



# Evaluation Summary



International  
Labour  
Office

Evaluation  
Office

## *Labour Rights: Preventing trafficking for labour exploitation in China (CP-TING Phase II) – Final Evaluation*

### Quick Facts

<b>Country:</b>	<i>P. R. China</i>
<b>Final Evaluation:</b>	<i>08/2013</i>
<b>Evaluation Mode:</b>	<i>Independent</i>
<b>Administrative Office:</b>	<i>DWT/CO-Beijing</i>
<b>Technical Office:</b>	<i>DWT/CO-Beijing</i>
<b>Evaluation Manager:</b>	<i>ILO/IPEC/DED</i>
<b>Evaluation Consultants:</b>	<i>Asmita Naik (leader) &amp; Li Ping</i>
<b>Project Code:</b>	<i>CPR/09/01/CAN</i>
<b>Donor &amp; Budget:</b>	<i>Canada (CAD 4,000,000)</i>
<b>Keywords:</b>	<i>Child Labour; Human Trafficking</i>

### Background & Context

#### **Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure**

This is a final independent evaluation of the 'Labour Rights: Preventing Trafficking for Labour Exploitation in China (CP-TING) project Phase II which runs from January 2010 to June 2013. The project aims to reduce trafficking for labour exploitation among children and young women and builds on strategies developed in the Phase 1 project (2004-2010) that was implemented by ILO/IPEC with support from the United Kingdom's Department for International Development. The focus of the project is on internal rather than cross-border population movements. It is being implemented by the International Labour Organization (ILO) in close

collaboration with the All-China Women's Federation (ACWF). Financial support amounting to US\$3,936,138 (CAD 4 million) comes from the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA).

#### **Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation**

As an end of project evaluation, priority attention is given to outcomes - whether the project was effective in achieving its objectives, and to what extent its interventions are sustainable. The evaluation seeks to understand the factors that facilitated or constrained implementation (including project design, strategy, and management). The relevance of the project is reviewed and the evaluation takes forward lessons learned for the future. This evaluation closely follows the internal mid-term review (MTR) completed just nine months previously. As such, field visits were carried out to three provinces pre-selected by the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) – two provinces not visited by the MTR – Anhui and Yunnan; and one province – Fujian – which was visited by the MTR team. The evaluation adhered to standard principles. As an independent evaluation, it was carried out by two independent consultants, one international and one local expert.

#### **Methodology of evaluation**

The evaluation team was accompanied by All-China Women's Federation (ACWF) project staff and an IPEC/CP-TING project assistant who provided translation support. The evaluation was participatory in terms of planning, and in obtaining inputs from the full range of stakeholders, though the evaluation report itself was prepared independently. In order to safeguard impartiality, the evaluation team ensured that service providers (teachers, trainers, Women's Home staff, etc.) did not participate in evaluation

meetings with direct beneficiaries (children and women).

The evaluation used a qualitative methodology and drew on existing quantitative data collected by the project after verifying the process for such data collection. The evaluation used several techniques including desk review of internal and external documents, individual and group meetings with key informants including project staff, key stakeholders and international partners, focus group meetings with direct and indirect beneficiaries comprised of children, women, teachers, staff and volunteers from Women's Homes, etc., direct on-site observation of Life Skills classes and Women's Homes' activities and stakeholder meetings at national and lower levels to receive information on the project and to share initial findings. The evaluation used three instruments tailored to different groups. The evaluation consulted 169 persons in total, 69 of whom were women and children constituting direct beneficiaries.

## Main Findings & Conclusions

### *Effectiveness*

- Objective 1 - the project has made important contributions to the policy framework alongside other UN actors, especially in terms of mainstreaming the concept of trafficking for labour exploitation into national policy. It has also influenced the practice in Women's Homes nationwide. Its Life Skills work has been integrated into the school curriculum at provincial level in Anhui but not at the same level elsewhere. The project attributes the passing of regulations on the protection of student workers in Jiangsu to its research and policy advocacy work. Its impact on other areas of government policy (labour, policing, etc.) is more variable. The project far exceeded its own targets for strengthening the policy framework by training 1,855 decision-makers, 333 journalists and eight research institutes, and by holding several forums and seminars;
- Objective 2 - the project has made a valuable contribution to building the capacity of individuals on trafficking, labour exploitation and related issues. The project provided training to some 5,000 indirect beneficiaries comprised of service providers such as school teachers, as well as staff and volunteers from Women's Homes. The institutional capacity of on-going partners of the project has also been strengthened. The development of a number of

technical tools has been central to this capacity-building process. Key good practices include the way the project has worked with civil society (Happy Family Children's Club/Anhui and Wang Jiaqiao centre/Yunnan) and the private sector (Clivia beauty school/Fujian) to deliver Women's Homes' services to migrant women;

- Objective 3 - the project methodologies, its Life Skills training and services provided in Women's Homes have proved their worth and are undoubtedly effective in giving beneficiaries the tools, knowledge and skills needed to better protect themselves. The project reached more than double the amount of direct beneficiaries originally intended. Some 146,171 people benefitted from the Life Skills and Women's Homes interventions, while the greater majority were female (96,560), the numbers were more balanced in the Life Skills in schools services which are specifically designed to target boys and girls under 18 years of age (40,440 girls to 36,863 boys). The project also counts 2,297,054 indirect beneficiaries of its mass information campaigns.

### *Sustainability*

The signs are positive for sustainability of project concepts, approaches and activities, a real achievement for a development project. Sustainability for the project's approach to Women's Homes is promising. The picture is less secure for the project's Life Skills work (except in one province). A review of the project's Life Skills work suggests sustainability might have been better secured by taking a more strategic approach towards policy integration and dissemination.

### *Relevance*

CP-TING has played and continues to play a relevant and necessary role in advocating for Chinese legislation and policy to come in line with international conventions. The substance of the project's work is highly relevant to the context. The scale of internal migration is huge: government authorities faced with these challenges, especially at the receiving end, have shown themselves to be receptive to good ideas and willing to fund and continue them.

### *Facilitating or constraining factors*

Project design – a number of aspects proved very beneficial to project implementation particularly the project approach to partnerships and its choice of

ACWF as a partner, its participatory approach and the emphasis on evidence-based research and advocacy. In terms of targeting, the efforts to include boys in this phase, is on course though further efforts can be made to equalize numbers. Some initiatives were well-targeted towards the most at risk groups e.g. Life Skills in schools but others such as services in Women's Homes seem to serve an older demographic in virtually all provinces and may be missing young women at the most vulnerable time in their lives. The geographical and thematic scope of the project in the original design proved overly ambitious and had to be trimmed back in the course of implementation.

Strategy – the project approach to influencing policy could have been more strategic. The project consciously took a bottom-up approach, in the belief that good practices would “trickle up”. It worked at multiple levels and with different sectors: this was positive but interventions sometimes appeared haphazard. The lack of strategies for internal and external information and communications, as well as for marketing and disseminating pilots, was a disadvantage. The project enjoyed political support from the Women's Federation but the interest of other government agencies was sometimes difficult to attract and appears contingent on finding mutual interests in project objectives.

Management – the project was managed very well, delivered what was expected in a timely way and is well regarded within the organization. It was also very cost-efficient, delivering concrete benefits to large numbers of beneficiaries at a low rate per head. The project was one professional staff member short for much of the implementation period. This had a hidden cost in terms of lack of time and space to focus on strategic aspects of refining and promoting the project's work, looking forward, and networking with other players. Modern management tools were diligently applied. The project clearly amassed a great deal of data under its monitoring framework but it is not clear that it was able to make optimum use of this information by consolidating and presenting its data analysis in a way that showed evidence of project outcomes.

### Recommendations

The project has been a success: it has met its objectives and serviced a high number of beneficiaries in a cost-effective way. Its methodologies have

proved highly effective in improving the ability of beneficiaries to protect themselves and in building the capacity of practitioners. While the project's impacts are impressive, it perhaps had the potential for even wider policy effects. It piloted a number of good practices which are very relevant to China's stage of development. The project was managed very well but the on-going staff shortages had a hidden cost – the lack of time and space available to focus on strategic issues and promotion appears to have held the project back from realizing its optimum potential.

The project clearly has much to offer and could do useful work in a future phase. However, given the current funding climate with many donors withdrawing from China (including CIDA the current donor), the recommendations are not premised on the basis that there will be a follow-on phase. Instead the evaluation proposes short-term recommendations for implementation before the end of the project in June 2013 and long-term recommendations to be picked up by any organizations involved in continuing or sustaining project initiatives or in devising potential new projects addressing similar issues.

#### *Short-term recommendations for implementation by project end in June 2013 and aimed at the project:*

1. Develop sustainability plans with project partners specifying what is to continue, when and how.
2. Ensure the proper handover and continuation of the project website to ILO or ACWF.
3. Ensure project products, tools, manuals, etc. are available on the website in a downloadable and adaptable format, including, if possible, offshoots such as the Life Skills chapters adapted for the school curriculum by Anhui Provincial Education authorities.
4. Revise the draft ‘good practices and lessons learned’ document to take account of learning from the final evaluation.
5. Review the project monitoring framework and document lessons learned on whether the indicators developed by the project were appropriate, the experience of data collection, management and analysis and whether this could have been improved in any way and how the data could have been better consolidated and presented so as to give a more accessible picture of progress being made by the project.
6. Review the draft Decent Work Country Programme and ensure it adequately reflects the terminology and focus of the project.

***Long-term recommendations for any organization involved in the follow-up, continuation or replication of project initiatives:***

***Promotion, replication and scaling up***

7. Promote the project approach for improving migrant services through Women's Homes to local authorities in migrant-receiving areas.
8. Engage implementing partners who are recognized as having carried out good practices either by this report or other studies (e.g. Anhui education department, Happy Family Children's Club NGO, Heart to Heart Community Care NGO, Clivia Beauty School etc.) as advisors for replication and scaling up pilots elsewhere.
9. Increase dissemination of Life Skills in vocational schools as a key approach given the suitability of the content to the age group of older adolescents, as well as the fact that such schools come under the remit of departments of labour.
10. Extend Life Skills education to parents and community members with an emphasis on passing this on to younger people.
11. Disseminate Life Skills modules and training to social workers and social work institutes.

***Outreach and dissemination of information***

12. Improve the use of new media and technologies (e-learning, internet, chat rooms, CDs, audio and video, etc.) for disseminating information to stakeholders, beneficiaries and staff.
13. Engage target groups (especially children and young people) when designing information strategies to better understand their interests and preferences.

***Measuring impact***

14. Find ways of measuring the impacts of prevention activities, for instance tracer studies, or tracking of beneficiaries.

***Reaching target groups***

15. Reach younger migrants at the most vulnerable time of their lives through Life Skills in vocational schools, mobile Women's Homes, outreach by older users of Women's Homes, summer clubs, youth organizations.
16. Continue to strive towards achieving as optimum and proportionate a gender balance as possible

among beneficiaries under the age of 18 to ensure that both vulnerable boys and girls are reached.

***Research***

17. Continue expanding the knowledge base through targeted research projects.

***Long-term recommendations that ILO should take into account in the design of any potential future projects on related areas:***

18. Consider reframing the project in a broader way in order to better capture the substance of the work that needs to be done in relation to the labour rights of young migrants: this would do better justice to the range of prevention and integration activities that the project has actually carried out and safeguard future projects from being undermined by a lack of data on selective target groups.
19. Ensure the geographical and thematic scope of the project is realistic and doable.
20. Keep an emphasis on innovation, piloting, technical advice and capacity building in keeping with China's stage of development, rather than re-doing and re-visiting old approaches which have not been taken up despite the best efforts.
21. Place more emphasis on ILO's traditional counterparts – labour departments, workers and employer's groups.
22. Ensure an advocacy and dissemination strategy for pilot projects is prepared in a timely manner, taking into account, for example, where and how a pilot might best be integrated into existing policy, ensure pilots are strategically placed in order to take maximum advantage of policy-making and political structures, how training for pilots can fit into existing systems, the use of flexible printing formats like Word/PDF for easy adaptation and replication as well as collaboration with other international and local players interested in the same objective.
23. Develop an information and communications strategy to enable effective sharing of information internally and externally.
24. Place greater attention on the development of the results framework at the planning stage to ensure the inclusion of realistic targets, outcome indicators, precise outputs, coherence between outputs and outcomes, as well as appropriate data collection, management and presentation methodologies.