associations and training institutions.
- 5) The project initial duration was not realistic, leading to the extension of 6 months. Prevailing opinion is that the project duration should have been 18 months.
- 6) The project has a well-developed sustainability strategy and clear risk and assumptions assessment. Still, planned mitigation measures were not applied.

Project effectiveness

- 7) The project has provided employment opportunities and training to 397 young women and men,
- 8) The project successfully involve women in all the project activities.
- 9) The involvement of returnees and persons with disabilities is somewhat satisfactory only in the training and construction works in Kotu.
- 10) Labour intensive work on infrastructure and using the Do-Nou technology is very well accepted by the national and local authorities and the local communities.
- 11) The project provided several trainings, but their duration of entrepreneurship training was too short to significantly improve participant's knowledge, rather it was more of a teaser and a general introduction to entrepreneurship.
- 12) Significant emphasis was put on mainstreaming OSH in the project and a significant number of people benefited from OSH training.
- 13) OSH assessment at the construction site in Gunjur proved important for the improvement of the working conditions at the site.
- 14) The project has successfully completed two out of the three infrastructure projects.

Efficiency and management arrangements

- 15) National project staff was important for the successful implementation of the project activities, but it seems there was not very good coordination between the members of the team, causing delays in the support received from the Dakar office.
- 16) Delays in preparation of contracts and payments to the contractors, which ultimately led to delays in payment to the workers engaged in the construction works influenced the delivery of the project activities and cause damage to the ILO reputation.
- 17) The disbursement level was 81% two weeks before the closure of the project and might point to an overbudgeted project.

Impact and sustainability

- 18) The project increased the employability of the engaged persons and with the newly acquired skills and knowledge, and some of them joined forces and established two companies for construction works.
- 19) New technology (Do-Nou) was well presented, adapted and accepted in the Gambia.
- 20) Reconstructed infrastructure improved and contributes to the growth of the local economies.

Gender Equality

- 21) The project adequately promoted gender equality through its programme of activities and monitoring of data.

LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

Lessons learned

Even a well-defined project, with clear direction and aim, should carefully and fully take into account the local situation, in terms of previous presence in the country, synergies with other projects, availability of local providers and local partners. Recruitment of local project staff affects the inception phase of the project when relationships with the local stakeholders are made, local providers are identified and potential allies are identified among the other organizations. Therefore is important to have the local project team since the first month of the project, especially if it is of short duration. In order to avoid problems during project implementation and delays of administrative nature, the country office should establish a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities among the members of the project team and the backstopping office, ensure mutual understanding of the ILO procedures. If that staff hired is working for the ILO for the first time, proper training on ILO procedures and rules should be organized in the first months of their engagement.

Good practices

An example of good practice is the **ILO OSH assessment in the Gunjur construction site, focusing on prevention and providing clear and practical recommendations for the improvement of the working condition**. It proved as a very good tool for immediate action, and the ILO contracted supplier has taken measures to address most of the identified problems. Rigorous follow up to all the recommendations can be an effective way to ensure that preventive measures are taken and that the health and safety of workers engaged in the ILO projects are respected.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation 1: For projects in countries where ILO has no previous or recent experience be careful in planning the timeframe, the budget and the start of the project, including timely recruitment of national project staff.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
DWT CO Dakar	High	Ongoing	Low

Recommendation 2: Deliver induction training on ILO procedures for newly recruited staff

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
DWT CO Dakar	High	Ongoing	Middle

Recommendation 3: Improve the coordination between the ILO DWT/CO office and project team by clearly defining responsibilities and setting clear deadlines for delivery for each member of the team.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
DWT CO Dakar	High	Ongoing	Low

Recommendation 4: Provide more substantial entrepreneurship training as part of the training package that the one provided in this project.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
ILO	Medium	Ongoing	Middle

Recommendations for the stakeholders

Recommendation 5: National institution to develop the certification programme on Do-Nou and certify the persons trained during project implementation

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
Gambian Technical Training Institute	High	Next 6 to 12months	Medium

Recommendation 6: Explore the possibilities for further use of Do-Nou technology throughout the country

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
National Road Agency Ministry of Works and Infrastructure	Medium	Next 6-12 months	Low

Recommendation 7: Maintain the reconstructed roads after the project end.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
National Road Agency Ministry of Works and Infrastructure	High	Ongoing	Middle

Recommendation 8: Support CODEM and GURRA in understanding tender procedures for construction works

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
Ministry of Works and Infrastructure	High	Next 6 months	Low

Recommendation 9: Use the OSH manual for small construction works to train inspectors and during inspection visits

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
Labour Department	High	Ongoing	Low

Recommendation 10: Use EIIP as immediate response to high unemployment rates of unskilled youth

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
MOTIE	High	Ongoing	High

1. INTRODUCTION

The present document contains the report of the Final Evaluation of Project “Employment Creation for Youth to Build Sustainable Peace in The Gambia” carried out by Emil Krstanovski, ILO internal evaluator.

The evaluation was implemented by an ILO staff officer certified by EVAL as internal evaluator and not linked with the project and managed by Ricardo Furman, Senior monitoring and Evaluation Officer in the ILO RO-Africa. The evaluation benefited from tripartite national constituent consultation and feedback, as well as the inputs from the ILO Project team in The Gambia, ILO Decent Work Technical Support Team and Country Office in Dakar, Senegal and ILO staff in HQ in Geneva.

The main purpose of the evaluation is to promote accountability and strengthen learning among the ILO and key stakeholders. The evaluation attempted to contribute to organizational learning by identifying lessons learned and emerging good practices, and by providing recommendations that can inform future ILO projects.

2. BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT

2.1. The Gambia context

The Gambia is the smallest country in continental Africa, located on the West African coast and extends about 500 kilometers inland, with a population density of 225 persons per square kilometer. It is bordered on the North, South and East by the Republic of Senegal and on the West by the Atlantic Ocean. In 2018, Gambia’s population was estimated at 2.3 million people, of which 1.3 million are the age of 15 years and above and the 1 million are the age of 0-14 years¹. Population growth rate is among the highest in the world, estimated around 3% per year. The population primarily comprises of youth due to a high fertility rate and a low life expectancy of 61 years. The average household size is 9.7 persons.

The Gambia is classified as a least developed country (LDC), with a GDP per capita (current USD) of US\$ 712 in 2018². The main sectors driving economic growth are Services, Agriculture and Tourism. Agriculture and fisheries accounted for around 23% of GDP in 2018 and

¹ Gambia Labour Force Survey 2018

² World Bank

provides work for 70% of the labour force. Tourism is Gambia's primary foreign-exchange earner.³

While overall poverty has declined in the last decade, income poverty and household food insecurity are widespread with nearly half of the population 48.6% living below the poverty line. About 40% of people are considered 'working poor'; meaning that their earning capacity and standard of living are inadequate to meet their basic needs.⁴ Poverty is higher in rural areas mainly due to a reliance on agriculture for income (which is beset by limited access to productive assets or other factors resulting in low productivity) and exclusion from economic opportunities and social services.

Overall, unemployment is high, averaging 35.2% of the working-age population. Unemployment is especially pronounced among younger people (41.5 percent) and women and especially in rural areas.⁵

The key long-term development challenges facing The Gambia are related to its undiversified economy, small internal market, limited access to resources, and lack of skills necessary to build effective institutions, high population growth, and lack of private sector job creation.

2.2. Gambia commitment to Decent Work agenda

2.2.1. Decent Work Country Programme

The Gambia is an ILO member since 29 May 1995. The only Decent Work Country Programme was covering the period 2015 -2017 and was extended to 2018. It had three priorities: 1) Decent and productive Employment for Sustainable Growth and Poverty Reduction; 2) Enhanced Social Protection, Health and Safety of Workers at Workplace and Elimination of Child Labour, Particularly in its Worst Form; and 3) Enhanced Socio-economic Governance through Social Dialogue and Tripartism.

2.2.2. International Labour Standards

The Gambia has ratified only nine ILO conventions, including the eight fundamental conventions and one technical Convention, which will enter into force on 09 November 2019 (Maritime Labour Convention).⁶

2.3. Project background

³ UNDAF 2017-2021

⁴ UNDAF 2017-2021

⁵ Gambia Labour Force Survey 2018

⁶ ILO: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:11200:0::NO:11200:P11200_COUNTRY_ID:103226

The project aimed at building sustainable peace by creating employment opportunities for young women and men in infrastructure construction works, supported by skills training and entrepreneurship support.

The Gambia was in urgent need to respond to the political and economic instability triggered by the 2017 political transition, having sustained post-election violence and facing the fear of violent attacks, especially given its porous borders. The political instability has also worsened the economy, which was already in a critical situation under the former regime and with the 2016 Ebola crisis. With insufficient job opportunities in The Gambia, the number of Gambian migrants leaving the country via irregular means has not abated. Human trafficking and smuggling have become a lucrative source of income for organized criminal networks. Against this backdrop, immediate and visible achievements were critical for developing trust among the Gambian public in the new coalition Government and restoring hope for the Gambian youth about their future in The Gambia and thus contributing to the realization of human security in the country.

The project gave a specific focus on employment creation in infrastructure construction works, which can provide a large number of employment opportunities immediately for both skilled and unskilled people. Employment-intensive investments link infrastructure development with employment creation, poverty reduction and local economic and social development. In using local labour and resources, they create much needed employment and income, reduce costs, save foreign currency, and support local industry while increasing the capacity of local institutions. The project also ensured to select infrastructures that directly contribute to the agriculture, tourism, or fishery sector, which are the drivers of the economic growth, and to promote the use of locally available materials. It also considered making the project impact sustainable by not only offering employment opportunities to respond to this urgent need but also providing skills training and entrepreneurship support. Furthermore, the project underlines creating decent employment by promoting occupational safety and health (OSH) as well as equality and mutual understanding through encouraging the inclusiveness of returnees and women.

2.3.1. Project objectives

The overall goal of the project was to “promote employment opportunities for young women and men, with a particular focus on returnees and women, through local-resource based infrastructure construction works together with skills training and entrepreneurship support for the purpose of promoting social stability and building sustainable peace.”

The Project has three outcomes:

Outcome 1. Create employment for young people in infrastructure construction works in support of agriculture, tourism and fishery sectors.

Outcome 2. Decent work practices, inclusiveness and mutual understanding are promoted through construction works.

Outcome 3. Improve skills training for the youth in the construction industry

2.3.2. Project beneficiaries

Project beneficiaries are young women and men, returnees and local communities at large.

3. EVALUATION BACKGROUND

3.1 Evaluation objectives

The overall purpose of this final evaluation is to promote accountability and strengthen learning among the ILO and key stakeholders.

The specific objectives of the evaluation are:

- Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives and expected results while identifying the supporting factors and constraints that have led to them;
- Identify unexpected positive and negative results of the project;
- Assess the extent to which the project outcomes will be sustainable;
- Establish the relevance of the project design and implementation strategy in relation to the ILO, UN and national development frameworks (i.e. SDGs and UNDAF);
- Identify lessons learned and potential good practices, especially regarding models of interventions that can be applied further;
- Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to promote sustainability and support further development of the project outcomes

3.2. Scope and clients of evaluation

The final evaluation focus is on the implementation period of the project from the start in April 2018 to the 13 September 2019, which is 17 days before closing of the project. The evaluation is assessing all the results and key outputs that have been produced since the start of the project.

The Final Evaluation was carried out between September and October 2019 through a desk review, followed by a field mission (13 days, 1-14 September, 2019) to The Gambia (Banjul and three field locations outside the capital in Kotu, Gunjur and Sama Karantaba) which included interviews with Government officials, social partners and other stakeholders, beneficiaries, as well as the ILO project team. Interviews were conducted by Skype with ILO officers in Dakar and Geneva

The client of this evaluation are the Governments of Gambia (particularly Ministry of Trade, Industry, Regional Integration and Employment –MOTIE- as the major counterpart in close collaboration with Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Fisheries and Water Resources, Ministry of Tourism and Culture, Ministry of Higher Education, Ministry of Transport, Works and Infrastructure, and National Authorizing Office Support Unit -NAOSU), local authorities and communities, the social partners, the Government of Japan and the ILO (ILO CO in Dakar and ILO DEVINVES in HQ as well as other relevant ILO departments and branches).

4. EVALUATION APPROACH, METHODOLOGY AND METHODOLOGICAL LIMITATIONS

The evaluation was carried out in accordance with the UN Evaluation Group (UNEG) Norms and Standards (up-dated in 2016), and OECD/DAC's recommendations, as well as the ILO's Evaluation Policy Guidelines. [1] It has also adhered to ethical standards and codes of conduct, when gathering of information in order to protect those involved in the evaluation process. Thus, confidentiality of the respondents was respected in field visits, and in interviews. As much as possible, the evaluation applied triangulation/cross-checking and observations to increase the credibility and validity and also to minimize any subjective conclusions.

An evaluation question matrix including criteria and evaluation questions were designed in a way that takes into account stakeholder diversity and ensures gender equality and women's empowerment-related data is collected (see annex 2).

The evaluation used triangulation of data sources (e.g. document analysis, interviews, focus groups, workshop reports data on participants, and direct observation) to ensure the validity and reliability of the findings. In addition, it used a participatory approach by involving ILO key stakeholders such as beneficiaries, ILO tripartite constituents, ILO staff and strategic partners. Below in mission this is described. The evaluation was carried out in adherence to the ILO's policy guidelines for results-based evaluation code of conduct and norms and standards of UNEG.

Data for analysis have been triangulated through a mixed methods approach that included desk review, consultation with all main stakeholders, and an assessment of development effectiveness, as planned in the Inception report.

The evaluation was based on a desk review, interviews carried out during the country mission to The Gambia and observations during the field visits to the construction sites in Kotu, Gunjur and Sami Karantaba. Additional data was collected during skype interviews with the ILO DWT/CO-Dakar specialists and headquarters staff.

Data analysis, along with the synthesis of findings, is reflected in the evaluation report. It contains the conclusions, recommendations, and lessons learned and emerging good practices.

The desk review included the following documentation: strategic national documents; project documents; progress reports; reports, and other relevant material from secondary sources (see Annex 3 for a detailed presentation of the documentation reviewed).

The interviews (face-to-face and through Skype) were carried out in September and later completed in October 2019.

The mission to The Gambia took place between 1 and 14 September 2019 and included 14 interviews with the local stakeholders, 2 focus group discussions and 3 field visits to the construction sites in Kotu (4 September 2019) , Gunjur (10 September 2019) and Sami Karantaba (11 September 2019). Persons interviewed were selected purposely to represent all the stakeholders, beneficiaries and staff implementing the project. They were all relevant for the

implementation of the project and covered a variety of target groups such as ILO partners in the country (representatives of the Government, workers' and employers' organizations), national training institution, local communities (leaders of villages, local authorities), beneficiaries (young women and men engaged in the construction works) and the ILO project team. **Focus groups** discussion were organized with the young women and men engaged in the construction works in Kotu (5 female and 5 male) and Gunjur (14 female and 11 male). They were selected to be representative of the groups engaged in the construction works and included women, returnees and persons with disabilities. They are all part of the two construction companies established by the young women and men that worked on the construction the discussion mainly reflects the views of their management boards. Since the voices of young people outside these companies was not heard, that discussion was combined with the observations at the construction sites and other interviews when drawing the findings and conclusions. The list of all persons interviewed is available in Annex 4.

Limitations

Unfortunately, the interview with the donor, although planned, did not take place, because the attempts to organize the interview were not successful. That did not allow me to get first-hand opinions about the expectations of the donor and that was partially mitigated with the information from the project document and interviews with the project team.

4.1. Evaluation criteria and questions

The evaluation applied the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Development Assistance Committee (DAC) evaluation criteria, namely, the relevance of the programme to needs, the validity and coherence of the programme design, the programme's efficiency and effectiveness, the impact of the results and the potential for sustainability. For each criterion, three to seven specific evaluation questions were suggested in the ToR.

Relevance and strategic fit

- Was the project relevant to the related government's strategy, policies and plans, the DWCP of The Gambia, UNDAF and SDGs?
- Was the project relevant to the felt needs of the beneficiaries?
- How well has the project complemented and fit with other ongoing other organizations' programmes and projects in the country's target areas?
- Has the project addressed the specific needs of women and youth?

Validity of design

- Has the design clearly defined outcomes, outputs and performance indicators with baselines and targets?
- Was the project design realistic?
- Did the project design include an integrated and appropriate strategy for sustainability?

- Was the implementation approach valid and realistic? Has the project adequately taken into account the risks of blockage?
- Has the project addressed gender issues in the project document?

Project effectiveness

- To what extent has the project achieved its objectives in terms of stated targets?
- Has this been done through the planned outputs or new ones have been included, why and how effective have been?
- Has the project successfully built or strengthened an enabling environment (systems, policies, people's attitudes, etc.)?
- Which have been the main contributing and challenging factors towards the project's success in attaining its targets?
- What, if any, unintended results of the project have been identified or perceived?
- Have women, men, PLWD and returnee migrants benefited equally from the project activities?
- Has the project provide good visibility to Japan as the donor?

Efficiency of resource use and Effectiveness of management arrangements

- How efficiently have resources (human resources, time, expertise, funds, etc.) been allocated and used to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives?
- To what extent are the disbursements and project expenditures in line with expected budgetary plans? Why yes and why not?
- Have been the available technical and financial resources adequate to fulfill the project plans? If not, what other kind of resources may have been required?
- Assess if the management and governance arrangement of the project contributed to facilitate the project implementation
- Has the project created a good relationship and cooperation with relevant national and local level government authorities and other relevant stakeholders, including the implementation partners, to achieve the project results?
- Has the project received adequate administrative, technical and - if needed - policy support from the ILO office and specialists in the CO and in HQ?

Impact orientation and sustainability

- To what extent there is evidence of positive changes in the life of the ultimate project beneficiaries?
- Assess whether project outcomes are sustainable and identify the steps that have been taken to enhance it. What is the likelihood of sustainability of outcomes?
- Are the results and benefits likely to be durable?
- Identify and discuss gaps in the sustainability strategy. How can these gaps be addressed by the stakeholders?

5. FINDINGS

5.1 Relevance and Strategic Fit

Relevance and Strategic Fit was evaluated largely by reviewing secondary information, the project document, Decent Work Country Programme for The Gambia (2015-2017), UNDAF 2017-2021 and triangulated through interviews with the ILO constituents, beneficiaries, ILO project staff in the Gambia, ILO staff in Dakar and Geneva and field observations.

The evaluation assessed the extent to which the program resonated with key Government of The Gambia national policies and strategies. The program's strategic fit with the UNDAF was also assessed as well as the extent to which ILO strategies are relevant to the achievement of the overall project outcome.

As already stated the overall objective of the project was "Promoting employment opportunities for young women and men, with a particular focus on returnees and women, through local-resource based infrastructure construction works together with skills training and entrepreneurship support for the purpose of promoting social stability and building sustainable peace".

The project is entirely relevant to the Government development goals and it directly contributes to the achievement of The Gambia National Development Plan (NDP) 2018-2021, especially the priorities on empowering youth and investing in people; building infrastructure and modernizing agriculture, agribusiness and fisheries; and making private sector engine of growth and job creation. Project addressed the need of the Gambian people by providing income, delivering training to increase their employability, and supported country development by construction work in support of tourism, fisheries and agriculture sector. It involved young people, including women, persons with disabilities and returnees as vulnerable groups.

Specific project interventions contributed to the specific goals of the NDP:

The project ensured access to training on new technologies, contributing to the specific goal of access to non-formal education for young women and men in order to build a more skilled and productive workforce. At the same time project contributed to the goal of creating employment opportunities and entrepreneurial skills for Gambian youth. By inclusion of persons with disabilities in the training and work activities, the project contributed to the goal of enhanced participation and economic empowerment of persons with disabilities.

The project revitalized the access road to the fish landing site in Gunjur, contributing to the specific goal to enhance fisheries infrastructure and improve the value chains for fisheries and aquaculture.

The project revitalized a promenade road in a touristic area of Kotu, contributing to the specific goals of tourist offer diversification and enhanced community participation.

The project has invested in revitalization and expansion of farming center in the rural area of Sami, by engaging local communities in the work and thus contributing to the goal of modern, sustainable and market oriented agriculture and livestock sector for increased food and nutrition security, income and employment generation, poverty reduction and economic transformation.

Project activities contributed to the Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 8: “*Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all*”, by creating job opportunities and decent working conditions for the youth. The project action was especially focused on results contributing to the target 8.6 to “substantially reduce the proportion of youth not in employment, education or training”, target 8.8 “protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for all workers, including migrant workers, in particular women migrants, and those in precarious employment”. Additionally, the project contributed to SDG 10: “Reduce inequality within and among countries”; and to SDG 5: “Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls”, by planning and effectively ensuring active and significant participation of young women in all the trainings and in the infrastructure works.

The project objectives and activities fit in the *United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2017 -2021* mission statement “to transform The Gambia into a financial centre, a tourist paradise, a trading, export-oriented agricultural and manufacturing nation, thriving on free market policies and a vibrant private sector, sustained by a well-educated, trained, skilled, healthy, self-reliant and enterprising population and guaranteeing a well-balanced ecosystem and a decent standard of living for one and all under a system of government based on the consent of the citizenry.” It especially contribute to the UNDAF Strategic Result 2 on Human Capital Development and its Outcome 2.5 “Women and youth empowerment promoted to reduce gender disparities, gender-based violence, access to decent employment opportunities and ensure effective participation in national development. It also contributes to the Strategic Result 3 on Sustainable Agriculture, Natural Resources, Environment and Climate Change Management and its Outcome 3.1: “Sustainable agricultural production and productivity increased for enhanced food security, nutrition and income generation for all in rural and urban areas”

The project was developed and implemented in line with the commitments under the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) 2015-2017 (extended to 2018), *especially*:

Priority Area 1: Decent and productive Employment for Sustainable Growth and Poverty Reduction...

...contributing to three outcomes under this priority

Outcome 1.1: Employment opportunities, particularly for youth and women, increased in all major sectors of the economy

Indicator 1.1.2: Number of employment promotion programmes targeted at women and youths implemented in all major sectors of the economy.

Indicator: 1.1.3: Number of Decent Jobs created in the major sectors of the economy.

Outcome 1.2: Self-employment opportunities for young women and men increased in the MSME sector of the economy

Indicator 1.2.2: Number of women and youth owned businesses accessing business development services and micro-finance products

Indicator 1.2.3: Number of young women and men benefiting from technical, vocational and entrepreneurship skills training opportunities.

Outcome 1.4: Youth employment opportunities, especially for young women and youths, increased through labour intensive approaches in public work programmes.

Indicator 1.4.1: Number young men and women graduating trained as contractors using Labour based approaches to public works.

Indicator 1.4.2: Capacity of training institutions built to provide demand driven training on Labour based methodologies to public works.

Indicator 1.4.3: Increase in the number of young women and men getting employment opportunities in Labour based infrastructure programmes.

And elements of the project are in line with the

Priority Area 2: Enhanced Social Protection, Health and Safety of Workers at Workplace and Elimination of Child Labour, Particularly in its Worst Form...

...contributing to one outcome under this priority:

Outcome 2.3: Health and safety of workers at the workplace is greatly improved

Indicator 2.3.2: Number of workplaces implementing Government approved Occupational Health and Safety standards

Indicator 2.3.3: Labour Inspectors and Social Partners adopt ILO OSH tools and methodologies in the promotion of a better OSH environment

5.2. Validity of design

Validity of design was evaluated largely by reviewing secondary information, the project document, project reports and triangulated through interviews with the ILO constituents, beneficiaries, ILO project staff in the Gambia, ILO staff in Dakar and Geneva.

The project was designed during the times of Gambian transition to a democracy and as a response to the immediate needs of the Gambian people during emergency and fragility.

Evaluation found that some of the constituents are not satisfied with the consultation process during the project design phase because they were included only when the project document was in its final stage, limiting their opportunities to influence it. However, all the constituents expressed

satisfaction with their involvement during the project implementation, which is further elaborated in section 5.4 of this report.

The project has a clear focus on the creation of immediate job opportunities for young women and men through labour intensive work in the small scale infrastructure, in a combination with the skills training and entrepreneurship support. Skills training and entrepreneurship support increase the employability of the persons trained, and the likelihood of them being employed, which represents the sustainability aspect of the project intervention. Gender aspect is taken fully into consideration in the project document and there is one key indicator of success directly linked to the percentage of women involved in the programme. Despite the traditional understanding of the role of the women in infrastructure works, the project set a commendable target of 30% for women involved in the programme.

The project's original duration of 12 months was very ambitious and unrealistic, which lead to its no-cost extension to 18 months. There are several reasons why it was unrealistic to expect project completion in 12 months: a) being the first project of its kind to be implemented in The Gambia, b) no ILO presence on the ground before the project and c) delay in local project team mobilization. The prevailing opinion among the stakeholders is that project of this kind, implemented in three separate locations, one of which is far from the project office, and with this number of activities should have an implementation period of at least 18 months. For a future project with similar characteristics, it is recommended to consider 18 months duration.

Under the three (3) outcomes and nine (9) outputs planned with the project there is a clear flow of activities on construction works, induction training on several topics, adaptation and adoption of Do-Nou training programme, contributing to the achievement of the stated objectives of the project.

The project log-frame was revised in February 2019, and revision included change in activities under:

- Output 3.1, by removing the activities on provision of equipment and organization of training of trainers, replacing them with activities which included technical training and enterprise development support and operationalization of technical curriculum on Do-Nou technology; and
- Output 3.3, by replacing the activity on developing modules on entrepreneurship training with a training of trainers on Start and Improve your Business green, including coaching support service.

When reading the log-frame after the revision, one of the things standing out is the lack of linkages between the initial entrepreneurship training and ILO SIYB training. It appears that the SIYB was included artificially, just to fulfill the commitment under this output and was not directly planned for the participants of the initial entrepreneurship training.

The project document contains six key indicators of success, with one of them having 4 sub-indicators. There is a specific target on women to be included in the programme, as well as a

specific target on returnees/migrants. Indicator 6 on “extension of entrepreneurship support in the construction sector after given contribution” is not clear and it is difficult to assess its achievement.

The project document included sustainability strategy which included identification of infrastructures for constructions or rehabilitation, which directly improve the sector development and the value chain, use of locally available materials to promote the sustainable local economic development, skills development of the young workers through on-the-job training and technical and vocational training as an exit strategy and capacity building of public agencies and private sectors in relation to Employment-Intensive Investment approach and use of local materials. As a way to ensure the sustainability of the action the exit strategy for young women and men engaged in the project was discussed during the tripartite workshop held after the completion of the first 6 months of the project (on 25 October 2018). The elements discussed included certification of the young persons engaged in the project, adaptation of the Do-Nou technology and developing of training curriculum by the Gambian Technical Training Institute (GTTI).

The project document elaborates very well the risks and assumptions for the successful implementation of the project, and the project implementation proves that some of them had a critical impact on the project delivery, particularly delay in administrative and financial management, delay in implementation works and incoherent strategies and support with other agencies.

5.3 Project effectiveness

Project effectiveness was evaluated by reviewing secondary information, the project document, project implementation reports, products of the project, and triangulated through interviews with the ILO constituents, beneficiaries, ILO project staff in the Gambia, ILO staff in Dakar and Geneva and field observations in Kotu, Gunjur and Sami Karantaba.

The evaluation assessed the extent to which expected outputs and outcomes were achieved, the timely delivery of outputs, as well as the quality and quantity of outputs delivered. The evaluation also assessed the unintended results of the project

The overall goal of the project was to “promote employment opportunities for young women and men, with a particular focus on returnees and women, through local-resource based infrastructure construction works together with skills training and entrepreneurship support for the purpose of promoting social stability and building sustainable peace”.

Overall achievements of the project, based on the data provided by the project are:

- **397** persons provided with **job** (192 women, 35 returnees and 11 persons with disabilities), engaged for at least 20 working days.
- **249** young people trained on the job training for use of **Do-Nou technology** for in Kotu and Gunjur (112 women, 10 persons with disabilities, 35 returnees)

- **397** persons trained on **OSH** in Kotu, Gunjur and Sami Karantaba (192 women, 35 returnees and 11 persons with disabilities)
- **225** persons trained on entrepreneurship in Kotu and Gunjur (118 women, 25 returnees, 10 persons with disabilities)
- **55** persons (11 women) trained as trainers on OSH
- **60** persons in 9 construction companies received training on OSH
- Reconstructed 2.5 km road in Gunjur
- Reconstructed 1.2 km promenade road and access road in Kotu

According to the project document, the project had 6 key indicators of success. The following table shows the achievement of the project's stated targets.

Table 1. Achievement of the project targets up to 13 September 2019:

	INDICATOR	TARGETS	ACHIEVEMENT	Comments
1	Young women and men directly employed in infrastructure construction works for agriculture, fishery, and tourism sectors.	500	397	The indicator corresponds to Outcome 1 of the project. The project reached 79.4% of the planned target.
2	Decent work is promoted through: - OSH manual for construction work, - trainers' training on the Occupational Safety and Health (OSH), - OSH inspection at the construction sites - role-model construction site for the Employment-intensive approach and OSH application.	1 OSH Manual 3 ToT on OSH 3 OSH inspections 1 role model constructions site	1 OSH manual 2 ToT 0 OSH inspections 1 Role model construction site	The indicator corresponds to Outcome 2 of the project. The project target was partially reached. It developed OSH manual, 2 out of 3 planned ToT, had 1 role model construction site and did not realize planned inspection visits. Lack of staff and proper equipment for OSH inspections of the Labour Department was the main reasons for not carrying out the inspection visits as planned with the project.

3	Percentage of Women in the overall number of programme beneficiaries.	30%	48.4%	<p>The indicator corresponds to the overall involvement of the women in the project, under the three outcomes. The project exceeded the target and 48.4% of beneficiaries were women.</p> <p>The project inclusive approach and engaging of the national authorities in the recruitment process for construction works resulted in an almost equal number of women and men on the construction works. The project effectively advertised equal possibilities for employment and skills training, especially for women and returnees. This represents even bigger success because it happened in a sector that is traditionally dominated by male workers.</p>
4	Percentage of Returnees, migrants and refugees in the overall number of beneficiaries.	20%	8.8%	<p>The indicator corresponds to the overall involvement of the returnees, migrants, and refugees in the project, under the three outcomes. The project did not reach the target, as only 8.8 % of the beneficiaries were returnees, migrants and refugees.</p> <p>Lack of reliable data on returnees and failure to establish the planned partnership with IOM on identifying returnees resulted in a lower number of returnees engaged in the project activities.</p>
5	The training module for construction works is developed and trainers training is organized.	1 training module 1 ToT	Training module on Do-Nou adapted and 4 Gambian engineers trained as trainers	<p>The indicator corresponds to Outcome 2. The project target was fully reached. Do-NOU training module was adapted by the contracted company for construction works in Kotu and Gunjur and 4 Gambian engineers who were trained as trainers provided training and supervised the work of 249 young women and men engaged in Kotu and Gunjur.</p>
6	There is an extension of entrepreneurship support in the construction sector			<p>Not applicable as it is not clear what is the target and what are the measurement criteria.</p>

after given contributions.			
----------------------------	--	--	--

Source: Project reports, data provided by the project team and List of participants

The project followed all the rules for donor visibility and the donor was visible on all the products of the project, as reported by all the beneficiaries. Appropriate and visible signposts (see Annex 5) indicating the donor were placed in Kotu, Gunjur and Sama Karantaba, radio, TV and social media were used to promote the project activities. A short documentary was produced to capture the project results. Ms. Sainabou Jammeh, Managing Director of CODEM Company and Mr. Lamin Jobe, Minister of Trade, Industry, Regional Integration and Employment of the Republic of The Gambia participated in the Tokyo International Conference on African Development –2019 as panelists in Jobs for youth side event.

Some of the stakeholders stated that visibility needs to be improved and results should be shared and disseminated more widely with the general public.

In the following section, achievements per Outcome and Particular Output are systematically listed:

Outcome 1: Create employment for young people in infrastructure construction works in support of agriculture, tourism and fishery sectors.

Under this outcome, the ILO has successfully applied Employment Intensive Investment approach and has created employment for 397 young women and men (192 women, 35 returnees and 11 persons with disabilities) during the implementation of the labour intensive construction works. Taking into consideration the local needs and the potential impact on the three target economic sectors (agriculture, tourism and fishery), construction and reconstruction works were carried out in the areas of Kotu, Gunjur and Sama Karantaba. These works resulted in a fully reconstructed promenade road and access road in Kotu and fully reconstructed road to fish landing site in Ganjur. Due to the late start, which was the result of delay in contracting of local service provider and subsequent delay in the payment to the contracted company, the construction works on expansion and revitalization farming center in Sami Karantaba faced delay. Although not all planned construction works within the project was realized and the planned number of employed persons was not reached, all the stakeholders reported the satisfaction with the ILO approach and the value of the implemented activities.

Output 1.1

Young women and men gain employment opportunities in the infrastructure construction works which support the development of the agriculture sector.

According to the project team reports, the project provided employment opportunities for 148 persons in Sami Karantaba, with 54 % of them women. Participants were engaged in rehabilitation and expansion of the village farming center in Sami Karantaba Dutokoto. The selection of the site

was done based on the well-done feasibility study. As reported by the project team, the workers engaged in the work received a daily allowance of 250 dalasi. No health insurance for these participants was provided by the project, due to the unavailability of local private health providers in the area.

Employment opportunities offered by the project were highly valued by the local community, and as a source of income in the area which mainly depends on agriculture. Rehabilitation and expansion of the farming center has the potential to improve the agriculture practices in the village and support villagers to fully utilize the potential for agriculture production. Persons engaged in the farming center rehabilitation works received OSH training.

The construction work is facing big delay and observation made during the evaluation visit show construction site at which construction work started, but is far from being completed (see photos in annex 6). It is unlikely that the construction work will be finish by the end of the project and there are several reasons for that. The late start for the works, delays of payment to the contractor, and subsequent delay of payment to the engaged workers lead to a stoppage of works for several weeks.

Output 1.2

Young women and men gain employment opportunities in the infrastructure construction works which support the development of the tourism sector.

The project provided employment opportunities for 125 young people in Kotu, out of which 45.6% were women. 8% of the engaged persons were with disabilities and 24 % were returnees. Workers engaged in the work received a daily allowance of 250 dalasi and had health insurance for 20 working days, with 25 of them working an additional 15 days.

The participants worked on the reconstruction of the promenade road in Kotu and access road to the promenade and hotel from the main highway (see photos in annex 7). The selection of the site was done based on the well done feasibility study. The works were successfully completed in the period 1 September to 31 October 2018.

The engagement of persons on this works is exemplary of inclusiveness and it was highly praised by the participants, especially women and persons with disabilities, who reported this was the first time they are given opportunity in training and at work.

Participants in this infrastructure works participated and benefited from the project organized trainings on Do-Nou technology, OSH and entrepreneurship:

Table 2. Training for participants in Kotu

Training	Total number of participants	Out of which Women	Out of which Persons with disabilities	Out of which returnees/migrants
Do-Nou	125	57	10	30
OSH	125	57	10	30

Entrepreneurship	109	51	10	25
------------------	-----	----	----	----

Source: List of participants provided by the project team

Unintended results: Benefiting from the skills acquired and inspired by the entrepreneurship training, construction company was established by young women and men, including returnees and persons with disabilities. The company is a model of inclusiveness, where the Executive Director is a young woman and the managing board includes a returnee.

The CODEM Company has a potential, and can offer perspective for the young women and men involved, under three preconditions:

- To be supported with further training of its management board on entrepreneurship and tender procedures for construction works.
- To be provided with equipment and materials for construction works or startup capital.
- To get opportunities from the Government and local communities for engagement in public works.

Output 1.3

Young women and men gain employment opportunities in the infrastructure construction works which support the development of the fishery sector.

The project provided employment opportunities for 124 young people, out of which 44.4% were women. Workers engaged in the work received a daily allowance of 250 dalasi and had health insurance for 5 months.

The participants worked on the reconstruction of the access road to the fish landing site in Gunjur (see photos in annex 8). The selection of the site was done based on the well done feasibility study. The works were successfully completed in the period of October 2018 to 30 April 2019.

Participants in this infrastructure works participated and benefited from the project organized trainings on Do-Nou technology, OSH and entrepreneurship:

Table 3. Training for participants in Gunjur

Training	Total number of participants	Out of which Women	Out of which Persons with disabilities	Out of which returnees/migrants
Do-Nou	124	55	0	5
OSH	124	55	0	5
Entrepreneurship	116	54	0	5

Source: List of participants provided by the project team

Unintended results: Benefiting from the skills acquired and inspired by the entrepreneurship training, the construction association (GURRA) was established by young women and men in Gunjur. The managing board is led by a young woman.

The GURRA is currently established as an association, with the intention to be registered as a company. It has potential, and they already voluntarily reconstructed a 500 m road in their community. GURRA can offer perspective for the young women and men involved, under three preconditions:

- To be supported with further training of its management board on entrepreneurship and tender procedures for construction works.
- To be provided with equipment and materials for construction works or startup capital.
- To get opportunities from the Government and local communities for engagement in public works.

Outcome 2. Decent work practices, inclusiveness and mutual understanding are promoted through construction works.

The project focus on labour intensive works was coupled with a strong emphasis on the working conditions and building of the preventive culture on OSH. For that, the project worked with stakeholders on the national level, providing tools and knowledge on OSH, which was successfully replicated through training of 397 persons engaged in the construction works in the project. Manual on OSH in small construction sites was developed and published, providing a tool for future construction works, as well as for OSH inspection visits. As reported by the beneficiaries, the ILO OSH assessment in the Gunjur construction site, focusing on prevention and providing clear and practical recommendations resulted in the improvement of the working conditions at the site.

The project inclusive approach and engaging of the national authorities in the recruitment process for construction works resulted in an almost equal number of women and men on the construction works. This is even more success, as it happened in a sector that is traditionally dominated by male workers. Lack of reliable data on returnees and failure to establish a planned partnership with IOM on identifying returnees resulted in a lower number of returnees engaged in the project activities.

Output 2.1

Knowledge on OSH is disseminated among workers, enterprises, and government officials who work for construction works.

The project trained 55 persons (11 women) as trainers on OSH. The two trainings of trainers included representatives from the government, employers and trade unions.

A Manual on OSH in small construction sites was developed and published.

All 397 persons engaged in construction work in Kotu, Gunjur and Sami Karantaba benefited from the OSH training.

Additionally, 60 workers in 9 construction companies were trained on OSH by the TU trainers.

Output 2.2

OSH's inspections and sustainable application are encouraged in construction works.

Due to constraints on the behalf of the Labour department, OSH inspection visits were not carried out. These constraints were the lack of staff and proper equipment for OSH inspections as the main reasons for not carrying out the inspection visits as planned with the project. But, the OSH assessment of the Gunjur construction site, done by the ILO provided important lessons for both the contractor and for the engaged workers. The OSH assessment report identified the shortcoming regarding OSH at the construction site and provided clear recommendations for the contractor for improvement of the construction site. Based on the recommendations from the assessment report, the contractor improved the working conditions and strengthened the preventive measures in Gunjur, applying to a great extent what was recommended, as reported by the workers who were engaged at the site.

Output 2.3

Participation of returnees and women is promoted in construction works and training.

Partnership planned with the IOM did not materialize (more under section 5.4) , and the project faced problems in identifying returnees for the programme, because of lack of reliable sources of data on returnees, which contributed to the much lower number of returnees involved in the programme then planned (8.8 % compared to targeted 20%). But, the project strongly over performed on the inclusion of women in both training and construction works (48.4 % compared to targeted 30%), by effectively advertising the equal possibilities for employment and skills training, especially for women and returnees. The selection process done with the national labour authorities ensured that a sufficient number of unemployed young women will be engaged in the project.

The project used various media channels to advertise employment opportunities, including radio, TV and social media.

Outcome 3. Improve skills training for the youth in the construction industry

This outcome was focused on increasing the employability of young women and men by providing them with skills that can be used in the labour market and giving them initial impetus to start their own business. 249 young women and men gained skills in Do-Nou technology and 225 of them on entrepreneurship. Young women and men benefiting from this training established two construction companies, one in Kotu (CODEM) and one in Gunjur (GURRA), which could potentially provide stable employment and income for them. However, the provided training on entrepreneurship is not sufficient for running a company. Furthermore, the correlation between the initial entrepreneurship training and start and improve your business training was not established

Do-Nou technology was already proven in other countries and for the first time was introduced in the Gambia. It was very well accepted by the national road authorities and by the local communities where it was applied. The project started the process with the Gambia Technical Training Institute (GTTI) to adapt and develop a training curriculum on Do-Nou and offer certified training, but the process was still not completed. If finished, it will offer an official Gambian

certificate to the persons trained in the project and offer a chance to more young people to acquire knowledge and skills on Do-Nou technology.

Output 3.1

Technical and vocational training for the youth in the area of infrastructure construction is reinforced.

The project managed to successfully introduce Do-Nou technology⁷, which was applied during construction works in Kotu and Gunjur. The company which transferred the knowledge (company CORE from Kenya) trained 4 Gambian engineers and used the adapted training modules on Do-Nou technology. All the 249 persons engaged in Kotu and Gunjur received on the job training on Do-Nou technology.

Do- Nou technology is very well accepted by both the state institutions responsible for roads and infrastructure works and by the training institutions. The project contracted the Gambia Technical Training Institute (GTTI) to adapt and develop a training curriculum on Do-Nou and this was planned for the period after the evaluator's visit. The activity was about to start, and if successfully implemented will lead to a certified training on Do-Nou offered by the GTTI, ensuring the sustainability of the transferred know-how.

Output 3.2

Trainees have access to career development services.

The project supported the organization of job fair organized by the Ministry of Trade, Industry, Regional Integration and Employment of Republic of The Gambia

The project used various media channels to advertise employment opportunities in the project, including radio, TV and social media, which resulted in the engagement of 397 persons.

Output 3.3

Entrepreneurship support becomes available, refined and updated in the construction works.

The project offered one day entrepreneurship training to 225 young people in Kotu and Gunjur (118 women, 25 returnees, 10 persons with disabilities). The training was introductory and motivational. As a result, young people decided to established two construction companies, one in Kotu (CODEM) and one in Gunjur (GURRA). The Start-Up Incubator of Gambia⁸, in a follow up to the provided training, made their working space available to CODEM.

⁷ Do-nou”is Japanese word that means wrapping soil in a gunny bag. “Do-nou” Technology involves use of gunny bags filled appropriately with either sand, farm soil, gravel or murram, the opening properly tied and then, compacted manually. “Do-nou” bags are commonly used for: raising embankments to prevent floods and reinforcing buildings’ foundations. “Do-nou” Technology for maintenance of unpaved roads have been adopted as alternative technology proven to improve the livelihood of the rural communities and enhance their role in the maintenance of road and other infrastructure.

⁸ Start-Up Incubator of Gambia is first ever business incubator center in the Gambia. The Startup Incubator Center is a co-working space for young entrepreneurs, with cubicles, computers, high-speed internet, printing and a fully

The project established the relationship with the YEP project, which supported CODEM to showcase their company at the trade fair in July 2019. Youth Empowerment Project is implemented by the International Trade Centre, funded by the European Union and aims to address the economic root causes of irregular migration by supporting youth employment and entrepreneurship and creating economic opportunities in selected value chains.

In addition, the training on start and improve your business green was scheduled for after the evaluation, which can improve the knowledge of the management boards of both CODEM and GURRA. But, it seems there was no clear linkage between the entrepreneurship training provided and ILO SIYB, which was introduced only after the project revision in February 2019.

5.4 Efficiency and management arrangements

Efficiency and management arrangements were evaluated by reviewing secondary information, the project document, project reports and triangulated through interviews with the ILO constituents, beneficiaries, ILO project staff in the Gambia, ILO staff in Dakar and Geneva and field observations.

ILO did not have field presence in The Gambia before this project and not much experience with the local constituents on project implementation.

The project's human resources comprise a very small core team of three staff members only, forming the Project management unit (PMU). These are namely the National Project Coordinator, the Technical Project Junior Officer, and the Project assistant. The team was technically backstopped by the ILO Employment Intensive Investment Programmes (EIIP) specialist (Dakar and HQ). All administrative work was processed by the ILO DWT/CO Dakar office.

The project started in April 2018 with the Technical Project Junior Officer and the ILO specialist on Employment Intensive Investment Programmes based in the ILO Dakar office. There was no staff in The Gambia in the first three months of the project and the National Project Coordinator and National Programme Assistant were hired in July and August 2018. National project staff was important for the successful implementation of the project activities. Work of this nature cannot be done without being present on the ground, having almost daily contacts with the contractors, beneficiaries and the national and local authorities. It was evident that the National Project Coordinator built a good relationship with all stakeholders. Delay in the recruitment of national staff might explain some of the delays in the project and the need for no-cost extension, as it was unlikely to successfully implement project activities without anyone in the country in the first three months. The national project team did not manage to build effective relationships with other important actors in the area, like UNOPS and IOM, and that is something the ILO should pay more attention to future projects in the country.

equipped training room with a capacity of 25 participants. This center staged clients who met and discussed with mentors and did site visits by incubator clients.

ILO Technical Project Junior Officer was located in the ILO DWT/CO office in Dakar from the start of the project until leaving the ILO in March 2019, being replaced by a new Technical Project Junior Officer located in ILO HQ in Geneva. The same ILO EIIP specialist was working on the project for its entire duration, being first stationed in Dakar, and from April 2019 in the ILO HQ in Geneva. These changes do not seem to effect the project implementation. The Project was under the overall guidance of the project steering committee (PSC), which, as reported by the NPC, was composed of the ILO representatives and 11 members from the national stakeholders. Unusually for the ILO, the PSC was not tripartite and did not include members from the trade unions. It was overwhelmingly composed of Government officials. Ten of these members were representatives of different state institutions and one of the Gambia Chamber of Commerce and Industry (GCCCI).

It seems there was not very good coordination between the members of the project team and the Dakar office, causing delays in the support received from the Dakar office. Disbursement of funds and other support functions has not been always timely and delays in payments to the contractors caused delays in the implementation of activities (for example with the service provider for construction works in Sami Karantaba) . Delays in preparation of contracts and payments to the contractors, which ultimately led to delays in payment to the workers engaged in the construction works influenced the delivery of the project activities and cause damage to the ILO reputation.

The project document elaborates very well the risks and assumptions for the successful implementation of the project, and has mitigation measures for the identified problems of the project, like the delay in administrative and financial management, delay in implementation works and incoherent strategies and support with other agencies. For each of them, the mitigation measures were foreseen in the project document, for example, the mitigation measure to develop accurate and close communication among the Project Team, Dakar Office, and Headquarter and clarify each responsibility. It's not clear why the ILO DWT/CO Dakar did not apply the mitigation measures, which might have resulted in smoother implementation of the project.

The project has mostly delivered in accordance with available funds, but the disbursement level of around 81% on 17 September is an indication that the complete delivery was possible with less funding and the project might have been over-budgeted.

5.5 Impact orientation and sustainability

Impact orientation and sustainability were evaluated by reviewing secondary information, the project document, project reports and triangulated through interviews with the ILO constituents, beneficiaries, ILO project staff in the Gambia, ILO staff in Dakar and Geneva and field observations.

Employment and income provided to the 397 persons were very important to the young women and men, as an immediate answer to their difficult situation in the Gambian labour market. That employment opportunity, although short in duration and unable to provide long term solutions, has

offered them job experience and new skills, improving their employability and chances to get a permanent job.

Two companies established by the young persons who benefited from the project show their eagerness to work and earn. They demonstrate the benefits of the training provided in the project. However, their motivation needs to be met with further support, both in terms of capacity building and provided opportunities. These companies can offer perspective for the young women and men involved, under three preconditions:

- To be supported with further training of its management board on entrepreneurship and tender procedures for construction works.
- To be provided with equipment and materials for construction works or startup capital.
- To get opportunities from the Government and local communities for engagement in public works.

There is a clear impact of the reconstructed Gunjur access road on the increase of fish processed through the fish landing site. 30-40% of fish are taken with trucks, which now use the reconstructed roads. This also led to an increase of around 15 p.p in the revenues of the Ice plant in Gunjur, as a result of the increased number of trucks coming in and taking the fish. Maintaining this road by the national authority after the project end will ensure sustainability of the action taken and can ensure growth in the quantity of the fish processed through this fish landing site.

As reported by the hotel association and birdwatcher association in Kotu, the reconstructed promenade road (together with the access road), will enhance the tourist offer in the Kotu area, by being used for bird watching or walks by the tourist. However, it's not clear who will maintain the promenade road after the project end and that is very important for the sustainability of the project result.

Farming center, if fully finished and operational, will increase production and productivity using sustainable land and water management practices to address hunger and food security needs; research and development and extension to ensure that farmers have access to the latest technologies, irrigation, seeds and other inputs to enhance productivity;

Gender equality assessment

Interview data shows that project stakeholders were satisfied that the project promoted gender equality through fair and equal access to project activities and benefits. In total, 192 women and 205 men got employment on infrastructure works. Having in mind that construction work is male dominated sector, these figures represent the big success of the project. Regarding the participation of women in the various trainings, the project also performed very well, with 47% women participants.

The project management and the steering committee didn't have a good gender balance, which was mirrored in the interviews, except in focus group discussions with beneficiaries, in which the gender balance was achieved.

6. CONCLUSIONS

Conclusions have been drawn on the basis of the totality of evidence available to the evaluator.

Relevance and strategic fit

- 22) The project was highly relevant for Gambian youth, in the context of the high unemployment rates, lack of jobs and income and the overall state of fragility.
- 23) The project is fully aligned with the national priorities, set in the NDP 2018-2021 and in line with ILO global mandate, DWCP priorities and UNDAF.

Validity of design

- 24) The project has a clear goal, well defined outcomes, outputs and activities. Not all indicators of success are well defined.
- 25) Although the consultations during the project design phase did not fully involve the national stakeholders, the project received full support from them during implementation, including from the government, local authorities, trade unions, employers associations and training institutions.
- 26) The project initial duration was not realistic, leading to the extension of 6 months. Prevailing opinion is that the project duration should have been 18 months.
- 27) The project has a well-developed sustainability strategy and clear risk and assumptions assessment. Still, planned mitigation measures were not applied.

Project effectiveness

- 28) The project has provided employment opportunities and training to 397 young women and men,
- 29) The project successfully involve women in all the project activities.
- 30) The involvement of returnees and persons with disabilities is somewhat satisfactory only in the training and construction works in Kotu.
- 31) Labour intensive work on infrastructure and using the Do-Nou technology is very well accepted by the national and local authorities and the local communities.
- 32) The project provided several trainings, but their duration of entrepreneurship training was too short to significantly improve participant's knowledge, rather it was more of a teaser and a general introduction to entrepreneurship.
- 33) Significant emphasis was put on mainstreaming OSH in the project and a significant number of people benefited from OSH training.
- 34) OSH assessment at the construction site in Gunjur proved important for the improvement of the working conditions at the site.
- 35) The project has successfully completed two out of the three infrastructure projects.

Efficiency and management arrangements

- 36) National project staff was important for the successful implementation of the project activities, but it seems there was not very good coordination between the members of the team, causing delays in the support received from the Dakar office.
- 37) Delays in preparation of contracts and payments to the contractors, which ultimately led to delays in payment to the workers engaged in the construction works influenced the delivery of the project activities and cause damage to the ILO reputation.
- 38) The disbursement level was 81% two weeks before the closure of the project and might point to an overbudgeted project.

Impact and sustainability

- 39) The project increased the employability of the engaged persons and with the newly acquired skills and knowledge, and some of them joined forces and established two companies for construction works.
- 40) New technology (Do-Nou) was well presented, adapted and accepted in the Gambia.
- 41) Reconstructed infrastructure improved and contributes to the growth of the local economies.

Gender Equality

- 42) The project adequately promoted gender equality through its programme of activities and monitoring of data.

7. LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

7.1 Lessons learned

Even a well-defined project, with clear direction and aim, should carefully and fully take into account the local situation, in terms of previous presence in the country, synergies with other projects, availability of local providers and local partners. Recruitment of local project staff affects the inception phase of the project when relationships with the local stakeholders are made, local providers are identified and potential allies are identified among the other organizations. Therefore is important to have the local project team since the first month of the project, especially if it is of short duration. In order to avoid problems during project implementation and delays of administrative nature, the country office should establish a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities among the members of the project team and the backstopping office, ensure mutual understanding of the ILO procedures. If that staff hired is working for the first time for the ILO, proper training on ILO procedures and rules should be organized in the first months of their engagement.

7.2 Good practices

An example of good practice is the **ILO OSH assessment in the Gunjur construction site, focusing on prevention and providing clear and practical recommendations for the improvement of the working condition**. It proved as a very good tool for immediate action, and the ILO contracted supplier has taken measures to address most of the identified problems. Rigorous follow up to all the recommendations can be an effective way to ensure that preventive measures are taken and that the health and safety of workers engaged in the ILO projects are respected.

8. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation 1: For projects in countries where ILO has no previous or recent experience be careful in planning the timeframe, the budget and the start of the project, including timely recruitment of national project staff.

When implementing a project for the first time in a country, and don't have the experience with the local providers of services, the timeframe and budget should be carefully planned. Consultations for the design of the project should include ILO constituents from the beginning of the project development. The hiring procedure of national project staff can be started when there is a good indication that the project will be approved. The recruited staff can be informed that they will start to work once the project is approved and funds transferred.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
DWT CO Dakar	High	Ongoing	Low

Recommendation 2: Deliver induction training on ILO procedures for newly recruited staff

Clear understanding of ILO rules and procedures, the time it takes to follow them, and a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities is crucial for effective and efficient implementation of any project.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
DWT CO Dakar	High	Ongoing	Middle

Recommendation 3: Improve the coordination between the ILO DWT/CO office and project team by clearly defining responsibilities and setting clear deadlines for delivery for each member of the team.

It is crucial for the success of a project to have good coordination between the ILO DWT/CO office and the project team which is located in another country. Especially in situations when there is no continuous presence of ILO project staff, each member should clearly know what is her/his responsibilities and which is the timeframe to deliver.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
DWT CO Dakar	High	Ongoing	Low

Recommendation 4: Provide more substantial entrepreneurship training as part of the training package that the one provided in this project

In a situation when you motivate young people to start a business, it is important that the support does not stop with one day train on entrepreneurship. The standard package for this intervention could be for example improved by adding training on tender procedures for construction works etc.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
ILO	Medium	Ongoing	Middle

Recommendations for the stakeholders

Recommendation 5: National institution to develop the certification programme on Do-Nou and certify the persons trained during project implementation

The process which started with the project should finish by the creation of a certified training programme on Do-Nou technology. Participants trained on Do-Nou technology within the project should get the opportunity to obtain an official certificate from a Gambian institution. Young unemployed people usually do not have resources to cover the training fee and the Government should assist them with covering a portion of the training fee.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
Gambian Technical Training Institute	High	Next 6 to 12months	Medium

Recommendation 6: Explore the possibilities for further use of Do-Nou technology throughout the country

The Do-Nou has the potential to be used for feeder roads and in remote areas of the country. The institutions should explore areas where the technology can be applied and devise a plan for implementation.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
National Road Agency Ministry of Works and Infrastructure	Medium	Next 6-12 months	Low

Recommendation 7: Maintain the reconstructed roads after the project end

Reconstructed roads bring benefits to the local communities and economies. But if not maintained by national authorities, their condition will worsen over time and they will come back to the situation they were before the project intervention.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
National Road Agency Ministry of Works and Infrastructure	High	Ongoing	Middle

Recommendation 8: Support CODEM and GURRA in understanding tender procedures for construction works

In order to successfully bid in a tender on construction works, the capacities of both companies regarding the tender procedures and requirements need to be strengthened.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Frame	Resource implication
Ministry of Works and Infrastructure	High	Next 6 months	Low

Recommendation 9: Use the OSH manual for small construction works to train inspectors and during inspection visits

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
Labour Department	High	Ongoing	Low

Recommendation 10: Use EIIP as immediate response to high unemployment rates of unskilled youth

As an immediate response to the high level of youth unemployment, and in a situation when many of the unemployed are unskilled, the Government should increase the use of employment-intensive investment programmes.

Responsible Units	Priority	Time Implication	Resource implication
MOTIE	High	Ongoing	High

[ANNEX 1 Terms of reference for the evaluation](#)



Terms of Reference for Final Evaluation

Final version

Project Title	Employment Creation for Youth to Build Sustainable Peace in The Gambia
Project Code	GAM/18/01/JPN
Implementer	ILO Country Office for Senegal, Cabo Verde, the Gambia, Guinea and Guinea-Bissau
Backstopping units	Employment Intensive Investment Programme (EIIP), Dakar Office and HQ
Donor	Government of Japan
Budget	USD 1,000,000
Duration	March 2018 – September 2019
Type of Evaluation	Final
Timing of evaluation	August –September 2019

I. Background of the Project

The country went through a political transition in 2017 and the new coalition government is actively laying the groundwork for a transformation of its economy to support the progress towards achieving growth. However, it has yet to face many challenges to success in this venture. The Gambia is ranked 173 in the human development ranking according to UNDP's 2016 HDR. In 2017, the unemployment rate was at 29.8 per cent, 38.6 per cent for women and reaching as much as 43.9 per cent for youth. As such underemployment and unemployment among youth continues to be significantly high and remain a key challenge for the country. Remittances are a major source of foreign capital. UNCTAD estimated that workers remittance inflows accounted for 7.4 % of the country's GDP in 2013. The Gambia is also heavily dependent on official development assistance (ODA) inflows. The economic stagnation is leading to the irregular migration abroad particularly of young generation in search of economic opportunities. Due to the lack of jobs and the past social instability, it is expected to have more young people willing to leave the country. There are more than 15,000 applications for asylum in the European Union in 2016, which is almost eight times increase in the last five years from 2012 . IOM's Flow Monitoring Survey (FMS) data indicates that a total of 11,929 Gambian nationals registered to have arrived in Italy in 2016, representing 6% of total arrivals to Italy that year, putting them in 6th place by nationality arrivals despite the small size of the country. By the end of July 2017, additional 5,465 Gambian nationals reached Italy. It also indicates a significant share of unaccompanied children (24%, 1,337). Meanwhile, more than 3,500 returnees – the great majority from Libya and Niger – have been assisted by IOM to return to The Gambia since January 2017. The new Government of The Gambia is developing a diaspora engagement strategy that would harness the potential of the Gambian diaspora to contribute to the development of their country of origin and encourage Gambians abroad to invest in their country via skills and knowledge transfer. The Government is also prioritizing the work to support the return and reintegration of stranded irregular Gambian migrants.

The Gambia's new National Development Plan (2017-20) was finalized to encompass the vision of the new coalition government and to address gaps. This is due to the fact that most of the consultations to elaborate this document took place before the 2016 elections.

Against this backdrop, the government of The Gambia, through the Ministry of Minister of Trade, Industry, Regional integration and Employment (MOTIE) and the ILO launched a project "Employment Creation for Youth to Build Sustainable Peace in The Gambia" in 2018 with the financial support from the Government of Japan. The project aimed to respond to the needs of youth and restore their hope in the country by providing women, men, people with disability as well as returnees from irregular migration equal and also immediate opportunities for paid jobs and trainings within their own country, as well as entrepreneurship support which would enable young people to start up their own businesses with acquired skills and experiences for sustained outcomes.

The project is linked to SDG targets 8.3, 4.4, and 16.A and to the DWCP Outcome 1: More and better jobs for inclusive growth and improved youth employment prospects, Indicator 1.4: Number of member states in which constituents have strengthened capacities on pro-employment macroeconomic policies, or have developed and implemented sectoral industrial, trade,

infrastructure investment or environmental policies for structural transformation and for promoting more and better jobs and tackling inequalities.

II. Project Objectives and key Results

The objective of the project is to provide immediate employment opportunities, develop skills of participants and enhance understanding on decent work conditions, and build infrastructure that circulates the local economy for the sustainable livelihood. This objective is achieved through the following outcomes:

1. Create employment for young people in infrastructure construction works in support of agriculture, tourism, and fishery sectors
2. Decent work practices, inclusiveness and mutual understanding are promoted through construction works
3. Improve skills training for the youth in construction industry

The project strategy is to maximize employment opportunities by taking the employment-intensive investment approach with direct engagement of young people, in particular women, the youth with limited educational background, the youth with disabilities, as well as returnees to abate the trends of irregular migration from The Gambia. Project beneficiaries gain work experience together with skills development through “labour-based approach on construction sites, an approach built through the ILO’s 40-year-long experience.

Three construction sites have been selected from the key sectors for economic growth, namely the Tourism, Fishery and Agriculture sector, for the maximum impact of the constructed infrastructure and promoting further employment creation in the labour market. The project also highlights knowledge transfer of the construction technologies, including the Do-nou technology which is newly introduced to the country in collaboration with the NGO Community Road Empowerment (CORE), a pioneer in innovative road technologies from a Japanese NGO registered in Kenya.

The project has reported the following achievements up to July 2019:

Component 1 – Promenade Road Construction/Rehabilitation in Kotu

- 125 youth between the ages of 18 – 35 were provided job opportunities
- Project participants included 50% women, 30 returnees of irregular migration, and 10 workers with hard of hearing disability
- All participants received training on Occupational Safety and Health (OSH), as a result of which no occupational accidents were reported and training on business start-up
- 55 trainers of social partners were trained on OSH with the ILO’s WISCON tool
- 1.2 km of road was constructed/rehabilitated, leading to the nearby hotels and tourist spots
- All participants and two skilled trainers launched a business enterprise and registered with Attorney General Chambers in November 2018.

- The technology used for the road construction was incorporated in the curriculum of the Gambia Chamber of Commerce and Industry (GTTI) as a short-term training module

Component 2 – Fish Landing Site Road Construction/Rehabilitation in Gunjur

- 125 youth in the local community between the ages of 18-35 were provided job opportunities.
- All participants received 1 day training on Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) as a result of which no occupational accidents were reported and 1 day training on business start-up
- 2.5 km of road was constructed and rehabilitated, leading to the fish landing site
- All participants launched a business enterprise and was registered with Attorney General Chambers

Component 3 – Rehabilitation of Mixed Farming Center in Sami Karantaba>

- 52 full-time workers were employed from the local community to work on site each day, of which 100 female were registered.
- The women are divided in 4 groups of 25 and each group work alternate days while they engage in their harvesting activities in the rice field and also avoid overcrowding at the work site
- Two women with physical disabilities.
- All participants received 1 day training on Occupational Safety and Health (OSH)

III. Project Management Arrangement

The project is managed by a National Project Coordinator with support of an Administrative and Finance Assistant based in the project office in The Gambia. Financial and Administrative transactions are processed in CO Dakar.

The project has been backstopped by an EIIP specialist from the CO in Dakar and since April 2019 by a HQ EIIP specialist, with support of Junior Professional Officer (JPO) based in ILO HQ.

IV. Evaluation background

ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of technical cooperation activities. As per ILO evaluation policy and procedures all projects with a budget between USD 500,000 and 1 million have to go through one final evaluation managed by an ILO evaluation manager and implemented by an ILO officer certified by EVAL as internal evaluator or a consultant evaluator and not having any link with the project.

The evaluation in ILO is for the purpose of accountability, learning and planning and building knowledge. It should be conducted in the context of criteria and approaches for international development assistance as established by: the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard; and the UNEG Code of Conduct for Evaluation in the UN System.

In particular, this evaluation will follow the ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation; and the ILO EVAL Policy Guidelines Checklist 3 “Preparing the inception report”; Checklist 4 “Validating methodologies”; and Checklist 5 “Preparing the evaluation report”.

V. Purpose of the Evaluation

The overall purpose of the independent final evaluation is to promote accountability and strengthen learning among the ILO and key stakeholders.

The specific objectives of the evaluation are:

- Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives and expected results, while identifying the supporting factors and constraints that have led to them;
- Identify unexpected positive and negative results of the project
- Assess the extent to which the project outcomes will be sustainable;
- Establish the relevance of the project design and implementation strategy in relation to the ILO, UN and national development frameworks (i.e. SDGs and UNDAF);
- Identify lessons learned and potential good practices, especially regarding models of interventions that can be applied further;
- Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to promote sustainability and support further development of the project outcomes

VI. Scope of the Evaluation

The final evaluation will focus on the whole implementation period of the project, assessing all the results and key outputs that have been produced since the start of the project.

The evaluation will follow the OECD-DAC framework and principles for evaluation. For all practical purposes, this ToR and ILO Evaluation policies and guidelines⁹ define the overall scope of this evaluation. Recommendations, emerging from the evaluation, should be strongly linked to the findings of the evaluation and should provide clear guidance to stakeholders on how they can address them.

The evaluation will have a strong focus on what worked, what not and why based on feedback against evidence.

The evaluation will integrate gender equality and no-discrimination, social dialogue and international labor standards as crosscutting concerns throughout its deliverables and process. It should be addressed in line with EVAL Guidance Note n° 4 for gender issues and Guidance Note n° 7 to ensure stakeholder participation.

VII. Clients

The principal audiences for this evaluation are the Governments of Gambia (particularly Ministry of Trade, Industry, Regional Integration and Employment –MOTIE- as the major counterpart in close collaboration with Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Fisheries and Water Resources, Ministry of Tourism and Culture, Ministry of Higher Education, Ministry of Transport, Works and Infrastructure, and National Authorizing Office Support Unit -NAOSU), local authorities and communities, the social partners, and the ILO (ILO CO in Dakar and ILO DEVINVES in HQ as well as other relevant ILO departments and branches).

VIII. Evaluation criteria and questions

The evaluation will cover the following evaluation criteria

- i) relevance and strategic fit,
- ii) validity of design,
- iii) project effectiveness,
- iv) efficiency,
- v) impact orientation and sustainability as defined in ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation¹⁰.

The evaluation will be conducted following UN evaluation standards and norms and the *Glossary of key terms in evaluation and results-based management* developed by the OECD's Development Assistance Committee (DAC).

In line with the results-based approach applied by the ILO, the evaluation will focus on identifying and analysing results through addressing key questions related to the evaluation criteria and the achievement of the outcomes/ objectives of the project using as a central but the only one the indicators in the logical framework of the project.

The evaluation should address the questions bellow. Other aspects can be added as identified by the evaluator in accordance with the given purpose and in consultation with the evaluation manager. Any fundamental changes to the evaluation criteria and questions should be agreed between the evaluation manager and the evaluator, and reflected in the inception report.

The methodology to follow should throughout the report address what worked, what not and why, based on feedback against broader evaluation evidence

Key Evaluation Questions

The evaluator shall examine the following key issues:

1. Relevance and strategic fit,
 - Was the project relevant to the related government's strategy, policies and plans, the DWCP of The Gambia, UNDAF and SDGs?

¹⁰ ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation: Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations 3rd edition , 2017

- Was the project relevant to the felt needs of the beneficiaries?
- How well has the project complemented and fit with other ongoing other organizations' programmes and projects in the country target areas.
- Has the project addressed specific needs of women and youth ?

2. Validity of design

- Has the design clearly defined outcomes, outputs and performance indicators with baselines and targets?
- Was the project design realistic?
- Did the project design include an integrated and appropriate strategy for sustainability?
- Was the implementation approach valid and realistic? Has the project adequately taken into account the risks of blockage?
- Has the project addressed gender issues in the project document?

3. Project effectiveness

- To what extent has the project achieved their objectives in terms of stated targets?
- Has this been done through the planned outputs or new ones have been included, why and how effective have been?
- Has the project successfully built or strengthened an enabling environment (systems, policies, people's attitudes, etc.)?
- Which have been the main contributing and challenging factors towards project's success in attaining its targets?
- What, if any, unintended results of the project have been identified or perceived?
- Have women, men, PLWD and returnee migrants benefited equally from the project activities?
- Has the project provide good visibility to the Japan as the donor?

4. Efficiency of resource use

- How efficiently have resources (human resources, time, expertise, funds etc.) been allocated and used to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives?
- To what extent are the disbursements and project expenditures in line with expected budgetary plans? Why yes and why not?

5. Effectiveness of management arrangements

- Have been the available technical and financial resources adequate to fulfil the project plans? If not, what other kind of resources may have been required?
- Assess if the management and governance arrangement of the project contributed to facilitate the project implementation
- Has the project created good relationship and cooperation with relevant national and local level government authorities and other relevant stakeholders, including the implementation partners, to achieve the project results?
- Has the project received adequate administrative, technical and - if needed - policy support from the ILO office and specialists in the CO and in HQ?

6. Impact orientation and sustainability

- To what extent there is evidence of positive changes in the life of the ultimate project beneficiaries?
- Assess whether project outcomes are sustainable and identify the steps that have been taken to enhance it. What is the likelihood of sustainability of outcomes?
- Are the results and benefits likely to be durable?
- Identify and discuss gaps in the sustainability strategy. How can these gap be addressed by the stakeholders?

IX. Methodology

The evaluation will be carried out through a desk review, Skype interviews with ILO officers in Dakar and HQ. Field visit to the project three-target areas (tourism, fishing and agriculture) to cover consultations with development partners, the Government, implementing partners, beneficiaries and other key stakeholders.

The evaluation will be implemented through a consultative and transparent approach and can make use of the following methods and tools: (i) a desk review of literature, (ii) semi-structured interviews with key informants and stakeholders at local and village level; (iii) focus group discussions with beneficiaries at village level; (iv) direct observation during field visits and (vii) validation workshop on preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations with all key stakeholders at the end of the field work, including tripartite partners, implementation agencies, ILO relevant officers and development partners, in Gambia..

Desk review

A desk review will analyze project and other documentation including the approved logframe (annex II), implementation plan, annual reports project deliverables and other relevant documents. The desk review will suggest a number of initial findings that in turn may point to additional or fine-tuned evaluation questions. The desk review will include briefing interviews with the project team and the development partners.

This will be reflected in the Inception report that will translate the TORs in an operational work plan. The Inception report will be reviewed and approved by the evaluation manager prior to the fieldwork phase.

Field work

The evaluator will undertake group and/or individual discussions with the project manager in Gambia and ILO staff responsible for financial, administrative and technical backstopping of the project. An indicative list of persons to be interviewed will be prepared by the project manager in consultation with the Evaluation Manager.

A first meeting will be held with the project manager. After that, the evaluator will meet relevant stakeholders, project beneficiaries, to examine the delivery of outputs at local level and achieved

expected and unexpected outcomes. List of beneficiaries will be provided by the project for selection of appropriate sample respondents by the evaluator.

A stakeholders' workshop will be organized to validate findings and complete data gaps with key stakeholders, ILO staff and representatives of the development partners.

Draft Report

After the field work the evaluator will develop a draft evaluation report (see Deliverables below for the report outline its content) in line with EVAL Checklists 5 and 6.

The total length of the report should be a maximum of 30 pages for the main report, excluding annexes; background and details on specific projects evaluated can be provided in the annexes. The report should be sent as one complete document. Photos, if appropriate to be included, should be inserted using lower resolution to keep overall file size low.

The Evaluation Manager will circulate the draft report to key stakeholders, the project staff and the development partners for their review and forward the consolidated comments to the evaluation team. The project will translate the report into national languages, if necessary, for submission to stakeholders in the countries.

Final report

The evaluator will finalize and submit the final report to the evaluation manager in line with EVAL Checklist 5¹¹. The report should address all comments and/or provide explanations why comments were not taken into account. A summary of the report, a data annex and the lessons learned and good practices fact sheets from the project should be submitted as well. The quality of the report will be assessed against ILO/EVAL's Checklist 6¹².

The evaluation manager will review the final version and submit to the TOAF Evaluation officer for final review. The evaluation report will be distributed to the key stakeholders to ensure enhance learning. The final evaluation report, good practices and lessons learned will be storage and broadly disseminated through the EVAL's database¹³ as to provide easy access to all development partners, to reach target audiences and to maximise the benefits of the evaluation.

Sources of information for the desk review:

- ILO Evaluation guidelines and templates
- Project documents
- Technical Progress reports
- Project deliverables

¹¹ *Opus cit.*

¹² [EVAL Checklist 6: Rating the quality of evaluation reports.](#)

¹³ [ILO i-eval Discovery.](#)

Consultations will be held with:

- Implementing partners
- Direct beneficiaries of the project including women and youth
- National and local Government officials
- Japan embassy
- Project staff
- ILO HQ and Dakar CO

X. Deliverables

1. Inception report (with detailed work plan and data collection instruments) following ILO EVAL Checklist 3, the report should include:
 - Description of the evaluation methodology and instruments to be used in sampling, data collection and analysis and the data collection plan mentioned above.
 - Guide questions for questionnaires and focus group discussions;
 - Detailed fieldwork plan should be developed in consultation with the Evaluation Manager and project manager
 - The proposed report outline structure.
 2. A draft and a final versions of evaluation report in English (maximum 30 pages plus annexes) as per the following proposed structure:
 - Cover page with key project and evaluation data
 - Executive Summary
 - Acronyms
 - Description of the project
 - Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation
 - Methodology and limitations
 - Clearly identified findings for each criterion or per objective
 - Conclusions
 - Recommendations (i.e. for the different key stakeholders)
 - Lessons learned and good practices
 - Annexes:
 - TOR
 - Inception report
 - List of people interviewed
 - Schedule of the fieldwork
 - Documents reviewed
 - Project outputs and unexpected results achieved versus planned as per the Project logical framework targets
 3. ILO templates for the Executive summary, Lessons learned and Good practices completed.
- All reports, including drafts, will be written in English.

XI. Management arrangements, work plan & time frame

The evaluator will report to the evaluation manager Ricardo Furman with whom he should discuss any technical and methodological matters. The evaluation manager will supervise the evaluator.

The evaluation will be carried out with full logistical support of the project staff in Gambia, with the administrative support of the ILO Office in Dakar.

All draft and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided to the evaluation manager in electronic version compatible with Word for Windows.

The first draft of the report will be circulated to all partners for a two weeks review. Comments from stakeholders will be presented to the evaluator by the evaluation manager for its integration into the final reports as appropriate or to document why a comment has not been included,

Evaluator responsibilities

The evaluation will be conducted by an internal evaluator selected based on a short list composed of those certified and linked with the subject and not working directly with project. The selection was coordinated with EVAL.

Responsibilities

Responsibilities
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Desk review of programme documents• Briefing with ILO/ Evaluation Manager• Development of the evaluation instrument as a part of the Inception report• Telephone interviews with ILO and development partners• Undertake interviews with stakeholders and key informants• Undertake field visits in projects areas• Facilitate the stakeholders workshop• Draft evaluation report• Final evaluation report

Timeline

The evaluation will be conducted between August and September 2019, in accordance with the tentative timeline below:

Phase	Tasks	Responsible Person	Days TL	Tentative timing
I	Telephone briefing with evaluation manager Desk review of project related documents Evaluation instrument designed based on desk review	Evaluator	5	22-30 Aug.
II	Consultations with Project staff/management in Gambia Consultations with ILO Dakar and HQ Units Consultations with participating government officials and beneficiaries Consultations with other stakeholders Debriefing and presentation of preliminary findings to the project team, government partners and other stakeholders (Evaluator with logistical support by the Project	12	2-12 Sept
III	Draft evaluation report based on desk review and consultations from field visits	Evaluator	5	16-20 Sept
VI	Circulate draft evaluation report to key stakeholders Consolidate comments of stakeholders and send to consultant leader	Evaluation manager	0	25 Sept -9 Oct
VII	Incorporate comments and inputs including explanations if comments were not included	Evaluator	2	10-11 Oct.
VIII	Approval of report, dissemination among the stakeholders and upload in the EVAL public repository i-discovery Web page by the EVAL	EVAL	0	15-22 Oct.
TOTAL			24	

XII. RESOURCES

Estimated resource requirements at this point:

- Evaluator: travel to Gambia project target areas including flights and DSA days
- Local transportation in the country
- Stakeholders' workshop

Annex I, Project Logical framework (see PDF file)

Annex II. All relevant ILO evaluation guidelines and standard templates

1. Code of conduct form (To be signed by the evaluator)

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206205/lang--en/index.htm

2. Checklist No. 3 Writing the inception report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165972/lang--en/index.htm

3. Checklist 5 Preparing the evaluation report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165967/lang--en/index.htm

4. Checklist 6 Rating the quality of evaluation report

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165968/lang--en/index.htm

5. Template for lessons learned and Emerging Good Practices

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206158/lang--en/index.htm

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_206159/lang--en/index.htm

6. Guidance note 7 Stakeholders participation in the ILO evaluation

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165982/lang--en/index.htm

7. Guidance note 4 Integrating gender equality in M&E of projects

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_165986/lang--en/index.htm

8. Template for evaluation title page

http://www.ilo.org/eval/Evaluationguidance/WCMS_166357/lang--en/index.htm

9. Template for evaluation summary: <http://www.ilo.org/legacy/english/edmas/eval/template-summary-en.doc>

ANNEX 2 Data collection worksheet

Data Collection Worksheet in Annex 2 describes the way that the chosen data collection methods, data sources, sampling and indicators will support the evaluation questions. The table below consists of a series of elements of which the most important ones are: Evaluation Questions and Criteria/Indicators, Sources of Data and Method, while one additional element (stakeholder interviews) is also included because it is an important element in this particular evaluation. For each of the five Evaluation Criteria distinguished, a series of evaluation questions have been identified in the ToR.

Evaluation Criteria and Questions	Sources of Data	Stakeholder Interviews	Specific Methods
A. Relevance and strategic fit			
1) Was the project relevant to the related government's strategy, policies and plans, UNDAF and SDGs?	Government Policies, DWCP 2015-2017, PRODOC, Project documents, SDGs	Project Team Tripartite stakeholders, ILO Dakar office, HQ	Documents review; Stakeholder Interviews
2) Was the project relevant to the felt needs of the beneficiaries?	PRODOC, National Plans, DWCP, SDGs, UNDAF	Tripartite stakeholders, Project team, Relevant Ministries,	Documents review & Interviews
3) How well has the project complemented and fit with other ongoing other organizations' programmes and projects in the country target areas	UNDAF, Other organization s plans	Desk review, stakeholders	Documents review, interviews
4) Has the project ddressed specific needs of women and youth ?	PRODOC, National policies, Progress Reports	Project team, Tripartite constituents, ILO Dakar HQ,	Documents review & Interviews
B. Validity of Design			
5) Has the design clearly defined outcomes, outputs and performance indicators with baselines and targets?	PRODOC, Updated LogFrame, Project Reports	Project Team, Tripartite stakeholders, ILO Dakar, HQ	Document review; Stakeholder Interviews
6) Was the project design realistic?	PRODOC, Updated LogFrame, Project Reports	Project Team, Tripartite stakeholders, ILO Dakar, HQ	Document review; Stakeholder Interviews

7) Did the project design include an integrated and appropriate strategy for sustainability?	PRODOC, Updated LogFrame, Project Reports	Project Team, Tripartite stakeholders, ILO Dakar, HQ	Document review; Stakeholder Interviews
8) Was the implementation approach valid and realistic? Has the project adequately taken into account the risks of blockage?	PRODOC, Updated LogFrame, Project Reports	Project Team, Tripartite stakeholders, ILO Dakar, HQ	Document review; Stakeholder Interviews
9) Has the project addressed gender issues in the project document?	PRODOC, Updated LogFrame, Project Reports	Project Team, Tripartite stakeholders, ILO Dakar, HQ	Document review; Stakeholder Interviews
C. Project effectiveness			
10) To what extent has the project achieved their objectives in terms of stated targets?	Project Reports, Government & Partner Reports, Tripartite constituents	Project Team, Tripartite stakeholders, ILO Dakar HQ,	Documents review; Stakeholder Interviews; Observations
11) Has this been done through the planned outputs or new ones have been included, why and how effective have been?	Progress Reports, Updated LogFrame, , Project reports	Project Team, Tripartite stakeholders, Other Ministries & Partners, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review & Interviews; Observations
12) Has the project successfully built or strengthened an enabling environment (systems, policies, people's attitudes, etc.)?	Project Reports, Government reports, other reports	Project Team, Tripartite stakeholders, Other Ministries & Partners, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review & Interviews; Observations
13) Which have been the main contributing and challenging factors towards project's success in attaining its targets?	Project Reports, Government reports, other reports	Project Team, Tripartite stakeholders, Other Ministries & Partners, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review & Interviews; Observations

14) What, if any, unintended results of the project have been identified or perceived?	Project Reports,	Project Team, Tripartite stakeholders, Other Ministries & Partners, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review & Interviews; Observations
15) Have women, men, PLWD and returnee migrants benefited equally from the project activities?	Project Reports,	Project Team, Tripartite stakeholders, Other Ministries & Partners, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review & Interviews; Observations
16) Has the project provide good visibility to the Japan as the donor?	Project reports, project products and events	Project team, Tripartite constituents, Japan Embassy Dakar	Document review; Stakeholder Interviews; Observations
D. Efficiency			
17) How efficiently have resources (human resources, time, expertise, funds etc.) been allocated and used to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives?	Financial Reports, Progress reports, project reports	Project team, Tripartite constituents, ILO Dakar and HQ	Review of Financial Reports; Stakeholder and ILO staff Interviews
18) To what extent are the disbursements and project expenditures in line with expected budgetary plans? Why yes and why not?	Financial Reports, Progress reports, project reports	Project team, Tripartite constituents, ILO Dakar and HQ	Review of Financial Reports; ILO staff Interviews
19) Have been the available technical and financial resources adequate to fulfil the project plans? If not, what other kind of resources may have been required?	Project Reports	Project team, Tripartite constituents, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review & Interviews
20) Assess if the management and governance arrangement of the project contributed to facilitate the project implementation	Project Reports	Project team, Tripartite constituents, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review & Interviews

21) Has the project created good relationship and cooperation with relevant national and local level government authorities and other relevant stakeholders, including the implementation partners, to achieve the project results?	Project reports, Government reports	Project team, Tripartite constituents, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review & Interviews
22) Has the project received adequate administrative, technical and - if needed - policy support from the ILO office and specialists in the CO and in HQ?	Project reports	Project team, Tripartite constituents, ILO Dakar and HQ	Interviews
E. Impact orientation and sustainability			
23) To what extent there is evidence of positive changes in the life of the ultimate project beneficiaries?	Project reports	Project team, Tripartite constituents, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review; Stakeholder Interviews; Observations
24) Assess whether project outcomes are sustainable and identify the steps that have been taken to enhance it. What is the likelihood of sustainability of outcomes?	Project reports	Project team, Tripartite constituents, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review; Stakeholder Interviews; Observations
25) Are the results and benefits likely to be durable?	Progress Reports, National policies, SDG-reporting	Project team, Tripartite constituents, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review; Stakeholder Interviews;
26) Identify and discuss gaps in the sustainability strategy. How can these gap be addressed by the stakeholders?	Project Reports	Project team, Tripartite constituents, ILO Dakar and HQ	Documents review; Stakeholder Interviews;

ANNEX 3 Documents reviewed

1. Project document
2. Revised Project logical framework
3. Revised Work Plan
4. Progress report
5. Final report on the Identification of a construction site in Gunjur Kombo south (west coast region)
6. Final report on the application of occupational safety and health in EIIP project in Gunjur, The Gambia
7. Rehabilitation of the Sami Karantaba farming center report
8. Project analysis and justification report tourism sector - promenade development plan
9. Curriculum for routine maintenance road works and Do - Nou technology course
10. List of participants from trainings
11. Exit strategy meeting minutes
12. Minutes of the first meeting of the steering committee
13. Entrepreneurship Training Report
14. Report of Launched event for ILO Project Activities 9th October 2018
15. Media reports

ANNEX 4 List of the people interviewed

The Gambia

Individual interviews, 2-13 September 2019

1. Mr. Fanding Kinteh, National Project Coordinator, ILO
2. Mr. Baboucarr Saho, Manager Business development and Project, Gambia Chamber of commerce and Industry
3. Mr. Ebrima Sidiblh, Birdwatchers association, Kotu
4. Mr. Mamadi Dampha, Ministry of tourism
5. Mr. Abdou Saidy, Department of Labour
6. Mr. Clifford Johnson, manager at Sunset Beach Hotel, Kotu
7. Mr. Malang Jammeh, Ministry of works and infrastructure
8. Mr. Foday Jadama, Regional Director, CRR North, Department of Agriculture
9. Mr. Kebba Touray, Chairperson, Village Development Committee, Sami Karantaba Dotokotu
10. Ebrima Garba Cham, President, Gambian National Trade Union Congress

Group interviews 2-13 September

Ministry of Trade, Industry, Regional Integration and Employment (MoTIE)

Ms. Ajara Jallow, Acting Director of Employment sector

Mr. Basiru Secka, Senior Labour Economist

Mr. Lamin Daffeh, Labour Economist

National Road Authority

Mr. Bannie Taiwo Chapman, Feeder Roads Manager

Mr. Lamin Manneh, Feeder Roads Engineer

Mr. Momodou Senghore, Managing Director

Gambia Technical Training Institute

Mr. Edward Ceasar Mansal, Director General

Mr. Ahen Secka, Director Academics

Mr. Abien B. Saine, Registrar

Department of fisheries

Ms. Binda Ceesay, civil servant

Ms. Fafere Tauray, civil servant

Mr. Jibril Jaba, administrative worker, Ice plant in Gunjur

Focus groups

CODEM members (4 September 2019)

GURRA members (10 September 2019)

Skype interviews

1. Mr. Tomoki Watanabe, Technical Project Junior Officer, ILO HQ (17 September 2019)

2. Mr. Claude Yao Kouame, EIIP Specialist, ILO HQ (26 September 2019)

3. Mr. Amadou Sakho, Programme officer, ILO DWT/CO Dakar (3 October 2019)

ANNEX 5 Photos of sings posts at construction sites





ANNEX 6 Photos Sami Karantaba





[ANNEX 7 Photos Kotu](#)





ANNEX 8 Photos Gunjur



ANNEX 9 Lesson Learned

ILO Lesson Learned	
<p>Project Title: Employment Creation for Youth to Build Sustainable Peace in The Gambia</p> <p>Project TC/SYMBOL: GAM/18/01/JPN</p> <p>Name of Evaluator: Emil Krstanovski</p> <p>Date: 23 October 2019</p> <p>The following lesson learned has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text explaining the lesson may be included in the full evaluation report.</p>	
LL Element	Text
Brief description of lesson learned (link to specific action or task)	<p>Even a well-defined project, with clear direction and aim, should carefully and fully take into account the local situation, in terms of previous presence in the country, synergies with other projects, availability of local providers and local partners. Recruitment of local project staff affects the inception phase of the project when relationships with the local stakeholders are made, local providers are identified and potential allies are identified among the other organizations. Therefore is important to have the local project team since the first month of the project, especially if it is of short duration. In order to avoid problems during project implementation and delays of administrative nature, the country office should establish a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities among the members of the project team and the backstopping office, ensure mutual understanding of the ILO procedures. If that staff hired is working for the first time for the ILO, proper training on ILO procedures and rules should be organized in the first months of their engagement.</p>
Context and any related preconditions	<p>Context :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - First project of its kind to be implemented in The Gambia by the ILO; - Mo ILO presence on the ground before the project and - Delay in local project team mobilization. <p>The prevailing opinion among the stakeholders is that project of this kind, implemented in three separate locations, one of which is far from the project office, and with this number of activities should have an implementation period of at least 18 months. For a future project with similar characteristics, it is recommended to consider 18 months duration.</p>
Targeted users / Beneficiaries	ILO DWT/CO Dakar and other ILO offices

Challenges /negative lessons - Causal factors	Not clarifying the role and responsibilities of each member of the project team and backstopping officers, lack of proper induction training for newly recruited ILO staff contributes to problems in project implementation and jeopardize the ILO image and reputation.
Success / Positive Issues - Causal factors	Positive is that during the design phase of the project the ILO DWT/CO Dakar identifies possible risks and potential problems, developed good mitigation measures. Unfortunately, these measure were not applied.
ILO Administrative Issues (staff, resources, design, implementation)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Start procedure for hiring staff as soon as you have clear signal that the project will be supported. The recruited staff will be informed that they will sign the employment contract once the project is approved and funds allocated. - Training on ILO rules and procedure for every new hired staff as soon as they start working for the ILO. - Office Director should ensure clear understanding on roles and responsibilities by the national project coordinator, programme assistants (local and in DWT/Co), specialists. And define clear deadline for delivery. - Application of mitigation measures foreseen in the project documnt

Annex 10 Good Practice

ILO Emerging Good Practice

Project Title: Employment Creation for Youth to Build Sustainable Peace in The Gambia
Project TC/SYMBOL: GAM/18/01/JPN

Name of Evaluator: Emil Krstanovski

Date: 23 October 2019

The following emerging good practice has been identified during the course of the evaluation. Further text can be found in the full evaluation report.

GP Element	Text
Brief summary of the good practice (link to project goal or specific deliverable, background, purpose, etc.)	<p>An example of good practice is the ILO OSH assessment in the Gunjur construction site, focusing on prevention and providing clear and practical recommendations for the improvement of the working conditions. It was linked to project outcome on Decent work practices, inclusiveness and mutual understanding are promoted through construction works.</p> <p>The OSH assessment of the Gunjur construction site, done by the ILO provided important lessons for both the contractor and for the engaged workers. The OSH assessment report identified the shortcoming regarding OSH at the construction site and provided clear recommendations for the contractor for improvement of the construction site. Based on the recommendations from the assessment report, the contractor improved the working conditions and strengthened the preventive measures in Gunjur, applying to a great extent what was recommended, as reported by the workers who were engaged at the site.</p> <p>It proved as a very good tool for immediate action, and the ILO contracted supplier has taken measures to address most of the identified problems. Rigorous follow up to all the recommendations can be an effective way to ensure that preventive measures are taken and that the health and safety of workers engaged in the ILO projects are respected.</p>
Relevant conditions and Context: limitations or advice in terms of applicability and replicability	<p>This identified practice is applicable to all projects that involve a component of ILO contracted construction works. When replicated, it can improve effectively the working conditions for workers engaged on the construction works and ensure then respect of OSH measures by the contractors.</p>

Establish a clear cause-effect relationship	As a direct result of the findings and clear recommendation of the ILO OSH assessment of the construction site, the contractor made the necessary changes, and improved the working conditions at the site, as reported by the engaged workers.
Indicate measurable impact and targeted beneficiaries	Safe and healthy working environment for the workers. Aware and more responsive employers.
Potential for replication and by whom	By the ILO in any project that involves construction works.
Upward links to higher ILO Goals (DWCPs, Country Programme Outcomes or ILO's Strategic Programme Framework)	<p>ILO Strategic Plan 2018-2: ILO 2021 will have reinforced significantly its capacities to deliver quality services to its constituents and member States to realize social justice through the Decent Work Agenda and systematically incorporated the imperative to better understand and respond to constituents' needs.</p> <p>DWCP Gambia Priority Area 2: Enhanced Social Protection, Health and Safety of Workers at Workplace and Elimination of Child Labour, Particularly in its Worst Form...</p> <p>P&B 2018-19 Outcome 7: Promoting safe work and workplace compliance including in global supply chains.</p> <p>SDG 8 target 8.8 “protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for all workers, including migrant workers, in particular women migrants, and those in precarious employment”.</p>
Other documents or relevant comments	