



Evaluation Summaries

Employment, Vocational Training Opportunities and Migration Policy Measures to Prevent and Reduce Trafficking in Women in Albania, Moldova and Ukraine Phase II

Quick Facts

Countries: Albania, Moldova, Ukraine

Evaluation Type: Final

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

Technical Area: Migration and Trafficking

Evaluation Management: International Labour Organization (ILO) International Migration Programme (MIGRANT) and SRO/BUDAPEST, in coordination with SAP/FL and IPEC and in collaboration with EMP/SKILLS, EMP/SFP, EMP/SEED

Evaluation Team: Emily Hillenbrand, External Evaluator

Project Code: Donor: RER/05/04/IRL

Keywords: human trafficking, vocational training, migration

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

This report is a review of the second phase of the project “Employment, Vocational Training Opportunities, and Migration Policy Measures to Prevent and Reduce Trafficking in Women in Albania, Moldova, and Ukraine,” which is a component of the ILO’s International Migration Programme (ILO/MIGRANT), covering work in the three countries. The project has been implemented in coordination with EMP/SFU, EMP/SKILLS, EMP/SEED, NORMES, and IPEC. The 27-month project

(from 1st January, 2006 through 31st March, 2008) was solely funded by Irish Aid, on a budget of 700,000 euros. The project is coordinated by ILO headquarters in Geneva and the Sub-Regional Office in Budapest. It is administered on a daily basis by a Project Coordinator and Project Assistant in the Albanian, Moldovan, and Ukrainian offices.

The findings are based on a desk study of relevant project documents from each country, followed by a two-day Evaluation Seminar and interviews conducted in Ukraine from March 3 to 7, 2008. The Seminar included presentations by and interviews with the delegations and project staff from the three countries (*see Annex 1*). The project staff in Ukraine also facilitated interviews with additional Ukrainian stakeholders and a one-day site visit to the pilot project in Chernivtsy Oblast in Ukraine.

The study focuses on the project’s relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability, gender-awareness, and knowledge-sharing. The objective measures of the project’s achievements are based on the quantitative indicators provided in the Evaluation Terms of Reference (*see Annex 2*). Open-ended interviews with stakeholders focused on how well the project was tailored to national priorities; the clarity of each party’s responsibilities within the project; the responsiveness of ILO project staff and headquarters; the main achievements of the project in the second phase; and areas for improvement or future work. A questionnaire

Main Findings & Conclusions

was sent to additional key partners in Moldova and Albania, several of whom contributed to the evaluation. However, due to the seminar setting in Kiev, the majority of key informants were involved with the Ukraine project. A more complete picture of the programme's achievements and areas for improvement could be drawn from self-assessments by national project staff and stakeholders. The first draft of the evaluation has been circulated to project teams and ILO headquarters for review.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The logic of the project design reflects the ILO's position on human trafficking as an issue interlinked with irregular migration and internal labour market issues, as well as a gendered human rights violation. The second phase took "mainly a preventive approach, with provision of increased protection and rehabilitation services" (Second Phase Project Proposal, p. 3). By strengthening national capacities to implement gender-sensitive migration policies, and improving access to safe migration channels or decent employment in their own countries, the project aimed to diminish the distress entry of vulnerable individuals into high-risk irregular migration networks.

Consistent with the ILO position that "flexible or free movement of labour within areas of economic integration is essential to ensuring progress towards integration, as well as to accelerating rates of economic development" (www.ILO.org/migrant), the project also sought to build the partners' capacity to negotiate bilateral agreements for legal migration and social protections of migrants with important destination countries. The association and self-regulation of Private Employment Agencies (PEAs) recruiting for external employment was also an important area of work during the second phase.

Principle Conclusion

Overall, the project "Employment, Vocational Training Opportunities and Migration Policy Measures to Prevent and Reduce Trafficking in Women in Albania, Moldova and Ukraine" is well-designed, carefully implemented, and has had impact on multiple levels. This section highlights some of the success factors of the project and suggests a few recommendations for future designs.

Further Conclusions

Participatory Approach and Practical Application of Feedback: The project's "research, test, re-tune, and replicate" approach was used throughout the project. Data was collected where needed, input from partners (including national NGOs and regional partners) was incorporated into the project, and feedback was sought and disseminated. This careful and participatory approach helped ensure that materials and activities were relevant to the beneficiaries and lessons learned were immediately applied.

Qualified Staff and Partners: The achievements of the project are due in no small part to the exceptional motivation of the project staff, who devoted extra-curricular hours and much creative energy to organizing activities, fostering cooperation among partners, and seeking co-funding opportunities. They also selected highly qualified partners to carry out research and direct interventions. Collaborating with other international actors and in some cases helping partners find additional donors for their projects advanced coordinated action in the anti-trafficking policy field.

Identifying Common Interests: The project teams and ILO materials were instrumental in helping partners with fundamentally different constituents recognize their role in addressing irregular migration and human trafficking. Emphasizing the human capital loss due to

migration resonated strongly with employers' organizations and employment centers' representatives, as did trade unions' concerns about membership loss.

Decentralization of Project Design and Financial Management. Involving project staff in the design of the project and decentralizing financial administration to the Sub-Regional Office eliminated many of the administrative problems experienced during the first phase and improved the effectiveness and efficiency of the project.

Continuity of Efforts: Last but not least, the achievements of Phase 2 build on the groundwork laid during the first phase and on continuous provision of pragmatic information and technical support to partners throughout the project. A Moldovan staff member said that the achievement of the project was evident in the 'awakening' of the trade unions:

"In 2004, we asked: Do you see your role in managing migration? They joked that the sole role of trade unions is to decorate Christmas trees...but already in 2006, they saw, 'Our role is significant.' And at this point, we have probably the best possible result—a Plan of Action that they can put in place."

It is hoped that with continued support from the ILO, similar progress can be made on important second-phase initiatives, particularly the work with private employment agencies.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations

Adequate Staffing and Training Support: As noted by several staff members, the project set an ambitious agenda, and staff were at times under strain to complete the activities well. Increasing the number of staff members per country will deepen project impact, avoid human resource turnover, and increase the visibility of the ILO and its effective

approaches. As human capital development is a key theme of work with the target groups, ILO as an institution should also continue to invest in national staff capacity-building, through technical training.

Better Data and Awareness on Migration-Development Trends: The tendency of some key partners to view migration primarily as a problem of human capital loss and demographic decline obstructs the urgent need to provide safer migration channels and experiences. Better data on migration and trafficking patterns, seminars on other countries' experiences with migration management, and studies on the social and economic impacts of migration are still needed, both to overcome such resistance and to develop sounder policies. Partnerships with other research institutions in the region may support data collection needs.

Better Balance Between Direct and Indirect Interaction: While the main focus of the ILO is on national-level policy support, the pilot projects generate important bottom-up developments (at low financial input) that can also stimulate longer-term structural changes. Fully supporting and publicizing this level of intervention; inviting more of the direct beneficiaries to participate in relevant seminars (where appropriate); and extending dialogue with potential or returned migrants can strengthen the link between the lived realities of the beneficiaries and the institutional reforms implemented on their behalf.

Targeted Interaction Among Key Partners in the Three Countries: Given the limited operational budget of the project, it is awkward to recommend additional high-cost activities such as travel visits—particularly when direct interaction with destination countries may be more imperative. However, in developing the next phase, the project should try to identify areas where targeted knowledge-sharing among stakeholders in the three countries could advance each country's objectives.

Prioritize Objectives and Activities or Develop Separate Projects: The Moldovan and Ukrainian experience with the integration of two projects shows that while new objectives were complementary, the shortage of staff and time prevented in-depth coverage of the new components. Given its limited resources and ambitious agenda, the next phase of the project should give careful consideration as to what objectives are most imperative, have the most momentum, and are not covered by other ILO projects or international donors. With ILO's demonstrated commitment to comprehensive solutions and tripartite action, it is safe to assume that developing separate, fully-staffed projects with complementary aims will not diminish the conceptual linkages among the issues, and that trafficking awareness, gender equity, and social protection for all workers will continue to be mainstreamed into activities.