



Evaluation Summaries

Combating child labour through education and training, Phase II and

Support to the time bound Programme on the elimination of child labour in Pakistan

Quick Facts

Country : Pakistan

Date of Evaluation: May 2008

Mode of Evaluation: Independent joint final

Technical Area: Child labour

Evaluation management: ILO-IPEC's Design, Evaluation and Documentation Section (DED)

Evaluation team: Nina Louise Frankel and Fawad Usman Khan

Project Start: September 2005

Project end: September 2008

Project code: PAK/02/03/SDC, PAK/04/01/DAN

Donor: Swiss Development cooperation (SDC) (4,194,071 US\$)

Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA) (1,336,454 US\$)

Keywords: child labour and its worst forms, Time bound programme (TBP), capacity building

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

Combating Child Labour through Education and Training and Combating Child Labour through Education and Training Project of Support to the National Time Bound Programme in NWFP are a joint SDC-DANIDA supported initiative executed with the technical support of the ILO's International Programme on the Elimination of

Child Labour (IPEC). They contribute to the elimination of the Worst Forms of Labour in Pakistan, within the broader framework of the ILO-IPEC Project of Support to the Time Bound Programme in Pakistan and human rights based approach. Both projects operate in the same province of Pakistan (where two third of working children are concentrated) working with similar management structures and goals. They aim to gradually eliminate child labour practices in Pakistan's Northwest Frontier Province (NWFP) in line with internationally agreed standards through strengthening the capacity of government entities, civil society and trade unions to combat child labour in four districts of NWFP and providing direct services, principally better access to education and skills training to children at risk and their family members, using non-formal education as an entry point. In applying a Human Rights Based Approach, the projects embrace a focus on changing the perception and attitudes of duty bearers towards child labour and strengthening their capacity to play a role in ratifying and implementing ILO child labour conventions.

The Immediate Objectives of the two projects are similar and can be summarized as:

1. The provincial government (Labour Department) capacitated to formulate, implement and coordinate child labour interventions.
2. Better understanding of the child labour problem developed in the project area among

rights holders and duty bearers and strengthened capacity of policy makers, law enforcement agencies, trade unions, associations and employers organizations to implement child labour laws and exchange information on child labour laws.

3. Mechanisms for provision of quality education to working children and their siblings made functional and institutionalized and school environments improved to increase retention rates.
4. Skill enhancement avenues for working children (12~18 yrs) improved, institutionalized and integrated into technical training system.
5. Working conditions of the target group improved by protecting them from occupational accidents and diseases.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation was to evaluate both the SDC and DANIDA supported components, with a focus on their achievements and contribution to national and provincial efforts to achieve the elimination of WFCL especially within the context of the national TBP framework. The evaluation looked at the projects as a whole.

The scope of the evaluation included all SDC and DANIDA project activities to date including Action Programmes (APs) and considered project design, relevance, effectiveness, lessons learned, Good Practices and recommendations. For both projects, the evaluation focused on the extent to which they were able to achieve their intended objectives and how the lessons learned and potential good practices could inform future SDC, DANIDA and ILO programming. The timing of the evaluation which coincided with the end of the DANIDA project was before the SDC project had implemented all the prescribed activities for Phase III.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation team consisted of one international and one national consultant with an even gender balance. The methodology included document review, discussions with ILO-IPEC management in Islamabad, project staff in Peshawar, and implementing partners including government officials. The team held individual and focused group discussions with teachers and children at multipurpose centres (MPCs) and government schools and vocational training facility, project management committees and beneficiaries of the various awareness raising and skills training

activities, including employers and community members.

Group discussions and individual interviews were also held with participants of trainings on the SCREAM, Teacher Training Kit and an employers' awareness session on occupational health and safety. Due to security considerations, time in the field was very limited.

Briefings were held before and after the field visits with SDC in Islamabad to discuss SDC-specific concerns, namely the progress made with respect to institutional development and the lessons learned for subsequent programming

Main findings and conclusions

Government entities and policy frameworks are gradually taking child labour into consideration in planning and policy (afternoon schools, teachers training on child Labour, IPEC's curriculum on Supporting Children's Rights through Education, Arts and Media (SCREAM), and child Labour needs factored into new education and skills training policies). The project has moved in the right direction by taking on institution building of the DICL by strengthening the Child Labour Unit and making it the focal point in the province.

Although this component of the project remains a work in progress, due to the long term investment required for capacity building, ultimately, it will contribute to the institutionalization and long term sustainability of successful project interventions.

By developing innovative, replicable and culturally-sensitive models, the project has made great headway in fostering a greater awareness of child labour and other occupational safety and social welfare issues at different levels. It has significantly improved the knowledgebase on child labour in the NWFP and enhanced the capacity of duty bearers at all levels. The project has been for the most part successful in reaching targets to divert children from child labour by enrolling them in non-formal education and offering them formal education and skills training alternatives.

Finally, It has successfully experimented with marshalling a diverse range of partners with different approaches and perspectives to work together on child labour issues and, and has also shown that the government departments which are often accused of lethargy can be motivated and mobilized to produce high quality work.

Recommendations and Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up :

- Continue efforts to strengthen the capacity of the Provincial Child Labour Cell to coordinate partners working on child labour and child protection, and to mobilize resources for greater government ownership and scaling up of project models. Continue to advocate at the national level to incorporate action on child labour into poverty reduction and education plans.
- Standardize NFE syllabus/ training program developed by PITE. Advocate with the Directorate of Industries, Commerce and Labour (DICL) to make child-specific skills training programs a part of regular training offered by their institutes in the province. Support provincial consultations and a participatory review of curricula for adaptation of the Teachers Information Kit and SCREAM training into Pre-Service teacher training.
- Motivational strategies should be built into all training for teachers to ensure that the participants actually implement their learning and that those tasked additionally with social mobilization are better equipped to deal with family resistance and traditional values.
- Services to students enrolled in government NFE activities should be expanded. Quality of government afternoon schools should be improved and advocacy for their adoption by the Department of Schools and Literacy be carried out. Future initiatives addressing child rights should include linkages with health and family planning awareness and services. Explore opportunities for expanding on UNICEF-ILO collaboration such that child labour can benefit from child protection services through ensuring that children in protective custody and their custodians are made more aware of child labour issues and provided with access to non-formal education.
- A baseline study should be conducted prior to the project inception. Conduct an impact study to follow up on government teachers training. Ensure that all future training

workshops include a standardized means for pre, post and follow up assessment to measure impact. Document the working models that the project has put in place in a manual for marketing to government and non-government agencies.

Important lessons learned:

- Involving local stakeholders and government departments in the development of project materials and strategies imbues ownership. This is clearly proven by the successful partnerships managed by the SDC-DANIDA projects. The partnerships not only helped in achieving outputs, they also fostered a common platform and understanding among the various implementing partners coming from a diverse range of approaches – civil society, government etc. These partnerships created a network of linkages that can serve as a foundation for sustaining project interventions. The lesson learnt is bringing partners with a different approaches but bound to a common cause together can create an enabling environment whereby each can contribute productively and respect each other's input.
- Sustainability mechanisms and exit strategies need to be better spelled out in project and programme designs. The project has the basic elements in place but these have not been debated comprehensively among the implementing partners with the result that a viable exit strategy is not in place. The lesson learnt is that development projects need to work out sustainability options during the first two years of the project since these strategies often impact the direction of the project, its strategies and actions.
- The project has established a database to monitor beneficiary children. The next step would be to share this database with relevant government departments such as the provincial DICL and District Labour Officers in the target districts. The project would need to build the capacity of the relevant government agencies to maintain, expand and update the Child Labour Monitoring System as a routine part of

their work. The Child Labour Monitoring Systems established in six districts across the country under the GoP TBP can serve as demonstration models.

- Without baseline and impact studies, it is difficult to measure the impact of interventions on the quality of life of the beneficiary population. Since 2005, all IPEC projects in Pakistan include baseline and tracer studies as integral project components. However, they are not always accorded the requisite precedence in the face of other implementation demands, especially baseline studies, and when one is conducted in the absence of the other, its utility may be diluted. The lesson learnt for the projects is to ensure provision of budget and time to conduct the prescribed studies as a priority rather than emphasizing only the targets and timely delivery whose impact is hard to measure.