



Evaluation Summaries

ILO/LUXEMBOURG PROJECT FOR ENHANCING CAPACITY OF OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND HEALTH TRAINING IN VIETNAM

Quick Facts

Countries: Vietnam

Final Evaluation: *December 2009*

Mode of Evaluation: *Independent*

Technical Area: Occupational Safety and Health

Evaluation Management: *ILO Hanoi (Shafinaz Hassendeen)*

Evaluation Team: *led by Dr. Ha Huy Thanh*

Project Start: *15 August 2006*

Project End: *30 June 2009*

Project Code: *VIE/05/01/LUX*

Donor: *Government of Luxembourg (530,000 US\$)*

Key Words: *Occupational safety and health training, National Occupational safety and health system, ILO standards, Participatory approaches, Small enterprises,*

Up to date, Vietnam has ratified ILO Convention on Labour Inspection (No. 81) and the Occupational Safety and Health Convention (No. 155). Other ILO instruments such as the ILO Promotional Framework for OSH Convention (No. 187), the Occupational Health Services Convention (No.161), and the ILO Guidelines on OSH Management Systems (ILO-OSH 2001) will provide sound guidance for strengthening national OSH systems of Vietnam.

The Bureau for Safe Work (BSW) at the Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (MOLISA) is the designated focal point for all the ILO Luxembourg project activities and it has hosted the project management unit and undertaken those activities to strengthen capacity of the national OSH officers.

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

Present situation of project

Vietnam launched the first National Programme on Labour Protection and Occupational Safety and Occupational Health up to 2010. The Programme intends to strengthen national OSH systems and provide adequate OSH protection for all workplaces.

The development objective of the ILO/Luxembourg Project for Enhancing Capacity of Occupational Safety and Health training in Vietnam is to develop OSH training policies, consolidate the OSH training system, strengthen OSH performance, help reduce occupational diseases and accidents at work, facilitate training centres with effective training equipment, and enhance capacity of officers, trainers and collaborators. The project continues to provide training to labour

inspectors as well as a cadre of OSH officers so that they will then become OSH trainers who use the developed training materials to train employers and employees through training services in Hanoi, Da Nang and Ho Chi Minh City.

Purpose, scope and objectives of the evaluation

Objective of the final evaluation

This evaluation focuses on project outcomes, in other words the effects of the project's results (immediate objectives and its intended/unintended effects) on the project's intended beneficiaries and institutional partners over the past three years. While assessing the effectiveness, efficiency and impact of the project so far, the evaluation is forward-looking and develops recommendations on the existing OSH training strategy and means of institutionalizing good practices. The core evaluation concerns for assessing project performance are:

- Relevance and strategic fit of project strategies
- Effectiveness and outcomes
- Efficiency
- Sustainability, replication and institutionalization of good practices

Evaluation Scope

The final evaluation focuses on the following areas:

- Identifying the project's good practices, lessons learned, successes and challenges
- Assessing the project's performance in term of achieving the set immediate objectives
- Identifying the unintended outcomes, results, and impacts.
- Identifying the opportunities that contributed to the successful implementation of the Project

- Identifying any constraints that affected the effectiveness of the project execution.

Methodology of evaluation

Both qualitative and quantitative methods were combined to conduct this evaluation.

The evaluation team studied relevant project documents provided by the project office and the partners; intensive interviews with targeted groups (beneficiaries and implementers) of the project. The team also participated in the achievement workshops organized in Da Nang and Binh Duong province; interviewing participants of the Training of Trainers (TOT) courses who are labour inspectors, lecturers in vocational training college in central and southern provinces, employers of the WISE participating enterprises.

The team designed a quantitative questionnaire to quickly collect information related to the project activities, the quality, effectiveness and sustainability of the project, learning the strengths, difficulties and impacts of the project on participating groups. The Sample Analytical Framework of the ILO had also been referred to by the team in designing the questionnaires.

Due to limitation of time, the team used the qualitative survey to TOT participants and representatives from enterprises participating in central and southern regions, and in the North. The project activities under consideration and were evaluated in the mid-term evaluation have been referred in the final evaluation.

After collecting the information, the team used the SPSS program to process the quantitative information to figure out the evaluation indicators according to the expected objectives.

The Sample Analytical Framework of ILO has been referred to by evaluation team to design research form and interviews.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Main findings of the evaluation are the following:

- The project enhanced the capacity on OSH training and met the needs of improved OSH training for Vietnam and achieved its immediate objectives, contributing to the realization of the long-term objective set in the project document
- The project was evaluated to be of highly efficient through the use of its resources in improving capacity, skills for human resources development; integrating project activities with related national and international program and projects, saving the times and efforts while extending the project's beneficiaries; attracting resources from enterprises under the Public Private Partnership model; mobilizing qualified staff and officers to participate in the project implementation.
- The project was well-managed by selected experienced and enthusiastic staff; its work plan and monitoring plan were prepared since the start to the final step of each activity;
- The project activities were closely coordinated and supervised from the central to local levels through its compliance to the principle of enhancing the ownership of the implementing partners; investing in the development of criteria for selection of personnel and trainers; being flexible in integrating activities and balancing the interests of different stakeholders

- Challenges of the project share the challenges to OSH training. They are: training quality; criteria and organization to measure the impacts and usefulness of involving in OSH training and the ability to meet the needs and; changes in investment to upgrade training units.
- Through enhanced capacity for OSH Training Center, the project has created great impacts on beneficiaries from the central to local levels and on social partners; enhancing tripartite cooperation, promoting gender equality and improving capacity for trainers who are staff and officers in localities, OSH officers, State management officers, enterprises and workers.
- The Project ensured its sustainability as it directly supported one of the key objectives of the national program on OSH; outputs of the project will continue to be maintained and duplicated thanks to the national budget and other resources. Activities of the project which are universal can create conditions for effective maintenance of the project activities.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

- For the Bureau for Safe Work: Lessons learnt from the project are: development of legal framework for duplication and use of project results and outputs; being flexible and proactive in management and coordination; paying attention to the savings and effective use of resources; mobilizing the participation of social partners, particularly of enterprises; the ability to mobilize diversified resources;

- For the OSH Training Centre: Points need to be improved in organization and implementation of project activities: it is necessary to have resources for enhancing the diversification of the communication strategy and promotion of project's products; strategy and ability to attract the participation of small enterprises; attention should be paid to the ages of trainers to ensure the harmonious exchanges of conventional experiences and the ability to access new information.
- The evaluation team proposed the Bureau for Safe Work with the recommendations for promoting OSH training activities such as: the improvement of awareness of OSH training service; promotion OSH training service toward meeting the real needs of customers; improvement of training quality; expansion of international cooperation, linking the training with OSH trainers; integrating OSH training activities toward balancing the interests of all parties and paying attention to the quality of the activities' outputs, diversifying training materials; continuing to include OSH training in the national program on OSH in the next phase.
- It is recommended that it is important for the Ministry of Labour and specifically the Bureau for Safe Work in collaboration with the International Cooperation Department to have the proactive development of project proposals to mobilize more financial resources to promote OSH training; setting up a strategy for approaching potential donors; assigning staff to involve in developing future projects and program in preparation process and managing the project upon its operation as well as for monitoring and evaluating the project in order to

ensure the sustainability and expansion of cooperation in the field.

Important lessons learned

1. For the Bureau, the project has become a good demonstration of demand-driven approach to building capacity of ILO constituents on OSH. The project work plan is always consulted with all stakeholders, not only within the implementing agency. For that reason, it becomes a "living" document for all concerned agencies.
2. For the OSH Training Centre: A network of 300 trained trainers has been established, the qualifications of trainers still need to make clearer and more follow-up activities need to be carried out to support the application of what they have learnt to their work and training activities.
3. The capacity of the Training Centre was improved and they could promote training for employers, labour protection officers at enterprises on a basis of both support-free and fee-charge collection, the participating enterprises were mostly State-owned ones, who are required by law to conduct at least one OSH training for their staff per year, and they prefer to invite MOLISA's Training Center to do it. The Project is targeting to support the Center to expand its reach to FDI and private sector companies and provide more TOT and order-based training workshop rather than regular/annual training for enterprises.