



Evaluation Summaries

Combating Hazardous Child Labour in Tobacco Farming in Urambo District, Phase II – UTSP, Tanzania

Quick Facts

Countries: Tanzania

Mid-Term Evaluation: July 2009

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

Technical Area: Child Labour

Evaluation Management: ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED)

Evaluation Team: Stephen Tembo, (Team leader); Sitta Ngissa, (National Consultant)

Project Start: January/February 2007,

Project End: US \$ 1,439,671

Project Code: URT/06/02/ECT

Donor: Elimination of Child Labour in Tobacco Growing (ECLT) US\$ 1,439,671

Keywords: Child Labour, Tobacco

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The implementation of Urambo Tobacco Sector Project (UTSP) Phase II started in January/February 2007, for a total period of four years. Funded by Elimination of Child Labour in Tobacco Growing (ECLT), the total budget for the four year period is US\$ 1,439,671 (including US\$ 116,999 that has been transferred from Phase I). The second Phase focuses on utilization and building on partner skills for addressing the root cause of child labour (CL) in Urambo. It was preceded by Phase I.

Development Objective

The overall objective is to contribute to the prevention and elimination of child labour in Tanzania, particularly hazardous child labour in tobacco growing.

Immediate objectives

These are two-fold:

- (i) By the end of the project, model interventions for the prevention and elimination of CL in tobacco growing are in place in Urambo district, and;
- (ii) By the end of the project, capacity of communities and relevant institutions will have been strengthened to address CL issues in a sustainable manner.

Present situation of project

CL was correctly identified as a core problem in the Urambo district. It continues to persist, caused by high levels of poverty and HIV/AIDS prevalence. The project has made good strides towards undertaking an effective sensitization campaign on hazardous CL as evidenced by the articulation of the seriousness of the problem by all levels of stakeholders at both district and community levels.

The project is supporting the implementation of 14 action programmes (APs) with a total budget of US\$ 662,050 (excluding facilitation costs by the project office in Urambo) for a period of four years. Six local NGOs have been engaged for implementation as Agencies

(IAs). However, the IAs have capacity challenges evidenced by slow responsiveness to the project reporting demands. Capacity building efforts undertaken by the project team have gone a long way in improving IAs performance. More training is needed.

The project has successfully established a number of fora at both district and community level to promote coordination, collaboration and synergies. However, these fora have not been taken advantage of to fully exploit their benefits. In some cases, there is a duplication of such structures in terms of the functions they ought to be engaged in. For example, the District Child Labour Subcommittee (DCLSC) could greatly benefit in terms of resources if it was merged with the Project Coordination Committee (PCC) and the functions of the two streamlined. It would be more cost-effective, therefore, to streamline the institutions at district level in order to enhance prudent resource management and utilization as well as deal with sustainability issues of appropriate structures beyond the project life.

At least two thirds of the recommendations made following the final evaluation of phase I have been incorporated into Phase II. This includes the recommendation

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

These are primarily three-fold:

- (i) At least 1,500 girls and boys up to 15 years involved in or at risk of CL in tobacco sector were to be withdrawn or prevented through education opportunities;
- (ii) At least 200 girls and boys 14-18 years involved in or at risk of hazardous CL in tobacco provided with formal/informal vocational skills training. 400 girls and boys under the age of 16 that are withdrawn through the Commercial Agriculture (COMAGRI) support, benefit from supplementary social protection interventions such as health care and post-skill training grants, and;
- (iii) At least 250-300 parents/guardians whose children were targeted for prevention from CL, were to be supported with Income Generating Activities (IGAs), credit and savings scheme

and capacity building. The focus was particularly to be on the most vulnerable of such families.

Methodology of evaluation

Literature review started on 15th January 2009 for three days. This went on throughout the field data collection period. Data collection through stakeholder interviews took place from the 20th of January 2009 and culminated into a stakeholder workshop on the 29th of January 2009. The stakeholder workshop had a three-fold purpose, namely:

- (i) Present preliminary findings of the UTSP Mid-term Evaluation by the consultants;
- (ii) Provide an opportunity for stakeholders to make the necessary corrections on the preliminary findings, and;
- (iii) Provide an occasion for stakeholders to fill in the gaps with regards to the data collected.

Main Findings & Conclusions

CL was correctly identified as a core problem in the Urambo district. It continues to persist, caused by high levels of poverty and HIV/AIDS prevalence. The project has made good strides towards undertaking an effective sensitization campaign on hazardous CL as evidenced by the articulation of the seriousness of the problem by all levels of stakeholders at both district and community levels.

The overall performance at mid-term of the project towards the achievement of its targets was low. The achievement of the target relating to withdrawal and prevention of 1,500 boys and girls from hazardous CL was at 4% while none had been trained in vocational skills, out of the targeted 200 boys and girls. On support given towards Income Generating Activities (IGAs) for caregivers (parents and guardians), though 104% of the target population had received sunflower seed for the first time during the data collection period of the MTE, the benefits (in terms of improvement in household income) had not yet started accruing as the initiative had just

been initiated. The ultimate aim of the IGA initiative was to increase the families' household income in order to enable them to send children to school which would then impact positively on reducing CL.

However, this is not yet visible at the MTE stage. There is dire need to broaden the IGA base. The starting point could be an assessment of the viability of the IGAs undertaken during Phase I. The most viable IGAs could then be included in the IGA portfolio for Phase II.

Notwithstanding available statistics, it is the evaluators considered opinion that the project will meet its set targets in the remaining half of its life. This is on account of the fact that adequate ground work has already been done, including the submission of the necessary documentation to ILO/IPEC Geneva to facilitate disbursement of the next installment.

About 29% of the approved budget specifically ear-marked for APs (excluding administrative costs for project management) was expended at the time of the mid-term evaluation. Expenditure by agencies ranged from 20% (those providing relevant education to withdrawn children) to 98% (for Basic Child Labour Monitoring System and capacity building at ward and village level). The expenditure was within the anticipated range, given the amount of ground work that has already been done by mid-term.

Efforts towards awareness creation and strengthening of local institutions have advanced well with some considerable fruit being evident. For instance, the tobacco companies have responded well in supporting the oxenization programme as an internal strategy to enhance the efficiency of tobacco transportation. This has resulted in a reduction of losses per unit area, from 40% before oxenization, to 20% after oxenization. In this regard, both farmers and the tobacco companies are showing signs of benefiting, with the farmers benefiting through improved household income and the tobacco companies,

through increased revenue arising from improved quality and quantity.

However, there is need for an impact assessment to quantify the actual increase in income accruing to both parties, i.e. farmers and the tobacco companies.

Though the project has a Monitoring and Evaluation system in place, it has had a number of challenges, particularly relating to failure by lower level stakeholders to utilize the generated information to improve project performance. What was clear is that a number of M&E components (e.g. the Direct beneficiary Monitoring and Reporting (DBMR) and Technical Progress Reports (TPR)) were intended to provide data to ILO/IPEC who designed them. There is need, therefore, to re-orient the M&E system in order to make it more relevant to meeting information needs of all stakeholders, particularly the information needs related to project impact, e.g. impact of IGAs. As a matter of urgency, there is need to refine, expand and recast the entire indicator matrix.

The operationalization of the M&E system at sub-district level was not adequate and requires further capacity building and systematic backstopping.

Not much progress has been made in improving disbursement procedures following the recommendations the final evaluation of Phase I. For instance, from IPEC HQ approval to advance payment, it took nearly half a year (i.e. five months). The period between the advance payment and the second progress payment was 7.5 months, i.e. almost two thirds of the year.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

1. Notwithstanding the challenges relating to the effective implementation of UTSP Phase II that have been highlighted in this report (including: (i) lengthy disbursement

procedures and; (ii) low capacity of IAs) the progress made by the project at MTE in meeting its objective targets is considerable. The project has successfully undertaken prerequisite activities that would be a basis for accelerated completion of its whole mandate in the remaining half of its life. Such prerequisite activities include: sensitization and capacity building of various partners and institutions at both district and community level. At the time of the MTE, the IAs had all successfully submitted documentation to trigger the next funding. For the vast majority of the APs, it is expected that the next funding will enable the respective IAs to reach their remaining targets.

2. On account of the foregoing, and the fact that Phase II started with the need to complete six carry over APs from Phase I, it is the evaluators' considered opinion that the project will successfully meet its targets in the remaining half of its life.

3. The magnitude of the CL problem in Tanzania is deeply rooted in high poverty levels, a fact that cannot be ignored in many developing countries. Poverty is a complex phenomenon. It needs a multi-faceted approach if it is to be dealt with adequately. In this regard, concerted efforts should be made by all stakeholders whether they be: government, the civil society or community members themselves. This is a long-term commitment. It is unrealistic to expect the project to resolve all CL related concerns in the areas it is working in given the magnitude of the problem, its root cause and the resource limitation. Consequently, the project should be seen as an initiative that has kick-started long-term sustained efforts by all stakeholders aimed at fighting the WFCL.

4. One of the greatest avenues for sustaining the fight against CL beyond the project life is the involvement of private sector institutions. The tobacco companies have done Combating Hazardous Child Labour in Tobacco Farming in Urambo District, Phase II – UTSP, Tanzania Independent Mid-term Evaluation -

2009 43 particularly well in the oxenization program. This should be encouraged all the more as it is one of the potential good practices. It is a model with high potential to fight the WFCL. However, there is need to undertake an impact assessment of the oxenisation programme by the two tobacco companies in order to quantify the benefits. This is likely to act as an incentive thereby triggering greater investment and more activities by the tobacco companies towards the fight against the WFCL in tobacco growing. Such a study is likely to motivate other stakeholders to get more actively involved.

Important lessons learned

The lessons are dealt with in the following way: (i) highlighting the general lesson learnt, and (ii) briefly discussing the context in which the lesson was learnt. Such a presentation is meant to deepen the appreciation of a lesson. The order in which the lessons appear is not necessarily a reflection of their respective importance. The lessons have been grouped according to the evaluation criteria beginning with design i.e. in cases where issues have been identified under such criteria.

Design

1a. General lesson: The capacity of an institution is dependent on a number of factors some of which may be beyond the control of the institution concerned. Consequently, during the design phase, it is crucial to undertake a comprehensive review of all factors that are likely to affect the performance of an institution (including whether the budgetary provisions for staff remuneration are sufficient to attract and retain qualified staff).

1b. The context of the lesson: To a great extent, the low capacity of the IAs staff as well as their high staff turn-over was due to low budgetary provisions. The total Phase II budget for 14 APs over a period of nearly four years was US\$ 662,050. What goes towards the administration is a fraction of the total budget, usually not more than 10% for projects

of this nature. It is not surprising, therefore, that the IAs had a challenge to engage suitably qualified staff as well as to retain those engaged. This scenario suggests that a comprehensive assessment of institutional capacity alluded to in (1a) above was not sufficiently done.

Implementation

2a (i). General lesson: Resource leveraging and a well designed referral system that links up project beneficiaries and implementers to alternative funding sources, should be given serious attention at both design and implementation stages. In order to ensure that this is happening, the project's monitoring and evaluation system should include key performance indicators to facilitate the monitoring of financial and other resources being mobilized from alternative sources during project implementation.

2a (ii). General lesson: Linked to the point above, it is vital to abundantly make it clear the limitations of the project from the very start in terms of what it can do and what it cannot do. For a project of this nature that deals with a huge and complex problem (in this case WFCL) whose coverage is not only district wide, but also nation wide, there is always the danger of creating over-expectations. In this regard, it is important that such an aggressive sensitization and awareness package that underscores the fact that the project is only kick-starting efforts to deal with WFCL, should be embedded in its day to day operations. Combating Hazardous Child Labour in Tobacco Farming in Urambo District, Phase II – UTSP, Tanzania Independent Mid-term Evaluation - 2009 42

2.b The context of the lessons: In many ways, some stakeholders demonstrated an overdependence syndrome on the project. This was particularly evidenced by an out-cry from community leaders and teachers on the inadequate resources from the project. This matter came up in all the six out of the nine wards the project is operating in. The basis of

such an out-cry were the large numbers of OVC who needed support. In a number of cases, there was desperation that was evident on account of the magnitude of the problem.

3.a General lesson: A public-private sector partnership can work well in the fight against the Worst Forms of Child Labour. The prerequisite for such success is a carefully thought through sustained sensitization initiative that aims at bringing the private sector on board. It takes the private sector to appreciate at least two fundamental issues for it to respond appropriately: (i) the private sector's social responsibility, and (ii) the benefits to the private sector which tends usually to be long term, where such benefits apply.

3.b The context of the lesson: The two tobacco companies operating in the Urambo district have responded well in their efforts to fight the WFCL. The most outstanding response by the tobacco companies relates to the oxenization programme whose growth has been impressive over the years. From the analysis in Chapter 4, the programme appears to be positively contributing to the fight against the WFCL through the usage of more efficient means of transportation. It also appears that the project is positively contributing towards household income which empowers households to provide for the school needs of their children.