



International
Labour
Organization



ILO Evaluation

Safety + Health for All Workers in Myanmar Project (Mid-Term Self-Evaluation)

Evaluation Title		Mid-Term Self-Evaluation	
Project Code	MMR/19/02/JPN		
Type of Evaluation	Self-Evaluation (Mid-Term)		
Country	Myanmar		
Date of Evaluation	1 Jan to 30 May 2022		
Evaluation Period	30 Mar 2020 to 31 st Dec 2021		
Name of Staff	Patricia MacDonald, Technical Officer ILO-Yangon		
ILO Administrative Office	ILO-Yangon		
ILO Technical Backstopping Office	LABADMIN/OSH Branch		
Date Project Ends	31 st Dec 2022		
Donor	The Government of Japan (Ministry of Health, Labour, and Welfare)		
Budget	USD 1,623,021.67 (from 30 Mar 2020 to 31 st Dec 2022)		
Evaluation Manager	Patricia MacDonald		
Key Words	Occupational Safety and Health, Myanmar		

CONTENTS

Acronym List	1
Executive Summary	2
I. Project Background & Description.....	6
1.1. Project Background	6
1.2. Project Implementation Context in Myanmar: A Timeline	6
II. Evaluation Background	9
2.1. Overall Scope of Evaluation	9
2.2. Specific Scope	9
2.3. Clients of the Evaluation	10
III. Methodology	10
3.1. Data Collection	10
3.2. Limitation.....	11
IV. Main Findings	11
4.1. Relevance.....	11
4.1.1. Project Contribution & Relevance	11
4.1.2. Project Beneficiaries' Needs & Possible Contributions by the Project in the Remaining Duration	12
4.1.3. Project Contribution Towards Achievement of Myanmar DWCP Outcomes, Relevant P&B outcomes and SDG Goals	13
4.2. Validity of Design	13
4.2.1. Validity of Project Immediate Objectives.....	13
4.2.2. Complementing with other ILO-Yangon Projects.....	14
4.2.3. Project's Risk and Assumption in Current Context	14
4.3. Project Progress & Effectiveness	15
4.4. Efficiency.....	17
4.4.1. Efficiency in Allocation and Usage of Funds.....	17
4.4.2. Optimization of Non-Monetary Resources	17
4.4.3. Time Efficiency.....	18
4.4.4. Leveraging Partnerships.....	18
4.4.5. Other constraints affecting efficiency	18
4.5. Impact.....	19
4.5.1. Project's Progress in Creating Positive Impacts	19
4.5.2. Potential to Create Further Positive Impacts	20
4.6. Sustainability	21
4.6.1. Survey Respondents Perspective of Project's Sustainability	21

4.6.2.	Sustainability of Project Outputs	21
4.7.	Gender and Inclusion Issues	22
4.8.	Tripartism and Social Dialogue	23
4.9.	International Labour Standards	23
V.	Conclusions	23
VI.	Lessons Learned & Emerging Good Practices	24
6.1.	Lessons Learned	24
6.2.	Emerging Good Practices	25
VII.	Recommendations	25
7.1.	Recommendations of the Mid-Term Evaluation to the Project	25
7.1.1.	Gender and Inclusion	26
7.1.2.	Reviewing Project Objectives	25
7.1.3.	Strategically Planning for Prospective Activities	26
7.2.	Recommendations to the Current Stakeholders	27
7.3.	Recommendations to the ILO	28
VIII.	Annexes	i
	Annex 1: Terms of Reference	i
	Annex 2: Project Progress and Output	v
	Annex 3: Theory of Change	x

Acronym List

AFFM-IUF	Agriculture & Farmer Federation of Myanmar (Food Allied Workers)- The International Union of Food, Agricultural, Hotel, Restaurant, Catering, Tobacco and Allied Workers' Associations
ASEAN	Association of South-East Asian Nations
CDM	Civil Disobedience Movement
CPO	Country Programme Outcome
CSO	Civil Society Organization
CTUM-ITUC	Confederation of Trade Unions Myanmar – International Trade Union Confederation
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
DWT	ILO Decent Work Technical Support Team for Southeast Asia
EAO	Ethnic Armed Organization
EO	Employers’ Organisation
FGLLID	Factories and General Labour Laws Inspection Department
ILO	International Labour Organization
ILS	International Labour Standard
IO	Immediate Objective
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MICS- TUF	Myanmar Industries, Crafts and Services Trade Union Federation – Trade Union Federation
MoHS	Ministry of Health and Sports
MoLIP	Ministry of Labour, Immigration and Population
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MTE	Mid-Term Evaluation
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NPC	National Project Coordinator
NUG	National Unity Government
OECD	Development Assistance Committee of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OSH	Occupational Safety and Health
PCC	Project Consultative Committee
PDF	People Defence Force
RBM	Results-Based Management
ROAP	(ILO) Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific
SAC	State Administrative Council
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
SME	Small and Medium-sized Enterprises
SSB	Social Security Board
ToC	Theory of Change
ToR	Terms of Reference
ToT	Training of Trainers
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
UMFCCI	Union of Myanmar Federation of Chambers of Commerce and Industry
UN	United Nations
VZF	Vision Zero Fund
WO	Workers’ Organisation

Executive Summary

Summary of the Project, Purpose, Logic and Structure

The ‘Safety + Health for All Workers in Myanmar’ is a 34-month project, originally planned to be implemented from March 2020 to December 2022, with a total budget of US\$1.623 million. The project is funded by the Ministry of Health, Labour, and Welfare, the Government of Japan and is implemented by the ILO-Yangon. As the project operation commenced in October 2020 due to COVID-19 related delays, this report covers an evaluation of activities between October 2020 and December 2021.

The ultimate objective of the project is for Myanmar workers to be safer and healthier. To reach this goal, the project was initially designed to implement:

Immediate Objective 1 (IO1): A holistic approach to ensure that the government, employers and workers adopt/revise governance instruments to build a promotional framework for Occupational Safety and Health (OSH),

Immediate Objective 2 (IO2): Institutions such as the Ministry of Health and Sports, take policy and operational measures to enhance access to occupational health services,

Immediate Objective 3 (IO3): Social partners and educational institutions to implement programmes to address OSH issues,

Immediate Objective 4 (IO4): Workers to increasingly demand Safe and Healthy workplaces.

The project was decentralized and thus under the responsibility of the ILO Liaison Office in Yangon, Myanmar. The project is managed by a technical officer based in Ottawa, Canada, reporting to the ILO Liaison Officer in Yangon, with support from a National Programme Officer and an Administrative and Finance Assistant also based in Yangon. The Chief Technical Advisor (CTA) is based in Bangkok, Thailand, and technical backstopping is provided by the Senior Specialist, Occupational Safety and Health, in Bangkok, Thailand. The project received support from Senior Administrator, Programme & Operations Officer and Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Officer in LABADMIN/OSH in Geneva HQ.

The project had been designed in 2019, prior to both the COVID-19 pandemic and the February 1, 2021, military takeover of the democratically elected government in Myanmar, and was thus intended for a context significantly different from the reality over the course of the evaluation period. Originally intended to start March 1, 2020, the project was delayed by seven months, and was fully staffed and operational only for three months before the military takeover. While initial progress was strong, a moratorium on working with the de facto government and the breakdown of social dialogue and the tripartite post-military takeover significantly affected the Myanmar landscape and consequently rendered implementation of some activities impossible, particularly under Objectives 1 & 2. Despite this, the project staff were able to respond to the needs of some constituents and were able to modify activities, particularly those under Objectives 3 & 4.

Purpose, Scope and Clients of the Evaluation

This report serves as the mid-term self-evaluation report for the project. The purpose of this mid-term self-evaluation is organizational learning and programme improvement. The clients and target audience of the mid-term evaluation include the Government of Japan, management of the ILO/Japan Multi-bilateral Programme, the ILO Regional Office for Asia, and the Pacific (ROAP), the

LABADMIN/OSH Branch in ILO/HQ as technical backstopping unit, ILO project management based in Bangkok and Yangon and the partners of the project including the constituents in Myanmar.

Methodology of the Mid-Term Self-Evaluation

The project mid-term self-evaluation covers the following evaluation criteria: relevance, validity of design, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, and sustainability as defined in the ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation. The evaluation was conducted following UN evaluation standards and norms and the Glossary of key terms in evaluation and results-based management developed by the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development's (OECD) Development Assistance Committee (DAC). A term of reference (ToR) was developed by project officials at the ILO-Yangon office in conjunction with and reviewed by Monitoring and Evaluation Officer at LABADMIN/OSH at ILO headquarters in Geneva.

Criteria were assessed through mid-term evaluation questionnaires which was distributed to 13 representatives of project stakeholders and 2 members of the ILO Yangon team. The project team received 9 responses in total. A follow-up interview questionnaire with members of the ILO Yangon team was subsequently conducted. Due to the security issues, constant military surveillance, and issuance of warrants, many of the union members are in hiding and establishing consistent contact with them remains challenging. Therefore, the project team constructed this evaluation report with the best feasible sources of information such as from the mid-term self-evaluation questionnaires findings, project activity reports and project progress report, as well as sourcing information from regular meetings with other ILO officials in HQ and Bangkok and reflecting on feedback and suggestions received. In general, mid-term self-evaluation questionnaires were developed by the SHFA Myanmar project team with consultation and approval from the Monitoring and Evaluation Officer at LABADMIN/OSH in ILO Headquarters.

Main Findings and Conclusions

Relevance – The project has considered the beneficiaries needs, including the emergency needs such as COVID-19 prevention training, provision of COVID-19 support materials and Mental Health awareness at Work training based on the current context. Although highly positive responses on the relevance of the project objectives from the survey respondents were received, the project would benefit from reprogramming, especially certain objectives that require engagement with the de facto authority, to adjust to the current conditions in Myanmar. Development or amendment of the theory of change, targeting new beneficiary groups, and implementing activities through non-traditional partners is needed for the project. In this regard, the project is reported to be drafting strategic activities for the remaining duration of the project with the aim to build foundations at the workplace level through awareness raising and capacity building, and continue to be responsive to contextual needs.

Validity of Design – A review of the validity of design was conducted by the independent evaluation experts, who based their analysis primarily on feedback received through the stakeholders responding to the evaluation questionnaire, project reports and original design documents. Of note, the project was designed over several months in 2019, prior to the global pandemic and more than a year before

the military takeover. Within this context, the evaluators found the original design, including the original theory of change, valid.

Feedback received from operations team in LABADMIN/OSH (HQ, Geneva) and reflection from project staff including the technical and national programme officers, determines the project design is no longer applicable. As the project was designed to work largely on building a national OSH framework, a significant portion of project activities involved working directly with line ministries, in consultation with employers' and workers' organizations. Requirements which are no longer permissible. Consequently, while the overall objective remains valid, a new theory of change, strategic and operational planning are required.

Effectiveness – The project could not meet 2 of its immediate objectives as these involved engagement with the de facto authority. Nonetheless, the project made progress in its OSH awareness raising activities, occupational health promotion training activities, and capacity building of the OSH consultants at the time of writing. As the situation evolves, the project team continues to identify the social partners' and new partners' needs through liaising with other project teams under the ILO-Yangon, and the social partners wherever possible. The project is also reported to be planning for its activities for 2022 to continue fulfilling the immediate objective 3 and 4 as described above. In anticipation of new directions by UNCT, the project team can adapt the changes accordingly.

Efficiency – The project has an implementation rate of 37% of the total project budget of \$1.6 million. This delivery rate covers the period of March 2020 – December 2021, which includes a seven-month period in which the project was not operational due to COVID-19 pandemic-related delays. The February 1, 2021, military takeover of the democratically elected government, combined with several waves of COVID-19, and global economic disruptions resulting from the COVID-19 pandemic resulted in the creation of an implementation context markedly different from that for which the project was originally designed. A significant portion of the work undertaken during the evaluation period was marked by adapting to emerging challenges associated with the disruptions caused by the large-scale events. This is where the project has successfully coordinated with other OSH project such as Vision Zero Fund to develop COVID-19 prevention in workplaces training module, commemorate Safe Day 2021, and provided capacity building activity to OSH consultants through XXII World Congress for Safety and Health at Work 2021. With the ILO-Yangon Liaison Officer's direction, the project has responded to the needs of over 550 migrant workers through a trade union with COVID-19 prevention information sharing and support materials. Despite the challenges, the project was able to adapt to the changing conditions, deliver some activities, with more, sustainable, interventions planned or underway.

Sustainability – As the emergency situation in Myanmar unfolded over 2021, the project shifted focus solely from sustainability to include some emergency response to ILO constituents. This was undertaken at the direction of the ILO Liaison officer, to support ILO constituents during the "double crisis", and to establish new partnerships with non-traditional partners. Consequently, some activities included sustainable practices (e.g., train-the-trainer COVID-19 prevention), and emergency support (provision of PPE, COVID-19 testing, other supports for workers).

Sustainability had been incorporated into the original project design. Given the circumstances described in earlier parts of this report, many of the sustainable activities originally envisioned are no longer possible. Nonetheless, the initially planned IO3 is still perceived to have high likelihood of continuation post-project, including the new common OSH modules and OSH content in TVET. Additionally, the project team has reported to be preparing the strategic project activity planning for the remaining project duration, with sustainability at the core of planning. In addition to TVET activities,

Gender and Inclusion – The project is found to be making conscious effort in mainstreaming gender and inclusion approach in its implementation. The project activities have so far benefited both female and male beneficiaries equally. Nonetheless, the project still needs to strengthen its gender responsive approach.

Conclusions

The Project faced significant barriers to implementation associated with both the COVID-19 pandemic and the military takeover. As a result, the project was not able to implement many planned activities, and in most cases, these planned activities remain unimplementable due to prohibitions on working with the de facto government.

The project adapted in the context of 2021 to focus on emergency needs of beneficiaries, developing mitigation strategies for new and emergent barriers, identifying new implementing partners, and establishing relationships to gain access to workers on the ground. In so doing, the project was able to demonstrate flexibility and responsiveness, and an ability to deliver some activities in challenging contexts. Gains made in 2021 are expected to carry-over to 2022, and should the political and general safety context remain largely the same, allow for improved implementation through 2022 and beyond.

The project as originally designed is no longer applicable to the Myanmar context, and consequently the project would benefit from a reprogramming exercise to determine how best to advance the overall objective and new, specific, immediate objectives.

The project would benefit from an extension into 2023 to deliver objectives in the new context. Funding for the period of March 2020-October 2020 can be allocated to cover the additional period.

Recommendations

- 1) Undertake a project reprogramming, establishing a new theory of change and replacing obsolete immediate objectives with updated objectives, aligned with the Safety + Health for All Flagship Programme Phase II, and applicable to the current Myanmar context.
- 2) Identify new target beneficiaries, such as informal, new and future workers, or OSH professionals, to build capacity and protect gains made in Occupational Safety and Health to date.
- 3) Continue to identify and build relationships with new and partners as the means to expand networks and reach target beneficiaries through non-traditional means. Additionally, continue to explore working with social partners as and when the political and security situations allow.

- 4) In the absence of the ability to support a national framework, continue to focus implementation at the workplace-level and promote best practices in accordance with appropriate ILO Conventions, standards, and guidelines. Additionally, explore new opportunities at the regional or international level.
- 5) Ensure sustainability is prioritized in identifying new potential activities
- 6) Improve efforts on gender and inclusiveness considerations in future activities

I. Project Background & Description

1.1. Project Background

Myanmar's parliament passed the new Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) Law in March 2019, which is a major step towards the Government's provisions for safer and healthier workplaces. The passage of the law calls for assistance in its implementation, particularly in drafting regulations, improvement of OSH data collection and analysis, capacity building and awareness raising. Although a national OSH profile was developed in Myanmar with ILO support in 2018, there is a need to develop a national OSH policy and/or national OSH programme. Nonetheless, a number of challenges remain for the full implementation of this legislation and to build a preventative culture on safety and health in the country.

The ultimate objective of the project is for Myanmar workers to be safer and healthier. To reach this goal, the project is mandated with the immediate objectives below:

- **Immediate Objective 1 (IO1):** To implement a holistic approach to support the Government, employers' and workers' organizations in adopting or revising governance instruments to build a promotional framework for OSH.
- **Immediate Objective 2 (IO2):** Institutions, and in particular the Ministry of Health and Sports, take policy and operational measures to enhance access to occupational health services.
- **Immediate Objective 3 (IO3):** Social partners and educational institutions implement programmes to address OSH issues.
- **Immediate Objective 4 (IO4):** Workers increasingly demand Safe and Healthy workplaces.

The project is implemented in the framework of the ILO Flagship programme on OSH Safety + Health for All and builds on results achieved by other projects such as SafeYouth@Work. The project is part of the ILO OSH Project Portfolio in the ILO Liaison Office in Yangon. It complements other OSH projects, such as the Vision Zero Fund focusing on agriculture, garment and construction supply chains. The ILO OSH Portfolio is the implementing arm of Myanmar's Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) 2018-2021, Priority 3, Outcome 3.3: "By 2021, an integrated and unified OSH system is in place and implemented". The project therefore contributes to the implementation of the DWCP through its role in the OSH Portfolio.

1.2. Project Implementation Context in Myanmar: A Timeline

The project was initially expected to commence March 1, 2020, however the COVID-19 pandemic resulted in significant delays to project commencement, including staffing. The technical officer and

finance and admin officers started on October 1 and began preliminary activities, including completing staffing actions for the project. Full staffing was finalized mid-November 2020 and further planning and implementation of activities began. Between November 2020 and January 2021, meetings were held with the Myanmar Ministry of Labour, Immigration and Population (MoLIP), and the Ministry of Health and Sport (MoHS). The project was presented at the Portfolio Consultative Committee (PCC), the steering committee comprised of Government, Union, and Employers as well as ILO officials in November 2020. First rounds of review of OSH regulations, particularly Business Registration and Notification & Recording of Occupational Accidents, Injuries and Illnesses, were completed, and initial work on Occupational Health Services Assessment and the Occupational Diseases List commenced.

On February 1, 2021, the Myanmar military, the Tatmadaw, overthrew the democratically elected government, imprisoned the head of state and other officials, and established a military-led State Administrative Council (SAC) as the de facto government. A civil disobedience movement (CDM) commenced characterized by large public protests and many public and private sector employees leaving their positions. Civil disobedience acts, particularly public protests, were met with violent crackdowns, and activities designed to terrorize citizens, including releasing violent actors into neighbourhoods at night. The situation exacerbated the already delicate economic situation in Myanmar resulting from the COVID-19 pandemic.

In the immediate aftermath of the military takeover tripartite mechanisms facilitating social dialogue, including the PCC, broke down as unions representatives officially withdrew in protest. The Project Coordination Committee (PCC), the committee of government, workers, and employers in place to advise on the direction of the project activity, was dissolved after the PCC meeting in November 2020.

In the wake of these events, direction came from ILO and UN heads in the country to pause all activities involving the government until direction from the UN HQ in New York was received. The first direction came in March in the form an interim *Principles of Engagement*¹, which set out conditions for projects to remain in operation in Myanmar and prohibiting all work with the SAC. Through March and April 2021, the project was required to undergo an internal review by ILO-Yangon officials to determine if the activities could be adjusted in the short term to avoid working with the de facto authorities. The project undertook the review and was deemed to have viable activities but was prohibited from engaging with the de facto authorities. Meanwhile, many international staff serving in Yangon were evacuated in April, and in July 2021 Yangon was declared a non-family duty station.

Consequently, project staff had to engage in creative thinking to identify new partners. Adhering to the original outcomes intended by the project designers, while simultaneously operating within an environment constrained by political unrest, public health measures to address the pandemic, operational constraints associated with having staff located outside Myanmar, frequent power and internet outages, and constraints associated with directions on engagement developed in response to the global reaction to the military takeover and the requirements of donors presented challenges. As a result, non-traditional partners, particularly civil society organizations (CSOs) and not-for-profit

¹ The UNCT guidance specifies that programming can continue if a clear case can be made that it meets any or a combination of the following criteria and compiles with specific risk criteria: (a) the benefits of programming accrue primarily and directly to the people or local communities without discrimination; (b) programming supports the strengthening of the rule of law; (c) programming supports the protection and promotion of the human rights; (d) programming contributes to preserving, to the extent possible, the democratic space.

organizations and institutions, have become the project's main partners and a reliable, and in some cases, exclusive means to reach project beneficiaries – e.g., workers. For example, while traditionally outreach to workers would be undertaken through unions (and is still the case in some situations, such as reaching migrant workers to deliver supports in combating COVID-19), the project funded a civil society organization to deliver COVID-19 prevention training and supportive materials to workers unaffiliated with unions, and in informal work. This connection represents a key partnership which can be leveraged in the future.

On April 16th, 2021, a National Unity Government (NUG) was formed counterpoint to the SAC. Comprised of former elected officials ousted in the military takeover, the NUG serves as a government-in-exile and formed, in May, a paramilitary wing; the People's Defence Force (PDF). Working at times in cooperation with ethnic armed organizations (EAOs), the PDF commenced training and ultimately combat with Tatmadaw forces through Myanmar and particularly in frontiers and peripheral areas.

In June and July 2021, less than 6 months after the military takeover, a third and devastating wave of COVID-19 swept through Myanmar. At the same time, the economic situation in Myanmar continued to deteriorate and crackdowns by the SAC worsened. In retaliation for condemning the military takeover and refusing to work with the SAC, the ILO was threatened with a cancellation of the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) authorizing implementation of the Decent Work Country Programme. Consequently, ILO Bank accounts in Myanmar were frozen, effectively preventing payment for services to domestic partners, entry visas and extensions on visas for ILO officials were refused, and staff were unable to return to Yangon, and in some cases were forced to relocate to Bangkok.

In its report to the Governing Body in November 2021, the ILO reported of this period that an estimated 1.6 million jobs were lost in the first half of 2021.² The World Bank reported an expected contraction of the economy by 18%.³ COVID-19 related deaths exceeded the number of deaths from both the first and second waves combined, with some sources estimating the unofficial death toll at over 100,000⁴. The SAC continued crackdowns on dissidents, and issued arrest warrants for union officials, forcing them into hiding and preventing in many cases the ILO from contacting them directly. Sanctions were issued against Myanmar and heads of the military by various governments. Calls for boycotting of Myanmar companies, compounded with the economic conditions globally because of the pandemic, contributed to a near-collapse over several sectors, particularly the garment sector. Women were particularly hard-hit by the “double crises” of COVID-19 and the military takeover, with reports suggesting that up to a third of women workers from the garment sector turned to sex work⁵ to support themselves and their families.

² https://www.ilo.org/yangon/press/WCMS_835953/lang-en/index.htm#:~:text=Military%20takeover%20hammers%20labour%20market,19%2C%20women%20workers%20hit%20hardest.

³ <https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2021/07/23/myanmar-economy-expected-to-contract-by-18-percent-in-fy2021-report>

⁴ <https://www.frontiermyanmar.net/en/covid-cover-up-third-wave-death-toll-may-be-in-hundreds-of-thousands/>

⁵ <http://burmese.dvb.no/archives/495205>

By September, the SAC rescinded their threat to cancel the MOU, and relaxed some restrictions on ILO domestic banking, though the office continues to face “serious obstacles in conducting transactions to pay implementing partners” due to increased scrutiny by and approvals from the Central Bank in conducting banking transactions.⁶ This has resulted in some cases in refusal by the Central Bank to process transactions until broader SAC demands have been met. International officials were still not permitted to enter the country. The third wave of COVID-19 receded, and a new period marked by a rise in formal conflict between EAOs, PDF, and Tatmadaw forces emerged at the formal launch of a “defensive war” declared by the NUG.

As of November, Confederation of Trade Unions Myanmar (CTUM-ITUC) reported that, since the military takeover, 35 of its leaders and members and a further nine workers from partner organizations had been arrested. In addition, 48 CTUM leaders and members had warrants out for their arrest and 25 have had their passports cancelled.

Additionally, the Myanmar Industrial Crafts and Services Trade Unions Federation (MICS-TUF) offices in Mandalay were raided and the General Secretary was arrested by the military authorities in June 2021. As of January 2022, over 1,500 people have been killed for voicing opposition to the military government, at least 11,787 people had been arbitrarily detained of whom 8,792 remain in custody and at least 290 people have died while in detention. There are credible reports that many deaths in detention are the result of torture.”⁷

Conflict in many parts of the country continues as PDF, EAO and Tatmadaw forces continue to engage in hostilities. Tatmadaw forces have attacked several villages, killing civilians, and burning the villages to the ground. Since February 1, 2021, over 440,000 people have been displaced in addition to the 370,000 already displaced prior to the military takeover. The United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs has stated that “the crisis is projected to drive almost half the population into poverty in 2022.”

As the conflict deepens and economic conditions worsen, commodity prices such as food and fuel have risen sharply. This coupled with sharp rise in job losses and reduced working hours as resulted a dire situation for many workers. Reports of labour rights violations, including in intimidation and harassment in workplaces, have risen.

II. Evaluation Background

2.1. Overall Scope of Evaluation

The mid-term self-evaluation examines the project implementation period since project inception in October 2020 until December 2021.

2.2. Specific Scope

The aim of the midterm self-evaluation of ILO-/SHFA project is to assess the project with 6 criteria (Relevance, Validity of the Design, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Impact and Sustainability), for

⁶ https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/news/WCMS_840338/lang--en/index.htm

⁷ https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/news/WCMS_827567/lang--en/index.htm

organizational learning and good practices, and to make recommendations for project improvement. In usual circumstances, the self-evaluation at the ILO does not require an exclusive report, rather the findings are reported using a special reporting template. Nonetheless, the project functions in a highly volatile, difficult, and unstable context. Therefore, the project team decided to conduct in-depth examination along with the standard evaluation criteria as these would be useful to inform decision making on the project's future strategies. It must be noted that self-evaluation in the ILO does not undergo the approval process applicable to other types of evaluations. Therefore, the findings and recommendations from this mid-term self-evaluation are solely for internal reflections and decision making.

2.3. Clients of the Evaluation

The clients and target audience of the mid-term evaluation include the Government of Japan, management of the ILO/Japan Multi-bilateral Programme, the ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (ROAP), the LABADMIN/OSH Branch in ILO/HQ as technical backstopping unit, ILO project management based in Bangkok and Yangon and the partners of the project including the constituents in Myanmar.

III. Methodology

The present mid-term self-evaluation of the SHFA Myanmar project is based upon the ILO's evaluation policy and procedures. The ILO adheres to the United Nations system's evaluation norms and standards as well as to the OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards.

The ILO uses a conceptual framework that is consistent with Results-Based Management (RBM) and which addresses the following six Evaluation Criteria as specified in the Terms of Reference (ToR). (See Annex 1). These six criteria are 1) Relevance of the Project, 2) Validity of Design, 3) Project Progress and Effectiveness, 4) Efficiency of Resource Use, 5) Impact, and 6) Sustainability.

3.1. Data Collection

The project team developed the mid-term self-evaluation questionnaire on the above six evaluation criteria in consultation with and approval from the Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Specialist at the HQ/Geneva. The data collected by the project team through primary and secondary sources was then analysed by a consultant who also drafted this report. The evaluation criteria were assessed through the mid-term evaluation questionnaires which was distributed to 13 representatives of the project stakeholders and 2 members of the ILO Yangon team. The project team has received 9 responses in total. The follow up interview questionnaire with a member of ILO Yangon team was subsequently conducted regarding the project contributions towards the achievement of the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP), the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG), and the ILO Programme and Budget (P&B). Herein, these participants will be referred to as "Survey Respondents".

Key Stakeholders who participated in the survey include:

- Vision Zero Fund Project Team (Myanmar) Project within ILO Yangon
- TRIANGLE Project Team (Myanmar) Project within ILO Yangon
- CVT Myanmar, TVET Institution
- Photo Doc Association, CSO
- Skill for Humanity, CSO

- Win OSH Services, OSH Institute
- AK Safety, OSH Institute
- Safe Mind Myanmar, OSH Institute
- Converge Safety Myanmar, OSH Institute

Additionally, the mid-term self-evaluation was carried out through the review and analysis of other secondary data, including project documents, progress reports, workshop/training reports, relevant correspondence and others as deemed appropriate. Input from HQ and Bangkok, including the donor liaison and CTA, was gathered from periodic meetings and correspondences, and their input into drafts of this report.

3.2. Limitation

In compliance with the UNCT Principles of Engagement, this mid-term self-evaluation did not include primary data collection from the governmental representatives, including from the MoLIP and MoHS. This has effectively reduced the survey respondent base for the project.

The escalating violence and unprecedented challenges around telecommunication, including electricity cut and internet cut, at the time of data collection has resulted in delays as productivity in Myanmar is particularly low. These challenges have also impacted collection of data directly from the primary institutions that the project has relied on to reach out to workers, instead of directly sourcing primary information from the workers. These events have also resulted in project team to choose data collection method that do not impose security risk to the potential respondents, evaluators, and the project team based in Yangon.

IV. Main Findings

4.1. Relevance

4.1.1. Project Contribution & Relevance

Regarding how well the project contributes to the achievements of outcomes, all the survey respondents agree that the project activities meet their expectations and needs. The COVID-19 Awareness Training provided by the project for workers representatives from the Workers' Organizations, and CSOs, and delivering of personal protective equipment for returning migrant workers and frontline service providers in the quarantine Centres at the Thai-Burma Border are found to be very useful by the respondents.

The survey respondents indicated that the project's activity on Mental Health Awareness 2022 demonstrates that the project responsiveness to high priority issues and recommends continuing work on mental health to meet the growing need among the population. In this respect, the project responsiveness, coordination, and approach are highly relevant and beneficial for Myanmar constituents. One of the evaluation respondents said that "We are in the process of planning and working with ILO for OSH activities. So far, we are satisfied with ILO OSH service and contribution." In this context, the respondent was referring to technical assistance.

In another instance, the project was able to work with a non-profit TVET organization, CVT Myanmar, at developing a basis OSH module commonly used in all TVET curriculum and integrating OSH into their core curricula: Business Administration, Electrician, Furniture Technician, and Metal Technician.

4.1.2. Project Beneficiaries' Needs & Possible Contributions by the Project in the Remaining Duration

More than half of the survey respondents indicated that the project objectives are still relevant and highly consistent with the country needs and beneficiaries' requirements, except for the objective 1.1, which is on adoption/ revision of governance instruments to build OSH promotion framework (including National OSH system and OSH programme).

Despite the above challenge, the project remains highly relevant to Myanmar, if reprogrammed to adjust to the current conditions. High rates of job losses, economic downturn, increases in labour rights violations, and increasing poverty rates all point to significant increases in vulnerability of workers, and protecting gains made in occupational safety and health remain critical in this context. These conditions may also lead to an increase in work in informal settings, a segment of the labour market already very high in Myanmar. In 2017 alone, the informal employment in Myanmar was estimated to be at 84% of the total employment.⁸

Furthermore, despite the economic downturn, demand for training and knowledge building from many, including OSH professionals (such as OSH Engineers, OSH Consultants, etc) continues. Demand for issue-specific OSH support from constituents and informal workers, particularly around mental health in the workplace, has increased, greatly exceeding the current capacity in country. For example, the project team was approached by an employer organization, Myanmar Construction Entrepreneur Federation (MCEF), on the need of Mental Health awareness at workplaces and de-stigmatization for the construction workers. Thus, while the context in which the project was envisioned has disappeared, the need and demand for OSH awareness raising and capacity building remains. Reprogramming the Safety+Health for All Myanmar project, including developing a new theory of change, targeting new populations and implementing activities through new partners is viable.

A similar observation is also found from the survey respondents. The respondents are of the view that OSH is a "must activity" for all workplaces. Myanmar workers need wide range of OSH assistances, such as awareness raising, capacity building on workplace risk management with focus on gender-based violence and harassment as well as occupational health and wellbeing. In particular, mental health at work has become a priority issue as workers are exposed to high-level of stress mentally and economically due to COVID-19 Pandemic and the general insecure conditions due to the military takeover.

In terms of potential scope and sectors for the project to focus during the remaining period, one of the survey respondents suggested the project could consider capacity enhancement on safety and health risk assessment and control" as this would be one of the fundamental OSH approaches applicable in the current context. Given the low capacity, including labour inspection and labour law enforcement, before the coup and the potential for further reduced capacity, arising from the Civil Disobedience Movement (CDM) among the civilian staffs and the constraining of unions, workers may be at a higher disadvantage with respect to capacity and knowledge on hazard identification, analysis, and risk assessment. This is in addition to another evaluation respondent's suggestion for the project to also look for OSH interventions at the Micro and Small enterprises and the informal sector. The ILO estimated that 1.6 million jobs were lost over 2021, and trade unions report that in addition to

⁸ ILO (2020): Extending the Scope of Social Security to Internal Migrants in the Informal Economy: An Analysis for Myanmar ([Link](#))

addition to increased unemployment, workers still employed are facing various labour rights violations, including in OSH. Thus, OSH interventions would be in dire needs in these sectors.

...

4.1.3. Project Contribution Towards Achievement of Myanmar DWCP Outcomes, Relevant P&B outcomes and SDG Goals

The project is designed to contribute towards the achievement of DWCP Priority 3, Outcome 3.3 which states that “By 2021, an integrated and unified OSH system is in place and implemented”, the project contribution could be moderate. The project started in the middle of the pandemic and not long before the military takeover and as a result, tripartite work has collapsed. This prevented the project from engaging in stakeholder consultations and building relationships.

A lack of social dialogue prevents the engagement required for the achievement of national level results. This is in addition to the sensitivity and caution to be employed around the promotion of social dialogue when implementing activities for the workplace-level indicators. This is beyond the project’s control. However, according to the evaluation participant, the project is perceived to have contributed to achieving the DWCP outcome 3.3 to a moderate extent. Respondents also indicated that the project can still continue to contribute towards DWCP outcomes by working on building the foundations at workplace level through awareness raising and capacity building and continuing to be flexible to respond to contextual needs, while being mindful of sustainability, such as in its response to COVID-19 and mental health awareness.

Likewise, the project contribution towards the achievement of P&B output 7.2 could be said to be of a moderate extent based on the respondents’ perspectives. As the project is following UNCT Principles of Engagement, the achievement of P&B output 7.2 especially through engagement with government bodies is deemed to be beyond project’s control. However, the project can continue contributing to the P&B outcome by continuing to work on knowledge building, awareness raising and workplace level activities as important elements of ensuring safer and healthier working conditions.

As to the project contribution to the SDG goal 8, particularly target 8.8 and SDG 3 particularly Target 3.9, it can be termed as ‘To a large extent’ based on the respondents’ perspectives. The project contributes to these SDGs through its support to migrant workers with COVID-19 training and the provision of protective kits, as well as the training on chemicals and work in food processing and for street vendors. Under current circumstances, the project can explore informal and migrant workers for potentially high-impact activities.

4.2. Validity of Design

4.2.1. Validity of Project Immediate Objectives

The project’s strategy and logical framework were drafted in collaboration with and through rounds of discussions with national stakeholders and partners in 2019. Thus, the project design was responding to constituent’s demands on the ground and directly support national efforts on OSH. The disruption of the implementation caused by Covid 19 Pandemic and the military takeover, which were unforeseeable in the formulation stage of the project in 2019, have led to the project’s theory of

⁹ SDG 3, Target 3.9: By 2030, substantially reduce the number of deaths and illnesses from hazardous chemicals and air, water and soil pollution and contamination, SDG 8, Target 8.8: Protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for all workers, including migrant workers, in particular women migrants, and those in precarious employment.

change to be partially valid for the immediate objectives, especially, IO3 and IO4. This is where the activities under those implementable objectives that can be delivered through new partners with some adjustments.

On the other hand, there were strong indications from the survey respondents that based on the current context in Myanmar, the three objectives namely: Greater adoption of OSH management systems, Provision of occupational health services, and Greater adoption of OSH controls to eliminate/mitigate risks, are still valid to make workers in Myanmar safer and healthier. However, the evaluation finds that the theory of change may need to be reviewed in the light of inability to progress on IO1 and IO2.

In response to the unforeseeable challenges, the project team re-focused efforts to project activities that are still possible to undertake and have constantly networked with non-traditional partners for implementation and activities. The project decided to undertake a shift from the national level to workplace level for implementation activities with consultations with HQ, technical backstopping in Bangkok, and project's Chief Technical Advisor. In 2022, the project intends to expand this focus to international and regional level activities, such as research.

4.2.2. Complementing with other ILO Project in Myanmar

The survey respondents perceived the SHFA project activities have built off or complemented past projects such as Safe Youth @ Work and current related project, such as Vision Zero Fund. The project team has made a conscious and informed effort of coordinating and adding values to past and current activities.

More than half of the survey respondents reported that they have not seen any indication or any duplication in effort, lack of harmonized effort, and/or any incoherent traits from the SHFA Myanmar project intervention(s). One respondent noted that the current political situation contributing to the lack of harmonized effort and incoherent traits among stakeholders. Another respondent highlighted that the continued tense political situation and the COVID-19 infections could be obstacles for the effective and coherent implementation of SHFA Project.

4.2.3. Project's Risk and Assumption in Current Context

The risks and assumptions identified in the project design, such as national agenda priority shift, epidemic outbreaks, political instability, lack of access to workplaces due to infrastructures or security continues to apply. Myanmar was facing severe and widespread waves of Covid 19, limiting livelihood activities. A new wave of COVID-19 is possible, though WHO has not issued a warning at the time of writing. The military takeover that took place on the first of February 2021 aggravated the chaotic situation as many workers were unable to go to work and lacked adequate equipment to support working from home. This situation persists, having further worsened in recent months.

New risks associated with the military takeover are now present. The security not just of national staff in Myanmar, but also of potential implementing partners may affect the project's implementation ability. Logistical and administrative constraints in the form of banking restrictions continue, impeding operations in country.

Looking forward into 2022, operating constraints associated with the expiration of the MOU for implementing the DWCP also poses a risk to the project's ability to implement. The establishment of

the Commission of Inquiry, expected after the International Labour Conference in May and June 2022, may further disrupt operations, though its impact is currently difficult to predict.

Despite these risks, the project is relatively well prepared with mitigation strategies while continuing to abide by the UNCT *Principles of Engagement* to continuously monitor new development on the ground, particularly through consultation with stakeholders. These mitigation strategies include:

- Taking the stock of the situations of the constituents, including their availability, priorities, any sensitivities around engagement, through periodic check-ins
- Identification of new and potential stakeholders or implementing partners, and setting up meetings to learn their needs and to determine the suitability of the project intervention.
- Regular check-ins with the project Chief Technical Advisor and liaison between the project and the donor, were undertaken to ensure the donor was informed and approved of the strategy and proposed activities.
- Assessing and responding, where appropriate, to requests received from the constituents directly and through other ILO project colleagues
- Selecting international partners for activities, to circumvent the banking restrictions present in Myanmar

Together with the mitigation strategies above, the project should continue seek opportunities in current context, for example, leveraging the increased interest in public health broadly as an entry point for raising OSH awareness and subsequently support implementation of workplace level OSH interventions, including OSH management systems. This interest is expanding to include persistent and emerging OSH risks, including identifying new risks emerging as a result of the pandemic. Another example being mental health; some employers who have traditionally been interested only in safety issues are expressing increased interest in health promotion activities, including substance use/addictions issues, and mental health supports for workers.

4.3. Project Progress & Effectiveness

In October 2020, the project began the process of providing technical assistance on the drafting of OSH regulations. The project team met with MoLIP from October 2020 to January 2021, and had the two draft regulations, namely Business Registration and Notification and Recording of Occupational Accidents, Injuries, and Illnesses, reviewed by HQ experts as well as by the project team, and had feedback prepared. The project team had started discussions with MoLIP on how to engage in a proper consultative process for regulatory development. Likewise, the project has also had preliminary discussions with the Occupational and Environmental Health Department (OEHD) under the MoHS on its priorities, needs, and the plan for occupational health services assessment, and had the Terms of Reference prepared and ready for posting.

The project team made significant progress on two major project activities when the military takeover occurred. However, due to the COVID-19 pandemic and the military takeover in early 2021, this provision of technical assistance, including the engagement with the current de-facto Ministries, has been put on hold due. Consequently, the first two objectives which were designed to be undertaken in collaboration with tripartite partners have become unrealistic.

For the remaining objective 3 and 4, the project has made substantial achievements as identified below:

No	Activities in 2021	Output	Workers Reached	Employers Reached	Others
1	Developing COVID-19 Prevention in Peripheral Work Activities Training Module	All 3 outputs below are produced in Myanmar and English Trainer's Guide, Learner's Handbook, PowerPoint Presentation	N/A	N/A	N/A
2	Delivery of COVID-19 Prevention Training for Migrant Workers Representatives (CTUM- MRC) in collaboration with the WHO.	Final Activity Report in English	35 (22 F, 13 M)	N/A	N/A
3	Provision of COVID-19 Prevention Materials, including Feminine Hygiene Products, to Migrant Workers in Kayin State through CTUM-MRC	Final Activity Report in English (combined with above report)	350 (170 F, 180 M)	N/A	N/A
4	Delivery of COVID-19 Prevention Training for SFH Members	Final Activity Report in English	15 (10 F, 5 M)	N/A	N/A
5	Provision of COVID-19 Prevention Materials, including Feminine Hygiene Products, to Informal and Non-Unionized Workers	Final Activity Report in English	1,564 (739 F, 825 M)	N/A	N/A
6	Provision of COVID-19 Prevention Materials, including Feminine Hygiene Products, to Migrant Workers in Kayin State through CTUM-MRC (2nd Request)	Final Activity Report in English	300 (120 F, 180 M)	N/A	N/A
7	XXII World Congress for Safety and Health at Work 2021	Reflection reports submitted by Participants. Followed up meeting with Participants in Feb 2022	N/A	N/A	10 (7 F, 3 M)
8	World Day for Safety and Health at Work 2021 (SafeDay 2021) in collaboration with the VZF Project.	In-Person Photo Exhibition Press Release	N/A	N/A	N/A

Table 1: Project Activities and Outputs Under the Immediate Objective 3 and 4

More than half of evaluation survey respondents indicated that the top 2 areas that the project has progressed well include: 1) 'Capacity building for workers and employers on Occupational Diseases and Workplace Health Promotion', 2) 'Awareness raising of OSH (Campaigns, Materials, Events and Sharing of Good Practices)'

The project is adapting to the practice of identification and leveraging opportunities in highly unstable and reactive environment. The survey found the majority of respondents were of the view that “the technical assistance were [sic] appropriately provided at the time of project activity delivery” and also affirmed that ‘Project partnerships effectively contributed to achieving objectives’. More than half of the respondents are also of the view that the ‘Project interventions deliver against the current OSH needs of project stakeholders’.

4.4. Efficiency

4.4.1. Efficiency in Allocation and Usage of Funds

Generally, the evaluation team found that the project has used its resources (including funds, information, time and expertise, etc.) in a relatively efficient manner given the financial and operational constraints in current context

According to the Project’s Progress Report, the project achieved a budget delivery rate of 37% (46% if including commitment) of the total project budget of \$1.6 million. This delivery rate covers the period of March 2020 – December 2021. In terms of overall project delivery, 40-60% outputs have been or are being implemented on schedule as proposed in the implementation plan. These two factors together indicate that the project funds are being spent in an efficient manner since outputs delivered fall within a range that is consistent with or should be expected of the budget spent.

The project team reported that in some cases, the funds allocated surpassed the original funds intended for outcomes 3 and 4. The reasons for this are clear, given that outcomes 1 and 2 are works to be undertaken in collaboration with tripartite partners which were rendered impossible after February 2021 due to the breakdown in the tripartite mechanism and the requirement to adhere to the UN Principles of Engagement. Hence, the skewness towards outcomes 3 and 4 in allocation of funds is only logical and natural, given that these were the two outcomes where the project made strong progress. Through budget revisions, the funds allocated to outcomes 1 and 2 have mostly been re-allocated to activities in outcomes 3 and 4. However, the funds largely remain unspent.

4.4.2. Optimization of Non-Monetary Resources

Apart from allocation of funds, the project demonstrated efficiency in its use of non-monetary resources. One example is the project’s ability to optimize the use of materials that have been produced. The project developed materials for COVID-19 prevention in peripheral work activities which included amongst others, Learners Guide and Trainers’ Manuals in Myanmar and English. The value of these materials was maximized, when the same training was delivered to workers’ representatives and households through not one, but two partners: CTUM Migrant Resource Center and Skills for Humanity (SFH). Fifteen volunteers from SFH were successfully trained in the process; SFH then trained 358 workers households (825 male and 739 female) with COVID-19 prevention in peripheral work activities; and the same training was provided to 31 (11 male, 20 female) migrant workers representatives through CTUM.

These outputs achieved indicate that the project was able to make the most effective use of an available resource pool and take advantage of opportunities catering to the immediate needs of available partners as and when such opportunities arise. Likewise, all of the survey respondents are of the view that the project activities were adequately resourced.

4.4.3. Time Efficiency

Majority of the evaluation respondents indicated that the project was also able to deliver activities in a timely manner either to a large or moderate extent. This is evident when cross-referenced against the timeline of works completed. When responding to the requests received from CTUM, for example, the project team was able to deliver within a one-month turnaround period, i.e. request was received in July 2021 whereas training and supported materials by supported by ILO-SHFA in August 2021. Other pre-scheduled and workable activities, such as the OSH Awareness Raising event with the Yangon Photo Festival and the capacity building of OSH consultants through sponsoring their attendance at the XXII World Congress for Safety and Health were also completed in a timely manner.

A majority of the evaluation respondents also indicated that the project activities were delivered in a timely manner or were expected to be delivered at timely manner.

4.4.4. Leveraging Partnerships

The project was quite successful in leveraging existing partnerships with the ILO-VZF Project to enhance delivery of outputs. On the other hand, the project was unable to build on previous ILO Safe Youth at Work project when integrating OSH content into TVET as it would require liaising with current de facto Ministries. Instead, the project is in the process of implementing the objective of integrating OSH content into TVET curricula through engagement with non-profit and non-government TVET institution, known as the CVT Myanmar.

The project has also cultivated new partnerships to enhance delivery of outputs. When all work with the de facto government ceased after the military takeover in February 2021, the project team identified non-traditional partners, particularly civil society and not-for-profit organizations and institutions. These new partners became the project's main partners and means to reach beneficiaries. There are benefits and drawbacks associated with this approach. These new partners are adept at operating in a volatile and dangerous environment, are highly adaptable with strong operational expertise, and offer access to vulnerable workers not represented by ILO's regular tripartite partners. However, they generally lack expertise in OSH, and familiarity with ILO's roles and responsibilities, particularly with respect to norms and standards setting as opposed to humanitarian operations. The lack of expertise in OSH is not necessarily a whole barrier, as the introduction of the discipline to select health practitioners within these orgs serves to raise awareness of OSH as a discipline.

4.4.5. Other constraints affecting efficiency

Project efficiency has been severely impacted by many factors related to the COVID-19 pandemic and the military takeover, though project staff have been able to make headway in mitigating these effects.

Administratively, the technical officer works on an 11-hour time zone difference from Yangon, and has been unable to travel to Myanmar first due to COVID-19 related public health restrictions, and later due to entry restrictions imposed by the de facto authorities. In addition to the health impacts associated with the irregular work hours, this presents operational barriers, as staff in Yangon often wait until end of the work day before reviews and approvals. The finance and administrative officer and the national programme officer both contracted COVID-19 and were unable to work for a period of time. Over the evaluation period, frequent internet and mobile data outages ordered by the SAC as they took control of telecommunications interfered with the project staff's ability to perform their duties.

The project's original design was based on operating access points to the Myanmar context, such as the functioning of the Portfolio Consultative Committee, established relationships with appropriate

personnel in line ministries, and with contact points in unions and employers' organizations. With the collapse of the tripartite, the attacks on union leaders forcing them into hiding and incommunicado, and the general reticence of employers to engage in public activities, project staff were left with no established network or contacts for implementation of new activities. Establishing new contacts, networks and building relationships was particularly challenging given project staff were located outside the country and/or unable to attend in-person events due to public health restrictions and later security issues. Furthermore, the attacks on civil society organizations and the public health and security conditions, as well as the profound economic downturn, resulted in many possible partners ceasing operations, further impeding access to beneficiaries. Gains made in highlighting the importance of OSH in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic, were somewhat side-lined in the latter half of 2021 as employers' focus shifted to survival of their businesses, or addressing supply chain, banking, or other crises. Consequently, a significant amount of time over the evaluation period was spent identifying implementing partners and establishing relationships. This work remains ongoing, with strong progress having been made.

Finally, a significant amount of time was required to respond to new directions from UN HQ, in the form of Principles of Engagement and in establishing and adhering to new administrative processes. Two iterations of the Principles of Engagement were issued over the evaluation period, each necessitating a project review and justification against the guidelines. Other constraints also prevented or slowed implementation, while work-arounds were developed or identified. For example, banking restrictions imposed by the military government resulted in an inability to contract domestic companies for implementation activities, resulting in the requirement to find international providers or domestic providers with international bank accounts. This also resulted in routing many financial and administrative processes ordinarily handled in Yangon to Bangkok, in some cases causing significant delays to implementing activities and negatively affecting relationships with new partners. Furthermore, restrictions on working with potential implementing partners with ties to the SAC resulted in the development of a vetting process, including background checks, which increased administrative burden, and lengthened the overall contracting process. In one case, it resulted in the elimination of potential candidates for an implementation activity.

4.5. Impact

4.5.1. Project's Progress in Creating Positive Impacts

Since the military takeover in 2021, the project team has adapted by identifying new partnerships while also considering the traditional constituents' priorities, sensitivities around engagement. This adaptability has made headways in strengthening the OSH portfolio by broadening the reach internally to include new stakeholders. For example: at the request of the employers' organizations UMFCCL, the project developed the COVID-19 prevention training for workplace peripheries. This training was subsequently delivered to workers in their homes, as it was designed for trainers to draw parallels between workplace periphery behaviour (such as COVID-19 prevention in commuting, reception areas, washrooms, cafeterias/workplace kitchens, etc) and other parts of workers' personal lives.

Likewise, the project was also approached by the CTUM Migrant Resource Centre (MRC) via the ILO-Yangon TRIANGLE project, with the request to assist with COVID-19 prevention training to migrant workers and their families together with the prevention materials support in Kayin State. Through these activities, the workers' capacity on COVID-19 prevention at the workplace was enhanced. Additionally, this activity may pave the way for the project to promote occupational health services

by strengthening these MRCs' occupational health capacities which may help in creating sustainable impacts for the prospective migrant workers.

These two activities contributed to progress on targeted impacts benefiting many formal and informal workers. This action may satisfy or surpass the indicator of the project and may be considered that the capacity of workers and employers has improved in promoting OSH.

The project's activities in integrating OSH and gender into existing TVET curricula, namely: Business Administration, Electrician, Furniture Technician, and Metal Technician are sustainable, as they will continue well past project termination.

Thus, the above-mentioned activities contribute to the targeted impact of "Social partners and educational institutions implementation programmes to address OSH issues".

4.5.2. Potential to Create Further Positive Impacts

The COVID-19 outbreaks may pave an increase in interest in occupational health issues. Demand for knowledge and skills related to managing infectious diseases in the workplace (COVID-19), as well as interest in Mental Health have been major drivers toward broader interest in Occupational Safety and Health. New opportunities to use this increased interest to introduce and support implementation at the workplace level of OSH measures, including risk assessment and OSH management systems, are emerging. This interest is expanding to include persistent and emerging OSH risks, as a result of the pandemic. For example, the project has received interest in developing ergonomics related information sessions aimed at workers now required to work from home using ad hoc workspaces. Some employers who have traditionally been interested only in safety issues are expressing increased interest in health promotion activities, including substance use/addictions issues, and mental health supports for workers.

Additionally, many organizations are using the current slowdown in the economy and in some cases suspension of activities, to improve knowledge and skills. Consequently, demand for skills and knowledge development activities are increasing. This has been particularly relevant to OSH, such as GHS training, as interest in trainings being offered is generally high, though logistical challenges at times prevent participation.

These opportunities are far reaching and have the potential to carry forward past the current project termination date. For example, the Myanmar Construction Entrepreneurs' Federation (MCEF) reached out seeking support in mental health activities for their workers – presenting the opportunity to engagement in both mental health destigmatisation activities, but also health promotion broadly. Given that the construction sector appeared to be rebounding at the time of writing this report, this presents an excellent opportunity to advance OSH issues to employers so that when the sector returns to full capacity, OSH considerations are already integrated. The project has received great interest in these activities after even small promotion efforts, including requests from CTUM-migrants, the Myanmar Centre for Responsible Business Conduct (MCRB), mental health promotion specifically for youth and children from the Child Labour project, and finally as part of the broader support for out-of-worker women workers from the garment sector, as part of the VZF-led Cash for Training initiative. The demand for this type of activity has surpassed the projects' current ability to deliver due to budget allocation and capacity limits of providers.

The activity of integrating OSH into TVET also shows great potential to reach new generations of workers. This activity could be expanded to include more technical and vocational education streams.

Finally, the success of the COVID-19 prevention activity in October and November 2021 has opened many opportunities to reaching informal workers in Myanmar, a growing portion of the labour force given the current economic conditions. For instance, the project has begun investigating opportunities to work on OSH initiatives especially the street vendors, as well as the local networks that are in reach with these workers to implement potential OSH research study. CSOs working with non-unionised miners in rural areas have also reached out seeking assistance to address OSH and other broader labour rights issues for these workers.

4.6. Sustainability

Sustainability had been incorporated into the original project design, as the focus of planned activities was largely on supporting the development of a national framework. Given the circumstances described in earlier parts of this report, many of the sustainable activities originally envisioned are no longer possible.

Any approach to long-term sustainability is speculative given the current state of Myanmar. In this political climate, partner organizations and traditional constituents are navigating unknown waters, and in some cases their existence or safety are in question.

The project team had drafted the sustainability and exit strategy in 2021. This plan will have to be updated to reflect the current situation pending the approval for a no-cost extension, and can be finalised after consultation with HQ, Bangkok, and appropriate personnel in the ILO Yangon office. The plan examines each of the project's immediate objective against the conditions for sustainability, further actions required by the institutions and partners involved, and the recommended actions from the project team.

4.6.1. Survey Respondents Perspective of Project's Sustainability

While implementing activities, the project considered the sustainability of activities against immediate and emergency needs. Where emergency needs were identified, the project implemented best practices for integrating sustainability into activity design. More than half of the respondents were confident that project activities were either very likely or likely to be sustainable. The project team speculates that this overwhelming rating from the respondents may have been based on the value-added OSH technical knowledge and awareness gained directly from participating in the project activity. For instance, the XXII World Congress for Safety and Health at Work was indeed a rich platform for OSH technical knowledge, where these participants learned from and could go on to incorporate best practices in OSH from other countries in their work.

On the other hand, a few other respondents expressed concerns that the positive effects of project interventions would be unlikely to last due to on-going political instability, the COVID-19 Pandemic and declining economic conditions, with the existence of partner organizations and safety of traditional constituents in question.

4.6.2. Sustainability of Project Outputs

The challenges identified above and mixed perceptions from the respondents do not necessarily imply that outputs are not sustainable. The project team has drafted a new proposed plan for the remaining project duration on the three of four strategic components outlined in the Safety + Health for All Phase

II: Building knowledge, strengthening national capacities, and promoting demand for safe and healthy workplaces. The new proposed plan will also feature activities on improving OSH for informal economic actors and increasing attention towards occupational health. Amongst others, a few of these activities are described below.

The integration of OSH content into TVET curriculum activity is perceived to have high likelihood of continuation past-project. Originally, the project intended to liaise with State TVET Institution and State Agricultural Institutions (SAI) where the project had the scope of building on the results achieved by the SafeYouth@Work project. As these are the public institutions, the project shifted to developing a comprehensive OSH common module to be delivered at a specific non-profit TVET institution in Myanmar, whose board is head quartered in Switzerland. This course will be a required introductory course for all students. In the second phase of this activity, the project plans to integrate OSH content into their specific curricula namely: Electricians, Furniture Technicians, Metal Workers and Business Administrator. Once the courses have been integrated with OSH content, the non-profit TVET institutions will continue with the delivery of these technical courses with updated curriculum. The project team has learnt that the annual anticipated enrolment in each of these technical courses range from 25 to 50 students. The TVET institution is currently reported to be preparing for resumption of existing batch with practical sessions and assessments, with the anticipation of additional batches to be enrolled in the coming years.

Next, the project reported on sponsoring the OSH experts in Myanmar to undertake the GHS training developed by the UNITAR. This will be followed by the translation of Safety Data Sheets (SDS) into Myanmar language. The SDSs will be prioritized based on the most used hazardous substances in Myanmar, beginning with the agriculture and construction industries. Likewise, the project also reported to be planning on developing recording and notification training targeting OSH advisors, who are currently being trained for OSH advisory services program under VZF project. Additionally, majority of participants from the OSH advisory services program will also be enrolled under GHS Training. Therefore, these two activities are perceived to have high likelihood of continuation past-project.

4.7. Gender and Inclusion Issues

The project is making conscious efforts towards mainstreaming gender and inclusion in its approach and implementation. To ensure inclusiveness, the project required implementing partners to provide information on activity participation broken down by gender when implementing activities (Progress Report Pg. 15).

In most of the project's capacity building activities, focus is also made on equal or balanced gender participation (refer to table 2). Gender based needs were also considered when the project provided COVID-19 prevention support materials to migrant and informal workers through CTUM-MRC and SFH respectively. Also, it is noted that 7 females and 2 males have participated in the mid-term self-evaluation questionnaire. Participants include professionals and members, reflecting the fact that the project is making conscious efforts towards integrating gender and inclusion concerns in its approach and implementation. Likewise, more than half of the evaluation respondents are of the view that the SHFA Project was successful at incorporating gender equality and non-discrimination in its interventions

Nonetheless, the project could strengthen its gender and inclusion issues consideration further in OSH context. One of the feasible examples include the gender-responsive and inclusive training content

when providing Mental Health Awareness at Workplaces information sharing sessions. This is where the project could make effort in the elimination of gender-based and all types of discrimination at workplaces. Furthermore, the project also has the opportunity to address gender differences and/or the inclusion issues and gender-responsive OSH measures through TVET curriculum. Additionally, the project is also encouraged to look into gender sensitive risks assessment guidance in the remaining project duration.

4.8. Tripartism and Social Dialogue

The project team participated in the Project Consultative Committee (PCC) Meeting on 17th November 2020, under the implementation of ILO Occupational Safety and Health Project Portfolio. The project team introduced the commencement of the Government of Japan funded project: Safety + Health for All Workers in Myanmar project and the overall objectives and key activities. The tripartite members included: the Factories and General Labour Laws Inspection Department (FGLLID) under the Ministry of Labour, Immigration and Population (MoLIP), Confederation Trade Unions Myanmar (CTUM), Myanmar Industries Craft and Services Trade Unions Federation (MICS), Agriculture and Farmer Federation of Myanmar (AFFM), and the Union of Myanmar Federation of Chambers of Commerce and Industry (UMFCCI). In the immediate aftermath of the military takeover, the tripartite mechanisms facilitating social dialogue, including the PCC, broke down as unions representatives withdrew in protest. The PCC, the committee of government, workers, and employers in place to advise on the direction of the project activity, was dissolved after the PCC meeting in November 2020.

4.9. International Labour Standards

Myanmar has not ratified the key Conventions on OSH such as C155 – Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 1981 (No. 155); C187 – Promotional Framework for Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 2006 (No.187); C161 – Occupational Health Services Convention, 1985, (No. 161). The project was initially targeted to set an OSH promotional framework in line with the C187 and to prioritize in ratifying this convention, or any other OSH convention if the Government of Myanmar shows an interest. However, this initiative cannot be implemented in the current context.

V. Conclusions

Despite the unprecedented circumstances that the project is facing, the project team has delivered the activities that are not only implementable, but have also been responsive towards the beneficiaries needs and demands, including emergency needs. The evaluation team finds that the project has leveraged partnership and resources, including non-monetary resources, to the greatest extent possible in the current context when implementing the project activities.

The evaluation finds that the certain project's objectives, specifically IO3 (social partners and educational institutions to implement programmes to address OSH issues) and IO4 (workers to increasingly demand safe and healthy workplaces) remain generally valid in the current context. Therefore, the current project design, including the theory of change, would benefit from review and/or thorough strategic planning for the remaining duration of the project. Consideration of the risks, the constraints, the Governing Body and UNCT directions may need to be reflected in formulating the strategies based on highly reactive environment in Myanmar.

The evaluation also finds that the delivery rate of the project budget is perceived to be unsatisfactory. This is not surprising considering how circumstances unfolded over the 2020-2021 period. Given the work-arounds and mitigation strategies developed over this period, it is likely project implementation will improve through 2022-2023, should the context remain largely the same as now. However, ensuring high-quality products will continue to depend on expanding the project's current network, stakeholder base, and partners.

The project has drafted a new proposed plan for the remaining project duration on the three of four strategic components outlined in the Safety + Health for All Phase II: Building knowledge, strengthening national capacities, and promoting demand for safe and healthy workplaces. The new proposed plan, which is still in development and requiring consultation, proposes activities on improving OSH for informal economic actors and increasing attention towards occupational health. Meanwhile, the project should also continue and strengthen its effort towards mainstreaming gender and inclusion concerns in strategic planning and implementation of the project activities.

VI. Lessons Learned & Emerging Good Practices

6.1. Lessons Learned

The mid-term evaluation is anticipated to yield lessons that can be applied elsewhere to improve the performance, outcome, or effect of the project for the purpose of improving project performance while also promoting organizational learning.

Two key lessons learned from the ILO-SHFA Myanmar project are listed below:

Lesson 1: Diversity of partners in addition to constituents is critical to implementation of activities in unstable contexts.

One of the greatest impediments to implementation for SHFA project in the Myanmar context was the lack of partners and avenues for implementation that arose as a result of the military takeover, and limitations on gathering information necessary to understand priorities and plan accordingly. The fact that the project was nascent and that public health restrictions prohibited in-person gatherings meant that the SHFA project was in a particularly challenging position with respect to implementation, as the staff had no established partners and limited means of building a network. These limitations were mitigated by leveraging relationships with well-established projects and accessing their networks, but also through desk-review of media sources and internal UN reports to gather information and target particular actors whose activities and skill set aligned with project priorities. This was a time-consuming process and gains made in this area should be protected to avoid losing ability to readily implement activities.

Lesson 2: Emergency situations can serve to broaden networks of implementing partners while also creating opportunities to raise awareness among non-traditional stakeholders.

In two cases, the project was able to raise the profile of OSH among particular groups of health workers while simultaneously building networks and identifying new, non-traditional implementing partners. In the first case, the project contracted an OSH firm to develop a train-the-trainer COVID-19 prevention product, and deliver it to officials in the public health Civil Society Organization, who had expertise in general public health and infectious disease control as well as humanitarian assistance, but no prior training in and very limited understanding and awareness of OSH. Members of these CSO,

including some health care professionals, took part in further trainings offered by the project and have served to inform the project of critical events taking place on the ground.

Similarly, by networking with other UN agencies, the project was able to identify mental health practitioners who had expertise in clinical psychology and counselling, or workplace wellness campaigns, but limited knowledge or understanding of the application to the workplace, particularly on prevention principles of OSH. By combining their knowledge of the current situation on the ground and their expertise in mental health with ILO's expertise in OSH, the project was able to deliver mental health de-stigmatization activities to workers, while also improving the knowledge and awareness of OSH among these actors. This activity synergised well with the above activity, as members of the aforementioned CSO participated in some of the awareness raising activities on mental health in the workplace, broadening their understanding of OSH beyond infectious diseases.

6.2. Emerging Good Practices

The mid-term evaluation also involves identifying successful practices from those lessons which are worthy of replication. There are six Good Practices (GP) that emerged from the present evaluation that could well be replicated under certain conditions in other projects and/or countries.

GP1: Adopting highly flexible, adaptive, and responsive project management principles in an unstable and volatile environment. This includes having a strong, up-to-date understanding of the situation on the ground so as not to appear “out of touch” with the needs of beneficiaries, thorough contingency planning, adapting the project to suit the changing needs of the beneficiaries, or direction from authorities, and establishing mitigation tactics to control risk or work-arounds to circumvent barriers.

GP2: Strengthening networks in addition to working to the extent possible with constituents and more traditional stakeholders in politically unstable environments; and identifying new implementation opportunities that align with current needs of available constituents.

GP3: In politically unstable environments, considering sustainability against immediate, emergency needs of constituents and stakeholders. For example, when there was a need for COVID-19 emergency response, information sessions and ToTs on COVID-19 control measures were provided in addition to supplying personal protective equipment (PPE) and food (humanitarian one-offs), which allowed implementing partners to further train their beneficiaries in project funded activities and beyond. Due to the severity of the situation among the general population, CSOs advised that delivery of training alone would be construed by constituents as “tone deaf” or “out of touch”, and reflect poorly on the SHFA project as well as the ILO in Myanmar.

VII. Recommendations

7.1. Recommendations of the Mid-Term Evaluation to the Project

7.1.1. Reviewing Project Objectives

The project would benefit from reprogramming of activities to best respond to the current context in Myanmar. This includes an analysis of the current OSH landscape in Myanmar, and establishing new operational objectives aligned with the Safety+Health for All Flagship Programme Phase II approach, as well as identifying new activities, and developing targets, milestones and indicators, which are possible within the Myanmar context.

In so doing, the project should identify new target beneficiaries, such as informal workers and OSH professionals, identify and build relationships with new partners, and focus on workplace-level interventions as national level framework development is not permissible.

Despite the continued and escalating conflict on the ground, and other barriers, an extended implementation period is desirable based on feedback received through the survey, as well as to protect gains made by the project to date, keeping in mind the general direction from the Governing Body to continue ILO operations in Myanmar. However, since it is likely the political situation will remain challenging and unstable for the foreseeable future, the project team must continue to exercise caution and evaluate risk on an ongoing basis, particularly security and reputational risks, when developing strategies and options, as well as in choosing its partners.

7.1.2. Gender and Inclusion

The project could strengthen its gender and inclusion issues consideration further in OSH context. One of the feasible possibilities includes training content on gender perspectives and inclusion issues perspectives when providing Mental Health Awareness at Workplaces information sharing sessions. Furthermore, the project also has the opportunity to integrate concepts on how gender and/or inclusion issues may influence working conditions and risks through TVET curriculum. Additionally, the project is also encouraged to look into gender sensitive hazards and risks assessment guidance or rapid assessments in the remaining project duration.

7.1.3. Strategically Planning for Prospective Activities

Strategic planning should involve an assessment of the needs of beneficiaries and constituents against the original project design to determine which activities remain relevant and can be implemented, considering the significant constraints in the implementing context. Budgets originally allocated to activities which can no longer be implemented should be diverted to new activities, identified after taking stock of the Safety+Health for All Flagship Programme Phase II priorities, cross-referenced with the needs of beneficiaries, and evaluated for implementation considering the *Principles of Engagement*, direction from the Governing Body, direction from the Government of Japan, and finally direction from the Liaison Officer.

The project should concentrate on the following areas in order to ensure longer-term sustainability of OSH outcomes:

- Build the capacity of stakeholders to address OSH concerns to ensure the project's interventions are sustained through further activities of these stakeholders.
- Instil a sense of ownership among implementing partners and beneficiaries by establishing OSH as a priority issue. These initiatives could include evidence-based advocacy, impactful communications, and sharing of good practices where impacts of OSH improvements are visible.
- Continue to collaborate with local organizations and providers, foster knowledge transfer, and facilitate network development and replication.
- Continuously monitor and analyse the results of the project interventions; closer collaboration, keeping in touch and communicating with implementing partners and beneficiaries
- Provide technical assistance for all stakeholders' participation and documentation of success stories.
- Given the fluid situation, the usage of technology-oriented resources should be central to the project's sustainable strategy. This may include for instance, high quality training modules, tutorial videos, advocacy videos and digital documentation. The project can propose a good

repository that can be used by a wider range of users over a longer period of time and will not be dependent on any institution/partner.

- Incorporate end-focused and goal-oriented dimensions into upcoming activities. The current context still does offer opportunities to seed sustainability from the project outputs. These can include, for instance, 1) the assessment on OSH conditions of the vulnerable worker population with the end goal for advocacy and policy formulation in the future, 2) the translation of OSH documents, such as Safety Data Sheets, on the commonly used hazards in Myanmar with the end goal to promote wider application and understanding among the workers, 3) the promotion of a safe and healthy preventive culture through TVET curriculum with the end goal of the prospective workers being equipped with OSH awareness and skills, and 4) the promotion of occupational health through current social partners and non-traditional partners' existing institutions, such as Migrant Resource Centre, with the end goal of strengthening these institutions capacity to offer OSH related information and support to the prospective migrant workers.

7.1.4. Selecting the Beneficiaries

The understanding on the beneficiaries, i.e. the ILO social partners, in the current context is important as to shape the beneficiaries selection criteria when planning for the upcoming project activities. Workers including, trade unionists, still continue to face, but not limited to, labour rights violation and constant surveillance, and warrant issues by the military authority. At the workplace level, there are increasing reports of intimidation and harassment, trade union members being dismissed, employers unilaterally cutting wages and reducing benefits, an increased use of precarious contracting arrangements, dissolution of collective contracts and factories denying the salaries that they owe, and certain cases of factory owners calling in the military when workers have protested about workplace conditions or taken strike actions.

In this context, continued awareness on workers' rights, including around OSH, is needed to reduce vulnerability from any sort of exploitation, including unsafe and unhealthy working conditions. In current Myanmar OSH perspective, without having legal OSH enforcement and proper recording and notification system established, continuation of OSH awareness and rights among the workers are more than necessary. Additionally, OSH interventions being implemented so far seem to have reached far more workers in formal sector. Therefore, when selecting beneficiaries for future project activities, it is not only important to analyse the sector that they work in, but also information on which sort of OSH interventions have been provided so far to ensure equity among the different types of workers.

7.2. Recommendations to the Current Stakeholders

As the project staff continue efforts to identify and establish partnerships, sustainability of activities should be prioritized.

So, when the project explores the possibility of new partnerships, the project should also be looking for partners that may have the capacity to do such strategic planning and strategic implementation in reaching out to workers together with the needs that they may have in the current context.

The project may also consider the activities that would enhance the CSO members' understanding on the workers' as one of the vulnerable populations in the current context and raise the profile and importance of OSH. If feasible, the project should discuss with workers organizations and unions (if

available) to identify alternative ways and means and take on new initiatives to meet the achievable objectives.

7.3. Recommendations to the ILO

Under current circumstances, it is advisable for the project to work with community-level partners. With activities that the project is already working together with CSOs in implementation, this would mean widening the project's reach horizontally through collaboration with more like-minded partners, compounding the project's impact through multiplication. The project could then decide whether to take things further judging from whether the pilot programs are successful and indicate whether there is a need and potential for a bigger rollout.

Next, the relocation of the Project Technical Officer to the ROAP in Bangkok is recommended. This would, in fact, bring multiple benefits. These include subsiding the 11-hour time zone difference from Yangon, reducing potential occupational health impacts arising irregular work hours including working over nights, and ensuring timely communication to increase efficiency in decision making and approvals required for project activity implementations.

VIII. Annexes

Annex 1: Terms of Reference

Project Title	Safety + Health for All (SHFA) Workers in Myanmar
Project Code	MMR/19/02/JPN
Type of Evaluation	Self-Evaluation
Evaluation Manager	Patricia MacDonald, Technical Officer of SHFA Myanmar
Period covered by the Mid-Term Evaluation	OCT 2020 to DEC 2021
Project Duration	MAR 2020 to DEC 2022
Donor Agency	Government of Japan
Administrative Unit in the ILO Responsible for Administering the project	ILO-YANGON
Technical Unit(s) in the ILO Responsible for Backstopping the Project	ILO-BKK, HQ
P&B Outcomes Under Evaluation	ILO P&B: Output 7.2 Increased capacity of member states to ensure safe and healthy working conditions.
Budget (For Entire Project Duration)	USD 1,623,021.67
Countries	Myanmar

Background/Rationale

Project evaluation is an objective and systematic assessment of ongoing or completed project, programme or policy, its design, implementation, and results. The aim of evaluation is to determine the relevance and fulfilment of objective, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, and sustainability.¹⁰ The ILO-SHFA Myanmar project aims to conduct both mid-term evaluation and final evaluation. The mid-term evaluation is to assess the progress achieved with project implementation against the project objectives and performance indicators adopted, and to identify and address any major obstacles that may arise.

As per the ILO policy guidelines for evaluations issued by the Evaluation Office (EVAL), the project has an option of carrying out either self or internal mid-term evaluation. When the purpose of an evaluation is organizational learning and/or programme improvement, the self or internal evaluation is a better choice. Self or internal evaluations may be less costly and can be done quickly as they are managed by the project team and conducted by the project team in case of self-evaluation or by an ILO official trained by EVAL to conduct internal evaluations in the case of internal evaluations. Project staffs are familiar with the context and are rich sources for inputs for project improvement. Additionally, those who identify good practices from the evaluation are also in the position to implement them.¹¹

In addition to the considerations above, the fact that the ILO-SHFA Myanmar project is in the middle of its implementation and will end December 31, 2022 and following consultation with the ILO-Japan Multi-

¹⁰ OECD (2010): Glossary of Key Terms in Evaluation and Results Based Management.

¹¹ ILO (2020): Guidance Note 2.2: Self and Internal Evaluations

bilateral programme management, backstopping officers, and the Evaluation officer at the HQ, it was decided that the project would undertake a self-evaluation for its mid-term evaluation. An external final evaluation will be carried out at the end of the project.

Project Brief

In March 2019, the Myanmar's parliament passed the new Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) Law. Hereof, the law defines the need of National Tripartite OSH Council, promotes prevention actions at the enterprise level, recognizes the importance of forming working places that are safe and good for health. However, several challenges remain in implementation of this significant legislation and fostering preventive culture on safety and health in the country.

The ultimate objective of ILO-SHFA Myanmar project is for workers in Myanmar to be safer and healthier. To reach this goal, the project implements holistic approach towards 1) building promotional framework for Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) including recording and notification, 2) enhancing access to occupational health services, 3) supporting social partners and educational institutions to implement programmes to address OSH issues, and 4) workers increasingly demanding safety and healthy workplaces.

The ILO-SHFA Myanmar project is being implemented in the framework of the ILO Flagship programme on OSH Safety + Health for All. The project is also part of the ILO OSH Project Portfolio in the ILO Liaison Office in Yangon. The SHFA Myanmar project is aligned with the ILO Programme and Budget 2020- 2021 under output 7.2, "Increased capacity of member states to ensure safe and healthy working conditions". The SHFA Myanmar project is contributing to implementation of the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) 2018-2021, especially on priority 3, outcome 3.3, "By 2021, an integrated and unified OSH system is in place and implemented". The project also contributes to the realization of sustainable development goal (SDG) 8 especially target 8.8 "Protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environment for all workers, including migrant workers, and those in precarious employment", and Goal 3, especially 3.9 "By 2030, substantially reduce the number of deaths and illnesses from hazardous chemicals and air, water and soil pollution, and contamination through the improvement of occupational health and hygiene".

Purpose/Objectives of the Mid-Term Evaluation

The ILO-SHFA Myanmar project's mid-term self-evaluation seeks to accomplish the following objectives:

To review the validity of the project design, i.e priorities, outcomes, outputs, activities and budget.

To assess the progress of the project against the approved logical framework and workplan.

To determine the project contribution to the achievement of Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP 2018-2021) outcomes in Myanmar.

To assess the project performance so far, using standard evaluation criteria and provide constructive feedback for course correction

To identify gaps and constraints in project implementation, including partners' involvement, and recommendations for project improvement to support the achievement of objectives.

To recommend measures for improving the project performance, including any required adjustments in the project design and implementation strategy.

Scope, Coverage, and Clients

The mid-term self-evaluation examines the project implementation period since project inception in October 2020 until December 2021. The mid-term self-evaluation covers activities in Myanmar where the project

components include; strengthening of occupational health and safety in Myanmar through development of OSH regulatory framework until the end of January 2021, OSH awareness-raising, workplace mental health and occupational health promotion, and integration of OSH into TVET education.

The clients and target audience of the mid-term evaluation include ILO project management based in Bangkok and Yangon, management of the ILO/Japan Multi-bilateral Programme, the ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (ROAP), and the partners of the project including tripartite constituents in Myanmar.

Criteria/Key Questions/Analytical Framework

The mid-term evaluation will examine project implementation against the criteria below by posing the following questions:

Relevance of the Project	<p>Were the project objectives and strategy consistent with the beneficiaries' requirements, country needs, ILO priorities, and partners' donors' policies?</p> <p>How well does the project contribute to the achievement of Myanmar DWCP outcomes, relevant P&B Outcomes and SDG goals?</p>
Validity of Design	<p>To what extent the project theory of change remains valid?</p> <p>Do the risks and assumptions identified in the project design remain valid?</p> <p>What changes should be made in the design to strengthen its validity?</p>
Project Progress and Effectiveness	<p>Based on the recent requirements and knowledge, are the originally defined objectives still realistic?</p> <p>To what extent have the project interventions/activities contributed to the expected outcomes/objectives?</p> <p>How effective is the project in contributing to changes in project's ultimate beneficiaries?</p> <p>Is the project making conscious efforts towards integrating gender and inclusion concerns in its approach and implementation?</p>
Efficiency of Resource Use	<p>How optimally has the project allocated resources (including funds, human resources, time and expertise, etc) to achieve results?</p> <p>To what extent does the project leverage resource (financial, partnerships, expertise) to attain its objectives and to promote gender equality and non-discrimination?</p>
Impacts	<p>- To what extent do the project interventions contribute towards the progress of targeted impacts?</p> <p>- Is the project expected to generate significant positive impacts? What are the internal or external factors that may affect this likelihood?</p>

Sustainability	<p>To what extent will the positive changes and effects from project interventions be sustainable in the current local context?</p> <p>To what extent is/are the target groups/constituents prepared and capable to sustain the positive effects from the project interventions without support in the long-term?</p> <p>Are there any internal or external factors that may affect the sustainability of results?</p> <p>Is the project working towards an exit strategy that contributes to sustainability of project results?</p>
----------------	--

Outputs

The project's mid-term evaluation aims to produce a mid-term evaluation report with the following sections.

- Cover page with key project and evaluation data
- Executive Summary
- Description of the project (including the local situation, policy, regulatory and economic space)
- Purpose, scope and clients of evaluation
- Methodology
- Clearly identified findings for each criterion
- Recommendations (including sustainability and capacity building within the project and among partners)
- Lessons learnt and good practices
- Conclusions
- Country office management response
- Annexes

Methodology

The mid-term self-evaluation will be carried out through the review and analysis of primary and secondary data. This will be based on the review of project documents, including progress reports, workshop/training reports, relevant correspondence and others as deemed appropriate.

The mid-term evaluation will also incorporate inputs from meetings, discussions and surveys with the ILO staff in Bangkok, Yangon and key stakeholders, including key implementation partners in Myanmar.

Key Stakeholders for Survey Questionnaires

No	Stakeholders	Types
1	Vision Zero Project Team (Myanmar)	Project within ILO Yangon
2	TRIANGLE Project Team (Myanmar)	Project within ILO Yangon
3	CVT Myanmar	TVET Institution
4	PhotoDoc Association	CSO
5	Skill for Humanity	CSO
6	Win OSH Services	OSH Institute
7	AK Safety	OSH Institute
8	Safe Mind Myanmar	OSH Institute
9	Converge Safety Myanmar	OSH Institute

Management Arrangements

The mid-term self-evaluation will be carried out by the Technical Officer in collaboration with the Programme Officer and Finance & Administration Assistant for Myanmar, with inputs from Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist, Programme administrators and Operations officers from Head Quarters (HQ), as applicable.

Annex 2: Project Progress and Output

OUTPUT DELIVERY 12			
Output		Output status	Output summary
Outcome 1: Immediate Objective 1 - Government, employers and workers adopt/revise governance instruments to build a promotional framework for OSH.			
Output 1.1. Myanmar national system for occupational safety and health is developed through implementation of the 2019 OSH law.			
1.1.1	Provide technical advice to the national drafting group on OSH regulations	Delay: behind schedule	Up until January 2021, the project supported the development of OSH fundamental regulations around Business Registration, and Reporting & Notification of Occupational Accidents, Injuries and Illnesses. First draft was received, translated and circulated for comments among the LADMIN/OSH and Bangkok DWT experts. However, this activity is put on indefinite hiatus due to the military takeover on February 1, 2021.
1.1.2	Support the establishment and functioning of the National Tripartite OSH Council through high-level technical advice	Delay: not yet started	This activity was started in 2020 but was put on indefinite hiatus due to the military takeover on February 1, 2021.
1.1.3	Provide technical assistance to improve OSH data collection system including reporting and notification with tripartite constituents in line with ILO Protocol 155	Delay: not yet started	The provision of technical support to the Myanmar Government (Ministry of Labour) is likely to be slim given the UNCT Principles of Engagement does not allow policy support and technical support to the regime.
Output 1.2. The development, adoption, implementation and monitoring of a national OSH programme for Myanmar is supported.			

¹² Based on the Implementation Plan

1.2.1	Support tripartite constituents in the drafting of the National OSH Programme	Cancelled	Given the breakdown in the tripartite mechanism due to the military takeover, the activity is cancelled.
1.2.2	Launch the National OSH Programme	Cancelled	Given the breakdown in the tripartite mechanism due to the military takeover, the activity is cancelled.
1.2.3	Support the implementation and monitoring of the national OSH Programme	Cancelled	Given the breakdown in the tripartite mechanism due to the military takeover, the activity is cancelled.
Output 1.3. Technical advice to facilitate the ratification and implementation of ILO Convention N. 187 and potentially other core ILO OSH conventions is provided.			
1.3.1	Hold a tripartite workshop to present the ILO Convention(s) proposed for ratification as well as the Myanmar government duties accompanying such ratification.	Cancelled	Given the breakdown in the tripartite mechanism due to the military takeover, the activity is cancelled.
1.3.2	Support the development of a feasibility study and/or an Action Plan to accompany the ratification process)	Cancelled	Given the breakdown in the tripartite mechanism due to the military takeover, the activity is cancelled.
Outcome 2: Immediate Objective 2 – Institutions, and in particular the Ministry of Health and Sports, take policy and operational measures to enhance access to occupational services.			
Output 2.1. – Workers’ access to occupational health services is improved in line with ILO Convention No. 161			
2.1.1	Carry out an assessment of occupational health services in Myanmar	Delay: not yet started	Up until January 2021, the project worked with LABADMIN/OSH and MoHS on the development of Terms of Reference to undertake the evaluation of Occupational Health Services in Myanmar. Term of Reference was completed and ready for posting. However, this activity is put on indefinite hiatus due to the military takeover in 2021. The project is also closely monitoring the political situation across the nation to determine when and if it is possible to

		undertake. Currently there are no projected timelines for completion.
2.1.2	Share the report's findings and support its validation with tripartite constituents	Delay: not yet started Please see above
2.1.3	Pilot selected recommendations to improve workers' access to occupational health services	Delay: not yet started Please see above
Output 2.2. – Capacity of constituents and institutions to enhance occupational health is improved.		
2.2.1	Provide training to the SSB to apply the Myanmar updated list of occupational diseases for compensation and prevention	Cancelled Given the breakdown in the tripartite mechanism due to the military takeover, the activity is cancelled.
2.2.2	Build the capacity on industrial hygienists to assess and monitor working environment	Delay: behind schedule Together with VZF project, the SHFA project is sponsoring a total of 18 industrial hygienists to Globally Harmonizing System for Labelling and Classifying Chemicals (GHS) training developed by the UNITAR, which is beginning from the end of March 2022. This will be followed by translation of Safety Data Sheets into Myanmar language in 2022. The Safety Data Sheets will be prioritized based on the most commonly used hazardous substances in Myanmar, beginning with the agriculture and construction industries.
Outcome 3: Immediate Objective 3: Social partners and educational institutions implement programmes to address OSH.		
Output 3.1. The capacity of employers and workers to promote OSH is enhanced.		
3.1.1	Provide training to workers and employers on reporting and notification systems	Delay: not yet started The project is currently looking into the development of a short recording and notification training in 2022 targetting the OSH advisors in Myanmar. Using the recording and notification guides and videos for employers and workers recently developed by the VZF, the short training will familiarize the OSH advisors with the ILO standards on recording and notification, including how to set up a

			system at the workplace level, and promote the advantages of the system.
3.1.2	Provide training to workers and employers on occupational health including occupational diseases and its prevention and workplace health promotion	On schedule	<p>Conducted 1 COVID-19 prevention in workplace peripheries training and content requested by the Union of Myanmar Federation of Chamber of Commerce and Industry (UMFCCI).</p> <p>Delivered the above training to representatives of CTUM Migrant Resource Centres and to workers through the representatives of a Local CSO known as Skill for Humanity SFH.</p> <p>Through SFH, trained 358 workers households (825male and 739female) with COVID-19 prevention in peripheral work activities and provided COVID-19 support materials.</p> <p>Provided similar training to 31 (11male, 20 female) migrant workers representatives and supported 550 migrant workers with COVID-19 support materials.</p> <p>Collaborated with VZF project to sponsor 10 nominees from OSH service organizations in Myanmar to XXII World Congress for Safety and Health at Work 2021.</p>
Output 3.2. OSH is mainstreamed into education.			
3.2.1	Support the development/strengthening of OSH modules into TVET with particular focus on occupational health	On schedule	Ongoing partnership with the CVT Myanmar (non-profit INGO TVET institution) to provide OSH management training for trainers and integrate OSH content into 4 curricula.
3.2.2	Support the OSH training centre in developing its research capacity	Cancelled	As the OSH training centre is a government-run facility, we are unable to engage in this activity per the UN Principles of Engagement
Outcome 4: Immediate Objective 4: Workers increasingly demand Safe and Healthy workplaces.			
Output 4.1 Awareness on the newly adopted OSH framework and health promotion is fostered.			
4.1.1	Support tripartite constituents in the development of an awareness-raising campaign in line with the	On schedule	Ongoing activity on Mental Health Awareness at workplaces activity with MCEF in 2022.

	selected themes relevant to the project		
4.1.2	Develop, in consultation with the tripartite constituents, awareness raising materials as outlined in the plan	On schedule	Ongoing activity on Mental Health Awareness at workplaces activity with MCEF in 2022.
4.1.3	Hold a series of awareness raising events in line with the adopted plan	On schedule	Organized 1 in-person photo exhibition to raise awareness on OSH from 12 Jun to 10 Sep 21 through PhotoDoc Association at the IFB Yangon.
Output 4.2. Myanmar OSH good practices are widely shared at regional and global level.			
4.2.1	Document a selection of good practices on OSH in Myanmar	Delay: not yet started	Due to the commencement and roll-out delays associated with the first, second, and third waves of COVID-19, the military takeover and ensuing violence and political unrest, as well as the constraints on project implementation activities, a selection of good practices will be undertaken once the current planned sustainable and capacity building related activities are completed (e.g. mainstreaming TVET, and the mental health awareness activities). Next steps will be include evaluating the activities upon their completion and identifying appropriate venues for showcasing.
4.2.2	Share good OSH practices between Myanmar and the global OSH community (including ASEAN-OSHNET)	Delay: not yet started	Please see above.

Annex 3: Theory of Change

**SAFETY
+ HEALTH
FOR ALL**

