



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation Unit

Capacity building for the implementation of the Roads 2000 programme and the enhancement of quality and delivery of employment-intensive technology training

Quick facts

Country: Kenya

Mid-Term Evaluation: June 2011

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

Technical Area: *Employment-intensive Investment Programme*

Evaluation Management: ILO CO in Dar es Salaam

Evaluation Team: Bjorn Johannessen

Project Start: 1 March 2009

Project End: 30 June 2012

Project Code: KEN/08/02M/SID

Donor: Sweden (US\$ 3,726,418)

Keywords: *Labour-based works technology, rural roads, poverty alleviation, maintenance*

employment generation and other social benefits.

The ILO project provides support to a road works programme that has been in operation for more than 10 years. The main focus of the ILO TA is towards the Kenya Rural Roads Authority (KeRRA), which is the agency responsible for the coordination of the Roads 2000 programme. KeRRA provides office facilities for the ILO project and also acts as the main counterpart.

For training related activities, the project interacts closely with the Kisii Training Centre (KTC) and the Kenya Institute of Highways and Building Technology (KIHBT). KTC is the main provider of training in labour-based road works technology, conducting a wide range of related courses for government staff and small-scale contractors.

Although a major component of the project TA consists of institutional development support to KeRRA, there is also regular interaction with the other road sector agencies including the Kenya Highway Authority (KenHA), Kenya Urban Roads Authority (KURA), Kenya Wildlife Services (KWS), Kenya Roads Board (KRB) and the Ministry of Roads (MoR).

The development of guidelines on various crosscutting issues is meant for the road sector as a whole and therefore involves all four road works agencies. Technical support to on-going road pavement trials in Muranga and Bondo has led to close collaboration with the Materials Branch in MoR.

The project provides technical assistance to the Roads 2000 programme, which covers the entire country. This implies that the project has a geographical coverage spanning all of Kenya and interacts with all projects forming part of the Roads

Background and context

The overall objective of the project is to improve and expand the implementation of the Roads 2000 programme in all roads authorities as originally envisaged in the Strategic Plan for the Roads 2000 Programme. To achieve this, three main activity interventions have been identified:

- (i) improve training of stakeholders (small scale contractors, road authority technical staff, etc.) to undertake small-scale road works,
- (ii) improve exchange of information and experience between projects and initiatives leading to more cost effective and efficient use of resources, and
- (iii) improve the performance and visibility of the Roads 2000 Strategy with respect to

2000 programme. As part of the support to KeRRA it assists in the supervision and monitoring of the various Roads 2000 projects.

The ILO technical assistance team consists of two experts an engineer and team leader, Asfaw Kidanu, and a development economist, John Mukoza. In addition, the project draws on short-terms specialists from within and outside Kenya for training-related activities and for some of the crosscutting issues introduced by the project.

Present situation of project

The objective of the Roads 2000 programme was originally formulated as “maintenance of the classified road network to an economic level of serviceability using local-resources and labour-based methods wherever these are cost effective”. As such, Roads 2000 is a major policy shift from earlier programmes, as it adopts a road network approach with a strong emphasis on maintenance and providing rural access with currently available resources.

The overall objective of the ILO TA is to support the Government in up-scaling the implementation of Roads 2000. This is done through (i) general management support to the programme, (ii) further development of programme policy and strategy documents and implementation guidelines, (iii) development of technology and work methods, (iv) improved monitoring and supervision of road works and (v) training and information dissemination.

The total project budget amounts to US\$3,7 million, financed by the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA). The project has been in operation since April 2009. Initially, it was to run up to June 2010 but was later extended by two years to June 2012 at the request of KeRRA. A detailed review of activities and outputs as defined in the logical framework in the original project agreement indicates that good work progress has been achieved and that the TA team is in a good position to complete all activities by the end of the project next year.

Methodology of evaluation

Information has been drawn from two main sources, a desk based review of project related documentation and interviews with ILO staff and key personnel from government agencies to which the project provides support, and related projects.

Field visits were carried out to selected road works sites to obtain an impression of the quality of works and the effects of training and technical support provided by the project.

Main findings and conclusions

Relevance and strategic fit

As the main purpose of the project is to support the Roads 2000 programme, the relevance of the ILO TA is therefore closely linked to the objectives and strategy of Roads 2000. Roads 2000 remains a sound approach for improving and maintaining the road network in Kenya. Current government commitment to infrastructure development is strong and Roads 2000 figures as a key implementation strategy.

The emphasis on the use of labour-based road works technology results in added benefits through the significant employment generated. In addition, the programme has with support from the ILO TA incorporated several crosscutting issues into its implementation strategy, including community participation, environmental concerns, labour rights, occupational safety and health, HIV/AIDS, and persons with disabilities.

Considering the recent restructuring in the road sector, the ILO technical assistance is both relevant and timely. □□The project has been designed to provide support to a nationwide programme and not only an individual project. As such, it contributes to the government's goals of building sound and capable institutions in charge of the road sector. In addition, the TA, due to this design, also has an impact on other donor funded projects as the capacity development activities address nationwide demands.

Validity of design and efficiency of resource use

The project was designed to address specific challenges facing the Roads 2000 programme. These challenges were identified through detailed discussions between government and development partners and clearly spelt out in the project document. The outputs and activities identified to address these challenges are logical and seem to have had the desired effect in terms of strengthening the programme. The outputs are also logical in relation to the objectives of the project.

This is partly due to the fact that the objectives are practical and not over-ambitious.

Aspects of sustainability of outputs permeate the project. The main emphasis of the TA is to strengthen institutions involved in the implementation of the Roads 2000 programme. Outputs are centred around the development of sound management procedures within these institutions, producing policies and related guidelines owned by the same institutions and integrating these into existing training programmes and finally strengthening the training provided as part of the programme.

Project effectiveness

In terms of reaching its overall objective of scaling up the implementation of Roads 2000, the project is achieving its expected impact. There is still a large potential for improvements, and with the current emphasis of project activities, further improvements are expected.

The project has been successful in mobilising key technical personnel and expertise within and outside government when embarking on new initiatives thereby securing good ownership as well as expert manpower resources beyond those available from the project. The ILO TA has also made strategic use of collaboration with other ILO programmes within and outside Kenya.

The strong ownership of project outputs from the government side, has led to an active involvement of key stakeholders in partaking and reviewing the improvements made to various implementation and training tools. This has had a positive effect on the quality and relevance of project outputs with the result that the guidelines and tools produced are adopted as government documents, forming part of the management system within KeRRA and the other road agencies.

New training programmes in the use of the newly developed Roads 2000 tools are being incorporated in the General Training Plan of KTC, while also taking into account new training needs arising from upcoming Roads 2000 projects. There is still a strong demand to provide training and support to works activities within KeRRA that are not supported by any of the development partners. Furthermore, the ILO TA has focused on strengthening Roads 2000 activities within KeRRA and to a lesser extent in KenHA, KURA and KWS

where there are similar capacity development potentials.

Employment generation

With support from the ILO TA, the employment generation is monitored in all the on-going Roads 2000 projects. To date, a total of 4,9 million workdays have been generated through the road works. This is equivalent to some 20,000 work years. There are wide variations in employment generated in the various projects, indicating a significant potential for increasing the use of labour-based work methods and thus increasing the number of jobs created. In addition, there is further potential for increasing employment in government funded works in all four road works agencies.

Pavement trials

The ILO TA has supported field trials on the use of stabilised base courses and emulsion based surface seals in Muranga in Central Province and Bondo District in Nyanza. In addition, the use of stone pavement was tried out on a short road section in Bondo. The new technical solutions are expected to (i) reduce initial costs of upgrading roads to bitumen surface standard and (ii) reduce total life-cycle costs of roads with higher traffic volumes. The new pavement technology is an important asset to the Roads 2000 programme as it demonstrates how higher construction standards can be achieved while still applying labour-based work methods.

Need for further TA

The project commenced at a time when the road works institutions were being restructured. This in itself posed both challenges and opportunities. Working with new organisations has the advantage that it allows for new thinking and the introduction of new implementation arrangements, procedures, guidelines, etc.

In that respect, the ILO TA is acknowledged as a valuable input to the establishment of KeRRA. This job is however not complete. There is still a number of development challenges facing the sector and also more training and institutional capacity development required.

County administrations

Next year, a new form of local government bodies will be established at county level. The new constitution of Kenya already assigns duties and

mandates for the new county level government, which include the upkeep of “county roads”. The establishment and development of these county level organisations will have a direct impact on the future role and organisation of KeRRA and KURA.

This poses a certain a risk factor in relation to the sustainability of some of the systems and procedures established within KeRRA, some of which have been developed with support from the ILO TA. At this stage it is difficult to assess which part of the development results are at risk as the development of the new county government bodies is yet to commence. All the same, it is expected that the county administrations will take charge of rural road works implementation and this implies that financial, administrative and technical capacity need to be established within these bodies.

The Roads 2000 programme survived the recent restructuring of the road sector. With its firm basis on sound implementation strategies, well defined in manuals, training tools and guidelines, it has a reasonable chance of surviving the imminent restructuring.

Still, for this change to take place in a structured manner, it requires a concerted effort in terms of allocating sufficient technical and managerial resources that can be used first to define the new structures and secondly assist in building the required capacity.

Recommendations

Main recommendations and follow-up

The following recommendations are targeted towards the government, the ILO TA and the ILO’s overall support to Kenya:

- (i) Analyse potential for job creation and set targets for employment in each of the Roads 2000 projects as well as within each of the four road works agencies. With the current monitoring system in place, this would provide a more proactive management approach for the Roads 2000 projects;
- (ii) Formulate new capacity development demands in order to further mainstream the application of the Roads 2000 Strategy. Naturally, these would be linked to the employment targets as proposed above;

- (iii) Establish core units within the road agencies to deal with capacity development in support of increasing the application of the Roads 2000 Strategy. These units would essentially have a mandate similar to that of the current ILO TA;
- (iv) Assess TA requirements in the proposed capacity development units in order to reach reasonable targets and involve development partners;
- (v) Prepare for the new county administrations and identify capacity development needs. Roads 2000 has a complete set of sound management and implementation tools which can be used in the county institutions;
- (vi) Include Roads 2000 and related employment generation programmes in the next DWCP for Kenya. Employment generation is today a major concern of the Government. The ILO has a long history of successful work in this field and should take advantage of this when formulating the next DWCP for Kenya;
- (vii) Document work methods and technical specifications applied in the surface trials in order to facilitate a structured increase of its use. Plans have been made to expand the use of the new pavement technology. The successful expansion depends on properly defined work instructions in the form of technical guidelines;
- (viii) Secure a process for future monitoring of the pavement trials with a view to establish clear guidelines for the application of the new standards;
- (ix) Resuscitate the international training courses at KTC/KIHBT, thereby regaining the reputation as a centre of excellence by marketing the existing training capacity in country and overseas. KTC/KIHBT still has the capacity to run such courses and there are very few providers of such training, so the market is there for such services;
- (x) Continue ILO involvement in strengthening Roads 2000. The ILO project has successfully demonstrated the effective use of technical assistance in a large-scale government infrastructure works programme. This arrangement can act as a model for future technical cooperation between ILO and the Government of Kenya.