



Evaluation Summaries

Strengthening Industrial Relations and Labor Law Compliance in Morocco

Quick Facts

Country : Morocco

Mode of Evaluation: Independent Final evaluation

Technical Area: Social dialogue

Evaluation management:

Evaluation team: Dr. Saskia Brand

Project Start: March 2002

Project end: September 2008

Project code: MOR0150USA

Donor: United States department of Labour (USDOL) (1,522,432US\$); International Labour Office (ILO) (1,450,000 US\$)

Keywords: Industrial relations, social dialogue, labour inspectorate

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

This project was developed and implemented against the background of the drafting of the 2004 labour code and the signature of the free trade agreement with the United States. The provisions of the labour code, along with the impact of globalization, created considerable changes in Moroccan labour relations. An increase in short-term contracts has created more insecurity and tends to reduce the membership of trade unions. On the other hand, international competition between companies increases the need for labour law conformity. An aspect of conformity that needs to be realized is the creation of enterprise committees in every company with more than 10 employees.

As all these developments call for improved industrial relations, the timing for the strengthening industrial relations project was well chosen.

The “Strengthening Industrial Relations and Labour Compliance in Morocco” project, is a combination of two projects funded by the US Department of Labour. The first ran from March 2002 to September 2006 and was funded from an umbrella cooperative agreement between the ILO and USDOL, of which the purpose was to assist countries in the application of the ILO’s Declaration on the fundamental principles and rights at work.

The second project, the purpose of which was to improve industrial relations, started in 2003 and was scheduled to end in December 2007. Because both projects had almost identical objectives they were technically integrated from the start of the second project. After a difficult start, the project effectively started in January 2005 and though scheduled to phase out by December 2007, project managers with no remaining funds available arranged for a no cost extension of 9 months, which enabled the implementation of delayed activities.

The project articulated itself around the two following immediate objectives:

1. Improved performance of the labour inspectorate in the application of the labour code
2. Strengthened skills of the project’s three partners for establishing Institutions Représentatives du Personnel (IRP) and

mechanisms for collective bargaining and conflict prevention/resolution.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of the final evaluation is to determine if the project achieved its objectives and explain why/why not; Assess and document the effects of project activities and outputs on target groups; Assess the likelihood of project outputs being sustained; And to finally report on lessons learned and best practices.

Finally, the final evaluator investigated to what extent the recommendations, made in the mid-term evaluation (January 2005), had been carried out, if not, why not, and if adopted, whether intended results were achieved as a consequence. The final clients of this evaluation are the donor agencies which are USDOL and the ILO.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation was undertaken by an independent evaluator between the 23rd of October and the 4th of 23 November 2007. The following activities were undertaken for the evaluation purpose:

- Document Review
- Pre-trip and post trip meetings
- Interviews
- Debrief in Field

Upon completion of the report, the evaluator has provided a debriefing to USDOL on the evaluation findings, conclusions, and recommendations, as well as the evaluation process.

Main findings & Conclusions

The objectives and strategies were highly relevant and appreciated by all stakeholders. The project has been responsive to the needs expressed by the target population and has been able to deliver nearly all outputs, in spite of a number of delays. These delays can be attributed to the participative approach, and to political changes with which the project has been confronted. Important progress has been made towards the achievement of the development objective. The budget has been respected and the outputs have been widely praised for their quality.

The original sustainability plan, as described in the 2003 project document, had lost its relevance after the 2005 design exercise, and a new plan has never been developed. Nevertheless, many results are likely to have a lasting impact (the training manuals, the CD-Rom, the inspectors' procedures manual, the trainers' networks, the knowledge shared, the equipment, and the improved industrial relations).

The project has been managed professionally and the communication between all parties has been good. Reports could have been timelier and should have included a Performance Monitoring Plan. Indeed, the January 2005 design exercise failed to include the development of an overall work plan and the setting of targets, and indicators were ill defined. This affected the design and use of the project monitoring plan.

Therefore, the mid-term impact of trainings on the labour code and inspection methodology can only be measured through a follow-up survey. The impact on industrial relations of recent training on collective bargaining and enterprise committees cannot be established as yet, but very likely additional activities are necessary to accompany the realization of collective labour agreements and functional enterprise committees.

The sustainability of other results depends to a large extent on efforts made by the Employment Ministry.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Important lessons learned:

- The training of young unionists was relevant for two reasons: it helped to rejuvenate the graying labour unions, and is an investment in the industrial relations of the future: in ten years these people will have leading positions and will be able to capitalize on their tripartite experiences and networks.
- The evaluations and knowledge tests administered at each workshop provided a continuous quality check at minimal cost
- The success of this project depended strongly on the professionalism, diplomatic skill, and cultural sensitivity of

the CTA. While this was a positive attribute of the project under review, it is the potential Achilles heel of any new initiative. It implies that the choice of a CTA for a possible follow-up project will need careful consideration.

Main recommendations and follow-up :

1. Organize a survey to test the knowledge level of workers and labour inspectors 1-2 years after the training on the labour code, workers representation and inspection methodology and add refresher courses as necessary to ongoing or planned training programs.
2. Follow-up on the training on enterprise committees, through practical guidance and monitoring, action plans and on-site advice, either directly or (preferably) indirectly through a joint trainers' network.
3. Plan and implement a public awareness campaign, either in the remaining months, or during the follow-up project.
4. Review the reporting method recommended in the procedures manual, in view of adapting it to the working conditions of the Moroccan labour inspectors.
5. Include a PMP in every technical progress report.
6. Organize at least two PAC meetings a year.
7. Include a binding commitment from the government of Morocco in any new engagement by the ILO to ensure the sustainability of results. This may be a commitment in terms of funds, staff time, and/or the elaboration of a plan of action.
8. Include monitoring as an activity in its own right in the work plan of the follow-up project, to ensure that sufficient staff time and budget are being dedicated to it and that mid-term impact questions are asked and answered.

9. The project team should work with the Ministry to see if the latter can commit to:
 - a. Institutionalizing the RIF
 - b. Maintaining the equipment provided
 - c. Support the use of the procedures manual
 - d. Ensure regular updates of the procedures manual
10. Develop a follow-up project to capitalize on the results of the project under review. The new project ought to:
 - a. Maintain the participative style
 - b. Strengthen further the tripartite approach and activities
 - c. Ensure a full project design, including a work plan, targets and adequate indicators
 - d. Include the awareness raising component if it is not implemented during this project
 - e. Include activities that focus on the realization and operationalization of enterprise committees and collective labour agreements