



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation Unit

Growth with decent work for all: A youth employment programme in Antalya, Turkey Final Joint Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: Turkey

Final: Dec 2012

Mode of Evaluation: Independent Joint

Technical Area: Employment ED/EMP/MSU

Evaluation Management: United Nations
MDG Fund – (ILO lead) Partners: IOM, FAO
and UNDP; Consultant: Frank Kavanagh

ILO Project Code: TUR/09/50/UND

Donor: United Nations MDG Fund

Keywords: Youth employment, migration,
Decent Work, employment creation

Budget : US\$3,980,000

IOM: 658,906

UNDP: 1,157,768

FAO: 659,120

ILO: 1,504,206

Taken from the Executive Summary of the MDG Joint Evaluation Report

The UNJP is a Millennium Development Goals Achievement Fund (MDG-F) financed Joint Programme of four UN Agencies (UNDP, ILO, FAO, IOM) in collaboration with ISKUR, the Turkish Employment Agency. Its main aim is the adoption and implementation of employment policies benefiting the most vulnerable groups in the labour market within the context of Turkey's east-west migration.

At the national policy level, the UNJP had the ambition to develop a National Youth Employment Action Plan (NYEAP) which

includes concrete targets and actions to promote women's participation in the labour force (MDG Target 3.2) and to reduce poverty among the most vulnerable in the labour market including recent migrants by adopting decent work targets for the youth (MDG Target 1.B.6). At the local level the UNJP set out to ensure focus on both labour supply and demand through the effective delivery of employment, youth and migration management interventions that benefit the most vulnerable in the labour market and young women while bolstering the dynamics of demand for labour in Antalya (being one of the provinces with the highest rate of inward migration in the country). At the policy level, the primary beneficiaries would be the policy makers, civil society and those responsible for delivery of employment services to youth and women. At operational implementation level in Antalya, the primary beneficiaries of the UNJP were to be the young men and women (age 15-24) who are unemployed, cannot access or benefit from placement services and who do not have the employability skills for joining the formal labour market.

Impacts have been substantial and potentially long lasting. They occurred both on National Institutional and Local Operational levels. The UNJP has encouraged and facilitated good vertical, horizontal and local integration. A high level of ownership by the main players was evident during the evaluation. This was achieved in part by the development of fully representative National Steering and Management Committees and at local level, strong coordination among the relevant players was driven by good local management of the

joint programme by the UNJP coordinator/manager on the ground in Antalya, and by the full engagement of the Provincial Employment and Vocational Training Board (PEVTB) and ISKUR in the implementation of the UNJP.

Progress and Effectiveness

Despite the need to replace the local Antalya-based programme site manager and the change of manager at central level, many of the planned outputs were achieved in a timely manner by the steady addition of activities over the life of the programme. The workplan of the UNJP programmed the ALMPs in the second year. However the scheduling of the Labour Market analysis might have come earlier in the programme and thus the ALMPs to meet the labour demand could have started earlier. The target to deliver employability training and skills to 1200 unemployed has been met. This consisted of the delivery of 36 VET courses to unemployed young people designed by the ILO, FAO and IOM in collaboration with ISKUR. A new approach to entrepreneurship training for young people was also piloted. The FAO delivered some innovative training to women working in the agricultural sector that will contribute to both the local economy and the provision of decent work for women and migrants. The IOM launched an innovative Basic Life Skills two-day training module to a large group of migrant workers through a cascaded delivery. More than 1200 young people benefited from the Basic Life Skills training to date. The employment needs of People with Disabilities (PWD) were addressed to a certain extent and a number of approaches were taken to reach PWD such as sms and telephone calls. However methods to reach this target group need to be improved and developed.

The high level of stakeholder engagement in the UNJP at local and national levels was notable, as was the development of clustering initiatives in yacht building, cut flowers and health tourism sectors. Indeed the clustering investment by UNJP has produced high dividends for the local economy and has attracted major funding from the Ministry of the Economy.

Efficiency of Resource use

The UNJP management and governance structures were efficient and effective and were operationalised through the National Steering and Programme Management Committees (NSC and PMC), the programme implementation group composed of the UN focal points, active management and operational delivery by ISKUR and the key role of the site manager. The PMC executed its advisory and guidance role very effectively. Monitoring and evaluation frameworks operated in an efficient and effective manner. There was however room for improvement in the tracking of the delivery and targeting of the ALMPs. But having said that, the placement outcomes from the ALMPs are good at 59%. Women were more represented than men on the VET programmes which is a significant improvement on the representation of women on ISKUR VET programmes nationally where 41% of participants were female in 2011. Targeting of vulnerable disadvantaged jobseekers locally was good but it would have been preferable to have more focus on the lower educated cohort, as 57% of trainees had secondary level education and 26% had primary level. 15% were of degree level.

This issue of targeting is underlined by a recent note from the World Bank which indicates that “about 74% of ISKUR trainees (nationally) have at least secondary education, being significantly better educated than even the working 20-34 year olds in the population (let alone the jobless). This is a reflection of both the demand for such courses and their supply, as many of these courses are designed for people with medium levels of education, and training providers tend to select individuals with higher levels of education. And yet 52% of the working age population (15-64) in Turkey has less than basic education (lower secondary education), accounting for 64% of the jobless and 65% of informal workers. Even among 20-34 year olds, the proportion with less than high school is 57%, accounting for 53% of the jobless and 54% of the informal in that age group”

Impacts and sustainability

Impacts have been substantial at both national and local levels through the efforts of the four UN Agencies, Employers, Trade Unions and

ISKUR. Government employment policy has been significantly influenced by the NYEAP, the development of which was led by the ILO². This is one of the most significant highlights of the project and has the potential to impact positively on the employment prospects of 12 million young people. Locally the PEVTB and ISKUR are working in a more efficient and collaborative way. The mainstreaming of decent agricultural work by the FAO means that ISKUR are now engaged in this area for the first time. The ALMPs have impacted significantly on the employment prospects of 1200 young people, many of whom are disadvantaged and from the migrant cohort. Many of the outputs have high sustainability potential and a task force has been established by the UNJP to ensure that sustainability and an efficient hand-over of the programme's successful outcomes and the durability of impacts.

Conclusions and Lessons Learned

The UNJP set out to support the adoption and implementation of employment policies benefiting the most vulnerable groups (young people and women from migrant families) in the labour market within the context of Turkey's east-west migration. It is clear that the UNJP has gone a long way towards achieving this aim.

The achievements at National and Local levels as set out in this evaluation are impressive. The project has provided a firm basis for achievement of Millennium Development Goals 1 and 3 in Turkey and in particular the position of women in the workforce and the provision of decent work for youth. The range and scope of both national and local outputs and the potential payback in terms of economic and policy development and individual placement into decent work for the target groups are impressive and potentially self-sustaining. The adoption of the NYEAP by Government is an outstanding achievement. There are now opportunities for scaling up of activities piloted in Antalya such as sectoral and rural development studies, the professionally designed and executed labour market surveys and skills analysis and migration studies in the labour market context. ISKUR now has an extensive toolkit, which can be further developed and replicated nationally. Job counsellors trained under the UNJP can act as

the local agents to sustain the lessons learned from their engagement with the UNJP. On a local level particularly, significant opportunities created by the UNJP are in the area of the sectoral development projects which have successfully leveraged very substantial public financing for the sectors, such as the yacht building and seed processing.

The initial placement outcome from the ALMPs (59%) is good. This indicates that the alignment of the ALMPs to labour market needs was very good. This was guided by the labour market survey conducted under the project by the ILO. A pilot 3-stage entrepreneurship-training course targeted vulnerable disadvantaged groups including women and PWD. The total number of PWD participants (7 out of 46) who attended the course exceeded the target set prior to the launch of the course. The type of ALMPs might also have been varied to provide new pilot initiatives designed to engage directly with more very vulnerable disadvantaged jobseekers rather than using mainstream VET courses already available through ISKUR. However a new Basic Life Skills module inserted into the ALMPs was specifically designed to address some of their needs. It would also have been useful to allocate more of the budget towards initiating such new pilot initiatives for highly vulnerable disadvantaged jobseekers early on in the programme.

The addition of the IOM Basic Life-Skills modules to VET courses was commendable, innovative and worthy of replication on a wide scale in western Turkey in particular, which has a high level of inward internal migration. The development of a web-enabled animation of a Rights at Work Handbook by the ILO is also worthy of note and ISKUR is committed to introducing it to all VET beneficiaries during the first day of VET Courses and intend to integrate it in ISKUR's website.

Recommendations

1. The UN Multi-Agency delivery model of the UNJP should be promulgated within the UN as a best practice example of how the MDGs can be achieved. The Sustainability and Exit

Strategy Task Force should also be sustained and resourced for 12 months after the programme end in order to consolidate the significant successful impacts and outcomes from the UNJP.

2. A more structured tracking of outcomes using a combination of robust database tracking and the commissioning of a follow-up survey of ALMP participant outcomes will improve the measurement of the UNJP impacts. A follow-up survey has been already commissioned by the ILO in cooperation with ISKUR and its findings will be incorporated into a report, which will be completed by mid-December 2012. The report will have a concrete set of recommendations for ISKUR management to mainstream such follow-up surveys in ISKUR's operations.

3. The programme provided a suite of training to new job counsellors³ but there is also a need to professionalise the work of PES staff to bring them more in line with the skills sets available to professional employment counsellors. More detail on this recommendation is set out in section 9 further on in this report.

4. The introduction of a more scientific system of client profiling in ISKUR is recommended. This would allow for more accurate identification of the target groups. Suggestions in this regard are included in Appendix 3 attached.

5. Earlier engagement (in the first year of the programme) with individual jobseekers through the initial identification of skills and worker shortages in Antalya would have been preferable despite the fact that the original programme document envisaged this in the second year. A more individualised engagement with disadvantaged jobseekers is recommended though measurement of individual competency deficits of individuals related to those skills shortages identified in the economy. The recent recruitment of a significant number of new job counsellors will facilitate this approach.

6. Sectoral clustering studies and activities have proven to be one of the most cost-effective aspects of the programme and the model should be extended to other Provinces.

7. The IOM Basic Life Skills for Migrant workers training course has proven to be a huge success and should be available to all ISKUR jobseekers and ALMP participants in high migrant- receiving Regions. Such an initiative not only supports the migrant workers' inclusion in the labour market, but also encourages them to integrate in urban living

8. A People with Disabilities (PWD) awareness programme and training should be provided for all ISKUR staff with a view to increasing the placement rate for PWDs.

9. Finally, FAO/ISKUR pilot initiatives to formalise work and provide certification to rural agricultural workers are to be commended and are worthy of widespread replication. Health and Safety are central to providing decent work in all occupations but are particularly important in agricultural work. This needs to be reinforced in the cut-flower and seed sectors which were supported by the FAO/UNJP.