

**Project on Mobilizing Action for the Protection of
Domestic Workers from Forced Labour and
Trafficking in South East Asia
RAS/03/52/UKM**

Mid-term review

Report on Indonesia and destination countries and final formatting by
Annemarie Reerink (National Consultant Jakarta)
Report on the Philippines by Lucita Lazo (National Consultant, Manila)

27 October 2005

Table of Contents

1. Summary of findings and recommendations	3
2. Introduction.....	4
A. Indonesia and Destination Countries	8
(by Annemarie Reerink)	8
3. Design	8
4. Implementation	10
5. Performance	22
6. Special concerns.....	27
7. Findings, conclusions and recommendations	28
B. Philippines	34
(by Lucita Lazo).....	34
3. Project Design.....	34
4. Implementation	38
5. Cross-cutting Concerns: Gender, ILO Standards.....	43
6. Progress of implementation and delivery	45
7. Recommendations.....	54
8. Lessons learned.....	57
Annex 1: Mid-term review timetable.....	61
Annex 2: List of documents reviewed	64

1. Summary of findings and recommendations

The mid-term review of the ILO Project on Mobilising Action for the Protection of Domestic Workers from Forced Labour and Trafficking analysed the project's design, preparations, activities and achievements to date through discussions with project staff, implementing partners and PAC participants as well as analysis of project documents. With regard to Indonesia and the destination countries (Malaysia, Singapore and Hong Kong), it found the project to have implemented a large number of activities that have contributed to substantial progress in meeting its immediate objective.

Concerning Indonesia and destination countries, the review notes a number of notable achievements by the project as well as some shortcomings and weaknesses. Among the achievements are considerable progress in building support among ILO constituents for national and local legislation and policies to protect domestic workers, and significant capacity building among NGOs that provide services for domestic and migrant workers and advocate on their behalf. New partnerships have also been forged with private recruitment agencies in Indonesia. The project has been successful in putting domestic work, trafficking and forced labour on the agenda of relevant government ministries and agencies, and in strengthening important coalitions and networks involved in policy advocacy. While legislation and policy to protect Indonesian domestic workers will probably not be realised during the life of the project, there is sufficient momentum as well as monitoring by NGOs to make passage of legislation likely to happen in the next five years.

For reasons related to staff limitations, the short duration of the project and concerns about sustainability, the project has not been able to implement activities related to direct interventions in the same way as proposed in the project document. Outputs related to trade union involvement have been fewer than proposed, due to the lack of interest of most Indonesian trade unions. While this could to some extent have been foreseen if sufficient consultations had been held prior to the project's launch in Indonesia, it is regrettable that the project has not been able to focus more attention and resources on this problem. This is partially due to limited human and financial resources, but also a result of the project's strategic decision to focus on organisations eager to collaborate with the project. On a positive note, the project has made advances in creating linkages between trade unions and domestic workers in destination countries.

The review notes a number of important shortcomings with regard to the project's design, some of which are responsible for the delays in delivery of outputs, but concludes that on the whole, the project document presents a strong problem analysis and is well designed in terms of strategies, outputs and activities. The mid-term review also raises questions about the sustainability of project outputs. Several outputs related to direct interventions have been dropped due to concerns about sustainability in the absence of sufficient national resources and interest. While the project has engaged in direct interventions for domestic workers by supporting relevant NGOs, it is likely that the outputs from these activities cannot be continued independently beyond the project's life and will require

further donor support. Concerns about sustainability have been discussed extensively but a comprehensive and concrete solution has not yet been found. This issue will require more attention from technical officers involved in this field as well as from the donor community in general.

While the project will not achieve its unrealistic objective of eradicating the worst forms of abuse of domestic workers, it certainly has laid the foundations for effective future action that can offer concrete benefits for domestic workers in Indonesia and destination countries. The project's achievements are important in terms of bringing together the stakeholders at regional, national and local levels and putting domestic work, trafficking, and forced labour on the agenda of government institutions, recruitment agencies and some trade union federations.

The review recommends that the project be extended or that a second phase be explored with the donor. The main reason for this recommendation is that the severity and the extent of the problems faced by domestic workers require a multi-pronged approach that is sustained over a period of at least five years. The duration of current project is too short to expect significant improvements, whether in legislative changes, in trade union involvement, or in the capacity for self-organisation among domestic workers. For the remaining six months of project implementation, it is recommended that the project in Indonesia focus on awareness raising and advocacy for policy and legislation.

2. Introduction

2.1 The mid-term review

The objectives of the mid-term review were to assess the delivery and impact of the project against its stated objectives (specifically concentrating on the project relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability of results), and to provide concrete recommendations for the remainder of the project duration as well as for any follow up action for the project, thus contributing to the design of a possible new project phase. In particular, purpose of the review was to:

- examine the validity of the logic and approach defined in the project document and identify possible needs for modification of the outputs and activities and indicators;
- examine project preparations, consultations and national support for project concept and objectives;
- examine the adequacy and suitability of project structure and staffing;
- assess project implementation to date vis-à-vis staffing, constraints and validity;
- evaluate current management and staff performance;
- evaluate support for the project by concerned ILO Departments and offices;
- evaluate support for the project by relevant National Partner Organisations; and
- evaluate the project's sustainability and prepare the ground for the next phase of the project.

In Indonesia, the mid-term review took place between 7 and 23 September and also covered project activities in destination countries. In the course of two weeks, the consultant held meetings with the main implementing partners of the project as well as the members of the Project Advisory Committee. These included: the Ministry of Labour and Manpower, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Ministry of Justice and Human Rights, the State Ministry of Women's Empowerment, the Indonesian Association of Employers (APINDO), the All-Indonesia Association of Placement Agencies (APPSI), the Indonesian Manpower Services Association (APIATI), the All-Indonesia Trade Union Federation – Reform (FSPSI-R), the National Commission on Violence Against Women (Komnas Perempuan), Rumpun Gema Perempuan, the migrant workers' network KOPBUMI, the Indonesian Migrant Workers' Trade Union (SBMI), Fatayat NU (a Muslim women's organisation) and the Hong Kong-based Asian Migrant Centre (whose Indonesian staff member was on mission in Jakarta). The consultant also carried out field visits to two sites of domestic workers' organisation (Kemuning in Jakarta and Sawangan in West Java), observing and participating in regular discussion meetings. Phone interviews were conducted with the Tunas Mulia domestic workers' trade union in Yogyakarta and information was solicited from the Malaysian Trades Union Congress via e-mail). Lastly, the consultant met with the Director, the Deputy Director and other relevant staff in the ILO Jakarta Office and the backstopping officer from Headquarters. (the detailed schedule of the review is attached as Annex 1).

In the Philippines, the mid-term evaluation consisted of a desk review of pertinent project documents as well as interviews with key informants listed in Annex 1. The list of documents reviewed is in Annex 2. In addition, the consultant in the Philippines obtained the views and opinions of various stakeholders, including ILO staff, specialists and managers, through individual or group interviews and discussions. Among the stakeholders, the interview respondents can be grouped into two sets: the first consisting of partners who have ongoing external collaboration contracts under the project and the second consisting of those who have existing proposals under review and those who have taken related development actions without ILO support.

Institutional respondents who have existing contracts include the following: Department of Labor and Employment – Institute of Labor Studies; Bureau of Local Employment, Bureau of Women and Young Workers, Philippine Overseas Employment Administration, Technical Education and Skills Development Authority, Department of Foreign Affairs – Foreign Service Institute; Employers Confederation of the Philippines; and the Visayan Forum. The consultant in the Philippines also had conversations with the Director and Deputy Director of the Manila sub-regional office, as well as discussions with the project team, including the CTA and the HQ technical staff backstopping the project, the labor standards specialist, the National Project Coordinator, the Finance and Administrative staff on 26 September 2005.

2.2 Brief overview of objectives and activities

The Project on Mobilising Action for the Protection of Domestic Workers from Forced Labour and Trafficking in Southeast Asia started in May 2004 and is expected to end in

March 2006. It is funded by the Department of International Development of the Government of the United Kingdom with a total budget of US\$1.7 million for activities in Indonesia, the Philippines and destination countries (Hong Kong, Singapore and Malaysia). The main beneficiaries of the project are Indonesian and Filipina domestic workers in the sending and destination countries, while ILO constituents responsible for addressing domestic workers' needs in Indonesia and the Philippines are also expected to benefit from project activities. The immediate objective of the project is "the eradication of the worst forms of abuse of domestic workers in Asia, through an integrated programme of law, capacity building, organisation and self-representation and targeted interventions". Four main areas of action are foreseen in the project document to reach the immediate objective: a law and policy framework on domestic work; advocacy and research; outreach and empowerment of domestic workers at the national and international levels; and targeted interventions to respond effectively to reports of forced labour and trafficking affecting domestic workers.

Due to delays in staffing, the project as a whole started in May 2004. Activities in Indonesia took off when the National Project Coordinator started her work in October 2004. The Indonesian component of the project had already started before the arrival of the CTA, with the implementation of a situational analysis, while by October 2004 the project had completed national consultations and various capacity building activities and meetings with trade unions and NGOs. During the first months of project operations in Indonesia, further research and documentation was commissioned on trafficking and forced labour concerning domestic work. A needs assessment and mapping of migrant workers' organisations and a risk and needs assessment for Aceh followed in subsequent months. In destination countries, a journalistic documentation of trafficking and forced labour is ongoing.

In terms of advocacy and policy development, the project has supported a variety of advocacy efforts by NGOs through national and local networks, and has initiated consultations among stakeholders to develop a framework for relevant national and provincial legislation. In destination countries, the project has facilitated advocacy and policy dialogues by domestic workers' organisations in Hong Kong and by the Malaysian Trades Union Congress.

The project has supported capacity building for a variety of partners in Indonesia, including training activities with the Ministry of Labour and Manpower, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and trade union representatives, as well as strategic planning with a Muslim women's mass organisation, migrant workers' organisations and a domestic workers' trade union. The project is planning to conduct capacity building activities with employers' organisations in Indonesia. In destination countries, the project has supported organisational strengthening of domestic workers' unions and building the capacity of trade unions to reach out to, organise, and provide services for migrant domestic workers.

The project's awareness raising activities have included launching the ILO Forced Labour Report and funding public dialogues by a Muslim women's organisation in Indonesia, and producing and disseminating IEC materials in all project countries. Direct

interventions for domestic workers have included funding an outreach and empowerment programme in five locations in and near Jakarta, and a similar programme of service provision and outreach in Hong Kong (see annex 2 for a list of expected outputs and activities).

Activities already planned but still to be carried out include the development of guidelines and training materials for recruitment agencies, outreach and networking activities in Singapore, testing of pre-departure training materials and techniques, and further awareness raising and advocacy activities.

A. Indonesia and Destination Countries

(by Annemarie Reerink)

3. Design

The project document was designed by staff in ILO Headquarters with feedback from various country and subregional offices, on the basis of knowledge on domestic work gathered through ILO projects such as IPEC, through technical cooperation activities on gender and labour, and through the Hong Kong programme consultation on domestic work in February 2003. The design of the current project reflects the experience and knowledge gained through such earlier project activities. In general, the project was designed in a logical and clear manner, incorporating clear objectives and outputs that are relevant to the achievement of objectives. However, close examination of the project document reveals some strengths and weaknesses which will be addressed in this section.

3.1 Socio-economic and cultural context

While the socio-economic and cultural context provided in the project document is generally very detailed on the issue of domestic work in Indonesia and destination countries, it includes little assessment of the organisations that exist in Indonesia. This is a concern particularly because of the weak institutional capacity of relevant NGOs in Indonesia and the state of Indonesian trade unions, most of which are organisations with few real members and little ability to provide concrete services. Both factors have impacted on delivery of outputs and could have been reflected in the project document. While the situation analysis at the start of the project was intended to map the organisations active on domestic work, the project document could have painted a more realistic picture concerning the institutional context in which the project has to operate.

3.2 Adequacy of problem analysis

The problem analysis in the project document is very detailed and appropriate, given that it is based on the 2003 Hong Kong programme consultation meeting in which NGOs with detailed knowledge of problem matter participated. But it appears that there were no consultations with traditional ILO constituents in Indonesia during the design phase. The first progress report only makes mention of one meeting with the Ministry of Justice and Human Rights by the CTA and visiting backstopping staff at the start of the project in Indonesia. This lack of consultation has resulted in the project document not reflecting some constituents' relative lack of interest in collaboration with the ILO on the issue of protection and organisation of domestic workers. Because this is a new programme area for the ILO, it would have been very useful to gauge the level of interest and commitment of constituents and to reach an understanding regarding the objectives and in particular how they could become involved in the project. With respect to mainstream trade union centres in Indonesia, it is important to see their reluctance to embrace informal workers

Comment [adS1]: A situational analysis was carried out at the start of the project to map the institutional context and a consultation of national stakeholders was held on May 17, 2004.

as members in the context of institutional weaknesses. A second phase of the project would therefore do well to address this issue within the larger debate about the future role of trade unions, for example by tabling the issue of domestic and migrant workers in national congresses and other large-scale policy gatherings, sharing lessons learned from other countries (e.g. through the ILO Bureau of Workers' Activities and NGO partners), and setting up information dissemination and awareness raising activities within trade union centres.

3.3 Development and immediate objectives

It should be stated upfront that the immediate objective of “eradication of the worst forms of abuse of domestic workers in Asia” is not realistic in the context of a project of limited duration and with limited financial and human resources at its disposal. The same must be said about the aim “to directly reach ... over 20,000 domestic workers” in the two sending countries and in the three receiving countries covered by this project. It is unclear on what analysis or prognosis this number is based. Eradication should probably have been the development objective, but no other immediate objective was given in the project document. It would have been more useful to refer to a decreasing incidence of abuse of domestic workers or empowerment of domestic workers in terms of their legal and social position, and to mention a much lower, but more realistic number of main beneficiaries.

3.4 Overall validity of design

It is noted that the project document calls for an integrated approach to the problems facing domestic workers, covering multiple strategies which are all backed up with substantial justification and appropriate activities. However, one of the main shortcomings in project design concerns the fourth component of the project: direct interventions for the assistance of domestic workers who have been victims of trafficking and forced labour. In the project document, there is little mention of how the impact of such interventions (or the interventions themselves) could be sustained after the project period. Furthermore, whether such interventions constitute an appropriate use of resources for such a relatively small technical cooperation project by the ILO is open to debate. While direct interventions for victims of trafficking and forced labour are without doubt urgently needed in both sending and receiving countries, this may be better done by other international agencies and government agencies. A number of activities under component four in the project document call for the project to provide linkages with service providers, yet in many cases the few existing relevant service providers in Indonesia are either not interested or not able to incorporate domestic workers into their clientele (e.g. the national social security agency). On a positive note, it is useful that potential collaboration with ILO IPEC programmes is mentioned in the project document.

A second shortcoming of the project is its scale, in particular the budget committed to staff vis-à-vis the number of outputs and the number and size of countries where the project is active. Even if the project had opted to focus its resources entirely on action programmes with implementing partners (and forego the direct lobbying activities in

which its staff have actually engaged), the current staffing arrangement would have been insufficient. This is mainly due to the tight workplan for the actual duration of the project, and to the low capacity of constituents and NGOs in submitting proposals. As noted in section 4.5, proposals from project implementing partners have required many revisions to increase their quality, a process in which the NPC and CTA have been heavily involved. It would have been useful for the project to have a programme assistant or a second NPC based in Indonesia. This is also relevant in relation to the need of the project to be active in 'sending areas' (from where many domestic workers hail). Because of the lack of ILO staff in the provinces, it has been difficult for the project to carry out direct interventions in locations other than the greater Jakarta area.

It is furthermore questionable whether the project document should stipulate outputs that are not under the control of the project. Specifically, until recently it was difficult to achieve legislative changes in Indonesia due to the lack of interest of the Indonesian government in offering legal protection to domestic workers. The critical assumption of sufficient political will – mentioned in the project document (section A9) – could have been expanded and linked to some additional advocacy and lobby activities to help create such political will. On the other hand, it is recognised that legislative changes are one of the most important potential outputs under the project. As such, it is justifiable to include them as one of the focus areas of the project. What is also questionable is the appropriateness of comparing Indonesia and the Philippines and attempting to have the former learn lessons from the experience of the latter. Given the differences in history, culture and political climate (just to name a few factors of importance); it is perhaps not realistic for the project document to state that successful strategies from the Philippines could be applied in Indonesia.

It is noted that the project document does not specify numerical indicators against which project success will be judged, and instead leaves monitoring arrangements as well as development of specific indicators to the project team.

In most other respects, the project is generally well designed and coherent in its analytical framework. The objectives are well linked with each other and with the activities foreseen in the project document. The project document is logical in relation to the inputs, activities, outputs and objectives. The strategies selected by the project are sufficiently innovative, which is appropriate as the technical focus area of the project calls for new approaches.

4. Implementation

4.1 International inputs

Through the ILO, the project's donor the Government of the United Kingdom provided the project with a budget of US\$1,700,000 for its entire duration. Of this amount, US\$734,848 is projected to be spent on project personnel, missions and consultants in all five participating countries (of which US\$125,000 on consultants), US\$50,000 on

subcontracts in Indonesia (after a budget revision in June 2005 reallocated this amount from training and seminars), US\$504,755 on training and seminars, US\$21,628 on equipment, and US\$173,746 on miscellaneous costs.

4.2 Activities

General observations:

The project has carried out a large number of activities as foreseen in the project document, both by funding action programmes implemented by project partners and directly by the project itself. The latter category encompasses important activities such as lobbying and networking. While these activities are all relevant to achieving the project's objective, some implementing partners observed that project activities are not always mutually reinforcing. The review notes that working with a smaller number of project implementing partners might have resulted in a more sustained and coherent approach (e.g. possibility of direct follow-up after support for strategic planning).

It is noted that the project has made special attempts to broaden its activities geographically beyond the capital of Jakarta. The project has made good use of the presence of an ILO programme officer in East Java to start consultations with local stakeholders on the possibility of a local draft ordinance.

While it is widely recognised that support for domestic workers' organisations is necessarily a long-term process due to their limited ability to raise their own funds, it is also important to raise questions about their future self-sufficiency and search for strategies to attain this goal. The project has certainly raised questions of sustainability with the NGOs who are implementing organising and outreach activities. It has piloted limited activities on micro-entrepreneurship (mainly skill training) and has emphasised the importance of capacity building for domestic workers' organisations (especially for their leadership in terms of organisational skills). These efforts are limited in nature due to the short duration of the project and its limited funds, but it should be kept in mind that this is a new technical area for the ILO as well as for donors. In conclusion, it is recommended that the ILO take a long-term perspective concerning the need to organise domestic workers in trade unions (see also recommendations in section 7).

Component 1: Campaigning for protection through law and legislation

Activities under this component have largely followed the outline proposed in the project document. They have included research on trafficking and forced labour, mapping of migrant workers organisations, advocacy on legislative amendments and additional laws and policies, and consultations with stakeholders on policy and legislation.

Indonesia:

Several research activities were carried out in 2004 and 2005. A situation analysis and a study on trafficking and forced labour were commissioned early on in the project. The situation analysis included a detailed review of national legislation, policies and

regulations on domestic work in Indonesia, as well as an overview of relevant organisations and their main programmes and activities. The study on forced labour and trafficking was well conceived but the output has been delayed due to concerns about the quality of the research. It would be useful for the ILO to build up a greater pool of capable consultants who can be drawn upon for these and other activities, and for the project to be stricter in its deadlines. The planned consultation workshop at the end of this research activity is yet to be held. The project is also planning to validate the findings of the research on trafficking and forced labour with the Ministry of Justice and Human Rights and to support the Ministry in conducting strategic planning on implementation of relevant parts of the National Plan of Action on Human Rights.

The project also supported the mapping and needs assessment of migrant workers' organisations. This activity served as a preparation for the strategic planning workshop by the migrant workers' NGO KOPBUMI, and supplied information about the existence and capacity of migrant workers' organisations and networks, with the future aim of building an alliance to represent the interests of migrant workers.

Although the incidence of trafficking in Aceh after the tsunami has been lower than was initially feared and forecast, it was useful for the project to conduct a needs and risk assessment given the limited knowledge available at that time. The project staff report that the study fed into the design of ILO activities in Aceh.

Opinions in the ILO Jakarta offices are divided about the appropriate role to be taken by the ILO concerning lobbying for legislative changes. While some would prefer to see the ILO mainly supporting its constituents or NGOs in their lobbying activities, others believe that ILO staff can usefully improve the capacity of project partners by directly facilitating this lobbying (e.g. holding discussion groups and offering technical inputs). Nevertheless, the project has carried out a variety of advocacy activities for the protection of migrant and domestic workers in Indonesia, based on a careful assessment of the existing structures and information. These activities include the launch of the ILO Report on Forced Labour and related media events, the establishment and facilitation of a working group to draft a national bill, technical assistance to the Ministry of Manpower, and policy formulation workshops and consultations in three provinces.

Destination countries:

In terms of research, the project has commissioned a journalistic documentation of the situation of domestic workers in the three destination countries covered by the project. While the information gathered in this documentation is perhaps already available from other organisations, the reader-friendly nature of the documentation is hoped to make the issues of forced labour and trafficking more easily accessible for a wide audience. Since the consultant has not yet seen a draft of this report, it is not possible to evaluate it.

AMC staff in Hong Kong are engaged in lobbying activities together with (and on behalf of) the Indonesian and Filipina domestic workers' trade unions, vis-à-vis the Hong Kong labour department and the Indonesian and Philippines consulates. In Malaysia, the project

supports the involvement of MTUC in advocacy efforts on domestic workers' rights and policy issues. Activities in Singapore have yet to start.

Component 2: Strengthening outreach and organisation of domestic workers and creating alliances between workers in the formal sector

The project has conducted and funded a wide range of outreach and organising activities with various project partners. Outreach, education and awareness raising efforts have been implemented through NGO partners, using IEC materials newly developed as part of this project. These activities have targeted domestic workers, trade unions, and the wider public, while the development of specific materials for employers is also planned.

Among the more notable activities is the support provided to domestic workers' trade unions and groups in the greater Jakarta area and in Yogyakarta, which includes funding for awareness raising and sensitisation about domestic workers' human and labour rights, for organisational strengthening, and for lobbying. In Yogyakarta, Serikat Pekerja PRT Tunas Mulia, the first trade union of domestic workers, participated in a variety of public campaigns to raise awareness about the needs and issues facing domestic workers. Tunas Mulia members also held frequent meetings with potential and actual members, which led to an increase in membership from 27 at the time of founding in 2003 to around 175 by mid-2005. The union conducts activities in six local areas, which include theatre performances, case handling, solidarity action, public marches, and publishing and circulating a regular newsletter.

Self-organisation of domestic workers in Yogyakarta and the greater Jakarta area has been hindered by various factors, including the lack of time of domestic workers, refusal by employers to permit their domestic worker to attend an event, low enthusiasm if no perceived direct benefits, and limited funds to provide services for members (in part because the dues system does not function well). Taking into account these difficulties, the domestic workers' groups and the NGOs involved in facilitating these activities have been very successful in carrying out a large number of activities with domestic workers.

Activities to build alliances between domestic workers and trade unions and to have been few in number, due to the lack of interest on the part of the majority of Indonesian trade union leaders who were consulted by the project staff and the backstopping officer. Activities leading to effective representation of domestic workers in trade unions – whether domestically or in countries of destination – have not yet been implemented. The project has identified several individual trade union activists who are willing to be involved in unionisation of domestic workers, but it has been difficult to engage Indonesian trade unions directly in workers' education campaigns, alliances, and other forms of collaboration. More outreach and awareness raising among trade unions at the start of the project would have been useful. Despite the reluctance and the lack of interest in the project matter, the project could have conducted more lobbying and sensitisation activities for trade unions on the informal economy in general and on the need to organise domestic workers in particular. Offering project funding for small-scale awareness raising activities on informal workers could perhaps have provided an incentive for trade unions to explore further collaboration.

It is furthermore unfortunate that the project is expected to work first and foremost with those trade union confederations that the ILO recognises as its social partners, because this has made it very difficult for the project to approach smaller (independent) trade unions – especially some outside Jakarta – who have an active interest in gathering members among informal workers. It is noted, however, that the project has engaged with individual trade union activists who have an active interest in informal workers. This has resulted in linkages between the Tunas Mulia domestic workers' trade union in Yogyakarta and a senior female trade union activist (see also sections 3.1, 3.2 and 4.3).

Fatayat NU (a nationwide Muslim women's organisation) has designed and printed two leaflets and held three public dialogues with 500 members each on trafficking and forced labour. These public dialogues could perhaps have had more impact in terms of awareness raising if their target group had been smaller and restricted to one or two major groups, instead of multiple groups. The dialogues raised the question of standard work contracts, offered a model contract to all participants, and featured the signing of a public declaration promising to eradicate trafficking. These are good examples of efforts to achieve concrete and sustainable results.

Destination countries:

Among relevant organisations in destination countries, there has been significant contact between NGOs, domestic workers' organisations and trade unions in Malaysia, which is likely to lead to the main trade union centre offering some type of membership and/or services to domestic workers. MTUC has initiated discussions with two NGOs working with migrant women workers, to explore areas of possible collaboration (e.g. a standard contract for migrant domestic workers). MTUC has also met with representatives from the government and recruitment agencies in order to get a better understanding of the problems and needs of migrant domestic workers. The organisation reports that it is in the process of obtaining the necessary approval from government agencies to establish an association for migrant domestic workers. In Hong Kong, the two domestic workers' trade unions have initiated joint campaigning with the main trade union centres for wage protection and against underpayment of domestic workers at the occasion of International Labour Day. They have plans to conduct another joint campaign on International Migrants Day.

Component 3: Supporting domestic workers' rights through technical assistance and capacity building

Largely in accordance with the proposed activities in the project document, the project has conducted a wide variety of capacity building activities with diverse implementing partners. In the process, the project has forged new partnerships and has opened up opportunities for new types of activities and strategies in the future.

A new training package for Indonesian diplomats through the **Ministry of Foreign Affairs** will be piloted in October 2005, with plans for follow-up testing in one overseas mission. The project has also developed and tested training materials on counselling for department of labour staff and other relevant officials at local level, through the **Ministry**

of Manpower and Transmigration. These activities were conducted at a later stage than originally envisaged, due to lengthy negotiations about the proposal. The Ministry has since combined the activities under the ILO project with its own output to create an integrated training module that addresses both counselling and basic labour rights.

As proposed in the project document, the Genprom training manual on women migrant workers was translated and adapted for use in Indonesia, though with some delays. Posters and leaflets on forced labour and trafficking were produced for wide dissemination and use in capacity building activities. These materials will no doubt be very useful for the project, but could have been put to use earlier and more effectively if they had been completed at the beginning of the project. The delay appears to have been due to the busy schedules of relevant ILO office personnel and project staff.

Although the project document does not explicitly call for capacity building activities with **employers' organisations**, the project has taken the positive step of making efforts to collaborate with the associations that unite private recruitment agencies for the domestic and the migrant markets. It has been difficult to get the national employers' organisation APINDO involved because of its stated concern for formal sector employers only (see above). Activities with private recruitment agencies (both for domestic and for international placement) are starting after extensive discussions about both their needs and the ILO's strategic role in promoting protection of workers rather than the commercial interests of these agencies. It is expected that these activities will contribute in the long run to improving the quality of services provided by employment agencies to domestic workers.

The project collaborated with the ILO projects on youth employment and child labour in Indonesia to support a training seminar for **trade union officials** on organising workers in the informal economy, including migrant and domestic workers (May 2005). The project has developed plans to follow-up on the results of this workshop in the second half of 2005. The difficulties in creating activities involving trade union representatives have been noted previously in this section.

Among capacity building activities supported by the project with organisations other than ILO constituents are: the second membership and strategic planning meeting of Serikat PRT Tunas Mulia, the domestic workers' union in Yogyakarta (May 2005); a strategic planning workshop on trafficking for Fatayat NU, a Muslim mass women's organisation (March 2005); a joint forum and strategic planning workshop for the three main Muslim women's organisations (June 2005); the second congress of the Federation of Indonesian Migrant Labour Organisations (FOBMI) (April 2005); and a national dialogue to build an alliance of migrant workers' organisations (May 2005). These strategic planning activities have resulted in action plans which include elements that could be supported by the project in a possible second phase.

Destination countries:

In destination countries, the project is working with AMC in Hong Kong to build capacity among Indonesian and Filipina domestic workers' trade unions on advocacy and

lobbying. Training activities have been conducted for the two organisations on migrant human rights advocacy and on gender and health. The manual used for these training activities is being translated into Indonesian. As a direct result, one domestic worker who participated in the training has taken her employer to court complaining of underpayment. The project has also funded the design and printing of a brochure on these two local organisations and their structure, which has been distributed widely to current and potential union members. These and other activities with AMC have been implemented without any major difficulties, but according to AMC staff they could be up-scaled significantly and become more sustainable if the two domestic workers' trade unions had full-time staff to manage their office, consolidate their dues system and strengthen their organisation through fund-raising. Because it is hoped that local donors or employer contributions could cover the expenses of having full-time staff, the project could focus in the future on strengthening fund-raising skills for the two trade unions.

The project is planning to collaborate with the Migrant Forum Asia to hold a regional meeting for MFA network organisations and trade unions and to conduct capacity building on reintegration of migrant workers with these organisations in Indonesia, Singapore and Malaysia. The project also intends to support MFA in conducting a campaign on migrant workers' rights and sensitisation and capacity building on how to reach out and unionise migrant workers.

Component 4: Targeted interventions through demonstration programmes

Very few activities have been carried out to date under this component, reflecting justifiable concerns of the project staff (and ILO Jakarta management) about sustainability of the outputs (e.g. shelters, monitoring systems, vocational training, skills upgrading) (see also sections 3.4 and 5.3). In addition, some of the activities called for in the project document require collaboration with agencies that are not traditional partners of the ILO and that have little interest in protecting domestic workers or promoting their rights (e.g. Jamsostek on social security and the Ministry of Social Welfare). Given the difficulty in establishing a working relationship with these partners and given that domestic workers are not a priority for any government agency when it comes to poverty reduction or training and education programmes, it is understandable that the project has carried out few of the activities under this component.

However, the project has through its NGO implementing partners offered non-formal education to small groups of domestic workers in the greater Jakarta area ('Paket C' or senior high school equivalent) and has offered vocational training (sewing and cooking lessons, handicrafts). The problem with such activities is that they mainly help small groups of domestic workers in finding alternative employment or supplementary means of income-generation. They do little to raise the profile of domestic work or to improve conditions of work. Therefore, while it is heartening that small numbers of domestic workers have found alternative and better paid employment (e.g. as seamstresses), project resources may be better used for awareness raising, capacity building for organisations, and organising activities.

Destination countries:

Regarding migrant domestic workers, AMC (one of the project partners in Hong Kong,) is using project funds to create educational materials to raise awareness about its “Migrants’ Savings Alternative Investment” scheme. This type of activity should be continued and expanded during the next six months and in a potential second phase of the project. The project could also provide capacity building and other technical assistance to Indonesian local NGOs with networks among migrant workers who could establish savings schemes.

4.3 Outputs

General observations:

The project has made a significant contribution in terms of **strengthening the capacity** of partner organisations in planning their activities and writing effective proposals. Through its intensive assistance to NGOs in particular, the project has provided technical assistance that is likely to be of great use for these organisations in the years to come.

Outputs under component 1:

- National recognition and inclusion of domestic work within existing labour laws; and
- Preparation of policy guidelines on domestic work, forced labour and trafficking.

Indonesia and destination countries:

The research carried out in Indonesia and about Indonesian migrant workers abroad has contributed to growing recognition of the problems frequently associated with domestic work. Since the knowledge base was quite low at the start of the project, it was appropriate to commission situational and needs assessments. However, the study on forced labour and trafficking has been significantly delayed and many project implementing partners and members of the PAC would like to see the findings disseminated as fast as possible and in easily accessible format. This would contribute to stimulating national debate. The needs assessment and mapping of migrant workers’ organisations has contributed to reaching the output by making available detailed information on the existing organisations and networks and their needs for capacity building. The risk and needs assessment in Aceh was necessitated by the tsunami but similarly contributed to the knowledge base and national recognition of the problem of trafficking and forced labour in Indonesia. The journalistic and reader-friendly documentation on trafficking and forced labour in destination countries supported by the project is expected to offer a means to increase national recognition of the scale and the complexity of the problems. It remains to be seen if and how this documentation can be linked to lobbying and advocacy efforts relating to policy and legislation.

Advocacy efforts for changes in national legislation have all contributed to increasing the recognition of domestic work as an issue of importance and of domestic workers as deserving labour and social protection. Although a national bill on protection of domestic workers is unlikely to materialise during the current project period, the above activities have resulted in a (NGO) framework for a draft bill and a listing on the Parliament’s waiting list for public hearings. Moreover, the project has supported local consultations

and lobby efforts in East, Central and West Java to develop or amend a provincial legal framework. This support was necessitated by the fact that development of national legislation appeared very unlikely during the first year of project operations.

In short, while neither national nor local legislation on domestic work has been achieved, the project has made considerable progress towards reaching this output. Sustained lobbying efforts and continued consultations among stakeholders could very well see national legislation become a reality in the next few years.

Destination countries:

AMC staff report that local lobbying activities by the Indonesian and Filipina domestic workers' unions have had some success, as the Indonesian consulate conveyed the demand for action on reduction of agency fees and underpayment to the Department of Labour and Manpower in Jakarta, which has since requested AMC and IMWU to present case documentation.

Outputs under component 2:

- Organised domestic worker organisations and associations at the national and international levels;
- Alliances built between migrant and local domestic workers and national and international trade unions; and
- A joint advocacy campaign for the recognition of domestic workers' rights.

Indonesia:

The project has funded outreach and organising activities conducted by NGOs and already existing domestic workers' organisations in Jakarta and Yogyakarta. IEC materials produced by the project are generally of a high standard and well designed. However, because the output as described in the project document is somewhat unclear (it could refer to existing or new organisations and associations), it is difficult to evaluate to what extent the output has been realised. The existing organisations have benefited from the project's assistance in that they have increased their membership and have strengthened their organisational capacity and self-management skills. However, they remain mostly local in character, with the exception of their participation in the national network Jala PRT. As mentioned before, concerns have been raised about the sustainability of support for organising activities.

Alliances between migrant and local domestic workers and trade unions have been realised only to a limited extent. This is mostly due to the lack of interest by national trade unions in Indonesia, despite attempts by the project to raise awareness and create interest as called for by the project document. While some individual trade union activists are aware of the need to involve informal workers and have shown commitment to helping domestic workers become union members, these efforts are yet to translated to the organisational level.

For this same reason, the project has not yet been able to conduct a joint advocacy campaign for the recognition of domestic workers' rights in Indonesia. The project could

have made more efforts to communicate and collaborate with relevant international trade union federations which could in turn have tried to influence their national centres and affiliates.

Destination countries:

Project activities in Hong Kong and Malaysia with international NGOs and some trade union federations have made some progress towards the establishment of alliances between domestic workers' organisations and trade unions. At the occasion of May Day (2005), the Indonesian and Filipina domestic workers' unions conducted a public campaign and rally in collaboration with the local trade union centres. Some 2,500 domestic workers attended the rally (whereas 500 people had been expected). Furthermore, domestic workers' organisations in Hong Kong have been able to hold dialogues with local decision-making bodies and with the Indonesian and Philippines consulates on domestic workers' rights. The AMC reported that it had been requested by the Indonesian consulate to attend a meeting on excessive agency fees and underpayment of Indonesian domestic workers in Hong Kong.

In Malaysia, the project has been able to involve the Malaysian Trades Union Congress (MTUC) in conducting public advocacy and monthly dialogue sessions with the main stakeholders. This initiative constitutes an important step towards building alliances between domestic workers and trade unions, although it is unclear to what extent domestic workers themselves are involved in this initiative with MTUC. In Hong Kong, the project also offers support for the already existing trade unions of domestic workers from Indonesia and the Philippines through its work with the Asian Migrant Centre. However, as mentioned above, given the unclear formulation of the output (2.1), the review cannot answer the question to what extent the output has been realised.

Outputs under component 3:

- Trained officials and staff of national and regional domestic workers' organisations and trade unions; and
- Trained and sensitised government agencies at the national and regional levels.

Indonesia:

The project has supported a wide range of training activities on human and labour rights and has adapted existing ILO manuals, but has in fact taken the more strategic approach of supporting the development of new and tailored training materials and courses, training of trainers workshops, strategic planning events, and national and local dialogues to build networks and alliances. With respect to training for government officials, while it is encouraging that the project has realised its output and has thus contributed to achieving the objective (though the consultant has seen no numerical indicator for this output), any concrete improvements in services for and attitudes towards domestic/migrant workers can only be measured in the long-term. Evaluations of training activities and feedback from users of government services will in the future be able to shed light on the question of impact of training activities. The same applies to capacity building of employers' organisations. Although private recruitment agencies have indicated willingness to collaborate with the project, it remains uncertain to what extent

they will seriously implement activities such as self-regulation which go beyond (or even against) their direct commercial interests.

Destination countries:

In Hong Kong, Malaysia and Singapore, the project is providing support for strengthening the organisational capacity of domestic workers' unions, in collaboration with local NGOs concerned with migrant workers' rights. In Malaysia, the project is also strengthening the capacity of the main trade union congress to reach out to and provide services for domestic workers. Through these activities, the project appears to be reaching new staff and officials of domestic workers' organisations and trade unions whose capacity needed to be strengthened. According to the Indonesian staff member of the AMC in Hong Kong, members of the Filipina and Indonesian domestic workers' unions thought the training activities on migrant workers' rights and on gender and health were very useful and increased their confidence. However, as the consultant has not seen any needs assessment or evaluation report, it is difficult to say to what extent these capacity building activities have concerned new areas of knowledge and skills and were directly useful.

Outputs under component 4:

- Strengthened national referral mechanisms that systematise, upgrade the quality and coordinate crisis interventions for adult and child domestic workers;
- Improved education and employment opportunities for adult and child domestic workers; and
- Improved health and social protection coverage for adult and child domestic workers.

Indonesia:

The project has chosen not to focus activities and resource allocation on component four, mainly due to serious concerns about sustainability of the outputs (see also sections 3.4 and 5.3 on concerns about sustainability). As the latest progress report correctly asserts, government and private in-country structures and resources to sustain community-based activities and new institutions are still lacking in Indonesia. The lack of interest on the part of the few service providers that already exist, the low priority accorded to domestic workers, and the relatively weak capacity of those organisations tasked to provide education and employment opportunities also contributed to this decision (see section 3.4 on additional reasons related to staff and resources). As a result, the project has not realised its outputs under component 4.

Destination countries:

No activities appear to have been carried out under component four that would lead to the realisation of the outputs in destination countries.

4.4 Management and coordination

The mid-term review has noted several strengths and weaknesses with regard to management and coordination arrangements and practice. These are also reflected in the sections on recommendations and lessons learned.

The **selection** of project implementing partners and PAC members was done in a collaborative fashion using the available knowledge in the ILO Jakarta office. The project has approached several government ministries that are not the usual technical cooperation partners of the ILO and has forged working relationships with them, which will be useful for future activities in this and other technical fields.

The significant delay in hiring of the CTA appears to have been due to lengthy procedures in ILO Headquarters. The project has also suffered from weaknesses in communication between the various ILO offices involved in the project, in particular the unclear division of roles and technical responsibilities between the project and backstopping (and other) staff in HQ and the field offices in Manila and Jakarta (perhaps not unclear in theory, but certainly so in practice). SAP-FL (the unit responsible for project backstopping in HQ) and project staff based in Jakarta appear to have disagreed on the joint funding or joint implementation of some project activities.

The project could also have benefited from having a clear set of **guidelines for design of proposals and formats for reporting**, as several project implementing partners complained about not having received sufficient information at the start of their collaboration with the project. This led to delays in implementation of activities, as many proposals had to be revised numerous times before receiving approval. It must also be noted that some project implementing partners have very little experience in writing proposals and had difficulty in designing coherent plans of action. As this appears to be a common problem in projects that rely on small action programmes for delivery of outputs, the project could have benefited from a more structured approach to building capacity among partner organisations, in particular disseminating proposal requirements and holding workshops on planning and design of activities (e.g. using IPEC materials and approaches). While it is understood that project partners 'came on board' at different stages of the project, it could have been useful to hold a common orientation session for potential partners such as NGOs and trade unions at an early stage in the project.

The delivery of outputs could have benefited from greater clarity at the start of the project in terms of how to handle **subcontracts** with project partners. It appears that a budget line for subcontracts was finally set up in the middle of 2005. Up to that point, all activities were handled through either external collaboration contracts or under budget line 32 for training and seminars. Greater knowledge of ILO procedures would also have aided project staff in facilitating proposal submission and processing of contracts. This related especially to detailed guidelines on proposal requirements and reporting formats, as mentioned also in section 4.5.

Several implementing partners (NGOs) are of the opinion that the delivery of project outputs is also slowed down by the ILO's requirement for detailed information about proposed expenditure. They believe that the CTA is asking for **excessive accountability**, which could imply a lack of trust and which creates administrative hurdles for NGO partners. Given the obvious need to follow ILO administrative and financial procedures in an environment where proposals with inflated budgets are not uncommon, it is

sometimes difficult to strike a balance between accountability and trust. The project could perhaps learn from IPEC's experience with NGO implementing partners to find a balanced solution.

Several implementing partners expressed disappointment that information about outputs (e.g. research findings) had not been shared between the various organisations involved in the project. (Research findings are in fact not yet ready for sharing). This is in part due to the low frequency of **PAC meetings** (October 2004 and August 2005), which is in turn due to the difficulty in getting project partners together and in managing the sharp differences of opinion that exist between some partner organisations. Project and other ILO staff appear to have explored the possibility of having two types of committees or a working group, but decided to continue with the current arrangement to avoid confusion and to keep a broad range of partners informed about the project.

Lastly, implementation of project activities in destination countries has started only recently, due to the **absence of ILO staff** in these countries, as well as the need to build new working relationships with implementing partners (due to the lack of a history of ILO technical assistance in most of these countries).

4.5 External factors

As noted in the project's progress reports, the **tsunami** in December 2004 and its aftermath caused the project's staff to have to spend considerable time on issues not related to core objectives of the project, and to commit some resources to areas that the project had not intended to cover. While the need for the ILO to respond to this extraordinary disaster is appreciated, the project suffered further delays in its implementation as a result.

A second external factor that caused delays in implementation is the uncertainty in terms of high-level official appointments and political agenda as a result of the national parliamentary **elections** in October 2004. As mentioned in the project's progress reports, reshuffling in ministries and reluctance in government offices to commit staff and resources to the project resulted in delays in holding Project Advisory Committee meetings. While this could to some extent have been foreseen, it is difficult to think of ways for the project and for the ILO in general to overcome this obstacle.

The project's progress report also notes that the exodus of Indonesian migrant workers from Malaysia in late 2004 and early 2005 to escape **deportation** also negatively affected project activities, due to the disruption of informal networks among migrant workers and the reduction in the number of experienced activists. The consultant has not been in a position to verify this information, though it is well-known that the (threat of) deportation caused a large number of migrant workers to flee.

5. Performance

5.1 Relevance

During the mid-term review, many project partners affirmed the relevance of the project's objectives and activities to their operations. The employers' organisations are an important exception. The All-Indonesia Association of Placement Agencies (APPSI) and the Indonesian Manpower Services Association (APJATI) were somewhat in doubt about how the project could benefit them directly, which is understandable given that they are often portrayed as a cause of the many problems facing domestic workers. However, their representatives voiced approval of the project's objective of eradicating abuse of domestic workers, and recognised that their organisations have a role to play in the project. The representative from the main employers' organisation APINDO, on the other hand, was of the opinion that the project was not relevant to her organisation, since APINDO focuses mainly on large-scale employers in the formal sector. APINDO therefore has not offered to become involved in the project, beyond attending PAC meetings to be informed and share opinions.

The consultant was asked to meet with only one representative from the trade unions who is a long-term activist with an interest in women's and gender issues and who is committed to include vulnerable groups of (informal) workers in the membership of her trade union federation. However, if the consultant had met with other representatives, it is likely that different opinions would have emerged about the relevance of the project to the trade union movement in Indonesia. The need for awareness raising and education for trade union officials regarding the importance of representing informal workers remains very high. Generally speaking, the Indonesian trade union movement appears not yet fully aware of the risks of ignoring informal workers, in the context of decreasing union membership among formal workers and the growing size of the informal economy and the number of workers without job security. Further ILO technical assistance is required for Indonesian trade unions to adapt more quickly to these changing economic realities.

On a more general note, the project's focus on protection of domestic workers fits well with the growing international attention to labour migration, and the Indonesian government appears to have become more attentive to the problems facing migrant workers. The approach of the project – a combination of awareness raising, advocacy, research, outreach and direct interventions- was acknowledged by most project partners to be innovative and useful.

5.2 Effectiveness

The problems facing domestic workers – both in Indonesia and overseas – remain serious and are unlikely to decrease significantly in the coming years, as few government agencies and employers' organisations appear to have taken concrete steps to address them. In addition to these difficulties, it should also be emphasised that it is difficult to change perceptions and attitudes towards migrant and domestic work and to achieve legislative and policy changes in a short period of time. As stated in section 3.3, the objective of eradication of the worst abuses against domestic workers was and remains unrealistic, as was the target group of 20,000 beneficiaries. Nevertheless, the project has had some concrete impact in Indonesia and destination countries and is making progress

in several important areas, most notably in improving recognition of domestic workers' right to protection.

Given the limited staffing of the project in Indonesia compared to the country's size and the severity of the problems facing domestic workers, the project has made good progress in building support for and expertise regarding legislation and policies to protect domestic workers from forced labour, trafficking and other human rights abuses. The slow pace of legislative reform in Indonesia is not a reflection of the project lacking effectiveness, but rather constitutes a factor largely beyond the control of the project. Realising this, the project staff has supported and strengthened key organisations and important coalitions and networks that will continue to advocate for better protection of domestic and migrant workers after the end of the project. Yet, it is important to reiterate that some of the project activities appear to be rather 'stand-alone', requiring better follow-up as part of a coherent strategy for project implementation.

While the direct target group has enjoyed limited direct benefits from the project to date, the project has made considerable efforts at the meso-level to ensure that the relevant civil society organisations are better able to provide the necessary technical assistance. Although attempts to collaborate with trade union officials have not yet resulted in concrete benefits for domestic workers (for reasons mentioned earlier), the project has made progress in drawing private recruitment agencies into the project and by extension into the arena of protection of domestic workers. As with many of the project's capacity building and awareness raising activities, the impact of this planned collaboration will probably become clear in the long-run rather than at the end of the project.

Although there is no evidence yet of new or improved government services for domestic or migrant workers, the project has had some important impact. Through its study on forced labour and trafficking, the project has provided guidance to the Ministry of Justice and Human Rights in conducting strategic planning. Training activities with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs have been well-received and may become incorporated into the Ministry's own curriculum, pending successful pilot testing. The same has been reported about training activities with the Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration.

Similarly, capacity building and technical assistance to domestic workers, migrant workers and relevant NGOs should not be expected to have short-term results but should rather be seen as important steps towards building the general climate in which domestic workers can claim their rights to protection. For example, the project's support for the second congress of FOBMI (association of Indonesian migrant workers organisations) and its inclusion in the second PAC meeting facilitated the official establishment of the Indonesian Migrant Workers' Union (SBMI). SBMI believes that its standing vis-à-vis government and employment agencies has increased now that it is recognised as a trade union. Furthermore, several NGO partners are satisfied that the project has contributed to putting pressure on the government and employment agencies by using its influence as an international organisation to get all relevant organisations together around the table.

The project has unfortunately not been successful in identifying or creating linkages between domestic workers and service providers or crisis interventions, whether government agencies, private initiatives, civil society organisations, or other donor-funded projects. There is generally a lack of such infrastructure in much of Indonesia, while the ongoing devolution of power from the central government to local structures furthermore complicates efforts to identify suitable partners. The outputs proposed for the project component on direct interventions were perhaps not realistic in view of the project's limited duration and resources and the relative absence of government initiatives with which the project could create partnerships. It is hoped that the feasibility of these outputs can be discussed or studied in more detail, before a second phase or other type of follow-up to the current project is proposed.

In short, the project is making significant progress towards greater protection for domestic workers from forced labour, trafficking and other human rights abuses. In particular, the likelihood of national and/or local legislation being passed in the near future and the increasing recognition of domestic work as an area of responsibility for government institutions and employers' associations contribute to the immediate objective. As outlined throughout this review, the project could have been more effective in reaching out to trade unions and exploring what types of direct intervention have the potential to become self-sustainable in the future.

5.3 Sustainability

As mentioned in sections 3.4 and 4.2, there are serious concerns about the level of sustainability of activities planned under the project's component on direct interventions. It is recognised that direct interventions for domestic workers are necessary to demonstrate the possibility of providing services for vulnerable workers in the informal economy and to ensure that the NGOs who carry them out have credibility and legitimacy when conducting advocacy on behalf of domestic workers. However, many of the services require relatively large amounts of funding and it is therefore unrealistic to expect either NGOs or domestic workers' organisations to carry these costs themselves after the project ends. These services should ultimately be provided by government agencies, by volunteer organisations or through employer contributions, rather than by NGOs using international donor funds. Activities that create or strengthen linkages between domestic workers and such service providers have a greater likelihood of being sustained after the end of the project and should be the focus of the project. Yet, in Indonesia few of these service providers exist or have the capacity or political will to include domestic workers as their clients. On the other hand, project activities (e.g. skill training) that help a small number of domestic workers to find alternative employment do not constitute a sustainable use of the project's funds, as they are not likely to lead to improvements in the overall position of domestic workers in general or their organisations.

Project activities with domestic workers' organisations in Jakarta and Yogyakarta appear likely to require further external funding in the future if they are to be maintained. While the dues system of these organisations is not yet fully functioning, it is uncertain if

income through dues alone is ever going to be sufficient to cover all operating costs. Hence, the capacity for fund-raising among domestic workers (possibly from donors but preferably through sales of handicrafts and other products or services) needs further strengthening. The project has funded efforts in this direction which could be intensified in the remaining months.

At the time of the mid-term review, the Ministry of Labour and Manpower indicated that it would include the training materials on counselling for migrant workers and their families in its training materials (though it is unknown if any budget is available to carry out training in the coming years). The Ministry of Foreign Affairs is awaiting finalisation of the training materials and the results of the planned TOT for consular staff, hence it cannot yet give an indication of the likelihood of incorporating the materials in its own training curriculum.

It is worthwhile repeating that in the view of the consultant, many of the project's activities constitute important contributions to long-term aims in relation to protection of domestic workers. As such, to expect them to be self-sustainable after less than two years or to expect government or private agencies to fund or replicate them is unrealistic, especially given the low level of public concern about domestic workers. However, before further funding is granted to NGOs and domestic workers' organisations, it would be useful to conduct an assessment of the potential for future (self-)sustainability of these organisations and their activities.

5.4 Efficiency

As has been noted in previous sections, project implementation could have been more efficient in terms of timeliness of achievement of outputs. Due to late hiring of project staff, the delivery of outputs has been less efficient than would have been possible under the projected circumstances. However, project staff in Indonesia has made considerable efforts to speed up delivery during the past year, especially since the start of the NPC in October 2004. The CTA together with the ILO Jakarta Office had already conducted national consultations and capacity building activities with trade unions and NGOs, as well as initiated research activities before the NPC started her contract.

Delivery of outputs during the past 12 months has been hindered by the slow pace of approval of proposals submitted by implementing partners. Section 4.4 on Management and Coordination already noted the main factors that have hindered efficient delivery of outputs. Of these factors, the slow processing of proposals is being addressed by the project's staff. The project could have replicated or adapted proposal guidelines and reporting formats used by other ILO projects (e.g. IPEC).

The project has partnered with other ILO projects for implementation of several activities, thus increasing impact with limited resources, e.g. IPEC, Youth Employment, migration study. The project has also partnered with two other ILO projects to fund a programme officer in East Java who has been able to facilitate activities in this province, such as consultations on a new draft local ordinance to protect domestic workers.

The project has made efficient use of its budget for consultants, for example by hiring an intern. Although it would have been useful to hire a programme assistant with language skills and extensive knowledge of the subject matter who could facilitate the process of negotiating technical proposals in Indonesia, this was not possible due to budget restrictions.

5.5 Unanticipated effects

Project activities in Hong Kong had an unexpected but positive multiplier effect. Membership of the Indonesian Migrant Workers Union (IMWU) in Hong Kong increased by 200 people as a result of awareness raising and campaigning on International Labour Day (1 May 2005).

5.6 Alternative strategies

Partner organisations did not raise any alternative strategies during their discussions with the consultant. The project employed several novel strategies to improve the situation of domestic workers, in particular capacity building for self-organisation and lobbying and advocacy for legislative changes. In the future, it might be useful for the ILO to forge and expand its linkages with private recruitment agencies, in order to explore collaboration and the need for technical assistance. Although the current project includes some activities with private recruitment agencies, this is a large and mostly unexplored area that requires new strategies as well as sufficient caution.

The project could also make more efforts in the future to work with women's organisations such as the National Commission on Violence Against Women (Komnas Perempuan). The issues concerning domestic workers could be inserted into or linked with the networking and research currently being carried out by Komnas Perempuan. These include awareness raising and accountability using the Law on Violence Against Women, and activities by the Gerakan Perempuan untuk Perlindungan Buruh Migran (GPPBM – Women's Movement for Migrants' Rights) which was established in 2000 and comprises 17 women's organisations active in advocacy and awareness raising. In general, it would be worthwhile for the ILO to explore greater collaboration with the women's movement, or at least regular exchange of information and updates on activities to the extent that human resources permit.

6. Special concerns

6.1 International labour standards

The project has promoted ILS through its advocacy and awareness raising activities and through its capacity-building activities. In particular, project beneficiaries (domestic workers) and implementing partners (mainly NGOs) have learned about the principles and contents of the ILO Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29), as well as the ILO

mechanisms for improving constituents' accountability in upholding the principles of decent work.

6.2 Equality and gender issues

The project has clearly taken into account gender as one of several factors causing the problems experienced by domestic workers, as outlined in the project analysis. It has sufficiently ensured that its interventions are gender sensitive and address the needs of both men and women among the target group. Through its capacity-building activities, the project has promoted the general principle of gender equality and its importance for domestic workers. Domestic workers targeted in outreach and organising activities have learned about gender equality through their regular discussion meetings.

6.3 Environmental factors

No environmental factors can be mentioned that are relevant to this project.

7. Findings, conclusions and recommendations

7.1 Findings

Careful analysis of project activities and outputs, and discussions with project implementing partners and PAC participants have revealed a number of notable achievements by the project as well as some shortcomings and weaknesses. Despite limitations in staffing, the project has been able to implement a large number of activities in Indonesia and destination countries. These activities have covered three of the four components envisaged in the project document. Project staff members have raised concerns about the sustainability of outputs under component four (direct interventions) and have opted to focus the project's resources on the first three components. This decision is by and large justified, given the short duration of the project.

In general, the activities in Indonesia and destination countries have resulted in the projected outputs being delivered, with the exception of those outputs related to trade union involvement. The project design was flawed in its unstated assumption that trade unions would regard the project as relevant to their operations and objectives, and Indonesian trade unions were not consulted during the design of the project or prior to the launch of the project. Hence, the limited involvement of trade unions only partially reflects shortcomings in project management and implementation. More frequent consultations with Indonesian trade union officials at an early stage of the project might have resulted in greater collaboration at a later stage of project implementation. On a positive note, the project has made some advances in creating linkages between trade unions and domestic workers in destination countries.

The project has conducted and facilitated a large number of activities on advocacy and lobbying for legislation and policy. In particular, it has been successful in putting

domestic work, trafficking and forced labour on the agenda of relevant government ministries and agencies, and in strengthening important coalitions and networks involved in policy advocacy. While legislation and policy to protect Indonesian domestic workers will probably not be realised during the life of the project, there is sufficient momentum as well as monitoring by NGOs to make passage of legislation likely to happen in the next five years.

Other areas of success of the project in Indonesia include the efforts at capacity building from which a large number of important meso-level organisations on migrant and domestic workers have benefited, and the new partnerships that have been forged with important stakeholders such as associations of private recruitment agencies, and NGOs and trade unions in destination countries.

The review has noted some shortcomings with regard to the project's design. These mainly concern the unrealistic objective and target group, the lack of assessment of Indonesian partner/implementing organisations, and lack of clarity concerning some outputs. Concerns about the sustainability of the direct interventions component as well as the challenge of reaching these outputs with very limited resources in a very large country have also been raised. On the whole, however, the project document presents a strong problem analysis and is well designed in terms of strategies, outputs and activities.

Project implementation has been hindered by numerous problems. Some of these have affected the project as a whole, such as late hiring of the CTA, weaknesses in communication between ILO offices, and the absence of ILO staff in destination countries. Others are particular to project implementation in Indonesia, such as the late hiring of the NPC, insufficient consultations with constituents prior to the project's launch, difficulties in processing proposals from implementing partners, and ineffective and infrequent PAC meetings. The review has also noted several external factors that have hindered project implementation or made modifications necessary (tsunami, elections and deportations in Malaysia). Taken together, these problems have caused significant delays in the delivery of outputs, which in turn have made it impossible for the project staff to achieve maximum impact during the project's duration. The sections on recommendations and lessons learned will explore the extent to which (and how) these problems could have been foreseen.

7.2 Conclusions

While the project will not achieve its unrealistic objective of eradicating the worst forms of abuse of domestic workers, it certainly has laid the foundations for effective future action that can offer concrete benefits for domestic workers in Indonesia and destination countries. National and/or local legislation and policies to protect domestic workers are likely to be realised in Indonesia in the next five years, as a result of the project's successes in strengthening advocacy and lobbying networks. The improved capacity of Indonesian NGOs to conduct lobbying and advocacy on behalf of domestic and migrant workers has increased their legitimacy as well as their national and international linkages. In Indonesia, the project has forged new partnerships with private recruitment agencies

(for national and overseas placement) and with government institutions other than the traditional ILO constituents. In destination countries, the project has initiated and strengthened collaboration between NGOs, domestic workers' unions and national trade unions. These achievements are important in terms of bringing together the stakeholders at regional, national and local levels and putting domestic work, trafficking, and forced labour on the agenda of government institutions, recruitment agencies and some trade union federations.

The project has suffered from weaknesses in design which have seen it operate in a large geographical area with relatively few staff members, and have expected the project to collaborate with unwilling constituents who lack serious interest in domestic work and do not regard it as relevant to their mandate (trade union centres and the main employers' organisation in Indonesia). The mid-term review also has raised concerns over delays in delivery caused by late staff hiring, weaknesses in communication, the lack of ILO structure in destination countries, and lack of preparation on how to process proposals from implementing partners.

The mid-term review has raised questions about the sustainability of project outputs. Several outputs under component four (direct interventions) have been dropped due to concerns about sustainability in the absence of sufficient national resources and interest (both private and government). While the project has engaged in direct interventions for domestic workers by supporting relevant NGOs, it is likely that the outputs from these activities cannot be continued independently beyond the project's life and will require further donor support. This may be inevitable, as organising of domestic workers requires funds that are beyond the fundraising abilities of domestic workers' own fledgling organisations. Furthermore, it is important for the ILO to offer concrete benefits for domestic workers through this project and for NGOs to have credibility and in-depth knowledge of the situation to back up their advocacy efforts on behalf of domestic workers. Nevertheless, concerns about sustainability have not yet been sufficiently addressed and will require more attention from technical officers involved in this field as well as from the donor community in general.

7.3 Recommendations

At a general level, it is recommended that the project be extended or that a second phase be explored with the donor. The main reason for this recommendation is that the severity and the extent of the problems faced by domestic workers – both domestically and overseas – require a multi-pronged approach that is sustained over a period of at least five years. The duration of current project is too short to expect significant improvements, whether in legislative changes, in trade union involvement, or in the capacity for self-organisation among domestic workers.

For the remaining six months of project implementation, it is recommended that the project in Indonesia focus on awareness raising and advocacy for policy and legislation. The impact of awareness raising is difficult to measure but the project has built up good partnerships with a variety of organisations with grassroots networks, and has developed

materials. These should be put to effective use in the next six months, through collaboration with organisations in the women's movement and the labour movement. It is also important for advocacy for policy and legislation to continue. Although the project has little control over the possible passage of new legislation, keeping the momentum going constitutes an effective use of project resources. It is useful to ensure that capable NGOs are ready to submit alternative drafts and advocate for amendments when national or local governments are ready to discuss legislation.

Although organising of domestic workers and providing or improving access to services are important for the target group, these are probably not areas in which the ILO or the project can offer its greatest added value. The project partners involved in outreach to and organising of domestic workers have done so very well, considering the difficult circumstances in which they operate. However, as these efforts are not (yet) sustainable, it is recommended that the project in the remaining six months focus on the activities mentioned above. One possible exception is holding a roundtable discussion with the involved organisations together with donor and other international organisations with experience in this field, to explore cost-effective ways to make domestic workers' organisations sustainable.

A. Project activities

Short-term:

- Focus on capacity building and advocacy, because these are the areas in which the ILO has a comparative advantage. Limit these activities to already established project partners, in order to increase impact and contribute to a coherent approach.
- Assist NGO partners in finding cost-effective ways to make outreach, direct interventions and awareness raising for domestic workers sustainable, e.g. through roundtable discussions with donors and other involved international organisations.
- Disseminate research findings in easily accessible format.
- Involve Fatayat NU as well as other Muslim women's organisations that have nationwide networks on the ground in awareness raising. Collaborate with these organisations to convey messages about domestic workers' rights to and through religious leaders.
- Explore greater partnerships with government agencies to lobby for a Domestic Workers' Bill. For example, involve MenNegPP in its role as coordinating body in discussions on how to gain political support for proposed national legislation and how to involve national police in implementation and monitoring. Support the Department of Human Rights (Ministry of Justice and Human Rights) in efforts to lobby for legislation on domestic workers and to harmonise draft legislation proposed by the project (partners) with other (local, national and international) human rights legislation and instruments.
- In Indonesian provinces with high incidence of trafficking and forced labour, support the provincial networks already established by the Ministry of Justice in capacity building, information dissemination and sensitisation.
- Support AMC to conduct regional consultations and advocacy efforts (where outputs are concrete), and to set up a referral system informing migrant domestic workers of available services in destination countries and ways to access these.

- Conduct media campaigns with project partners where it is proven to be a cost-effective way of reaching a well-defined audience.
- Intensify efforts to raise awareness of trade union leaders on the importance of engaging with informal workers, e.g. through roundtable discussions, through international trade union centres, in collaboration with other projects working with new or especially vulnerable target groups, in coalition with NGOs, by lobbying for internal trade union policy changes, and by implementing concrete demonstration activities that show informal workers as reliable trade union members.
- Support linkages between mainstream trade unions and domestic workers' organisations, such as internships, collaboration on workers' education activities, participation in each other's national or regional meetings, and sharing of resources.
- Fund pilot training for diplomats in at least one overseas mission, as a demonstration of the effectiveness of the training materials designed by the project together with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. This will increase the likelihood of the Ministry taking on the training materials in their regular course offerings.

Long-term:

- Design and implement demonstration projects with APJATI, e.g. on making the recruitment system easier and less costly for migrants (possibly through awareness raising and capacity building for local civil servants involved in labour and migration issues), or on monitoring standards of pre-departure training. These activities could become part of a separate project with private recruitment agencies, or could be one component of a second phase of the current project. More generally, it is important to find entry-points for future inclusion of rights education in training programmes for domestic workers and to provide recruitment agencies with incentives to conduct self-regulation.
- Continue to conduct project activities in East Java and other sending areas, but in a way that maximises sustainability of outputs rather than one-off activities.
- Provide technical assistance for migrant worker NGOs with capacity and interest to set up savings schemes for returned migrant workers.
- Create linkages between domestic workers' organisations and micro-entrepreneurship training organisations, and facilitate provision of skills training and micro-credit with the aim of providing alternative income-generating possibilities for domestic workers in difficult circumstances.
- Where possible, broaden collaboration to include more trade union activists from areas outside Jakarta, from independent unions, and from the factory level in areas where many families depend on formal workers for their livelihood (in order to create solidarity between formal and informal workers).
- Collaborate with Muslim women's organisations to provide training for motivators, if for a carefully delineated target group and with concrete plans for follow-up activities to allow motivators to practice their skills.
- Conduct research on the incidence of domestic workers being dismissed because of trade union activism and explore legal action to prevent such illegal dismissal (especially in Hong Kong).

- Continue project implementation through a sub-regional approach, as this gives the ILO the option of adding additional countries to the project framework as desired and possible.
- Broaden the framework of the project to address domestic work issues not only from the angle of forced labour and trafficking but rather from a rights-based approach.

B. Management and coordination

- More senior management direction in terms of backstopping and division of roles and responsibilities between concerned offices.
- Greater flexibility in selecting consultants, through more extensive networks, and with more frequent and intense supervision where needed.

B. Philippines

(by Lucita Lazo)

3. Project Design

Domestic work is a pervasive reality in the country and is expected to continue as a practice of many households, especially those who can afford to hire household help. The issues and concerns of domestic workers as identified and elaborated in the situation analysis continue to exist and need to be addressed at greater length and depth.

In light of these, overall, there is no question among stakeholders that the Domestic Work Project is relevant and appropriate in the Philippine context. Likewise, the Chief Technical Adviser appreciates the general directions provided in the SPROUT but also notes the high level of project ambition and the inadequacy of project infrastructure in the host/receiving countries which comes in the way of moving and operationalising the project in the selected project countries.

Some enhancements in the project design could still be made and incorporated in the course of project implementation in the current phase as well as in the succeeding phase.

The project was designed to “make domestic work decent” and takes as its starting point a) the fact that the phenomenon of domestic work has been in existence in the Philippines for a long time although it has not been acknowledged as “proper work” and b) there have been spontaneous initiatives on the ground that seek to improve the conditions of work of domestic workers in the Philippines. (Conversation with ILO Manila Deputy Director Amy Torres, 5 September 2005)

The project design as embodied in the SPROUT appears to be appropriate, relevant but ambitious considering the scope and the project time frame. In fact, this was already articulated by the government partner:

“The Project was perceived to be too idealistic and threatening, even by its official project title. There is a perception that the situation of Filipino domestic workers abroad is relatively stable and that those in the Philippines are more protected. That the domestic workers in the local market and abroad continue to be vulnerable to forced labour and trafficking was doubted by the DOLE.” (2nd semester 2004 Project Progress Report, section 3)

...the limited project duration was the most threatening factor for achieving the project agenda in the eyes of the stakeholders and project managers. While similarly situated with all SAP-FL projects of ILO, the new framework in addressing domestic worker vulnerabilities seems to need enough space for project experimentation and risk-taking to

build an experiential basis of what is feasible, cost efficient and responsive or otherwise.”
(1st semester 2005 Progress Report to DFID, section 3)

Therefore, it is important to recognize that there is great sensitivity to the application of trafficking and forced labor as the framework for action on domestic work. In both project countries, there has been explicit discomfort with the forced labor framework. Appreciating and understanding this sensitivity among some national partners, the ILO Manila sub-regional director has taken deliberate effort to “repackage” domestic work within the framework of promoting decent work for which there is already a national action plan that is supported by the government. Such responsiveness to the sensitivities of the social partners is commendable and should be continuously practiced. It is vital in removing a potential psychological bottleneck in project implementation and should be sustained to eliminate the discomfort with the forced labor and trafficking framework and shift their attention towards promoting decent work.

It must be noted however that the SPROUT envisaged this initial phase as part of a larger program of action. (SPROUT, p. 5/32). A more realistic work plan was expected to scale down activities into what is feasible within the time frame of three years. (Conversation with ILO MNL Deputy Director, 5 September 2005). In fact, this was done by the NPC and the work plan for 2005 is shown in the annex; the expected outputs and partners are shown in the table below:

PROJECT COMPONENTS/ EXPECTED OUTPUTS	Partners
Component 1: Documentation of Protection Requirements 1. Publication of diagnostic account of selected FL and internal trafficking cases of Filipino domestic workers over a period of one year 2. Validation workshop: Survey of Student on the Value of DW to HH on Working Conditions of DW	Visayan Forum Direct Activity
Component 2: Technical Cooperation and Advocacy on Regulatory Reform to Strengthen the Protection of DW 1. Mass mobilization, lobbying at Lower House and Senate 2. Workshop on the passage of two pilot local ordinance & local program of action 3. Advocacy forum/workshop with League of Mayors, governors, barangay officials re: local ordinance 4. Development of a new version of the Kasambahay Bill 5. TWG quarterly meeting with Legislative Staff 6. Review & amendment of the regulations re recruitment of domestic workers for local employment 7. Symposium/workshop on forced labor, internal/international human trafficking of domestic workers	VF VF DOLE/ILS DOLE/ILS DOLE/ILS DOLE/BLE Direct Activity
Component 3: Awareness raising/Advocacy/Technical Cooperation on Protection Requirements of Domestic workers 1 .Development, promotion and use of domestic helper pre-employment orientation, VCD, conduct of tripartite/multipartite consultation on	POEA

substance, form, delivery; pilot launching and trainers' training 2. Consultations with experts & other project implementers; sector/multi-partite consultations at local level; conduct of a national convention	VF
Component 4: Outreach to & organization of domestic workers & alliance building between trade unions and domestic workers' organizations 1. Development and application of domestic worker sector organizing & capacity building 2. Development & implementation of local outreach program under a framework of cooperation with local authorities and other social partner	TUCP/FFW/SUMAPI VF/SUMAPI

One area for work within the last months of the current project phase is to lay the ground for building the links between the source and destination sites, for both internal and international migration. This means defining the project approach in the destination countries. There are both technical and administrative issues to be dealt with. For example, Malaysia as a destination country does not come within the ambit of the Manila sub-regional office. How will the project handle activities that it might contemplate in Malaysia as a host country? In the case of internal migration, rural migrants to the National Capital Region (NCR) of the Philippines come from varied provinces in the three main islands of Luzon, Visayas and Mindanao. Which provincial sites would the project focus on and why?

Another aspect that needs further work is the sub-regional actions. The CTA reported that some sub-regional activities have been initiated from Jakarta and these are now being evaluated by the national consultant in Indonesia. However, there is a general feeling among the project team members that there remains the need to define more sharply the project's vision for the region. Five or ten years hence, what does the project expect to emerge in the region? The thrust of sub-regional actions could be the subject of internal discussions within the project team. In this regard, the two NPCs could contribute substantively in defining the sub-regional vision.

3.1 Project objectives

A singular immediate objective is the "eradication of the worst forms of abuse of domestic workers in Asia, through an integrated approach...." This statement has popular appeal and arises from the ILO goal of eliminating forced labor and trafficking that underpins the project. But on closer examination, the objective would require further elaboration and clarification in order to guide practical actions on the ground.

What constitutes "worst forms of abuse?" Is there an inventory of abuses or types of abuses that would allow the project implementer to have the universe and hierarchy of abuses according to some criteria and say that the project would focus on those that are at the most negative end of the spectrum?

Would it not be better to say that the objective is to “reduce the vulnerability of domestic workers to the risks and hazards of domestic work through an integrated approach” or to extend social protection to domestic workers? According to the national project coordinator, the objective means “alleviating the domestic workers’ vulnerability to trafficking and forced labor which are the worst state of abuse and acknowledges the fact that poor working conditions are not necessarily forced labor or trafficking...”

One of the informant/stakeholders in the interview, an LGU official took note and suggested that the objective be stated in positive terms although there was no specific suggestion as to the articulation of the project objective.

If the implementing team is asked whether or not such objectives have been met at the end of the project period, what indicators would be used? Is there a baseline to measure progress from project inception to completion? Are there baseline figures on the incidence of the worst forms of abuse on domestic workers to serve as a reference point for determining project success or failure relative to this overarching objective?

It may be well worth the time and effort for the project team to think this through in operational terms.

3.2 Target Group

The SPROUT specifies that the project aims to directly reach 20,000 domestic workers over a three-year period, including the overseas communities. Is this in terms of direct services and is this a realistic goal? And on what basis?

3.3 External factors affecting project implementation

Project implementation was affected by the workloads of various partners and the level of priority they attached to the project. There are competing priorities in the government as well as the non-government sectors. Frequent change in the Labor Department’s officers have also necessitated repeated orientations into the project. In the case of the ILO specialists, their frequent missions and vast area of responsibility and coverage in the sub-region would not allow as frequent consultation as may have been needed. Also, for some partners, there is the risk of over-commitment that could jeopardize implementation of DOM WORK activities.

The ILO DOM Work had put the highest priority to direct assistance type of actions, putting less emphasis on research activities due to the expressed preference of national partners, especially the DOLE, as well as ILO directives from both the regional office and headquarters. The action orientation has a plus because it ensures greater outreach to the target beneficiaries in terms of concrete services and could facilitate tangible impacts for the target beneficiaries over the long term.

However, the Project’s social partners identified a number of data needs such as establishing a survey-based account of the occupational safety & health needs of

domestic workers and valuing of domestic work for purposes of wages and compensation. These data gaps need to be filled as they are essential in the advocacy for the adoption of the omnibus law on domestic workers, otherwise known as Batas Kasambahay. The proposed bill covers social security, health insurance, wages and compensation provisions for the workers. In the legislative hearings and inter-sector consultations, the definition and coverage of hazardous work and compensation levels have become two of the most contentious issues. Further, a constant query pertains to the incidence and evidence for the prevalence of trafficking and forced labour cases. This necessitates a research cum action agenda. In order to establish a strong evidence-based advocacy, the Project could support focused studies and research cum action type of activities (as opposed to research for research sake activities).

4. Implementation

4.1 Inputs, Output and Activities

The SPROUT indicates the specific outputs and enumerates corresponding activities and indicators which are to be adapted to the situation in the project countries. The main means of action consist of: legislation and policy, capacity building, outreach and organization and demonstration projects and targeted interventions. The activities as indicated are fairly general but the project team had formulated specific country-level activities and through the operational work plan 2004-2006 had notably scaled down activities to more realistic and feasible levels within the two-year time frame.

Examples of efforts undertaken to elaborate and link these to the ground involve mainstreaming technical advisories to the policy and program priorities of the DOLE and other government agencies (which included ratification program of ILO Convention Nos. 29, 97 and 143, National Plan of Action for Decent work, its market-driven need for a developing skills training, testing, certification and orientation technologies for migrant and local domestic workers, the attempt to provide concerted action against trafficking of persons in general) as well as sensitization of local government units, traditional ILO tripartite partners and NGO's/civil society groups into possible collaboration between and among them .

National activities considered appropriate to the Philippine situation have been strategically selected and embodied in the work plan. In the current project phase, there is great stress for 1) awareness raising and advocacy and 2) direct intervention, based on fund allocation in the Philippines.

One mode of action that is extremely important for domestic workers is the generation of alternative jobs. Creating options and opportunities for them is a huge challenge and addresses the more fundamental issue of poverty and unemployment, the very underlying causes why domestic work and attendant abuse and exploitation are perpetuated. The next phase could lay greater stress on this aspect. This may entail linking them with existing ILO programs such as those on youth employment, vocational skills training and

the like that would enable domestic workers to engage in productive and/or entrepreneurial ventures.

Significantly, the project team noted that in a SUMAPI survey finding, there were indications that domestic workers want to get out of domestic work. Related to this, ILO internal discussions had made clear that the intention of the ILO DOM WORK project is NOT to take the workers out of domestic work but to have minimum standards applied so that their conditions of work are elevated. Interventions would include skills enhancement and education.

There is a need to generate more precise indicators and means of verification, and define the expected strategic outcomes related to each of the outputs so that they are steered toward the objective of reducing vulnerability. These can be worked out in the coming months. The table below illustrates the idea but this should be taken as indicative and must be revisited by the project team for them to arrive at some consensus as to what might constitute key indicators and strategic outcomes. The CTA concurs with this idea and see this as an area for future action which can be more effectively done at this stage of the project when the knowledge and information base has already increased to a level that could enable them to effectively identify the appropriate outcomes and indicators.

OUTPUTS	STRATEGIC OUTCOMES	INDICATORS
Legislative Advocacy and Policy Reform <ul style="list-style-type: none"> National recognition and inclusion of domestic work within existing labour laws and remove discrimination provisions against domestic work in labour law Policy guidelines on domestic work 	A legal regulatory and protective framework is developed and in place Public attitudes toward domestic workers reflect appreciation of the value of their work and contribution to the economy	Progressive measures taken by government to put up the protective and legal regulatory framework New laws proposed and/or passed Amendments to the Law on recruitment Local ordinances and administrative regulations; ratifications of international instruments
Capacity Building and technical assistance in support of workers' rights <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Trained officials and staff of national and regional domestic workers' organizations and trade unions Trained and sensitized government agencies at the national and 	Institutional mechanisms for policy making and enforcement are strengthened in terms of systems, procedures and competent staffing to deliver services	Support programs for domestic programs are implemented at national and local levels Budgets are made available for programs and services for domestic workers

regional levels		
<p>Outreach and Organization</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Organized domestic worker organizations and associations, at national and international levels Alliances built between migrant and local domestic workers and national and international trade unions Joint advocacy campaign for the recognition of domestic workers' rights and the need for services for those trapped in situations of forced labour and trafficking 	<p>Voice and Representation in policy dialogues and in local and national governance/institutional mechanisms</p>	<p>Number of domestic workers' associations organized; size of membership base</p> <p>Participation of domestic workers' organizations in policy dialogues; articulation of views and positions relative to issues being considered</p> <p>Affiliation to national and international trade unions</p>
<p>Demonstration Programs and Targeted Interventions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strengthened national referral mechanisms that systematizes, upgrades the quality and coordinates crisis interventions for adult and child domestic workers Improved education and employment opportunities for adult and child domestic workers, including those returned from foreign employment Improved health and social protection coverage for adult and child domestic workers 	<p>Availability of reliable and quality support services to domestic workers, for crisis management, health, education, training, and the like</p> <p>Increased access to services by domestic workers</p> <p>Sustainability of institutional programs and mechanisms for domestic workers</p>	<p>Institutional mechanisms and support services are in place at the community level</p> <p>Number of domestic workers reached</p>

4.2 Link between strategic components and contribution to planned objectives

The strategy is conceptually coherent and was derived from the Indicative Framework for Action for the Protection of Domestic Workers from Forced Labor and Trafficking. The challenge is to ensure that such coherence is not lost as tasks are assigned for execution by different partners. The National Project Coordinator has the key role of ensuring coherence and synergy among various project components through monitoring and provision of technical advice to project collaborators.

One value added of the project is the deliberate effort to bring together stakeholders and partners into a dialogue so that they see how their individual work contribute to the overall objective of reducing domestic workers' vulnerability. This enables them to see how their specific actions link and contribute to the whole. According to the NPC, there have been six major sector meetings, 4 major multi-sector dialogues and six monthly Collaborators' meetings. The latter acts as the Project's Advisory Committee meeting. Focused meetings among partners and collaborators are organized according to need. Usually, this transpires whenever there is a perceived compelling need for the NPC presence as a technical adviser or resource person or when progress of a contracted project needs to be monitored.

These constant consultations have resulted in the progressive enrichment of the project's conceptual framework, averting the initial apprehensions about the seeming regulatory slant of its forced labour and trafficking framework. The NPC has taken effort to establish clearly among the key social partners that: they are a critical mass of champions for the protection of domestic workers; that DOMWORK demonstrates how migration can be governed in a holistic way using a rights-based approach as called for by the ILC 2004 Report VI, linking internal migration to out-migration as well as internal and international trafficking; and that the domestic worker sector, being a target vulnerable sector, can lead the way in operationalising the Philippine National Plan of Action for Decent Work. This way, the DOM WORK project gains a positive spin.

4.3 Assumptions

Political will is the most important assumption to make for the project to succeed. In addition, for project continuity, there must be relative stability in government to ensure that implementation processes are not disturbed by the turn-over of responsible officials who may not immediately perceive the importance of this project.

4.4 Role of Constituents

The tripartite constituents have varying degrees of awareness and commitment relative to the cause of legal and social protection for domestic workers. At this stage, there is much scope for increasing the level of understanding and acceptance by the ILO tripartite partners. This re-enforces the need for more advocacy among the partners and stakeholders.

In general, trade unions in the Philippines have not ventured into the realm of the domestic workers as an area of work. Engaging them now would be ground breaking and greater attention must be paid to engage them in the project. For political and pragmatic reasons, it would be appropriate to have the trade unions on board as they have the mandate to address the sector as well as the institutional and social infrastructure to undertake it though this may be painstakingly slow in the beginning. The existing proposal of the Federation of Free Workers which had been submitted in late June is an excellent opportunity for getting the trade union on board the DOM WORK project.

Employer representatives are likely, as they have expressed so, to have some degree of resistance to the protective measures being promoted under the project. While this is true, there are concrete examples on the ground to show that there are employers who have in fact taken actions to assist domestic workers such as the Barangay Bel-air program for domestic helpers. The project must pursue its plan to make this as an advocacy tool and enable pioneering institutions to bring on board a bigger network of employers and disabuse their minds from being threatened by measures for social protection of domestic workers.

Government, particularly its executive arm at the national and local levels, is an important player in the entire undertaking. It is in their purview to create the enabling environment, particularly to formulate, promulgate and enforce the law and policy needed to ensure social protection for the domestic workers and to establish, support and monitor delivery of social services beneficial to the domestic workers.

The non-government sector in the Philippines have engaged in domestic workers' issues even prior to the project but the focus had been child domestic workers because significant support was channeled to them under the ILO-IPEC program. It would be useful to have the IPEC-DOM WORK projects interface and cultivate synergies wherever appropriate and feasible. The initial efforts of the NPC to derive insights and guidance from the IPEC should be sustained to keep the synergies alive. In fact, one might note that the bigger sector is really domestic workers and that children and adults are sub-sets of the client base; hence, the IPEC-DOM WORK partnership is vital to ensuring coherence on the ground.

4.5 Participation of target groups

The participation of target groups in the various strategic components is vital in ensuring long-term sustainability. The project design in fact explicitly states that "domestic workers are in the best position to advance their agenda for labor and social protection." While a number of NGO's work to represent the interest of this sector, both those in the local market and abroad, the challenge is bringing and keeping the domestic workers themselves on board in the course of project implementation.

It is observed that SUMAPI, the lone domestic worker organization, continues to exist under the umbrella of the Visayan Forum. The great challenge to the DOM WORK project is to spin them off as an independent organization, build their capacity to raise

visibility and establish a voice for domestic workers. Although SUMAPI has been catering to the local domestic workers, organizations of migrant domestic workers based abroad could be linked through region-wide and sub-regional undertakings.

4.6 Internal logic of project structure and staffing

Domestic work consist of a) local or household helpers in the Philippines usually migrating from rural to urban areas and b) those who work as domestic helpers abroad. These two categories are not necessarily mutually exclusive. They have commonalities and differences. In the current domestic work project, both types are being addressed. However, there are variances in perceptions as regard the relative vulnerability of overseas versus local domestic helpers. There are sectors who argue that the overseas workers are more vulnerable to trafficking and forced labor.

Also, there are differences in the flow of migrant workers. For example, for Filipino domestic workers the top destinations are Hong Kong and Singapore while for Indonesia it may be Malaysia and the Middle East. Within the Philippines, flows of domestic helpers emerge from the Visayan provinces.

As designed, there are two national project coordinators, one for each of the two project countries and one chief technical adviser who exercises oversight on the NPCs. For the initial stages of the project, the lean structure is sufficient. However, as the project gains momentum and the volume of work scales up, the need for another technical staff who could give technical advice to the partners on demand has become apparent in the Philippines. To cope with the increasing work volume, a consultant can be hired to assist in providing technical advice.

5. Cross-cutting Concerns: Gender, ILO Standards

By design, the project took into account related issues on ILO standards and gender have been written in the SPROUT showing some degree of consciousness about the need to mainstream such concerns in the DOM WORK project.

ILO conventions have been adequately factored in and is effectively guided by the labor standards specialist. However, the SPROUT does not take cognizance of the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), an international instrument which can be the basis for actions on domestic work. The Philippines is one of the signatories to CEDAW and therefore it has to fulfill treaty obligations in the way it does with ILO Conventions it has ratified. Mainstreaming the CEDAW in the project would certainly aid in mainstreaming gender.

The vulnerability of domestic workers is the intersection of gender, class and sometimes ethnicity and this could well be the case in the Philippines. Trafficking for forced labor represent situations that violate women's rights as embodied in the CEDAW. It is suggested that the interfaces between the ILO conventions and the CEDAW could be

spelt out and applied in the context of domestic work. This could be invoked and used in the advocacy for the passage of the KASAMBAHAY Bill. The project might even benefit from linking with the UNIFEM-CEDAW project which seeks to promote women's rights in Southeast Asia, including the Philippines.

In the course of the project field visits, it was noted that gender sensitivity of the SUMAPI could be enhanced and this could well be true of most other project partners. The standards aspect of domestic work appear to be better understood and appreciated but the gender aspect has not been given as much prominence in the analysis of the problem although this is reflected in the SPROUT.

Further, some issues pertinent to project design have come to fore in the course of project implementation:

a. Maximizing demonstration impact of the project

The two project countries, Indonesia and the Philippines, have differing ground situations relative to domestic work. The Philippine ground seems to be ready for development actions on domestic work while Indonesia seems to require more ground preparation to create an attitudinal set that would encourage development actions on domestic work. Reportedly, there is relatively stronger cultural resistance in Indonesia than in the Philippines. This implies that more preparatory work is needed in Indonesia before desired outcomes results can be had. In contrast, the Philippines has the "seeds" of development actions which have emerged out of local volunteerism and all that is needed to nurture and support them in order to carry them to full fruition. Within the ILO project, this could be done.

An interesting and strategic issue for discussion that could define overall project approach is: should more funds be allocated to the Philippines in order to optimize the chance of having some concrete impacts or should more funds be invested in Indonesia because it requires more social preparation? This is a matter that the project team could address and have some consensus on to rationalize decisions on project operations and investments.

b. Selection of project countries

The Philippine government, i.e. DOLE, noted that there are more host countries of domestic workers where forced labor practices and trafficking incidences are suspected which require equal if not more attention than the current project countries. One persistent problem is the incidence of run-away domestic workers who seek refuge and get stranded for days or months in Philippine workers' centers abroad such as Kuwait. Interventions to address the cause of running away – usually, employer-worker contractual and cultural conflicts and recruitment malpractices – are areas which could be explored.

In the second phase of the project, it is suggested that the project countries be reviewed and selected. Obviously, the needs of the countries and the flows and patterns of

migration in each country should be taken into account in determining the participating countries in the project.

6. Progress of implementation and delivery

6.1 Project preparations

Project preparations are needed at different levels, namely: political, technical and administrative/management. Pertinent project actions were taken to create national ownership, defining operational strategies and setting up project management support systems.

Creating Political Support And National Ownership

At the political level, the Philippine strategy had undergone a multi-stakeholder validation workshop in May 2004 and was an effective mode of generating interest and political will among the key partners to engage and collaborate in the DOM WORK project. This served to initiate the building of national support for the project concept and objectives. This must be a continuing process in order to nurture and cultivate the enabling environment for extending social protection to domestic workers.

At project inception, the NPC embarked on promotional activities among the social partners and opened the field for them to think of possible development actions. This stirred interest and motivated the partners to submit proposals. Thus far, the NPC has received and reviewed 24 proposals, recommended 15 for CTA approval, and obtained CTA approval for 9 proposals. The latter are now ongoing and/or near completion.

The informal Collaborators' Committee is the technical group which serves to approximate the Project Advisory Committee. While the NPC has called for elevating their representation to policy-level officers, the constant changes of incumbents and their work load settings, especially among government, has kept the Committee comfortable with the technical informal structure. The Collaborators Committee acts as the technical group which addresses project implementation as well as conceptual issues. Their individual representation is engaged to raise policy questions to their respective hierarchy whenever necessary.

The ILO HQ technical staff noted that the Project Advisory Committee in Indonesia is a good example to emulate. Having a clearly defined Project Advisory Committee, would enhance and deepen national ownership for the project, and enhance coordination with the ILO office (e.g. in Indonesia, no less than the ILO director attends PAC meetings).

Support for the project by relevant National Partner Organizations

The national partners organizations have been generally supportive of the DOM WORK PROJECT. In the government sector, the partners are: DOLE, Institute of Labor Studies, Bureau of Local Employment, Bureau of Women and Young Workers, Technical

Education and Skills Development Authority,, Philippine Overseas Employment Administration, Department of Foreign Affairs-Foreign Service Institute, employer sector: Employers Confederation of the Philippines; trade union sector: Federation of Free Workers and the NGO Sector: Visayan Forum.

During the interviews all the partners expressed support for the DOM WORK project. In the government sector, the OWWA and POEA could play bigger roles in terms of disseminating information and providing direct assistance. To date however, their project involvement has been rather limited. This should be reviewed and expanded in the next phase. Further, the NPC indicated that there is great scope for the POEA to enhance their engagement with the DOM WORK project. This could be pursued in phase II. Significantly, the POEA saw and articulated that one lesson they learned is the value of tapping external partners like the ILO DOM WORK project. This positive insight and goodwill should be harnessed in the immediate future.

In the employers' sector, a feeling was expressed that the employers have not been given adequate space to play a role especially in the field of policy advocacy. They believe that they have a good network that they can harness for more effective policy advocacy at the two houses of Congress. According to the NPC, the employers were invited by the Senate and the Congress but they did not come. Instead, they submitted their position paper.

The trade union sector have not been vociferous, particularly the Federation of Free Workers, which is awaiting feedback on their proposals. In fact they said they would start the preparatory activities already so as not to waste time while waiting for feedback from the DOM WORK management on the approval of their proposal.

Technical Preparation

Conceptual and intellectual preparation for the project was well addressed by engaging a national consultant to conduct the situational analysis of Filipino Domestic workers and a Strategy paper to implement the Philippine component of the project. The strategy document has been translated into an operational work plan which focused on the feasible actions within the available project time. This effectively scaled down the ambitious program set forth in the project document. (refer to work plan) into attainable levels. The multi-partner, multi-pronged and multi-level approach makes it possible to initiate and launch several activities at the same time and move forward on each of the components and strategies. The main challenge becomes monitoring and quality control of project outputs and ensuring that they effectively adhere and contribute to the project objectives.

An overall strategy document that would bring together the national strategies of Indonesia and the Philippines into a sub-regional strategy would have been useful in defining the project vision. This could lead to the identification of appropriate, meaningful and relevant sub-regional actions. For example, a sub-regional meeting to share national strategies could have led to the formulation of a practical strategy for sub-regional action. After 14 months of project work, it may be opportune to have such a sub-regional meeting to review the results of the first phase which could feed into the design and implementation of phase II of the project.

One specific possibility for sub-regional action for the DOM WORK project is to provide a forum for a social dialogue between the Philippines and Indonesia as sending countries and Hong Kong SAR, Malaysia and Singapore as receiving countries. The idea is to address and forge consensus and collaboration on extending social protection for domestic workers between sending and receiving countries. This could be done by the development and application of bilateral instruments as contemplated in ILC 2004 resolutions which will in effect implement the ILO agenda for advancing migration governance.

6.2 Project implementation

The Philippine DOM WORK project is on track and all planned activities have been started. Details of the status of the activities and outputs are shown in Table B.3. Given the late start of the project and the amount of time required to prepare the ground, it is commendable that the project has managed to get the activities launched within the last 14 months.

It would seem baffling to see that the delivery rate stands at 41 percent as shown in Table B.1. It must be noted however, that funds have already been allocated to the various activities although actual disbursement has been slow. This is due to the project efforts to ensure quality of the outputs and compliance with contract terms prior to fund releases. Thus payments are delayed until outputs reach satisfactory standards.

Utilization of project funds

At the time of the mid-term evaluation in September 2005, project delivery had reached only 41 percent, meaning \$ 77,358 USD out of 188,888.00 funds allocated for the Philippines have been disbursed. This low delivery rate has already raised concern among management circles. As shown in table C.2, this disbursement cover activities under external collaboration totaling 59,473 USD and 17,884 USD spent for those activities directly administered by the NPC.

Table B.1

	Amount	%
Total Allocated Project Cost - Phils.	\$ 188,888.00	100%
Less: Disbursements		
Collaborated/Direct Activities	\$ (77,358.30)	41.0%
Balance	\$ 111,529.70	59.0%

Table B.2

	Amount	%
Disbursed for Collaborated Activities	\$ 59,473.80	77%

Disbursed for Direct Activities	\$ 17,884.50	23%
Total	\$ 77,358.30	100.0%

Table B.3

	Amount	%
Total Allocated Project Cost - Phils.	\$ 188,888.00	
a) Project Activities under external collaboration	\$ 112,480.00	59.5%
b) Direct Activity	\$ 36,558.00	19.4%
c) Budgeted for the Other Project Activities	\$ 39,850.00	21.1%
Total	\$ 188,888.00	100.0%

Fund use by sector and purpose

Table B.4 and B.5 depict the distribution of the fund allocation. Table B.4 clearly shows that the project has allocated far more for government (52 %) and NGOs (40 %) than the other tripartite constituents. Notable is the absence of allocation for the trade union/worker sector. This is a politically sensitive issue and must be addressed as soon as possible. Already, the employer respondent articulated the view that the DOM WORK project is NGO driven and that the employer sector's role should be given more importance in the project. Further, the trade union partner reported that they had submitted their proposal but are awaiting feedback from the project team. These "polite" statements must be taken as indications of concern and must not be taken for granted. In short, there needs to be some balance in the project fund allocation and distribution and must give due regard to the respective roles and importance of the social partners.

Table B.4

	Amount	%
Allocation for Collaborated Project Activities		
a) Government	\$ 52,400.00	51.5%
b) Worker/Trade Union	\$ 0	0.0%
c) Employer Organization	\$ 9,020.00	8.9%
d) NGOs	\$ 40,240.00	39.6%
Total	\$ 101,660.00	100 %

Table B.5

	Amount	%
Total Allocated Project Cost - Phils.		
a) Researches/Studies	\$ 12,500.00	8.1%
b) Legislative and Policy Advocacy	\$ 27,100.00	17.6 %

c) Capability Building	\$ 42,880.00	27.9 %
d) Direct Intervention	\$ 41,084.50	26.8 %
e) Awareness Building	\$ 30,000.00	19.5 %
Total	\$ 153,564.50	100%

Table B.5 show that funds have been mostly allocated for capability building and direct intervention which partake of 27.9 per cent of the funds and 26.8 percent, respectively. Interestingly, legislative and policy advocacy only shares 17.6 per cent of the funds.

The relative under-investment on legislative advocacy must be understood in the light of additional resources from the IPEC on the Kasambahay Bill which cross cuts children and adults. In addition, the classification of expenditures under the current accounting system may not accurately reflect the thrust of the project activities. Hence, it may be worthwhile for the project to review the accounting system for activity classification and expenditure.

Implementation of Activities and Status of Outputs

At the outset, the NPC devoted his time to promoting the project among various stakeholders. This seems to have paid off in terms of motivating the social partners to collaborate with the DOM WORK project, notwithstanding that it is small compared to gargantuan projects as the IPEC to which many social partners have been used to and which for some partners seem to have benchmarked their level of expectations of ILO financial and technical support in the field.

After the initial promotional work, project time was spent mostly in evaluating proposals, negotiations, refinements, formatting, conceptualization, work planning, budgeting, improvement of reporting structures and start up monitoring. Close supervision of the DOLE proposal on the domestic workers' education program also took up significant project time.

It is interesting to note that over a period of 14 project months, the NPC had been able to initiate action in each project component and was able to optimize strategic partnerships as a means for moving the project forward within a brief project period. In addition, existing initiatives on the ground such as those by the Visayan Forum are excellent opportunities for generating project momentum within a short project period. However, it is noted that while the domestic workers have been organized under the SUMAPI, it is still a fledgling organization and the domestic workers' voice as a collective is yet to emerge. The HQ technical staff has expressed this view and agrees with the need to increased involvement of the workers' sector and the trade unions such as the TUCP.

On the whole, the project results lend support to the efficacy of a multi-partner, multi-pronged, multi-level action strategy for technical cooperation projects that require integrated and holistic actions for them to be meaningful and effective on the ground.

Most planned activities are ongoing and some are near completion by end of December 2005 or early 2006. Table 3 summarizes in a chart the status of the outputs and activities.

TABLE B.3

**SUMMARY CHART ON THE STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF ACTIVITIES PER
THE 2005 WORKPLAN**

Expected Outputs (per the SPROUT)	Activities initiated and/or completed as of 15 September 2005	Expected Outputs (per the 2005 work plan)	Status of Outputs per 2005 work plan
Component 1	Law and Policy		
1. Consultation Workshop on laws, policies	Mass mobilization in the Senate during public hearing for the Batas Kasambahay and	Sector presence in legislative sessions and exhibits;	Ongoing
2. Baseline studies on domestic workers	have mobilized 56 partners and domestic workers;	Sector presence in Senate hearings;	Ongoing
3. Amendments in law	Series of legal fora, advocacy symposia and Senate hearings on the ratification of ILO Conventions and on the Kasambahay Bill or the National Domestic Worker Bill;	TWG quarterly meeting with key legislative staff in the Senate;	Ongoing
4. Review of international conventions & relation to national laws	Workshop on the passage of two pilot local ordinance & local program of action;	Local ordinance in at least 2 key cites;	Completed
5. Policy formation workshop – Decent Work & IPEC TBP	Advocacy forum/workshop with League of Mayors, Governors, Barangay Officials re: local ordinance;	Draft Local Ordinance & Employment Contract Model	Ongoing
6. Information dissemination on policy & laws	Development of a new version of the Kasambahay Bill;	Revised version of the Kasambahay Bill;	Ongoing
	Review &	Improvement in the draft Revised Rules and Regulations Governing Private Recruitment and Placement Agency for Local Employment;	Completed
		Presentation of Domwork project	

	<p>amendment of the regulations re: recruitment of domestic workers for local employment through a consultation workshop</p> <p>Promotion of the conceptual foundation progress of the project through meetings and conferences;</p>	<p>in the Philippine launch of the ILO Global Report 2005 on Forced Labour on 05 July 2005;</p> <p>Roundtable discussion of a research on the youth's view of domestic workers' value to the households on 16 June 2005;</p>	
Component 2:	Outreach & Organization of Domestic Workers & Alliances with Formal Sector		
1. Outreach activities	Development and implementation of local outreach program by SUMAPI leaders in Metro Manila thru creative flip charts about domestic worker issues, basic rights and responsibilities;	Improved outreach program with more stakeholders and greater number of domestic worker beneficiaries; successful outreach model can be replicated;	Started
2. Training of outreach organizers			
3. Awareness-Building of key sectors			
4. Alliances between migrant & local domestic workers			
5. Removal of barriers to domestic workers organizing at local & national level			Started
6. Worker Education Campaign	Facilitated recreational activities and peer counseling sessions by VF social workers;	Organizing tool, capacity-building module, pilot application	Ongoing
7. Awareness and alliance-building on domestic workers rights			
8. National fora on socio-economic activities of migrant domestic workers	Representation during outreach activities such as the Global March, QC Kasambahay Day and Labor Day;	Organized domestic worker organizations and associations at national and international levels;	Started
9. Effective representation of migrant & national domestic workers in national trade unions			Started
10. Domestic worker registration	Improved intake sheet of SUMAPI members and cases;	Computerized database	
11. Advocacy materials for legal protection	Mapping and profiling of members and cases on forced labor and trafficking; purchase of one	Enterprise level awareness and employer's guidelines to	Completed
12. Priority attention to domestic workers on international			

<p>advocacy campaigns and mass action</p> <p>13. Promotion of portable trade union membership</p> <p>14. International solidarity among domestic worker organizations, unions and NGOs</p>	<p>computer and started encoding of names of members;</p> <p>1st Roundtable Discussion of Employers, 29 July 2005 and partnership with Bel-Air Association;</p> <p>Inputs to employer's position on Kasambahay Bill prioritized and ride on other activities to promote the advocacy;</p>	<p>promote decent work for domestic workers</p>	<p>Started</p>
Component 3:		Supporting Domestic Workers' Rights Through Technical Assistance and Capacity Building	
<p>1. Training activities on human rights and workers rights;</p> <p>2. Training on communication and advocacy campaigning, safer migration, legal, medical and psycho-social services;</p> <p>3. Adapting ILO manuals on employment creation, trafficking, gender in national languages;</p> <p>4. Train national offices in the use of these tools;</p> <p>5. Networking among domestic workers, migrant workers, NGOs, IGOs and government bodies</p> <p>6. Organizing, networking, cultural change survival skills;</p> <p>7. Regional networking to facilitate alliance</p>	<p>Production of the audio-visual material for household workers intended for Pre-Employment Program;</p> <p>Promulgated training regulations for household services NCII and validation report on the development of the training regulation;</p> <p>Preparations for the pilot program implementation in Region 9 and NCR;</p> <p>Development of IEC materials and first draft of Orientation module and workbook for domestic workers;</p> <p>Development & launching of a capability material in CD-ROM for foreign service staff &</p>	<p>DW-focussed pre-employment orientation VCD; trainors trained; greater nationwide outreach; conduct of training and use, distribution and impact monitoring;</p> <p>Competency standards, training curriculum, assessment guidelines & tools, accreditation system, training regulations, launching ceremony and capability building needs inventory</p>	<p>Near completion (POEA)</p> <p>Near completion (TESDA)</p> <p>Ongoing</p> <p>Near completion (BLE)</p> <p>Near completion (FSI)</p>

8. Trained and sensitized government agencies	advocacy and organizing;	attaché corps on forced labour and trafficking vulnerability of domestic workers	Publication of new regulations; brochure/flyer production; CD-ROM training tool	Ongoing
		Symposium/workshop on forced labour, internal/international human trafficking of domestic workers;	Good practices sharing, sensitized stakeholders, identified welfare gaps;	Completed
		Development and institution of a needs assessment instrument;	Training Needs Assessment	
Component 4:		Establish through demonstration programmes, targeted interventions that address the worst abuses of human and workers' rights		
1. Map existing interventions for domestic workers in protection and rehabilitation; 2. Network existing interventions and pursue capacity building activities; 3. Establish monitoring system for tracking domestic workers who are victims of trafficking and forced labour; 4. National poverty reduction, employment and training programs; 5. Assessment of employment and training needs of domestic workers; 6. Promote the employment and education programmes addressing domestic workers; 7. Short-term literacy and vocational		Conceptual discussion on rescue hotline system initiated with media network;	Strengthened national referral mechanisms that upgrades the quality and coordinates crisis interventions for adult and child domestic workers;	Started
		Negotiation with local authorities for support in cooperation and referral system; Documentation of 45 cases on forced labour and trafficking of adult domestic workers in the port halfway house and safehouse;	Improved education and employment opportunities for adult and child domestic workers, including those returned from foreign employment; Promoted expansion of	Started

programs; 8. Skills upgrading programmes for housekeeping employment sectors; 9. Occupational mobility through skills training; 10. Promote savings and small business development activities; 11. Improved health and social protection coverage for adult and child domestic workers; 12. Voluntary registration and enrolment in health and social insurance schemes; 13. Orientation/seminars through domestic workers' organizations, domestic workers' centers, homeowners' associations, and local government/community-level assemblies on employer responsibilities; 14. Project feasibility study on cooperativism;		learning and training schemes for domestic workers through short-term literacy and vocational programs; Pilot savings and small business schemes for domestic workers in project sites; Conduct health and social insurance registration and enrolment campaigns for domestic workers; Conduct seminars through local domestic worker organizations and local project partners on basic health and social protection concerns;	
--	--	---	--

In general, most project activities have been initiated and some are near completion, particularly the training and advocacy tools. It is commendable to note that each of the components have been launched. What remains to be seen are the desired impacts of these various activities. Will there be real reduction in vulnerability of domestic workers resulting from these?

7. Recommendations

1. Review the project objectives and reformulate in positive terms. Refer to explanation in section A.
2. Revisit the project implementation strategy and assess which would be most effective in terms of achieving concrete project impact and create a demonstration effect on the ground. Also, reconsider the project countries and whether or not the next phase could be expanded to other geographic areas. For instance, according to the DOLE, there are more countries of domestic worker destination where force labor practices and trafficking incidences are suspected which require attention as much as, if not more than, the current project countries. One persistent problem is the incidence of run-away domestic workers who seek refuge and get stranded for days or months in Philippine workers' centers abroad such as Kuwait. Interventions to address the cause of running away – usually, employer-worker contractual and cultural conflicts and recruitment malpractices – are areas which could be explored.
3. Strengthen Evidence-based Advocacy. The project is designed as an anti-trafficking and forced labor intervention; however, there is a need to strengthen the evidence base on the prevalence of forced labor and trafficking in the Philippines. As the situational analysis indicated, “there is little information and few formal complaints regarding the forced labor and trafficking of domestic workers.” In the absence of solid data, this may not be an effective platform for advocacy.
4. Address causes as much as the symptoms – community-based job generation to create alternatives for domestic workers. The project vantage point of vulnerability reduction tends to assume an approach that redresses the “symptom” rather than the “cause” of the social phenomenon. This is so with every project that addresses legal and social protection.

In the case of domestic work, the need to work as household help and/or the need to migrate as a household help is driven by poverty, indebtedness, lack of opportunities, lack of education & skills. The intensification of job and income generation at the community level, especially in the extremely poor regions and provinces which have been found to spawn high incidence of domestic workers (Visayas, Bicol, Southern Tagalog, Northern Mindanao for local domestic workers and NCR, southern Tagalog, Ilocos, Cagayan Valley, Central Luzon, Sorsogon, Western Visayas for overseas migrant workers). This aspect has been included in the project design as part of the demonstration programs and targeted interventions. Its operationalization is yet to come. There should be greater emphasis on this component.

Along this line, there was a suggestion to revisit the suggestions of Bangkok SRO, embodied in the report prepared by Nelien Haspels.

5. Develop and elaborate the concept for the second phase. In fact there has been an initial concept paper prepared by the NPC. The thrust of the second phase should be toward up-scaling and institutionalization of the successful initiatives by mainstreaming it in regular social policy and programs. Such a thrust implies the recognition of successful

ground initiatives and disseminating them among stakeholders. Enhance the role of various constituents such as the DSWD, DILG, POEA and OWWA. Broaden the base of participation among NGOS in order to develop a critical mass of champions and advocates.

8. Lessons learned

A. Indonesia and destination countries

On the basis of her observations and discussions with ILO staff, project partners, and implementing organisations, the consultant in Indonesia concludes that much can be learned from the project's experiences. This mid-term review provides a useful opportunity to gather some insights that may be useful both for possible project continuation and for the ILO in general. These concern technical as well as managerial, administrative and coordination issues.

From a technical perspective:

- Some of the project's activities required relatively small amounts of money but had impact on the ground or with decision-makers. This shows that the action programme approach does not necessarily have to involve large sums for grantees.
- Involvement of trade unions and employers' organisations in organising informal workers requires concerted efforts to explore how such a project can benefit the social partners. When the social partners display little interest and/or do not have the capacity to reach informal workers, it may still be useful for the ILO/the project to offer funds for small-scale activities, in order to stimulate interest and give incentives.
- The project shows the usefulness and effectiveness of involving a broad range of civil society organisations in awareness raising, including religious organisations. In Indonesia, these organisations have a wide reach, which is especially important in a project that is trying to influence opinions on a vulnerable group of informal workers.
- In general, direct interventions for domestic workers and organising of domestic workers are difficult to sustain without external financial assistance, both in Indonesia and in destination countries. The main reason appears to be that domestic workers will mainly organise and remain active members of their organisation if their membership offers them concrete benefits. They will pay dues to their organisation if they recognise its usefulness to them, which in turn requires the availability of substantial funds for activities like case handling, capacity building and skill training for alternative livelihoods.
- The mid-term review is of the opinion that direct interventions are not the area in which the ILO can contribute the most. Outreach and organising are important activities because they increase the capacity of domestic workers to promote and defend their rights and to prevent abuse such as forced labour and trafficking. However, such activities can be funded and monitored by other organisations (donors or international agencies), whereas the building of strategic alliances, the strengthening of capacity among constituents and lobbying for legislation and policy are areas in which the ILO has a unique role to play. This is not to say that domestic workers' organisations should not receive funding (because self-sustainability is a long-term goal that cannot be realised without substantial aid). It means that when resources are limited, the ILO should focus first on those areas where it can add the most value. These include: strengthening advocacy skills, conducting awareness raising on labour rights and health, and facilitating the establishment of health

insurance. The ILO can also help to build linkages with other civil society organisations that might be able to offer technical assistance on a volunteer basis (e.g. trade unions or women's NGOs).

- When exploring assistance in the form of entrepreneurship or skills training for domestic workers, it is important to differentiate between skills that benefit domestic workers' organisations as opposed to skills that benefit individuals. For example, marketing skills are more likely to benefit the organisation in selling its handicrafts than sewing lessons which may only lead the organisation to loose members when they find alternative employment. Cooking and household skills are useful because they can provide members with an incentive to attend meetings regularly while at the same time offering concrete benefits for their current employment.

From a management perspective:

- The relatively low capacity of Indonesian NGOs and domestic workers' organisations for advocacy for policy and legislation made it necessary for the project staff to spend considerable time on building and strengthening advocacy efforts. When a project attempts to be active both through small action programmes and by facilitating advocacy activities, it is essential to budget sufficient staff working months.
- Capacity-building for project partners who implement small action programmes needs to be done in a systematic manner. Although this is difficult to achieve when project partners are varied and become involved with the project at different stages of the project's implementation phase, it would be useful to hold training sessions for groups of partners. Where necessary, such training sessions could explain ILO principles, proposal requirements and reporting formats (adapted from other projects, where possible).
- Because the ILO has no staff presence in the destination countries covered by this project, implementation of project activities in those locations has been relatively slow and has required frequent visits by the CTA. While the project made good use of information supplied by the Bangkok SRO on possible collaborating partners, the project would have benefited from the availability of more time and resources for activities in destination countries.

B. Philippines

The project is a pioneering and path breaking exercise that requires time to test approaches and strategies and observe the emergence of the desired results. What this immediately implies is the need to extend the project duration either a) through extension of the current phase or b) expansion into another phase to give adequate time for the project to come to full fruition.

Development projects of this nature would usually require significant time for social preparation to create a fertile ground for the social changes being advocated and for piloting effective strategies and institutionalizing or laying the ground for eventual sustainability and institutionalization. In a very similar development project on home workers funded by ILO-DANIDA, Rural Women Workers in the Putting Out System,

1988-1996, the issues of legal and social protection had to be brought to the fore and much work was spent on raising the awareness of key stakeholders. Also, at least one year was spent on studying the ground situation, identifying key partners and advocates who could champion the cause far beyond the project duration.

The overall project design seeks to a) create an enabling and supportive environment to the domestic workers and b) extend direct assistance to the domestic worker. It accepts domestic work as a proper job and seeks to have it professionalized. In fact this is the very issue for advocacy. This is fine considering the current job deficits in the Philippines and the reality that there is demand for domestic work locally and overseas. But in the light of the risk of trafficking, abuse and exploitation, would it not make sense to include a component that seeks to create alternative jobs and income sources at the point of the domestic workers' regional/provincial origin? If approached from the latter perspective, this puts greater onus on the local and community officials in job generation. And from the standpoint of project strategy, direct assistance could come in the form of sustainable livelihood, self-employment and entrepreneurship assistance. In the SA, Recommendation 9, makes a similar point (SA, p. 64).

The main instruments for creating an enabling environment is legislation and capacity building of institutional players and stakeholders, employers, government, workers' associations, etc. Greater importance should be given to strengthening community-focused players and local governance because when abuse and violations occur, the resort of first instance are the local officials and grassroots based NGOs as in the case of violence against women (VAW) cases.

Some lessons learned in the course of project implementation are:

1. The framework must evolve over time because the phenomenon of migration and employment are dynamic by nature. (RC) The forced labor framework needs to be better understood in country. More work is needed to shed light on the notion of forced labor and trafficking and its interpretation within the Philippine context. "Although general awareness regarding trafficking in persons is expected to rise as implementation of the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act of 2003 progresses, there is a currently a lack of awareness regarding the risks and realities of forced labor and trafficking among domestic helpers, source of communities for domestic helpers and the general public. There is also a lack of understanding regarding the distinctions between trafficking, illegal recruitment, and economic migration." (Situational Analysis, p. 62)

(It must be noted that the harnessing of people for domestic work has had long historical roots in the Philippines and had been culturally seen as a "benevolent" relationship for the better off to help the less fortunate. In some cases, kins are taken on board as household help to actually provide income assistance to the needy family. In the light of modernization, this relationship is being taken out of its old cultural context and is interpreted within the framework of the labor market.)

2. There are numerous spontaneous initiatives on the ground which could be cited as good practices in extending social protection of domestic workers. More investment can be made in methodically documenting these good practices and popularize them, especially at the local government levels.
3. The project should build upon existing development initiatives in the Philippines, support and upscale them. This approach would be an efficient and effective way of approaching actions on the ground.
4. Advocacy can be effectively pursued if there is strong evidence base. The data and statistical base for the domestic workers' vulnerability to trafficking and forced labor needs to be strengthened considerably.

Annex 1: Mid-term review timetable

A. Indonesia

Date	Appointment	Time	Venue
8 Sept	Ms. Irma Alamsyah Djaya Putra - MenNegPP	09:00	MenNegPP
8 Sept	Mr. Husein Alaydrus - APJATI	11:00	ILO
9 Sept	Mr. Peter Rademaker – ILO (Dep. Dir)	09:15	ILO
9 Sept	Ms. Asenaca Colawai – ILO (backstopping)	10:15	ILO
9 Sept	Ms. Maria Pakpahan – ILO (NPC)	11:30	ILO
9 Sept	Ms. Lotte Kejser – ILO (CTA)	15:00	ILO
11 Sept	Ms. Anita – Rumpun Gema Perempuan Field visit to Kemuning group of DW	17:00 – 20:30	Kemuning
12 Sept	Mr. Ferry Adamhar - Deplu	11:00	Deplu
12 Sept	Ms. Dorothea – ILO (admin. secretary)	13:45	ILO
12 Sept	Mr. Miftah/Mr. Hadi - SBMI	14:15	ILO
13 Sept	Mr. Soegito/Mr. Tarmono - APPSI	09:00	ILO
13 Sept	Ms. Nina Tursinah - APINDO	11:00	APINDO
13 Sept	Mr. Felix - KOPBUMI	13:30	ILO
13 Sept	Ms. Aida Milasari/Ms. Ira – RGP	14:30	ILO
14 Sept	Ms. Ari Sunarijati – FSPSI-R	10:00	FSPSI-R
16 Sept	Ms. Fifi Arianti - Depnaker	09:00	Depnaker
16 Sept	ILO Facilitation Meeting*	10:30 – 12:30	ILO
16 Sept	Ms. Lotte Kejser - ILO	13:30	ILO
16 Sept	Ms. Nena Zein – Fatayat NU	15:30	ILO
17 Sept	Ms. Nurul Qoiriah - AMC	10:30	Hotel Sofyan
18 Sept	Ms. Anita – Rumpun Gema Perempuan Field visit to Swangan, West Java	14:30 – 17:30	Sawangan
19 Sept	Ms. Maria Pakpahan - ILO	09:30	ILO
22 Sept	Ms. Tati Krisnawati – Komnas Perempuan	11:00	Komnas P
23 Sept	Mr. Alan Boulton – ILO (Director)	10:00	ILO
30 Sept	Ms. Asha D’Souza – ILO SAP-FL	15:00	ILO
5 Oct	ILO project staff meeting**	09:00 - 12:00	ILO

* Participants in ILO Facilitation Meeting: Ms. Lotte Kejser (CTA), Ms. Maria Pakpahan (NPC), Ms. Asenaca Colawai (ILO Jakarta backstopping officer) and Ms. Annemarie Reerink (mid-term review consultant)

** Participants in ILO project staff meeting: Ms. Lotte Kejser (CTA), Ms. Maria Pakpahan (NPC), Ms. Asenaca Colawai (ILO Jakarta backstopping officer), Ms. Asha D’Souza (ILO SAP-FL backstopping officer), Mr. William Pang (intern), Ms. Dorothea Soetiman (administrative secretary) and Ms. Annemarie Reerink (mid-term review consultant).

Phone interviews:

Ms. Susi Apriyanti – Serikat PRT Tunas Mulia: 16 September 14:30

B. List of Informants and Respondents Philippines

Government Sector:

Ms. Marichu Liwanag & staff: Foreign Service Institute
Atty. Edna Mae Lazaro: Department of Foreign Affairs-OUMWA

Ms. Ahmma Charisma Lobrin, Mr. Levinson Alcantara: Institute for Labor Studies

Director Maria Luisa Gigette Imperial & staff: Bureau of Local Employment

Deputy Administrator Ramon Tionloc, Jr., Atty. Virginia Calvez, Ms. Francy Baldoza,
Mr. Augusto San Diego: Philippine Overseas Employment Administration

Angelita Santos: Bureau of Women and Young Workers

Ms. Irene Isaac, Ms. Luz Amponin: Technical Education and Skills Development
Authority

Mr. Ignacio S. Diaz, Jr. & staff: Quezon City Industrial Relations Office

NGO

Ms. Ma. Cecilia Oebanda, Mr. Vio Montaño: Visayan Forum Foundation, Inc.

Sr. Anne R. Resurrecion: Religious of Mary Immaculate

Sr. Mary Bernadette de Guzman: Center for Overseas Workers

Ms. Virginia Pasalo: Women in Development

Ms. Malu Marin: Action for Health Initiatives, Inc.

Trade Union

Mr. Tony Asper & staff: Federation of Free Workers

Employer and Private Sector

Mr. Nomer A. Macalacad: Employers Confederation of the Philippines

Mr. Manuel Dayrit: Confederation of Homeowners Association

Ms. Ligaya M. Barcinas: League of Barangay-Makati

Ms. Constancia O. Lichauco: Barangay Bel-Air Makati

Mr. Bernardino P. Miguel: Philippine Organization of Private Employment Agencies

ILO-SRO-MNL

Mr. Ricardo R. Casco

Mr. Temesgen Samuel

Ms. Serenidad Lavador

Ms. Hilda Tidalgo

Ms. Ma. Antonina S. Ducusin

ILO Jakarta

Lotte Kejser

ILO Geneva

Ashza d'Souza

Annex 2: List of documents reviewed

A. Indonesia and destination countries

1. Guidelines for Preparation of Independent Evaluations
2. Project document
3. PAC summary report
4. PAC list of attendance
5. Matrixes of implemented project activities, sponsored contracts, direct activities, time line of major events, excol monitoring
6. Progress reports (Jan-June 2004, July-Dec 2004, Jan-June 2005)
7. Monthly progress reports (Jan-March 2005, April 2005, July 2005, August 2005)
8. Job descriptions (CTA, NPC, Administrative Secretary)
9. Report from counterparts
 - KOPBUMI
 - Rumpun Gema Perempuan (2 reports)
 - SPM
 - Fatayat NU Workshop
 - Fatayat NU public dialogue (3 reports)
 - Fatayat NU anti-trafficking leaflet
 - JALA seminar
 - JALA report of workshop
 - Tunas Mulia workshop
 - FOBMI/SBMI congress
 - Fatayat NU – joint workshop with Muslim women’s organisations

B. List of documents reviewed for Philippines

1. SPROUT and Work Plan 2004-2006
2. Analysis of the Situation of Filipino Domestic workers by Nicole J. Sayres
3. Strategy to Implement the Philippine Component of the ILO Project by Nicole J. Sayres
4. Project Work Plan & Budget
5. Semestral Donor Reports: First & Second Semester 2004 and First Semester 2005
6. Monthly Accomplishment Reports (February-June 2005)
7. Job Descriptions of National Project Coordinator and Secretary
8. Collaborator’s Service Contracts Annex 2: Terms of Reference
9. Selected Papers and Reports by Project Team
 - ILO Action to Address Trafficking of Domestic Workers by R. Casco
 - Decent Work in Asia: Inputs from DOMWORK, Philippines
10. Selected Draft and Final Outputs by Collaborators
 - Local Ordinance Models
 - Model Employment Contract (ILS)
 - Kasambahay Bill References
 - Training Regulations for Household Services (TESDA)

National Domestic Worker Summit References (VF)

Progress Report of Multi-Component Project of Visayan Forum which includes those benefiting SUMAPI

11. References on National Plan of Action on Decent Work
12. Concept Paper: Presenting the Second Phase of the Domestic Worker Project to Prospective Donors: Philippine Inputs
13. Promoting Job Quality for Domestic Workers in Asia and the Middle East by ILOSAP-FL