



Evaluation Summaries

Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia

Quick Facts

Countries: *Ethiopia*

Final Evaluation: 08/03 – 02/04/2010

Mode of Evaluation: *Independent*

Technical Area: *Employment*

Evaluation Management: *ILO Sub-regional Office, Eastern Africa, Addis Ababa*

Evaluation Team: *Dr. Birgitte Woel*

Project Start: *January 2007*

Project End: *April, 2010*

Project Code: *TC Code ETH/06/50M/NET*

Donor: *Government of the Netherlands (US\$ 2,803,592.00)*

Keywords: *Employment, Social Dialogue, OSH, Child labour, HIV/AIDS, International Labour Standards.*

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

This programme is aimed at addressing decent work deficits, promoting productivity and innovation in three priority sectors identified by the tripartite partners in line with the national development strategy. These priority sectors are (a) cotton /textiles, (b) floriculture and (c) solid waste management in the city of Addis Ababa. The TCRAM Programme is a culmination of a series of consultations between SRO Addis Ababa and government, social partners, target beneficiaries, researchers and ILO HQ colleagues.

Thus, the programme has three components, namely: 1. Promoting decent work in the cotton

and textiles sector and making it nationally and internationally competitive; 2. Enhancing Productivity, Competitiveness and Market Access through Decent Work in the Floriculture Sector of Ethiopia; and 3. Employment Creation through Sustainable Solid Waste Management Services in Addis Ababa. Child Labour (CL) became an independent fourth component. The components incorporated gender and HIV/AIDS into their activities.

The project emanates from the DWCP for Ethiopia. Moreover, outcomes of the project have contributed to the priorities and outcomes of the national development strategy, the Plan for Accelerated and Sustainable Development to End Poverty (PASDEP). Likewise, the project has contributed to the UNDAF for Ethiopia, particularly aligned with outputs under the enhanced economic growth pillar of the UNDAF.

ILO's implementing partners at the sectoral and macro levels are the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA), Ministry of Trade and Industry (MoTI), Ethiopian Horticulture Producers and Exporters Association (EHPEA), Ethiopian Employers Federation (EEF), Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU), and the Sanitation, Beautification and Parks Development Agency of the City Government of Addis Ababa.

The project interventions were at three levels: upstream (addressing the tri-partite capacity building and new legislation, NAPs, Code of Operations etc), at meso-level (involving the sector associations, which came to play a lead role in the achievements in all three sectors) and downstream level interventions involving NGOs (for example

in testing the NAP for withdrawal of children from WFCL).

Present situation of project

The project was approved by the GoE-MOFED in January 2004 and implementation commenced in August 2007 with a budget of \$3,249,824. A few months through its implementation, the budget was cut down by \$446,000 for various programmatic and administrative reasons. The project will be completed on 30th April 2010.

A mid-term evaluation of the project undertaken in November 2008 revealed that “key notable outcomes have been achieved in all three components” while progress in some objectives is still lagging and faces a number of challenges. The project has managed to incorporate many of these, especially at downstream and meso level.

The programme has carried out substantial and impactful work at meso and downstream level for up-scaling of introduced DW practices, but did not pay sufficient attention to the needs for institutional building of the tri-partite constituents with the view to build a foundation and framework for sustainable partner-based continuation of activities. The programme outputs did not include such support.

By the end of 2009, the delivery rate of the project was at 88%.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of the final evaluation report was to provide an opportunity for the Office and its funding partners to assess the appropriateness of the design as it relates to the ILO's strategic and national policy frameworks, and considered the effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of project outcomes. Moreover, the evaluation examined the underlying assumptions about contributions to the MDGs and the PASDEP.

This final evaluation looked at progress made under the 7 immediate objectives in the three sectors of the project from August 2007 to date. As this is an integrated programme the evaluation looked at the links between the three different components and analysed progress made as a whole.

The main audience/clients of the evaluation are; relevant staff members of the ILO SRO Addis Ababa, programme coordinators and technical backstopping specialists, the tripartite constituents ILO technical units in Headquarters and the donor.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation took place from March 8th -April 2nd. 2010. Secondary data was gathered through desk review of the programme document, quarterly progress reports, work plans and emergency work plans, mission and workshop reports, baseline surveys, monitoring data, country data and previous evaluation reports etc. Primary data was gathered through field visits and interviews with relevant ILO staff, social partners, service providers, implementing partners and beneficiaries in all sectors.

The time for country visit was short, which limited the choice of methods.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The programme had reported 88% achievement by the end of 2009. The achievements are significant at meso and downstream level, while the capacity of the tripartite constituents has not been built in a manner and to a level, where they can maintain and disseminate DW practices in a sustainable manner.

The major achievements of the four components are the following:

Child labour: National Action Plan in place, MoU ready for signature and 320 children withdrawn from commercial sex and traditional weaving against the planned 300.

Flower farms: 52 flower farms comply with the programme developed Code of Practices and have received certification opening export opportunities, Template Farm Policy on OSH produced and distributed among farms, training in Modern Labour Inspection System organized and attended by all labour inspectors in the country.

Cotton/textile: Development of Competitiveness Plan for the sector, development and implementation of Action Plan for Business Development Services, 5 garment factories received WRAP certification and thus access to export markets, 88% female employment.

Solid Waste Management: 776 waste collectors trained on basic OSH skills with 66% female participation, 112 women and men (99% women)

were trained in 6 categories of handicraft recycling skill, OSH action manual developed

The programme has significantly contributed to development and introduction of procedures for DW practices. However, capacities of local institutions and partners have not been effectively enhanced to ensure sustainability of the project's results.

Internal conditions that have affected the project's achievements:

1. *The Budget cut* by \$446,000 negatively affected performance at a peak time for delivery and progress.
2. *Lack of coordinator/Project Manager* resulted in less efficient and effective use of funds and other resources.
3. *The Programme design* did not sufficiently build institutional and HR capacity of tri-partite constituents to ensure up-scaling and sustainability negatively.
4. *Programme implementation period* of 3-year was too short for the intended achievements as policy design and subsequent implementation of policies and frameworks takes time.
5. *The SRO technical expertise in the office* was not fully and effectively utilized.

External conditions that have affected the project's achievements:

1. *The Conducive investment policy* income/export optimism, which facilitated a positive attitude towards the project.
2. *Sector attitude:* The respective sectors engaged whole-heartedly resulting in considerably deliverables despite internal challenges.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

It is recommended that the project be extended for a second phase with a three years duration in order to ensure sustainability of institutional structures set up and capacities and motivations of beneficiaries in all components. Immediate efforts should be made to mobilize funds for a subsequent

phase of the project without a long interruption of interventions at the downstream level.

The design process of similar project should give ample time for the preparatory phase in order to establish a common ground before commencement of implementation. Moreover, similar interventions should give due focus on building the capacities and motivating social partners to ensure the relevance of interventions, involve them more in the implementation and monitoring of the project and to ensure sustainability of impacts.

Finally, it is recommended that the ILO forges partnerships with UN agencies with similar and/or complementing interests and efforts such as FAO, UNIDO, UNIFEM, WHO, UNICEF, IOM and UNEP.

Important lessons learned

1. Project designs should emphasise more on capacity building of future implementers than on the very implementation to ensure sustainability of project outputs.
2. The preparatory stage of the project is important for establishment of a common ground and thus should be given due time.
3. Achievements in terms of policies, protocols and procedures, institutionalisation of the same and then implementation at downstream level takes more than three years to accomplish. Interruption after three years awaiting decisions of possible programme extension disrupts the work and current motivation, which may be difficult to restore.
4. It is essential to have a fully informed programme coordinator for the implementation of similar project with interrelated components.
5. Programme planning ought to incorporate factors motivating individuals at short term at upstream level.
6. Introduction of DW practices and ILS can be swift and successful when targeting specific industries intensively.