



Evaluation Summaries

Evaluation: Promoting Good Governance and Decent Work in the Mediterranean through Improved Labour Administration and Social Dialogue

Quick Facts

Countries: *Algeria, Jordan and Lebanon*

Final Evaluation: *December 2010*

Mode of Evaluation: *Independent*

Technical Area: *Labour Administration and Social Dialogue*

Evaluation Management: *LAB/ADMIN*

Evaluation Team: *Michele Colucci*

Project Start: *1 August 2008*

Project End: *31 December 2010*

Project Code: *INT/08/11/ITA*

Donor: *Italy*

Keywords: *Labour Administration, Social Dialogue, Mediterranean Countries*

Background & Context

The Italian-funded ILO Project “Promoting good governance and decent work in the Mediterranean through improved labour administration and social dialogue” supports activities related to the Joint Immediate Outcomes 11 and 12 and development of universal tools. The strategy for delivering these Joint Immediate Outcomes includes activities requested by the ILO Governing Body, at the global and national levels; helping member States undertake tripartite audits of labour inspectorates and developing national action plans to strengthen inspection services.

The objective of the evaluation was to assess the efficiencies and extent of the implementation of the Project.

In this regard, the purpose of the final evaluation was to:

- a. Determine whether the Project has achieved the immediate stated objectives and to which extent;
- b. Explain any difficulties encountered and identify lessons learned;
- c. Determine to which extent the identified outputs have been achieved and assess the implementation status;
- d. Evaluate the quality of the Project design, Project management and performance monitoring vis-à-vis the achievement of Project immediate objectives;
- e. Assess potential of Project continuation and of a consolidation of Project results achieved towards the fulfilment of the milestones indicated in the P & B 2010-2011 under outcome 11, indicator 11:1: strengthening labour administration in line with international labour standards and the Strategic Policy Framework 2010-15.
- f. Evaluate the efficiency and impact of the methodological approach which was applied within the Project for the capacity building of relevant national labour administrations.

The evaluation methodology was based on the analysis of existing information, data gathered through a preliminary questionnaire survey sent to ILO officials and beneficiaries involved in the Project, and participatory data collection.

The evaluation was undertaken in several steps: 1) Preparation; 2) Participation in an ILO workshop in Algiers (2-5 October 2010); 3) Interviews in the ILO HQ (Geneva, 7-8 October 2010); 4) Writing the Report.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The ILO Project “*Promoting good governance and decent work in the Mediterranean through improved labour administration and social dialogue*” has partially met its objectives. In general, it has been implemented in an effective manner at least with regard to the training activities foreseen. Indeed, there have been reasonable deviations from the initial Project description due to political difficulties encountered during the implementation of the Project activities and that were beyond the ILO control.

The ILO and national-level stakeholders showed good participation and ownership, contributing to the results. In particular, the Algerian stakeholders exhibited an excellent participation and their enthusiasm and support for the program contributed to the overall results.

The evaluation did not identify any significant Project deficiencies that could be related to the ILO. The one exception was the under-estimation in the planning phase of the national political scenarios and time needed for the implementation of the Project.

Some specific additional findings are that the Project:

- ✓ has partially met its objectives to promote Good Governance and Decent Work, with some result varying according to the country context;
- ✓ has partially met its objectives to ensure that employers’ and workers’ organisations are in a better position to engage with Government, and promote compliance with legislation;
- ✓ will be affected by the short term nature and lack of follow up to consolidate results, which undermine consolidation of results and sustainability.

As areas of concern, it was challenging to implement the program in certain participating countries (namely Lebanon) within the initial period. As a matter of fact, planning was not realistic and did not take into proper consideration the national and political situation of each country. For this reason, despite the original aim of the Project, this latter mainly provided some training activities to line-managers in the Ministry of Labour of the countries involved in the Project. These training activities were carried out timely in Algeria and Jordan, as in Lebanon they will be carried out in December 2010. In fact, the implementation activities were delayed in Lebanon due to political reasons, but hopefully they are going to take place by the ending of the Project. Some delays may be attributed to insufficient commitment and to a not realistic planning of the Project activities, goals and concrete outcomes; however, the greatest factor appears to be the national political environment that contributed significantly to the delay.

For purposes of evaluating this Project, collection and consistency of data was definitely an added challenge, since each country provides the data in whatever form they maintain it. Consistency in the types and form of data collected and reported is an area that should be given more attention in future planning.

Sustainability will ultimately be determined by the commitment and efforts made by the

government and the social partners (which, ultimately is beyond the ILO's control). Nevertheless, it may be undermined by the short-term duration of the Project and limited capacity of the ILO and governments for follow-up and consolidation of results. There was evidence that sustainability will be enhanced by an additional phase to the Project, focused on additional training. Nevertheless, the ILO made a good contribution to sustainability, through its institutional commitment, the quality of services, training support, and direct involvement of the ILO officials responsible of the Project.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

The current Project has produced tangible but incomplete results. The training activities carried out so far require consolidation, and the other components of the Project should be better addressed. In particular, there is a need to assist labour administration officers in carrying out and coordinate training and other related activities throughout the country. Termination of the Project at this moment would undermine sustainability, and may lead the loss of some achievements. The ILO and Italy, therefore, should consider an extension. If an extension is granted, work should focus on consolidation of the results in the current group of countries.

For future implementation, a proper log-frame with indicators and baselines should be developed. The log-frame will also be useful as Project management tool. A better definition of the objectives in the short, medium and long term should have been provided in advance, even supported by a better analysis of the national labour market and of the political situation of each countries.

Notwithstanding the political situation in the targeted countries prevented from implementing all components of the Project, the methodological approach foreseen might be applied to new countries. However, a few

improvements should be taken into consideration, such as:

- a better assessment of the national labour market and the political context of each participating country should be considered in advance in the Project design in order to ensure expectation and a more efficient allocation of the resources;
- a periodic reporting requirement for the countries should be foreseen in order to monitor the implementation of the Project and its consolidation;
- the creation of a dedicated web-site which could facilitate networking and exchanges of documents, best practices, ideas and knowledge should be implemented;
- a national contact person in each country involved should be clearly identified in order to guarantee a smoothly implementation of the Project activities and facilitation among the ILO, Governmental representatives and social partners.

It is noted that the project had been formulated in DIALOGUE, but that when the project was launched, it was under the responsibility of LAB/ADMIN which was created in April 2009. This shift has revealed a positive impact on the implementation of the Project. Indeed, the expertise gathered in the new Program has allowed a more coherent and smooth implementation of the Project itself. The technical competencies of the new Program dealing with social dialogue and labour administration issues permitted to better serve the beneficiaries of the Project. In particular, the beneficiaries received assistance in the capacity building of labour administration with a view to informing and advising on the social dialogue mechanisms and processes.

Important lessons learned

The evaluation process identified the following lessons learned on Project design:

1. Capacity development Projects must take a medium terms perspective, regarding both implementation and funding. One year is often too short for interventions that aim to strengthen capacity, and involved changes to systems, procedures, behavior and attitudes. This is particularly the case when a Project also seeks to expand the political commitment of the participating government, and the other social partners in areas characterized by difficult political situations.
2. The national context of each participating country needs to be assessed and considered in the Projects design, to ensure expectations and resources are realistically aligned. Future Project design may be able to weight resource allocations based on assessment results.
3. Building results frameworks into Project design is now a long established standard, to improve planning, implementation and monitoring and assessment. The ILO must build a credible results framework into future design.
4. Web-sites and other global products can facilitate networking and exchanges of ideas and participation. Beneficiaries would have been appreciated networking and exchanges and the technology for providing this for web-sites and global products is available.