



Evaluation Summaries

Project of Support to the National Time Bound Programme on the Worst Forms of Child Labour in Pakistan

Quick Facts

Countries: Pakistan

Date of Evaluation: February¹ & December 2007

Mode of Evaluation: Independent - Mid Term

Technical Area: Child Labour

Evaluation Management: -IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section

Evaluation Team: Dr. Christopher Hermann (Team Leader) and Ms. Samia Raoof Ali

Project Start: October 2003

Project End: September 30, 2008

Project Code: PAK/03/P50/USA

Donor: United States Department of Labor (US\$ 4,008,360)

Keywords: Child Labour

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

In 2001, the Government of Pakistan ratified the ILO Convention 182 and requested technical assistance from the ILO's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) to assist the Government in fulfilling its international commitment under the Convention.

In 2002, a National TBP preparatory phase was designed to undertake four broad tasks: (i) Consultations; (ii) Baseline Surveys and Rapid Assessments; (iii) Policy Review; and (iv) Capacity Building and Awareness Raising of Social Partners.

It was identified that the IPEC's Project of Support to the National TBP (the project) would support the implementation of the National Plan of Action/National TBP by 2 major components: 1. Strengthening the enabling environment supporting the elimination of the worst forms of child labour. 2. Targeted, direct interventions to tackle the worst forms of child labour.

Under Component 1, there are 6 immediate objectives and 14 outputs. Under Component 2 there are 2 immediate objectives and 9 outputs.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The mid-term evaluation was conducted to serve as a **learning tool** for the project management team. The purpose of the mid-term evaluation was to review the ongoing progress and performance of the project (extent to which immediate objectives have been achieved and outputs delivered), to examine the likelihood of the project achieving its objectives and to examine the delivery of the project inputs/activities and an investigation on nature and magnitude of constraints, the factors affecting project implementation and an analysis of factors contributing to the project's success. The mid-term evaluation should provide all stakeholders with the information on the possible need to revise work plans, strategies, objectives, partnership arrangements and resources. It should identify the potential impact on policy and

¹ The evaluation field visits first took place in February 2007, as the team leader was unable to complete the report a new mission was fielded in December 2007 to complete the evaluation.

strategies and suggest a possible way forward for the future. Furthermore, it was to draw lessons from experience gained during the period, and how these lessons can be applied in programming future activities within the framework of the existing support project to the National Policy and Plan of Action and the National TBP, for other existing or planned ILO/IPEC interventions as well as in broader terms of action against child labor in the Pakistan

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation process included a comprehensive desk review of various documents. Detailed discussions were held with the Director of the ILO Islamabad Office, and the project management. The evaluation team also held numerous meetings and consultations with government officials (federal, provincial, and district), workers and employers representatives, as well as other project partners and stakeholders, including direct beneficiaries. The evaluation team visited Rawalpindi, Hyderabad, Sialkot, Karachi, Quetta, Lahore and Islamabad to review project interventions. Two stakeholder workshops were conducted to discuss and consolidate initial findings of the evaluation.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The evaluation found that the initial breakthrough has been made and partnerships have been established with the implementing partners and target district governments. The preliminary requirements have been met with. The linkages between the implementing partners and local officials and other relevant partners have been set up and support has been provided by the local officials. Moreover, the target communities have been sensitized and mobilized on the issues of WFCL. Achievements on the ground are visible. It is anticipated that these linkages will strengthen and sustain the PoS activities but only to a limited level.

The implementing partners are committed to the issue of addressing the worst forms of child labour. However, institutional capacity and resources are required to further strengthen their capacity on a long term basis. Although, the partner government officials

have been sensitized and trained on the issue this process also needs to involve lobbying with the elected representatives at all levels, from union councils to the national level.

Realistically, ensuring the sustainability of activities under the present circumstances falls on the government. Sensitization and awareness raising has been successful but it has to be taken further to address the issue of elimination of WFCL as a whole. This is the initial stage of a long process and requires continuity of support. At least, such support should continue until the level of sufficient consciousness and adequate financial resources can be provided. Such a collective campaign will mainstream the issue into the relevant policies and help achieve the overall objectives to eliminate WFCL from Pakistan.

At the federal level discussions held with the officials of Ministry of Labour reflect commitments to take forth the issue of WFCL. Political commitment needs to be sought at all levels and forums need to be built to lobby for the issue. At present and for some future time government's commitment to address the issue of WFCL would need further international support. At this stage despite the impressive and effective achievements of the PoS it would be too early to advise that Pakistan can address the issue entirely on its own without any international financial and technical assistance. In this regard, ILO is strategically placed both in terms of knowledge and experience, to provide necessary technical assistance to the government of Pakistan to eliminate WFCL from Pakistan.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Short Term Recommendations for the remaining period of PoS

1. The National TBP on WFCL must be developed to ensure sustainability of interventions both at policy and district levels.
2. The PoS should roll-out its education policy level initiatives and provide some technical level assistance to the Ministry's policy formulation efforts. Moreover, PoS must jointly with the Ministry of Education promote the

- District Education Plan to scale it up in other districts.
3. Ensure that national level data collection instruments are child labour sensitive.
 4. The PoS must document the “District Model”, comprising of tool-kit of its various components to eliminate the WFCL, and disseminate it both nationally and internationally for knowledge sharing. Document the community mobilization strategies adopted by implementing agencies in different target districts to capture the cultural change
 5. Given the limited time left, PoS at least must carry out robust policy level advocacy with government’s social safety nets, Pakistan *Baitul Maal* and *Zakat*, to highlight the need to built flexibility into policies and programme of *PBM* and *Zakat* to rehabilitate children in the WFCL and their families.
 6. Provide necessary technical support to the Ministry of Labour to periodically convene National Steering Committee meetings to develop synergies among on-going child labour programmes run by ILO, other donors and the Government of Pakistan.
 7. Establish a strong linkage and supervision of the four provincial governments with their respective PoS TBP target district governments to sustain the “**District Model**” interventions.
 8. Establish linkages of the CLMS with the respective provincial governments and finally with the federal government.
 9. Promote and show-case the “**District Model**” at the provincial and federal levels for replication. National TBP on WFCL must fund the PoS developed district model at least in four districts – one each in the four provinces. Funds are already available with Ministry of Labour for child labour education. PoS must facilitate this process to get this process to move forward and get sustainable action.
 10. Jointly with federal and provincial governments, PoS must support the target district governments in sharing good practices and success stories of the “**District Model**” with other district governments to generate a demonstration effect. It is important that the factors responsible for the good practice of the district model be highlighted for replication.
 11. The PoS must get the District Education Plan (DEP), being developed with the target district governments, recognized by the provincial education departments and particularly by the Ministry of Education.
 12. The PoS should further augment its Occupational Safety and Health interventions, and develop model workplaces in the three target sectors of glass bangles, tanneries, and surgical, as planned in the project document.
 13. Engage target sector employers’ and workers’ organizations at a more substantial level. The PoS must involve workers and employers organizations more intimately during the remaining period of the project.
 14. Further build the technical capacity of target district government officials, through trainings and exposure visits, to address the issue of WFCL.
 15. The PoS experiences in each of six target districts, including case studies, must be documented for knowledge sharing and for future interventions.
 16. Video documentary focusing each target district should be developed and launched at federal, provincial and district levels. These video documentaries should also be aired by involving public and private electronic media.
 17. Carry out a case study focusing on the linkages between the impact of micro

credit on the target poor households in terms of withdrawal and prevention of their children from WFCL.

Long Term Recommendations

18. Reinforcement of political commitment at all levels.
19. Formation of a National Body to address WFCL/CL in Pakistan and stronger role of National Steering Committee (NSC) of the Ministry of Labour.
20. Continued strengthening of District Model, through capacity building of district government (both elected representatives and government officials) to effectively address WFCL concerns.
21. Special allocations to the government of international financial resources to address WFCL in Pakistan. This should be independent of investment being made in the national education sector, as the latter fails to reach out to the marginalized groups of WFCL families.
22. Future WFCL interventions must also target mothers through literacy and health assistance.
23. Promotion of research on child labour:
 - National Child Labour Survey
 - National Data base – with district level desegregation