



**International
Labour
Organization**

Evaluability Assessment Report

EVALUABILITY ASSESSMENT OF THE ProGRESS PROJECT

PROJECT: Promoting Gender Responsive Enterprise Development and TVET Systems (ProGRESS)

TYPE OF ASSESSMENT: Internal independent

PROJECT DURATION: 60 months (October 2022 – September 2027)

COUNTRY: Bangladesh

TECHNICAL FIELD: Enterprise and TVET

DONOR: Global Affairs Canada

PROJECT BUDGET: 20 million CAD

ADMINISTRATIVE UNIT: ILO Country Office in Bangladesh

TECHNICAL BACKSTOPPING UNIT: SME Unit and Skills Department

RESPONSIBLE ILO OFFICERS: Pedro Bellen, Chief Technical Advisor and Nabin Karna, Technical Officer

TIME OF ASSESSMENT: October 2022 – March 2023

ASSESSMENT TEAM: Sten Toft Petersen, International Consultant
Subrata Kumar, National Consultant

Table of Contents

Contents

Acknowledgements.....	2
Acronyms	3
I. Context.....	6
II. Project Background and Objectives	9
III. Description of the Project Strategy.....	10
IV. Project Implementation Arrangements.....	16
V. ILO Evaluability Assessment Process	17
VI. Findings.....	21
VII. Summary of Recommendations	42
VIII. Conclusion.....	44
Annex 01: Revised Performance Monitoring Plan	1
Annex 02: Proposed ToR for the Mid-Term Evaluation	2
Annex 03: Key Assessment Questions	3
Annex 04: List of Literature.....	7
Annex 05: List of Key Informants	8
Annex 06: Proposed Theory of Change.....	10

Acknowledgements

This report was prepared by an assessment team consisting of: Sten Toft Petersen, an independent international consultant as Team Leader and Subrata Kumar, an independent national consultant as Team Member.

The project Chief Technical Advisor (CTA) Pedro Bellen, the project M&E Officer, Mohammad Mohebur Rahman and the whole project team, provided support and guidance throughout the process as well as valuable comments for the current report. Management and programme staff in the ILO's Country Office, in Dhaka, Bangladesh, also provided valuable input and support to the assessment.

The assessment team would like to thank the ILO stakeholders in Bangladesh, especially the key members of the Government of Bangladesh and social partners, who participated in the assessment.

Acronyms

ACTEMP	Bureau for Employers' Activities
ACTRAV	Bureau for Workers' Activities
BANBEIS	Bangladesh Bureau for Education Information and Statistics
BBS	Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics
BDS	Business Development Services
BEF	Bangladesh Employers Federation
BEZA	Bangladesh Economic Zones Authority
BGD	Bangladesh
BMET	Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training
B-SEP	Bangladesh Skills for Employment and Productivity
BSCIC	Bangladesh Small and Cottage Industries Corporation
BTEB	Bangladesh Technical Education Board
BUILD	Business Initiative Leading Development
CAD	Canadian Dollar
CHTDF	Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Facility
CHTDB	Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Board
CMSME	Cottage, Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises
CO	Country Office
CPD	Centre for Policy Dialogue
CPO	Country Programme Outcomes
CRP	Centre for Rehabilitation of Paralyzed
CTA	Chief Technical Advisor
DAP	Disabled Persons
DIFE	Department for Inspection of Factories and Establishments
DoL	Department of Labour
DTE	Directorate of Technical Education
DWA	Department of Women Affairs

DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
EA	Evaluability Assessment
EEO	Equal Employment Opportunities
ELCG	Education LCG: Local Coordination Group
EVAL	Evaluation Office of the ILO
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
FYP	Five Year Plan
GAC	Global Affairs Canada
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GED	Gender, Equality and Diversity
GoB	Government of Bangladesh
GPI	Gender Parity Index
HR	Human Resources
HSC	Higher Secondary Certificate
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ILS	International Labour Standards
IMED	Implementation, Monitoring and Evaluation Division
IMTs	Institutes of Marine Technology
IOE	International Employers Organization
IR	Industrial Relations
ISCs	Industry Skills Councils
IUTC	International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC)
KAB	Know About Business
LCG	Local Coordination Group
LFS	Labour Force Survey
MIS	Management Information System
MoCHTA	Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs
MoE	Ministry of Education

MOEWOE	Ministry of Expatriates' Welfare and Overseas Employment
MoLE	Ministry of Labour and Employment
MOOCs	Massive Open Online Course
MoSW	Ministry of Social Welfare
MoYS	Ministry of Youth and Sports
MoWCA	Ministry of Women and Children Affairs
MSME	Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises
MTE	Mid-term Evaluation
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
NCCWE	National Coordination Committee for Workers' Education
NPD	National Project Director
NSDC	National Skills Development Council
NSDP	National Skills Development Policy
NTVQF	National Training and Vocational Qualifications Framework
OECD-DAC	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development's Development Assistance Committee
PD	Project Document
PSC	Project Steering Committee
ProGRESS	Promoting Gender Responsive Enterprise and TVET Systems
PWD	Persons With Disabilities
RMG	Ready-made Garments
RPL	Recognition of Prior Learning
SCORE	Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprises
SD	Social Dialogue
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
SDWG	Skills Development Working Group
SEIP	Skills for Employment Investment Program
SIYB	Start and Improve Your Business
SME	Small and Medium Enterprises

STEM	Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematic
TMED	Technical and Madrasah Education Division
ToC	Theory of Change
ToR	Terms of Reference
TTC	Technical Training Center
TTTC	Technical Teachers Training College
TU	Trade Union
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
UMIC	Upper Middle Income Country
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
VTTI	Vocational Teachers' Training Institute (VTTI)
WED	Women Entrepreneurship Development
4IR	4th Industrial Revolution

I. Context

Across the globe, on average women remain at a greater disadvantage than men in the labour market in terms of both quantity and quality of employment. Women tend to experience higher unemployment than men and be more affected by underemployment, inactivity and vulnerable employment. One of the key reasons is that women undertake the bulk of unpaid care work which reduces their ability and available time to participate in economic activities. Female informal workers in developing countries are more concentrated in occupations with lower remuneration, less visibility and fewer rights at work than men. Where gender gaps in the labour market are wide, traditional patriarchal gender roles restrict girls' and women's access to education, skills development and employment and income opportunities. Because of gender barriers in terms of social constraints as well as limited access to entrepreneurial skills, credit and other productive resources, women are less able to engage in self-employment or run small-scale economic activities.

The ProGRESS project builds on over a decade of support to the core policy and governance systems of Bangladesh's TVET system. In collaboration with a range of donors and development banks, Bangladesh has established a more market-oriented, competency-based skills system coordinated through a collaborative peak body. The next step is to establish a clear link between the skills system and economic development strategies to ensure that these major investments yield long term benefits for human capital development, sustainable employment and improved livelihoods. The project uses gender equality as a central theme to drive for improvements in public policy, skills and business service provision to empower Bangladeshi women. The project combines capacity building and policy support with practical demonstration to achieve sustainable change and focuses on economically underdeveloped regions.

Problem Analysis

Bangladesh's economy registered steady economic growth of more than seven percent over the pre pandemic years and the government had set an ambitious target¹ of becoming a middle-income country by 2021 and upper middle-income by 2031. Bangladesh's labour force however does not reflect equal participation by all. Concern exists about an apparent reduction in female labour force participation in Bangladesh. The Labour Force Survey of Bangladesh² shows that female labour participation declined from 36% in 2010 to 33.7% in 2013 but again increased to 36.3% in 2016-17. Approximately 21% of the female working population has no education and only a very small number of skilled female workers enter into the job market. In addition, women suffer from higher unemployment rates of around 7% against 3% for males (BBS, 2013), which is evidence of additional barriers women face in accessing employment. The national Labour Force Survey (LFS) also finds that 85% of the 'potential labour force' are female, indicating that they face greater difficulty in seeking jobs. Gender differences in the status of employment were also evident in the LFS, which showed that 56.3% of women were unpaid family workers compared to 7.1% for men. These gaps

¹ Refer to the "political context" section under "executive summary of the 8th five year plan. http://plancomm.gov.bd/sites/default/files/files/plancomm.portal.gov.bd/files/68e32f08_13b8_4192_ab9b_abd5a0a62a33/2021-02-03-17-04-ec95e78e452a813808a483b3b22e14a1.pdf

² <https://today.thefinancialexpress.com.bd/26th-anniversary-issue-3/women-labour-force-in-bangladesh-key-facts-and-trends-1544443424>

and differences are evidence of the continuing low value placed on girls and women, especially women or girls with disabilities, who also face social stigma. In Bangladesh, at least 10% of the population is physically challenged, while for women the rate is 8.8%. Women with disabilities are in a complex discriminatory situation³.

TVET and Gender Gaps

Bangladesh has made considerable progress in achieving gender parity in primary and secondary education under the general education stream in the last two decades. However, girls' enrolment and other gender outcomes in technical and vocational education and training (TVET) are far from what is desired. Female enrolment in diploma programs has been averaging around 12% over the past years and 24% in overall TVET education in 5,790 institutes. Girls' enrolment rate in TVET has declined from an average of 27-28% in 2011-2014 to 24% in 2015. The Gender parity index⁴ was 32% in 2015, far behind the national target of 100%. The gender ratio among teachers / instructors in TVET institutions is 20%⁵. Females drop-out rates at the secondary level are significantly higher than that for males: 46% compared to 34% for male students. Many of the female drop-outs enter either low-skilled jobs in informal economies or remain unemployed or inactive at home.

Another hindrance to gender equality in skills and employment is occupational segregation that remains a predominant feature of TVET and labour markets. This limits women's choices of occupations and confines them to lower-paid and lower-status jobs than men. The Bangladesh Technical Education Board's (BTEB) enrolment data for girls clearly reveals gender stereotyping in occupational choices. BTEB data for 2015-16 shows that girls comprised 95% of students in nursing technology but a negligible number of them chose footwear, electrical, automobile and refrigeration and air conditioning technologies. Barriers to TVET faced by women can be categorized into seven key types⁶: Attitudinal barriers; Financial constraints; Inappropriate training environment; Lack of security in access and accommodation including sexual harassment and "eve teasing"; Information and knowledge gaps; Low prospects for decent work, and Low self-confidence and fear of challenging the status quo.

It is clear from all accounts that the female working population in Bangladesh has not been utilized to anywhere near its full potential. According to a Business Initiative Leading Development (BUILD) study report, women entrepreneurs in Bangladesh constitute about 10% of all businesses whereas in advanced market economies women own more than 25% of all businesses. Women face more barriers than men in becoming entrepreneurs and starting their own businesses. The main reasons include time constraints (primarily owing to care responsibilities), lack of access to productive assets such as land and credit, lack of opportunities to acquire entrepreneurial skills, and lack of access to information or relevant professional and social networks. Other challenges and skills gaps they face include business management and product marketing. These factors in the context of countries' socio-cultural factors limit women's choices in engaging with specific business types or sectors such

³ Sample Vital Registration System 2011, BBS.

⁴ Released by UNESCO, the Gender Parity Index (GPI) measures the relative access to education of males and females.

⁵ GOB, Ministry of Education, BANBEIS (Bangladesh Bureau for Education Information and Statistics): *Bangladesh Education Statistics 2015, Executive Summary*, Dhaka, Jan 2016, p. 21

⁶ GoB/ EC/ ILO. 2010. *Assessment of Female Participation and Access to TVET in Bangladesh*, Dhaka.

as boutiques, handicrafts, or beauty parlour, etc.

Studies show that Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) has higher returns for both male and females compared to Higher Secondary Certificate (HSC) education, and TVET leads to higher returns on investment for women than for men⁷. Many studies show that TVET is one of the key determinants in reducing inequality among advantaged and disadvantaged groups including between women and men, by enabling the less advantaged to access better jobs and higher incomes and benefit from economic growth. Thus, technical and vocational education merits more attention in the context of annual budgets and policy priorities need to better reflect this potential.

Government's Response, Gaps and Justification for the Current Intervention

ILO, with funding from the EU, supported the Government of Bangladesh in formulating the National Skills Development Policy (NSDP), 2011, which envisages increased access to skills training for females and creating a gender-friendly environment in training institutions. The NSDP calls for increasing the enrolment of women across a broader range of skills development programs and ensuring a gender-friendly TVET system. ILO further supported the government in strengthening the National Skills Development Council (NSDC) through its Secretariat which was tasked to coordinate with various ministries and departments in ensuring the implementation of the NSDP. ILO further supported NSDC Secretariat in formulating a National Strategy for Promotion of Gender Equality in TVET, 2012, which aimed at increasing the female share in TVET programs to 40% by 2020 and employment of skilled women by at least 30%.

The Government of Bangladesh's 7th Five Year Plan (FYP) for the period 2016-2021 recognized gender inequality as a barrier to economic growth, poverty reduction and family wellbeing. With an emphasis on creating more than 12.9 million additional jobs in the economy to achieve 8% of GDP growth, the 7th FYP reinforced the need to bring more skilled female workers into the labour market through improved access to quality training and increased access to credit for promoting SMEs. The 8th Five Year Plan (FYP) for the period 2022-2026 places a stronger focus on the economic front of women empowerment; it underlines that at only 36%, the female labor force participation is very low and not commensurate with UMIC Bangladesh. It also highlights that, there are reports about continued violation of laws including early marriages, spousal abuse, and wage and employment discrimination against female employees in the workplace, although all legal and regulatory policies are in place to eliminate all kinds of gender discrimination and prevent violence against women,

Despite the development partners' support to the government's policies, plans and strategies to reduce gender gaps in TVET and the labour market, major gender gaps and challenges remain in many crucial areas, including low enrolment and graduation rates; percentage of female instructors/trainers, TVET managers and administrators; low participation of girls in non-traditional occupations and STEM; and lack of gender focused employment support services. Similarly, the share of women entrepreneurs at all levels and in all sectors of the economy is extremely low. Business development service providers, including financial institutions, need to significantly improve their awareness,

⁷ Binayak Sen and Mahbubur Rahman; Earnings Inequality, Returns to Education and Demand for Schooling: Addressing Human Capital for Accelerated Growth in the Seventh Five Year Plan of Bangladesh (Background Paper for 7th Five years plan)

motivation and capacities to increase the share of women entrepreneurs and of women in business.

There are also systemic gaps in TVET and enterprise development governance and practices to address gender barriers. The objectives set in policies and strategies have mostly not been translated into concrete plans, budgets and actions. Skill and business support service providers have little understanding of value chains and of the potential for skills and enterprise development within chains to create jobs and increase income opportunities. In the last ten years, ILO's support to its constituents in Bangladesh has considerably impacted policies, systems and practices of market driven inclusive skills and enterprise development. Relevant government departments, industries and trade unions in the country have indicated a need for further support in strengthening the skills reform and market development work initiated by the ILO, including enhancing opportunities for women's employment as industry demands greater skills.

The Technical Review of the Global Affairs Canada (GAC) that supported B-SEP project concluded that the national partners found potential for further support in: a) Continuing to build the capacity of government bodies; b) Using government policies as a driver to create demand for skills training, certification and inclusion; c) Fast tracking implementation of the National Strategy for Gender Equality in TVET; d) Supporting the development of higher-level qualifications in key sectors under the NTVQF.

II. Project Background and Objectives

The project targets 10 districts⁸ which suffer from high rates of poverty and low levels of economic development. The project is based on the market system approach to value chain development, which is the promotion of strategically planned and locally driven partnerships for the creation of productive employment and decent work for women, youth (age 18-35) and other disadvantaged groups. The project will run for five years (60 months) starting from October 2022. The project is funded by Global Affairs Canada with a budget of 20 mil CAD.

The ProGRESS Project covers a range of components including:

(1) to implement and align TVET systems with National Strategy on Gender Equality in TVET (2012), TVET Development Action Plan; National Skills Development Plan (NSDP) 2022, national budget and operational systems which promote gender equality particularly in terms of digital access, enterprise development and green jobs;

(2) to increase opportunities for wage and self-employment of women within selected value chains and market systems, particularly in the green growth sectors; and

(3) to improve availability of accessible, inclusive, sustainable and green skills training opportunities for women, youth, persons with disabilities and other disadvantaged groups.

The main aim of the project is to support the economic empowerment of the female work force of Bangladesh in order to improve their economic wellbeing and maximize their contribution to the

⁸ Chattogram, and the districts in Chattogram Hill Tracts; Sylhet, Mymensingh, Rajshahi, Rangpur, Khulna and Barishal.

national economic growth. In particular, it aims to increase the number of women in Bangladesh employed under decent working and employment conditions in a broader range of occupations (10,000 young women and men out of which 50% are women, 5% persons with disabilities and 3% ethnic minorities - 5,000 women of which 250 are persons with disabilities and 150 are ethnic minorities and 5,000 men of which 250 are persons with disabilities and 150 are ethnic minorities).

III. Description of the Project Strategy

ILO's intervention for a period of five years (years 2022 to 2027) aims at furthering gender equality in employment by making Bangladesh's Skills Development System integral to economic development and women's economic empowerment. A well-qualified workforce of women and men, and an inclusive and sustainable business environment will support local and national economic and employment growth in the medium and long term. The focus of this project is to demonstrate how linking economic and skills development investment generates longer term, inclusive and sustainable returns in terms of employment and opportunity by:

- Continuing to support system wide change and capacity of public and private sector actors: aim for greater national leadership, independence and sustainability.
- Making women's economic empowerment the core focus for activities rather than an add-on: aim to achieve significant change in terms of government policy, representation of women at all levels of training and employment, with targets that address intersectionality (PWD, indigenous, extreme poverty etc.)
- Using demonstration/ practical examples to advance understanding and show impact: aim for widespread adaptation/adoption.
- Focusing on selected value chains: aim to generate meaningful additional employment at all levels, leverage existing resources and demonstrate productivity improvements to achieve buy in and ownership from the private sector.
- Support livelihoods and employment creation for highly vulnerable populations

It works at three main levels:

- **Policy/ Governance:** Working with the government to build capacity on using policy and conditions to drive skills investment and increase training and employment transition support for women and men, with appropriate representation of disability, indigenous, etc. This will include work with the update of the NSDP and action planning, but also involve coordination with Ministries (Finance, Women and Children Affairs) not normally concerned with skills development. Leverage of relevant industry sectors is also included. To achieve the central goal of women's empowerment, one task will be to integrate the National Strategy on Gender Equality in TVET into the NSDP and include accountability for gender equality in NSDP action plans.
- **Selected Value Chains:** Working with selected value chains, including tourism which are highly relevant for host communities in Bandarban district, to identify and support policies

and strategies that will stimulate increased demand for skilled employees at all levels, with a priority on increasing demand for women employees, and generate business growth that will benefit women.

- **Service (training and business support) Providers:** Working with formal and informal training providers to build their capacity to respond to market / industry needs and to attract a diverse student body. To enable services to support greater labour force participation, in decent employment/self-employment, for women and men, including from disadvantaged groups (PWD, indigenous, etc.)

The project emphasizes capacity building and demonstration and practical application as the most effective ways to drive sustainable change. This draws from the experience of B-SEP, where innovations such as Industry-TVET institution PPP's and informal apprenticeships have now been widely adopted as core operating strategies by responsible bodies across Bangladesh.

- **By focusing specifically on women's skills and employment** the project would improve the opportunities for all while ensuring women's empowerment is understood not only as a central concern but as a key resource for development.
- **By combining skills development and value chain development**, the project strategy adds unique value to interventions currently being implemented. To complement activities directly targeting the poor, there is a need for interventions that focus on employment-creation through promoting development of businesses and value chains that have clear potential for growth, led by market opportunities and presence of sufficiently dynamic private sector actors. The skills development and value chain development approaches are designed to achieve these goals and are approaches for which the ILO offers extremely strong implementation, based on well-defined methods, a wealth of experience and first-rate technical expertise. In May-June 2018, value chain analysis was carried out on two value chains with high potential to create employment in Cox's Bazar District and upgrading strategies were formulated.

Gender equality means improved access, agency and reduced barriers to training, business development and employment for women and is a precondition to socio-economic progress in Bangladesh. Therefore, the project will address gender concerns in skills (e.g. masculine culture in TVET institutions and low social acceptance of women entering male dominated professions) and enterprise development (e.g. lack of access to financial and business services) as entry points for all interventions. The project will strengthen the capacity of government, employers' and workers' organizations to continue building a demand-led skills systems e.g. setting up of LMIS, setting up of Skills Anticipation Assessment, doing value chain analysis, tracking system that encourages women and men to enroll, access training and business development services, and transition into decent employment. Capacity building includes policy- design work to ensure that gender concerns are fully reflected in the revised National Skill Development Strategy. Employers' organizations and industry skills councils (ISCs) will be supported to continue ensuring that skills delivery is relevant and that their engagement and investment in skills benefits women. Workers' organizations capacity to advocate for women's economic empowerment through advocacy, skills development and employment will be enhanced. The ProGRESS project is fully aligned to the National Strategy and its

proposed measures for equal access in skills development programs:

- Offering a broader range of traditional & STEM-related or emerging skills training programs that could improve the employability of women;
- Reviewing programs and their delivery modes to assess their gender friendliness;
- Conducting social marketing and awareness raising for women on the benefits of skills development;
- Increase enrolment rates for females across all skills development programs;
- Providing a gender friendly environment for female students;
- Providing separate wash rooms for male & female students;
- Employing female instructors where possible;
- Implementing a workplace harassment prevention policy in public institutions;
- Ensuring all instructors and managers undergo gender awareness, workplace harassment prevention and equal employment opportunities (EEO) training;
- Providing a system where all students have access to counselling services.

Some of these measures will be directly implemented, such as rolling out gender awareness training through online learning modules or the design of new training curricula. Others will be indirectly supported through partner TVET institutions or the line ministries, e.g. the review of existing training programs and competency standards through BTEB. An important tool will be gender action plans at the level of NSDC ministry directorates and TVET institutions. The project will provide direct support for the policy review, development of strategies and implementation of these, as well as to the implementation of social marketing campaigns to enhance outreach to women and influence social perceptions. Work with employers' organizations and industry skills councils will lead to strengthening of the institutional framework of industry-institute public private partnerships and of quality apprenticeships, and their gender responsiveness. The project will provide direct implementation support to those that benefit women. Similarly, both public and private business development service providers will benefit from institutional strengthening to make their service offer more attractive and relevant for women.

Project Stakeholders and Target Groups

Stakeholders

Governmental Institutions

The National Skills Development Authority (NSDA) is a high-level partnership between government, industry and unions, mandated to implement the National Skills Development Policy (NSDP). Its Executive Committee (EC NSDA) meets regularly to facilitate decision making. NSDA Secretariat (NSDCS) is responsible for execution.

The Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB) is the national regulatory body in charge of accreditation and certification of qualifications, curriculum development and examinations

The Technical and Madrasah Education Division (TMED) under the Ministry of Education (MoE) and its Directorate of Technical Education (DTE) which is the main provider of formal TVET with more than 100 Polytechnic Institutes and Technical Schools and Colleges (TSCs).

The Ministry of Expatriate Welfare and Overseas Employment (MoEWOE), and Bureau of Manpower Employment and Training (BMET) which manages 47 Technical Training Centres (TTCs) and six Institutes of Marine Technology (IMTs). It is also promoting Apprenticeships.

The Ministry of Labour and Employment (MoLE) has overall responsibility for employment issues and serves as a focal point for collaboration and consultation with worker and employer organizations (such as NCCWE and BEF). Returning workers who come back and join the domestic market also fall under the purview of MoLE.

The Ministry of Youth and Sports (MoYS) is responsible for implementing the National Youth Policy which calls for practical education and skills development to support employment and entrepreneurship.

The Ministry of Women and Children Affairs (MoWCA) – Department of Women Affairs (DWA) runs many training institutions and it is a key ministry for inclusion.

The Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs (MoCHTA) operates and coordinates technical training institutions in Chittagong Hill Tracts.

Other Ministries, including the Ministry of Social Welfare (MoSW) and delegated authorities of government, such as the Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Board (CHTDB) operate technical training institutions within their areas.

Private Sector and NGOs

Industry Skills Councils (ISCs) are tripartite, sector based bodies responsible for strengthening links between industry and the education and training system.

Private Training Centres including the Centres of Excellence developed by the Leather, Agro- food and RMG sectors have pioneered adoption of competency based training and assessment and demonstrated the value to industry of training investment.

Social Partners

Bangladesh Employers' Federation (BEF), Local Chambers of Commerce and other employer organizations and business associations have engaged actively in promoting the linkages between the TVET and the industry, including through strong representation in, and assistance to ISCs.

Trade Unions are an important group of stakeholders and represent a tripartite constituent of the ILO that shall be involved in all stages of the Project to ensure a coordinated and coherent effort is exercised by all during the Project implementation phase. Representatives of the National Coordination Council for Workers' Education (NCCWE) and other related structures should be involved and consulted on an equal basis in all Project activities.

Planned Target Groups

The Project will employ the 'results-based beneficiary approach' concept for definition of direct and indirect beneficiaries based on level of results. The direct and indirect beneficiaries are defined based on Project's results levels as follows:

- Individuals and institutions involved in and benefiting from activities at 'Direct Output' and at 'Outcome' levels are considered as direct beneficiaries
- Individuals and institutions benefiting from potential 'Impact' in the result of Project's interventions are considered as ultimate beneficiaries

Direct beneficiaries include:

- Technical and Madrasah Education Division of the Ministry of Education including Directorate of Technical Education (DTE); Directorate of Youth of the Ministry of Youth and Sports; Directorate of Women Development of the Ministry of Women and Child Development; Directorate of Social Services, SME Foundation, Ministry of Industry and Commerce and SME and Special Programmes of Bank of Bangladesh; Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training (BMET), Bangladesh
- Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB);
- Bangladesh Employers Federation (BEF), relevant Industrial Skills Councils, Women Chamber of Commerce, women business associations and enterprises operating in identified value chains.
- Business development service (BDS) providers, including microfinance institutions;
- National Coordination Committee on Workers Education (NCCWE), and Employee Associations and the relevant sectoral unions.

The project will target the following populations for skills and enterprise development:

- Young women and men entering the labour market will benefit from improved demand-led TVET programs particularly through apprenticeship and entrepreneurship for value chains and growth sectors;
- Skilled workforce, including migrant workers, without formal skills recognition can benefit from the Recognition of Prior Learning system and have their skills certified
- Potential entrepreneurs willing to start or improve their Micro, Medium and Small Enterprise (MSME) in the targeted sectors;
- Women and men working in small, medium and large enterprises in the target value chains.

In addition to targets for gender equality that constitute the core of the intervention, targets for indigenous and tribal peoples and disability inclusion for each group of direct beneficiaries will be established through consultation and review during the inception stage and in reference to national policies.

Coordination with Ongoing Support and Investments in Skills Development

The project will build on the considerable investment in the skills development system in Bangladesh in previous years through the government and key international development partners such as World Bank, DFID, ADB, EU, Swisscontact, and synergize with ongoing projects as much as

possible. The project will also coordinate with UN Women and other organizations/agencies offering relevant services for women, such as training on rights, non-discrimination, anti-harassment and civil empowerment.

Cross-cutting Strategies

The project will mainstream the following approaches for sustainable development throughout all project outcomes:

Promoting Social Dialogue and Tripartism

The development and implementation of effective skills and enterprise development systems needs the concerted action of multiple actors across different policy domains. Due to its tripartite structure, the ILO is particularly well placed for supporting its constituents to work towards improved coordination. Capacity building of social partners is an integral component of the project to improve the quality of dialogue and outcomes for both women and men. The project responds to demands from all tripartite constituents and their role within project oversight and monitoring will be ensured.

Enhancing Access to Information and Communication Technology, in Particular for Women

The national ICT strategy, Digital Bangladesh, aims to transform the country into a modern and inclusive knowledge-based society through the development of countrywide ICT infrastructure and development of skilled ICT workers and technicians. This project will promote ICTs in TVET as well as in business/enterprise as a transversal approach to reflect the transformations taking place in the workplace and in society at large. The project will work with business development service providers to add ICT applications and platforms to their existing services, in particular targeting women and youth; assist employers' associations to train women in basic and applied ICT skills and facilitate partnerships between private sector employers and ICT training programs to ease recruitment for women.

Promoting Green Jobs

The ILO Green Jobs approach is based on the Green Jobs Initiative which is a joint effort of the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), the ILO, the International Employers Organization (IOE) and the International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC). It supports a concerted effort by Governments, Employers and Trade Unions to promote environmentally sustainable, decent jobs and development in a climate challenged world.

Promoting the Application of Labour Standards

Bangladesh has ratified the two core conventions on non-discrimination: the Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100), and the Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111). It has not ratified the Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention, 1981 (No. 156) or the Maternity Protection Convention, 2000 (No. 183), the two other instruments highly relevant in promoting women's labour market integration. The project will contribute to the implementation of C100 and C111 by raising awareness, reducing gender barriers, and implementing measures to overcome inequalities. The project will advocate for the ratification of

C156, C183 and C190 with the ILO's tripartite constituents during capacity building workshops and individual meetings and consultations.

Lessons Learned from Earlier Projects

The Technical Review of B-SEP conducted in mid-2018 concluded that the project had supported significant development in the skills system in Bangladesh both in terms of the formal training provision system and in terms of how employers understand and relate to it. It has raised awareness and supported the development of new approaches to training and employment for disadvantaged groups, particularly persons with disabilities and indigenous populations, and provided active models and examples of services and strategies at all levels of the skills system.

The ILO has made significant efforts to capture lessons learned on Women's Entrepreneurship Development from programmes implemented by the ILO and others. The ILO's 2018 report 'Entrepreneurship Development Interventions for Women Entrepreneurs: An update on what works' and 2014 report 'Effectiveness of Entrepreneurship Development Interventions for Women Entrepreneurs' summarised the evidence. Although both studies found that more research is needed, several conclusions were drawn.

The Project Theory of Change (ToC)

No ToC was established during the development of the Project Document. The EA has therefore in dialogue with the project team suggested a ToC for the project. Please find a description of the ToC in the Findings chapter.

IV. Project Implementation Arrangements

Institutional Framework

The main implementing partner for the Project is the Technical & Madrasah Education Division (TMED) of the Ministry of Education (MoE). TMED will ensure wide outreach to ministries and bodies for the implementation and delivery of all the capacity building and institutional strengthening activities. Other key collaborating stakeholders will be the National Skills Development Authority (NSDA), Prime Minister's Office, Ministry of Expatriates' Welfare and Overseas Employment (MoEWOE), Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs (MoCHTA), Ministry of Women and Children Affairs (MoWCA), SME Foundation and BSCIC under Bangladesh Bank, Bangladesh Tourism Board under the Ministry of Civil Aviation and the Ministry of Youth and Sports (MoYS).

Project Steering Committee (PSC)⁹

A PSC headed by the Secretary of the Technical and Madrasah Education Division (TMED), Ministry of Education will be established. The PSC will provide overall strategic guidance, assess all aspects of project progress against targeted results, including examination of lessons learned and service delivery, review and endorse annual work plans. Meetings of the PSC will be convened every six

⁹ The ILO is the grant holder and is as such legally responsible in front of the donor. Decision making can therefore not be transferred to third person. The PSC has the character of an advisory body.

months. The PSC will convene representatives of the key ministries as well as ILO and the donor, Global Affairs Canada (GAC). Additionally, other stakeholders from government, private sector, research organizations, and other project stakeholders and beneficiaries will be invited on need basis, on an observer capacity.

Project Implementation Committee (PIC)

A Project Implementation Committee (PIC), chaired by the National Project Director (NPD) will be established at the Directorate of Technical Education (DTE) under TMED, to oversee overall project implementation. Meetings of the PIC will be convened once in three months. Governance proposals will be detailed at the beginning of the inception phase to ensure appropriate structures are created to (a) facilitate efficient and effective oversight of the programme, (b) create space for closer engagement with government to disseminate findings and influence key officials without duplicating existing or planned structures, and lastly (c) engage a wider groups of stakeholders to share learning and influence practice, in particular within existing coordination bodies, e.g. Local Consultative Group on Skills Development, Youth, Migration and ICT. As a technical and co-implementing agency, the ILO Officials with Chief Technical Advisor (CTA) will participate in the meetings of the PIC on request. Stakeholders will be invited on a need basis to give necessary assistance or suggestions for implementing project activities.

GoB Stakeholders & Development Partners

The project will have collaboration and coordination with National Skills Development Authority (NSDA) under Prime Minister's Office, Bangladesh Technical Education Board (BTEB), Department of Women Affairs of the Ministry of Women and Children Affairs (MoWCA), SME Foundation and BSCIC under Ministry of Industries, Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training (BMET) of MoEWOE, Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs (MoCHTA) and Ministry of Youth and Sports.

Coordination with all development partners will be facilitated through the Local Consultative Group on Skills Development, Youth, Migration and ICT which ensures government/ DPs coordination and dialogue on thematic and technical issues beyond project implementation; The LCG is chaired by the NSDA and co-chaired by the European Union. The development partners involved in the skills sector meet as an DP SDWG (Development Partners' Skills Development Working Group) as the sub-group of Local Consultative Group on Skills Development, Youth, Migration and ICT.

Management Arrangements

The project includes a lean project structure which places the core project team in the larger context, not only for the donor and the target groups and other stakeholders, but also includes an ILO Quality Advisory Team mainly concerned with quality assurance aspects and providing insight to the Project Team. ILO assures its relevant permanent capacities and backstopping in addition to the project related resources. The project is managed by a Chief Technical Advisor (CTA), supported by Technical Specialists. The National Project Director (NPD) provides strategic direction to the project.

V. ILO Evaluability Assessment Process

The Evaluation Office of ILO (EVAL) defines the term evaluability as “the extent to which an activity

or a programme can be evaluated in a reliable and credible manner.”

- ILO considers evaluation as an integral part of the implementation of technical cooperation activities. Provisions are made in all projects in accordance with ILO evaluation policy and based on the nature of the project and the specific requirements agreed upon at the time of the project design and during the project as per established procedures.
- Evaluations of ILO projects have a strong focus on utility for the purpose of organizational learning and planning for all stakeholders and partners in the project.
- ILO Evaluation policy considers that all projects with over 5 million USD budget should be subjected to an Evaluability Assessment (EA) during the first year of its implementation for the quality and completeness of the monitoring and evaluation plan and two independent evaluations (mid-term and final).
- The EA is implemented by the project, while the independent evaluations are managed independently from the project by EVAL.
- The current EA was guided by an overarching question, namely, to what extent does the ProGRESS project have the technical and strategic elements to achieve intended results, and to credibly demonstrate such results in future evaluations?

Evaluation reports often show the need for additional M&E fine-tuning, during project delivery, before the project is at an advanced stage of implementation. For instance, the inception phase is critical for the success of the M&E design of large-scale projects (those over US\$ 5 million). This is particularly true with regard to adequate baseline measurement and the selection of data collection methodologies.

Purpose of the Evaluability Assessment

As the project completed its year one from signing of the agreement and while government approval is awaited, it was found important to determine the evaluability of the project so that adjustments can be made that may enable and or improve the effectiveness of the mid-term and final evaluations of the programme. The purpose of the EA is to: i) review the quality of the project’s M&E plan and systems in the light of implementation realities; and ii) recommend changes in the Theory of Change (ToC) and results framework to make the project evaluable.

Assess measurability: determine whether interventions are designed such that, once they are complete, they will be able to demonstrate their effectiveness in achieving established results and whether they are replicable: (1) the logical framework, (2) the theory of change, (3) options for evaluation design, (4) value for money indicators, and (5) adaptive learning.

In addition, the EA did:

- **Check the clarity of** data in reflecting progress towards results. The EA identified information needs and possible sources of information for the mid-term and final evaluation.
- **Raise awareness among the project key stakeholders on what ProGRESS intends to**

achieve during the lifetime of the project, and how they need to ensure the availability of adequate evidence to demonstrate such achievements. This included orientating key staff on monitoring systems that should be developed and/or put in place to measure results, and evaluation questions of concern to stakeholders.

- **Review complementarity with other ILO interventions** and suggest changes for avoiding duplication and creation of synergies.

Scope of Evaluability Assessment

The scope and criteria for the EA was based on Annex III- “Evaluability review during project start-up phase” of the Guidance Note 1.3: Procedure and Tools for Evaluability of the ILO.

Under the scope of this assignment the assessment team has:

- Analyzed the project’s log frame approach, to identify the logic between the activities, outputs, expected Outcomes and risks/assumptions in consultation with project team and technical specialists. Since log frames are rarely documented explicitly or adequately, much of the underlying logic and assumptions were identified. Reviewed information sources and gathered different points of view on project logic. The management of risk involves active monitoring of assumptions and known or predictable risks. The quality of the risk analysis at project design and assessment of importance and likelihood set the framework for subsequent monitoring during implementation. The EA team reviewed the logical fit of the risk management plan and monitoring mechanisms aimed at tracking & testing assumptions.
- Reviewed/ analyzed the 'Theory of Change/ Logic Model' to improve the M&E framework.
- Reviewed the causal logic and results-level linkages between the DWCP and the project. The complementarity of the DWCP/CPO monitoring plan and the project M&E plan for large projects need to be well integrated to save costs and avoid duplication. Suggestions for improvements were provided as needed.
- Reviewed the definitions, key questions, methodological approach, and initial preparations made, including baseline measures, by the project to assess the effectiveness and impact of the project, and determine the soundness of the approach in terms of the future evaluability of project impact.
- Gathered information on monitoring and evaluation and capacities of key partner organizations and identified specific role of monitoring at the constituents’ parts, in addition to determining existing useful linkages, information exchanges and other collaboration in the M&E area. The EA team reviewed the resources and management arrangements for implementing the M&E plan to ascertain feasibility and appropriateness and make recommendations for improvements where needed.
- The EA team considered the overall institution building context for monitoring and evaluating the project ex post in order to determine the sustainability of M&E information and practices. The ownership of the project’s results by national constituents, as evidenced

through implementation planning, monitoring, and reviewing, was considered as were the interest and support of national senior stakeholders for assessing the impact, cost effectiveness, and other means of determining project results.

- The EA team considered the quality of the information, the appropriateness of the Management Information System (MIS) for storing and safeguarding the data and use of this information by project stakeholders and in performance reports.
- For all of the above, identified good practices and also specific improvements that should be made to the M&E system, giving specifics for acting upon these Recommendations. Major risk areas and means of addressing these were also identified, recommending overall changes to ILO's design and quality control system for M&E of large projects.

The EA has given priority to ensuring that ILO constituents, partners and staff were actively involved in the assessment process. The consultative nature of the process and the explicit engagement of stakeholders is expected to strengthen the ownership of the project's M&E.

Methodology

The evaluability assessment included three phases with seven data collection and assessment activities:

- Document review, including project document, work plans, communications, minutes of stakeholder meetings, and other information sources.
- An inception period during which an Inception Report was developed based on desk review of relevant documents and interviews with project staff and other relevant informants.
- Discussion with project team, CTA and technical specialists during the inception period.
- A ten days field visit to Dhaka, Sylhet and Chittagong to conduct interviews and FGDs with key informants and potential beneficiaries. The field mission further conducted semi-structured interviews with key informants as agreed in the Inception Report. The list of key informants included ILO staff, constituents, implementing partners, CSOs and other relevant stakeholders.
- Stocktaking of existing M&E plans and systems to identify capacities and needs.
- A reporting phase followed the field mission. The review team provided the project team with a draft report for comments. When the draft for a final report with recommendations was ready a findings workshop was conducted to present the preliminary findings and fill in eventual information gaps and sort out possible misunderstandings.

It should be noted that the project has started preparatory work, but at the time of the EA full-scale implementation had not been initiated. The desk review and initial interviews conducted during the inception period suggested a number of findings that in turn pointed to additional issues and information to be assessed.

For a full list of Key Assessment Questions see Annex 03.

The assessment was carried out in the context of criteria and approaches of ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation and the technical and ethical standards and abided by the Code of Conduct for Evaluation on the UN System. Gender concerns are addressed in accordance with ILO Guidance Note 4: “Considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects”. All data were as far as possible/ available sex-disaggregated and different needs of women and men and of marginalized groups targeted by the programme were considered throughout the review process.

The consultants addressed especially to the ILO-EVAL guidelines in Evaluability Assessment.

[Guidance Note 1.3: Procedure and Tools for Evaluability](#)

These are the Guidance Note 11 “Using the Evaluability Assessment Tool”, Guidance Note 12 “Dimensions of the Evaluability Instrument” and the Guidance Tool “Tools for Evaluability Review of ILO Projects over USD 5 million.

[Guidance Note 3.2: Adapting Evaluation Methods to the ILO's Normative and Tripartite Mandate](#)

Limitations:

At the moment of the EA no work plan for 2023 and onwards was developed which made it difficult to assess if the timeframe for project implementation is realistic, but it is assumed that with a project duration of 5 years there are good chances for implementing the planned activities and adjust the timeframe if external factors provoke a delay.

VI. Findings

General Observations

The below findings and linked to the Recommendations are all based on the conducted desk review of project related documents (Annex 03) and interviews with project team members, ILO officials, ILO constituents, partners and stakeholders (Annex 04).

The EA has the following general concerns to the project documents and common understanding in the project team:

- Understanding of some of the terms used in the project documents e.g. value chains – a subject which is of key importance for implementation of the project, differed among project team members.
- The members of the project team expressed different understandings of the key outcome of the project. Is it 10,000 employment opportunities, 10,000 new jobs, 10,000 with improved employability or does it also cover all people who are joining training within the project, but without getting a job or being promoted. The EA understands from the PD that the idea is to achieve 10,000 people get new jobs, including promotion within the person's current career pathway. This understanding was supported by one of the authors of the original project document. It is suggested that the project team discuss with the donor and partners for determining a realistic key outcome.

Recommendation 1:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	High	Short-term	None

The Project Team is recommended to develop a joint vocabulary to ensure that all are on the same page and have the same understanding of the terms used in the project documents when it comes to outcomes. If a common understanding is created it will ease the reporting and improve the evaluability of the project.

The project documents are using different wordings when referring to the target group “disabled”. The EA recommends streamlining the wording and use the term: “people with other abilities” or “differently abled people” as these are seen to be more inclusive terms. However, the EA understands that the team will prefer to use the term persons with disabilities (PWD) as per UN resolution.

Throughout the documents the terms: “industry associations”, “business associations” and “employers associations” are used. The EA recommends using a uniform wording or if there are specifics with one of these groups then underline this as e.g. women chambers of commerce or similar. The same situation is in place when it comes to the worker’s side. Here “workers organisations”, “trade unions”, “workers associations” and “employee associations” have been used.

Recommendation 2:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	Low	Short-term	None

The project team is recommended to streamline the terms used in the project documents and internal and in external communication, this to avoid misunderstandings and misinterpretations. Using the same terms throughout the documentation will also make it easier for evaluators to understand the progress of the project.

The project has not established baselines neither in general nor for the target sectors/ value chains. This is a major problem for the evaluability of the project's progress and impact. There is an urgent need for establishing a baseline for each sector/ value chain, and as the sectors/ value chains will differ from district to district there is a need for a locally oriented baseline building on locally collected data.

Recommendation 3:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	High	Short-term	High

The establishment of a baseline for all parts of the project including sector/ value chain level should be given the very highest priority. The revised Performance Monitoring Plan has a detailed description of the needed intervention.

The M&E Plan and the Performance Monitoring Plan need a review for streamlining target groups, often only women mentioned and, in some cases, disadvantaged groups. There is a need for a

uniform wording including mentioning of 5% persons with disabilities (PWD) and 3% ethnic minorities throughout the documents.

Project Coherence

The EA finds that the project is overall in coherence with national and international development strategies and will contribute to two policy outcomes of the ILO's Programme and Budget.

Outcome 1: More and better jobs for inclusive growth and improved youth employment prospects

Outcome 4: Promoting sustainable enterprises

Outcome 5: Skills and lifelong learning to facilitate access to and transitions in the labour market

And in particular, it will contribute to the following Country Program Outcomes:

BGD 101 "Skills development reforms for employability and livelihoods implemented" linked to indicator 1.3

It will directly assist in achieving Country Priority 1 - Effective employment policies to enhance employability through skill development including for green growth of the Decent Work Country Program's (2022-2026) priorities, and more particularly:

Outcome 1.2: Promoted accessibility of TVET system, aligned with National Skill Development Policy (NSDP) especially for women, disadvantaged groups, people with disabilities and ethnic groups and in view of introducing skills in emerging technologies for climate resilient green growth. Enhancement of productivity and employability through skills development including for emerging green industries and climate smart agriculture is of overriding importance and therefore TVET related issues are posted as a separate outcome under this priority.

The project also contributes to the following Sustainable Development Goals, namely

- SDG 4 – Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all
- SDG 5 – Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls
- SDG 8 – Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all

The project is contributing to the realization of the donor's, Government of Canada's framework for a feminization of the labour market through "Feminist International Assistance Policy Indicators.

Link to National Development Frameworks

This project is strongly in support of Bangladesh's 8th Five Year Plan which focuses on employment growth as a development goal and identifies skills constraints as a major challenge faced by Bangladesh. Skills constraints lead to low labour productivity and as an obstacle to acceleration of GDP growth. The plan calls for raising the quality of education and increasing enrollment, and cites the National Skills Development Policy of 2022.

The EA however finds that the project Problem Analysis is building on statistics and documents from 2013-15 and even 2000. It also refers to the 7th five-year plan (the 8th plan is in place already) and the NSDP of 2011 which recently has been revised. It is recommended that in connection with the development of a project baseline, the problem analysis is updated accordingly.

ILO supported the NSDC Secretariat in formulating a National Strategy for Promotion of Gender Equality in TVET, 2012, which aimed at increasing the female share in TVET programs to 40% by 2020 and employment of skilled women by at least 30%. It would be of great value for the project to analyze to what extent these goals were met and what successes, opened potentials and possible challenges and failures there have been identified during the ten years of implementing the strategy. The lessons learned from this can be of high importance for the way forward when implementing the current project.

Recommendation 4:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team and GoB	High	Short-term	Low

It is recommended to conduct an in-depth analysis of the progress in implementing the National Strategy for Promotion of Gender Equality in TVET, 2012. A review of the strategy is required for aligning this with NSDA and creating ownership of NSDA over it.

The EA finds that in most of the areas where project implementation is planned policies and strategies are in place. The project should therefore concentrate on supporting the implementation of these policies and strategies at as well ministerial as at institutional level.

The ProGRESS project is well aligned to the National Strategy for Promotion of Gender Equality and its proposed measures for equal access in skills development programs:

- Offering a broader range of traditional & STEM-related or emerging skills training programs that could improve the employability of women.
- Reviewing programs and their delivery modes to assess their gender friendliness.
- Conducting social marketing and awareness raising for women on the benefits of skills development.
- Increase enrolment rates for females across all skills development programs.
- Providing a gender friendly environment for female students.
- Providing separate washrooms for male & female students.
- Employing female instructors where possible.
- Implementing a workplace harassment prevention policy in public institutions.
- Ensuring all instructors and managers undergo gender awareness, workplace harassment prevention and equal employment opportunities (EEO) training.
- Providing a system where all students have access to counseling services.

Further the Technical Review of the Global Affairs Canada (GAC) supported B-SEP project concluded that the national partners saw potential for further support in:

- Continuing to build the capacity of government bodies,
- Using government policies as a driver to create demand for skills training, certification and inclusion,
- Fast tracking implementation of the National Strategy for Gender Equality in TVET,
- Supporting the development of higher-level qualifications in key sectors under the NTVQF.

Project Design

The PD indicates that priority will be given to supporting livelihoods and employment creation for highly vulnerable populations. The EA does however not find that such activities e.g. targeted on people living with disabilities are given priority among the planned activities.

The problem analysis does not pay any particular attention to youth (only young women) and other disadvantaged groups including ethnic groups and persons with disabilities. It will be important that the baseline study compensate for this by creating strong baselines for the situation of these groups and the challenges they are confronted with in accessing TVET training and employment opportunities.

The project is planning to strengthen the capacity of government, employers' and workers' organizations to continue building a demand-led skills systems that encourages women and men to enroll, access training and business development services, and transition into decent employment. The EA however finds that only limited attention is paid in the project's LogFrame to capacity building of worker's organizations – only directly mentioned under Output 1222-1 and 1312. EOs are also mentioned under these and in addition there are some Outputs ex. 1310 where they are a natural beneficiary. There is however no mention of a tripartite approach to encourage women and men to enroll in demand-led skills systems.

The current project is a gender marker "3" project; it is therefore of concern that the project documents in general are lacking gender disaggregated data and targets.

Comments and Suggestions on Theory of Change including Proposed Alternative

The project has no defined ToC. The EA suggested a ToC to the project team which was discussed with component leads, and the ToC as per Annex 03 was agreed.

Indicator's matrix-output, outcome, and impact levels (definitions, methodology of measurement, source, who and when)

The M&E Plan suggests many data collection frequencies to be mid-term and end of project whereas it at the same time is planning for annual milestones. The EA recommends collecting data for all Outputs on an annual basis until targets are met 100%. This will make it possible for the mid-term and final evaluations to identify trends in the impact of the project.

Goal/ Ultimate Outcome: *Increased number of women in Bangladesh employed with decent work in a broader range of occupations.*

The Goal indicates a wish to increase the number of women in till now male dominated professions. The EA finds it important that this is streamlined into the project activities and given priority when

the selection of sectors and specific professions within the selected value chains is made.

The target of 10,000 new employment opportunities will cover both self-employment, wage employment and promotion within the current career path.

The EA understands that the TVET institutions have relatively weak systems in place (if any) for tracking the career path of their graduates. It is therefore not realistic that the project can secure a full tracking of all students as this would be a rather resource demanding exercise even if it would be of long-term benefit for the institutions.

The EA suggests the project to follow all graduates from project supported training after three, six and twelve months. In addition, the project could select 2-3 institutions for piloting a full tracking of all students. A positive outcome of such a pilot could lead to a systemic change that the more that the vocational training system in Bangladesh is well financed by donors.

Data should be collected quarterly during the first year to secure that the data collecting tools are in place and are used. Thereafter annual data collection would be sufficient.

The project is aiming at contributing to an increased labour market participation among women. The baseline for the project implementation can only be defined when the selection of sectors and value chains have been defined. The project's indicator definition refers to: "women employed in selected value chain, infrastructure project and skills training". As the project does not intend to include the construction sector the infrastructure projects should be left out of the statistics.

The EA recommends to use HIES data for 2021-2022 which is expected to be available during March 2023 as a valid baseline. The target should be defined only after the baseline data are available.

The project aims to influence the perception of women entering the labour market outside the home. A study conducted in 2017 by Gallup/ILO indicated that 58% of women and 42% of men had a positive attitude towards this. The target set out for the project is 60% and 45% respectively. The EA finds that it will be a too heavy task for the project to conduct a new survey (with Gallup) and also the baseline is giving a figure across all sectors whereas the project will only cover a few sectors. If ILO HQ decides to conduct a new survey after ten years in 2027, then the figures from this can be of interest for the project, but not be an instrument to measure the success/ impact of the project. It is suggested that the project conducts an opinion survey in the selected value chains.

Intermediate Outcome 1100: Adoption and implementation of National Strategy on Gender Equality in TVET (2012), TVET Development Action Plan; NSDP 2020, national budget and operational systems which promote gender equality particularly in terms of digital access, enterprise development and green jobs.

For all activities under this component it should be realised that ProGRESS will have to propose extraordinarily interesting activities to be able to flag its support and win the attention of the governmental partners. TMED already has a project portfolio of 700 million USD. There is therefore a risk that ProGRESS will disappear in "the sea of projects", if extraordinary efforts are not in place to attract attention and by this priority given to the project by partners.

The EA is questioning to what extent the current project will have an impact on the "national

budget” of Bangladesh as mentioned in the Outcome. It seems that this would be out of the reach of the project. It is suggested to remove this reference.

According to project staff, operational systems means the development and operationalization of Gender and Skills Taskforce, development of strategy and action plan, implementation of action plan, digital and green guideline for equal participation of men and women.

The target set out in the PD is according to project staff not feasible anymore as the policy will not be changed in next 5-10 years. The project could however do some policy advocacy around this towards the 40 partner institutions expected to work with the project. A realistic target could be that: “All (40) TVET institutes have increased gender equality targets according to the revised NSDP and TVET development Action plan and are implementing activities to meet these targets.” With an annual data collection from the institutes it will be possible to follow the level of achievement.

Recommendation 5:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	Medium	Long-term	Medium

The NSDP has been approved and the originally planned Indicator 1 for Outcome 1100 is not fully relevant anymore. The Project is recommended to develop advocacy activities towards the partner TVET institutes to contribute to the implementation of the gender equality elements of the NSDP.

An indicator (3) under Outcome 1100 is suggesting that the project should achieve an increase of annual budget allocations and expenditures by relevant ministries and TVET institutes on gender responsive skills facilities and services. No baseline is available the EA therefore suggests a desk review of the ministerial budgets if accessible and based on this during mid-term and final evaluation assess if an upwards trend in the budget allocations can be identified. The EA does not recommend establishing an indicator in percentage increase in budgets as the ministries will have uneven involvement. It would however be a positive sign to identify an upwards trend.

Immediate Outcome 1110: *Improved capacity of Technical and Madrasah Education Division (TMED) and Directorate of Technical Education (DTE) to achieve explicit gender equality, digital access and green jobs targets through the implementation of National Skill Development Policy (NSDP), TVET Development Action Plan and SDG action Plan.*

TMED and DTE are implementing a significant number of very large projects, some of which will also have a gender perspective. The EA is therefore suggesting that the ProGRESS project align with some major donors for contributing to the ambitious task to establish an inter-governmental coordination committee. The project should realise that the procedures for developing and adopting ToRs and SoPs for the work of the committee might be a lengthy process.

It is foreseen to support the development of monitoring tools and the establishment of a coordination committee, but the targets: “Monitoring tool and data collection method prepared” and “ToR for the coordination committee is prepared” does not foresee the use of the tools and benefits of the work of the committee. The project team is recommended to set up some targets for the monitoring and coordination.

As mentioned above it can become a lengthy process but quarterly reporting is recommended to ensure that the process is moving forward and the motivation among staff and governmental officials is kept alert. There will be no need for reporting after the tools and the committee ToR have been prepared with the current targets in place.

When the instruments are approved the project should consider (depending on the timeframe towards the end of the project) to establish targets for their use/ implementation.

Output 1111: *Technical support to TMED, DTE and other relevant government agencies for adopting and implementing National Skills Development Policy with gender equality targets.*

The EA has the same concern as above (Outcome 1110) when it comes to time frame and governmental approval procedures. From the projects M&E Plan and staff interviews the EA understands that the task force will facilitate 3 courses (one basic and two refresher) that will be conducted over three years for a group of 25 people. No target for participation of women has been determined. Having in mind that very few women are working in the sphere of vocational training, a participation of 30% women would be a strong achievement. Besides this there will be a strategic and advocacy role of this taskforce to play like strategy and action plan development and implementation, gender-based budgeting implementation etc. The project plans to equip the task force members with the needed capacity to be able to contribute to the above.

There should be pre and post training surveys conducted including statements on the usefulness of the training in the second and third year of implementation of training activities.

Output 1112: *Technical and coordination support to DTE/TMED to coordinate with different ministries and those providing skills training for tracking gender targets and inclusion in line with TVET development action plan.*

Same comments as above (Output 1111) concerning participation of women and reporting from training. According to project staff this would be a mixed group from different ministries who will be involved in the taskforce. It seems a little unclear if there will be two training sessions with 10 and 15 participants respectively or one training with 25 participants followed by two refresher training sessions in the following years. The project is setting a target of 10 coordination meetings conducted. As the project will have very limited influence on the work of the coordination committee it should be considered if an exact quantitative target should be in place or rather a qualitative target referring to the functioning of the committee.

Output 1113: *Technical assistance to DTE and TMED in implementation of TVET relevant gender equality goals of the 8th Five-year plan including digital access, enterprise development and COVID-19 recovery.*

The EA finds that with the selected sectors and possible value chains in mind there seems to be limited relevance in giving priority to “COVID-19 recovery” as stated in the indicator definition.

In the Indicator under Output 1113-2 there is a mismatch between Indicator definition and Target as one talks about number of workshops and the other about number of people trained. The EA is informed that there would be two workshops and 100 officials would be oriented. 50 participants per workshop is a high number, but as this is an orientation event not training as such, the number

is acceptable. Reporting should be annually until research and workshops are conducted.

The mid-term evaluation should look into how the research study has been used by relevant stakeholders.

Immediate Outcome 1120: Improved capacity of the DTE/TMED partner institutions and other relevant stakeholders in gender and green jobs focus and targeting in line with relevant NSDP objectives.

The project has a very ambitious target that all concerned ministries will have action plans and budgets in place by 2025. The project will have limited influence on the ministerial priorities and by that also on the extent to which the target under Outcome 1120 Indicator 1 can be achieved.

The second Indicator under this Outcome can be influenced by the project to a bigger extent. The target is however established very low (2 enterprise development institutions). The EA finds the target too low to influence a systemic change. It is therefore recommended to increase the target to 5 and secure a close coaching of the institutions through a platform where they can exchange experiences and the project staff can provide inputs and guidance throughout the development of gender equality practices and mechanisms. By choosing this approach there will be on-going reporting which should be summarised quarterly to ensure that all are on track and the development and implementation is progressing.

The EA finds that it will be important to keep sharp focus on the 40 selected institutions and not broaden activities beyond these. This to secure that impact will be visible and change can be identified. For the M&E the EA suggests selecting 3-5 non-beneficiary institutions as reference/control group including baseline, mid-term and final evaluations.

Output 1121: Capacity development on gender equality mainstreaming and green skills related planning, budgeting, and monitoring provided to DTE/TMED and skills training institutes.

The current Output 1121 is indicating a rather broad approach to the capacity building to be provided to DTE/TMED and the training institutions. The EA is concerned if the same capacity development is needed for the staff in authorities and those at the institutions.

When it comes to “budgeting” it seems not realistic that the project will have insight into these neither at DTE/TMED level nor at the institution level.

The output could be evaluated on progress in planning of green skills training and a survey among female students and staff if any changes in gender equality efforts has been noted.

There seems to be missing some text in the second part of the indicator. Also, it is not indicated how many staff (and how many of these would be women) are to be trained. The Target indicates that training should be finalized by 2025. There would be a need for reporting every six months to track the progress in this field. The mid-term evaluation should analyze the extent to which the training received has impacted the progress in implementation of the action plan.

Output 1122: Assistance provided to partner institutions for implementation of gender equality targets, including in digital skills and green enterprise development.

The EA suggests increasing the number of institutions involved to align with Outcome 1120. Having a minimum five institutions would create a more solid basis for establishing the planned gender mainstreaming forum. The quality of this would be seen in institutes' improved capacities on gender equality issues through the established gender mainstreaming forum. The EA finds it important for the success of the intervention to concentrate on institutions that have the capacity to take the lead and function as showcases for a larger number of institutions. A strong forum established would increase the chances for sustainability in the mainstreaming efforts.

The targeted centres will need a lot of coaching from the project staff, there will from this be a constant flow of report back to the project management, but for formal reporting semi-annual reporting from institutions would be sufficient. Because of the delay in initiating project implementation the EA suggested moving the target to be met from 2023 to the end of 2024.

Output 1123: *Technical assistance/Training provided to partner industry associations, workers association and ISCs on achieving gender equality in the workplace and gender friendly working environment.*

The suggested baseline says that no assessment studies on current practices related to improving gender equality in the workplace for the selected industry sectors have been conducted. The EA questions this statement as the Bangladeshi labour market is one of the best researched especially in the field of gender equality.

The number of people foreseen to be trained is relatively low (20), it is questionable if this number will be enough for impacting a systemic change.

Further the output refers to: "Technical assistance/ training provided to partner industry associations, workers association and ISCs". There are however no indicators for interventions toward these. Whereas there are employers associations and trade unions in most sectors, still many sectors have no ISCs and as mentioned elsewhere in this report the EA found that the ISC as an institution is not yet known even among leaders in the social partner organizations.

Immediate Outcome 1130: *Enhanced capacities of TVET providers (public and private) to provide gender responsive facilities, skills training and employment support services using e-learning remote and other accessible means of delivery*

The EA finds it positive to take steps to increase the use of e-learning methods, but especially for vocational training the new technologies also have their limitations in most trades. The accessibility of internet and availability of skills to utilise more complicated applications as well as accessibility of hardware (computers, laptops and smartphones) among beneficiaries both direct- and end-beneficiaries needs to be analysed both for the sake of selection of realistic and inclusive training methods and for the choice of M&E instruments. The project team is very optimistic about the accessibility, but evidence should be in place before larger e-learning interventions are initiated.

The EA was informed by stakeholders that very few women are using the employment support services available today. The EA will recommend to the project to conduct a survey among graduates that have not used the provided services to understand what are the factors that are pushing them away from these and also what would be needed to attract them to the services.

Recommendation 6:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	Medium	Short-term	Medium

The project is recommended to conduct a survey among graduates not using the job placement services to identify push and pull stimulators.

Depending on the results of the survey and possible additional interventions the target should be increased from 40% to 50%. An end goal would be that practically all graduates use the facilities.

The project is optimistic when it comes to the institution's implementation of their action plans. It is expected that all institutions will implement at the least part of their plans.

Output 1131: *Training and technical assistance on developing gender-responsive training facilities and digitalized training package provided to TVET institutes to deliver gender friendly skills training programme applying e-learning approach.*

The EA is concerned if it will be possible for all potential training participants to have access to the internet and/or needed hardware.

Only few skills development activities can in full be implemented remotely. There is in most cases a need for hands-on practical training without which the increased employability would be limited. The experiences from a number of countries shows that a hybrid/mixed training model can be recommended.

Output 1132: *Partnerships between TVET institutes and industry associations established to deliver online gender-responsive career guidance and the job placement cells and apprenticeship counselling at TVET institutions.*

The EA could not find evidence that the industry associations have the capacity to engage in resource demanding partnerships as indicated by Output 1132. The associations would only be able to do this if and as long as external resources are made available. Likewise it is unclear to what extent the TVET institutions and the Industry associations are ready/ interested in entering partnerships with the given purpose.

The project suggests to measure the extent to which the graduates are satisfied with the career guidance and work of job placement cells. The EA suggests in addition to track the career pathway of the graduates to get an objective understanding of the services efficiency.

Output 1133: *Capacity of staff and teachers of the Technical Teachers' Training College (TTTC), the Vocational Teachers' Training Institute (VTTI) and other TVET institutes strengthened to adopt the accessible learning approach for women and persons with disabilities using digital platforms.*

It is recommended to involve CSOs working in this field ex. Centre for Rehabilitation of Paralyzed (CPR) in the project implementation hereunder the capacity building of trainers. It would be important to include not only persons with other physical abilities but also people with other mental abilities.

In the ICT sector people living with different types of autism are in many countries in high demand because of their ability to scan computer programs for possible errors. These and other experiences could be considered within the current project. The EA notes that no indicators for the work with other groups than women are identified. The EA recommends increasing efforts to promote an inclusive labour market including targets for TVET trainers capacity to include these groups.

Recommendation 7:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team and constituents	Medium	Long-term	Low

The project is recommended to work together with relevant CSOs like OPD, and constituents to find new ways for establishing an inclusive training and working environment for persons with disabilities based on national and international experiences.

In the M&E plan is it foreseen to train 200 TVET teachers on-line in promoting women access to TVET institutes. For the training of teachers, a group of 20 trainers will be capacitated. The project has 40 target institutions, the EA recommends having at least one trainer/ facilitator in each to secure continuous training and follow-up.

Recommendation 8:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	High	Long-term	High

The teachers are key to attracting women to the TVET institutes. It is recommended to reallocate funds making it possible to train more teachers to create a women friendly and inclusive environment in the TVET institutions.

Intermediate Outcome 1200: *Increased opportunities for wage and self-employment of women within selected value chains and market systems, particularly in the green growth sectors.*

“Green growth sectors” is a very broad target the EA would recommend to specify what more precisely are the target sectors or sub-sectors where the employment possibilities for women (and other disadvantaged groups) are best. According to project staff it will be difficult to collect data on the number of women in green jobs. It therefore does not seem realistic to collect data annually. The EA suggests conducting a baseline survey within the selected value chains and a survey mid-term and by end of project. This could provide an indication of possible impact of the project in the selected value chains.

No baseline is in place even if this could be established with relatively few resources through a desk review of existing data. A target of 20% increase is suggested. It is expected that the selected value chains would have the opportunity to create more jobs for women. The EA finds it a realistic target, but depending on the selected value chains the target might have to be reviewed during the mid-term evaluation. If already many women are working in the selected value chains, it might be optimistic to reach a 20% increase. The EA suggests an annual reporting frequency and milestones to be established in value chains where possible.

The project is aiming at increasing the number of women managers and entrepreneurs in the evolving new economic sectors such as digital innovation, platform-based business, green businesses and service sectors. The EA understands that there are other projects working on increasing women entrepreneurship in Bangladesh; it is therefore strongly recommended to keep track of these initiatives and to the extent possible coordinate to avoid overlapping.

Immediate Outcome 1210: *Increased capacity of value chain actors and business associations to promote growth of green jobs and enterprises in the selected value chains with high concentration of women, youths and persons with disabilities.*

The goal of the ProGRESS project is to have “Increased number of women in Bangladesh employed with decent work in a broader range of occupations”. The EA questions if this can be achieved through focusing on “selected value chains with high concentration of women”. Giving priority to such value chains would require that specific professions within the value chain with few or no women are given priority. Otherwise, the project will contribute to an even stronger concentration of women in the traditional women dominated occupations.

The M&E Plan sets a target of: “5 number of value chain’s actors engaged in making inputs and services available to the selected value chains”. The EA finds that this target is very low. The project should consider if it would be realistic to set a target of 5 actors within each selected value chain. A number of this size could eventually have an impact on the willingness and openness for engaging women in professions which traditionally have been dominated by men.

Under Output 1210-2 a target of five BDS which are providing new services such as digital innovation, green business and other training and tools i.e. coaching, mentoring and counselling. The EA finds the target relatively low when taking into account the length and size of the project. The EA recommends reviewing the possibilities of increasing the target. The indicator for this output points to the quality of the services; this could be measured by the number of clients using the services and their satisfaction rating.

For each of the selected value chains the business associations are expected to create a forum for coordination. The project expects that: “The forum will help to strengthen value chain governance for specific value chains.” Forums will be established/ strengthened at district and/or division level to coordinate and facilitate for VC governance. The EA recommended to the project team to consider a more detailed description of the work of the forums based on the value chain needs and capacity of the individual business associations. From stakeholder interviews the EA understands that many of the business associations have very limited capacity.

Output 1211: *Gender-focused value chain analysis and market research carried out to identify opportunities for increasing women’s employment in COVID-related value chains.*

It is not clear to the EA what a “COVID-related value chain” means. If it is related to testing and vaccination, then this seems not to be relevant anymore.

This output is not fully in line with Outcome 1210 and also not the Goal of the project as it just talks about “increasing women’s employment”. This does not mention the broader range of occupations and does not include the other disadvantaged groups. Therefore, the EA recommends to the project

to clarify and review Output 1211.

The EA understands that a maximum of six value chains will be selected but implementation at ground will be less. The target is set for three due to budgetary limitations. Compared to the overall political ambitions and the size of the project the EA finds this less ambitious. Output 1211-2 suggests a value chain analysis of the three identified value chains in the third quarter of year three of the project. The EA does not see the logic in conducting the analysis at this late stage of the project implementation as the value chains already will be identified in the first quarter of year one of the project. The analysis should be conducted shortly thereafter.

Output 1212: *Improved capacities of local businesses and their associations to adopt improved technologies and processes to drive productivity and efficiencies of the enterprises with high concentration of women and youths.*

See also comments under Output 1210 concerning concentration of women.

The EA does not find the logic in the target “4 training packages” as it in Output 1211 is indicated that the project will work with three value chains only. Further the EA has been informed that the number of packages will be based on demand.

Output 1212-2 informs that a group of 20 value chain actors will be trained to promote improved technology and processes. The EA would recommend that a target indicating that the trained actors are using their new knowledge and that there is a link to the aim of improving women’s access to new professions.

Output 1213: *Business associations and value chain actors are supported to advocate for the gender friendly businesses practices, policies, and regulations.*

The project should clarify what regulations are referred to under Output 1213-1; is it internal regulations in the enterprises, in the business associations or in legislation.

The project will train 60 people from 5 business associations, this seems rather ambitious as some of the associations have limited financial and human resources available; it will therefore be a challenge for the intervention to create activities which will be continued beyond the project.

The EA strongly recommends that ACTEMP is actively involved in the work with the business associations.

Immediate outcome 1220: *Improved coordination among the value chain actors and TVET institutes for training design and employment support services.*

The EA understands that the ILO will have a facilitating role, it is expected that the relevant market players will take the lead in the group and ensure functioning and coordination in a way that would be of interest for the members of the group.

It will be difficult to measure this Outcome as it would be the number of women employed, but measured up against what? It will also be difficult to document the ProGRESS impact on the achievements as there are many actors/ other projects targeted in the same direction.

The link between increased coordination and the tracking of gender employment targets is not clear. The EA suggests clarifying the link. It should likewise be explained how the sustainability of the tracking initiative will be secured beyond the project.

The project should establish clearly defined milestones for this Outcome as the overall measurement of achievements is a challenge.

Output 1221: *Value chain actors and training providers are supported to design and rollout market-relevant occupational, digital, entrepreneurship and managerial skill training focusing on the green sectors to the existing enterprises, women, youths, and disabled persons (DAPs).*

This Output is not very clear. The EA recommends reformulating and by that make it more understandable and action orientated.

For Output 1221-1 there might not be ISCs in all selected sectors. It is unclear how the different value chain actors should be capable of tracking women's employment.

Output 1221-2 is suggesting to support training providers in rolling out market relevant skills training. Such training needs to be based on an analysis of the market skills demand. The EA was informed that it is expected that some of the training packages to be rolled out are outside the current programming of the DTE TVIs, and new budget structure may take time to develop. Hence, as a matter of piloting the courses, the Project will have to finance the roll out through the training providers.

The EA would have liked to see an indicator on how many women and people from disadvantaged groups are receiving assistance and the effect of the assistance on their employment situation.

Output 1222: *Value chain actors are supported to design and implement career guidance/job placement services for the women and youths in the respective value chains.*

The EA suggests that the project is more inclusive in its approach and not limit the target group to "women and youth" only. The EA has included a missing Indicator definition under Output 1222-1.

The problem analysis does not discuss what the problems are with the existing services. Why they are not efficient and what could be done to improve their performance. In general stakeholders interviewed by the EA found the current set-up for job-placement cells insufficient. The project should investigate this before developing new initiatives.

Under Output 1222-1 "workers association" appears as a value chain actor to partner with TVET institutions for career guidance and job placement. The EA finds that it should be stated here if the project aims at a tripartite approach. If the trade unions foresee a role in the career guidance (which they have in many countries) it is very much welcome, but it will require significant investments in their capacity and also a change in mindset among other stakeholders. Even the EA finds the idea sympathetic; it is a question if it is realistic.

The project stated in Output 1222-2 that no business associations are offering career guidance and job placement service. The EA questions this statement and recommends that a mapping of all

existing services is conducted and lessons learned by the business associations are taken onboard in the planning of new activities.

Immediate Outcome 1230: *Improved access to quality business management and entrepreneurship development support services for women, youths, and Persons with disabilities in the selected areas.*

Outcome 1230-1 is a suggestion that no services currently are available. For EA suggestions see output 1222-2.

The project has set a target of an increase in new services offered by ten types of services. The EA cannot find any argument for this target and therefore recommends to determine the target based on the planned BDS mapping.

Under both Outcome 1230-2 and 1230-3 the project Indicator is mentioning only women, but in the definition it includes also persons with disabilities. The EA is suggesting to “clean up” the indicators and re-establish their logic.

Under the same two outcomes the targets set out seem to be unrealistic 3000 out of the total of 5000 should get access to financial and business development services and all 5000 would get access to business associations. This indicates that none of the beneficiaries would go into waged employment or get promotion within their current job, but all would go into self-employment/ entrepreneurship. The EA recommends that the project review the targets for this outcome.

Output 1231: *Technical assistance to Business Development Service (BDS) providers for need based and tailor made BDS services, including financial services, available to women, including green and e-commerce enterprises.*

The EA did not find a full match between the Output, Indicator and definition of Indicator. By editing the definition slightly, a better match is now in place.

The EA understands that the target indicates that only ten of the originally targeted 20 BDS providers will be able to provide the services in question. The EA does not find a 50% success rate is not satisfactory. The project should consider the selection criteria and the needs based technical and financial support to secure an increased success rate.

As the number of service providers is small (target 10) and therefore fragile it is recommended to have quarterly reporting in place to be able to intervene early if progress is lacking. It is likewise recommended to conduct a quality analysis of the progress in connection with the mid-term evaluation.

Output 1232: *Technical support to the value chain actors to promote women employment and entrepreneurship in the selected areas by making use of the ILO entrepreneurship development tools and methodologies.*

The project has changed the target from 100 to 250 women.

The EA suggests analysing the success rate among supported entrepreneurs during the mid- and end term evaluations.

Output 1233: *Technical and financial support to entrepreneurs to adopt green, gender friendly technologies in their enterprises/businesses.*

This Output needs a total review as the Indicators do not match and the Targets do not fit with e.g. Output 1232. The EA has no proposal for reformulating the Output.

The EA would appreciate it if the control functions in place for the financial support were an integrated part of the project documents. It will be important that the grants are provided through a fully transparent and objective procedure where criteria for providing financial support is understood by all stakeholders. A monthly reporting on financial support would be preferable, but as a minimum the reporting should be provided quarterly, with an option of conducting unannounced financial control.

Intermediate Outcome 1300: *Improved availability of accessible, inclusive, sustainable and green skills training opportunities for women, youths, persons with disabilities and other disadvantaged groups.*

The Indicator for this Outcome is highlighting both quantity (number of TVET institutes and BDS providers that offer training) and also that it should be quality training. The EA suggests that the quality of the training and the standard of inclusive training materials are measured against the percentage of graduates that get a new job or are promoted with an existing job after graduation and by that proving that the training meets market demands.

In addition to targets for gender equality that constitute the core of the intervention, targets for indigenous and tribal people and persons with disabilities inclusion for each group of direct beneficiaries is planned to be established through consultation and review during the inception stage and in reference to national policies. The EA did not find these initiatives in project documents and also not during stakeholder interviews. The EA suggests to report on the number of people from disadvantaged groups enrolled and graduated from green skills training.

The project has a target of 15 new TVET institutes and BDS providers offering green skills training to women and disadvantaged groups. The EA finds this an optimistic but realistic target. Another indicator is that 15 new training programs should be developed and approved. Even if it takes some time to get approval of new programs (6-12 months) it is doable to reach the target. It is however not clear from where the figure 15 comes, it would be preferable if the target is built on a skills gaps analysis in the selected sectors. Further the ILO should ensure that the constituents are involved in and agree to the skills gaps analysis.

Under Outcome 1300 one indicator indicates that 50% of trainees (women and people from disadvantaged groups) will benefit from green skills training. The EA understands this as 50% of participants will get a green job, start their own green business or get promoted to a position where the green skills can be of use. This is a very optimistic figure as the current uptake from training is far lower.

Both on the number of institutions, percentage of women and people from disadvantaged groups benefiting from training and number of programs an annually reporting is recommended.

Immediate outcome 1310: *Increased industry participation in identifying employment opportunities and reskilling, skills training needs for women and returnee migrants.*

A plan for sector relevant outreach to returned migrants should be developed. It would be difficult to calculate how many migrants get a job because of project contribution, but if a digital platform is established Google statistics can give an indication of the usefulness of the intervention. These data should be collected and analysed on a quarterly basis.

The Outcome 1310 has a target of 50 MoUs to be signed between TVET institutions and industries. This is ambitious, if these MoUs should be implemented. Unfortunately, it is often seen that the MoUs are signed within projects like ProGRESS but the implementation of the good intention is lacking. The project will work with 40 TVET institutions and a condition for cooperation will be signing of MoUs with industries. The EA understands “industries” as private sector enterprises.

The Indicator 2 for Outcome 1310 is targeted on a very specific type of apprenticeships. The EA assumes that the activities will be targeted towards the selected value chains even if this is not specified in the indicator. The number of such programs might according to informants be very limited if at all existing in the given value chains. There is no baseline identified the EA recommends to rely on business associations with whom the project will work as source for baseline data and also for the further data collection on progress and impact of the project activities.

In Indicator 3 for Outcome 1310 it is stated that 27% of all persons in apprenticeships and employment generation programs are women. It is however not indicated in what year these data are collected. The EA is concerned that apprenticeship programs and employment generation programs are mixed as the target groups might be very much different. For women employment it would be important to specify the sectors in which these programs are implemented as the women participation might differ significantly. The target set out in this Indicator is 35% meaning an increase of more than 30%, the EA finds this very much optimistic as the Indicator is not about access only but the de facto number of women enrolled into the programs.

The project is recommended to add an Indicator specifying that these should be quality jobs with decent working and employment conditions.

Output 1311: *Technical assistance provided to ISCs and TVET institutes on inclusive skills need anticipation in assessing job opportunities, skill needs and productivity gaps.*

The project has set a target of 4 skills that need analysis to be conducted. The EA recommends as far as the number of sectors/value chains not have been determined to set a target of one skills needs analysis per sector/value chain identified.

Many countries have good experiences from establishing local/ district sectoral ISCs to ensure that the training providers meet the needs of the local labour market.

EA interviews with stakeholders however disclosed very limited knowledge and/or interest in these new bodies among stakeholders. The EA understood that there are some inter-governmental competency issues linked to the mandate of the ISCs. The interviews also informed that the ISCs are not seen as tripartite bodies.

Under Output 1311 there is also an intention to conduct training programmes for the ISC, Business association members and TVET officials on skills needs assessment/review. The EA questions if it is efficient that staff in all these structures should have the capacity to conduct skills needs assessments. Such assessments are relatively complicated and would normally be placed with professionals.

Output 1312: *Technical assistance provided to key industry partners on expanding the scope and inclusiveness of flexible learning systems including Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL), apprenticeships and workplace-based learnings for target beneficiaries.*

Recommendation 9:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team and donor	Medium	Short-term	None

It is recommended to amend Output 1312 to make it clearer and action oriented. It should read: Technical assistance provided to key industry partners on expanding the scope and including apprenticeships and workplace-based learnings with certification through Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL) for target beneficiaries.

The project has a target of training 20 persons, but responsible officials (training participants) will be nominated by the department and the project can therefore not establish a quota for the number of women participants the EA was informed. The EA finds that this is a problematic practice and recommends to the project to have a minimum quota for gender balance in training and other activities. The EA understands that this can be a challenge, but initiatives need to be taken to at least touch the “glass ceiling”, if not break it in the first go.

It is the experience from many countries that a tripartite approach can help to secure the quality of apprenticeships and workplace-based training. This approach would also help to secure an objective reporting on the progress of the project in this field. Implementation of such programs are often challenged by the control of quality and the balance between theory and practice.

The project has a target of training 40 staff members from constituents and partner organisations on gender responsive apprenticeship systems. The EA finds that this number is relatively low taking into account the many expected partners. It should be recommended to give priority to finding possibilities within the project to expand the number of trainees. The persons trained under this Outcome can have a positive impact on implementation of other parts of the project.

The project has indicated an aim of 50% participation of women in these training programs but this will, according to project staff, depend on available staff in partner organizations.

The project has included returning migrants as a target group. The project is indicating efforts of re-integration of migrants to the local labor market. For returning migrants it would be a huge benefit if the skills obtained abroad could be recognized after return on the basis of their proven merits. This would however require development and adoption of regulations making the recognition of merits a rights-based approach. The current project has however no plans for addressing these

aspects of the challenges returning migrants are confronted with.

Output 1313: *Technical assistance on establishing gender focused institution-industry partnerships on TVET including capacity development for key implementers.*

Reporting is required with milestones until the proposed regulatory framework is in place.

Immediate outcome 1320: *Improved capacity of TVET institutions to expand their outreach, pedagogical practices and offer gender responsive skills training opportunities to youth, women and persons with disabilities using digital technology and other innovative learning modalities.*

It will be important to have an inclusive user-based approach for the development of the new pedagogical practices and materials.

The EA suggests including disadvantaged groups in the indicators which originally was targeted on women only. This to reflect the intentions of the Outcome.

Output 1321: *Technical assistance to the nodal ministry and TVET institutions to manage and implement skills development interventions including social marketing to promote, skilling, upskilling and re-skilling and formal qualification through RPL of migrant workers, focusing on green skills to women, including persons with disabilities.*

The project expects that all 40 TVET institutes involved with the project will conduct promotion activities. The EA finds this optimistic.

Output 1322: *Technical and financial assistance to TVET/skills training institutions to roll out market-relevant, gender friendly and inclusion focused training, assessment and certification programs targeting women, youths, and persons with disabilities in the green growth sector.*

Project staff indicates that no gender disaggregated target can be established for this Output. Data will be captured but cannot assume in advance.

The EA finds that under Output 1322 Indicator 2 the baseline could be a list of obstacles for the target groups access to training and the target could be a list of obstacles removed by the end of the project.

It is foreseen to train 500 persons with disabilities (5% of 10,000). It could be valuable learning also beyond the project to track these persons career path. The EA recommends using the planned app and/or other means to follow these persons after three months, six months, one year and if possible after two years.

Recommendation 10:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO and GoB	High	Medium-term	Medium

This project will train a relatively big group of persons with disabilities. It is recommended to use this opportunity to follow the graduates and the possible drop-outs in their career pathway and from this get important learning for future interventions.

The project suggests direct implementation of design of new training curricula. The EA is concerned that the approval process of new curricula can take a long time and a lot of resources. It is therefore recommended to use existing curricula just with use of alternative pedagogical methods such as e-learning.

Propose monitoring and evaluation methodology for data collection, processing, reporting and use

The EA is concerned that the social partners are not included neither in the PSC nor in the PIC. It would be of importance for the evaluability of the project that all three constituents have full insight in the project implementation. As this talks to the very DNA of the ILO the EA suggest a Recommendation to highlight the importance of tripartism also in skills development, gender equality and employment.

Recommendation 11:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO	High	Long-term	Low

The project is recommended to do all efforts to ensure that the social partners are involved with the project and that they are given the possibility to develop their capacity in projects fields of intervention. Also, at the local level the labour market can benefit from a tripartite approach. The project's potential for success is expected to increase with strong and active involvement from the social partners.

The methods to be used for collecting data from end beneficiaries depends to a large extent on accessibility of the internet, computers and smartphones.

The EA learned from informants that there is only limited experience in tracing the career path of students/ graduates. The EA did not find evidence that the institutes would be ready to allocate human resources for tracing graduates' career path after training. It is therefore suggested to randomly select a proportional group of male and female graduates to be contacted by phone after one month, three months, half year and one year.

A focal point in each institute should be responsible for contacting students and report back in a simple format to the project or the DTE if they agree to allocate resources to proceed with the data.

As a key player for the systemic change is foreseen to be the ISCs it should be investigated if it would be possible for the project to receive copies of the minutes from the ISC meetings to be able to intervene and offer support if bottlenecks appear.

To measure the progress and quality of the services provided by BDSs and other service providers to value chain actors. These should report on new products, new clients, increased turnover of students, enrolment vs. graduation and new decent jobs providers. DIFE/Labour Inspection, TUs or other authorities to confirm that jobs have decent working and employment conditions.

VII. Summary of Recommendations

Recommendation 1:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	High	Short-term	None

The Project Team is recommended to develop a joint vocabulary to ensure that all are on the same page and have the same understanding of the terms used in project documents when it comes to outcomes. If a common understanding is created it will ease the reporting and improve the evaluability of the project.

Recommendation 2:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	Low	Short-term	None

The project team is recommended to streamline the terms used in the project documents and internal and in external communication, this to avoid misunderstandings and misinterpretations. Using the same terms throughout the documentation will also make it easier for evaluators to understand the progress of the project.

Recommendation 3:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	High	Short-term	High

The establishment of a baseline for all parts of the project including sector/value chain level should be given the very highest priority. The revised Performance Monitoring Plan has a detailed description of the needed intervention.

Recommendation 4:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team and GoB	High	Short-term	Low

It is recommended to conduct an in-depth analysis of the progress in implementing the National Strategy for Promotion of Gender Equality in TVET, 2012. A review of the strategy is required for aligning this with NSDC and creating ownership of NSDC over it.

Recommendation 5:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	Medium	Long-term	Medium

The NSDP has been approved and the originally planned Indicator 1 for Outcome 1100 is not fully relevant anymore. The Project is recommended to develop advocacy activities towards the partner TVET institutes to contribute to the implementation of the gender equality elements of the NSDP.

Recommendation 6:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	Medium	Short-term	Medium

The project is recommended to conduct a survey among graduates not using the job placement services to identify push and pull stimulators.

Recommendation 7:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team and constituents	Medium	Long-term	Low

The project is Recommended to work together with relevant CSOs like OPD, and constituents to find new ways for establishing an inclusive training and working environment for persons with disabilities based on national and international experiences.

Recommendation 8:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team	High	Long-term	High

The teachers are key to attracting women to the TVET institutes. It is recommended to reallocate funds making it possible to train more teachers to create a women friendly and inclusive environment in the TVET institutions.

Recommendation 9:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO Project Team and donor	Medium	Short-term	None

It is recommended to amend Output 1312 to make it clearer and action oriented. It should read: Technical assistance provided to key industry partners on expanding the scope and including apprenticeships and workplace-based learnings with certification through Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL) for target beneficiaries.

Recommendation 10:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO and GoB	High	Medium-term	Medium

This project will train a relatively big group of persons with disabilities. It is recommended to use this opportunity to follow the graduates and the possible drop-outs in their career pathway and from this get important learning for future interventions.

Recommendation 11:

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO	High	Long-term	Low

The project is recommended to do all efforts to ensure that the social partners are involved with the project and that they are given the possibility to develop their capacity in projects fields of intervention. Also, at the local level the labour market can benefit from a tripartite approach. The project's potential for success is expected to increase with strong and active involvement from the social partners.

VIII. Conclusion

The EA notes that the current project has been long under way and over time changes have been made to the PD. After the TAPP now has been approved by the GoB there is a need to establish baselines for all elements of the project and if needed update some of the priorities accordingly. When establishing the baselines it would be important to use the expertise available both within the ILO, among the constituents and other stakeholders. A comprehensive baseline study in the selected industrial sectors/ value chains will enable the project team to target priority interventions and also it will create a solid foundation for the project's M&E Plan.

The current EA has not gone into details on the exact milestones to be established for indicators of achievements, this firstly because it needs discussion within the project team so that all find the targets both for the overall achievements and for the respective milestones achievable and by that take an ownership in them. Secondly, an experienced and well qualified M&E Officer has been employed and he has already outlined concrete plans for the instruments he plans to use for the monitoring process. The EA feels confident that the M&E mechanism technically is well served.

The Project Team is composed of experienced project staff, many of whom have been working together in other projects. The M&E procedures hereunder reporting requirements are therefore not new to them. The fact that the project has three components which are divided both when it comes to budget and staff can be a challenge for the M&E, it will be important to create a cross component ownership to maximise the achievements. Some activities and expected Outputs could have some overlap; it will therefore be important to have strong communication lines between the components in place. To achieve this it will be important to ensure that all have the same understanding of goals, objectives and targets to be met, when and by whom.

A major systemic change to achieve – a change that also could have a positive impact on women's access to certain male dominated professions would be to establish a tracer system on the TVET students career path. If the project manages to introduce a tracking system with the project partner institutions it can deliver important information for the M&E when it comes to quality and impact of the project activities. It is anecdotal reported that very few women are entering entrepreneurship after graduation and of those who do, the success rate is low. It would be important for the M&E also to collect information as far as it is possible from those who fail to get their business running, this to understand push and pull factors so that the project intervention can react to these.

The project has a target of 5% participation from people with disabilities and 3% from ethnic groups. The M&E needs to keep track of the quantity of participants from these groups to secure that targets are met. Experience tells it can be hard for the institutions to meet such targets often

because of lack of applicants. The M&E is therefore recommended to follow the progress in this field closely from day one and recommend the component leads to take action if lacking behind agreed milestones, this to avoid that by the end of the project the targets for these groups have not been met.

The EA finds that for the M&E process it would be important to establish ownership to the project among all three constituents. This also because well-functioning vocational training systems often build on a tripartite approach and by that can impact on the qualitative indicators of the project's achievements.

Annex 01: Revised Performance Monitoring Plan

This has been presented separately due to the length of the document.

Annex 02: Proposed ToR for the Mid-Term Evaluation

This has been presented separately due to the length of the document.

Annex 03: Key Assessment Questions

1. Intervention logic, risks and assumptions
 - 1.1 Do you find that the situation has been properly analysed?
 - 1.1.1 Are you aware if problem statement has been formulated through a situation analysis, baseline study or other evidence
 - 1.1.2 Stakeholders have been identified. Have you been involved in this process?
 - 1.1.3 The target population has been differentiated. Are you aware of the target group for the intervention?
 - 1.1.4 What are the operational systems in place which promote equality particularly in terms of digital access, enterprise development and green jobs?
 - 1.1.5 Are you aware of what the project wants to achieve?
 - 1.1.6 How can you document such achievements in your organization and/or beyond?
 - 1.2 Are the project's overall objectives clearly defined?
 - 1.2.1 The intervention specifies its contribution to the long-term ILO priorities and outcomes. Are you aware of this?
 - 1.2.2 The intervention specifies its linkage with DWCP objectives, CPOs, national strategies and the international development frameworks, including SDG targets. Was this discussed?
 - 1.2.3 Is the intervention linked to specific topics of the ILO's mandate (e.g. cross-cutting policy drivers) as well as pro-poor focus and inclusion of people with disabilities?
 - 1.2.4 Does the project document set out a clear and holistic approach to capacity development based on a capacity assessment of key partners in the results strategy?
 - 1.3 Does the document contain a strategy or Theory of Change or Logic for dealing with the problem?
 - 1.3.1 Have you been consulted concerning the Theory of Change/ intervention model when it was developed and does it reflect the logical connection between the project's situation analysis and its objectives and outcomes?
 - 1.3.2 Does the intervention explain the what, how and why of the intended change process, specifying causal links, mechanisms for change and assumptions?
 - 1.3.3 Does the intervention concentrate on dealing with root causes (causal logic established)
 - 1.3.4 Is the intervention relevant to the needs of the target group(s)?
 - 1.4 Any experience in employment/training of people living with disabilities?
 - 1.4.1 What sectors are open for employing people living with disabilities?
 - 1.4.2 Do they in general have access to the internet/ smartphone in rural areas?
 - 1.4.3 Are there any known skills gaps?
 - 1.4.4 Would this group have access to credit instruments?
 - 1.4.5 Does a demand for employment among disabled persons exist?
 - 1.5 What are the sectors most attractive to young people? And are they in demand in these?
 - 1.5.1 What are the challenges in creating employment for youth (18-35)?
 - 1.5.2 Do they in general have access to the internet?
 - 1.5.3 Would they take green jobs? And if, why?

- 1.6 What sectors are in practice open for employment of young women?
 - 1.6.1 What are the specific challenges for creating employment for young women?
 - 1.6.2 What interventions are needed to overcome these challenges?
 - 1.6.2 Is there an employment demand among young women?
- 1.7 Do women prefer wage jobs for self-employment?
 - 1.7.1 What are the main obstacles for women entering the labour market?
 - 1.7.2 Where do you see major skills gaps?
- 1.8 How does your organization/ department measure success of employment related interventions?
 - 1.8.1 Are you aware of instruments used in Bangladesh with success for tracing career paths for graduates from VET/TVET?
- 2. Quality of baseline, milestones and targets
 - 2.1 Are indicators appropriate proxies for the IOs?
 - 2.1.1 Do you find that there is a logical fit between indicators and outcomes, meaning the indicators measure the intended result?
 - 2.1.2 Do IOs enable reporting on progress under specific SDG targets and indicators?
 - 2.2 Are indicators of quality?
 - 2.2.1 Do indicators include a clear definition of what is being measured?
 - 2.2.2 Do indicators measure intended results?
 - 2.2.3 Are indicators Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Relevant and Time-bound (SMART)?
 - 2.2.4 Do indicators allow to capture gender equality, non-discrimination and people with disabilities concerns?
 - 2.3 Is Baseline information collected for each indicator?
 - 2.3.1 Does a baseline exist for each indicator? Were you eventually involved in establishing the baseline?
 - 2.3.2 Are baselines specific to the programme/project?
 - 2.3.3 Does baseline clearly describe the situation prior to the intervention?
 - 2.3.4 Is data available to track the baseline?
 - 2.3.5 Do baselines permit comparison of results?
 - 2.4 Are targets established for each indicator?
 - 2.4.1 Are targets specified for all indicators? Who defined the targets?
 - 2.4.2 Were targets computed by adding the amount of change desired to baselines?
- 3 Means of verification/measurement and methodologies
 - 3.1 Does the document propose the appropriate combination of annual reviews, mid-term and final evaluations?
 - 3.1.1 Does the project conform with ILO evaluation policy guidelines by including the appropriate amount of annual reviews, mid-term and final evaluations?
 - 3.1.2 How does the reporting and evaluation schedules fit into performance measures in your organization?

- 3.2 Does an M&E plan exist to conduct monitoring and evaluation in a systematic manner?
 - 3.2.1 Has a monitoring and evaluation plan been developed, did you participate in developing the plan?
 - 3.2.2 The results framework includes actions to achieve appropriate M&E results ((for example responsibilities and periodicity for data collection) do you see yourself/your organization as a part of this?
 - 3.2.3 Would it be possible that comparison groups are included for impact evaluation purposes?
 - 3.2.4 Is information needs for performance reporting well identified?
 - 3.2.5 Are roles and responsibilities for data collection, evaluation and reporting specified. Are you aware of your role in this?
 - 3.2.6 Have risks for the monitoring and evaluation system been defined with identified mitigation strategies?

- 3.3 What data collection and analyses methods in the M&E plan technically would be adequate?
 - 3.3.1 Will the methods proposed lead to valid and reliable propositions or are other interventions needed?
 - 3.3.2 Are you aware if a data gathering system to generate information on all indicators has been defined?
 - 3.3.3 Are methods technically and operationally feasible with appropriate levels of efforts and cost for value added by the information?
 - 3.3.4 Are sources of information specified for all indicators? Could you suggest more?

- 4. Infrastructure, human and financial resources
 - 4.1 Are you aware if the budget for the evaluations are properly expressed in the project budget?
 - 4.1.2 Is the evaluation budget on a separate line of the project budget?
 - 4.2 Are there adequate financial resources in the evaluation budget?
 - 4.2.1 Is the monitoring and evaluation budget adequate for the size and duration of the project?
 - 4.2.2 Have resources been identified and committed to ensure that predefined data will be collected and analysed?
 - 4.3 Are there adequate human resources available for M&E in the project and in your organization?
 - 4.3.1 Has a member of project management been designated to be responsible for M&E issues?
 - 4.3.2 Do you have human resources available in your organization for joining the project M&E?
 - 4.3.3 Are social partners and beneficiaries expected to participate in monitoring and evaluation?
 - 4.3.4 Are reporting mechanisms and products identified with clear responsibilities?
 - 4.4 Are organizational arrangements for M&E efficient?
 - 4.4.1 Is a M&E system used for work planning, implementation and reporting practices? Do you have such experience in your organization?
 - 4.4.2 Will tripartite partners engage in M&E and use available information?
 - 4.4.3 What M&E capacity do you have in place in your department/agency?

5 Partners' participation and use of information

5.1 Was the project proposal designed in a participatory manner?

5.1.1 Were constituents and other stakeholders involved in establishing project priorities and outcomes?

5.1.2 Are the areas of agreement and disagreement (if any) among constituents priorities and outcomes identified?

5.2 Was information from previous evaluations used to design the proposal?

5.2.1 Have lessons learned from past evaluations of projects and interventions been used to design the project?

5.3 Is there a plan for evaluation, reporting and dissemination?

5.3.1 Are you aware if the project has a communication strategy for evaluation results?

5.3.2 Will evaluation results be communicated to constituents and stakeholders in a timely fashion?

5.3.3 For what purpose could you eventually use evaluation results?

Other Questions:

a) What should be done to increase opportunities for wage- and self-employment of women?

b) What mechanisms are in place to align and implement the 2012 gender strategy, TVET Action Plan and national Skills Development Plan? What systems are in place for monitoring these?

Annex 04: List of Literature

ILO Guidance Note 4: “Considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects”.

ILO-EVAL guidelines in Evaluability Assessment:

Guidance Note 1.3: Procedure and Tools for Evaluability

https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_746707.pdf

Guidance Note 11 “Using the Evaluability Assessment Tool”,

Guidance Note 12 “Dimensions of the Evaluability Instrument” and the

Guidance Tool “Tools for Evaluability Review of ILO Projects over USD 5 million.

Guidance Note on Adopting Evaluation Methods to the ILO’s Normative and Tripartite Mandate: [wcms_721381.pdf](#) (ilo.org)

Technical Assistance Project Proposal (TAPP)

Project Document (original)

Agreement between the ILO and the GoB

Tracer Study Report, Arced Foundation – ILO (2018)

Decent Work Country Programme for Bangladesh, 2022-2026

Decent Work Country Programme Results Framework

Final Independent Evaluation, Bangladesh Skills for Employment and Productivity (B-SEP) (2018)

ProGRESS Logframe Matrix

ProGRESS Draft Implementation Plan

Government of Canada “Feminist International Assistance Policy Indicators”

Annex 05: List of Key Informants

SN	Region	Organization/ Institution/ Project/ Programme	Position	Name	Male/ Female
1	Dhaka	ILO, Dhaka	Enterprise, Skills and Employment Specialist	Gunjan Bahadur Dallakoti	Male
2	Dhaka	ILO, Dhaka	Programme Officer	Saif Moinul Islam	Male
3	Dhaka	ILO, ProGRESS	CTA	Pedro Bellen	Male
4	Dhaka	ILO, ProGRESS	Technical Specialist Enterprise Development	Nabin Karna	Male
5	Dhaka	ILO, ProGRESS	National Programme Officers	Alexius Chicham Tanjilut Tasnuba Tanjel ANM Ahsan	Male Female Male
6	Dhaka	ILO, ProGRESS	National Programme Officer - M&E	Mohammad Mohebur Rahman	Male
7	Dhaka	ILO, ProGRESS	Communications Officer	Farhana Alam	Female
8	Dhaka	ILO, ProGRESS	Admin and Finance Officer	Mehubub Ur Rahman Khan	Male
9	Dhaka	Technical and Madrasah Education Division	Joint Secretary Deputy Secretary	Mr. Shamsur Rahman Khan; Mr. Bashir Ullah	Male
10	Dhaka	Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training (BMET)	Not collected	Not collected	Male
11	Dhaka	Directorate of Technical Education	Director, Planning & Development	Engr. Md. Aktaruzzaman	

12	Dhaka	Ceramic ISC	Consultant Trainer Coordinator	Mohammad Abdul Jalil Ashraful Haque Julfiqar Ali	Male
13	Dhaka	Bangladesh Tourism Board	Deputy Director (PR & IR)	Rahnuma Salam Khan	Female
14	Dhaka	Bangladesh Business & Disability Network (BBDN)	Senior Program Manager	Golam Kibria	Male
15	Dhaka	Bangladesh Labour Federation (BLF)	General Secretary	Shakil Akhter Chowdhury	Male
16	Chattogram	Chattogram Women Chamber of Commerce & Industry (CWCCI)	Chief Executive Officer	Mr. Raihan	Male
17	Chattogram	Chattogram Mohila Technical Training Centre	Principal	Ms. Ashrifa	Female
18	Chattogram	Chattogram Mohila Polytechnic Institute	Principal	Md. Mosaddequl Bari	Male
19	Chattogram	Department of Youth Development (DYD)	Deputy Director	Mr. Projesh Kumar Saha	Male
20	Chattogram	Public Administration	Divisional Commissioner	Dr. Md. Aminur Rahman, NDC	Male
21	Chattogram	Bangladesh Jatiyatabadi Sramik Dol	President	A. M. Nazim Uddin	Male
22	Chattogram	National Association of Small and Cottage Industries of Bangladesh (NASCIB)	President	Md. Nurul Azom Khan	Male
23	Sylhet	Sylhet Technical School & College (STS&C)	Principal (interim)	Santosh Chandra Debnath	Male
24	Sylhet	Tour Guides Association (TGA) of Greater Sylhet	General Secretary	Mazharul Islam Sadi	Male

25	Sylhet	Sylhet Tourism Club	President	Humayun Kabir Liton	Male
26	Sylhet	Sylhet Women Chamber of Commerce & Industry (SWCCI)	President	Ms. Sharnalata Roy	Female
27	Sylhet	Ethnic Community Representative	Khasia Punji Headman	Not collected	Female
28	Sylhet	Tea Workers Union	Executive Secretary	Deb Kumar Das	Male
29	Sylhet	Bangladesh Jatiyatabadi Sramik Dal	Not collected	Ali Akbar	Male
30	Sylhet	Jatiya Sramik Jote (NCCWE)	Not collecte	Golam Kibria	Male

Annex 06: Proposed Theory of Change

Theory of Change (Narrative)

At the level of Immediate Outcomes

- *if* the capacity of Technical and Madrasah Education Division (TMED) and Directorate of Technical Education (DTE) to achieve explicit gender equality, digital access and green jobs targets through the implementation of National Skill Development Policy (NSDP), TVET Development Action Plan and SDG action Plan is improved and
- *if* the capacity of the DTE/TMED partner institutions and other relevant stakeholders in gender and green jobs focus and targeting in line with relevant NSDP objectives is improved and
- *if* the capacities of TVET providers (public and private) to provide gender responsive facilities, skills training and employment support services using e-learning remote and other accessible means of delivery are enhanced
- *then* The National Strategy on Gender Equality in TVET (2012), TVET Development Action Plan; NSDP 2020, national budget and operational systems which promote gender equality particularly in terms of digital access, enterprise development and green jobs are adopted and implemented.

- *if* capacity of value chain actors and business associations to promote growth of green jobs and enterprises in the selected value chains with high concentration of women, youths and persons with disabilities is increased and
- *if* coordination among the value chain actors and TVET institutes for training design and employment support services is improved and
- *if* access to quality business management and entrepreneurship development support services for women, youths, and Persons with disabilities in the selected areas is increased
- *then* opportunities for wage and self-employment of women within selected value chains and market systems, particularly in the green growth sectors are increased and

- *if* industry participation in identifying employment opportunities and reskilling, skills training needs for women and returnee migrants is increased and
- *if* capacity of TVET institutions to expand their outreach, pedagogical practices and offer gender responsive skills training opportunities to youth, women and persons with disabilities using digital technology and other innovative learning modalities is improved
- *then* availability of accessible, inclusive, sustainable and green skills training opportunities for women, youths, persons with disabilities and other disadvantaged groups is increased

At the higher intermediate level the ToC looks as follows:

- *if* the National Strategy on Gender Equality in TVET (2012), TVET Development Action Plan; NSDP 2020, national budget and operational systems which promote gender equality particularly in terms of digital access, enterprise development and green jobs are adopted and implemented and
- *if* opportunities for wage and self-employment of women within selected value chains and market systems, particularly in the green growth sectors are increased and
- *if* availability of accessible, inclusive, sustainable and green skills training opportunities for women, youths, persons with disabilities and other disadvantaged groups is increased
- *then* the number of women in Bangladesh employed with decent work in a broader range of occupations will be increased.

Theory of Change (Visual)

