

FINAL REPORT



Prepared by

Maureen Wang'ati
Sr. Evaluation Consultant
Executive Director
Measure Africa
Office-18 Langata Link
Karen, Nairobi, Kenya
P.O. Box 1548-00606
Sarit Center, Westlands
Nairobi, Kenya

Email: mwangati@measureafrica.org

Mid Term Evaluation

Of the

Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia Programme

(TC Code ETH/06/50M/NET)

For

ILO Sub Regional Office for Eastern Africa,

Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Submitted on:

11/11/ 2008

Table of Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS	II
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	IV
LIST OF ACRONYMS	V
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	VII
1. BACKGROUND AND PROGRAMME DESCRIPTION	1
1.1. Background and Context	1
1.2 Aims of the Programme	2
1.3 Programme components	2
1.6 Target group	4
1.7 Cross Cutting Issues	4
1.8 Programme Status	6
2 PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION	7
2.1 Study Contributors and Participants.....	7
2.2 Focus and scope of the MTE.....	7
2.3 Objectives of the MTE	8
2.4 Evaluation Norms and Standards	8
3 METHODOLOGY	9
3.1 Analytical Framework (Evaluation Criteria and Key Questions).....	9
3.2 Approach and process	10
4 EVALUATION FINDINGS	11
4.1 Relevance Complimentarily and Alignment	11

4.2	Effectiveness.....	13
4.3	Efficiency.....	17
4.4	Adequacy.....	20
4.5	Coordination.....	20
4.6	Sustainability and Ownership.....	21
4.7	Replicability.....	22
5	CONCLUSIONS.....	23
6	RECOMMENDATIONS.....	24
6.1	Relevance, Complementarily and Alignment.....	24
6.2	Effectiveness.....	24
6.3	Efficiency.....	25
6.4	Adequacy.....	25
6.5	Coordination.....	26
6.6	Sustainability and ownership.....	27
6.7	Replicability and Scaling Up.....	27
	ANNEXES.....	28
	Annex 1a. Contribution to Bipartite, Social and Tripartite Partners and Constituents: Cotton and Textiles Component.....	29
	Annex 1b. Contribution to Bipartite Relations, Social Partners & Tripartite Constituents: Floriculture.....	30
	Annex 1c. Contribution to Bipartite Relations, Social Partners & Tripartite Constituents: SWM.....	31
	Annex 1d. Contribution to Bipartite Relations, Social Partners and Tripartite Constituents Cross Cutting Issues.....	32
	Annex 2 Summary of Main challenges in the Components.....	33
	Annex 3. Summary of MARCO, MESO & MICRO Level Outputs.....	34
	Annex 4. List of Participants and Contributors to the MTE Study.....	35
	Annex 5. Work Plan and Schedule for MTE in Ethiopia.....	37
	Annex 6. List of References for MTE Study.....	42
	Annex 7. TOR for Mid Term Evaluation.....	43

Acknowledgements

The consultant wishes to thank the Director, and staff of the ILO Sub-Regional Office for Eastern Africa for the excellent facilitation and support offered to the consultant on the Mid Term Evaluation of the Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation Programme in Ethiopia. Also to support staff including secretaries and drivers both in the ILO and Government offices who ensured smooth implementation of the study from contractual arrangements to logistical support for field work.

Equally, the consultant appreciates the contribution of the National Counterparts in the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, and the Ministry of Trade and Industry. Their effective collaboration and full participation in the study helped the consultant to better understand the relationships and identify strengths and challenges for informing the study findings and recommendations.

Finally, the consultant wishes to acknowledge the contribution and willing participation of social and tripartite constituents of the programme. Their views helped to explain the issues and findings identified in the evaluation so far and together with the ILO and bipartite members helped to complete the picture and improve the quality of the study through accurate interpretation of findings.

List of Acronyms

AACA	-	Addis Ababa City Administration
AACSA	-	Addis Ababa Chamber of Commerce and Sectoral Associations
ADLI	-	Agricultural Development Led Industrialization
AGOA/EPTA	-	African Growth and Opportunity Act/Export Preferential Trade Area
CETU	-	Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions
CL	-	Child Labour
CTA		Chief Technical Adviser
DWCP	-	Decent Work Country Programme
EEF	-	Ethiopian Employers Federation
EHPEA	-	Ethiopian Horticulture Producers and Exporters Association
ENDA		Environmental Development Action in the Third World
ESA	-	East and Southern Africa
FEMSEDA	-	Federal Micro Enterprise Development Agency
FIP	-	Farm Improvement Programme
GDP	-	Gross Domestic Product
GoE	-	Government of Ethiopia
GTZ	-	German Technical Cooperation Agency
HIV/AIDS	-	Human Immunodeficiency Syndrome
IDS	-	Industrial Development Strategy
ILS	-	International Labour Standards
IO	-	Immediate Objective
MDG	-	Millennium Development Goals
MOARD	-	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
MOFED	-	Ministry of Finance and Economic Development
MOLSA	-	Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs
MOTI	-	Ministry of Trade and Industry
MOU	-	Memorandum of Understanding
MOWA	-	Ministry of Women Affairs
MTE	-	Mid Term Evaluation
NPC	-	National Programme Coordinator /or National Programme Counterpart
NDP	-	National Development Plan
NGO	-	Non Governmental Organization
NPA	-	National Plan of Action
NPC	-	National Programme Coordinator

NSC	- National Steering Committee
OSH	- Occupational Safety and Health
PAC	- Programme Advisory Committees
PASDEP	- Plan for Accelerated and Sustainable Development to End Poverty
PIC	- Production Improvement Centre
PIU	- Programme Implementation Unit
PLWHA	- People Living with HIV AIDS
PRSP	- Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
SD	- Social Dialogue
SDPRP	- Sustainable Development for Poverty Reduction Programme
SME	- Small and Medium Enterprise
SPBDA	- Sanitation, Beautification and Parks Development Agency
SRO	- Sub-Regional Office
TOT	- Training of Trainers
TWG	- Technical Working Group
UNCT	- United Nations Country Team
UNDAF	- United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	- United Nations Development Programme
UNIDO	- United Nations Industrial Development Organization
WFCL	- Worst Forms of Child Labour
WIND	- Work Improvement in Neighbourhood Development
WRAP	- Worldwide Responsible Apparel Production
WISE	- Work Improvement in Small Enterprises
WTO	- World Trade Organization

Executive Summary

The following is a Mid Term Evaluation Study Report of the ILO Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia Programme, funded by the Netherlands Cooperation Programme and implemented by the ILO Sub Regional office for Eastern Africa together with the Government of Ethiopia and other partners. The 3-year (2007-2010) funded DWCP programme¹ was developed by the ILO and the United Nations Country Team in support of the Ethiopian Government's five year (2006-2010) "*Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to end Poverty*" (PASDEP)² that focused on improved commercialization in agriculture, private sector growth and scaling up efforts towards achieving the global MDGs to which Ethiopia is a signatory. The main objectives of the programme are threefold; 1) to promote decent work in the cotton and textiles sector and making it nationally and internationally competitive; 2) to enhance productivity, competitiveness and market access through Decent Work in the Floriculture Sector of Ethiopia; and 3) to create employment through sustainable solid waste management services by micro and small enterprises in Addis Ababa. Cross cutting issues are also a focus of the DWCP: Child Labour, Gender Mainstreaming, International Labour Standards, Occupational Safety and Health, Social Dialogue and HIV/AIDS. The programme aims to increase the competitiveness and productivity of Ethiopian agricultural products with a view to reduce poverty and increase employment opportunities for men women and youth in Ethiopia. This MTE study was conducted by an independent evaluator from 13th October - 10th November 2008. The TOR guided the study design and implementation which employed mixed evaluation methods-qualitative and quantitative- to enhance the quality of the study. Evaluation ethics and standards of respect, privacy, informed consent and confidentiality were keenly observed.

The study findings reveal that the DWCP in Ethiopia experienced a long implementation delay: about 8-10 months, from the initial contract signing between the ILO and the donor in January 2007. This has initially slowed the rate of activity implementation and effectiveness and efficiency outcomes achieved so far. However the programme management made deliberate attempts to expedite service delivery and budget expenditure through an emergency work plan implemented from April 2008 with positive results and trends evidenced so far. The programme activities are now well underway. However, although given the short time left it may not be feasible to complete all the activities by the end of the program cycle in March 2010. Some key notable outcomes have been achieved in all three components. Notably, enhanced competitiveness of floriculture through bronze certification of three flower farms, increased awareness on OSH for poor waste collectors in Addis Ababa, creation of a very effective technical working group in the cotton sub sector coupled with linkages of cotton farmers to textile producers. The needs of women and marginalized groups are well considered in each component as have child labour and social dialogue cross cutting issues. However ILS is still in its infancy stages and requires more activities to be implemented along with improved coordination within the ILO SRO team to maximize impact. Several unexpected challenges were identified and are in need of immediate redress by programme management. Central to these is the very low level of capacity of national counterparts and social partners to undertake key tasks associated to this programme; the current government reform and restructuring process; lack of incentives for government partners, and high employee turnover in floriculture farms. This signifies increased needs for training and capacity building and support for this programme in the form of a no cost 9-12 month extension and training support by Turin and other institutions. An important observation is the lack of a CTA or Programme manager which this MTE believes is necessary for such a complex programme. The M&E function is needs strengthening to effectively monitor and report on this complex programme that is working in many sectors and on various levels with multiple partners in a challenging environment. A results based evaluation framework should be developed for the programme to help managers and implementers to deliberately focus on achieving planned outcomes and impacts.

¹ The programme falls under the Decent Work Country Programme Agenda of ILO, and is therefore hereinto referred to as the DWCP

² Ethiopia has a population of 73 million people- the second most populous country in Africa and ranked the 5th poorest country out of 175 countries as measured by per capita income levels. (1999/2000 Household Income and Expenditure Survey). Nearly half (45.5%) of the total country population lives below the poverty line.

1. Background and Programme Description

1.1. Background and Context

Ethiopia is the second most populous country in Sub-Saharan Africa with a population of 73 million according to July 2006 statistics. It is also one of the poorest countries in the world as measured by per capita income levels; (US\$115). Ethiopia is ranked 169th out of 175 countries³ and the 1999/2000 Household Income and Expenditure Survey confirmed reports that that nearly half (45.5%) of the total country population lives below the poverty line⁴.

1.1.1. Government Strategy: PASDEP

However, despite registering commendable macro economic performance overall since the 1990s, its effect have been minimal on reducing poverty levels in the country. Therefore, in an effort to reverse this trend, the Ethiopian Government (GoE) has developed national development strategies aimed at reducing poverty and its consequent socio-economic challenges. In 2002, the GoE launched a 3-year Sustainable Development for Poverty Reduction Program (SDPRP), which aims to build a free-market economic system. The SDPRP strategy is expected to enable the economy develop rapidly, end dependence on food aid and allow poor citizens to benefit from the country's economic growth. The updated version of this strategic framework (SDPRP II) has been renamed and is now known as *A Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty* (PASDEP). It identifies the strategic guidelines for the GoE from 2006-2010 and builds on the SDPRP. It however focuses more on economic growth – with particular emphasis on promoting improved commercialization of agriculture, private sector growth and scaling-up efforts towards achieving the global Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)⁵ to which Ethiopia is a signatory. The PASDEP also considers “creating employment opportunities” as one of the eight strategies to be pursued during the five years period of the plan.

1.1.2 Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) in Ethiopia

The International Labour Organization (ILO) and the United Nations Country Team (UNCT) responded to the Ethiopian Government's five-year strategy by developing appropriate frameworks to support PASDEP. First, the ILO and its local constituents formulated the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for Ethiopia, which provides the framework for ILO's contribution to the realisation of PASDEP's objectives. Of the eight strategic focus areas of the PASDEP, four were prioritised and formed the basis for developing the DWCP for Ethiopia:⁶

- (a) Massive push to accelerate growth through commercialization of agriculture, and promoting rapid non-farm private sector growth.
- (b) Unleashing the potential of Ethiopia's women through, among other measures, intensifying the responsiveness to women clients of a wide range of programmes designed to boost productivity,

³ Source: 2003 Human Development Index.

⁴ Programme Document, p.9

⁵ Ibid, p.10

⁶ Ibid, p. 10

- including agricultural extension, micro-credit, natural resource management, and small business promotion.
- (c) Strengthening human resources development – which recognizes that a healthy, productive, and trained human resource is essential for the implementation of government policies, strategies and programmes.
 - (d) Creating employment opportunities.

1.2 Aims of the Programme

The Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia Programme constitutes a key vehicle for delivering ILO assistance for the implementation of DW for Ethiopia. Its main aims are to⁷:

- (a) Contribute to the enhancement of productivity and competitiveness in the floriculture, Solid Waste Management (SWM) and cotton/textile sectors by fostering decent work, with a view to unleashing their productive and employment potentials.
- (b) Contribute to the enhancement of the social and environmental credentials that enable sustainable access to global markets for the cotton/textiles and floriculture sectors.
- (c) Promote employment creation, creating a conducive environment for increasing foreign exchange earnings, enhancing local economic development, promoting social dialogue to address issues of training and human resource management, innovation, productivity and working conditions, facilitating the elimination of child labour, and enhancing compliance with International Labour Standards

1.3 Programme components

To ensure effective and efficient implementation, programme outputs and activities are grouped under three components, each coinciding more or less with one of the three sectors as listed below⁸:

- i. Promote decent work in the cotton and textiles sector and making it nationally and internationally competitive
- ii. Enhance Productivity, Competitiveness and Market Access through Decent Work in the Floriculture Sector of Ethiopia
- iii. Create employment through Sustainable SWM Services by MSEs in Addis Ababa.

⁷ Ibid P.5

⁸ Programme Document, p. 6-7

1.4 United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF)

To augment efforts by ILO, the United Nations Country Office (UNCT) formulated the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) for the period 2007-2011 in support of PASDEP. UNDAF set out to provide a collective, coherent and integrated UN system response to the national priorities and needs. UNDAF is the common strategic framework for the operational activities of the UN system in Ethiopia that provides a collective, coherent and integrated UN system response to the national priorities and needs. The convergence between Ethiopia, the UN system and other development partners around the MDGs and PASDEP provides the organizing principle for the UNDAF (2007-2011).

Central to each country's UNDAF is agreement with the Government on three to five priorities selected from the challenges identified. The five priority areas mutually agreed on for action in the UNDAF II (2007-2011)⁹, together with suggested outcomes are: (a) Humanitarian Response, Recovery and Food Security; (b) Basic Social Services and Human Resources; (c) HIV/AIDS, (d) Good Governance; and (e) Enhanced Economic Growth. Across these five themes are several crosscutting issues: gender, good governance, population, HIV/AIDS, and Information and Communications Technology (ICT). Monitoring and Evaluation is a key task that will be used to review the DWCP's contribution to the GoE PASDEP. Among the five UNDAF priorities, three themes are particularly relevant to the ILO in Ethiopia¹⁰:

- i. **Enhanced economic growth** - is the primary vehicle for reducing poverty in the coming five years, focusing on growth with particular emphasis on greater commercialization of agriculture and development of the private sector.
- ii. **Good Governance** – The need for transparent, accountable systems of governance, grounded in the rule of law, encompassing civil and political as well as economic and social rights, and underpinned by accountable and efficient public administration.
- iii. **HIV/AIDS** - emphasises the importance of UN advocacy at national and regional levels and across sectors to create and enhance a supportive environment for HIV/AIDS response in terms of prevention, care and support programmes

1.5 ADLI Strategy as part of PASDEP

The Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) is also guided by the GoE's Agricultural Development Led Industrialization (ADLI) strategy, which includes the *Integrated Programme for Development of Cotton, Textiles, Garments Export (2004)*; and *Ethiopia Labour and Employment Programme (2002)*¹¹.

⁹ UNDP: *The United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) 2007-2011*. Addis Ababa, December 2005

¹⁰ Ibid, p.11

¹¹ Ibid, p.12

1.6 Target group

The target groups of the DWCP Programme in Ethiopia are men and women involved in the cotton cropping, textile industry, traditional weaving, solid waste management services and floriculture sub-sectors.

1.7 Cross Cutting Issues

1.7.1 International Labour Standards

To enhance understanding of International Labour Standards (ILS), the Programme is focused on raising the level of awareness and compliance with ILS and national labour legislation, delivering training workshops on the main standards of relevance to all three sectors, and providing assistance to enhance concrete compliance with labour rights by all concerned stakeholders¹². The Programme is focused on sensitizing policy makers to the main ILS of relevance. It also focuses on assisting in defining and devising elements of a policy, taking due account of relevant ILS to guide lower-level actors in their concrete implementation. The Programme seeks to train them on the contents of the ILO Core Conventions, as well as other relevant conventions such as those on occupational safety and health, national labour law and working conditions.

1.7.2 Child labour

Interventions against child labour focus primarily on the cotton/textiles and solid waste sectors to:¹³

- Contribute towards the broader national efforts to develop and implement Time-Bound measures for all Worst Forms of Child Labour (WFCL) in Ethiopia.
- Facilitate stakeholders from the various government agencies, social partners and civil society to jointly draw up and put in place sectoral action plans in the selected sectors
- Raise awareness on child labour issues.
- Undertake pilot activities for identifying, withdrawing and rehabilitating children involved in WFCL in the Cotton and Textiles and SWM sectors; to prevent other children from entering these sectors, and protect those above the minimum age for employment (14 years) from exposure to work hazards and exploitation.
- Develop documented standardized procedures, protocols and guidelines for preventing, withdrawing and rehabilitating, and protecting children from the WFCL in these sectors.

1.7.3 Social dialogue (SD)

A fundamental lack of knowledge of practices, procedures and opportunities of bipartite and tripartite social dialogue prevails in Ethiopia, and in the three focal sectors of the DWCP. Consequently, DWCP for Ethiopia has focused on major awareness-raising and training on SD principles.¹⁴

¹² Programme Document p.39

¹³ *ibid* p.39

¹⁴ *Ibid*, p. 40

1.7.4 Occupational Safety and Health (OSH)

Ethiopia has ratified ILO Convention 155 focusing on Occupational Safety and Health. However awareness of OSH issues is low. The required resources: financial, technical, Information and Management systems are below the critical mass needed to meet OSH goals set under the ILO Decent Work Agenda and the PASDEP. The DWCP for Ethiopia therefore, seeks to develop an appropriate response to these challenges by relying on and making use of available measures for creating and sustaining a safe and healthy working environment, including the work carried out in Ethiopia in recent years in the area of OSH.¹⁵

1.7.5 Gender Mainstreaming

To enhance equal opportunities for both men and women, the DWCP for Ethiopia seeks to undertake a thorough mapping exercise in each of the three sectors. Its purpose is to identify gender equity gaps, and obstacles (including cultural ones) to the promotion of gender equality at the workplace. The Programme also seeks to identify opportunities and entry points for activities to promote gender equality, gender mainstreaming and potential partners with whom the Programme can collaborate with on this issue. The findings of the mapping exercise will be used to inform the development of a strategy that is well adapted to the situation in each sector on all three levels of implementation. Future planned elements of a gender policy will be elaborated in conformity with ratified ILO Conventions Nos. 100, 111 and 156, to be subsequently coherently applied at enterprise workplaces. Different measures that integrate gender equality at the workplace will be implemented under the supervision of appropriate enforcement institutions (e.g. the Labour Inspectorate).¹⁶

1.7.6 HIV/AIDS¹⁷

Recent study findings reveal that between 360,000 and 1,100,000 million Ethiopian people were living with HIV/AIDS at the end of 2003.¹⁸ In particular, year 2005 adult HIV prevalence levels in Ethiopia were more than five times higher in urban areas (10.5%) than in rural areas (1.9%).¹⁹ AIDS accounted for about 34% of all deaths occurring among the population aged 15-49 years (about 66% in urban areas). Findings of other studies indicate that the majority of AIDS cases comprise economically active adults.²⁰ The pressure of poverty due to HIV/AIDS has led to an increase in the incidence of child labour. Both the DCWP and UNDAF lay emphasis on minimizing negative impacts of the HIV/AIDS pandemic in Ethiopia. One of the five DWCP priority areas on HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia is concerned with mitigating the HIV/AIDS pandemic at the workplace. The UNDAF theme on HIV/AIDS emphasizes the importance of UN advocacy at national and regional levels and across sectors to create and enhance a supportive environment for HIV/AIDS response in terms of prevention, care and support programmes. This will include support for capacity building at all levels across sectors in government institutions, civil society organizations, the private sector and communities. The UNDAF outcome in this regard involves

¹⁵ *ibid*, p. 41

¹⁶ *Ibid*, p.41

¹⁷ *Ibid*, p.9,11,12

¹⁸ *Report on the global AIDS epidemic, UNAIDS, 2006*

¹⁹ *AIDS Epidemic Update, December 2006, UNAIDS*

²⁰ *Baseline Survey conducted under the SIDA funded programme on HIV/AIDS prevention and impact mitigation, 2006*

achieving, by 2011 “*substantial progress towards reducing the vulnerability to HIV infection, especially of women and girls, and alleviating the impact of the epidemic, with emphasis on the underserved and affected population.*”

1.8 Programme Status

The Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia programme was approved by the GoE- MOFED in August 2007. Consequently, a Memorandum of Understanding was signed between the ILO and GoE detailing the implementation arrangements and obligations of each party. However, funds for implementation were disbursed earlier in July 2007, following the initial agreement between the ILO and the Netherlands Cooperation Programme in January of the same year²¹.

In anticipation of the GoE’s approval of the DWCP, the ILO/SRO proceeded, in consultation with implementing partners, to recruit programme staff. A total of eleven (11) staff were recruited by 1st August 2007, however they could not start working until the MOU was signed later that month between the GoE and the ILO. Institutional arrangements were agreed upon with a National Steering Committee (NSC) that was established to oversee and provide policy guidance to the DWCP²². Similarly, three technical working groups (TWGs) were established for each programme component. They are comprised of representatives from all implementing partner groups, ILO social partners and relevant stakeholders. Gender mainstreaming helped to ensure that different perspectives were represented in the TWGs²³.

The last quarter of 2007, was focused mainly on installation of DWCP staff in Ethiopia, procurement of office space and office equipment. This involved operationalizing the programme organs and starting preparatory work for the major programme activities, for full implementation in 2008. The late start impacted on the implementation schedule by initially slowing down the delivery rate. However, in early March 2008, the ILO/SRO proactively embarked on developing a three month “Emergency Plan” to stimulate and expedite programme implementation efforts. The Plan’s aims were to accelerate delivery by rescheduling all outstanding activities to bring them back on track according to the original planned timetable. A total of USD 558,342 was committed to be spent over this period bringing the expenditure rate to 24%²⁴ from a low of only 7% by the start of 2007. Although there was notable expedition of budgetary spending during the quarter, it however did not reach the planned levels for several reasons explained in the findings section of this report.

²¹ Progress Report January – December 2007, p.1

²² The NSC comprises implementing partners of the DWCP

²³ Jan-Dec, 2007 progress Report, P. 1

²⁴ Progress Report, April- June 08, P.4

2 Purpose of the Evaluation

The purpose of the Mid Term Evaluation (MTE) and this report is to highlight the main findings, achievements, challenges, key lessons learned and recommendations of the Poverty Reduction through Decent Work Creation Programme in Ethiopia. The evaluation was commissioned by the ILO Regional Office in Addis Ababa from 13th- 10th November 2008 and conducted by an Independent Evaluation consultant. The study commenced with an initial desk review exercise in the consultant's home country followed immediately by a one week field data collection activity and another week reporting and debriefing period in the Ethiopia. The report was finalised in the consultant's home country and incorporated the views and comments from the ILO SRO on the first draft report. The total period for the Mid Term Evaluation was 20 days, from 13th October-10th November 2008.

2.1 Study Contributors and Participants

Contributors to the Mid Term Evaluation included representatives from various institutions, agencies, departments and organizations forming the tripartite relationship: private sector, public sector, and the NGOs community.²⁵

1. ILO Sub regional Office for Eastern Africa
2. Government Departments and Agencies working in Floriculture, Cotton and Textiles and SWM
3. SMEs
4. Farmer/ Producer, Employer, Manufacturer and Professional Associations
5. Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions
6. Ethiopian Employers Federation
7. Local NGOs and International NGOs
8. International Donors
9. Training Consultants
10. Technical Working Groups for SWM and Cotton Components
11. Programme beneficiaries
12. National Counterparts

2.2 Focus and scope of the MTE

The geographic scope of the MTE²⁶ is Ethiopia covering flower farms in Addis Ababa, Sebeta, Hoteta, Addis Alem and Debre Seit. Also Cotton farms, ginneries and traditional weavers enterprises in Addis Ababa, Gambella, Arbaminch, Bahir-Dar, Combolcha, Awassa and Nazareth. Regions. Sectors that are the focus of the programme are also the focus of the evaluation: - Textile and Cotton, Solid Waste Management and Floriculture industries.

²⁵ See full list of MTE Participant Organizations in Annex 4

²⁶ Site visits of the actual evaluation were limited geographically to Sebeta, due to logistical and time constraints. However, the study was comprehensive and addressed the full scope of the programme.

2.3 Objectives of the MTE

The objectives of this MTE are to identify the issues affecting service delivery and the slow rate of activity implementation and completion and to identify and propose practical recommendations to help re-design the programme and facilitate expedition of service delivery to ultimately achieve intended program results: outcomes and impacts.²⁷ The MTE therefore concentrates its efforts on addressing key questions highlighted in the study TOR, with special attention to measuring the level of performance based on what was planned and envisaged in the original programme document that was drafted in 2006- one year prior to signing of the agreement in 2007. Lessons learned and good practices based on the experiences of programme management, staff, key stakeholders, partners and beneficiaries are identified under the findings. These are triangulated, analyzed and highlighted for the purpose of offering useful insights and guiding the formulation of practical recommendations for adjusting the programme plan and design.

2.4 Evaluation Norms and Standards

The norms and standards for evaluation and ethical safeguards were followed and observed in the study. Participants' right to privacy, confidentiality and informed consent were well considered by the consultant who requested participant's permission to record their views, informed them on how the findings would be used to influence future programming and ensuring that participants voluntarily engaged in the study. Participants' identities were protected and their individual views were de-linked. Only the names of institutions and organizations were included in this study. Apart from the work plan document in the annex that contains the names of individuals interviewed, for the purpose of responding to the TOR requirements for this information.²⁸

²⁷ See MTE- TOR in Annex Section for further details

²⁸ The consultant made every effort to conduct herself in a respectful and cordial manner while listening and engaging study participants at all levels in the study ensuring that they felt comfortable to share their personal and official views on the programme with confidence.

3 Methodology

3.1 Analytical Framework (Evaluation Criteria and Key Questions)

Analytical Framework (Evaluation Criteria and Key Questions)

The 'analytical framework including the evaluation criteria and key questions for this MTE study are proposed in the MTE TOR²⁹. However with permission of the Director of the ILO Sub regional Office for Eastern Africa, the consultant decided to review and restate these criteria, with the understanding that each of the questions highlighted are addressed under the new criteria. The 7 broad categories and criteria under which the DWCP for Ethiopia outcomes so far were evaluated are:

1. Relevance, Complementarity and Alignment
2. Effectiveness
3. Efficiency
4. Adequacy
5. Coordination
6. Sustainability and Ownership
7. Replicability and Scaling up

The main difference between the criteria proposed in the study TOR and those listed above is the decision to omit Impact criteria which were not found to be feasible to evaluate meaningfully yet due to the delays with programme start up experienced by the Programme. Instead impacts will have to be a focus of the final/ end term evaluation. This report however captures achievements and challenges identified so far, using mixed methods and techniques of triangulation to make linkages, associations, comparisons. The methods and techniques employed in this study are explained below:

3.1.1 Document Reviews

Background information on the DWCP for Ethiopia was sourced through several documents that were availed to the consultant by the ILO SRO in Addis Ababa³⁰. They include the Study TOR; ILO Technical Cooperation and Programme Document; Quarterly and Annual Progress Reports, Original, Revised and Tentative Work plans, Various reports highlighting programme achievements, Programme Fact Sheets, Status reports, Activity charts, Summary reports and TORs for various independent studies including situational analyses by commissioned consultants, workshop reports, Sector specific outputs such as the Code of Practice and OSH promotional and training materials. Additional materials that were availed in soft copy include the UNDAF, PASDEP and P&E 2008-2009 reports.

²⁹ See TOR Section IV

³⁰ See List of References in Annex Section

3.1.2 Web Based Research

Web based research was conducted on internationally ratified agreements (e.g. the Occupational Safety and Health Convention, 1981 (No. 155), the Occupational Safety and Health Recommendation, 1981 (No. 164), Article 4 on National Systems for promoting OSH).

3.1.3 Round Table Meetings

Four Round Table Meetings were held with ILO SRO management and staff representing each of the 3 main programme components -cotton and textiles, solid waste management and floriculture- and the 'cross cutting issues sub component including gender, international labour standards, Child Labour and Social Dialogue. One round table meeting was held with the tripartite group representing the Ethiopia Horticulture Producers and Exporters Association (EHPEA), CETU and EEF.

3.1.4 Focus Group Discussions

Three Focus Group Discussions were conducted in:

- SWM component- with a Waste Collectors Group in Addis Ababa for the Solid Waste Management Programme.³¹
- Cotton and Textiles component- 7 members of the Technical Working Group

3.1.5 Individual Key Informant Interviews

The consultant conducted several interviews with key informants who include the ILO SRO Director, National Programme Counterparts engaged in the three main components and based in the Ministry of Trade and Industry (MoTI), the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA); a Floriculture farm manager; individual tripartite member representatives, and an officer with UNIDO.

3.2 Approach and process

An involved and participatory approach was adopted for the MTE to facilitate learning, information sharing and to enhance the quality of the study including interpretation of the findings. Being a mid-term evaluation, its main purpose was to inform programme design and help it realign itself properly within the current context. It therefore took on a light approach, encouraging all participants to offer their opinions and insights truthfully in order to help it deliver more effectively on its mandate. The MTE was initiated with a comprehensive briefing held in the ILO/ARO in Addis Ababa attended by the Consultant and the ILO Sub Regional Office for Eastern Africa Director; Senior Technical Specialists, National Programme Coordinators and the Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Officer. This was an introductory meeting where the purpose of the assignment was stressed and the consultant given the opportunity to ask questions and to seek any clarifications with logistical matters. The meeting instigated the field data collection exercise in Ethiopia.

³¹ In attendance were 11 female and 3 male group members:14 participants

4 Evaluation Findings

The following section contains comprehensively analyzed and consolidated findings of the MTE of the Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia Programme. Unlike the previous part, this section triangulates the findings from literature review -including updated documents such as budgets and work plans requested by the consultant during data collection- with results of key informant interviews, focus group discussions, round table meetings and observation. The questions identified in the MTE TOR³² are addressed under the 7 criteria as explained in the methodology section with the following key findings:

4.1 Relevance Complimentarily and Alignment

Ethiopia's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) focuses on the export oriented economy. In this respect, the GoE lays emphasis on agricultural exports with a view to realising industrialization, employment creation and other important goals. The overall focus of this strategy is to increase the competitiveness of Ethiopian products and create employment in all sub-sectors. This strategy is well supported by the government and other key actors in Ethiopia, including businesses and other development partners and fits with national frameworks particularly PASDEP.

- a. **OSH Policy-** the DWCP for Ethiopia is assisting GoE to deliver on its ratification to the OSH convention- 155 1981 and specifically on Article 4 that requires any ratifying country to develop an OSH policy to ensure compliance. A policy paper is currently being drafted through the programme that will help the country identify needs and gaps and develop a strategy and interventions to help it meet its international obligations in OSH –thereby increasing its competitiveness. Floriculture is an emerging sector with potential for economic growth and employment. Therefore the ILO commissioned a study (completed in 2006), to review decent work deficits. Results shared in a national consultative workshop offered recommendations and culminated in the drafting of a relevant Programme Proposal for this programme component.
- b. **The Factory Improvement Programme (FIP)** promotes productivity, competitiveness and working conditions in export-oriented enterprises in the sector. FIP promotes WRAP (Worldwide Responsible Apparel Production) certification which is expected to increase access for textile products to international markets and help the GoE to meet minimum international social compliance standards for enhancing benefits from AGOA EPTA within the export oriented, high priority sector. The government of Ethiopia has set up National Export Support Coordinating Committees on the first level led by the Prime Minister and on the second level led by the Minister for Trade and Industry. The latter has the responsibility of reporting to the first level Committee each month on the progress of ongoing development activities (e.g. WRAP certification of the garment industry; FIP for the Garment and Textile industry and WIND for the small scale farmers in cotton industry). USAID has already contacted buyers who have enquired about the certification status of garment factories in

³² See TOR page Section IV: Key Evaluation Questions/ Analytical Framework

Ethiopia. The donor agency plans to organize a ‘magic show’ to promote cotton products from the country- with expected benefits of enhanced competitiveness in the sub sector, and contribution to poverty alleviation and employment.

- c. **Contribution to the National Plan of Action (NPA) on Elimination of Child labour (CL)** - a Gender Sensitive Policy Framework (policy/institutional) review and baseline on CL was commissioned by the programme and completed in June 2008. Its purpose was to review the legislative and policy framework on CL with focus on the law, infrastructure, gender and existing gaps. A subsequent consultative workshop planned on 4th November 2008, would involve the State Minister for labour and 21 institutions mainly from social partners, worker and employer organizations, NGOs and regulatory bodies. This was found to be relevant and well aligned to the government’s needs to facilitate a national response NPA for Child Labour that will be endorsed by the government of Ethiopia and tripartite partners for future action even beyond the current programme.
- d. **Relevance to current needs on the ground- Business Process Re-engineering and Privatization**
The city administration policy shift towards privatization of waste collection services through MSEs and the apparent lack of capacity at policy, institutional and enterprise levels are still standing. The new City Administration, formed since May 2008 and the ongoing public sector reform through the Business Process Re-engineering process focuses on employment creation through improved waste collection services. Therefore, the program strategy shift towards interventions at policy, institutional and enterprise levels is well aligned with the policies of the new City Administration.sector.
- e. **Relevance to ILO’s mandate:** The DWCP for Ethiopia is relevant and well aligned to ILO’s mandate, key among its concerns are to address: low productivity and competitiveness; weak management capacity-especially evident among small enterprises in the solid waste sector-; important gaps in working conditions and occupational safety and health (OSH); low recognition of rights at work; weak social dialogue at the enterprise level; worst forms of child labour; gender inequality in the work place; HIV/AIDS in the workplace and weak institutional capacity to address problems³³. The programme is applying ILO tools: WISE, WIND, FIP, and Start Your Waste Collection Business Training Program to its programmes further aligning it to the ILO mandate and capacity including localized ILO publication on social dialogue and the national labour law.
- f. **Complementarity with other donors and social groups:** The programme is relevant, complimentary and aligned to the interests and activities of USAID (AGOA), UNIDO as well as local NGOs (e.g. enda-Ethiopia), professional, and employer associations, trade and worker unions. These aim to increase competitiveness, improve industrial relations, increase productivity and contribute to economic and national development goals of the country for poverty alleviation.
- g. **Relevance of Logic Model and Measures:** The objectives and indicators stated in the logic model are relevant to the programme overall. However certain modifications are proposed in the recommendations section of the report to prioritize and enhance the accuracy feasibility and relevance of measurement indicators and their means of verification.

³³ Ibid, p.15

4.2 Effectiveness

4.2.1 Effectiveness of Approach

Since signing of the MOU between the ILO and the Government of Ethiopia in August 2007, the Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia programme has so far been very effective in developing strong, bipartite and tripartite relationships that are essential to successfully coordinate, manage and implement this complex programme involving multi-level and multisectoral partners and beneficiaries in Ethiopia. This finding is reflected in the strong support for the programme overall expressed by programme partners at Micro, Meso and Macro levels. It is further evidenced through the committed, consistent, voluntary, active participation of National Programme Counterparts, Technical Working Group Members, beneficiary groups and private sector actors in scheduled meetings, events and activities with no form of monetary compensation or incentive from the programme. The equal responsibility partnership involving close, daily interaction between the National Programme Coordinators and National Programme Counterparts in Government with planned outputs is a completely new phenomenon and way of doing business for the GoE with development partners in Ethiopia. So far, according to the National Counterparts, no other international agency has worked in this modality with the GoE before- nor has such a high level of collaboration been expected. The bipartite partners see this strategy of the programme as potentially very mutually beneficial overall and an effective mechanism for ensuring good information flows from development programmes to the GoE's planning and reporting system. They are therefore ready and willing to continue to support the programme activities to ensure that it successfully meets its objectives which they find well aligned with their own country goals for poverty eradication. The current programme approach has instilled a feeling of ownership for the programme at all levels and with all partners of the programme which is essential to its successful implementation in Ethiopia.

“The issue of Counterparts is new to government as an implementing agency. UNIDO, GTZ, World Bank- we are working with them but they did not ask for a formal counterpart dedicatedly as the ILO NPC. However this one (ILO Programme) is interesting and practical and makes it fruitful, as from the government's side you have an accountable person. However juggling the office work there is sometimes a conflict however it is easily resolved” (stated by a National Programme Counterpart)³⁴.

A key strategy for achieving ownership and sustainability in the Cotton and Textiles component is the formation of an active TWG. Despite their being a new phenomenon in government, the TWGs have offered an important opportunity for GoE officials to interact and learn from the business, civil society, associations and other members. Likewise, the learning has been mutually beneficial as group members understand better how government works and creates networking opportunities for them which benefit their activities. Initially according to National Programme Coordinators, it was difficult to develop the TWG relationship and to get the modalities of efficient collaboration with members. However today the TWG it is properly established and includes an unconventional group: private businesses- who normally do not work closely with the Government. The outcome of this TWG so far has been felt most on the accelerated implementation and delivery of Programme activities through the two sub -committees who are invited separately to work on specific assignments. Another positive outcome is increased knowledge and learning about sector requirements for competitiveness and relevance to the PASDEP mandate.

³⁴ Specific outcomes realized under each component are summarized in Annex ____

4.2.2 Effectiveness of Activity Implementation

The MTE study reviewed program plans- including the logic model with planned activities and expected outcomes and an emergency plan drafted in April 2008. These documents were assessed against the current achievements and challenges of the DWCP so far and found to have a bearing upon the analysis of programme effectiveness. As observed during the field trip to a floriculture farm and a weaving micro enterprise in Addis Ababa, and as confirmed through focus group interviews with beneficiaries, and evidenced through the progress reports up to June 2008, it is clear that planned activities although initially delayed are now well underway with clear potential for achieving desired results upon their completion. So far, the findings suggest that there was an initial slow rate of budget expenditure which did not match expectations as per the initial planned programme of activities. The reasons for this are explained by the comments and views of evaluation participants who noted the need to internalize the process and to better understand the ILO mandate. The initial misconceptions about the ILO's mandate created defensiveness among businesses who saw the organization as a workers body promoting the rights of workers and not employers, with a *Hire! Don't Fire!* attitude and policy which employers and business considered unfriendly.

There were misconceptions and unfounded fears amongst programme beneficiaries (i.e., workers) and the public for instance about the potential harmful effects of working in floriculture due to perceived irreversible damage to health from pesticides and other chemical use. The need to frontload awareness raising activities on the issue of safe use of pesticides in order to improve the image of the sector and enhance the understanding of workers therefore took priority over other activities that would otherwise address the competitiveness and productivity angle with more easily measureable impacts. The idea of formal full time farm labour is relatively new in Ethiopia as these workers were previously self employed. Therefore floriculture producers and the association is faced with a very important task of capacity building and awareness raising of its human resource pool, on the benefits of formal employment, and worker rights, so as to ensure adequate human resource levels and reduce currently high staff turnover rates. Building employee trust, loyalty and ensuring OSH standards and labour rights and protection has been a significant preoccupation of the programme with its floriculture component especially. Significant progress has been made in delivering training activities, designing awareness and promotional materials on OSH, disseminating them to each of the relevant components. At this stage due to the newness of this activity it is difficult to determine what if any impacts have been realized as a result, However, these activities have been conducted in the spirit of the bipartite and tripartite relationship and therefore have potential for impact on gender equality, industrial peace, poverty reduction and strengthening influence of labour standards in Ethiopia, upon their completion - assuming that the momentum currently evidenced in the enhanced delivery rate of the emergency plan is maintained.

SWM activities in the Addis Ababa City Administration have been affected by the post 2005 election situation. After months of the political vacuum the Federal Government appointed a new 'Care Taker Administration' which lasted until May 2008. After the latest election in early 2008 and the subsequent formation of a new City Administration the counterpart Agency was not willing to fully engage until the new administration was fully installed. As a result the DWCP successfully negotiated with SPBDA which agreed to transfer the training activities for waste collectors on the Start Your Waste Collection Business Training Program (SYWCB) to the Micro and Small Enterprise Development Agency. However this too has its challenges as the new City Administration has since May 2008 been preoccupied with public sector reform and therefore fully committed its senior officials and experts up to the lowest levels in the training and formulation of GoE reforms. As a result the DWCP deferred these activities until after the completion of the restructuring process expected in November 2008.

4.2.3 Effectiveness of the programme outcomes by component

Some of the early positive outcomes so far realized through the programme are summarized for each component below. These have potential for impact in the competitiveness and employment objectives of the Programme in the near future:

a. Floriculture

- i. The ESA Association for Horticulture and a Community Partnership Agreement is an indirect outcome of networking and liaisons created between Floriculture growers in Ethiopia with those in Kenya. The purpose of the association is to increase the competitiveness and productivity of the East and Southern Region's horticultural produce so as to effectively compete against other trading blocs especially those in South America and Europe.
- ii. Bronze Certification- is the minimal level of certification of the code of practice. Three flower farms have been approved for compliance for the first time in Ethiopia by an external auditor. This is a direct outcome realised from the programme activities through the Association. The government has targeted that by the end of 2009 all flower farms in the country shall be code compliant and this is a huge task for the association and the programme. Also, a recent study tour to three labelled flower markets in Europe has helped the industry to better understand and refocus certain elements of the code of practice so that it will serve as the basis for any of the major flower labels in Europe or elsewhere, thereby potentially increasing competitiveness.
- iii. Growth of worker unions- as of 2 years ago there was no single union in the floriculture sub-sector to date there have been 50 Unions. This is one good development that can also be considered as an indirect outcome of ILO's efforts in the sector. The challenge however is to strengthen the unions as well as management in their approach respectively towards social dialogue at the enterprise level and to move towards increasing awareness of importance of collective bargaining for improved impact on poverty reduction and increased employment, industrial peace and decent working conditions.

b. Cotton and Textiles

- i. Linkages were established between cotton growers and other sub sectors in the cotton value chain. Following a needs identification workshop delivered by the programme in Gonder, a garment factory organized to buy cotton from farmers in the Amahara region, Gonder and Bahardar (northern part of ET). This is an important outcome which demonstrates that the programme is acting as a catalyst in relationship formation and networking of the sector's key players with potential positive impacts realized in future on poverty reduction and employment creation in the sub-sector as a whole. Links have also been established to other NGOs and UN agencies such as AGOA and UNIDO's cluster development programme, MSEs in the industry and WRAP Certification, in preparation for USAID AGOA programme and ILO through FIP which is integrated with the factory coaching programme of the Ethiopian Government.
- ii. The Technical Working Group- established under this component is effective and representative of the bipartite and tripartite relationship. This is one of the highlights of the overall programme as it has demonstrated effective delivery on its mandate and shown the positive benefits of a Public Private Sector Partnership (PPP).

c. Solid Waste Management

- i. Strategic Plan for SWM by the City Government of Addis Ababa -a study tour to Zambia was organized by the SWM component of the programme for the City Government of Addis Ababa – Sanitation Beautification and Parks Development Agency officials. An important outcome of the study tour is that the Agency has used inputs from Zambia to draft a strategic plan for SWM for the city. This was significant as the City did not have a strategic plan for SWM prior to this event.
- ii. Increased awareness of SWM issues, business practices and efficient processes are reported outcomes of the Adey Ababa Solid Waste Collectors group. The focus group held with mostly female workers in the City of Addis Ababa revealed that learning has taken place on OSH issues affecting waste, as well as business practices of sorting and differentiation of marketing waste products and materials, marketing and selling and labour division for improved efficiency and effectiveness. A culture of disciplined collective savings has been introduced by the programme as demonstrated with the opening of a savings account with a local bank, with potential to contribute to the poverty reduction goal of the Programme.
- iii. Increased tripartite awareness creation on decent work and beyond- the programme has produced and or assisted the production of print and audio-visual promotional materials, manuals and conducted several training all of which have potentially positive benefits as far as the creation and enhancement of the awareness of programme beneficiaries are concerned. However these benefits are yet to be tested and tried with the approval of funds for MSE transport equipment in the SWM component.

a. HIV/AIDS

Particularly in relation to the implementation of the Code of Conduct which is a contribution of the floriculture programme, EHPEA has developed programmes to address HIV/AIDS awareness in the farms through print and daily radio programs. This is currently done through a local NGO that is recruited by the EHPEA and paid by Global Fund.

b. Child Labour

No children were identified working in any of the components so far. Awareness of CL issues is notably high especially amongst the floriculture producers and the EPHEA who are the higher end beneficiaries of the Programme. The competitiveness strategy of the programme and the Code of Conduct document addresses CL issues and identify it as a precondition for certification. Therefore a positive outcome of the programme so far is the development of different awareness raising materials (brochures and posters) and creating awareness on cross cutting child labour issues within each component. Other main outcomes could be the beginning of the development of a National Plan of Action (NPA) for elimination of child labour by MoLSA using the study findings of the review of legislative, policy and institutional frameworks for addressing child labour commissioned by the DWCP in Ethiopia.

c. Social Dialogue

SD is an important prerequisite for promoting competitiveness, decent working conditions and harmonious industrial relations. Therefore an important outcome of the programme is raising awareness of employers on the importance and constituents of SD. There is evidence of early awareness of the importance of SD for peaceful relations amongst employers-especially those involved in floriculture however this awareness is still in its infancy and will need reinforcement through activity implementation and completion.

d. International Labour Standards

Apart from the code of conduct document already in place, there are no notable outcomes in the international labour standards area as few planned activities have been conducted to date. This is however a critical precondition for global competitiveness, and therefore outcomes are expected in key sub-sectors in the near future with expedited service delivery and activity implementation.

e. Gender

Gender outcomes for this Programme are particularly evidenced in all sub-sectors and components. For the most part deliberate effort has been made to mainstream women and men equally into employment and the TWGs. The Code of Practice, OSH documents and educational materials have clearly spelled out practice and safety practices for both females and male workers. The training outcomes were evidenced in the floriculture farms where women and men's work was clearly defined and enforced in such a way as to protect female workers also promote maximum productivity from all workers. Equal pay for equal work and fair access to overtime and other benefits on horticultural farm visited was clearly evident through the targeted and deliberate efforts of the management with support from the programme component.

f. Overall effectiveness rating

Activity implementation and service delivery are well underway and expedited through the emergency work plan and other subsequent drafts. There is evidence of achievements across components, however, the readiness of key actors has been a major factor constraining services delivery efforts and outcomes during the period under review. This process was not adequately understood prior to the programme and has therefore affected the initial activity roll out due to the need to prioritize other softer types of unforeseen, process type activities (e.g. follow-up meetings, discussions etc) in an effort to harmonize programme implementation processes with government structures for successful tripartite and bipartite relationships.

4.3 Efficiency

4.3.1 Effectiveness of implementation

As explained in the progress reports and other documents, efficiency of service delivery and achievement of outcomes so far has been compromised by an 8-10 month implementation delay due to factors expressed in the Programme status section above. In summary these include the late signing of the Government and ILO corporation agreement in August 2007 and the subsequent time for installation of components in various offices and government ministries that took time, due to space considerations and bureaucracy of government with many levels of protocol required before decisions that are already in effect in the MOU could be implemented in reality. The programme is therefore behind schedule on its expected outputs and this is reflected in the budget expenditure levels which are below expectations for the Programme timeframe. However notwithstanding the delay and subsequent negative impact on spending and activity implementation, the emergency work plan currently in effect is indicative of commitment to accelerated delivery and thereby increased expenditure rates. These have also been influenced by collaboration between bipartite and tripartite groups who have now understood and internalized the programme goals, focus and strategy.

The culture of social dialogue is yet to develop between workers and employees in the targeted sectors, at enterprise well as at TWG levels. The high level of suspicion and mistrust was a challenge to the

programme which had to first build the confidence and trust as a precondition for this processes. As change takes time, it ultimately has had an effect on the programme's ability to deliver on its mandate with the efficiency levels envisioned during drafting of the document in 2006.

The level of commitment expected of the bipartite counterparts far outweighs any personal benefit to them. The programme offers no extra compensation but ILO assumes that National Counterparts will readily take on additional responsibilities of the DWCP on top of their daily duties and routines in government. Meanwhile the Ministries are undergoing a restructuring process and are currently very short staffed. This according to some evaluation participants is a design flaw which should be reviewed in light of the fact that other international donors such as the World Bank decided to back away from the PIU approach to instead embark on a more efficient processes involving complete integration into the Ministries, rather than setting up separate parallel units within them.

The TWG members have helped to promote efficiency with some even offering to carry out activities themselves. They are however limited by the lack of adequate resources and lack of decision making powers in some cases which affects their morale and limits their contribution.

Cross cutting issues are generally lagging behind schedule just like the rest of the programme activity. Reasons cited include re-prioritization (IO 7 HIV/AIDS Prevention); and IO 6 (International Labour Standards) the slow rate of activity implementation in each component, and the need to sit together and do long term planning on the ILS interventions. Gender mainstreaming activities are also delayed for similar reasons that the overall implementation has been delayed. The delay in the baseline survey results is also another reason because design of interventions will be based on the situational analysis report. For example for the floriculture component, activities related to HIV/AIDS are already underway by the EHPEA and what remains is to scale them up based on the decision of the association.

4.3.2 Factors affecting efficiency

The bipartite and tripartite nature of the ILO's work and the demands of the programme coupled with the fact that the initial programme document was drafted nearly one year prior to its implementation has impressed upon the programme the need to re-design and re-focus some of their activities in order to make them coherent and aligned to the current context within

Text Box 1. Efficiency Issues affecting the Child Labour Sub -Component

Unforeseen delays experienced by the late signing of an MOU between the ILO and MoLSA for the bipartite agreement on CL came as both a surprise and a setback to the implementation plan for CL issues. The MOU signing was previously assumed to be a straightforward process; however, the process posed unprecedented problems due mainly to unresolved issues between ILO/IPEC and the Government of Ethiopia concerning a previously commissioned study funded by IPEC on CL with the Central Statistics Agency. There were claims by IPEC of incorrect application of funds for unauthorized activities of government. Meanwhile the Programme which is dependent on active participation of government officials as a precondition for successful implementation was delayed.

With the help of the Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia programme, a verification team was invited to review expenditures of the Government of Ethiopia. Their findings indicated reporting gaps within the government structure concerning the allocation of resources, and also confirmed that the government had spent Programme funds on items that had not been agreed upon. The ILO/IPEC was demanding its money back from the government and was disinterested in furthering inputs in the country.

The Government of Ethiopia had already ratified the two CL conventions and expected ILO/IPEC to come in and help the country to implement the recommendations. The Child Labour sub-component of the programme therefore had to divert its attention from the current programme to try to revive and jumpstart the relationship between ILO/IPEC and the GoE before it could pursue its own objectives. Although the problem was eventually resolved, it had negative repercussions on the timely service delivery and achievement of planned results so far. A baseline survey that was commissioned to address CL issues was delayed. However it now on track with promise to accelerate programming and amend bipartite relations

each sector. The long time allocated to work planning- for instance by the TWG members and the ILO in the Cotton and Textiles sub sector affected efficiency of implementation of planned activities.³⁵

Lack of incentives and facilities for national counterparts (e.g. a lack of programme vehicle and reliable internet service) makes for an unequal partnership between programme implementers putting ILO officers in a much more advantageous position which is potentially a threat to harmonized work relations. This being the first experience with this type of collaboration offers yet another challenge for how to manage and effectively juggle the many tasks with very limited resources of national counterparts. Efficiency of performance is therefore partly affected by the lower morale levels amongst national staff coupled with the business process activity currently underway, that has created a looming sense of uncertainty amongst the national counterparts concerning the future of their careers in government.

ILO/SRO staff in the sub regional office have a very wide mandate covering the Eastern Africa region and not just Ethiopia. The high demands on their time and frequent travel poses a difficulty for their relationship national counterparts and social partners. These difficulties and challenges are expressed in the form of delayed responses to proposal submissions, inadequate reporting and delayed decision-making processes that have had a negative impact on the efficiency outcomes of this programme.

ILO/Geneva- has also contributed to inefficiency in service delivery by DWCP in Ethiopia. Specifically by delaying the approval of an agreement between a local financing institution and the ILO that would help to release vital funds amounting to (USD 70,000) meant for purchasing intermediate transport equipment on micro finance credit for waste collectors in Addis Ababa. These beneficiaries represent about half of the total target beneficiaries for the Solid Waste Management component and the situation is causing difficulty for the Programme management. Not only has this delay of approval by ILO Geneva had a negative impact on service delivery, but it has also resulted in a spill over negative effect that is threatening to reverse the potential gains achieved by the programme in developing a good bipartite relationship development process with the city administration. This situation was evidenced in the low level of trust and apparent tension observed between the City Administration and the Programme management. Also, with other partners such as the finance institution which is now requesting for a re-negotiation on the price due to economic changes since the MOU was not signed. The SWM component is compromised and currently forced to only deliver theoretical training that is neither well received nor properly appreciated by the city administration without subsequent practical application through the micro credit facility that is still being awaited from ILO Headquarters. This situation is a cause for concern and clearly indicates the need to speed up on programme implementation on all levels including ILO HQ so as to ensure the DWCP objectives with MSEs in Ethiopia are met during the Programme funding cycle.

Budget spending The commitment vs. disbursement rates of the project currently stands at about 22% compared to 7% in January 2008. Although this shows a general accelerated rate of spending since January 2008, however it is not yet to the level expected at this stage of the programme. Several factors have contributed to the initial delays. These include the programme design that involves several components and cross cutting issues working at macro, meso and micro levels; the new way of working with the GoE through national counterparts, the bipartite, tripartite approach on macro, meso, micro levels involving a National Steering Committee and Technical Working groups. All these factors have contributed to inefficient delivery and lower than expected expenditure rates. However it's worthwhile to state that the recent positive changes since April 2007. Assuming that this current trend continues, and the recommendations of this evaluation on prioritization of activities are implemented, the budget should be efficiently spent by the end of the programme cycle in 2010.

³⁵ See Annex 1 for summary of ILO's bipartite and bipartite DWCPM activities in Ethiopia

4.4 Adequacy

The adequacy of programme activities and the corresponding budget allocated to each activity was evaluated based on the current strategy and scope of the Programme which is working on three levels. On the whole the programme budget was thought to be adequate for each component as it relates to the planned activities. However with the actual activities that were previously unforeseen but later deemed unavoidable and/or critical for ensuring the successful participation by all target participants, the budget *allocated* to the components does not appear to be sufficient. There exists a very large capacity gap at the national counterpart and social partner levels including enterprises with low capacity for enforcement of labour legislation, knowledge of OSH for floriculture and SWM especially; knowledge of worker and employees rights and responsibilities, etc. Discussions with ILO and government staff on the programme revealed that significantly more additional training than was envisioned in the document is now required to reach the competitiveness and productivity objectives of the programme. When reviewing the programme as a whole including Floriculture- the allocated funding does not correspond to the needs presented. (E.g. priority needs for capacity building for regional states may not be addressed effectively with the current resources. The same situation applies to cotton which works in geographically diverse locations requiring on site, localized trainings).

Inadequacy of time remaining for the programme brings to question the adequacy of opportunity to successfully deliver on the DWCP's its mandate within the context of low capacity, three sub-sector focus the culture of closed communication where there is little social dialogue and the business process re-engineering by government for public sector reform. Generally the evaluation participants felt and the consultant agreed that much more time is needed than is left to successfully implement the programme in Ethiopia and realize tangible results and impacts. The recommendation on this finding is contained in the latter part of this evaluation report.

4.5 Coordination

ILO SRO- Programme coordinators and specialists noted the challenges of coordination which are unique to this programme. There are difficulties of integrating activities and resistance by some ILO SRO staff to approach the programme as one integrated activity rather than as separate components working independently. An observation made by a Programme Coordinator concerned the difficulties in deciding and agreeing on the modalities for collaboration, implementation and reporting for this multi-faceted programme that is working in three main components and across five cross cutting themes (HIV/AIDS, ILS, SD, Gender and CL) on various levels: meso, micro and macro level notwithstanding the lost time due to government bureaucratic processes. It isn't surprising therefore that the findings have revealed difficulties and gaps with coordination. This is further exacerbated by the lack of joint work planning involving all target groups. The difficulties of coordination were expressed by some national counterparts and social partners in the form of dissatisfaction and complaints in some quarters on their inadequate involvement or consultation at all stages of the Programme according to the ILO tripartite arrangement. There was some expressed dissatisfaction with what is perceived by some as ILO's overemphasis in developing close bipartite relationships with government. The fear and concern is that this approach overshadows the ILO tripartite relationship, leading to a feeling of isolation and exclusion amongst some key social partners.

ILO Geneva- The delayed approval of the MOU between the ILO and the Microfinance Institution on the SWM component demonstrates a gap in activity coordination efficiency with the ILO. This coordination gap is a concern for this component which is behind schedule with service delivery- yet with potentially significant poverty reduction outcomes and impacts as it is addressing the poorest beneficiaries: solid

waste workers- mostly female, youth and lowest in the economic ladder compared to other components. Potential for impact is very high with this group if coordination is improved to facilitate the formalization and approval of the MOU and funds release as soon as possible.

Bipartite partners- The unequal playing field between Programme implementers with the ILO and Government represents a challenge for proper coordination of activities. The programme relies purely on good will and personal sacrifice on the part of the government partners due to the inadequate resources and facilities available to them for programme implementation.

Tripartite partners- The formation of TWGs has contributed to easier coordination of programme activities and members. Although there were some hiccups experienced initially with their set up, some TWGs are advanced and even broken down into subsets with a given mandate and TOR which they follow and implement on behalf of the programme, their sector and the country as a whole. The TWG therefore is according to this evaluation a potentially useful model for use with coordination of this complex programme in Ethiopia.

Baseline Survey- Coordination is affected by the quality of communication with stakeholders. Delayed outputs of the baseline survey have had a negative effect on coordination due to unavailability of information required to engage meaningfully with stakeholders. The quality and reliability of the baseline is in question because the data gathered cannot be substantiated by the actual field situation. The fact that it is a big study covering all programme components further complicates it and increases its chances of not being able to adequately address all key questions and issues of interest to all programme components, sub components and cross cutting areas. Yet secondary sources of information are not easily available due to poor infrastructural development therefore this again has a bearing on a coordinated response.

4.6 Sustainability and Ownership

As discussed above, the DWCP for Ethiopia is well aligned to national priorities of the government. The timing of the programme represents what one participant described as *'the perfect marriage'* between the ILO programme and the Government of Ethiopia. The programme is potentially sustainable due to the political support that the programme receives, its relevance and fit with other poverty reduction and employment creation activities. For instance, concerning cross cutting Child Labour, the State Minister for Labour is involved in developing and facilitating the national response for the National Programme of Action (NPA) on Child Labour. The consultative forum will reach consensus on NPA formulation with input of consultants who will review the formulation of the NPA to be endorsed by the government and tripartite partners for future action even after the program ends.

According to national counterparts, the Programme is contributing to the decent work agenda in Ethiopia which is part of the National Development Plan and therefore a sustainable activity. The business process re-engineering strategy of government requires that capacities be built in all components of the programme to enable enforcement of legislation and policy adoption. Key to sustainability is the availability of the government's own resources and willingness and ability of tripartite partners to continue to implement the decent work programme in their businesses. On the part of the government although there is demonstrated support and political will for this programme, the GoE lacks adequate resources: human resource capacity, equipment, and facilities- to undertake full responsibility for this complex programme by the end of the programme cycle.

However with private sector, key aspects of the programme are already enforced such as adherence to a code of conduct which they have no choice but to implement to ensure competitiveness of their export produce to international markets. OSH, waste management, gender considerations, rights of workers, awareness and worker unions are some of the issues that will continue even after the programme cycle ends. Sustainability will however be best assured through expedited service delivery to facilitate achievement of intended outcomes and impacts which will lead to the Programme being sustainable. As it stands now this midterm evaluation does not concur with the view that the programme is sustainable by itself without support from the ILO and the donor. There is a lot of work left to be done before the programme can be self sustaining. Ownership for the programme however is relatively high as nearly every participant made mention of the fact that this programme belonged to Ethiopia and therefore they own it. However some stakeholders do feel isolated and left out of the process thereby diminishing their feelings of true ownership for the programme. This is an issue that needs to be addressed by the Programme in a coordinated manner to ensure full ownership and involvement.

4.7 Replicability

The programme has ventured on piloting various models within its major components with the hope that these may be replicated elsewhere in the country and perhaps even in other countries.

The BDS services offered to SWM beneficiaries are potentially replicable in other parts of the country with similar needs. Waste collectors reported positive benefits of this training including learning new skills such as how to start their small business, record keeping, waste management, recycling, marketing and selling, sorting, etc. They also formed an association and registered a savings account. Once the funds for transport equipment are availed by ILO, the MSEs will have potential to increase their outputs and thereby increase their incomes and alleviate poverty.

In floriculture, the excellent coordination and very smooth working relationship between the programme and the EHPEA in the implementation of the Code of Practice is a replicable activity in other sectors. This code has been adopted successfully by floriculture growers due to its relevance to the international code of practice and the requirement for these farmers to observe internationally ratified agreements.

The successful TWG in the cotton and textiles component of the programme is replicable to other components and programmes as its benefits are clearly evidenced as discussed in the previous section.

5 Conclusions

The findings of this study indicate that the Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia Programme is well aligned and relevant to the interests and priorities of the ILO, the government of Ethiopia, other NGOs, businesses and civil society institutions engaged in the bipartite and tripartite collaboration at meso, micro and macro levels. The programme experienced a late start due to government bureaucracy that is beyond the direct control of the Programme. Further to this, the rather nouvelle approach involving for the first time in Ethiopia national counterparts from government has realized the benefits of increased alignment, relevance, ownership and potential for sustainability. However the approach has also brought about unforeseen challenges of coordination, capacity building, and incentives for government workers, logistical planning and budget constraints that were not previously anticipated. This coupled with the Programme's focus in two commercial sectors (cotton and textiles and floriculture) as well as one sub-sector- Solid Waste Management and cross cutting issues of HIV/AIDS, Gender, International Labour Standards, Social Dialogue and Child Labour has contributed to a very complex and multi-faceted programme which requires very high standards of management and coordination to ensure its success and future sustainability.

The demands for inclusion, consultation and more formal involvement by important tripartite and social partners such as CETU, EEF, AACA among others further complicates this programme and impresses upon it the need to seriously reconsider its overall management structure, commitments in terms of outputs and activities; and its overall objectives and outcomes to ensure that they are realistic and achievable within the programme cycle and the context of the country's business re-engineering reform process.

The current changes being experienced on all levels and in all partner groups presents an opportunity for the programme to ensure its sustainability by being more responsive and timely in its and , coordination efforts. The Technical Working Groups although difficult to organize and work with initially have proven to be indispensable and a model for implementation in the cotton and textiles component. Their needs for capacity building and facilitation should however be re-considered by the programme if it is to achieve its wide mandate over the remaining period, including scaling up and replication of programme achievements and positive outcomes.

6 Recommendations

6.1 Relevance, Complementarity and Alignment

All three components of the DWCP for Ethiopia are well aligned and relevant to the macro, meso and micro sectors. Their complementarity is also well assured. However, as the programme document was drafted in 2006, certain aspects of the program (assumptions, strategy, design, planned activities and expected results) need to be revised and updated through relevant processes to fit the current priorities and needs of implementing partners and other stakeholders.

6.2 Effectiveness

- i. This Mid Term Evaluation focuses on the effectiveness of outcome achievement through service delivery efforts. It does not measure effectiveness by the rate of expenditure only, but also in terms of desired change due to internalization, adoption or participation in programme services. The effectiveness findings of the programme demonstrate definite potential to achieve planned results. Therefore the study recommends that service delivery be expedited through a redesign of the programme to include other actors more effectively (e.g. Turin training centre), laying more emphasis on capacity building training focused on national counterparts and social partners, improved coordination of the programme internally at ILO SRO based on a targeted approach involving both autonomy and collaboration on value adding activities of each component rather than on the entire component. This will also help to ensure that outcomes are easily tracked and measured.
- ii. The programme requires a dedicated individual whose role is to manage the Programme and advice on its implementation. A CTA/ Programme Manager position with clear mandated should be created to bring together the various components under staff member responsible for the overall outcomes.
- iii. The monitoring and evaluation function component of the programme should be strengthened. An M&E framework and results chain needs to be developed and continually monitored and periodically updated by a team of dedicated staff and with the help of an experienced M&E consultant. Opportunities to share monitoring findings should be identified during regular office meetings and also through quarterly reports and informal discussions with managers and specialists for each component. This would allow timely adjustments to the programme that would help it be well aligned to the needs of each stakeholder group and increase opportunity for effective delivery of services by highlighting the status of expected outcomes regularly, given the project a chance to comment and expedite its activities.
- iv. Effective measurement of the programme's outputs would be enhanced by reviewing the programme log frame to determine expected outcomes that are achievable directly by the programme and those that are not in the direct control of the programme. For example outcomes that are dependent on the implementation of policy by the GoE are a risk to the programme as it does not control the decision of policy implementation by the government. Therefore the measures and indicators should be limited to

achievements that can be measured through actions that the programme has control and responsibility such as contributions to the policy formulation processes in OSH, WFCL, etc.

6.3 Efficiency

The rate of implementation and achievement of outcomes has been slow due to unforeseen problems such as discussed. The efficiency of service delivery and achievement of planned outcomes would be enhanced through improved coordination and increased capacity building of national counterparts and social partners. An exercise on Team Building would be helpful as would periodic meetings between the component heads to discuss their experiences with implementation and to identify ways to increase efficient processes. All levels of the organization should work together to improve efficiency of the programme in Ethiopia as this will have ultimate benefits of realizing the planned outcomes and goals of the programme under the ILO's (DWCP) agenda and UN's Framework for development (UNDAF) and Ethiopian Government's Poverty Reduction Acceleration Strategy (PASDEP).

6.4 Adequacy

- i. The work plan was found to be overambitious and with too many activities that cannot be effectively delivered with the low level of capacities of bipartite and some tripartite partners engaged in the delivery process. Therefore the programme should revisit the immediate objectives and activities as designed and determine together with their implementing partners which to prioritise so as to achieve the desired goal of the programme. (An exercise in Outcome Mapping Methodology or another planning tool would be potentially useful for identifying outcomes expected of each partner and the behavioural, relationship, relationship and activity needs and outcomes expected.) Ultimately the focus need not be on the expenditure rate or activity delivery rate, but on the rate of achievement of planned outcomes and impacts of the programme through targeted activities.
- ii. The programme needs to seriously consider the current context with severe capacity, knowledge and skills gaps in government and with social partners of the programme, required to ensure competitiveness of new businesses in the different sectors coupled with the current context of a new government reform programme and severely understaffed units for delivery. The idea of involving another training organization such as Turin or other similar institutions to help deliver training could help to increase the delivery rate of newly identified training needs as well as pre-planned training activities that are prerequisites for successful collaboration and engagement on this programme. Therefore the budget should be reviewed with the idea of reallocating funds resources towards more targeted and specific training by international consultants and institutions. Because training is generally an expensive activity, the budget should be well planned to accommodate the new training requirements and priority.
- iii. The time planned for the DWCP in Ethiopia is three years. However the results of this MTE so far indicate that the programme is less than 25% of the way towards achieving 100% expected delivery in another 1.5 years. This is measured in terms of both budgetary expenditure and service delivery rates. This time being about mid way from the start of the Programme –from date of signing the

agreement between ILO and the Netherlands Government, indicates that the programme is behind schedule. Even with the well intentioned emergency work plan with indications of accelerated delivery from April 2008, it does not seem feasible that the programme will deliver to its full potential within the remaining period. This is partly due to the inclusive and highly participatory approach which helps to ensure ownership and future sustainability of the programme in Ethiopia.

This is the first experience of the Government of Ethiopia to offer counterparts in development Programmes who are tasked with delivery responsibilities at the level of the ILO. Therefore, adequate time and financial and technical resources must be factored in to facilitate learning and capacity building of bipartite partners at all levels to help them work in a concerted effort together.

Alternatively this strategy of a separate PIU within the ministry could be reviewed with the another consideration to integrate the activities of this programme within the Ministries- which will involve additional capacity building for GoE staff and more time for these processes to be concluded Therefore the recommendation of this MTE is for the DWCP in Ethiopia to consider an extension of time for this Programme at no additional cost and by at least 9-12 months until December 2010 or ideally until March 2011 to facilitate capacity building and redesign of the programme and strategy to promote competitiveness, employment creation and poverty reduction in Ethiopia. Also to facilitate planning for a second phase of the programme to enable it to achieve its overarching poverty reduction and creation employment objective.

6.5 Coordination

- i. Since coordination was found to be generally weak at all levels, (macro, micro and meso) the recommendation is that the programme engage in a concerted effort with its partners to harmonize its approach to programme implementation. Outcome Mapping through Intentional Design can be applied so that staff can clarify and refine its vision, mission, partners, outcome challenges, and progress markers measures, priorities for monitoring, evaluation and reporting structures and for development of the M&E Framework.
- ii. Special efforts should be made towards integrating important cross cutting issues into the DWCP in Ethiopia in a targeted, defined way with specific, measurable outcomes in each component. The current strategy of integrating all components and cross cutting issues together in a rather ad hoc manner is not demonstrating much benefit for increasing efficiency and effectiveness of the programme. Therefore the study recommends that each component be accorded some level of autonomy to concentrate on achieving its specific mandate which is already found to be relevant and aligned to ILO's and the government's strategy on accelerating poverty reduction in Ethiopia. However that cross cutting issues be considered by each component and an entry point for specific interventions with specific measurable outcomes be identified and formed as a basis for collaboration and coordination with each component.

6.6 Sustainability and ownership

- i. The ongoing reforms in GoE commonly referred to as ‘business process re-engineering’ requires that capacities be built with national counterparts especially to help them deliver effectively and efficiently on all components of the programme. This will also enable policy development, implementation and enforcement so as to contribute towards achieving the objectives and the ratified agreements by government on OSH, CL, MDGs, and ILS. This capacity is currently low amongst the bipartite and social partners in particular and they being key implementers of the Programme means that the programme should look at ways to offer training to these officials. This would serve a double purpose of capacity building and providing incentives to government staff which will contribute to improving their morale and delivery levels. Other training resources of the ILO including the training centre in Turin should be called upon to help design and deliver relevant training for increased capacity of bipartite and relevant tripartite partners.

6.7 Replicability and Scaling Up

- i. The current successful model TWG in the Cotton and Textiles Component should be replicated to all components so as to lighten the workload for staff and government partners and as a strategy for capacity building and for scaling up and development of synergies necessary for achieving the ambitious objectives of this programme and other ILO interventions in Ethiopia in future.
- ii. Training and capacity building activities need to be replicated and scaled up in earnest to ensure adequate capacity and knowledge of implementation partners for ensuring smooth coordination and service delivery. More training for MSEs is required and should be scaled up to ensure that all members have equal access to information and knowledge that is useful to achieve the desired impacts of the programme. This is especially necessary for the SWM component of the programme
- iii. In order to scale up and replicate the positive outcomes of this programme, it is recommended that plans be developed for a second 3-5 year phase of this programme in Ethiopia. This will help the programme to build on its achievements and to scale up its efforts by each component taking advantage of the foundation, capacities, relationships, momentum and structures built during this first phase of the programme. Planning for a second phase of this programme should be considered early.

Annexes

Annex 1a. Contribution to Bipartite, Social and Tripartite Partners and Constituents: Cotton and Textiles Component³⁶

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Baseline survey/situational assessment conducted in six garment factories, four textile companies and two ginneries selected by the ILO , MoTI for participation in FIP. • Regional Cotton and Textile Value Chain Networking Workshop organized and task force established to facilitate ILO Work Improvement in Neighbourhood Development (WIND) training programme. • A two-day sensitization International Market Requirements and Social compliance Workshop conducted and raised awareness on the tangible benefits which can be exploited by accomplishing the social compliance organized for forty target enterprises and other stakeholders in the cotton and textile sector. • The ILO Decent Work Country Programme Cotton and Textile component in partnership with Ministry Of labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA), and Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU) successfully completed the Gambella regional state capacity building training of trainers (TOT) program on the labour law and collective bargaining. • Garment Companies benchmarked against International Standards for Garment Manufacturing • Three-day sensitization seminar on Social Compliance and International Market Requirements conducted for 40 participants from textile and garment enterprises and other stake holders. • World Responsible Apparel Production (WRAP) certification pre audit conducted in six enterprises. • Introduction and work facilitation meetings held with pre-selected enterprises and WRAP consultants • Terms of reference developed for the implementation of the Corrective Action Plan (CAP) for the target enterprises based on local best practices. • Six day Training of Trainers (TOT) workshop conducted for 20 participants on WIND methodology. A similar training was also conducted for twenty single small scale farmers for three days • Eleven people drawn from six selected textile and garment enterprises and representative of five institutes including the tripartite partners undertook a successful study tour to Vietnam. • Awareness workshop on Labour proclamation Article No.377/2003 conducted with 30 workers/managers of cotton farms ,Ginneries in Gambella, Ababo and Godere mechanized farms • On the job evaluation of eight TOTs of Gambela Peoples’ Regional State successfully completed • The final evaluation report of the IFTGLWTU on the Labour Law training in Gambella Region cotton farms and ginneries including the performance of trained trainers has been submitted • A demand and supply analysis study conducted on the microfinance situation in selected urban and rural areas with special emphasis to cotton and textile and solid waste management sectors. The study identified and proposed measures and recommendations on gaps to be filled in policy and institutional frameworks 	<p>Achievements/Outcomes</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Terms of References (TOR) for developing a competitiveness plan for the cotton and textiles industry developed and final report submitted. • Final evaluation report of the IFTGLWTU on the Labour Law training in Gambella Region cotton farms and ginneries submitted. • The final report of the Gambela Peoples Regional State BOLSA on the National labour law training and collective bargaining submitted <p>Challenges</p> <p><u>Bureaucracy</u> - Facilitating an interview with influential officials was challenging but manageable with the commitment of MOTI.</p> <p><u>Low level of Capacity of MSEs</u>- Difficulty faced by the management of the target enterprises to internalize the CAP and lack of technical capacity for further implementation.</p> <p><u>Poor infrastructure</u>- The enormous challenge of improving current condition of the newly constructed working sheds noticed.</p> <p><u>Delayed Child Labour Baseline delay</u>- Consultant faced challenges on timely collection of questionnaires -impeding the work progress</p>
---	--

³⁶ Highlights of achievements, July-Sep, 2008, p. 3; Jan-Dec 07 Progress Report; Progress report April-June 2008 p.13-15

Annex 1b. Contribution to Bipartite Relations, Social Partners & Tripartite Constituents: Floriculture³⁷

Completed Activities	Achievements /Outcomes and Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) trainings to 10 pilot flower farms and trainers of the Ethiopian Horticulture Producers and Exporters Association (EHPEA). • Promotion of OSH through commemorating the world day for safety and health at national level and the host was the floriculture sector. • Assisted Ethiopian Horticulture Producers and Exporters Association (EHPEA) implementing their code of practice. • A socially labelled marketing study tour to five members of EHPEA to the UK, Germany and The Netherlands. • Training on modern Labour Inspection Systems - Labour inspectors drawn from Ministry Of labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA), all regional Bureau of Labour and Social Affairs (BoLSA), Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU), Ethiopian Employee Federation (EEF) and EHPEA were trained from 14-18 July for 5 full days in Nazareth³⁸. • Training manual on social dialogue: It was during this month that ToR was prepared, contractor selected and agreement signed for this activity. The first draft is already submitted. 	<p>Achievements/Outcomes</p> <p>First draft of the training manual has been submitted</p> <p>Challenges</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consultants have difficulty of adhering to the agreements signed both in terms of time and quality of work. • Since this period is a slow season in Ethiopia, most staff of partner organizations are on leave hence difficult to move forward as much as desired. • There was a severe problem of power outage and internet interruptions in the office and this has seriously affected project performance.

³⁷ Ibid

Annex 1c. Contribution to Bipartite Relations, Social Partners & Tripartite Constituents: SWM³⁹

Completed Activities	Achievements/Outcomes & Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Digital library on SWM, including good practices on IEC for solid waste management is organized for knowledge sharing purpose and knowledge resource for the planned public education in electronic and print media campaigns. • 100 extension workers from all 10 sub city administration in Addis Ababa trained in the Start Your Waste Collection Business (SYWCB) Training Workshop in preparation for 500 waste business plans for trained waste collectors. • Trained 63 Kebele waste collection coordinators in the Start Your Waste Collection Business (SYWCB) Training Program from 90 local administrations in Addis Ababa. • Proposal sent to Addis Ababa City Administration (AACAA) Productivity Improvement Centre & the response returned for additional revision. • 50 waste collectors from two pilot condominium sites were selected for training. • Proposal received from Environmental Development Action in the Third World (ENDA) to train 200 waste collectors, discussion underway to reduce cost. • Bole Sub City Administration provided a plot for constructing a centre for pilot compost demonstration centre for training and marketing. Design and quantity estimate completed. • Proposal sent to AACAA Productivity Improvement Centre & for developing 5,000 OSH pocket books for solid waste workers. Concept paper on developing, institutionalizing Basic OSH Training for Solid Waste Workers prepared and sent to the OSH specialist and the back stoppers • The AACAA Media Agency signed a contract for developing and broadcasting weekly radio magazine program on SWM. Program ready for airing by MTE. • 563 basic OSH equipment was provided to 563 participants as part of the OSH session at the Start Your Waste Collection Business (SYWCB) Training workshops • Baseline survey on the OSH for SW MSEs in Addis Ababa • Study tour to Lusaka undertaken to see best practice in the solid waste sector for duplication in Ethiopia and for Adaptation and translation of ILO's Phase 2- 40 persons - TOT on SYWCB designed, selection criteria developed, agreed with the AACAA MSE Agency 	<p>Achievements/ Outcomes⁴⁰</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A communication strategy for a weekly radio programme on solid waste management was developed. • Based on the strategy the partner Agency signed agreement with the AACAA's Media Agency to produce and broadcast a weekly radio program on solid waste management. • Start Your Waste Collection Training Manuals completed. • A draft IEC strategy on solid waste management was prepared • The project compiled current global knowledge and information on solid waste management and organized the publications under 20 subject headings in a digital library. • Market Survey conducted in Menalesh Terra. "Menalesh Terra" • Translation & adaptation of the SYWCB training manuals into Amharic language⁴¹. • Baseline needs assessment tool developed. • A framework for pilot waste segregation scheme was developed • As a result of the study tour a strategic plan was developed for the City Administration of Addis Ababa following the similar format for Zambia <p>Challenges</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Delay in approval of MOU with MFI hampering service delivery and achievement of outcomes

³⁹ Highlights of achievements, July-Sep, 2008, p. 3; Jan-Dec 07 Progress Report; Progress report April-June 2008 p.13-15

⁴⁰ Ibid

⁴¹ Progress report April-June 2008, p.13

Annex 1d. Contribution to Bipartite Relations, Social Partners and Tripartite Constituents Cross Cutting Issues⁴²

Key: SD=Social Dialogue; CL= Child Labour ILS= International Labour Standards

Completed Activities	Achievements/ Outcomes/Challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SD- Week -long training for about 60 tripartite partners on Ethiopian Labour Law and the Principles of Social Dialogue. • ILS- One week training for about 55 labour inspectors on modern labour inspection systems. • HIV/AIDS: Mainstreaming HIV/AIDS was made with the Start Your Waste Collection Business (SYWCB) Training Program. One session was devoted to HIV/AIDS awareness issues with the specific situation of solid waste workers. • Gender: The project managed to achieve 67.5 percent women participants at the SYWCB Training Program. • CL - A review of the legislative, policy and institutional frameworks of addressing child labour in the three sectors --As part of an awareness creations strategy, quite a number of sensitization materials on child labour (Child Labour Poster, Exercise books, pens, paper Caps, Banners) printed and circulated at the June 12, 2008 World Day against Child Labour Event marked colourfully at the Addis Ababa University <p>-Sensitization activity carried out for Media personnel, on the August Media Round table discussion organized by UNICEF (Media Kit gathered and distributed for journalists) and one- day Orientation Training on Child Labour Reporting for Media Professionals was carried out. A total of 23 professional engaged in mass media production and broadcasting including professional engaged in press took part in the orientation programme</p> <p>-A Draft Concept Note for the development of National Plan of Action (NPA) for elimination of child labour in Ethiopia</p> <p>- Media promotion, distribution of localized promotional materials (500 T-shirts, 500 post cards, 500 book marks), promotion using posters (1000 copies) in two local languages and English, hanging of banners in Addis Ababa and all the way to the farm site, speeches, comedy, poem, songs, traditional horse riding show and visit to flower production green houses and packing areas⁴³.</p>	<p>Achievements/ Outcomes⁴⁴</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Needs reassessment status of cross cutting issues compiled. • Standardized Procedures, Protocols & Guidelines for Preventing & Withdrawing, Rehabilitating & Protecting Children from WFCL for each component developed and available <p>Challenges</p> <p><u>Unreliable power supply</u>- Frequent power outages in the country has significantly affected (40%) the work of both the project staff and external collaborators.</p> <p><u>Low HR capacity</u>- Also, lack of local consultants in some of the specialized areas of the ILO is seen to be a constraint⁴⁵.</p> <p><u>Insecurity</u>- The cotton and Textile component Work Improvement in Neighbourhood Development programme (WIND) training programme for the small scale farmers in Metema region has to be delayed because, of a relocation programme of the target group, due to security reason in the Gonder area with Sudan.</p> <p><u>Government restructuring process</u>- A key challenge for the SWM component -for the Addis Ababa City Administration</p> <p><u>Delayed Baseline Survey</u>- Child Labour interventions are awaiting the results of the baseline survey commissioned early this year</p>

⁴² Highlights of achievements, July-Sep, 2008, Jan-Dec 07 Progress Report; Progress report April-June 2008

⁴³ Progress Report, April-June 08, p. 11

⁴⁴ Jan-Dec 07, Progress Report p.2

⁴⁵ Ibid, P.4

Annex 2 Summary of Main challenges in the Components⁴⁶

Problem	Sector		
	Cotton, textiles and clothing	Floriculture	Solid waste management in Addis Ababa
Low of productivity and competitiveness	X	X	X
Weak management capacity, especially in small enterprises	X		X
Poor working conditions and OSH	X	X	X
Low recognition of rights at work	X	X	X
Weak social dialogue	X	X	X
Worst forms of child labour	X		?
Gender inequality in the work place	X	X	X
HIV/AIDS in the workplace	X	X	X
Weak institutional capacity to address problems	X	X	X

⁴⁶ Ibid, p.15

Annex 3. Summary of MARCO, MESO & MICRO Level Outputs

Level of Operation	Nature of Work	Outputs/Activities
MACRO	NATIONAL: Policy formulation and revision/updating.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child labour policy and plan of action • OSH policy • Institutional and policy support for the textiles sector
	SECTORAL: Policy formulation and revision/updating	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Solid Waste Management Strategy and Policy • Development of Competitiveness Plan for the textiles sector • Sectoral action plans for eliminating the worst forms of child labour
MESO	Institutional Capacity Building	Training in national labour law, international labour standards, OSH, gender equality, Factory Improvement Programme, productivity improvement, communication, information sharing and networking, management, working conditions, social dialogue, association building, labour inspection, rights at work, child labour elimination, and strengthening social partners at the sectoral level.
MICRO	Direct Enterprise Support	Training in OSH, national labour law, international labour standards, gender equality, productivity improvement, communication, information sharing and networking, management, working conditions, social dialogue, association building, labour inspection, and dealing with child labour.

Annex 4. List of Participants and Contributors to the MTE Study

1. **ILO SRO for Eastern Africa in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia** (Round Table Meetings)
 - i. Director
 - ii. Technical Specialists: Employment Intensive Works; OSH; Gender, ILS, SD
 - iii. National Programme Coordinators/ Technical Specialists: SWM,, CL, Cotton and Textiles, Floriculture
2. **Government Departments and Agencies** (Key Informant Interviews)
 - i. National Programme Counterparts, Experts and Trainers in the
 - a. Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (Child Labour Cross Cutting Area and Floriculture component)
 - b. Ministry of Trade and Industry (Cotton and Textiles component)
 - c. General Manager- City Administration of Addis Ababa (Solid Waste Management component)
 - ii. BDS Expert- Regional Micro and Small Enterprise Development Agency
 - iii. Expert- Industrial Relations Department of MoTI
3. **Private Sector Businesses and SMEs** (Round Table Meetings, Observation)
 - i. Chairman- ET -highland Flora
 - ii. Farm manager- ET- highland Flora
 - iii. Cluster Development Member-Geday Sweater Manufacturing in Kolfe Sub City
4. **Farmer/ Producer, Employer, Manufacturer and Professional Association representatives** (Round Table Meetings)
 - i. Training Coordinator- Ethiopian Horticulture Producer Exporter Association,
 - ii. Manager- Ethiopian Textile & Garment Manufacturers Association, (ETGAMA)
 - iii. General Manager- Ethiopian Textile Engineers Association
 - iv. Senior Expert- Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
 - v. Vice President- Addis Ababa Solid Waste Employers Association
 - vi.
5. **Trade and Labour Unions** (Key Informant Interviews)
 - i. Head of Education, Training and International Relations- Industrial Federation of Ethiopian Textile, Leather and Garment Worker Trade Union
 - ii. CETU
 - iii. EEF
6. **Local and International NGOs** (Individual Interviews)
 - iv. Project Coordinator- Environmental Development Action (enda-Ethiopia)
 - v. Project Officer- Women in Self Employment (WISE)
 - vi. Cluster Development Agent- UNIDO
7. **International donors** (Focus Group meeting with TWG)
 - i. Project Manager- USAID/VEGA- Ethiopia- AGOA programme
8. **Training Consultants** (Key Informant Interview)
 - i. Independent training consultant in Solid Waste Management
9. **Technical Working Group members** (Focus Group Discussions)
 - i. Cotton and Textile Component
 - ii. Solid Waste Management component
10. **Project Beneficiaries** (Focus Group Discussion)

- i. Adey Ababa Waste Collectors Group (14 representatives -11 female/3 male members)

Annex 5. Work Plan and Schedule for MTE in Ethiopia

MID TERM EVALUATION FOR THE DWCP

15-31 OCTOBER 2008

Draft Program I

Time	Activity	Responsible / Venue	Remarks
DAYS 1-4: 13-16 October			
	Desk Review in Nairobi	SRO Programme Unit	All the necessary documents for the desk review will be shared with the evaluator.
DAY 5: Friday 17th October 2008			
9:30 – 10:30	Comprehensive briefing of the Programme at the ILO with SRO Director, Focal Points, Program Manager and all National Programme Coordinators (NPCs)	SRO Program Unit ILO Director's Office (Old ECA Building, 6th Floor)	
10:30 -11:15	Meeting with the Child Labour focal person and NPC.	Yaw Ofosu (Focal Person) Urgessa Bedada (Programme Manager) and Alemseged Woldeyohannes (NPC) ILO Office (Old ECA Building, 6th Floor)	
11:30 – 12:15	Meeting with the Cotton and Textile component focal person and NPC.	George Okutho (focal person during the period under review) Jean Ndenzako (current Focal Person) Urgessa Bedada (Programme Manager) and Tewdros Yilma (NPC) ILO Office (Old ECA	

		Building, 6th Floor)	
1:00 - 1:45	Meeting with the Solid Waste Management Component focal person and NPC.	Kwaku Osei-Bonsu (Focal Person), Urgessa Bedada (Programme Manager) Tadesse Gebreselassie (NPC) ILO Office (Old ECA Building, 6th Floor)	
2:00-2:45	Meeting with the Floriculture component focal person and NPC.	Franklin Muchiri (Focal Person) Urgessa Bedada (Programme Manager) and Shumet Chanie (NPC) ILO Office (Old ECA Building, 6th Floor)	
3:00 - 3:45	Meeting with Specialists on Cross cutting issues – Social Dialogue, International Labour Standards, Gender and HIV/AIDS	Rainer Pritzer, Christina Holmgren, Aida Awel and NPCs ILO Office (Old ECA Building, 6th Floor)	
DAYS 6&7: 18-19 October 2008			
	The evaluator will undertake further desk reviews and reflect on individual meetings in preparation for field visits/interviews.		

DAY 8: Monday 20th October 2008

			The Solid Waste Management NPC will be responsible for picking up Ms. Wangati from the Hotel before the first meeting. He will provide transportation for the rest of the day.
10:30-12:30	Meeting with the National Counterpart for the Solid Waste Management Component - Addis Ababa City Administration	Tadesse Gebreselassie (NPC) Venue : Addis Ababa City Administration	
1:30 - 3:30	Meeting with members of the Technical Working Group of the Solid Waste Management Component	Tadesse Gebreselassie (NPC) Venue : Addis Ababa City Administration	

DAY9: Tuesday 21st October 2008

9:30 - 12:30	Field visits and interviews with beneficiaries of the solid waste management component	Tadesse Gebreselassie (NPC) Venue to be determined	Transportation will be provided by the Solid Waste component.
2:00 - 3:30	Meeting with the National Counterpart for the Child Labour Components - Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA)	(Focal Person) Shumet Chanie (NPC) Venue: MoLSA	The Child Labour NPCs will liaise with the Solid Waste Management NPCs and provide transportation for the rest of the day.

DAY10: Wednesday 22nd October 2008

9:00 - 10:30	Meeting with the National Counterpart for the Floriculture - Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA)	Shumet Chanie (Floriculture) NPC) Venue: MoLSA	The Floriculture NPC will be responsible for picking up Ms. Wangati from the Hotel before the
--------------	--	--	---

11:00 – 12:30	Meeting with the Ethiopian Horticulture Producers and Exporters Association (EHPEA)	Shumet Chanie (NPC) Venue EHPEA Office	first meeting. He will provide transportation for the rest of the day.
1:30 – 4:30	Field visits and interviews with beneficiaries of the Floriculture component – Dugda Flower Farm	Shumet Chanie (NPC) Debrezeit	
DAY11: Thursday 23rd October 2008			
10:30-12:30	Meeting with the Technical Working Group of the Cotton and Textile component.	Tewodros Yilma (Cotton and Textile NPC) Urgessa Bedada (Programme Manager) Venue: Ministry of Trade and Industry	The Cotton and Textile NPC will be responsible for picking up Ms. Wangati from the Hotel before the first meeting. He will provide transportation for the rest of the day.
1:30 – 3:00	Meeting with the National Counterpart for the Cotton and Textile component – Ministry of Trade and Industry	Tewodros Yilma (Cotton and Textile NPC) Urgessa Bedada (Programme Manager) Venue: Ministry of Trade and Industry	
DAY12: Friday 24th October 2008			
9:30 – 12:30	Interviews with beneficiaries of the Cotton and Textile component	Tewodros Yilma (Cotton and Textile NPC) Venue to be determined	The Cotton and Textile NPC will be responsible for picking up Ms. Wangati from the Hotel before the first meeting. He will provide transportation for the rest of the day.
DAYS 13&14 : 25th & 26th October 2008			
	The evaluator will review documents, conduct analysis and write up the findings.		

DAY 15 : Monday 27th October 2008			
10:00 – 11:00	Meeting with representatives from the Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Union (CETU) and Ethiopian Employer’s Federation (EEF)	Programme Unit ILO 3rd Floor	Separate meetings were held with each representative.
DAY 16 : Tuesday 28th October 2008			
2:30 – 3:30	Presentation on the preliminary outcomes of the evaluation for the SRO Director, SRO Specialists, all Focal Persons, the Program Manager and the NPCs.	Programme Unit ILO Director’s Office (Old ECA Building, 7th Floor)	The evaluator will present the preliminary findings, ask questions and get clarifications before finalizing the report.
DAY 17 : Wednesday 29th October 2008			
	The evaluator will submit the draft evaluation report to the SRO.		
DAYS 18 and 19 : Thursday 30th and Friday 31st October 2008			
	The ILO will review the draft evaluation report.		
DAY 19 : Monday 3rd November 2008			
	The ILO will send comments and inputs and comments on the draft evaluation report to the evaluator.		
DAYS 20 and 21 : Tuesday 4th and Wednesday 5th November 2008			
	The evaluator will incorporate the comments and inputs from the ILO and submit the final report on Thursday 6 th November 2008.		

Annex 6. List of References for MTE Study

1. International Labour Organization, Decent Work Country Programme for Ethiopia: A case for the Cotton and Textile Sector ILO Intervention and Support: <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/afpro/addisababa/sro/publ/cottoncasestudy.pdf>
2. Ministry of Finance and Economic Development, Ethiopia: Building on Progress. A Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty (PASDEP), (Sep. 2006). Retrieved from Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, <http://www.mofaed.org/>
3. United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) for the period 2007-2011, 2007. http://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/format_liste1_en.php?Chp2=Ethiopia
4. United Nations, Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Data.aspx>
5. ILO House Style Manual, (May 2007).
6. ILO Technical Cooperation Project Document including the Logical Framework Matrix
7. TOR for the Mid Term Evaluation
8. TOR for Situational Analysis on Informal Economy Operators in the Addis Ababa Solid Waste Stream
9. ILO Technical Cooperation Fact Sheet (ILO- Netherlands Annual Review Meeting, (1/9/2008)
10. Highlights of Achievements, July – August, 2008
11. ILO TC RAM 'Poverty Reduction through Decent Work Employment Creation in Ethiopia Progress Report, April - June (2008)
12. ETH/06/50/NET- Poverty Reduction through Employment Creation in Ethiopia Progress Report January – December (2007)
13. Report January – December (2007)
14. Study Tour Report on Solid Waste Management in Lusaka, Zambia ILO Sub Regional Office, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia (June 2008)
15. ILO Decent Work in the Floriculture Sector of Ethiopia National Consultative ILO Sub-Workshop Report for the Regional Office for Eastern Africa and MoLSA's Workshop on Decent Work in the Floriculture Sector of Ethiopia, Addis Ababa Hilton 12/10/2006.
16. Emergency Work plan for April – June 2008
17. ILO/ TC RAM Template
18. Status Report on the Child Labour Component illustrated at Output Level (2008)
19. EHPEA Code of Practice for Sustainable Flower Production
20. Floriculture DW Project Yearly Activity Focus During 2007-2010

Annex 7. TOR for Mid Term Evaluation

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR MID-TERM EVALUATION

Project Title: Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia

TC Code: ETH/06/50M/NET

Responsible administrative unit: ILO Subregional Office in Addis Ababa

I. Introduction and rationale for evaluation

During the planning process of the DWCP Programme being implemented in Ethiopia, an interim mid-term evaluation was planned to be conducted one year after its commencement. The purpose of the mid-term evaluation is to look at the management and operations systems laid down by the programme, assess if the progress is on the right track, identify the challenges faced and make recommendations for the remaining implementation period. The objectives of the mid-term evaluation are:

- Assess progress made on the implementation towards achieving the objectives set out in the project document;
- Identify lessons learnt and good practices of the programme implementation; and
- Recommend adjustments to the implementation plan in order to improve/speed up delivery.

The current interim mid-term evaluation will be conducted from October 13th to 31st 2008 by independent evaluator.

The evaluation will comply with evaluation norms and standards of the ILO and ethical safeguards will be followed. The attached documents on UN Evaluation Norms and Standards and OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standards can be referred for further information.

A final evaluation will be done at the end of implementation period. It will focus on assessing the performance of the project processes such as the outreach, activities, systems, actions and other outputs that needed to be completed in the project period to achieve the set objectives.

II. Background of the Programme

The Programme entitled “**Poverty Reduction through Decent Employment Creation in Ethiopia**” is a project funded by the Netherlands Government with a total budget of US \$3,249,824. This programme is aimed at addressing decent work deficits, promoting productivity and innovation in three priority sectors identified by the tripartite partners in line with the national development strategy. These priority sectors are (a) cotton /textiles, (b) floriculture and (c) solid waste management in the city of Addis Ababa. The DWCP Programme is a culmination of a series of consultations between SRO Addis Ababa and government, social partners, target beneficiaries, researchers and ILO HQ colleagues. Thus, the programme has three components, namely:

- Promoting decent work in the cotton and textiles sector and making it nationally and internationally competitive;

- Enhancing Productivity, Competitiveness and Market Access through Decent Work in the Floriculture Sector of Ethiopia; and
- Employment Creation through Sustainable Solid Waste Management Services in Addis Ababa.

The ultimate beneficiaries of the programme are workers (including child workers), employer, managers and cooperative members in all the three priority sectors. Moreover, the direct beneficiaries of the programme are meso and macro institutions who will receive capacity building support. These include MoLSA, EEF, CETU, Textile and Clothing Association, EHPEA, the Addis Ababa city Administration, line ministries and relevant NGOs.

Women represent the main work force in each of these three sectors, empirical evidence showing that they are disadvantaged vis-à-vis their male counterparts in terms of levels of salary, working conditions, access to facilities, etc. Therefore, particular attention is paid to giving them equal opportunities at all levels of the project in order to promote gender equality.

A National Steering Committee (NSC), chaired by the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MOLSA) and co-chaired by the Ministry of Trade and Industry (MOTI) has been set up to provide overall policy guidance, ensuring that the programme objectives and implementation are in line with the national development objectives. The technical cooperation and implementation of the programme is carried out by three National Programme Coordinators (NPCs) for each component and one NPC working on Child labour issues across all three components. Each NPC reports to the Director ILO SRO Addis Ababa through technical specialists within the SRO designated as technical backstopping focal persons for each component and for child labour. Furthermore, three technical working groups have been established for the cotton and textile, floriculture and solid waste management sectors chaired by the MoTI, MOLSA and EHPEA and the Addis Ababa City Administration (AACA) respectively.

ILO's implementing partners at the sectoral and macro levels are the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA), Ministry of Trade and Industry (MoTI), Ethiopian Horticulture Producers and Exporters Association (EHPEA), Ethiopian Employers Federation (EEF), Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU), and the Sanitation, Beautification and Parks Development Agency of the City Government of Addis Ababa.

The Programme commenced in August 2007 and is currently 13 months into its implementation period. In January 2008 installation of project staff, procurement of office space and office equipment were finalized. In addition, the programme organs became operational and preparatory work began for the actual implementation of major programme activities in 2008 and 2009. Quarterly emergency implementation plans (in line with the original work plan) were developed for the first two quarters of 2008 to obtain maximum delivery rate and achieve the desired objectives. As of August 30th 2008, the delivery rate of the Programme was 36% of the 1.2 million dollars allocated for 2008.

The planned mid-term evaluation will be the first evaluation to be conducted for this programme.

III. Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

Purpose

The purpose of the current interim mid-term evaluation report will be to review the programme design, implementation strategy, and institutional arrangements and monitor the progress of the programme. The evaluation will thoroughly look at progress made under the 8 immediate objectives set and evaluate to what extent the programme is realizing its overarching development objective. The evaluation should also analyze implementation and thematic adjustments made and other monitoring tools employed by the programme.

Consequently, the evaluation should highlight good practices and lessons learnt and make concrete recommendations on how to improve implementation over the next two years of the implementation period. Specifically, the evaluation should make recommendation on boosting delivery rate of the programme in the coming two years. The evaluation should also assess how the programme activities feed into the UN Delivering as One initiative.

The outcomes of the evaluation will be used for three purposes:

- Lessons learnt and good practices will be shared with all ILO staff and relevant stakeholders to be replicate in similar ongoing or future employment related programmes;
- Address challenges faced in implementing the programme;
- Revise/improve the implementation arrangements of the ongoing DWCP programme to achieve the best results and improve delivery rate; and
- The outcomes will also be shared with UN agencies with similar programmes to use in the planning process of similar programmes.

Scope

This mid-term evaluation will look into all activities implemented in the three sectors of the Programme from August 2007 to date. As this is an integrated programme the evaluation should look at the links between the three different components and analyse progress made as a whole.

The evaluation will cover all the sites included in the scope of the programme. Specifically;

- For the floriculture component flower farms purposefully selected by the industry to represent different geographic conditions, form of ownership, size of farms, product type and number of years in operation will be included. These farms are located in close vicinity to Addis Ababa in Sebeta, Holeta, Addis Alem and Debre Zeit.
- Cotton farms, ginneries and traditional weavers will be considered for the cotton and textile component. These enterprises and house hold traditional weavers are located in Addis Ababa Gambella, Arbaminch, Bahir-Dar, Combolcha, Awassa and Nazareth.
- Finally, the geographic scope for the Solid Waste Management component will be limited to waste collection and segregation sites in the Addis Ababa City Administration.

Specific sites for the evaluation will be further worked out with the respective NPCs for each component during the actual planning of the evaluation process.

Clients

The clients of the evaluation and main audiences of the report are:

- Relevant staff members of the ILO SRO Addis Ababa who are involved in the day to day activities of the Programme;
- The DWCP Programme coordinators and technical backstopping specialists who will be able to adapt the strategy of the programme implementation and readjust programme delivery if needed;
- The tripartite constituents, namely MoLSA, EEF and CETU as they are the direct beneficiaries and partners in this programme;
- ILO technical units in Headquarters who will adjust their support to the programme according to the evaluation results and benefit from lessons learnt and good practices; and finally
- The donor who will receive copy of the evaluation and be informed of the programme performance in terms of effectiveness, efficiency, impact, relevance and sustainability.

IV. Key Evaluation Questions / analytical Framework

The evaluator will examine the following key issues for all three components including child labour:

Relevance and strategic fit

- Does the programme address a relevant need and decent work deficit? Was a need analysis carried out at the beginning of project reflecting the various needs of different stakeholders? Are these needs still relevant? Have new, more relevant needs emerged that the project should address?
- Have the stakeholders taken ownership of the project concept and approach since the design phase?
- How does the project align with and support national development plans such as the PASDEP and UNDAF as well as programmes and priorities of the national social partners?

- How does the programme align with and support ILO's strategies (, gender mainstreaming, employment agenda, poverty reduction, youth employment etc.)?
- How well does the programme complement and fit with other ongoing ILO programmes in the country.
- How well does the programme complement and link to activities of other donors at local level? How well does the project fit within the broader local donor context (UN and non-UN, making reference to UNDAF)?

Validity of design

- What was the baseline of the programme for the three components at the beginning of the programme? How was it established? Was a gender analysis carried out?
- Are the planned programme objectives and outcomes relevant and realistic to the situation on the ground? Do they need to be adapted to specific (local, sectoral etc.) needs or conditions?
- Is the intervention logic coherent and realistic? What needs to be adjusted? (refer to the programme log frame)
 - Do outputs causally link to the intended outcomes (immediate objectives) that link to broader impact (development objective)? How plausible are the underlying causal hypothesis?
 - What are the main strategic components of the programme? How do they contribute and logically link to the planned objectives? How well do they link to each other?
 - Who are the partners of the programme? How strategic are partners in terms of mandate, influence, capacities and commitment?
 - What are the main means of action? Are they appropriate and effective to achieve the planned objectives?
 - On which risks and assumptions does the programme logic build? How crucial are they for the success of the programme? How realistic is it that they do or not take place? How far can the programme control them?
- How appropriate and useful are the indicators described in the programme document in assessing the project's progress? Are the targeted indicator values realistic and can they be tracked? If necessary, how should they be modified to be more useful? Are indicators gender-sensitive? Are the means of verification for the indicators appropriate?

Project progress and effectiveness

- Is the programme making sufficient progress towards its planned objectives? Will the programme be likely to achieve its planned objectives upon completion?
- Have the quantity and quality of the outputs produced so far been satisfactory? Do the benefits accrue equally to men and women?
- Are the programme partners using the outputs? Have the outputs been transformed by programme partners into expected outcomes?
- How do the outputs and outcomes contribute to the ILO's mainstreamed strategies?
 - How do they contribute to gender equality?
 - How do they contribute to the strengthening of the social partners and social dialogue?
 - How do they contribute to poverty reduction?
 - How do they contribute to strengthening the influence of labour standards?
- How have stakeholders been involved in programme implementation? How effective has the programme been in establishing national ownership? Is the programme management and the implementation participatory and is this participation contributing towards achievement of the programme objectives? Has the programme been appropriately responsive to political, legal, economic, institutional etc. changes in the programme environment?
- Has the programme produced demonstrated successes?
- In which areas (geographic, sectoral, issue) does the programme have the greatest achievements? Why is this and what have been the supporting factors? How can the programme build on or expand these achievements?
- In which areas does the programme have the least achievements? What have been the constraining factors and why? How can they be overcome?

- What, if any, alternative strategies would have been more effective in achieving its objectives?

Efficiency of resource use

Have resources (funds, human resources, time, expertise etc.) been allocated strategically to achieve outcomes?

- Have resources been used efficiently? Have activities supporting the strategy been cost-effective? In general, do the results achieved justify the costs? Could the same results be attained with fewer resources?
- Have project funds and activities been delivered in a timely manner? If not, what were the bottlenecks encountered?
- What are the financial results of the project? (Look at commitments versus disbursements and projected commitments).

Effectiveness of management arrangements

- Are management capacities adequate?
- Does programme governance facilitate good results and efficient delivery? Is there a clear understanding of roles and responsibilities by all parties involved?
- Does the programme receive adequate political, technical and administrative support from its national partners? Do implementing partners provide for effective programme implementation?
- Do the members of the National Steering Committee and Technical Working Groups have a good grasp of the project strategy? How do they contribute to the success of the project?
- How effective is communication between the programme team, the field office, the regional office, the responsible technical department at headquarters, CODEV and the donor? How effective is communication between the programme team and the national implementing partners?
- Does the programme receive adequate administrative, technical and - if needed - political support from the ILO office in the field, field technical specialists and the responsible technical units in headquarters?
- How effectively does the programme management monitor programme performance and results?
 - Is a monitoring and evaluation system in place and how effective is it?
 - Have appropriate means of verification for tracking progress, performance and achievement of indicator values been defined?
 - Is relevant information and data systematically being collected and collated? Is data disaggregated by sex (and by other relevant characteristics if relevant)?
 - Is information being regularly analysed to feed into management decisions?
- Has cooperation with programme partners been efficient?
- Has relevant gender expertise been sought? Have available gender mainstreaming tools been adapted and utilized?
- Has the programme made strategic use of coordination and collaboration with other ILO programmes and with other donors in the country/region to increase its effectiveness and impact?
- Was the needs assessment in the TC RAM appropriate in its recommendations on professional staffing given the mid course changes in project design and multiple tasks assigned pertaining to UNCT/Decent Work assigned responsibilities? (A simple work load analysis should be done to assess this).

Impact orientation and sustainability

- Can observed changes (in attitudes, capacities, institutions etc.) be causally linked to the programme's interventions?
- In how far is the programme making a significant contribution to broader and longer-term development impact (look at sustainability and local ownership of the programme)? Or how likely is it that it will eventually make one? Is the programme strategy and programme management steering towards impact?

- What are the realistic long-term effects of the programme on the poverty level and decent work conditions of the people?
- Is there a need to scale down the programme (i.e. if the programme duration is shorter than planned)? Can the programme be scaled up during its duration? If so, how do programme objectives and strategies have to be adjusted?
- How effective and realistic is the exit strategy of the programme? Is the programme gradually being handed over to the national partners? Once external funding ends will national institutions and implementing partners be likely to continue the programme or carry forwards its results?
- Are national partners willing and committed to continue with the programme? How effectively has the programme built national ownership?
- Are national partners able to continue with the programme? How effectively has the programme built necessary capacity of people and institutions (of national partners and implementing partners)?
- Has the programme successfully built or strengthened an enabling environment (laws, policies, people's attitudes etc.)?
- Are the programme results, achievements and benefits likely to be durable? Are results anchored in national institutions and can the partners maintain them financially at end of programme?
- Can the programme approach or results be replicated or scaled up by national partners or other actors? Is this likely to happen? What would support their replication and scaling up?
- Can any unintended or unexpected positive or negative effects be observed as a consequence of the programme's interventions? If so, how has the programme strategy been adjusted? Have positive effects been integrated into the programme strategy? Has the strategy been adjusted to minimize negatives effects?
- Should there be a second phase of the programme to consolidate achievements?

Accordingly, the evaluation report should be in line with the DAC Evaluation Quality Standards the following analytical framework is suggested for the final report:

1. Title page (1 page)
2. Table of Contents (1 page)
3. Executive Summary (1 page)
4. Acronyms (1 page)
5. Background and Project Description (1-2 pages)
6. Purpose of Evaluation (1 page)
7. Evaluation Methodology (1 page)
8. Project Status (1 page)
9. Findings, Conclusions, and Recommendations (no more than 15 pages)
This section's content should be organized around the TOR questions, and include the findings, conclusions and recommendations for each of the subject areas to be evaluated.
10. Annexes: including the terms of reference, evaluation work plan and any other relevant documents.

V. Main Outputs of the Evaluation

The evaluator will be expected to deliver:

- Detailed evaluation design/work plan before commencement of the actual evaluation;
- A draft report for the review of concerned ILO SRO staff and relevant stakeholders;
- An evaluation summary according to the ILO's template for summaries of independent evaluation reports;
- A final evaluation report incorporating comments made on the draft report; and
- A compilation of lessons learnt and good practices identified for improving ILO's engagement in decent work promotion.

The quality of the report will be determined by conformance with the quality checklist for evaluation reports.

VI. Methodology

The methodology will combine quantitative and qualitative approaches. The evaluator will collect secondary data from desk review and verify them with primary data from field visits, interviews and workshop. During the process of data gathering the evaluator will compare, validate and cross-validate data of different sources (programme staff, programme partners and beneficiaries) and different methodologies (desk review, site visits and interviews). All Data collected should be sex-disaggregated and different needs of women and men should be considered.

Desk Review

Before conducting field visits, the evaluator will review the programme document, quarterly progress reports, work plans and emergency work plans, mission and workshop reports, baseline surveys, monitoring data, country data and etc.

Individual interviews with ILO staff and field interviews

The evaluator will discuss with the ILO HQ staff of technical units (via e-mails and phone calls) and the field technical specialists and programme staffs that are involved in the management and implementation of the DWCP Programme in Ethiopia. Specific individuals to be consulted include:

- ILO HQ Staff:
- ILO Programme Staff: Mr. Shumet Chanie (Floriculture Component), Mr. Tewodros Yilma (Cotton and Textile component), Mr. Tadesse Gebreselassie (Solid Waste Management) and Mr. Alemseged Woldeyohannes (Child labour in the three components).
- ILO SRO Technical Backstopping Specialists (during the period under review) and the current SRO Director: Mr. George Okutho, Mr. Kwaku Osei-Bonsu, Mr. Joni Musabayana, Mr. Franklin Muchiri, Mr. Yaw Ofori.
- ILO SRO Programming Unit
- The Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs (MoLSA), the Confederation of Ethiopian Trade Unions (CETU), the Ethiopian Employer's Federation (EEF) and other relevant partners, stakeholders and beneficiaries.

Field visits

The discussions and interviews will be complemented with field visits to the actual sites of implementation. Discussion will also be held with relevant organisations involved and/or benefiting from the programme's interventions in those sites in accordance with the evaluator's requests and consistent with the terms of reference.

Debriefing in the field (Stakeholder's workshop)

Based on the above findings, the evaluator will organise a workshop to present and discuss preliminary findings and recommendations with the key national partners and the programme team.

Post-trip debriefing

In addition, the evaluator will debrief the Programme Coordinators, relevant SRO Addis staff and the ILO backstopping units in HQ about the course of the evaluation and the support received.

VII. Management Arrangements, work plan and time frame

The evaluation focal person for the ILO SRO Addis is Brooknut Tecola. The evaluator will thus be able to ask for any support and reports directly to the evaluation focal person of the SRO.

The evaluation will be implemented by one international (or one local) evaluator.

The Regional Office for Africa in Addis Ababa in consultation with EVAL will be involved in the selection process of the evaluator and later provide the necessary guidance on reviewing the draft evaluation report submitted.

A total amount of USD 20,000 has been allotted for the midterm evaluation process. The evaluation will be done in 15 working days from October 13th to 31st 2008.. A detailed work plan specifying each partner's contribution to the evaluation process is attached.

Task	Source of information	Time frame
Desk review of the major documents: programme documents, progress reports, mission reports, work plans, baseline studies, workshop reports, and others	ILO SRO Programming Unit and the DWCP Programme Staff	3 working days
Consultations with the ILO staff of technical units and the field technical specialists who are involved with the management and implementation of the DWCP Programme in Ethiopia.	Consultations will be held through emails and phone calls with relevant departments in HQ.	
The evaluator will be deployed to the various sites in Ethiopia to undertake interview/discussion with ILO programme staff, partners and key stakeholders particularly partners, stakeholders, relevant government units at the national, county and district levels, external collaborating organisations, and selected beneficiaries	The evaluator will first meet with the ILO programme staff and the Programme coordinators will recommend persons to be met among the listed partners, stakeholders and beneficiaries	5 working days
Visits the three components of the ILO programme	The head of each component will accompany the evaluator for a visit to their site and introduce him to the local partners and beneficiaries	3 working days
Focus consultations with ILO programme office	The evaluator will meet again with the ILO programme staff to cross-validate findings of the field visits	
Workshop with the key national partners and the programme team to present and discuss preliminary findings and recommendations	The evaluator together with the ILO programme office will organise the workshop	1 working day
Debriefing on the preliminary findings of the evaluation	The evaluator will debrief the programme manager, the ILO SRO Director and the ILO backstopping unit about the course of the evaluation and the support received	
Delivery of the first evaluation report draft	Based on the workshop results, the evaluator will draft the evaluation report and send it to the evaluation manager who will circulate it to the programme manager, main national partners, ILO SRO Director, HQ technical backstopping unit, field technical specialists, and the donor for comments.	2 working day
Circulation of the draft report for comments	The evaluation manager collects the comments and send them to the evaluator	5 ILO working days
Issue of the final evaluation report	The evaluator incorporates comments as he/she deems it appropriate and submits the final report to the evaluation manager	1 working day

