



Evaluation Unit (EVAL)

- **Project Title: Women's Employment Concerns and Working Conditions in Pakistan (WEC-PK)**
- **TC/SYMBOL: PAK/05/MO1/CAN**
- **Type of Evaluation : Independent Evaluation (Final)**
- **Country(ies) : Pakistan**
- **Date of the evaluation: March –April 2010**
- **Evaluation Manager: Margaret Reade Rounds**
- **Administrative Office: ILO Office for Pakistan**
- **Technical Backstopping Office: ILO Pakistan**
- **Evaluator(s): Mahjabeen Qazi**
- **Date project ends: March 2010**
- **Donor: country (budget US\$): Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) US\$ 2.6 million**
- **Key Words: Decent employment for women, Supportive Environment, advocacy, skills.**
- **Evaluation Budget: US \$ 9,700.00**

Quick Facts

Programme Title	Women's Employment Concerns and working conditions in Pakistan (WEC-PK)
Project Number	PAK/05/M01/CAN
Project Budget Code	M.27006342880
Financing Agency	Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA)
Type of Evaluation	Independent Evaluation (Final)
Geographical Coverage	Pakistan (Islamabad/Rawalpindi; Karachi; Lahore; Quetta; Peshawar; Faisalabad; Chitral and Gilgit)
Project start date	May 2005
Project end date	March 2010
Other partners	Ministry of Labour and Manpower; Ministry of Women Development; Employers, Workers, Civil Society Organizations and academia
Date of Evaluation	March-April 2010
Total Project Funds of Financing Agency	US\$ 2.6 million

Table of Contents

S#		Page #
i.	Acronyms	4
ii.	Executive summary	5
1	Project Background	10
2	Purpose and scope of evaluation	14
3	Methodology	15
4	Overview of Project implementation	17
5	Main findings	22
5.1	Component 1	22
5.2	Component 2	23
5.3	Component 3	25
5.4	Component 4	26
6	Overall project assessment	27
7	Lessons Learnt	29
8	Recommendations	31
9	Conclusion	36
 Annexes		
i.	Terms of Reference	35
ii.	Meetings Schedule for Final Evaluation of WEC-PK project	41

Acronyms

BBSYDP	Benazir Shaheed Youth Development Programme
CDA	Capital Development Authority
CDC	Career Development Centre
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CSA	Civil Services Academy
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
DoL	Department of Labour
DWCP	Decent Country Work Programme
DWE	Directorate of Workers Education
EFP	Employers Federation of Pakistan
FMFB	First Microfinance Bank
FSA	Foreign Services Academy
GRAP	Gender Reform Action Plan
HBWs	Home Based Workers
HRD	Human Resource Development
HNP	HomeNet Pakistan
ILO	International Labour Organization
IP	Implementing Partner
ITC	International Training Center
ILS	International Labour Standards
LMIA	Labour Market Information and Analysis
MINTEX	Ministry of Textile Industry
MoL M	Ministry of Labour and Manpower
MoWD	Ministry of Women Development
MTE	Medium Term Evaluation
MTM	Masood Textile Mills
NCSW	National Commission on the Status of Women
NGO	Non- Government Organization
NIPA	National Institute of Public Administration
NPC	National Project Coordinator
NSC	National Steering Committee
PCHR	Parliamentarians Commission for Human Rights
PWF	Pakistan Workers Federation
SRSP	Sarhad Rural Support Programme
STI	Secretarial Training Institute
TNA	Training Need Assessment
TREE	Training for Rural Economic Empowerment
TU	Trade union
WEC	Women's employment concerns
WEC-PK	Women's Employment Concerns and Working Conditions
WWF	Workers Welfare Fund

Executive summary

The women in Pakistan have fairly low literacy levels, restricted mobility and lack of access to training and other productive resources, together with “disabling” factors which include: lack of effective institutional structures; weak institutional capacity for providing more and decent jobs for women; lack of effective implementation of labour legislation; lack of adequate and appropriate legislation to cover the informal sector, which includes a considerable number of women; and need for more and better jobs. These factors have obstructed women’s employment. To address these issues and to improve the working conditions for women through decent employment, the ILO in collaboration with the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) developed a national project on “Women’s Employment Concerns and Working Conditions (WEC-PK)”. The following are the major goals of the project:

- I. Creation of a supportive environment through institutional strengthening of relevant ministries and other social partners
- II. Provision of direct assistance to women to secure decent employment

To achieve these goals, the programme has four interrelated components:

Component 1: Creating a supportive environment for working women

Component 2: Direct assistance to women in accessing decent employment

Component 3: Promoting gender equality in private sector employment in Pakistan

Component 4: Promoting women’s participation and leadership in trade unions in Pakistan

The project carried out a Mid Term Evaluation (MTE) during Dec 2007 and Jan 2008. The MTE findings clearly reflected that the project succeeded in achieving its objectives to build institutional capacity, creating awareness, developing a knowledge and skill base, and providing direct assistance to women to secure decent living. However, the challenges identified by the MTE included lack of cohesion among project components; lack of sustainability, weak follow-up mechanism; limited focus on informal economy, and the lack of a clear roadmap for sustainability amongst other findings.

At the completion of the project, final evaluation study has been undertaken with the purpose to draw lessons from experience gained during the project period and how these lessons could be applied in programming future activities. In order to achieve evaluation purpose, discussions were carried out with 12 implementing partners including project team and the donor CIDA.

The review of project implementation reveals that it has achieved planned targets under four components while achievements in training are higher than the planned targets. Following are the main findings under each component.

Component 1:

- The ILO team has made continuous efforts to keep MOL involved and informed of all project activities. These efforts have developed greater ownership within MOL for the project objectives.
- The project has substantially contributed to the development of useful training and resource materials. These have become a regular part of training programmes of various government institutes which will have long term policy and programmatic impacts.
- The project has succeeded in legislating bills on prevention of harassment at work in the Parliament and social protection of home-based workers in the National Assembly

Component 2:

- The selected partners provided sufficient grounds for implementing pilot projects and achieving targets in an efficient manner. Moreover, broad range of partners provided geographical and sectoral spread to the project.
- The broad based focus of the project has at times compromised programme effectiveness as partners were allocated with limited resources (time and financial resources). This limitation at times resulted in partners compromising on planning, monitoring, follow up to ensure sustainability of sub- projects.
- The experience and partnership with Ministry of Textile Industry (MinTex) is one of the successful models where skills training provided to women were responsive to the market demand.

Component 3:

- Sensitizing private sector on gender issues at work place and formulation of gender equality policy is a major achievement of the project as around 60 companies against the project target of 20 endorsed the gender policy.
- The complete adoption of policy within companies is a gradual process and premature to assess tangible impact.
- The objectives of WEC-PK fits well into EFP mandate. The project focused on two main ILO's conventions C.100 and C.111 which fit into the mandate of EFP. Therefore, promotion of gender equality in private sector is part of EFP own mandate which is being implemented with the help of ILO.

Component 4:

- As an outcome of the capacity building initiatives with women workers and office bearers in trade unions, they have better awareness level, improved negotiation skill, and better confidence level which has lead them to demand for equal rights and wages at their work places. This has also contributed to strengthened women committees at regional level.
- Men have started recognizing the role of women in trade unions which is mainly credited to the gender sensitization sessions conducted with both men and women.
- The project has been implemented in close consultation with PWF which has contributed to its capacity building in policy formulation, planning, implementation, monitoring. This has built the Institutional capacity of PWF towards achieving project objectives.

Overall project assessment

- The project has long term strategic objectives however; it has achieved number of strategic steps which contributes to the overall objectives.
- The project has remained focused on its strategic features and its elements. However, the project extension provided it with the opportunity to consolidate its activities.
- The project focus on gender issues and employment concerns is particularly relevant in social, legal, policy development and economic situation of the country. The project approach has been effective and efficient in terms of making partnership with relevant stakeholders and working with existing government institutions.
- The project has published useful resource material and trained number of resource persons. The gender policy and its guidelines will further help ILO constituents to work towards promoting gender equality at work place in a systematic manner. These provide substantial grounds for project sustainability.

Lessons learnt

1. The project has made a lot of efforts to build institutional capacity of Ministry of Labour and Manpower (MoL). However, there is still implementation level gap in capacities to take forward project objectives on their own and translate policies into implementation.
2. The project objectives focus on the enhanced capacities of both MOL and Ministry of Women Development (MOWD), however, there is gap in partnership levels between both ministries.

3. There is need for bringing coordination among all components under a strategic implementation plan. All the concerned stakeholders need to be placed in their relevant role and allocate them responsibilities that will complement and supplement each other. However at the same time, ILO constituents and IPs also need to take proactive role in this regard.
4. Focused partnerships under components 2 with longer duration and more input support (technical, time and financial) will help achieve deeper impact.
5. Market and demand based training in skills ensures better employment opportunities in formal sector contributing to the project objectives.
6. Consultative process and sensitization of stakeholders adopted under the project has shown good results in terms of creating better awareness level on the issues and developing ownership towards the project objectives.
7. The EFP recommended that the adoption of gender policies should remain voluntary as a legally binding and strict monitoring system may create resistance.
8. Strengthened women unions and networks provide women with strong foundations to further improve their roles in trade unions and PWF.

Recommendations

1. The long term strategic objectives of WEC-PK should be considered under a programmatic approach as it is difficult to achieve long term strategic objective in a time bound project.
2. In order to further build the implementation level capacities of MoL and MoWD, steps need to be taken with a different strategic approach which will help sustain the activities begun in the project.
3. There is still need for continued and increased sensitization on women and employment related issues at various levels and stakeholders.
4. There is continued need to influence policy and advocate for greater awareness on better working conditions for women.
5. In order to ensure continuation of training programmes in government institutions, master trainers in the faculty of these institutions should be trained to reduce dependency on ILO.

6. Focus should be on filling in the gap in the demand and supply of skilled labour in the market. The experience with Mintex based on this principle is a successful model which should be replicated on a larger scale.
7. To further achieve better and sustainable results, cohesion among various project components and constituents should have been brought through a proper strategic and inter linked approach rather than individual and one time efforts.
8. Greater focus on enhancing professional skills of women working at the middle management level would contribute to breaking the glass ceiling.
9. Assessment studies of the three components and constituents of ILO would contribute to the planning of upcoming projects.
10. Individual unions and federation should develop implementation plans in the light of gender policy. The identified activities should be allocated with budgets to ensure their effective implementation.
11. To bring women at the higher tiers of leadership in trade unions, it is important to provide strategic guidance to PWF to focus on capacity building and ensuring active involvement of women in unions at provincial and district levels.

Project Background

The women in Pakistan have fairly low literacy levels, restricted mobility and lack of access to training and other productive resources, together with “disabling” factors which include: lack of effective institutional structures; weak institutional capacity for providing more and decent jobs for women; lack of effective implementation of labour legislation; lack of adequate and appropriate legislation to cover the informal sector with considerable women; and need for more and better jobs. These factors have obstructed women’s employment. To address these issues and to improve the working conditions for women through decent employment, the International Labor Office (ILO), in collaboration with the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), developed a national project on “Women’s Employment Concerns and Working Conditions (WEC-PK)”.

This programme aimed at enhancing the quantity and quality of women's employment in Pakistan while reflecting the results of review and consultative processes that actually started before the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing (1995). It was framed within the context of important on-going and larger planning and policy formulation and implementation exercises in Pakistan. Amongst the major goals of the project are:

i. Creation of a supportive environment through institutional strengthening of relevant ministries and other social partners

Such a conducive environment will depend on: (a) gender-sensitive and responsive attitudes on the part of all the social partners as well as the women themselves and their families; and (b) capacity building and institutional strengthening of the relevant Ministries and key social actors as to generate an appreciation on the importance of enhancing the quantity and quality of employment for women; provide conceptual knowledge and practical know how in formulating effective policies and programmes; and facilitate them in effective enforcement of existing policies and regulations for women economic empowerment. Improved industrial relations will also contribute to more equal opportunities and treatment for women and men.

ii. Provision of direct assistance to women to secure decent employment –

Decent employment shall provide a reasonable standard of living and ensure basic security in adversity and old age. For women, this would also mean their basic human rights are respected and that they work in safe and healthy conditions. Moreover, decent employment shall lead to true empowerment of women and improved wellbeing of their families, especially their children. Direct assistance to create more and better jobs for women should focus especially on viable and sustainable economic activities. Linkages of skill and vocational training with the job

market, both in formal and informal employment need to be strengthened to enhance women's economic empowerment.

To achieve these goals, the Programme has four interrelated components:

Component 1: Creating Supportive Environment for working women

Component 2: Direct Assistance to Women in getting Decent Employment

Component 3: Promoting Gender Equality in private Sector Employment in Pakistan

Component 4: Promoting Women's participation and leadership in trade unions in Pakistan

The **strategic features of WEC-PK Project** are:

- i) Use of an **integrated approach** in order to ensure effective coordination for implementation of four distinct but interlinked components. This approach facilitates the forging of synergies between ILO constituents and other partners, sharing experiences, lessons learnt and good practices and maximizing the use of available resources to sustain impacts and outcomes.
- ii) **Striking a balance between direct assistance for promoting decent employment and institution building through capacity enhancement and policy development. The two elements are complementary. Direct assistance offers immediate benefits to** the neediest women and their families, and at the same time demonstrates effective and practical policies that can be replicated. Policy and institutional-level interventions help create a conducive environment for the promotion of employment and women workers' rights. The 'know-how' and 'show how' in promoting women's employment shall be emphasized in each of the four programme components to ensure impacts at all levels and increase the likelihood of sustainability.
- iii) **Adoption of two-pronged strategy of gender mainstreaming and women-specific action.** The combination of capacity building and policy development with direct or targeted action is, in fact, the two-pronged strategy that the Beijing Platform of Action enjoins governments to adopt. Given the persistent direct and indirect discrimination against women, it is essential that gender concerns are mainstreamed in all policies and programmes. The Programme therefore aims to enhance the capacity of policy makers, planners and implementers to enable them to formulate gender sensitive and responsive policies. As supportive attitudes are vital to gender mainstreaming, the programme focus would include awareness raising and sensitization. On the other hand,

given women's serious disadvantages in getting access to employment and productive resources, direct assistance and support to generate employment and income shall be provided to them.

- iv) Establishment of a **coordination mechanism** within the programme. Tripartism (including the traditional social partners and NGOs) will be strengthened through the Programme's emphasis on social dialogue and working with a wide range of stakeholders. A Programme Advisory Committee (PAC) will be set up in which the interests of the different social actors in women's empowerment will converge.
- v) Creation of **practical linkages with other programmes and activities of the ILO, multilateral and bilateral initiatives** and its constituents in Pakistan, to take advantage of synergies, avoid overlaps and optimise available resources and expertise.
- vi) Forging of **operational linkages with NGOs**, in particular under component No.2 on direct action, for creating decent employment for women. For specific activities, the most effective way of providing direct assistance may be through those NGOs in Pakistan which have well-established contacts and networks, tested strategies and sound expertise acquired from long experience and demonstrated successes.
- vii) **Coordination of arrangements for research, documentation and advocacy.** Since action research, awareness raising, training and advocacy will be relevant to all the programme components, ILO will coordinate joint or shared activities of these components to facilitate exchange of information, experiences and lessons learnt.
- viii) **Creating a Supportive Environment for Decent Employment through Capacity Building.** Direct action efforts to provide decent employment for women cannot be sustainable unless the policy, institutional and social frameworks are supportive. The programme strategy, therefore, is to help create such frameworks through capacity building for gender mainstreaming and the promotion of social dialogue and partnerships to be pursued under Component 1 (capacity enhancement of MOL and MoWD), Component 3 (promotion of gender equality in the private sector) and Component 4 (promotion of women's participation in trade unions). To this end, these components shall focus on:
 - i) awareness raising and sensitization on gender equality:* It has been widely recognized that a major constraint is the persistence of traditional attitudes and prejudices concerning the role of women and a lack of awareness of equality and women's issues;
 - ii) training on fundamental principles and rights at work:* While Pakistan has ratified the important conventions, the challenge is to enhance the capacity of policy makers and implementers to translate the conventions into effective national laws and practice;

(iii) technical support: To assist the main social partners to design and implement gender-sensitive and responsive policies and programs. Such support could also be extended for improving the collection of sex-disaggregated statistics;

(iv) advocacy: To provide convincing arguments and evidence to the social partners that women's empowerment through decent employment and adequate representation in decision making at all levels is "both the right thing and the smart thing to do"

(v) strengthening of institutional structures and networks: unless women are adequately represented (quantitatively and qualitatively) and have a voice in decision-making at all levels, women's issues tend to be ignored or neglected. The current low levels of women's participation in various unions means that they need to have their own institutional structures where they can feel confident to pursue their interests and needs. They also need support networks of likeminded groups for sharing experiences and information. The opportunity offered by the local bodies (increased women's representation and the representation of workers/labourers) will be used.

Decent Country Work Programme

The project WEC-PK was conceptualized and implemented under the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) which had been established as the main vehicle for delivery of ILO support to countries. DWCPs have two basic objectives. They promote decent work as a key component of national development strategies. At the same time they organize ILO knowledge, instruments, advocacy and cooperation at the service of tripartite constituents in a results-based framework to advance the Decent Work Agenda within the fields of comparative advantage of the Organization. DWCP Pakistan has been signed by the three constituents. In line with the DWCP priorities, ILO office develops outcomes for the biennium. Project responds to the priorities identified in the Pakistan Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) and contributes to the outcomes for Programme.

PAK101: Promotion of International Labour Standards relating to Equal Wages and Elimination of all forms of discrimination at work place focusing on C.100, C.111, C.156 and C.177.

PAK 803: Increased capacities of employers' and workers' Organizations to participate effectively in the development of social and labour policy.

Project management arrangement:

The project has been implemented under the overall supervision of the Director of the ILO office in Islamabad, backstopped by GENDER Bureau at HQ level. The RO specialists (on labour standards, gender, skills/employment, social security, employers' and workers' activities) have fully been involved with providing technical support on designing and planning project activities. The International Training Center (ITC) Turin has developed special programmes on gender and ILS, and is a key collaborating unit of the project.

The project has been managed by a National Project Coordinator (NPC) based in Islamabad, supported by two project officers and support staff. A Technical Backstopping Officer (from the ILO Area Office) has also been designated to the project. Regular events have been held for implementing partners and collaborating agencies to promote sharing of experiences and lessons learnt. Policy guidance, inter-governmental and inter-agency coordination, monitoring, mainstreaming and up scaling of initiatives have been achieved through National Steering Committee headed by Federal Secretary MoL. The project has specific collaborative arrangements with other external partners including National NGOs and other social partners.

1. Purpose and scope of evaluation

At the completion of the project WEC-PK, a final evaluation study has been undertaken with the purpose to draw lessons from experience gained during the project period (with particular focus on progress made after the Mid-Term Evaluation (MTE) and how these lessons of MTE could be applied in programming future activities. The main objective of the evaluation study are summarized below

- i) Identify emerging potential good practices.
- ii) Assess the efforts made by the project to address the issues and reduce the gaps identified in MTE.
- iii) Develop a set of recommendations that could be used in shaping the strategy for new project on Gender Equality.
- iv) Identify the potential impact on policy and strategies and suggest a possible way forward for the future.

The WEC-PK concept is relatively new and intended to evolve as lessons are learned and adapted to changing circumstances. The identification of specific issues and lessons learned for broader application for the WEC-PK concept, as a whole, remained a particular supplementary feature of this evaluation.

The evaluation assessed the project as a whole and addressed issues of project design, implementation, lessons learned, replicability and recommendations for future programme design. However, the incorporation of recommendations of MTE into the project remained the main focus of evaluation.

The evaluation study is carried out by an independent external consultant Ms. Mahjabeen Qazi while Margaret Reade Rounds was the Evaluation Manager from the ILO country office-Pakistan.

2. Methodology

The final evaluation of WEC-PK project was carried out during March and April 2010. The evaluation process was guided by the terms of reference developed for the evaluation and discussions carried out with the project team and evaluation manager at the ILO Office, throughout the evaluation process. The final evaluation further looked into the four main factors including effectiveness, efficiency, relevance and sustainability. Moreover, the UN evaluation norms, standards, ethics and safeguards were discussed with the project team and have been followed during the evaluation process. However, the main focus for evaluation has remained on assessing project response to the MTE's recommendations and to the identification of major lessons learnt and recommendations that would feed into the upcoming project(s) for ILO technical assistance. In order to carry out the evaluation study, a two pronged approach was adopted;

- Discussion on study ToRs and expectations from the evaluation report.
- Desk review of pertinent project documents to develop checklist for evaluation
- Visits and discussions with concerned stakeholders including project staff, project partners, beneficiaries and donor organization.

The consultant met with 12 implementing partners of four project components for the final evaluation including project team and donor CIDA (details given in annex 2). Since 100 percent coverage of all partners and geographical areas was not possible under the scope of the study, therefore a careful selection of partners was made on the basis of their mandate with the project. Four main factors were taken into consideration while making the selection;

- i. Partners interviewed by MTE team to assess the progress made after MTE
- ii. Geographical spread (where security allowed) to cover all parts of the country and project areas
- iii. Coverage of four project components
- iv. Partnerships with average to promising results

Study limitation:

The consultant could not travel and meet with all project partners and stakeholder due to time constraint and prevailing security situation at the country level in general and some specific areas in particular. These areas included Balochistan province as whole. The consultant met with some implementing partners in Khyber Pukhtonkhwa however, field visit and meeting with project beneficiaries could not be held. However, the responses and impressions from the project beneficiaries collected in Karachi in Punjab province were used to deduce main findings of the evaluation study.

Despite constraints, the consultant managed to meet with key representatives of the tripartite project partners including MOL, EFP and TUs. In addition, meetings were held with major partners from the civil society organizations.

Structure of the Report:

The following report is based on the discussion analysis with all the concerned implementing partners. The report reflects upon the project progress made in the light of MTE findings. In this regard, a summary of MTE recommendations is given below for reference before detail discussion on the evaluation of the project is carried out. Furthermore, the report elaborates on progress and major findings under each of the project component. The next section identifies new sets of lessons learnt, while the last section provides recommendations for future programmes.

Summary of MTE findings and recommendations

The MTE was carried out during December 07 to January 08. The MTE findings clearly reflect that the project succeeded in achieving its objectives to build institutional capacity, create awareness, develop a knowledge and skill base, and provide direct assistance to women to secure a decent living. In addition, MTE acknowledged that that project offered flexibility which helped in accommodating diversity in partnerships and actions. The MTE also identified some challenges which included a lack of cohesion among project components; lack of sustainability, weak follow-up mechanisms; limited focus on the informal economy, and the lack of a clear roadmap for sustainability.

Following is the summary of the recommendations made by the MTE;

1. There needs to be more active involvement by the lead Ministries in projects such as this, even if it means intensive handholding. A situation such as this invariably leads to a double-

edged sword. Active involvement often means greater control over resources, especially in the case of government partners. On the other hand, limited involvement, as has been the case here, means little or no ownership, which defeats the purpose of creating institutional mechanisms. One of the ways of combating such a situation is to increase the role of the NSC in decision-making and monitoring. The Ministry must also be made responsible for certain outputs itself such as briefings, progress reports and participation in monitoring missions to increase its ownership of the projects concept and processes. Until Ministries themselves have an implementation strategy that can be linked with policy, it will be difficult to assess the policy impact of project activities.

2. The projects should avoid supplementary or one-off inputs that may dilute overall impact.

3. ILO's primary contribution under projects such as WEC-PK should be to Influence policy and advocate for greater awareness on better working conditions for women, as opposed to providing hands-on opportunities for women to gain access to employment. Such "action" oriented (direct assistance) components must be avoided as part of pilot initiatives that also aim at policy level work, unless they form the bulk of the programme. Otherwise, the pilot should be linked with refinement/development of models, in addition to documenting learning for future programming.

4. For future intentions, it may be more relevant if the project is designed in a way that there are sector specific initiatives such as the agricultural sector, women in the informal sector, or the industrial sector, etc. Each of these sectors have their own set of issues surrounding women in the workplace and activities could be geared to address these issues e.g. equal wages, welfare and benefits, sexual harassment policy, mobility, etc. This can create a replicable and scalable model for each sector. Such an approach could be more consolidated and focused and would be able to generate greater policy impact.

5. The project has another 8 to 9 months left before its final completion. It is recommended that this time be spent in consolidating the key lessons emerging from each component, to be able to come to some sort of policy analysis of the interventions that are required in order to address the concerns of working women on a broader level. This could also perhaps be done by commissioning a set of research briefs that highlight the major issues such as minimum wages, lack of appropriate sex dis-aggregated statistics, lack of welfare and benefit packages to women in the informal sector, etc.

6. This time should also be used to bring together all the different partners and generate experience sharing so as to discern which could and has been the most valuable component for future expansion. The project must consolidate and derive lessons learned from its various components through experience sharing exercises and more refined documentation. Partners must be kept abreast of each other's developments so as to encourage internal linkages and

partners such as government and NGOs must not be allowed to work in isolation with one another. This can be achieved through stronger and more integrated coordination mechanism built into project design.

Overview of project implementation and progress

The following section gives a brief overview of the implementation and progress made under each component.

Outcome 1: Enhanced capacity of key policy makers, planners and implementers to formulate and implement and monitor effective policies and programmes for women

Immediate Objective 1

Creating Supportive Environment for working women through Capacity enhancement of the (Ministry of Labour and Manpower (MoL) and Ministry of Women Development (MoWD) to promote decent employment and women workers' rights

Ministries of Labour and Manpower (MOL) and Women Development (MOWD) are the main partners of WEC-PK under this component. In addition, the project also involved other related government functionaries in the process who could contribute to the project objectives. In this regard the project focused on capacity enhancement of policy makers, planners and implementers thus enabling them to formulate gender sensitive and responsive policies and programmes. In this regard, the project trained 267 Parliamentarians and more than 700 senior government officials on gender issues in the work place and related ILS at Civil Services Academy (CSA) National Institute of Public Administration (NIPA), Foreign Services Academy (FSA), Police Academy and Secretarial Training Institute (STI). Around 150 Public Officials have been sensitized on gender issues in the work place and related ILS at PMI. Technical support extended to Directorate of Workers Educated (DWE) during their regular training courses focusing on Gender issues; equality at work and related ILS for the protecting the rights of women workers, subject of women employment concerns (WEC) have been integrated into their regular training and research. The project supported the national women machineries through training of 72 officials (National Commission on Status of Women & GRAP, Punjab) in "Gender Audit" skills by a team of Gender Bureau, ILO HQ, and training of 10 Managers of Career Development Centers in 5 universities in Punjab in Standard Operating Procedures, Gender Reform Action Plan, Punjab; A total of 10 key officials representing ILO's constituents have been awarded fellowships to attend training on Gender issues and ILS at International Training Center, TURIN and they are offering their expertise as resource persons during national seminars and review of policies/programmes.

The project has an embedded function to provide technical support to review and analyze the current policy and legal framework related with women's employment in Pakistan; and bringing recommendations for improvements. Initiatives included: Gender Audit of Workers Welfare Fund (WWF), a study of child care problems of working women, needs assessment for establishing Day Care Centres was carried out in four provinces and shared with MoL and DoLs; architecture design, Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for running standard day care, and PC-1 developed and shared with Capital Development Authority. Using legal expertise the project drafted a Bill on the Prevention of Harassment in the Workplace drafted and tabled in Parliament which was un-opposed and forwarded to the relevant standing committee. In partnership with Action Aid Pakistan, a Bill on Social Protection of Home-based Workers was presented in the National Assembly and was un-opposed, was forwarded to the Parliamentary Committee of Labour for review. National policy for home-based workers developed in collaboration with HomeNet Pakistan (HNP) to recognize and protect the labour rights of home based workers and was handed over to MoL for further action. With the technical support of legal expert, the existing National Labour Laws have been reviewed and analyzed in conformity with ILS ratified by Government of Pakistan. Report has been shared with MoL, and under review. A facts-based documentary was prepared which highlights the transport problems of working women while commuting to work place, and in response the MoL constituted a Task Force to have consultations with relevant stakeholders and come up with feasible recommendations to be integrated into the National Transport Policy. Research Grants were extended to 35 students in seven universities to conduct primary research on issues encountered by working women in Pakistan; a compendium has been produced consolidating all research reports. The project also extended support to Benazir Shaheed Youth Development Programme (BBSYDP) for conducting a tracer study to track the progress of trained graduates (batch one) in getting employment.

Outcome 2. Women in rural and urban are empowered and have improved access to skills, leading to employment opportunities

Immediate Objective 2

Providing direct assistance to women in getting self/wage employment thus improving the welfare of families

This component aimed at skills enhancement of women by piloting different models. This component was designed to provide direct assistance to rural and urban women in getting access to decent employment through viable skills training programmes. Linkages of skill and vocational training with the job market, both in formal and informal employment were strengthened to enhance women's economic empowerment. The project successfully achieved the target of providing access to training of 6,000 women in various skills under the component. The target was increased from initially planned target of training 3000 women in various skills in light of recommendation made by National Steering Committee (NSC). This

component particularly focused on the strategic feature of striking balance between the direct assistance and capacity building at the policy level. The project partnered with 15 civil society organizations and Ministry of Textile Industry (MINTEX) and trained more than 6,000 women (including home-based workers) in employable and entrepreneurship skills in rural and urban across Pakistan.

The training was offered in a variety of disciplines including: teachers and health workers training; basic computer skills; office management/front office management cum telephone operator; marble mosaic; hospitality and hotel management; communication skills; tailoring and embroidery; communications and marketing strategy; beautician; Winta Wool Product; and Tie & Dye; food preservation; poultry farming; mushroom cultivation; livestock and shed management; date processing and developing small enterprises etc. Exhibitions and job fairs were organized to provide post training services including market linkages and access to employment opportunities. Around 460 women trained to meet the demands of skilled workers in Garment industries in Karachi, Lahore and Faisalabad in collaboration with MINTEX. Training disciplines include: industrial stitching, pattern cutting, quality control and assurance and merchandizing. More than 90 per cent of the trained women obtained employment in industrial units after completing training. The project also initiated two programmes in Mardan to capitalize and revive the skills of women internally displaced persons (IDPs) for income generation through providing them basic equipment, raw material, tools, along with 1 to 2 day refresher training to match with the market demand. However, as the Government abruptly announced the return of IDPs to their areas of origin, the planned programme did not materialize. Therefore, the programmes continued with slight modified methodology in Haripur and Mardan. Around 548 women in Mardan were trained in various skills and were linked with nearby markets. Around 300 skilled women were targeted in Haripur through group formation and market linkages were developed for income generation. A group of 60 women were trained in communication and marketing strategy in Kror Pakka, near Multan (Punjab) in collaboration with DEVCOM. Based on the reporting from IPs, around half of trained women engaged in gainful employment (self and wage employment). Training modules have been developed in Business Development Services; Standard Operating Procedures for Women Facilitation center; Communication Skills; Livestock shed management; Dates preservation and packaging; and embroidery.

The project has been able to collect a wealth of experience and lessons learnt under the component through piloting different models. However, in order to do so, the project went through a cumbersome procurement process and as a result the project was left with limited time to implement the training program.

Outcome 3. Enhanced commitment of private sector employers to promote gender equality

Immediate Objective 3

Promoting Gender Equality in Private Sector Employment in Pakistan

Employers Federation of Pakistan (EFP) was the main implementing partner of the WEC-PK under the component. The formal partnership of EFP with the project is since 2005 which continued till project completion. This component worked to convince the employers to promote gender equality and women's empowerment as the social responsibility as well as smart thing to do in business. In collaboration with EFP a number of programmes have been completed which aimed at promoting gender equality within private sector organizations in Pakistan. Two studies were commissioned and reports produced to develop knowledge base which may steer towards improving policies and strategies: i) "State of women employees in industries/ private organizations" through 1,000 interviews from 85 sampled organizations in four provinces;

ii) Research Study on compiling "Gender Equality in Private Sector: Showcasing Good Practices in Pakistan" pertaining to the implementation of GE/women friendly policies. The resulting report is being utilized as an advocacy tool. For the sensitization and capacity building of employers and management a series of training programmes organized in 7 cities across Pakistan on "Breaking the Glass Ceiling: Women in Management" has created a pool of 411 Women executives with effective leadership and management skills to break invisible barriers to their career development. A series of Interactive Advocacy Workshops on Gender Equality policy were also organized in 7 cities across the country where 255 Human Resource Managers (151 men and 104 women) have been sensitized on advantages of gender equality at work place. Using the study results Gender Equality Policies and Guidelines were designed for private sector organizations. As a result of advocacy workshops, around 60 organizations have adopted the GE policy and are piloting it on voluntary basis, whilst EFP is responsible for the monitoring of implementation process.

Outcome 4. Enhanced participation and leadership capacities of women in Trade Unions

Immediate Objective 4

Promoting Women's participation and Leadership in Trade Unions in Pakistan

Women's low membership of Trade Unions (TU), and their low representation in union decision-making structures poses a persistent challenge which is acknowledged by most unions. The situation would improve if all workers are brought under the umbrella of industrial relations and laws. This would result in increased harmony and cooperation between employers and workers. In Pakistan, women both in rural and urban contexts are disadvantaged and organizing them is a real challenge on account of their restricted mobility. The workers who are not covered by the industrial laws have no legal framework available that can resolve their grievances. The implementation of actions to achieve more sex-balanced representation in unions and their top decision-making structures is therefore the most critical.

In view of this project activities were designed in collaboration with Pakistan Workers Federation (PWF) which has the largest membership of workers in Pakistan and therefore the main partners of the project under the component. The PWF worked with the objective to promote women's participation and leadership role in trade unions of Pakistan. The following programmes have been accomplished in partnership with the project.

The programme mainly focused on educating and training women on benefits of being member of unions, labour rights, gender equality, trade union management and effective leadership. A good knowledge base has been developed through research studies on "women's participation in trade unions in Pakistan" based on 500 interviews in Punjab and a "Training Needs Assessment (TNA) Report" for leadership Programme for women TU leaders and office bearers". The project has developed advocacy material on gender issues in employment. In order to sensitize and build the capacity of women and men in TU, a series of workshops was organized in six regions and in total 228 men and women in trade unions and union councilors have been trained in: conceptual framework of Gender in the context of Pakistan; realization of gender issues in the world of work; role of trade unions to address the women's needs and problems; related national laws and ILS; International Convention (CEDAW) relating to rights of women workers; and combating Sexual harassment at work place. A report of this initiative has been produced and disseminated.

To enable women to participate in leadership positions in trade unions, a comprehensive training package was designed on advanced leadership, targeting women TU leaders and office bearers and was successfully completed in 6 regions across Pakistan, whereby cohort of 160 women were trained in six subjects on leadership. A comprehensive Tool Kit of "Training module on Advanced Leadership Training Programme" was developed which was further used by Master trainers who replicated the training and trained 90 women workers in six regions. Catering the demands of women in trade unions, a training programme on Basic Computer Skills was organized for women workers in 7 regions across Pakistan, so far 92 women have benefited from the training programme, which includes basics of the following software applications: MS Word, Excel, Powerpoint, In page and email. As an outcome of the leadership training programme, Women Committees have been set up in 8 regions, which are organizing women workers; raising awareness on labour rights and related ILS, therefore, enabling them to raise their concerns collectively. The women committees jointly organized a national conference in Lahore on March 30, 2009 to mark the achievements of the project which was attended by more than 250 women and men from various regions of Pakistan. The project also initiated institutional policy measures to enhance women's participation in trade unions and gender equality policies/strategies were developed and are being piloted in 20 trade unions. PWF is responsible to monitor the progress on implementation of GE policy.

3. Main findings

Component 1: Creating Supportive Environment for working women

Main findings

Intensive involvement of MOL for greater ownership: The project has done intensive handholding of MOL and has made continuous efforts to keep MOL informed and involved in all project activities through consultative process, sharing monthly progress report, ensuring their presence in major training programmes and conferences at provincial and regional level with other project partners; and involving them in monitoring of project activities. These efforts have developed greater ownership within MOL for the project objectives. In this regard their active role in holding National Steering Committee meetings demonstrates their ownership of the project. Furthermore, the project has been able to generate interest within MOL to continue with their efforts for the project objectives in close collaboration with the ILO in future.

Awareness raising and sensitization on gender and employment concerns: The capacity building activities with the MOL has created awareness at an encouraging level in the ministry and staff have been sensitized on these issues. The project has sensitized key stakeholders and tapped most relevant actors in employment sector that has resulted in greater awareness on gender issues in the workplace and the need for affirmative action to address the raised concerns. As result of sensitization efforts, MOL has declared their HRD department as gender wing to provide functional and technical support to gender related activities to the ministry. Moreover, the overall efforts have lead to generate greater political will that resulted into approval of women protection bill.

Legislation on women issues: The project has succeeded in legislating some of the issues concerning women through the legislative assembly. Some of the most important achievements include drafting and presenting Bills on i) prevention of harassment at work in the Parliament which remained un-opposed and was forwarded to relevant standing committee ii) social protection of home-based workers in the National Assembly which was forwarded un-opposed to Parliamentarian committee of Labour for review.

Integration of training into regular courses will have long term impact; The project has substantially contributed to the development of useful training and resource materials. The response from government partners in terms of its endorsement and adoption has been positive as the Directorate of Workers Education (DWE) and National Training Bureau (NTB) of MOL are conducting training programmes on women's concerns as part of their regular training courses. In addition, the contents on the subject have been integrated in the training courses of all state functionaries especially at Civil Services Academy (CSA). It is expected that the

sensitization of bureaucrats on the subject will be especially effective in the implementation of policies and policy formulation in form of providing technical backstopping to the relevant ministries.

Initiation of trial based-unplanned activities; the project undertook number of unplanned activities as to raise general awareness on women’s employment concerns on as many forums as possible. One such effort was to gear universities towards policy oriented research by engaging them in related research studies in all four provinces of the country. The initial result of this activity was good however; universities could not continue the research process on their own resources after the project support ended. Moreover, MTE identified need for higher level policy research than through the universities. Nevertheless, experience with universities is one of the few un-planned initiatives undertaken by the project. The project did not continue with such un-planned activities in the light of MTE recommendation.

Component 2: Direct Assistance to Women in getting Decent Employment

Main Findings

Identification of partners that provided sufficient grounds for implementing pilot projects, helped achieve the targets in an efficient manner; The partners selected under the component for the project were already engaged with activities which were somehow linked with the WEC-PK e.g. skill training, activities related to self employment and enterprise orientation. Therefore, it was easier for partners to initiate pilot activities quickly at the field level and therefore were able to achieve their targets in short span of ten months only. The training programs linked with employment opportunities also gave encouraging results; as per estimate, around 50 percent of trained women have been employed.

Broad range of partnership has provided geographical and sectoral spread. The project was able to cover all provinces and major districts of the each province. In addition, wide range of sectors was covered and activities were undertaken by these partners including training in hospitality, agriculture and garment-making and to home based workers.

Broad based focus of the project at times compromised the effectiveness. During the initial stages of component 2, the ILO’s successful TREE approach was shared with all IPs. The ILO’s existing training material on “Start your Business” was shared with First Microfinance Bank, which was tailored in lines with the local needs and a comprehensive training manual, handbook and registers were developed. Quality of Training was ensured through regular technical backstopping, monitoring, and compiling reports, training material. The project shared related ILS with IPs as to integrate these into training programmes. However, very few partners could add value to their programme through partnership with ILO.

The main reason identified by partners in this regard was limited resources (time and financial) due to which they had to compromise on the qualitative side of the project including planning,

monitoring, follow up and thus ensuring sustainability e.g. some partners had to compromise on quality of market surveys and went into skill enhancement training for which the market was already saturated. At times training sessions were squeezed while majority partners did not have time to monitor and do follow ups with beneficiaries to provide required support or to assess the sustainability of activities. e.g. the project duration allowed Lead Pakistan to establish 'employment facilitation centers' but did not have the time and resources to follow up on the centers or to strengthen them. Moreover, the projects were implemented in rush that partners did not get the opportunity to internalize the concept of the project.

Demand based trainings in skills, a successful model. The experience and partnership with MinTex is one such example of the pilot models where training in skills to women was responsive to the market demand. Under the project 460 women were trained in employable skills to cater for the demands of the garment industry at training institutes and five industrial units in Faisalabad. Since training was conducted in response to the needs identified by the employers, the majority of trained women were immediately employed by the industrial units. The model also proved to be successful as the project targeted the direct beneficiary of the activity i.e. MinTex. The experiences and lessons learnt of the component 2 have been documented through an assessment study conducted for component 2.

External factors influenced project impact; A number of external factors were beyond the project scope and of the implementing partners, however they impacted on the success and sustainability of the project. The major issues highlighted by project partners and beneficiaries are as follows:

- Market is mainly dominated by men and women are not easily accepted or taken seriously.
- Lack of ethical practices in market as there are no formal agreements made with workers in informal sector.
- Women have weak bargaining skills which are mainly due to lack of exposure to the outside world/market and lack of self confidence.
- The prevailing social and cultural environment also prevents women from working outside of the home. Women are dependent on the support of their male family members to work outside their homes. This hampers their movement from the informal to the formal sector or sometimes they have to give up on their well established economic activity due to changed perceptions of men in their families.
- The growing security concerns in the country have affected the project in general and women in particular. This was particularly experienced in Khyber Pukhtoonkhwa (KP) as

many women lost employment due to growing insecurity and threats against working women.

Component 3: Promoting Gender Equality in private Sector Employment in Pakistan

Main findings

Sensitizing private sector on gender issues at work place and formulation of gender equality policy is a major achievement of the project. The true implementation of the policy may take some time or may need some additional efforts. However, giving private sector the direction towards gender issues at workplace is a big achievement in itself. In addition, the number of female staff at EFP management level has increased by 100 per cent, from 2 to 4.

The gender policy has been well received by the member companies of EFP. Around 60 companies against the project target of 20 endorsed the gender policy. However, the number is expected to increase over time as more companies are showing interest in the policy.

The response on gender equality policy is positive by both national and international companies. It is argued that most of the international companies are already conscious of the issue and therefore readily accepted the gender policy. However, this is not only true for international companies only as national companies have also shown positive response. As per rough estimate around 60 percent companies endorsing the policy are national.

The complete adoption of policy within companies is a gradual process. It is premature to assess tangible impact of gender policy within the companies at this stage. However, some changes have been already noticed in policy endorsing companies e.g. i) vacancy advertisements highlight 'equal opportunity Company' ii) two private companies including Attock Refineries in Attock and Interloop (socks manufacturing) in Faisalabad have established child day care centers for their employees after endorsing the gender policy .

Response on Capacity building interventions remained positive; Although it is premature to assess tangible impact of the capacity building training which will be visible only in coming years, some successes have been achieved through these trainings e.g. the Vice Chancellor of Baluchistan University has shown interest in including contents of *breaking the glass ceiling* in the university courses.

Sustainability and institutionalization within EFP: The sustainability and institutionalization on women employment concerns was one of the emerging issues highlighted by MTE. However, EFP argues that though it is a private sector; profit oriented organization, the objectives of WEC-PK fits well into EFP mandate, which is promoting gender equality as an issue of human rights and as corporate social responsibility. Therefore, promotion of gender equality in private sector is part of its own mandate which is being implemented with the help of ILO. A lot of resource material has been developed in the form of baseline survey, good practices on

implementing gender equality policies and practices in Pakistan; training manuals, and gender policy and a pool of master trainers has been created.

All these will stay with the EFP and they can utilize all this on regular and need basis. Thus institutionalization and sustainability of project objectives within EFP does not appear to be an issue.

Component 4: Promoting Women's participation and leadership in trade unions in Pakistan

Main findings

The women representative of trade unions identified positive impact of capacity building training events conducted with them in terms of bringing attitudinal changes among women. They are now more confident and work for promoting women's rights as social mobilizers at both work and public places. Some of the qualitative impact as shared by women representatives of the training is as below;

Increased awareness level, improved negotiation skill, and better confidence level which has lead them to demand for equal rights and wages at their work places. Sharing an example from PTCL, a member after the training, women staff members have refused to stay back after working hours in the offices. Earlier women with families were facing a lot of social problems, mainly due to lack of knowledge on their rights and lack of confidence. However, they have now managed to overcome this problem and feel more confident with the support of trade unions. Nevertheless, in order to avoid any friction with the employees, these matters are discussed in amicable manner.

Women are taking lead in raising voices for their specific issues and rights on various forums. Earlier women were more dependent on their male counterparts to stand up for women issues however, in many instances this did not happen. However, women have now overcome this issue to quite an extent and are hopeful that with time and experience they will become independent in raising voices for their own issues.

Women committees have strengthened at the regional level. Women have started with regular and active participation in their own meetings as well as in trade unions. This has further led to the increased ***Linkages and communication within eight regions***.

Men have started recognizing and acknowledging the role of women in trade unions. This is mainly credited to the gender sensitization sessions conducted with both men and women. Moreover, women's active participation in union meetings, other events and conferences have made men members realized that they need women's active role and support in achieving their common objectives. However, there are still men members in trade unions who do not value the role of women in trade unions and are somewhat resistant to their participation.

Families support for women participation in union activities is vital. Women have been able to get the support of their families to participate in union activities such as training, seminars, rallies, and conference in which women participated from all over the country. Women credited this to the improved communication skills learnt during the training. However, there are number of interested and potential women who cannot come forward due to lack of support from their families.

Endorsement on gender equality policy needs further efforts. The gender equality policy was developed based on the findings of Baseline survey and in consultation with men and women office bearers of trade unions. The policy was shared with other unions for their response and endorsement. Though PWF achieved its target, as 20 out of 300 unions have endorsed the policy, efforts are underway to develop understanding and get the support of other unions for greater impact.

Efforts have been undertaken to Institutionalization of gender equality policy in PWF. A lot of useful material has been developed in form of baseline surveys and training manuals and have been made available to PWF. In addition, the project has trained a number of master trainers in various fields including i) leadership and self management ii) effective communication and conflict management iii) Trade Union management and organization, iv) labour rights and ILS, v) harassment at work place and vi) occupational safety and health. These master trainers are members of PWF and can be used in future for conducting formal and informal training sessions with co workers and members of PWF.

The project has been implemented in close consultation with PWF where they were involved in activity planning, implementation and monitoring follow ups. Their capacities have been built in formulating gender policy which is essential for continuation of the objective in their unions.

4. Overall project assessment

Main findings

- **Long term project strategic objectives;** The project has long term strategic objectives which were to be achieved in partnerships with wide range of stakeholders. It is difficult to quantify and comment on the achievement of these objectives; however, the project has achieved number of strategic steps under each component which contributes to the overall objectives. These particularly refer to bills drafted on 'prevention of harassment at workplace' 'protection of home based workers' formulation of gender policies with EFP and PWF and institutional capacity building efforts. The project has focused on non-traditional areas of women's empowerment and has successfully sensitized partners and concerned stakeholders on the subject. The project has played a proactive role in raising pertinent issues, made efforts to sensitize stakeholders on those issues, provided

them with technical support and brought them together on the same forums. The project has succeeded in changing opinions of many stakeholders ranging from government to private sector on women employment concerns through constant sensitization.

- **Project relevance and strategic fit;** The project was designed keeping in view the existing gender gaps, Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper and ILO Decent Country Work Programme. Moreover, it has particular relevance to the ILO's concern for the ending Discrimination at Workplace under Convention No.111; Equal Remuneration under Convention No. 100, Workers with Family Responsibilities under convention 156 and home-based work under Convention No. 177.
- **Focus on strategic features and validity of the project design;** In order to work towards the objectives, the project has remained focused on its strategic features and each component has its elements. The project has been able to achieve successes at varying levels under its each strategic feature. However, as the project was extended for a period of two years, it has provided the project with the opportunity to consolidate its activities and approaches. During the extension period, the project has made efforts and initiated number of activities to bring integration into its four distinct but interlinked components. The project extension has also allowed the project to extend some of the partnerships under component 2 to be able to compile lessons learnt and develop models. In addition, the project has been able to develop linkages with the Labour Market Information and Analysis (Unit) of ILO and published a report on statistical trends on women employment in 2009. The project has achieved some good results in policy research and analysis however; it continues to be one of the project features for the future.
- **Project effectiveness and efficiency:** The project focus and approach has been effective and efficient in terms of making partnership with relevant stakeholders, raising pertinent issues, undertaking activities, and thus reaching to the target beneficiaries. Moreover, the project has striven to work closely with existing institutions, building upon existing structures and following lessons learned from previous and ongoing ILO's projects. In addition, the project has linked its activities with some of the ongoing activities and programmes of the government and civil society organizations to capitalize on the similar outcomes through joint resources. All these efforts particularly related to advocacy and skills enhancement have given the project an edge and an effective orientation to all related stakeholders to initiate similar interventions.

The project effectiveness has enhanced with the active engagement of key partners in NSC. They have played an active role in giving appropriate and timely strategic direction to the project. Based on recommendations of the NSC, number of activities and strategic

approaches were adopted in the project. Moreover, the project was able to achieve all its planned targets.

- **Sustainability;** The project has developed and published a lot of useful resource material for wide range of stakeholders which has been made available to them at the institutional level. This material has not only contributed to awareness raising and sensitization on the issue but also can be used as a reference material on day to day working of these institutions. In addition, number of resource person have been trained under all four components who can further train and sensitize other members of their organization(s) on important matters related to women employment concerns. Furthermore, the gender policy and its guidelines will further help ILO two important constituent's to work towards the objectives in a systematic manner. These provide substantial grounds for the sustainability of the project results.
- **Transparency and decentralization;** The project formulated National Steering Committee (NSC), with representation from major project partners with MOL in the main lead role. The implementing partners were actively involved in information sharing and decision making process. A number of activities were initiated and targets were revised in response to the recommendations made in the NSC meetings. The mechanism adopted for NSC brought transparency and decentralization in project implementation.
- **Value addition to partnerships;** The project has added value to the direct and indirect partnerships between CIDA, ILO and the Ministry of Labour and Manpower. The value addition is particularly in reference to the strategic focus of the project which has linked the 'women's empowerment' focus of CIDA and the Decent Country Work Programmes of the Government and ILO.
- **Missed opportunity;** The project remained understaffed with only 2 programme officers against the allocated 4 programme officers under the project document. The National Project Coordinator (NPC) left in early part of 2008 and was not replaced when the project was extended for another two years. Although, the project staff remained committed and were able to achieve project targets in an efficient and effective manner, staff limitation with the project is identified as a missed opportunity that could have added further value to the project.

5. Lessons learnt

1. The project has made a lot of efforts to build institutional capacity of MoL and in developing ownership for the project objectives within the ministry. However, as the staff gets transferred and replaced, the capacity gap emerges again. Though resource materials have been made available to the Ministry and a Gender Wing has been established, there are still implementation level gaps in capacities to take forward the project objectives on their own and translate policies into implementation. There is greater reliance in MOL on ILO for taking forward the project objectives.
2. The project objectives focuses on the enhanced capacities of both MOL and MOWD, however under the current project, there is a gap in partnership levels between both ministries. Though, MOWD has contributed to the project within its own mandate under informal partnership, project has always played a pro active role in involving the Ministry in the project. There is an opportunity to tap the potential of MOWD in a more effective manner and bring them into closer collaboration.
3. Stronger coordination mechanisms at the project level will contribute to the enhancement of project impact. The project has made efforts to bring partners together and share information on various components. The Project has organized two conferences (Lahore and Karachi) and has a mechanism (NSC meetings) to provide IPs with a platform to share project progress and lessons learnt. The project publications are widely disseminated with all IPs. However, these efforts have been carried out in fragmentation and only selected groups among partners were involved in the information sharing forums. Since the effort lacked strategic and operational links, they could not generate effective results. There is need for bringing coordination among all components, ILO constituents and partners under a systematic strategic and implementation plan. All the concerned stakeholders need to be placed in their relevant role and allocate them responsibilities that will complement and supplement each other. However at the same time, IPs also need to take proactive role in sharing information and taking lead in developing cohesion and linkages within their own component and with partners from other components. Following is an example of coordinated effort;
 - a. Legislative Bills on home based workers and women harassment are major achievements under the component 1 and of the project. These Bills, as argued by a number of partners, have been passed through the joint efforts of stakeholders under component 1 with spillover effects of efforts of stakeholders from other components. This is one good example of joint efforts and contribution of multiple partners towards project objectives. This strongly

supports the need for making more effort and taking concrete steps to bring cohesion and strengthen links among the partners and components to enhance the impact of the project.

4. The project involved diverse partners under component 2 to pilot varied skills programme to learn about models that work better. The main lesson learnt for the project in this regard is that focused partnerships with longer duration and more input support (technical, time and financial) will help achieve deeper impact compared to broad range of partnerships with shorter duration, limited inputs and targets.
5. Market and demand based trainings in skills ensure better employment opportunities in formal sector contributing to the project objectives. Moreover, employment opportunities in regular industries such as the garment sector or any other may provided the project with the opportunity look deep into the implementation of International Labour Standards and gender policy i.e. if they are members of EFP endorsing Gender equality policy.
6. Consultative process and sensitization of stakeholders adopted under the project has shown good results and informs of positive responses to women's employment concerns, formulation of gender policy and its quick adoption by large number of stakeholders including private sector and units of workers federation. Nevertheless, there is need for further efforts to bring more stakeholders on board for greater impact.
7. Adoption of gender policy should remain as a voluntary process and legal binding and strict monitoring may create resistances. Therefore there should be continued effort for implementation of gender policy through advocacy based on the argument of better economic returns (increased efficiency and effectiveness).
8. Strengthened women unions and networks provide women with strong foundations to further improve their roles in trade unions and PWF.

6. Recommendations

1. The long term strategic objectives such as WEC-PK should be considered under a programmatic approach. A programme approach with long term goal, strategic approach and input support will contribute more effectively to the achievement of the objectives. Moreover, it will also allow ILO with more time to monitor, identify gaps in capacities at policy and implementation level and feedback and forward into the programme and thus to achievement of project objectives.

2. In order to further build the implementation level capacities of MoL and MoWD and to enable them to take project forward, step forward needs to be adopted with a different strategic approach by the project which will assist sustaining the project activities. The main purpose is to build MOL capacity to translate policy into implementation. The following are some of the recommendations in this regard;
 - 2.1 Integrate gender into all departments of the MOL for more sustainable results rather than compartmentalizing it. It is important to engender the Labour policy and workplans of the Ministry and its Departments. Once policy and work plans are engendered, budget will be automatically allocated to the identified activities. The gender wing at MOL, as an Outcome of the project's efforts, is mandated to provide technical backstopping to departments in developing and implementation of work plans. The project role should be in providing technical backstopping to the ministry
 - 2.2 The role and relevance of MOWD to the project objectives cannot be undermined. A more formal role of MOWD within their mandate may be considered to ensure their regular and systematic assistance to related ministry(ies), i.e. to provide technical backstopping to the MOWD in terms of assessment and providing guidelines for the formulation of policies and translation of policies into implementation. MOWD may be involved in the reviewing the labour policy 2010 of MOL, through a gender lens.
 - 2.3 There is need to decentralize the project focus and activities from federal level to provincial and district level ministries and departments respectively. It has especially become important after constitutional (18th) amendment which also includes delegation of powers from federal to provincial level under the concurrent lists. In this connection, provincial level issues would contribute to the priority setting of federal ministries. Therefore, it is essential to involve and bring all related stakeholders at the same level of sensitization on the subject. The decentralization at provincial levels and building upon the existing government structures will also pave the way for ensuring equal involvement of all provinces which was somewhat lacking in the current project.
 - 2.4 The decentralization process should also take into account inclusion of the other related departments which contribute to the implementation of activities. These include i) planning department, ii) finance department, and iii) women development department.
 - 2.5 It is important that the project is further linked with the existing political structures and government programs e.g. 'Inter Ministerial Committee' at Federal level and 'inter provincial gender mainstreaming task force' in all four provinces that have been established under GRAP for women's empowerment. These forums should be

effectively utilized for promoting project objectives and integrate project activities into ongoing political and governmental plans.

2.6 In response to MTE recommendation the project has already considered and included sector specific approach focused on ILO's new national project namely *Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment*.

2.7 The project should be extended to the newly established fifth province of the country Gilgit-Baltistan.

3. There is still a need for continued and increased sensitization on the women and employment related issues at various levels and stakeholders. This will help sustain institutional commitment and enhance project impact. In this regard, a number of steps may need to be taken e.g. the already trained master trainers should be properly utilized. They should be given periodic refreshers courses and some more at unions/provincial/district level should be trained. In addition, trained master trainers should be allocated with specific responsibilities that should provide regular progress report to their management and to the project.
4. There is continued need to influence policy and advocate for greater awareness raising on better working conditions for women. In this regard, legislation on important matters is of prime importance for effective implementation at all levels. Once legislation is passed, as was done during the project life, contributing activities will be identified and required budget will be allocated in the next planning period. In this regard, strong engagement of parliamentarians (at Federal and Provincial levels) is important to get the political will and support on addressing issues related to women employment.
5. The project has been providing resource persons on the subject of women employment concerns, to the training courses run in government training institution such as CSI, NIPA etc. However, in order to ensure continuation of these training sessions, master trainers in the faculty of these institutions should be trained to reduce their dependency on external re/sources.
6. The project should focus on filling in the gap in the demand and supply of the skilled labour in the market. The experience with MinTex based on this principle is a successful model with the project which should be replicated on a larger scale. The textile industry is the major industry of the country with great demand for women skilled labour. There is huge demand for skilled women labour as the cost efficiency of the industry is dependent upon them. Therefore there are high chances of employment opportunities to women with relevant skills. Moreover, this will also contribute to the effort of bringing more women to formal sector. Furthermore, there should also be a

comprehensive market survey which can help identify gaps in demand and supply of skilled labour in all sectors and throughout the country.

7. Cohesion among various project components can help further achieve better and more sustainable results. However, this should be done through a proper strategic and inter linked approach rather than individual and one time efforts. In this regard, all relevant stakeholders should be placed in their relevant and sequential roles. Citing an example in this regard, EFP forums have played a role in lobbying for women harassment bills. The Parliamentarians participated in training and advocacy programmes organized by EFP in various provinces, therefore they were cognizant of the issues and thus advocated and supported the Bill on Harassment at Workplace at their own level. Moreover, Employers Federation of Pakistan can help in conducting market surveys and facilitate linking skilled workers with market/employers. In addition, EFP role can be effectively utilized to address the need for even spread throughout the country and all sectors. The NGOs and other training institutes may be engaged for conducting social mobilization, skills training and linking skilled labour with employees. In this regard, the project should consider bringing resource persons from other project components should be invited to take sessions in the various training events. This will not only build linkages among various but inter linked stakeholders but will also contribute to information sharing process and bringing cohesion among project partners.
8. There is great demand for professionally skilled and competent middle management in the private sector with great scope for women to fill in the gap. The project should focus on enhancing professional skills and competencies among women professionals already working in the private sector which should contribute to breaking the glass ceiling. This can be further effectively carried out through a survey focused on the identification of issues and reasons for fewer working women at the management level and why they have not been able to break the glass ceilings.
9. Project carried out an assessment study of skill training program to collate the learning under component 2. However, it would be useful if there is detailed analysis of the remaining three components including ILO constituents. This analysis will contribute to the planning of future projects.
10. Individual unions and federation should develop implementation plans on yearly basis identifying important activities for strengthening women participation in unions. These plans should be developed in joint consultation with women and in the light of gender policy. The identified activities should be allocated with budgets to ensure their effective implementation. The implementation plan will contribute towards achievement of the project in a more sustainable manner with least dependency on

external sources. A similar approach should be adopted with EFP which should be elaborated in close consultation with EFP.

11. To bring women at the higher tiers of leadership in trade unions, it is important to provide strategic guidance to PWF to focus on capacity building and ensuring active involvement of women in unions at provincial and district levels.

7. Conclusion

The WEC-PK focus on gender issues and improving employment conditions is particularly relevant in social, legal, policy development and economic situation of the country which also has particular reference to ILO Conventions 111, 100, 177 and 156. However, project has long term strategic objectives, which makes it difficult to quantify and comment on their achievement. Nevertheless, the project has achieved number of strategic steps under each component which contributes to the overall objectives. These particularly refer to bills drafted on 'prevention of harassment at workplace' 'protection of home based workers' formulation of gender policies with EFP and PWF and institutional capacity building efforts. The project has focused on non- traditional areas of women's empowerment and has successfully sensitized partners and concerned stakeholders on the subject. The project has played a proactive role in raising pertinent issues, made efforts to sensitize stakeholders on those issues, provided them with technical support and brought them together in the same forums. The project has not only been able to achieve the targets or exceeded the planned targets but has also succeeded in changing opinions of many stakeholders ranging from government to private sector on women employment concerns through constant sensitization. The final evaluation study further confirms that the project has been able to incorporate MTE recommendations in the project.

The evaluation study draws lessons learnt based on the discussions with the project stakeholders and project progress review including;

- i) there are still implementation level capacity gaps in MOL in taking forward the project objectives on their own and to translate policies into implementation. Moreover, there is an opportunity to tap the capacities of MOWD in a more proactive manner;
- ii) there is need for bringing coordination among all components, ILO constituents and partners under a systematic strategic and implementation plan to be able to generate effective results;
- iii) focused partnerships with longer duration and more input support (technical, time and financial) will contribute towards achieving deeper impact compared to broad range of partnerships with shorter duration, limited inputs and targets;

- iv) market and demand based trainings in skills ensure better employment opportunities in formal sector contributing to the project objectives;
- v) Consultative process and sensitization of stakeholders adopted under the project has shown good results and informs of positive responses to women's employment concerns, formulation of gender policy and its quick adoption by large number of stakeholders including private sector and units of workers federation;
- vi) adoption of gender policy should remain as a voluntary process and legal binding and strict monitoring may create resistances. Therefore there should be continued effort for implementation of gender policy through advocacy based on the argument of better economic returns;
- vii) strengthened women unions and networks provide women with strong foundations to further improve their roles in trade unions and PWF.

The evaluation study recommendations include:

- i) The long term strategic objectives such as WEC-PK should be considered under a programmatic approach with long term goal, strategic approach and input support;
- ii) build the implementation level capacities of both MOL and MOWD;
- iii) There is still a need for continued and increased sensitization on the women and employment related issues at various levels and stakeholders;
- iv) for sustainability purposes, master trainers in the faculty of the government training institutions should be trained to reduce their dependency on external re/sources;
- v) The project should focus on filling in the gap in the demand and supply of the skilled labour in the market. The experience with MINTEX based on this principle is a successful model with the project which should be replicated on a larger scale;
- vi) Cohesion among various project components under a more strategic and interlinked approach will help further achieve better and more sustainable results;
- vii) There is great demand for professionally skilled and competent middle management in the private sector with great scope for women to fill in the gap;
- viii) There is continued need to influence policy and advocate for greater awareness raising on better working conditions for women;

- ix) Individual unions and federation should develop implementation plans on yearly basis identifying important activities for strengthening women participation in unions;
- x) To bring women at the higher tiers of leadership in trade unions, it is important to provide strategic guidance to PWF to focus on capacity building and ensuring active involvement of women in unions at provincial and district levels.

Annex 1

Terms of reference

1. Introduction & Rational for Evaluation

The ILO with the financial support of the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) implemented a national project titled “Women’s Employment Concerns and Working Conditions (WEC-PK)” aimed at enhancing the quantity and quality of women's employment in Pakistan. The project implementation period is May 2005 to March 2010. The project has inbuilt features to contribute to the ILO’s Decent Country Work Programme (DWCP) specifically to promoting greater employment opportunities for women and men, and facilitating for the social protection of workers.

The mandatory mid-term evaluation of the project was carried out during December 2007 and January 2008. The report of the Mid term Evaluation (MTE) of WEC-PK project clearly indicates that the project succeeded in achieving its objectives to build institutional capacity, creating awareness, developing a knowledge and skill base, and providing direct assistance to women to secure decent living. In addition, MTE acknowledged that that project offered flexibility which helped in accommodating diversity in partnerships and actions. The strategic, distinct, innovative and cost effective non-traditional partnerships with Universities, National Commission on Status of Women, Ministry of Women’s Development, think tanks, National Institutes for Public Administration and Parliamentarians Commission for Human Rights; wide-ranging geographical outreach, tapping the right international expertise, local resource development and efficient resource utilization¹ have also been recognized as the strengths of project. The interventions provided great insight for making improvements and re-strategizing for narrowing the gender gaps and for the socio-economic empowerment of Pakistani women.

Amongst the challenges identified in the MTE, are lack of cohesion among project components; lack of sustainability, weak follow-up mechanism; limited focus on informal economy, and clear roadmap

for sustainability. The project lacked sustainability due to limited time frame and budget, for example one of the components was successfully but expeditiously completed in 10 months, therefore the impact lacked visibility. MTE also pointed out that project lacked opportunities of creating linkages and experience sharing among partners, therefore the proposed project needs to consider budgetary allocations and flexibility for improved linkages and design strategies to ensure cohesion among various components and greater sustainability.

The project will end in March 2010, and in line with the ILO's rules and regulations, project is subject to final independent evaluation. The proposed final evaluation will focus on how far the project has responded to the emerging issues raised and the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation. It will also assess the impact of the interventions in terms of achieving its immediate objectives. This evaluation report will take into account the project's good practices and the lessons learned.

An external independent evaluator will lead this final independent evaluation and be responsible for drafting and finalizing the report. The evaluation will be a consultative and participatory process as it will involve the tripartite constituents and key stakeholders in all evaluation processes from ToRs development to the finalization of evaluation report and to the following up of evaluation's recommendations.

The evaluation will comply with the UN Evaluation Norms and Standards and OECD/DAC Evaluation Quality Standard. These Terms of Reference serve as a guide for all those involved in the final evaluation and describes the tasks to be undertaken by the independent external consultant engaged by the ILO.

2. Purpose, Scope and Clients of the evaluation

2.1 Purpose

The final evaluation is being proposed with the purpose to draw lessons from experience gained during the project period (particularly after the Mid-Term Review), and how these lessons could be applied in programming future activities. In line with the comments from the donor (CIDA) and subsequent agreement by ILO-EVAL, the final evaluation will focus on the process and results of the project in purview of Decent Work Country Program and the project milestones and objectives. The evaluation will also identify any emerging potential good practices. It is also important to consider the gaps identified in the mid-term evaluation (MTE) and what was done to reduce this gap? Amongst the main objectives of this evaluation is to develop a set of recommendations that could be used in shaping the strategy for new project on Gender Equality. The final evaluation will assess how far the project has managed to address

the issues raised in the MTE. The evaluation will identify lessons learnt and provide recommendations for future operations. The evaluation would identify the potential impact on policy and strategies and suggest a possible way forward for the future.

Given that the WEC-PK approach is relatively recent, the innovative nature and the element of “learning by doing” of the approach should be taken into account. The WEC-PK concept is intended to evolve as lessons are learned and to adapt to changing circumstances. The identification of specific issues and lessons learned for broader application for the WEC-PK concept, as a whole, would be a particular supplementary feature of this evaluation.

2.2 Scope

This final evaluation will focus on the ILO- WEC-PK project mentioned above, its achievements and its contribution to the overall national efforts to achieve the women’s economic empowerment and gender mainstreaming. The final evaluation takes into account all interventions that have been implemented during the entire project life.

The evaluation will assess the project as a whole and address issues of project design, implementation, lessons learned, replicability and recommendations for future programs design and any specific recommendations. The Final evaluation has to consider the recommendations of the mid-term evaluation. Given the key contribution of WEC-PK to the National process in the promotion of gender equality in the world of work and creating conducive environment for working women, the evaluation will have to take into account relevant factors and developments in the national process.

2.3 Clients

The principal clients for this evaluation are the project management, ILO constituents in Pakistan, ILO New Delhi, ILO RO Bangkok, ILO technical units GENDER, CODEV, EVAL and the project donor.

3. Suggested analytical Framework (Issues to be addressed) The evaluation should address the overall ILO evaluation criteria such as effectiveness, efficiency, relevance, management arrangement, impact and sustainability as defined in the ILO Guidelines for the Preparation of Independent Evaluations of ILO Programs and Projects and for gender concerns see: ILO Guidelines for the Integration of Gender Issues into the Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of ILO Programs and Projects. The evaluation shall adhere to the UN Evaluation Norms and Standards and OECD/DAC quality standards.

The evaluator should make conclusions, recommendations, and identify lessons learnt and good practices based on the below specific questions The evaluation is guided by the ILO’s Technical Cooperation Manual and the policies and procedures established therein (see Chapter 7 of the

manual see Section starting Page 17 for key guiding questions). Based on development objectives, outputs and activities specified in the WEC-PK project document, the evaluation will include, but not be limited to, the following issues:

Relevance and strategic fit of the project

- Are the objectives of the development interventions consistent with beneficiary requirements, Country needs (cultural/economic/ traditional context), global priorities and partner and donor policies?
- Does the project address a relevant need and decent work deficit? Was a need analysis carried out at the beginning of the project reflecting the various needs of different stakeholders? Are these needs still relevant? Have new, more relevant needs emerged that the project should address?
- Have the stakeholders taken ownership of the project concept and approach since the design phase?
- How does the project align with the support national development plans, the national poverty strategy (PRS), national decent work plans of action an relevant issues (e.g. employment creation etc.), as well as programmes and priorities of the national social partners?

Validity of Project Design

- Is the project design and approach realistic, appropriate and achievable within the respective country?
- Do outputs casually link to the intended outcomes (immediate objectives) that link to broader impact (development objective)? How plausible are the underlying casual hypothesis?
- What are the main strategic components of the project? How do they contribute and logically link to the planned activities? How well do they link to each other?
- Who are the partners of the project? How strategic are partners in terms of mandate, influence, capacities and commitment?
- Assess the relationships/synergies between the project activities and other interventions supported by other organizations in the country. Have adequate synergies and coordination been developed with relevant Initiatives?
- Assess whether or not the stakeholders assume ownership of the project activities and achievements?

Project Progress and Effectiveness

- Has the project made sufficient progress towards its planned objectives?
- Have the quantity and quality of the outputs produced so far been satisfactory?
- How do the outputs and outcomes contribute to the ILO's mainstreamed strategies?
 - How do they contribute to gender equality?
 - How do they contribute to the strengthening of the social partners and social dialogue?
 - How do they contribute to poverty reduction?
 - How do they contribute to strengthening the influence of labour standards?
- How effective has the project been in establishing national ownership? Has the project been appropriately responsive to the needs of the national constituents and changing partner priorities?
- Has the project been appropriately responsive to political, legal, economic, institutional, etc., changes in the project environment?
- In which areas (geographic, sectoral, issue) does the project have the greatest achievements? Why are these and what have been the supporting factors? How can the project build on or expand these achievements?
- In which areas does the project have the least achievements? What have been the constraining factors and why? How can they be overcome?
- How effective the project has been in improving the institutional capacity among partner organizations in designing and implementing skills training programmes for the target groups?
- Have there been other initiatives undertaken by NGOs to address the concerns of working women in Pakistan? if so, what are they? How are they linked to the project?
- What, if any, lessons learned have been produced from these Programs at this stage in project implementation so far? What possibilities are there for effective replication of efforts?

Efficiency of Resource Use

- Have resources (funds, human resources, time, expertise, etc.) been allocated strategically to achieve outcomes?
- Have resources been used efficiently? Have activities supporting the strategy been cost-effective? In general, do the results achieved justify the costs? Could the same results be attained with fewer resources?
- Have project funds and activities been delivered in a timely manner?

Effectiveness of Management Arrangements

- Are management capacities adequate?

-
- Does the project receive adequate political, technical and administrative support from its national partners? Do implementing partners provide for effective project implementation?
 - If the project has a national project steering or advisory committee, do the members have a good grasp of the project strategy? How do they contribute to the success of the project?
 - Does the project receive adequate administrative, technical and, if needed, political support from the ILO field office, field technical specialists and the responsible technical unit in headquarters?

Impact Orientation and Sustainability

- Can observed changes (in attitudes, capacities, institutions, etc.) be causally linked to the project's interventions?
- How far the project has contributed to broader and longer-term development impact? Is the project strategy and project management steering towards impact?
- Is there a need to scale down the project (i.e., if the project duration is shorter than planned)? Can the project be scaled up during its duration? If so, how do project objectives and strategies have to be adjusted?
- Are national partners willing and committed to continue with the project? How effectively has the project built national ownership?
- Has the project successfully built or strengthened an enabling environment (laws, policies, people's attitudes, etc.)?
- Are the project results, achievements and benefits likely to be durable? Are results anchored in national institutions and can the partners maintain them financially at end of project?
- Can the project approach or results be replicated or scaled up by national partners or other actors? Is this likely to happen? What would support their replication and scaling up?

Meetings Schedule for Final Evaluation of WEC-PK project

Date (2010)	Organization (City)	Contact Person and designation
March 29	SRSP- Peshawar	Zeeshan Atif-Chief PMER
April 5	Travel from Peshawar to Islamabad	
April 6	CIDA	Farah Chandani- First Secretary Development Canadian High Commission Ms. Rukhsana Rashid- Senior Gender Advisor, CIDA
April 6	WEC-PK project	Ms.Margaret Reade Rounds, Evaluation Manager, ILO office, Islamabad/ Mr.Saad Gillani; Senior Programme Officer Ms. Munawar Sultana; Programme Officer
April 6	Lead	Ms. Sabeen Mehmood-Program Manager Ms. Isma Israr –Program Manager trainings
April 7	MOWD	Ms. Rehana Sheikh- Project Director GRAP Irum Fatima- Director Gender employment
April 7	MOL	Iftikhar Ahmed Soomoro –Joint Secretary Adm/emg Fayyaz Ahmed Malik – Deputy Chief HRD
April 7	Travel to Karachi	
April 8	First Micro Finance Bank	Ms. Hina Haqqani- Project Officer
April 8	Employers Federation of Pakistan	Mr. K.M.Nauman- Vice president EFP Mr. Saghir Ahmed- Secretary General EFP Mr. Saud Alam- Deputy Secretary EFP Ms. Shahana Kaukab-Management Committee member Mr. Fasih UI Karim- Management Committee Member
April 9	Travel to Lahore	

April 9	Pakistan Workers Federation	Mr. Khurshid Ahmed-Chairman PWF Mr. Osama Tariq, Deputy General Secretary PWF Ms. Huma Aziz-Chairperson Women's Committee PWF Ms. Amina Khurram-Deputy Secretary, Women's Committee, PWF Ms. Salma Yasmin-Vice Chairperson, Women's Committee, PWF Ms. Mussarat Iqbal-General Secretary. Women's Committee, PWF. Syed Ahmed Raza Zaidi, Admin/Finance Assistant, WEC-PK project. PWF
April 10	Civil Services Academy	Syed Mehmood Javed - Director Common Training Programs Mr. Irfan
April 12	Travel to Faisalabad	
April 12	Meeting with MINTEX and visit of Masood Textile Mills (MTM) in Faisalabad	Mr. Mian Tariq Mahmood- Assistant Director HR Mintex Mr. Shahid Nazir- CEO MTM Mr. Nasir Ali Zia – Dy. General Manager MTM Mr. Amer H. Khan Director Operation MTM Trainers –Ms. Shagufta and Ms. Sadaf MTM Machine workers MTM
April 13	Meeting with Sarsabz Foundation, monitoring of Training	Dr. Naveeda Shoib Executive Director Sarsabz Foundation Trainees of Entrepreneurship Trainings