



ILO EVALUATION

- Evaluation Title: **Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment**
- ILO TC/SYMBOL: **PAK/09/03/CAN**
- Type of Evaluation : **Midterm Independent Evaluation**
- Country(ies) : **Pakistan**
- Date of the evaluation: **Feb-Aug 2013**
- Name of consultant(s): **Salma M. Jafar**
- ILO Administrative Office: **CO-Islamabad**
- ILO Technical Backstopping Office: **GENDER/DWT-CO New Delhi**
- Date project ends: **April 2015**
- Donor: country and budget US\$ **Canada CAD\$8 million**
- For Joint Evaluations: **Lead Organization:**

Participating organizations:
- Evaluation Manager: **Graeme Buckley, PROGRAM**
- Evaluation Budget: **\$18,695**
- Key Words: **Gender, Employment**

This evaluation has been conducted according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. It has not been professionally edited, but has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Unit.

List of Abbreviations

BISP	-	Benazir Income Support Programme
BCDF	-	Baltistan Culture and Development Foundation
COTHM	-	College of Tourism and Hotel Management
CIDA	-	Canadian International Development Agency
DCWP	-	Decent Work Country Programme
DOL	-	Department of Labour
EFP	-	Employers federation of Pakistan
ECI	-	Empowerment through Creative Integration
GE	-	Gender Equality
GRLI	-	Gender Responsive Labour Inspection
GB	-	Gilgit Baltistan
GII	-	Gender Inequality Index
HBWs	-	Home Based Workers
HDR	-	Human Development Report
IP	-	Implementing Partner
KAB	-	Know About Business
MINTEX	-	Ministry of Textiles
MDG	-	Millennium Development Goals
MTDF	-	Medium Term Development Framework
MPI	-	Multi Dimensional Poverty Index
NGOs	-	Non Government Organizations
NCS	-	National Steering Committee
NCSW	-	National Commission on the Status of Women
PDI	-	Participatory Development Initiatives
PIHR	-	Pakistan Institute for Human Rights
PWF	-	Pakistan Workers' Federation
PRGTTI	-	Pakistan Readymade Garments Technical Training Institute
PPAF	-	Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund
PMP	-	Performance Management Plan
RYK	-	Rahim Yar Khan
RFP	-	Request For Proposal
SRSP	-	Sarhad Rural Support Programme
SDPI	-	Social Policy and Development Institute
STEVTA	-	Sind Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority
TOT	-	Training of Trainers
TCCR	-	Trust for Conservation of Coastal Resources
TREE	-	Training for Rural Economic Empowerment
UNDP	-	United Nations Development Fund
WDD	-	Women's Development Department
WOT	-	War on Terror
WECPK	-	Women Employment Concerns and Working Conditions

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	5
1. Background and Project Description	10
2. Introduction to the Project and the Midterm Evaluation	11
2.1. Objective of the Evaluation	13
2.2. Midterm Evaluation Methodology	14
2.3. Disclosure of limitations	15
3. Project Status (implementation stage)	15
4. Findings	24
4.1. Validity of project design	24
4.2. Relevance	25
4.3. Efficiency	27
4.4. Effectiveness	28
4.5. Monitoring and evaluation	30
4.6. Sustainability and risk	31
5. Lessons Learned	32
6. Conclusions	34
7. Recommendations	36
 Annexures	
Annex1. ToRs for Project Evaluation	41
Annex 2. Checklist used with DOLs	47
Annex3. Check list for assessing Gender Equality	48
Annex 4. Field Visits	49
Annex 5. List of Stakeholders Consulted	50
Annex 6. Stakeholders Workshop Programme	52
Annex 7. CIDA Projects Relevant to GE4DE	53
Annex 8. Reference to Media work by other development partners	54

Executive Summary

The Project *Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment* (GE4DE) is a five year project (2010-15) funded by CIDA with ILO as the executing agency. The implementation is being carried out by ILO constituents, the provincial Departments of Labour, workers and employers federation i.e. EFP and PWF and implementing partner NGOs. In addition development and media consultants have been engaged in training, research and other awareness raising events. The total budget of the project is 8 million CAD distributed across four provinces and the three objectives of the project.

The project is developed in the context of the country situation that has a bulging population of youth ready to work. Women employment is obstructed by low literacy levels, lack of vocational skills and social cultural barriers. Moreover the institutional structures and capacities are weak demonstrated in poor governance, legislation is often gender blind and implementation of laws is weak. Since the majority of women work in the informal sector the issues of lack of legal cover to their rights to decent work are enormous. To address these issues ILO in collaboration with CIDA developed a national project on *Women's Employment Concerns and Working Conditions* (WEC-PK) that was implemented during the period 2005 till 2010. Based on the learning of this project GE4DE was developed.

The two strategic national outcomes of the project are:

- *Pakistani women have greater access to equal employment opportunities and decent working conditions in selected economic sectors; and*
- *Stakeholders have increased understanding of and favorable attitudes towards working women's issues.*

To achieve these outcomes the project has the following development objective and three immediate objectives / components.

Development Objective:

Working women in Pakistan have better incomes, working environment and increased participation in household decisions and specifically expenditures.

Immediate Objectives:

- 1) Strengthening national mechanisms to promote Equal Employment Opportunities for Women
- 2) Enhancing skills and employability of poor women in rural and urban areas of selected districts.
- 3) Strengthening capacity of media to raise awareness on issues related to working women

The project fits into CIDA's key anticipated results of economic empowerment in Pakistan which are to (i) improve labour conditions—policies, legislation, and an enabling environment—for women's formal and informal employment and (ii) improve employment conditions and income-earning opportunities for women.

The project Mid Term Evaluation took place during the month of February and March 2013. The evaluation methodology comprises a mix of site visits and observations, telephone and face-to-face interviews, discussion groups, desk-based research of existing reports and secondary data a national stakeholder's workshop and meetings with project team, ILO and CIDA. This evaluation report is based

on standard ILO evaluation parameters comprising, validity, relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, risks and sustainability. The purpose of the MTE was to review the ongoing progress and performance of the project and recommend midterm course correction.

The MTE findings reflect that the project has overall been successful in achieving its targets of building institutional capacity, providing direct assistance to women and men in securing gainful employment through skill development, developing a knowledge base and building the capacity of media, NGOs and ILO constituents in gender equality at workplace. However there are issues pertaining to a lack of cohesion amongst the three project components, weak monitoring mechanism, lack of a clear road map to consolidate the rather diverse work and lack of sustainability planning.

Following are the main findings under each objective:

Objective 1.

- Project achievements are demonstrated in the formation and capacity development of five Gender Units in the provincial labour departments. At the policy level the project success is established by the work done on Home Based Workers policy which has been approved by the Punjab government and is under review by other provinces. Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province has integrated gender in most of the labour laws approved by the provincial legislature. There are major changes in the work done with the DOLs where attitudinal changes in the approaches of government are evident.
- The project has developed a gender labour inspection tool kit which breaks the conventional gender blind labour inspection approach, the implementation of the tool kit is in a nascent phase so there are some reservations on its usage which requires further discussion with the labour departments.
- The Pakistan Workers Federation (PWF) is making inroads by mobilizing trade unions to form women's committees and has carried out training on gender equality at workplace for 50 organizations culminating in action plans and follow-up and is working on the review of gender policy.

Objective 2

- The skills development component has achieved more than half of its targets of training out of which 80 percent have been employed. The project target is 6300 beneficiaries and at the time of MTE it had reached 3268 plus (200 indirect women beneficiaries); the male female ratio has been 20/80 percent in most cases.
- The project has successfully used ILOs TREE methodology in the urban sectors and in breaking stereo types by skilling women to join unconventional occupations like hospitality, ancient knots, on line earning and new more marketable patterns in the hand woven cloth cottage industry.
- The project is ensuring women's workers rights in the informal sector through registration of HBWs and formation of trade unions.

- Using the approach of training of trainers, developing competency based standards for vocational skills, mobilization of communities and bringing on board public sector training institutes like STVETA and MINTEX the project has in principle set the ground for sustainability.
- The post training report highlights that most of the trainees of the completed training are employed; they have enhanced mobility, more confidence, are contributing to family income and can pay the child's school fee.

Objective 3.

- The project has worked towards enabling gender responsive reporting into a wider journalistic skills training programme targeting 700 journalists from print and electronic media (in 35 districts all over Pakistan) of which 331 have completed training. The project aims, through the pool of master trainers it has trained, to take the training to next level in Mass Communication / Journalism departments of selected universities by training 300 students.
- The project has also conducted a series of policy level dialogues with senior representatives of national and regional level media organizations. This resulted in 150 policy level representatives to agree on a declaration unanimously signed to promote gender sensitive reporting in their respective organizations.
- A high quality newsletter produced under the project with an Urdu version, a documentary developed 'Women of Courage' advocacy materials such as posters and calendars are the key achievements of the media component in terms of communication.

Overall Project Assessment

- The project has taken steps to achieve the strategic objectives which can culminate into a wider impact over the course of time if planning and monitoring are improved to capture how the projects will be consolidated.
- The objectives of the project are partially achieved at the time of the MTE and the project is on track in terms of its expenditure and achieving beneficiary targets. In March 2013 the project expenditure rate is 41 percent with 40 percent in sub contracts.
- The project shows considerable and impressive achievement in terms of outputs under immediate objectives; however there is a lack of cohesion amongst the three objectives and implementing partners and stakeholders. This if not addressed is likely to affect the impact.
- The projects focus on women's employment is particularly relevant in the favourable policy context towards gender equality and to ILOs DCWP. However implementation of laws in Pakistan is an issue which the project needs to address by implementing the output on capacity building of law enforcement agencies.
- The project at the same time has invested significantly in the capacity building of its government and NGO partners; it is noted that the project has allocated a large portion of its budget for training activities.

- An approach to bridge the gap between the public and policymakers by creating and strengthening a network of women leaders to reach out to over 500 representatives of parliamentarians, media, judiciary and police has not been implemented because a grassroots women's group from amongst the trainees has to be created as a strategy. This network will be initiated during the 4th year of project which will have minimal outcome.
- The project demonstrates emerging and potential sustainability measures such as capacitating the government, NGOs, public and private sector training and workers and employers federations through effective training and TOT courses; development and implementation of competency standards, formation of gender units in the provincial labour departments and policy and legislative work. There is a need therefore, that these successes of the project are continued through a good sustainability strategy and plan.
- Two outputs of the project a):(i.) setting up of Women Facilitation Centers in collaboration with the Ministry of Women Development (MOWD), provincial and district governments and b); (ii.) developing coordination mechanisms among the provincial cells (gender units) in Labour departments, Women Facilitation Centers (WFCs), Career Development Centers (CDCs) and Media are under review by the project team for implementation.
- The overall risk is related to the lack of cohesion and lack of interface amongst the three components of the project which if not addressed can undermine an overall impact by the end of the project.

Recommendations

1. In view of the devolution of Ministry of Labour, provincial level steering committees should be constituted under the provincial departments of labour. Nonetheless a national forum which can be under the project should be in place to ensure coordination and share progress with government, CIDA and other stakeholders.
2. The Gender Units at the Labour department can be further strengthened including formation of a data base on women's employment. As a first step, awareness raising about importance of role of women in economy has to target also the decision makers so that conscious knowledge is developed about their different roles of women in the economy for which gender units as a mechanism can support maintaining an impetus in the efforts of gender mainstreaming.
3. A database of trainers may be established and shared with other actors outside the project UN agencies and organizations and WEE partners of CIDA working on similar activities.
4. The work with women parliamentarians, law enforcing agencies is planned for year four this should be reconsidered and can be started now for measuring the outcomes of the project by end of year five.
5. The project may re-consider introducing new skills development. At this time it is crucial to strategize how the different projects will be consolidated by year 5 to demonstrate impact. If new projects are introduced then these should be in the

locations where the project has already created its presence and may consider focusing on youth and PWDs. The project should document indirect beneficiaries in all its projects.

6. Linkages should be developed by the implementing partners with other programmes for more holistic gains and optimization of resources.
7. The project would benefit from strengthening the training component of journalists by reducing the number of journalists and instead introduce a refresher for measurable outcomes. It should Communication strategy to be reviewed with partners of all three components to create synergies and bring in innovation to address the underlying issues of household decision making male vs. female, domestic violence etc.
8. In view of the marked role and effect of the advertising agencies in heavily stereotyping women's role the project may consider working with selected agencies.
9. A Project Implementation Plan till the end of project is strongly recommended, the project should engage its implementing partners in developing sustainability plans culminating in the sustainability plan of the project at the GE4DE, an exit strategy and review of PMP and results matrix.
10. The project should avoid one off ideas and focus more on in depth and holistic work on some of its successful projects. There are stories of success yes, but what next is vague in terms of impact and can be possible through better integration
11. The project M&E requires strengthening with respect to more systematic and uniform analysis and data that can help to analyze for the purpose of reporting as well as for corrective action.
12. The project should assign one of the SPOs the role of a provincial coordinator and also induct an M&E specialist or M&E officer.

1. Background and Project Description

Pakistan has entered the demographic transition phase in which the share of productive population (15-59) is greater than that of dependent population. This although promises accelerated economic growth but 50% of the country's population above 15 is illiterate and education is highly compromised without skills' training. There are huge gaps in the provision of social services and their quality. Added to this is the weak implementation of laws including labor laws, despite that the constitution of Pakistan contains a range of provisions, with regards to labour rights.

Poverty is at an estimated high at 33 percent measured via the Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI) by SDPI (Sustainable Development Policy Institute)¹. The provincial poverty rates are given below.

Table 1. Poverty Rates Pakistan

	%
National	33
Balochistan	55
Sind	32
Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	33
Punjab	16

Economic growth in the country remains low and the tax net remains weak. According to the Asian Development Bank (ADB)², Pakistan faces tough micro economic challenges and its economy recovered modestly from the severe floods in 2011 to grow by 3.7% in fiscal year till June 2012. The economic melt-down is mainly attributed to energy crisis, recurrent floods and the war on terror (WOT). The WOT has caused Pakistan 68 billion from 2001 till 2011³. The *National Economic Survey* report states that the indirect loses are likely to rise, it further emphasizes that thousands of jobs have been lost due to destruction of tourism industry alone.

Currently 28 percent of the population is between the ages of 15 and 29⁴ translating this youth bulge into a demographic dividend is a principal challenge which is possible by building capacity and increase productivity of this new young population. Pakistan Population Council estimates that by 2050, close to 59 percent of this bulging working age population will be women. The report on *Pakistan Employment Trends* (Progress towards achieving MDG Target 1B -Full and productive employment and decent work for all)⁵ informs us that the unemployment rate has decreased from 6.10 to 5.70 – the labour force participation rate is 53.4 percentage (81.9 men and 24.4 women). An increase is seen in the female labour force participation rate by 3.1 percentage points since 2007. However it does not accurately reflects on the real work load women are sharing in the country. As statistics division does not include all the roles played by women for which remuneration exists in developed countries. In 2010-11 the labour force participation was 32.8 percent in Punjab 13.3 percent in Sind, 6.3 percent in KPK and a dismal 2.1 percentage in Balochistan. The share of men with a wage and salaried job was 41.2 percent, almost double the share of 21.6 percent for females, reflecting a situation, in which the few wage and salaried jobs that are created tend to go to

¹ Clustered Deprivation: District Profile of Poverty in Pakistan, SDPI - 2012.

² Fact Sheet Pakistan - ADP – 2013.

³ Pakistan Economic Survey report 2011-12

⁴ Capturing the Demographic Dividend in Pakistan, published by Population Council - 2013

⁵ Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Statistics, GOP - 2012

men rather than women. Women in Pakistan often have to accept vulnerable working conditions; they are underutilized in the economy and labour market as reflected in their overall participation, as well as in the distributions in terms of economic sector and status groups. Roughly six out of ten employed people in Pakistan (women 78.3 percentage) in 2010 were considered to be vulnerable, meaning “at risk of lacking decent work”.

*Pakistan’s Human Development Report*⁶ GII relative to selected countries and groups as reflected in Table 2. shows significant gender disparities in the labour force participation rate in Pakistan 21.7 percentage of women vs. 84.9 percentage men. The country has the lowest female labour participation and lowest female secondary education in comparison with India and Bangladesh. On the other hand women’s participation in parliament is the highest in the region i.e. 21 percentage.

Table 2. Pakistan’s Human Development Report (UNDP 2011) GII

	GII Value	GII Rank	Maternal Mortality Ratio	Adolescents Fertility Rate	Female seats in Parliament (%)	Population with at least secondary education (%)		Labour Force Participation Rate (%)	
						FM	M	FM	M
Pakistan	0.53	155	260	31.6	21.0	23.5	46.8	21.7	84.9
India	0.617	129	230	86.3	10.7	26.6	50.4	32.8	81.1
Bangladesh	0.550	112	340	78.9	18.6	30.8	39.3	58.7	82.5
South Asia	0.601	–	25.2	77.4	12.5	27.3	49.2	34.6	81.2

Pakistan triumphs democracy at the completion of the first elected government in 2013. However poor governance remained the core issue. The lack of a local governance system has further increased challenges to sustaining development programmes. Nonetheless, during the last five years democracy and institutional strengthening has taken place which includes the parliament, the judiciary, and the media. The 18th constitutional amendment transferred power to provinces after decades of centralized rule resulting in complete devolution of resources and policy making. Education, information & fair trial were made constitutional rights of every citizen. The government introduced several social protection measures to provide relief to the poor including its largest safety net programme ‘Benazir Income Support Programme’ (BISP). A new multiple formulae for the national finance awards addressed the situation of inequitable distribution of resources paving the way for improved development in the poorest provinces.

Overall women friendly policy, planning and legislation during the project period including the law prohibiting sexual harassment at work place, paved the way for the project’s advocacy work on the rights of women workers. There is however adequate availability of public funds to translate related legislation into actions. On the other hand in some areas specific legislation is conspicuously absent this includes domestic work, labour in informal and family settings and home based work. It is important to highlight that after the constitutional reforms policy and legislation on social sector are now provincial subjects.

⁶HDR Pakistan, UNDP - 2011

Independent media is yet another opportunity, but with a ratio of one in 20 female reporters in Pakistan, a fair and balanced gender representation in the media is nonexistent. The bigger issue is the gender insensitive material that is produced by the various media; often portraying both women and men in ways that reinforce prejudices.

The political situation in the country during the project period has been that of a survival of a nascent democracy with military, judiciary and the media chasing a coalition government. Nonetheless history was made when an elected government completed its five years. The challenge ahead is of timely, free fair and safe elections in May 2013. Once this process is completed a new set of legislature that usually brings in its own choice of bureaucracy will be in place for the GE4DE project to work with. The security challenges remain high for international agencies and in recent cases also for local NGOs. The security situation in GE4DE target districts for its skill development projects (Gwadar, Thatta, Rahim Yar Khan, Charsadda, and Lahore) is comparatively better than many other districts of Pakistan in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan. However the provincial capitals of the four provinces except Lahore have been highly volatile where the project works with Departments of Labour, this also includes Karachi that also comprises skills development projects and is often subject to target killing resulting in protests and closure of business.

2. Introduction of the Project and Mid-term evaluation

This national five year project is funded by Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) with a total grant of CAD 8 million. The project started in July 2010 and is expected to complete by April 2015. It is implemented in selected districts of Punjab, Balochistan, KPK, Sind and Gilgit Baltistan (GB). The project contributes to the ILO's Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP), which prioritises 8 areas of work with ILO constituents. With a poverty reduction thrust the project aims to improve income-earning opportunities and employment conditions for women and men in Pakistan by promoting skills for employment and the development of institutional arrangements that are favorable in strengthening women's role in the national economy.

GE4DE aims to contribute to two strategic national outcomes:

- Pakistani women have greater access to equal employment opportunities and decent working conditions in selected economic sectors; and
- Stakeholders have increased understanding of and favorable attitudes towards working women's issues.

The project aims to contribute to these outcomes through work across the following objectives:

Development Objective:

Working women in Pakistan have better incomes, working environment and increased participation in household decisions and specifically expenditures.

Immediate Objectives:

- 1) Strengthening national mechanisms to promote Equal Employment Opportunities for Women
- 2) Enhancing skills and employability of poor women in rural and urban areas of selected districts.

3) Strengthening capacity of media to raise awareness on issues related to working women

The project fits into CIDA's key anticipated results of economic empowerment in Pakistan which are to (i) improve labour conditions—policies, legislation, and an enabling environment—for women's formal and informal employment and (ii) improve employment conditions and income-earning opportunities for women.

Geographical Scope of the Project

The project interventions under objective 1. related to working with ILO constituents is focused on four provincial capitals Quetta, Peshawar, Lahore, Karachi and Gilgit of Gilgit-Baltistan (GB). Skills development under objective 2. covers districts across Pakistan, Hub (Balochistan), Charsadda (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa), Lahore and Rahimyar Khan (Punjab), Thatta and Karachi (Sind) and Gilgit (GB). Work with media under objective 3. the above mentioned districts and another 35 districts around the country.

Organizational Arrangements

The project is nationally executed under the overall supervision of the Country Director of the ILO office in Islamabad. It is headed by National Project Coordinator (NPC) reporting to the Country Director, ILO. According to the project organogram the NPC is supported by a team comprising a Gender Advisor, two Senior Programme Officers and a Programme Officer. One position of SPO remains vacant. The team also comprises a Senior Programme Assistant, Administrative/Finance Assistant, a Project Assistant and two drivers. The project team is responsible to (a) coordinate and monitor the implementation of all the programme components (b) provide technical support to the activities; (c) facilitate consultants (d) facilitate and coordinate the networking activities and e). under take regular field visits to the programme locations to monitor progress, identify implementation issues and take corrective measures. ILO office in Islamabad extends technical and operational support to the project which also includes administrative and IT support. ILO also takes the responsibility of the security of the project staff under the UNDSS guidelines. The overall guidance is provided by the Country Director, and the senior management at ILO Office Islamabad including technical backstopping from the Islamabad based Senior Programme Officer, and Senior Gender Specialists and other relevant specialists in the ILO Decent Work Technical Support team and Regional Office. ILO Geneva technical units provide support for quality assurance. ILO resources and expertise of International Turin Center have been leveraged for national capacity building and product development. The existing knowledge base of ILO including the TREE methodology, training modules, and best practices provided the needful guidance in implementing the project activities.

2.1 Objectives of the Evaluation

This Mid Term Evaluation (MTE) aims to indicate whether the project is 'on track' and whether its strategies are adequate to achieve the objectives. The approach undertaken in this MTE is to assess whether the planned objectives are being achieved and to assess the appropriateness of the strategies and approach that have been used so far. The MTE aims to facilitate ILO and its implementing partners to appraise and reflect on how relevant, effective and efficient the delivery is and how it can be further improved to achieve the end goal using the standard parameters of evaluation. It examines the project design and implementation against the outcomes and outputs, documents key lessons learned, and provides recommendations for course correction. Around most issues investigated, the consultant employed triangulation to ensure the validity of analysis being carried out. For example, the data around media work was collected through project documents, interviews with relevant staff as well as trainees and stakeholders to arrive at conclusions supported by multiple sources of evidence.

As per TOR (Annex 1) this MTE reviewed the on-going progress and performance of the project:

- assess the relevance, appropriateness and feasibility of the project outcomes
- examine the extent to which immediate objectives have been achieved and outputs delivered.
- examine the likelihood of the project achieving its objectives and make any recommendations for enhancing the impact of the project vis-à-vis these objectives
- examine the delivery of the project inputs/activities
- analyse the nature and magnitude of constraints affecting project implementation
- analyse the factors contributing to the project's success
- based on the evidence found, provide recommendations for the remaining period of the project

This MTE has a multi project scope as it assesses the various projects implemented. The geographical scope of the MTE in terms of field visits and cross verification of information is Lahore, Karachi and Rahim Yar Khan.

2.2 MTE Methodology

This MTE is guided by the ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation: principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluation and ILO evaluation guidance note 4 on considering gender in the monitoring and evaluation of projects (Sep 2012). The evaluation methodology comprises a mix of site visits and observations, telephone and face-to-face interviews, discussion groups (Annex 2), desk-based research of existing reports and secondary data. Objective and subjective source of data and information includes:

Desk Review The review comprises but is not limited to the key government and non-government reports; including the National Economic Survey, Labour Force Survey, Economic Growth Policy, one UNDAF document (2008-2012), ILO Decent Work Country Programme, project document of GE4DE, annual work plans, result based framework, project proposals, lessons learned from final evaluation of the WEC-PK project, project progress reports, annual reviews, minutes of meetings, MOUs, reports of discussion forums, training reports, assessments, research and baselines undertaken by the project and communications materials prepared by the project.

Field Visits Over a period of 11 days; the consultant visited Lahore and Rahim Yar Khan (Punjab) and Karachi (Sind). These visits were facilitated by ILO and implementing partners. The field work included meeting a range of stakeholders, including women and their families, community members, trainers, media, government officials, heads of training institutes, trainees and staff of implementing partners (Annex 3). Due to strike in Karachi a products outlet that had to be visited was not possible.

Interviews and meetings Key informant interviews were conducted with a number of stakeholders and telephonic interviews were conducted with Gender Focal Person Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) and with the former Regional Gender Advisor ILO (Annex 4). Briefing with project Staff, ILO and CIDA focused on reviewing project implementation and monitoring, the evaluation context, project design and objectives, identifying the full spectrum of stakeholders and gaining a common understanding on the purpose and scope of the evaluation.

Selection of sites: two main criteria were established with the project team in selecting site visits:

- i. Accessibility in terms of security, weather and travel connections, the three project districts linked quite well in terms of travel, so time could be used quite efficiently. GB is not accessible during winter and Balochistan is not always clear from a security perspective. Thatta is a three hour drive from Karachi but the training centers are spread even further.

- ii. The number and range of interventions that could be seen in both rural and urban contexts, so that most could be seen in the stipulated time frame. Lahore, Karachi and RYK provided an opportunity to see interventions with employers, workers, government, skills and media, in rural, peri-urban and urban areas. Furthermore skills development training at RYK had completed the second phase of the change makers training, whereas others had completed first phase only.

Appreciative Enquiry (FGDs) The appreciative enquiry explored successes and positive experiences through a dialogue with groups of people in order to strengthen understanding of what worked well. Ten FGDs were carried out with members of the community groups and direct beneficiaries. FGD with women trade union members in Lahore and Karachi could not be held as only one woman turned up in Lahore and one in Karachi due to a strike in the city that day with whom an interview was carried out. Similarly with trainees of hospitality an FGD could not be held because the women who had completed training were on their jobs; the two women trainees available were interviewed.

Table 3. Focus Group Discussions

Target Group	Lahore	Karachi	RYK	Total
Skills Trainees	2	1	3	6
Media Trainees		1	1	2
Communities	1		1	2
Total	3	2	5	10

Stakeholders Workshop: This workshop in held on 7th Feb 2013 in Islamabad was the center piece of the evaluation participated by ILO and CIDA senior staff, partners from all four provinces and GB, including government, NGOs, donors, media, students of journalism and the private sector. The workshop aimed at sharing a). the methodology and process of the MTE b). key findings from the Lahore visit and c). obtained lessons learned, good practices and recommendations. Workshop Programme is attached at Annex 5.

2.3 Disclosure of Limitations

Due to the specified time of this MTE, Thatta district in interior Sind, KPK and Balochistan province could not be visited. The extreme weather conditions were a constraint to visit Gilgit Baltistan (GB). FGDs with women members of trade unions and with COTHM trainees was not held due to non-availability of several people at one time who had already completed training and were busy with their jobs; instead interviews were carried out with available persons. Various information and secondary data required was requested as the report progressed that was provided over a period of time. Consolidated qualitative and quantitative assessment of the social context of the Union Councils where project is being implemented was not available with partners nor with the ILO.

3. Project Status (implementation stage)

The project aims at accomplishing two interlinked intermediate outcomes at the end of the project life that will contribute directly to the development goal.

(i). Pakistani women have greater equal employment opportunities and decent working conditions in selected economic sectors: The project milestone achievement is the improved access of women to

employment in non-traditional sectors through innovation. Women trainees of the project working in factories (Garments Lahore and Fish Cleaning Karachi) informed they had decent working conditions; this has been confirmed through a monitoring/follow-up mechanism of face to face interviews and telephone calls.

(ii). Increased understanding and favorable attitudes of stakeholders towards working women issues: This is a long term outcome therefore could not be fully assessed at this stage. Changes in perceptions on working have been noted via a baseline study and changes in approaches and attitudes have been recorded during this MTE at the government level who informed of increased capacity and understanding on gender equality and decent work. Similarly the implementing partners of GE4DE demonstrated a paradigm shift in assessing gender equality at work place and breaking stereo types through the induction of women in non-traditional services usually seen as men's jobs. In the media component there are challenges for long term gains which are highlighted under objective 3.in this report.

Objective 1. Strengthening national mechanisms to promote Equal Employment Opportunities for Women

Output 1.1 Capacity of stakeholders developed to design and implement policies and programmes for working women at all levels

Output 1.2: Coordinating and implementing mechanisms established at federal and provincial levels

The project initiated a number of training to build capacities, including fellowships to key officials among ILO constituents who attended international trainings at the ILO's International Training Center in the area of gender mainstreaming. Upon their return they were closely followed by ILO and action plans were developed which according to the trainees interviewed helped tremendously in applying the training and internalizing it. Policy level work comprises Home Based Workers' (HBW) policy with the provincial Department of Labours (DOLs) and review of labour laws for gender integration. As a result of this work Punjab province approved the HBW policy, in Sind it was in the final stage of review and in KPK gender has been integrated in most of the labor and approved by the provincial assembly. In Punjab 36 district officers have been trained on the HBW policy. In three districts in Punjab and one district in Sind in collaboration with UN Women registration of HBWs is in process which is an important step forward for their protection rights. These are major achievements. The Pakistan Workers Federation (PWF) through leadership training for private organizations is working on gender mainstreaming. It is also reviewing the gender policy formed during the WEC-PK project. The strategy of the project as per project design to increase the capacity of the law enforcement agencies is yet to be translated into a plan of action.

In order to coordinate and share project progress a national steering committee, comprising of representatives of employers, workers, provincial department of labour and non-government organisations was formed. The steering committee was chaired by the Secretary, Ministry of Labour, and now after the devolution by the Secretary, Ministry of Human Resources Development. This committee has met once since the inception of the project. It does not have a role after the devolution; since policy and legislation is also devolved to the provinces. Therefore a federal level steering committee which does not have the relevant mandate is not feasible because it cannot function for the purpose it is constituted.

Under MOUs signed with the Governments of Sind, Punjab, KPK, Balochistan and GB the project has succeeded in the formation of five Gender Units one in each province and one in Gilgit Baltistan. The provincial DOLs have contributed through staffing and office space, essential office supplies, deputed

gender focal persons and extending support in reviewing and analyzing government's programmes. These gender units are a mechanism based on the Child Labour Units model of ILO aiming to mainstream gender in programming, projects, budgets and plans and to collect gender disaggregated data on employment for use in design, planning, implementation and M&E. The units are headed by a senior official as Gender Focal Person (GFP) a gender expert and a Gender Labour Inspector (GLI). The GFPs were trained in Turin in Labour Policy development and gender mainstreaming. The GFPs of Punjab and Balochistan were transferred so the ones now doing the work are not trained; GE4DE is developing a capacity building plan for them.

The five gender units have come together in the formulation of the gender responsive labour inspection (GRLI) tool kit with Punjab taking the lead in consultation with other provinces and inputs from ILOs regional experts. The Gender Units can and now do provide training in gender labour inspection; Punjab and KPK have formed gender resource units. KPK introduced the minimum wage notification for women in the province and for the first time appointed a female Assistant Director and four other females, which according to the GFP was not possible before the knowledge and capacity created by the GE4DE project. One significant achievement of the Punjab unit with technical and financial assistance of GE4DE (and MTFD funding) is the PC1 for the 'Child Day Care Centres' for working mothers. The government of Punjab as a result of recommendation from the unit has introduced paternity leave of 15 days which is a breakthrough and can be used by other provinces as a good practice. The unit spearheads a gender network of line departments, the TORs and minutes of the meetings however, were not available to verify the efficacy of this network. The unit has walked a mile further by integrating gender indicators in the child labor project. The Sind unit has made recommendations on mainstreaming gender in the policy and legal framework and has played a very proactive role in developing a project to respond to the victims of the Factory fire. Gilgit Baltistan is a new administrative entity still it is in the process of formulating a gender responsive labour policy and conducted the Gender Diagnostic Survey which is the first of its kind in Pakistan. Similar work in Balochistan could not be established partly due to the political instability in the province resulting in recurrent transfers of the Gender Focal Persons; which made the unit virtually ineffective. It has the fifth focal person since the project inception, however small progress is now being made. Overall these gender Units are a breakthrough in the rather gender blind employment scenario and are working towards achieving the projects outcomes of gender equality in the workplace.

The Gender Units as per their TORs require more support from ILO on collecting and maintaining a data base on working women, gender budgets and on knowledge and media management. The GFPs are of the view that the project publications are sent to them but these are few in number and there is no clarity on how to disseminate the findings nor is there a budget for it. The sexual harassment committee is notified but of the two DOLs visited it did not appear to be functional as one of the basic parameters i.e. of displaying the code of conduct was not visible although other posters developed by the project were. There are no women in the various committees formed by the DOLs including recruitment, procurement, and budget. The units informed that they are not aware of other interventions of ILO under the GE4DE project. The GFPs of some of the provinces had reservations on the use of GRLI due to its length, lack of transport facility or allowance for labour at the same time one unit advocated it very strongly. It was argued that the tool kit is on different laws and every establishment does not have the same laws, so one tool with all laws requires discretion on part of the Labour Inspector which is not viable. The inception Performa obtained from Sind DOL did not have gender indicators the only indicator the labour inspectors reported on was the number of women who work beyond 7 pm till 6 am. Nonetheless the GRLI tool was in the process of being finalized for approval which if implemented will be a significant achievement in changing this approach and a step towards achieving GE4DE strategic outcomes

The project has continued to strengthen partnerships with the employers and trade unions to bring improvements in the existing working conditions. PWF has trained 50 women organizations and a set of 50 action plans by these women organizations have been developed to ensure gender equality at workplace. The contents of the training include human rights, gender policy, decent work, day care centres, collective bargaining, right to association and awareness on labour laws. 15 employers have carried out either training or implemented sexual harassment code at the workplace. During Karachi visit one trainee was interviewed who felt empowered after the training; yet she doesn't see a role for herself in the male dominated association she is a member of. PWF is also making inroads by mobilizing trade unions to form women's committees and has carried out sessions on the role of women in trade unions, collective bargaining and importance of organization and association. The Gender Equality Policy was developed and piloted by EFP and PWF under WEC-PK project. PWF is working on the review of the Gender Policy but the progress is rather slow paced whereas; the project document emphasizes the implementation of the policy. The work on gender mainstreaming with these two constituents is interesting but stands alone from their other work and with the other two components of GE4DE. Show and Tell is a creative way of engaging employers and has been recognized as such by gender experts and the employers involved; it has shown some promising results already. The stories of success of women leaders, women members of councils and women committees are nonetheless a beginning to a prospective movement in a very male dominated arena.

Two outputs of the project a). setting up of Women Facilitation Centers in collaboration with the Ministry of Women Development (MOWD), provincial and district governments and b). developing coordination mechanisms among the provincial cells (gender units) in Labour departments, Women Facilitation Centers (WFCs), Career Development Centers (CDCs) and Media are under review by the project team for implementation. The devolution of MOWD and limited capacity of provincial Women Development Departments (WDDs) has been a barrier in translating the output of WFCs and CDCs. The project still has to decide how it will take this forward.

Objective 2. Enhancing skills and employability of poor women in rural and urban areas of selected districts.

The project baselines conditions used a sample size of 389 women that shows a young population 78 percent between the age of 15 to 30 of whom 48 percent were married. 56 percent of the respondents had an income out of which the majority was self employed, 33 percent were daily laborers and 10 percent worked in agriculture and 10 percent had a salaried job. 16 percent also informed that their husbands do not have an income. The majority of the respondents 82 percent indicated a monthly household income of PKR 10,000 and less. Only 1.5 percent women owned a property and only 26 percent men i.e. their husbands. Majority 84 percent of the salaried women did not know if they earn more or less than their male counterparts. In the majority of cases the decision making related to women's choice to work or mobility rests with the males of the household whether married or single. Household expenditures were also decided by men 81 percent. Only 25 percent women could go to the market to buy and sell. While more than half of the women respondents 65 percent said that they could use public transport, all of them shared that they could use it only if accompanied by either a male from the family or older female family members. However, in terms of perceptions encouraging trends were seen with the majority 75 percent responding that they do not have a preference to educate their sons, similarly 48 percent responded in negative that as women they can do only certain types of work.

Output 2.1. Increased entrepreneurship and vocational skills of poor women for income generation

The project targets 6,300 women and men in employable skills under ILO's TREE methodology. For this period the project had planned a target of 4482 (746 men and 3736 women) for training in the Tree methodology through different projects in different disciplines/trades in urban and rural areas of Pakistan. As a result 3368 men and women are either enrolled or have completed training i.e. 701 men and 1067 women are enrolled in training and 1600 men and women have completed training out of these 1100 have been placed in jobs; the male female ratio has been 20/80 percent in most cases; however in some cases the male female targets were reviewed with partners. The rural urban ratio of interventions has been 70 percent rural and 30 percent urban/peri urban. The project has invited RFP for the third phase of post training support under the TREE methodology for the weaving project by SRSP in KPK, the handicrafts project by PDI in Sind, wool processing and fabric weaving by BCDF in GB, ancient knots by Samanzar in Punjab and marble mosaic in Balochistan by SOHB. GE4DE is designing multi-faceted strategies to organize the HBWs through specific training on design marketing, enterprise and business development and also registration as HWBs. This is a stimulating endeavor that would culminate the small scale projects into a sustainable endeavor.

The skills development projects are designed according to pre defined criteria of helping communities with poor economic background but strong commitment to building on an existing opportunity.

Textile and readymade garment sector is one of the most competitive and value added sectors in Pakistan; the country being world's fourth largest producer and third largest consumer of cotton products. The project engaged Pakistan Readymade Garments & Training Institute (PRGTTI); to train 116 women and 30 in three selected trades. Hundred percent of these trainees have productively been engaged in decent employment. PRGTTI also lobbied with employers that instead of just machine operators trained women are inducted as supervisors to control quality. PRGTTI report lists 24 organizations that helped in identifying deserving trainees from local poor communities, the organization also disseminated the opportunity widely; establishing good practices in terms of information sharing, transparency and coordination with local NGOs. The institute follows up with the trainees and the factories where they are employed in terms of decent work issues. Nonetheless no mechanism was available for tracking the working conditions of these women which could be reviewed and / or proposed for replication.

The GE4DE project partnering with the Lahore based College of Tourism and Hotel Management (COTHM) created opportunities for 12 men & 25 women from poor background in this another upwardly mobile economic sector. COTHM approached the employers towards the completion of the training program to secure jobs for the successful trainees. COTHM exceeded the targets; 60% trainees have been inducted as internees in various hotels, restaurants and clubs while another 30% have already found firm employment in the hospitality industry. *Ancient Knots for Have-nots* project in a small village in Rahim Yar Khan is an innovative project that trained 100 young women in Zardozi; a very old craft which traditionally has only been done by men. The breakthrough came with the GE4DE project that trained a hundred girls in this craft and now two trainees of Skills Plus are managing this on sustainable basis. The project has a Face book page where orders are placed directly. The women trainees through the efforts of the implementing partner have visited Karachi and Lahore Fashion Weeks, where their work was displayed. The alumni of ILO's Skills Plus training who manages the training center was selected by Shell Tameer for the top Social Entrepreneurship Award sponsored by the British Council for a leadership exchange program to UK. The exposure led to a philanthropist in donating a 15 seater Rickshaw to the centre, eliminating women's transportation problems. This is an outstanding example of developing linkages with other partners including the private sector. The implementing partner *Samanzar* is the buyer as a business and there is a profit sharing mechanism. However, the women managing the project from the community still considered they are not getting their due share and would rather find ways and means

to establish their own enterprise. The Charsadda Weaving Project being implemented by Sarhad Rural Development Programme (SRSP), in the Khadi (hand woven cloth) cottage industry of Charsadda KPK has trained 20 men and 60 women weavers on the Indian patterns, the Sindhi fabric *Sussi*, *Baranji* from Afghanistan, *Khadi* bed sheets, pillow covers and handbags with leather patterns woven through them. After their products were exhibited at fairs in Peshawar and Islamabad, women have received orders for *Baranji* – shawls with Afghan weave - and leather bags. In Gilgit Baltistan in the remote Northern Pakistan, GE4DE worked with Baltistan Cultural Development Foundation (BCDF) to improve the local woolen shawl production value chain and over achieved its training targets; 20 men and 136 women have been trained. BCDF has succeeded in establishing marketing networks for local products with national and international buyers. In the coastal village of Karachi there are very few income-earning opportunities available to the women in these very poor communities, Trust for Conservation of Coastal Resources (TCCR) implemented *Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment* in the fishing industry training 50 individuals – 30 women and 20 men who are now fully employed the nearby sea food processing factory with decent working conditions. It was the first time for the rural women to venture out of their houses to the factory areas. This resulted in further training of 200 indirect beneficiaries voluntarily by these very women who had received training; the 200 also got employed; a remarkable achievement.

GE4DE is working with HBWs and women in small industries in Lahore and Sialkot. Home Net the NGO in Lahore has been lobbying for the social protection of women engaged in informal economic sector agriculture and small industries; advocating for the ratification of ILO’s C.177. Baidaree on the other hand in Sialkot has achieved the registration of and formation of trade union of 100 HBWs. These are impressive achievements which if pursued further can result in a replicable model and success story. The training of communities in IT, textiles, beauty, and personal care through selected Community Change Makers in selected Union Councils of districts Lahore, RYK (Punjab) and Thatta (Sind) is being implemented by Empowerment through Creative Integration (ECI). ECI using *ILO community profile* including identified 90 change makers to target 1080 community members. The community volunteers selected as ‘Change Makers’ 10 from each tehsil are being trained through a four phased training. These community change makers will help 12 House Holds in each village to get a job or to start an enterprise. Two groups of trainees (change makers) were met during the field visits one in Lahore that had completed its first residential eight day semester of theoretical training in Islamabad and the other group in RYK that has completed the second semester in RYK of assessing the situation, identifying potential jobs and enterprises. In the third semester there is a six month field work to select and train the households to get either a job or start an enterprise. In the fourth semester the beneficiaries would be assisted to institutionalize their enterprises. The project is presently on the position given in the table below:

Table 4. Progress of Community Change Makers -ECI

District	Training Phase	Change Makers		Target Beneficiaries
		M	FM	
Lahore	1st semester completed	15	16	360
RahimYar Khan	2nd semester completed	13	20	360
Thatta	2nd semester completed	19	12	360
Total	15 women and 2 men dropped out	47	48	1080

A spin-off effect of local community participating more enthusiastically in the project could be clearly seen during the interaction with the change makers and visiting associated communities. The project has a criteria established during first semester to select the most deserving households. Nonetheless based on observations during the evaluation mission the possibility of benefiting their own relatives can perhaps be avoided. In RYK there were some indications that relatives were being selected as beneficiary households by the change makers. This can be problematic despite that the selected HH could be the poorer one but it has implications for the project in terms of impact and gaining the good will of the community at large. Moreover, whether the number of beneficiaries (12 per change maker) would be enough to create an impact is yet to be determined. Once the project beneficiaries acquire the skills would the employment be decent or not is yet not clear. In RYK after the completion of second semester the trainees could not share their plans on way forward. To achieve decent work in the informal sector is more difficult as there are issues pertaining to lighting, ventilation and sanitation; therefore the implementing partner needs to build it in the training. The fact that the trainees have volunteered their time amidst their work and responsibilities is itself a measure of the projects success but it cannot be assessed further at this stage.

Online Earning Skills in Rahim Yar Khan and Charsadda a two year project targeting 750 educated women who have twelve years of education is being implemented by Pakistan Institute of Human Rights (PIHR). This is a very interesting programme with great potential for increasing income. Pakistan according to US department of labour ranked number 3 in 2011 on online earning; the market is being accessed by technically trained freelance online workers. This project is well placed in the social cultural context of areas like Charsadda and RYK where women have limited mobility and limited access to employment. Therefore the project is an innovative milestone in providing skills that would enable young women to earn from home. During field visits two such groups of young women were met in educational institutes which are the venue for training in 'on line earning'. These colleges already had computer training laboratories which made the intervention smoother and cost effective. This group may not be the most marginalized yet constitute the vulnerable women whose family income is less than 16000 PKR per month, their own income is less than 4000, have a family size of 6 to 7 and can remain unemployed due to their vulnerability due to lack of property rights, lack of access to gainful employment and limited mobility due to cultural constraints. The project has a clear plan on ensuring employment of the trainees as freelance earners and would provide them subsidized PCs. Most of the girls met did not have PCs and none of them had a telephone line or another form of internet access. The project has an integrated sustainability element as it trains selected staff of the institutions where this programme is being run. The heads of these institutions are keenly involved in the project and demonstrate commitment to replicate it after project life. The project has a clear work plan; monitoring indicators can be set for measuring the progress.

The work with the federal Ministry of Textiles MINTEX is in continuation of the work that was done through WEC-PK. Through this intervention the GE4DE project is contributing to building the capacity of a public sector organization. The ministry faces issues in training due to lack of funds. It is with the support of GE4DE it is carrying out a three months certified skills training for 600 trainers and workers (180 men 480 women). MINTEX strong linkages with employers enable training graduates to get guaranteed jobs. It works with TEVTA, Fashion and Apparel Design Institute (FADEN), Pakistan Knitwear Training Institute Lahore, International Foundation Garment Karachi, PRGTTI and One Industrial Unit Lahore. MINTEX is confident that it would be replicating this work through government and other donors' funds. The sustainability aspect is high in view of the nine vocational training institutes

under the administrative control of MINTEX which are being run in collaboration with various textile associations. MINTEX retains the trainees in these institutes for at least one year and absorption by associated industry is 85 percent. The project interventions are promising for gainful employment, sustainability of interventions with a clear work plan and risk mitigation plan. An Evaluation is also planned by the ministry to gauge impact of this intervention in terms of the increase in income levels and social empowerment (this practice does not cut across other projects of GE4DE). The admin cost in GE4DE was lessened compared to the WECPK and training has been standardized. On decent work the ministry said the labour departments should be working on its implementation. Expecting DOLs to do this is rather an uphill task since all departments have to play a role. GE4DE therefore may work on interdepartmental coordination through gender steering committees at the provincial level.

The Sind-TEVTA project is another intervention with the public sector. It is in the inception phase, till now a pool of experts in competency based curriculum development and a pool of teachers has been developed. Building upon the work on competency based curriculum; Food Production and Service, Fashion Design and Beauty and Personal Care curricula have been developed (cluster of competencies identified as high in demand). Around 500 young women/girls would be trained with at least 75% productively engaged. This is likely to be a sustainable model of school based enterprises for effective technical/vocational and business skills development.

In view of output 2 of objective 2 the project has developed the capacity of training providers and implementing partners for implementing programs on TREE methodology. This helps partner organizations to work effectively with local community through the training and post-training period and to follow through TREE processes in the field with beneficiaries and their businesses. Community units such as Women Organizations, Community Based Organizations etc are all proof of level of organization resulting from extensive social mobilization. However other than the Samanzar ancient knots project, and SRSP and BCDF collective bargaining and collective organization could not be seen in any of the other interventions. The project informed it will be made as part of the post training stage. From the project design perspective, employers' engagement in training helped build their ownership of trainees as they had trained on a day to day basis. In addition to technical training aimed at securing employment, women and men received ILO's Skills Plus training to help them grow in their jobs. Skills Plus is a supplementary module on enterprise skills, workers' rights and responsibilities, basic health, along with basic communication skills is an integral part of all training. The partner organizations also ensure support mechanisms underlined by the TREE methodology for conditions conducive to training and work – such as transport, clean airy rooms with toilets, health facilities etc – and business development plans post training are in place.

The Tree methodology was new for use in urban settings but has been implemented by the project successfully. The project built the capacity of the COTHM team in developing gender sensitive, competency-based training materials for the hospitality sector. PRGTTI developed 50 competency standards specific to the garment manufacturing industry to improve the performance of an employee. The four core competencies desired by employers were 1) occupational health and safety practices 2) communication with co-workers; 3) team work and 4). time management. Functional competencies complimented these including the garment sewing skills using: a) single needle lockstitch machines; b) double needle lockstitch machine; and c) feed-of-the-arm machine to join garment panels.

The project team informed that enterprise development is a planned part of all the projects post training. During the MTE women trainees met from the readymade garment training who had developed business plans aspired to set up their own businesses but didn't have access to finances. Akhuwat a micro finance

institute according to the project team had announced interest free loans but women choose not to take them for various reasons. To facilitate such women the project will initiate package of post training support. In enterprise development the SRSP connected graduates with their own micro finance programme funded by PPAF and Khushali Bank. In Baidarie the HBWs in Sialkot were given access to PPAF micro finance programmes. Informal savings schemes through formation of women's groups were introduced by SRSP and Samanzar which can also be used for enterprise development. The project has devised a useful strategy to assess the short term projects after completion. International Catholic Migration Commission (ICMC) conducted a Rapid Assessment of selected skills development programmes that had led to trainees working in small groups, as producers and sellers or for middle persons, in small enterprises. The study showed that four of the six surveyed were at an initial formative stage and could be strengthened and registered as cooperatives for instance.

Project reports of implementing partners and the end line of the project illustrate that other than the increase in income, significant changes have occurred in the lives of women including enhanced confidence and mobility; commuting alone and are able to pay for the household incomes.

Objective 3. Strengthening capacity of media to raise awareness on issues related to working women

Output 3.1 Enhanced capacities of the journalists/ reporters for gender sensitive and rights based Reporting

Output 3.2 Promotional packages and tools on women's economic empowerment in national and regional languages developed and disseminated

The media component comprises (i) training of 700 journalists and 300 students (ii) discussions around portrayal of women in the media (iii). development and release of a documentary (iv). events around gender issues and their coverage in national media and (v). use of social media.

The media consultations carried out by the project helped in gender responsive reporting and a wider journalistic skills training programme targeting 700 journalists from print and electronic media (in 35 districts all over Pakistan) of which 331 journalists had completed training. This training of journalists with a focus on 'news media' is outsourced to an NGO 'Inter Media'. Eleven Master trainers have been trained on gender sensitive communications, national policy frameworks on gender equality and international labour standards. To ensure followup on the training an assignment to the trainees is built in of writing an article on gender issues for publication that is mentored by the trainers. The project aims to take the training to next level in Mass Communication / Journalism departments of selected universities by training 300 students. In RYK a brief session of the media training was observed which was on human rights – basically a few minutes add on which needs to be significantly strengthened. The project has also conducted a series of policy level dialogues with senior representatives of national and regional level media organizations. This resulted in 150 policy level representatives to agree on a declaration unanimously signed to promote gender sensitive reporting in their respective organizations.

Based on interviews with implementing partners, local journalists and government officials during the field visits, the consultant confirms that the project has made concerted and rigorous efforts during the period to sensitize stakeholders, government, NGOs and media on the issue of women's employment and gender equality. It is also clear that there has been regular and strategic technical support and guidance from the project in the implementation of this component. Collaboration has taken place with media houses as numerous articles on GE4DE's work and events have been published in local and national

newspapers. Advocacy materials such as posters and calendars have been disseminated to the stakeholders in the target areas. The consultants noted during visits that posters on the rights of the working women were visible in girls' colleges and at the Gender Units in DOLs. Nonetheless similar display of this material was not visible in other organizations visited. Newsletters have been produced, the quality of which is very high and information is well consolidated and makes interesting reading. With an Urdu version this newsletter is one of the key achievements of the media component and also of the project reflecting on the commitment towards an important publication.

A number of events have been organized including celebration of international women's day and Global Entrepreneurship Week by hosting the awards ceremony of its 'Know About Business' (KAB). The events received wide coverage and led to several follow-up stories by the media. A UN commissioned series of radio programmes, interviews of successfully employed trainees for example the chef in a national newspaper, and participation as guest speakers to motivate other women in private sector training organizations. The photography competition led to an increased focus on women and work. A well known journalist who was awarded for good journalism attributes her skills partly because of her association with the project. There are many such individual stories associated with the project which are inspiring and have been covered. The project has engaged key and well-known names in the media as advisors to inform its strategy, getting hold of these people and buying in their time itself is no ordinary measure. The documentary developed under the project 'Women of Courage' profiles the stories of nine Pakistani women who have achieved success in unconventional professions, and included a chef, circus performers and policewomen from the elite force. It has been aired ten times over a period of three months on a private TV channel. The producer and camera man associated with the documentary were very much motivated by the stories they were able to capture to do further work on women's issues. Viewership analysis of this documentary and resultant change in perceptions about women in unconventional professions is not available with the project.

Two major issues confronting the project are its reliance on one-off training to bring the attitudinal change and secondly its very focus on news and print media; both a design issue. Although the project staff emphasized the inclusion of reporters from electronic media but there is a gap in the 'use' of electronic media by the project to reach a wider audience. This approach needs to be revisited by the project in view of the limited outreach print media has due to low literacy rates in general and in the project areas in particular. Even in the case of print media most of the journalists present in the RYK training complained of the policy of media houses and showed helplessness on what they report on and write. A senior anchor person with the country's largest media house informed that due to ratings of private TV shows the social sector programmes have been curtailed as a policy, therefore this is not in control of the project. The project as such operates in the realm of corporate media in Pakistan; however this context has not been discussed by the project to review its strategy and approach. The implementing partner Inter Media informed that the element is about breaking perceptions and stereotypes, improving quality of coverage on women and addressing structural issues through policy change. Nevertheless, the project design is not in line with this rather tall order. Ingrained attitudes towards women can only be changed by a persistent effort, radio and then television is the ideal arena for this to pitch the key messages, these realms have obvious influence on people's prejudices and social behavior which has not been used uptill now.

One of the project activities is the screening of a Hollywood documentary 'Miss Representation' followed by a dialogue with media and other stakeholders. The documentary highlights how gender stereotypes and the objectification of women in the media impedes women's professional and personal aspirations and the way they are judged. The dialogue is led by a well known media personality and is aimed at increasing

awareness on the negative portrayal of women in the media. The consultant participated in one screening in Karachi where the participation in the dialogue was high but the quality of dialogue was weak due to lack of association and relevance with the Pakistani culture, particularly when audience is younger people from universities who would be rather more open than the selected journalists. The screening did not evoke the kind of discussion that could lead to any impact. The western images in the documentary gave most of the discussants an excuse to highlight that Pakistan being an Islamic country has better values and images of women; which appeared rather counter-productive and led to skewed discussion over the issue at hand. The project has a Face Book Page and Twitter account. The face book page and twitter account of GE4DE is updated as per project records during the MTE in the month of Feb 14 tweets were sent of which 8 were on one day. There are no clear messages or activism on gender equality in workplace. Presently there are only 43 follower on twitter and only 61 likes on FB.

4. Findings

4.1 Validity of the Project Design

The project is designed in view of the lessons learned from the five year WECPK project. The overall design is flexible and innovation is encouraged. The project was formulated on the basic assumption that most of the policy work would be done through the Ministry of Labour. After the 18th constitutional amendment the ministry was devolved to the provinces; therefore policy work also moved to the provincial labour departments adding more on the plate of the project. Nonetheless undertaking the challenge of legislative review or formulation of new policy with a rather new responsible at the provincial level requires a clear plan in terms of measurable outcomes and impact. Furthermore the synergy with the skills development and media component is missing. The design is vague in terms of awareness raising i.e. the activities do not correspond to the objective 3 and are more about media development. Overall the projects outputs in the design link to the intended outcomes (immediate objectives) that link to the broader impact (development objective).

The partners in the project are the ILO constituents i.e. the government and the employers and workers federation, the NGOs and the media. The partners have varying level of influence for example the government labour departments have more influence over policy formation and institutionalization of the process as compared to others, in the same manner the NGOs have the capacity in social mobilization and implementation at the community level. Media is influential in changing attitudes and perceptions about women's work rights. All partners possess capacities towards achieving gender equality at the work place and can achieve more if aligned.

This MTE based its evaluation on the basis of output targets only; the indicators in the PMP and results matrix were not planned or quantifiably defined. The projects intention to change social behaviors through the media component is very ambitious; because the design of this component focuses on numbers of one off training and selected events. Moreover the progress under objective 3 (media) should be contributing to project outcome 2. but due to the inherent flaw in the design which emphasizes capacity building of media; it is not conceivable that 'attitudinal change' through media training can be achieved during the project's duration. This is because the overall objective of awareness raising is not defined as an output in project design; therefore the change targets are not defined nor a tool is being used to measure the perceived changes taking place through training, newspaper articles and certain events. Improvements in order to achieve the stated project objectives are required by reviewing the PMP and results matrix and identifying qualitative and quantitative indicators that are in line with the results rather than the activities. It is not the purview of this evaluation to provide an alternate result framework or

PMP. Each of the outcomes needs to be reviewed for consistency of purpose for example outcome number 2. 'home based workers policy implemented in all four provinces' is not in line with the planned nor with the indicators of 'policy and cabinet decision' only whereas the outcome states 'implementation. This is rather confusing as outcome is implementation but (and in some instances implementation is being done) but indicators or planning are nor measureable. Similarly outcome 4 states 'GM institutionalized in DoLs' but the planning column states 'Development of PC -2 (feasibility) and PC 1 (including implementation) for consented scheme by DoL', the 'including implementation' part of the planning needs review for certain provinces in view of progress made till now and issues at hand, moreover it is not clear what the PCI comprises in this framework which one would measure; MOUs are available with DOLs however but this framework does not capture the key points. Similarly the two indicators for outcome 4 are 'Furniture in use & Physical verification through visits'; which do not correspond with measuring the outcomes and outputs. Qualitative indicators are mostly missing from these documents. It is difficult to understand how the team measures qualitative aspects of the project, therefore it will be very useful for the team (as well as for the final evaluation) to revise these two documents (Results Framework and PMP).

4.2 Relevance

The project is relevant to the national context of a positive policy environment towards gender equality and is adequately resourced. The project was designed with the involvement of constituents and its interventions are aimed at reducing poverty. The focus of the Government of Pakistan during project period has been towards poverty reduction and gender mainstreaming. Women's employment quota was revised and the first ever social safety net programme of the government Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP) targeted women as main beneficiaries. The project baseline informs on 78 percent respondents from 15 to 30 years this shows the demographic dividend of the country (as given in the situation analysis in this report) the project maybe contributing to but it needs to be captured. The devolution through constitutional reform brought challenges but also brought opportunity for the project to do policy level work with provincial governments. Although the implementation of ILS was already with the provincial DOLs; the provincial autonomy enabled ownership at the execution level. The project is also relevant and has contributed significantly to ILO's Decent Work Country Programme.

ILO's vision stipulated in its 5 year Decent Work Country Programme (DCWP) 2010-15 refers to women's rights to decent work as a core function. The project at the time of midterm is primarily achieving the following Country Programme Outcomes:

Outcome 103: *Access to employment for vulnerable groups improved.* Through its skills development work over 2011, the project has contributed to this target by bringing over 3000 women and men from low-income backgrounds, minorities, and single women headed households. The project has done some work to include disadvantaged groups such as persons with disabilities and religious minorities into its skills development programmes. However, this was not a specific requirement of IPs, and if it had been, programmes would have been more inclusive.

Outcome 103.3.1 *Competency-based training curriculum and capacity* was supported by the project through the development of sector specific competency standards in vocational training in consultation with Labour Departments and training institutes of Punjab, Sind, KPK and Balochistan. A pool of high profile, national experts from the industries were brought together by the project to develop sector specific competency standards and training material for industry through a series of workshops. These standards were endorsed by industry for sectors where women's employment is high or increasing or

there is potential to take women to better levels of jobs, (garment manufacturing, beauty and personal care, fashion designing and hospitality).

Outcome 103.4 *Enhanced capacity for planning, coordination and implementation of TEVTAs at the provincial level* has been supported by the project with the government of Sindh TEVTA

Outcome 801 and PAK 802 *Increased capacities of employers'/workers' organizations to influence policies*; through building the capacity of three research staff of the EFP to measure gender equality through policies and practices at the work place and plans to undertake a quantitative analysis of Gender Equality and advocacy on Gender Equality in business studies curricula. The PWF enabled 50 women workers organizations through leadership skills training to promote gender equality in workers' organizations and their workplace.

Outcome 826: *Strengthened capacity of member states to ratify and apply ILS*. The Gender Units at the departments of Labor are contributing to this outcome. For details see the section on Project Implementation status under Objective 1.

Outcome 104: *Employable Skills Systems Promoted* - The project's skills development component has established a number of innovative models such as the Value Chain approach to skills development, employer engagement across the training cycle, developing community leaders for training and enterprise development, and breaking stereotypes in women's skills development programmes. For details see the section on Project Implementation status under Objective 2.

4.3 Efficiency

The project has an efficient management structure with supporting staff to carry the project but require more support in systemizing planning and monitoring as well as in provincial coordination; the latter in view of the devolution that has added to the work load. The work processes have gaps, in the PMP the planning indicators are not clearly quantified that made it difficult to assess efficiency particularly of partners work; the PMP format also has an issue related to time frames which does not always correlate with output targets. The project was signed in March 2010, team was on board in August and implementation started in November 2010. Overall the project is on track in terms of its expenditure and achieving beneficiary targets. In March 2013 the project expenditure rate is 41 percent with 40 percent in sub contracts. Of the 6300 target of training and employment generation 3368 has been achieved. At midterm 10 short term skills development projects have been completed and 4 long term projects have started. The short term projects have successfully met targets, have been assessed and scale up of four such projects is planned; bidding for new projects has been completed. Similarly interventions with the DOLs and EFP and PWF are at an advanced stage, the media component has also met targets as per the yearly work plans. Performance and participation levels of long term skills development projects and work with DOLs vary across geographical areas due to issues highlighted in the previous sections but overall the success rate of is high and the project is on track with some key activities lagging behind. The success is primarily due to adequate allocation of funds and human resources assigned strategically to different components. Moreover expenditure in the media component is skewed in favor of training and less on awareness raising that could have a wider impact. In terms of human resources monitoring requires more attention. The project management is a demonstrated strength in terms of meeting targets and team building. The project team is capable of apt delivery of resources and no major problems are there in terms of training, hardware and software.

The project prepared a detailed inception report in consultation with ILO and review research and good practices and lessons learned from ILOs previous work. The report outlined the implementation strategy in three phases and provided rationale for selection of sectors. The inception report also lay out three kinds of skills' training namely *Skills Plus*; the classroom approach, *Khadija* (entrepreneurship for women to setup and sustain their own businesses) and *Hunarmand* (apprenticeship training). Some planned and useful strategies however could not be implemented for example the inception report under the 'governance mechanisms' outlines that district level committees comprising of sector/community specialists and representatives of district and provincial governments would be established as needed. It also strategized that the Gender Units will be involved in the monitoring and evaluation of projects, in this connection DOL staff have been trained on gender monitoring in project cycle and are expected to apply those skills in the joint project they will implement for women's empowerment (eg childcare and transport in Sind, KPK and Punjab). The inception report of the project falls short on laying out a strategy to integrate project activities across the three objectives. It vaguely refers to creating models for this purpose.

An approach to bridge the gap between the public and policymakers by creating and strengthening a network of women leaders to reach out to over 500 representatives of parliamentarians, media, judiciary and police has not been implemented because a grassroots women's group from amongst the trainees has to be created as a strategy. This network will be initiated during the 4th year of project which will have minimum if any outcome. These activities if initiated in the first phase could have helped the project in mainstreaming gender equality at workplace in policy and legislation and implementation of laws relevant to women; for example to gain support of the provincial legislatures in Balochistan province where the project has faced problems in functionalizing the gender unit. Other pending activities include promotional packages concerning women's employment, gender equality and international labour standards in regional languages including Punjabi, Sindhi, Pashto and Balochi. Pashto and Sindhi are widely read and used.

Of the eleven recommendations in the Evaluation of the WEC-PK most have been taken up by the project. Two of these pertaining to inter linkages between components and assessment of PWF and EFP are pending. The WEC PK evaluation report highlights the gap in partnerships between labour and women development ministries which this MTE also identified at the provincial levels. The project is working with the WDD Punjab by pooling into the Punjab Women's Empowerment Package, the Working Women's Policy, gender mainstreaming courses through ITC and initiatives on domestic workers' training and childcare facilities are under discussion.

4.4 Effectiveness

The objectives of the project are partially achieved at the time of the Mid Term Evaluation. The major factors that led to the achievement of objectives were a dedicated team with no staff turnover (except for one), experienced NGOs and training institutes, responsive partnerships with provincial labour departments, EFP, PWF and the Media. The project at the same time has invested significantly in the capacity building of its government and NGO partners; it is noted that the project has allocated a large portion of its budget for training activities. In terms of approaches that have worked effectively social mobilization with communities represents a well-utilized strategic entry point in areas like suburbs of Lahore and in RYK. There has been a clear effect of this social mobilization with regard to the right of women to work and towards self-reliance in the community. There are some encouraging signs of village level ownership of the project. There are also good signs of passing over the skills in Karachi coastal communities whereby 200 additional women were trained as an indirect effect.

In response to increased incomes the project has provided training and access to jobs. The project succeeded in breaking stereo types by skilling women to join unconventional occupations and unique approaches like KAB are being used to provide entrepreneurial opportunities for women to start up their own businesses. The project is mindful of the fact that having acquired a skill does not guarantee employment given that creating gainful job opportunities with decent working conditions is still a major challenge in Pakistan. Therefore through competency based training and pre and post training services the project is aiming to enable women beneficiaries to get access to credit and other productive resources; business development services including market information; and organizational, entrepreneurial and management capacity development.

The project works closely with the EFP and PWF to continue ILOs tripartite social dialogue. The project has succeeded in review of labour laws gender mainstreaming and HBWs policy. The project has invested in developing the gender responsive labour inspection tool and competency based standards for skills training through consultations with industry and experts. The project effectively responded through the DOL Sind by developing a special set of training programmes for families 400 to 500 victims of the Karachi factory fire. There are major changes in the work done with the DOLs where attitudinal changes in the approaches of government are evident, DOL GFPs confirmed they had no knowledge of gender and women's employment concerns as well as decent work before the project. These changes in the form of improved knowledge and attitudes promise better outcomes for women on sustainable basis hence contribute to the strategic outcomes of the project. Similarly in work with NGOs it is reported that communities have actually improved their life styles and choices. For example in the PDI project locality, success was achieved in prevention from drugs "gutka" and incidences of domestic violence and early girl child marriages were identified and are now being addressed by the women communities who have been part of the trainings.

The project has also strengthened knowledge base through research and its dissemination mentioned in the previous section under Objective 3. But there is limited evidence that this was used for 'mass awareness for mobilizing public opinion and action' as given in the project design. The findings from the research have not been translated into key messages for awareness raising. At the downstream level, the three components stand apart from each other.

The project has used all the lessons learned from the WEC_PK project including selection of sectors for skills training. Therefore four sectors were selected which includes hospitality, garments, manufacturing and textiles, IT, and beauty. This selectivity on the one hand has helped the project to focus its research and skills development interventions but on the other at the community level for example in the ECI project there are other sectors which have more market demand. Confusion amongst ECI's change makers existed in Lahore; however project team is of the view that the model has already been consented with and has the potential to identify, say a 100 type of sub sectors even within hospitality and textiles. Secondly vigorous interventions under the One UN project during the bridging period between WEC-PK and GE4DE like training of the police force; despite being a part of the project have not continued.

In terms of effectiveness internal and external coordination have been important parameters for this evaluation. At the field level good models of collaboration were found in the ECI project in RYK where it has collaborated with Pakistan Development Forum (PDF) bringing in support for project beneficiaries in health. This represents a positive co-relation between the presence of health facilities, role of seminaries in eradication of polio. However since PDF does not have an education intervention the consultant met many children out of school, the reasons given by parents were poverty and lack of access to schools.

This is an area that would require attention to break the inter-generational cycle of poverty and although the project would achieve its results of income generation it has a bearing on its impact. The project reports that increase in income will ensure education of children but this does not always happen, as incomes are not always spent on children's education particularly on the education of the girl child. Although the project team rightly so doesn't consider this as their mandate and believes there is a spin off effect of the project on the education of children but linkages with other programmes could still have been developed and evidence can be created for the spin off effect if any. Ignoring this aspect can result in lack of sustainable impact; the risk being the continuity of the cycle of poverty despite the employment opportunity.

Sumanzar collaboration resulted in support from the vocational training institute the Nafisa Mai School and Shell Tameer's Social Entrepreneurship Award sponsored by the British Council. Work with COTHM included establishing an 'Employer's Forum' to guide the culinary skill development program with inputs from leading hospitality industry employers of Lahore. Meetings with leading industry employers determined skills shortages in the industry while also eliciting post training employment commitments for employment. These are good practices that have generated models of holistic approaches and sharing of resources.

Coordination with ILO country office comprises the baseline research by ILO on domestic workers, review of competency standards for domestic workers and models for decent work for domestic workers (DW4DW) borrowed from India which can be adapted. The project has been discussing to pilot these under the hospitality and services sector interventions. At field level, GE4DE has tapped several of the master trainers under TGP from KPK and Balochistan and continue to build their capacity. Similarly frequent resource sharing for publications knowledge products is conducted at the management level. The GE4DE has also furnished the media links for ILO. The project has partnered with other ILO projects including Labour Law Review from ILS perspective, training of DOLs on reporting on ILS, Decent Work and Labour Inspection (based on the GRLI), cross project visits for the media trainees, competency based training and standards development, support to Sind TEVTA, showcasing events, the Know About Business, TOT and the DWCP which is the umbrella for all projects in ILO. GE4DE has made efforts to optimize the use of resources by linking it into other ILO projects. Some examples are of jointly providing KAB training to Punjab TEVTA, Sind TEVTA, PVTC and others. GE4DE has built on research work done by TGP and WEC-PK on decent transport, childcare and residential facilities for women, in their work with governments of Punjab and Sind to establish childcare facilities for working women. The project has been working with the ILO programme team on labour law reform for all provinces. In all these collaborations financial and technical resources have been pooled. The project also benefits from ILOs partnerships with its constituents and their networks one major example is of ILOs existing work with DOLs in having established the Child Labour Units.

GE4DE reports show external coordination with international and national NGOs, micro finance institutions, public sector, various workers federations; more than 100 employers in the corporate sector and other UN agencies. Around 500 stakeholders (NTO participants) have been participating in regular consultations, events, show & tell events and other relevant gatherings since the start of the project. The TGP (ILO) project had initiated the Home Based Workers Policy (HBW) in Punjab continued by GE4DE. The Project has been working with UN Women on registration of HBWs in selected districts in Sind and Punjab and with other UN agencies and other ILO projects on the development of the HBW federal policy which is now being translated to provincial policies under the project. The Project of ILO under One UN has carried out two studies a). decent transport and b). child welfare facilities. It has in collaboration with GE4DE also documented and disseminated case studies of working women who are

GE4DE. These are small but important gains; the One UN agenda on the other hand itself it huge and organizations like UNDP have a lot to offer. Besides UN there are bilateral donors that have huge programmes for poverty alleviation including their support to BISP which also comprises vocational training and self-employment projects; linkages with these are missing. CIDA is funding three other projects on women’s economic empowerment (Annex 3).The learning from these projects if shared with ILO can enhance the GE4DE interventions. The project coordinator participates in the gender focal points working group and annual Women’s Economic Empowerment (WEE) Forum organized by CIDA for its four project that allows learning opportunities with CIDA and other development partners. In terms of collaboration and intermediate partnerships with the district governments, there was no evidence.

4.5 Monitoring and Evaluation

The project does not have a full M&E officer. The team is engaged in regular interaction with the partners. Necessary technical backstopping to the implementing partners has been possible through monitoring of projects at various stages of implementation. The monitoring practice is via field missions by project team and a post training assessment of skills development training. The project has also undertaken the process of post-training assessment. The following sample has been used:

Table 5. Sample of Post training Assessment

No.	Method	Sample	By
1	Face to face interaction	25%	Officials by ILO-GE4DE
2	End line survey	40%	External Collaborator
3	Telephonic Interviews	25%	GE4DE team

The post training report highlights that most of the trainees of the completed training are employed; they have enhanced mobility, more confidence, are contributing to family income and can pay the child’s school fee. However it cannot be determined through this qualitative assessment how many children (girls and boys) in a family were able to go to school as a result of the enhanced income. The assessment also highlights improvement in working conditions but whether this is due to the training itself or Show and Tell events is not clear because graduates may not necessarily be working with the same employers who participated in Show and Tell. One important aspect not found in the training assessment report is that the Karachi coastal community trainees were able to train another 200 women who are also now fully employed as indirect beneficiaries of the project.

The project has developed a Results Matrix and a Performance Management Plan (PMP). The project team informed that the PMP is the monitoring plan. However it is important for the project team to take into account that a monitoring plan is a managerial tool that specifies the schedule, resources, responsibilities, for M&E activities (data collection, data quality control, reporting, dissemination and use of data) supported by a budget with clear roles and responsibilities of project staff. Moreover, there is no planning of the target numbers under indicators; nor does it have time line and the project PMP is inadequate on this account. Therefore the consultant did not consider it as a monitoring plan which should have identified indicators specific to each project, the persons, organizations responsible for collecting information and a tentative time frame. There are no monitoring plans with the implementing partners either. Each of the projects has its own LFA and the LFA is considered as a monitoring plan and also a tool. This is fine but LFA in itself is not the appropriate tool to monitor rather it provides objective basis for activity review, monitoring, and evaluation. Moreover if an LFA is not updated during

implementation as is the case with this project, it can be a static tool that does not reflect changing conditions. There are no tools with specific indicators being used to collect and verify quantifiable data by the team during field visits. There is no uniform data collection template for field missions which could be adequately completed and stored on a database. The team referred to the community profiles of individual community members as a data base as such it seemed there was a huge gap even in understanding monitoring.

Most partners when queried on monitoring did not reply satisfactorily nor could produce supporting documents to establish that monitoring is being done systematically and its results being used for corrective action. The record shared by the project shows monitoring of each project has taken place but there is inadequate information on frequency of visits and analysis of data. This gap is also reflected in the project reports which are not analytical but description of activities. The project is therefore deficient in integrated monitoring tools with specific indicators to monitor the diversity of GE4DE projects with specific activities and resultant outcomes. The implementing partner's monitoring does not clearly link up with the GE4DE M&E at ILO and with M&E of other partners.

There are nonetheless, training plans and yearly activity work plans around which the project staff monitors the project activities but these are not sufficient to gauge the overall outcomes of the project. Formal surveys to collect information from a selected sample of people and households have also been used. This is a good tool to make comparisons but again the disadvantage is that results of such were not available for a long time, it's expensive, time consuming and some information is not available through interviews for example the increase in income does not inform on the dynamics except the increase itself. Evidence from an end line carried out by an external consultant that shows substantial increase in incomes of the baseline respondents after the skills training offered by the project but since this information is not yet available in the form of a report, causal relationship of such huge changes (below 10,000 earning to 50,000 earning could) could not be understood.

Overall there is no systematic and integrated monitoring taking place to measure periodically whether or not the activities (especially skills trainings) would have any impact on providing sustainable and decent work to beneficiaries not just in the form of employment but also as entrepreneurs. It is also difficult to assess how the soft assistance is being provided by the project such as policy advice, coordination, and advocacy all culminating into results and impact outcomes at some point. This is a major gap in the project and can affect the overall quality of implementation. This gap is also because no monitoring specialists in on the team to have developed a monitoring framework for the project with requisite tools and data base. The present team itself is fully engaged in implementation.

This evaluation of the project progress therefore; as stated in validity above is based on project outputs defined in the PMP. The MOVs in many instances are just a word like 'reporting' or 'monitoring'. In the communication component these are at times missing or mixed up with indicators. In the results matrix MOVs are more useful and concrete. In view of this gap information on the numbers heading towards entrepreneurship could not be collected.

Project reporting comprises annual reports, mid-term progress report and a project completion report. The project progress reports are based on reports received from the implementing partners and monitoring visits carried out by project team. There is no information in progress reports on assessment of short term projects, their replication or exit strategies or on risk management. The project progress reports lack essential analysis and can be improved by objective analysis and self-examination. This approach would enable corrective action and also more cohesion between the three components. A Result Based

Monitoring & Evaluation Framework Vs. the traditional M&E measures being used by the project would report on results more proactively and for improving substantive performance and achieving results.

4.6 Sustainability and Risks

The project demonstrates emerging and potential sustainability measures such as capacitating the government, NGOs, training institutes like PRGTTI and STEVTA and workers and employers federations through effective training and TOT courses; development and implementation of competency standards, formation of gender units in the provincial labour departments with government staff carrying out the responsibilities and policy work aimed at strengthening home based workers. The project has adopted a Training of Trainers (TOT) approach and master trainers met during the MTE noted that they have actually been delivering workshops for other organizations also this includes the trainers of the media component. There is a need therefore that these successes of the project are continued through a good sustainability strategy and plan. Although it is understood that much of the effort till now has been on implementation but sustainability planning and exit strategies cannot be left till the end of the project. This plan can during the project period address the gaps at the local level where local mechanism are not involved in the project. The eventual exit of the project still has to be discussed and it is missing from the project design and results matrix etc. The project might need additional time to cover this exit phase but this can only be decided if this exit strategy is formed now.

The overall risk is related to the lack of cohesion and lack of interface amongst the three components of the project which can undermine an overall impact by the end of the project. The policy makers and legislatures have not been involved resulting in losing the missed opportunity of making decent work for women a part of political parties manifestos during the 2013 general elections. If the project doesn't plan these activities for implementation now it can result in distancing the project from important and influential stakeholders that is the law enforcers, judiciary, parliamentarians whose buy in is absolutely necessary for the policy level outcomes of the project.

Without visible district/local institutions the investment in the community model at the village level may not be sustainable; project benefits notwithstanding. Keeping in view that in rural areas the entire system is based on client-patron relationships where decisions about who gets the job and who gets the business opportunity are based on parochial interests rather than merits of a case. It would be naïve to expect the community groups of change makers to navigate through local politics of patronage without providing a roadmap and strategies for collective action. There can be a conflict between recipients and non-recipients in the ECI community based skills development programme. The ongoing media related work would result in a pool of trained journalists who would have published articles - but changes in attitudes and awareness levels on gender equality in general and women's work rights in particular would not be achieved. The project will be demonstrating its impact only in terms of numbers trained.

Following list of Risks and assumptions were provided by the project team which have been analyzed in Table 6.

Risks and Assumptions Ge4DE

- National environment (political, economic and social) is sufficiently stable to allow sustained commitment to gender equality and women's empowerment.
- Gender equality remains a priority with leading donors and the Civil Society as a major Human Rights issue.

- Political willingness/commitment to adopt the innovative approaches developed by the project.
 - Partners are adequately motivated to address women’s employment issues
 - The political momentum allows the key state functionaries to take, or to consent to creative initiatives.
 - Trained officials are committed to reflect the acquired learning and training in their respective work
 - Gender analysis skills acquired but not applied due to frequent transfer of public officials thus requiring time and efforts to bring new incumbents on board.
 - MOL at the federal level willing to provide adequate financial and human resources for the Cells in the Labour Departments in the provinces
 - Willingness of the provincial governments to take ownership of the initiatives for sustainability for instance Women facilitation centers
 - Continued interest and contribution of government and the civil society in localizing MDGs through public and private partnerships.
 - District governments adopt M&E mechanism to monitor the progress of the outcomes at the district level.
 - Government revenue does not get stagnant or decline to affect the level of public spending.
 - Governments do not perceive technical cooperation on GE as a threat to their sovereignty or to their trade advantages.
 - The security situation does not deteriorate and allows the physical access of project team to all selected areas and target population
 - Existence of a credible threat of law enforcement
 - Targeted training institutes in selected areas are able to execute short cycle trainings and willing to continue post training services
- Project Document - Promoting Gender Equality through Decent Employment Page 30 of 40
- Market does not reach saturation and is unable to absorb skilled women labour
 - Training costs include provision of stipend and transport facility for trainees
 - Willingness of all sections of the media and civil society to act as watchdogs and address the gender

Table 6 Analysis of Risks and Assumptions

Risks and Assumptions	Analysis
National environment (political, economic and social) is sufficiently stable to allow sustained commitment to gender equality and women’s empowerment.	This can be a high risk due to militancy in KP dist Charsadda More information needs to be gathered on this aspect which at that time was not so apparent and therefore not identified
The political momentum allows the key state functionaries to take, or to consent to creative initiatives.	This is a medium risk but needs to be rated province wise rather than in generic terms as the situation varies from province to province

<p>• Gender analysis skills acquired but not applied due to frequent transfer of public officials thus requiring time and efforts to bring new incumbents on board.</p>	<p>This has been a high risk in Balochistan province and also partly in Sindh</p>
<p>MOL at the federal level willing to provide adequate financial and human resources for the Cells in the Labour Departments in the provinces</p>	<p>This is redundant as MOL does not exist anymore</p>
<p>Willingness of the provincial governments to take ownership of the initiatives for sustainability for instance Women facilitation centers</p>	<p>Again a high risk as team informed the women department's do not have the capacity to develop facilitation centers, requires review,</p>
<p>Continued interest and contribution of government and the civil society in localizing MDGs through public and private partnerships.</p>	<p>This has not been documented or pursued</p>
<p>District governments adopt M&E mechanism to monitor the progress of the outcomes at the district level.</p>	<p>No work with district governments is being carried out by the project as noted in evaluation and recommendations provided. Opportunity exists to reduce the risk in next two years by following recommendations and also that local bodies elections will be held and local government's formed soon.</p>
<p>• Government revenue</p>	<p>Factually government faces financial crunch particularly in 2013 and</p>

does not get stagnant or decline to affect the level of public spending.	budget analysis of expenditure should be available with the team in Pakistan economic Survey report 2013-14
Governments do not perceive technical cooperation on GE as a threat to their sovereignty or to their trade advantages.	Not likely
The security situation does not deteriorate and allows the physical access of project team to all selected areas and target population	Project team follows UNDSS advisory, threat were there but its nature was not as major obstacles to access to project areas.
Existence of a credible threat of law enforcement	
Targeted training institutes in selected areas are able to execute short cycle trainings and willing to continue post training services	COHTM, and PRGTTI were the selected training institutes that have and STVETA is performing its functions satisfactorily
Market does not reach saturation and is unable to absorb skilled women labour	Project end line and women's unemployment situation in the country shows this is not the case
Training costs include provision of stipend and transport facility for trainees	Yes this is being done
• Willingness of all sections of the media and civil society to act as watchdogs and address the gender	Willingness was observed at the same time media in Pakistan has become more inclined towards its corporate interests which has reduced the space for social issues particularly on electronic media. Civil Society is engaged with the project but more can be done as coordination at the field level is weak and implementing partners are

more focused on meeting project targets,

5. Lessons Learned

Following are the key lessons deduced from the GE4DE project during the MTE

1. **If the training is demand based i.e. what the factory/industry/market needs the opportunity for employment is greater.** Factories understand the value of women workers and are willing to facilitate their mobility, provide equal wages, maternity leave, separate eating and prayer space etc. **The value of engaging the employers from the very beginning** of the training project in the skills development projects with the coastal communities in Karachi, the hospitality training by COHTM and the readymade garments training by PRGTTI resulted in guaranteed internships and employment. PIHR is also involving prospective employer in the on line earning project. One example of working with employers is when the project and partner organizations partnered with potential employers to deliver the training on industry sites. The potential employer also provided the required machines, tools resulting in cost effectiveness; the skills matched the industry needs and the same employer provided work opportunity. Similarly, engagement with relevant stakeholders has proved very useful. Punjab Technical and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA) announced to certify the training course imparted by COHTM. Akhuwat, a micro-credit NGO, announced interest free loans for graduates to start their own small enterprises. Coordination with relevant stakeholders for example TEVTA Punjab enabled to get the COHTM training certified.
2. **The support of local community organizations, role models and the trust they have built through a long commitment to community welfare helps to lay the building blocks for ILO's interventions and vision.** For example the vocational training institutes like the Nafisa Mai School at Dera Jhatta, provided free space and helped to build upon the social acceptance from the community. Similarly the local colleges in RYK provided space and overall management support in the on line earning project, these colleges also have a trust relationship with communities and parents as a result there is a buy-in for computer training for girls in a conservative social set up.
3. **Simplicity of training materials coupled with exposure visits to prospective work places and interface with employers has been a source of encouragement and motivation for trainees to continue their certification as observed in the training in PRGTTI and COHTM.**
4. **Offering transport to women trainees and employees is another motivational factor.** Five girls dropped out of one of the training as they could not afford transportation fares. Although alternate candidates were found to fill the empty slots, perhaps addressing their problems could have avoided their dropping out from the training. Many such stories are prevalent in the local communities which consider girls' mobility a huge issue due to social cultural constraints. The trainees of on line learning, ranked home based work as the greatest attraction for them due to constrained mobility. In places very remote or far away honoraria has been duly incorporated by the project which the trainees receive to compensate for transport
5. **Lack of coordination and interface amongst partners implementing different components of the project can result in isolating the theme of decent work which is common to all.** At the same time it deprives partners from learning from each other and forming partnerships. Although project outputs can still be achieved in terms of numbers but can affect the strategic outcomes.

6. **Media cannot be considered as a one dimensional source of information and awareness raising** i.e. the emphasis of the project on training journalists for the purpose of reporting only, nor can the required change come through targeting only the literate population who are able to read the articles that would be produced as an output of the trainings. For wider outreach media strategies should target the most widely used medium used by those whose attitudes need to be changed. Since this target group is diverse the medium should be also diverse.
Many participants of the workshop noted that the media has received many training by different organizations in Pakistan and it has not quite translated into a sustainable change, women are still portrayed negatively; though there are exceptions.
7. **Implementation of media component as an independent component can result in isolation of key messages of the project.** For example messages coming out from the skills component such as gender equality issues pertinent in communities that become an obstacle for women to seek employment and workplace rights of those who have been trained and are employed.
8. **If communication materials are not used at the community level and at workplace it creates a gap in awareness raising.** This gap is visible in the project.
9. **In view of the diversity of the project in terms of skills, stakeholders, partners and geographical areas a set of monitoring tools with specific indicator are necessary to strengthen inputs and lead to the required actions for long term outcomes and harmonizing the project goals.**
10. **If tools are simpler these are easier to use; the GRLI tool usability is not demonstrated in the context of challenges that the DOLs face in terms of low capacity** i.e. few labour inspectors and lack of transport support. Furthermore there are issues around it being one tool for use towards various establishments from factories to shops which are under different laws making it difficult for the labour inspectors to discern which section of the tool to use. Therefore the summative learning is that the context of Pakistan governance structures and issues should be kept in mind when investing in such tools in order for them to be used and accepted more effectively.
11. People have to know about their rights at work in order to have decent work environments on sustainable basis.
12. **In view of the marked role and effect of the advertising agencies in heavily stereotyping women's role the project may consider working with selected agencies after identifying their advertisements.** The advertising has a huge impact and consistently reinforces women's traditional roles of caregivers. An assessment of adverts could also bring in valuable information to the project and discussions around selected adverts can itself create the required understanding and awareness amongst stakeholders.

6. Conclusions

1. Overall the project has achieved substantial progress towards meeting its objectives and targets. Several notable features have been cited in this report that adds value to the GE4DE project. This includes a conscious effort to deliver high quality activities and outputs, work with a broad spectrum of organizations which includes, NGOs, public and private sector, media and academia; and pioneering non conventional work in gender equality in women's employment in the country.
2. The project has to its credit key accomplishments such as the formation of five gender units in the provincial labour departments, policy on HBWs, review of labour laws for gender equality, formation and launch of the gender labour inspection tool Vs. the outdated labour inspection till now; high quality research, non conventional work with PWF on gender sensitizing organizations through training, development of competency standards and innovation in skills development

through the use of tree methodology in urban settings and creating a pool of media experts to deliver training in gender.

3. Impressive results have been achieved in skills training in a wide range of sectors. The project has to its achievement introducing new areas of work through piloting innovations. Many of these areas in skill development are new and have the potential for replication and scale up. With both PRGTTI and COTHM, the ILO has implemented in urban setting a methodology originally meant for empowerment of rural communities; successfully demonstrating the methodology can be implemented in the urban context also. The TREE process helped the organizations systematically identify employment and income-generating opportunities in the apparel and hospitality industries in Lahore and ensured design and delivery of appropriate trainings along with provision of necessary post-training support.
6. The work with communities through community change makers, on line earning, responding to an emergency of factory fire victims, working with an array of skills from hospitality to readymade garments, to the coastal communities are success stories.
7. The project design by default is ambitious being a national project it is geographically dispersed when ILO does not have sub offices. There are 10 projects completed during this time period each with no more than 200 or less trainees in diverse occupations in geographically dispersed areas. This is no ordinary achievement, yet it moves the project away from impact despite that the team has been hundred percent busy with getting the work done.
8. The project partners and the team informed that vulnerable groups like PWDs, widows, women headed households, minorities are included in the project and numbers were provided in some instances like Baidaree. But what was done by the project to include particularly disadvantaged or socially excluded groups did not bind with any targets. Therefore it was not possible to quantify nor a single PWD was met during the field visits amongst the dozens of trainees of skills training, employed persons or media training. In most development programmes PWDs are often excluded from skills and employment opportunities. This is despite the fact that the government has also allocated a special quota of 2 percent in employment for PWDs which often is not implemented. During the time of the field visit Inter-Media was carrying out training with journalists which comprised a very weak add-on on human rights with a rather humiliating reference to PWDs; this shows human rights expertise is required for such sessions.
9. A joint forum for discussion and information sharing amongst ILO constituents; implementing partners and the donor is missing. The project reports and activity plans do not demonstrate any such joint discussions held during this time period except for the WEE forum of CIDA projects that is held by CIDA for its partners once a year. The implementing partners, the government, NGOs, training institutes, media and journalists did not know about the other components of the project. The partners have not had the opportunity after the first initial consultation to contribute to developing a larger more holistic planning framework of the project. The project components do not link up with each other. During the MTE no such linkage could be found where one component compliments the other. For example the knowledge products could not be shared with the DOLs in a manner that they could use them more appropriately for information sharing, the DOLs are not even aware of the skills and media interventions. Similarly the skills projects have no media activity in the field where awareness needs to be created amongst the men in the family on women's rights. The media trainers or resource persons were not aware of GE4DE project related to skills and with the government and EFP and PWF. This makes the three components stand apart from each other and poses a risk to the project in terms of impact. The project design does not have activities under the three components to enable these linkages.
10. It was evident that the project has successfully transferred the knowledge to its constituents and partners on ILO conventions and decent work agenda and gender equality. Interestingly the implementing partners have not been assessed on decent work practices in their own

- organizations except for the DOLs. Some partners asserted they have anti-sexual harassment policy but there was no evidence found. All the women trainees interviewed were also not aware of these laws that give them their rights as workers and provide them protection.
11. The women's employment quota has been enhanced by provinces, 25 percent Sind, 15 percent Punjab, and 10 percent KPK but a 2010 research shows only 2 percent quota was implemented in Sind, similarly other provinces do not have a follow-up mechanism on this.
 12. ILO considers Human Rights as workplace rights. The GE4DE project focuses on the right to employment but lacks a detailed strategy for its IPs to address decent work issues of beneficiaries who are and will be working in informal work situations for example decent work was not found to be a part of the community change makers work plans in RYK, nor implementing partners had a plan on how decent work will be introduced in the long term projects of MINTEX, ECI, S-TEVTA and PIHR and in the upscale of projects. The women beneficiaries of the pilot project in coastal communities of Karachi had access to transport and separate personal area at work including maternity leave and PRGTTI has also ensured this for its trainees in prospective work places; but again this does not cut across all projects.
 13. The assumption that increased income would improve education and health indicators is inconsistent and any kind of economic shock to the target beneficiaries can jeopardize the efforts of the project; moreover this assumption can affect sustainability of the interventions in terms of breaking the cycle of poverty. A lack of wellbeing is as important to address as material poverty. The project design does not address this and leaves this largely to the assumption that by addressing income poverty it will sustain the benefits that incur through skills training and policy changes. Factually the project interventions cannot be isolated from other projects in education, health etc. in view of its strategic outcomes and ILO's goal of poverty alleviation. Improved linkages can result in providing education to the children of the beneficiary families, the project assumes based on interviews with recipients of whom many said they spend on the children and families or on themselves; that this will happen through increased income, but evidence from other programmes in the development sector suggest this is not always the case.
 14. The project design has limitations in the media component that has a heavy emphasis on training a large number of journalists. It is clear that the emphasis is on generating content, but this does not link with the objective pertaining to expected attitudinal change amidst limited literate audience of the print media. Work with electronic media particularly the state run television and Radio that has the highest outreach could have been undertaken. Although a number of radio journalists are a part of the media training, but it yet has to be seen how they will produce content that changes perceptions, because it is largely left to them and their mentors without a clear plan of action. The project media component reports it aims to measure change in behavior through monitoring content generation. Nonetheless, the journalists in training and those met outside the training complained about the policies of their media managers/houses which rendered them unable to prioritize social issues. Therefore the project approach does not clearly spell out the elements that as a result would lead to the required attitudinal change at different levels. It is not about the number of journalists trained or the number of events organized with the number of participants and the number of news channels picking the story; this is activity level - whereas the project needs to demonstrate the results of these activities and plan on how those results will be achieved and measured.
 15. Overall the project has to be in line with the changing realities; the biggest media house in Pakistan has recently given up the social sector programmes because the ratings are important for corporate media which lie either in political or entertainment programmes. This shows space for social issues is becoming less; same is in print media. Therefore opting for different sets of interventions can contribute more to the strategic outcome 2 of the project.

16. Small and big projects in geographically dispersed locations, media training, work with five DOLs including research, assessments, events has been challenging for the project team to manage, coordinate and monitor and also link up. Consolidating these interventions into a larger impact would continue to remain a challenge.
17. At the time of this MTE the project had not developed its sustainability strategy and plan or exit strategy. Although in practice the project is laying the foundations for sustainability of its interventions through capacity building and policy change. None of the partner organization had a plan of action to the post project period.

7. Recommendations

Objective 1. Policy and Institutional Strengthening

1. **In view of the devolution of Ministry of Labour, provincial level steering committees should be constituted under the provincial departments of labour.** Nonetheless a national forum which can be under the project should be in place to ensure coordination and share progress with govt, CIDA and other stakeholders.
2. **The Gender Units at the Labour department can be further strengthened** through the following recommendations:
 - An annual national forum should be organized to bring the five gender units together to engage with other partners and interface with other components of the project.
 - The project should prioritize the formation of data base on women's employment by providing technical assistance and also earmark a budget to enable them to carry out awareness raising activities (for example seminars) including the dissemination of knowledge products and key messages from publications.
 - The GRLI tool kit is a remarkable knowledge and application tool but is it workable as it is or requires further review is a question that needs to be discussed more openly with DOLs because the project team and the some of the DOLs views on it varied different during this MTE.
 - The project may include follow-up on women's employment quota in the TORs and support the gender units in monitoring and tracking its implementation.
 - The database of trainers may be established and shared with other actors outside the project UN agencies and organizations and WEE partners of CIDA working on similar activities. As a first step, awareness raising about importance of role of women in economy has to target also the decision makers so that conscious knowledge is developed about their different roles of women in the economy for which gender units as a mechanism can support maintaining an impetus in the efforts of gender mainstreaming.
3. **The work with women parliamentarians, law enforcing agencies is planned for year four this should be reconsidered and can be started now for measuring the outcomes of the project by end of year five.** The project has assessed the manifestos of political parties which are outdated now since the activity did not take place so the new manifestos released for election 2013 would require a review.

Objective 2. Skills Development

4. **The project may re-consider introducing new skills development projects because the geographical diversity is already a challenge to achieve impact. At this time it is crucial to strategize how the different projects will be consolidated to demonstrate impact.** If new projects are introduced then these should be in the locations where the project has already created its presence and may consider focusing on youth and PWDs. Nonetheless the emphasis should be on expansion during the second half of the project period. For example the Balochistan project on skills development of mosaic has the potential for scale up. An RFP for another project in the province was in process at the time of MTE. It would be advisable to consider scaling up the mosaic project that requires market linkages as a second phase instead of starting altogether a new project.
5. **Linkages should be developed by the implementing partners with other programmes for more holistic gains and optimization of resources.**
 - For this purpose mapping of donors is imperative in all project locations. MOUs can be signed with district governments' social welfare /community development departments by the implementing partners. The project can work at the district level towards bringing together the formal (Pakistan Bait-ul-Maal, BISP, Department of Social Welfare) and informal institutions (community groups and local CBOs) to work together in order to reduce exclusion and discrimination of the poorest and most marginalized, thus enabling increased access to opportunities and support mechanisms that are available at the district level. Target families can benefit in a number of ways through such linkages at the local level for example the Bait ul Maal has support and grants for widows and persons with disabilities. Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP) provides cash grants, vocational training and other similar grants. Furthermore coordination with National Commission on Status of Women (NCWS) and WEE Alliance being set up by UN Women with whom information and progress about the project need to be shared on regular basis.
 - Vulnerability targets should be increased in extended and new projects with quantifiable indicators. If the project decides to start new projects one can be on PWDs. Future projects of ILO should also fix a quota for vulnerable groups with clear selection and monitoring indicators.
 - The capacity development support to various implementing partners may include skills to formulate and raise informed analytical questions and activities allowing benefits and economic participation of women and men. Under the planned capacity development actions information and training on human rights may also be included. For this development of a Human Rights module fitting into the context of employability and skills development may be useful.
6. **The linchpin of the national policy for rural employment generation is creation of growth triangles linking union councils through Village Support Centres to clusters of UCs and further on to industrial estates with backward and forward linkages.** The policy proposes establishment of *Aik Hunar Aik Nagar* (one craft one village) Authority which is under the *Ministry of Production*, to promote a traditional craft in each city and/or district. UNDP and other donors have been investing in this and one craft villages are already present in several districts of Pakistan including in Swat. The GE4DE has already implemented one such project in Charsadda on weaving. This could be an important entry point for advocacy with the provincial governments to support such villages and **the project can also consider adopting it in the ongoing projects with HBWs; depending on if such villages could be found where skills in specialized crafts are present.**
 - If resources allow the MINTEX can be provided the opportunity to visit Bangladesh and do a focused study of the Bangladesh model of women's contribution to textiles. This

may not directly relate to the project but can be considered by ILO from a programmatic approach.

Objective 3. Media and Awareness

7. **The project would benefit from strengthening the training component of journalists by reducing the number of journalists and instead introduce a refresher for measurable outcomes. It should reinforce the component on Human Rights in the media training.** Local resource persons can be identified to carry out this session for example government officials or NGO are engaged with similar projects of other donors and have the institutional knowledge and also the training in human rights.
8. **The project media component can benefit by revisiting the strategy with the partners of all the three components in order to create synergies.**
 - The strategy should be made more holistic to bring the change in knowledge and attitudes of communities particularly men who dominate the household decision making and also are perpetrators of domestic violence against women. The strategy should also answer the key question on how decent work for men and women can be promoted. It should have clear bench marks, indicators and target audience reflecting demand articulation and collective action around women's employment and decent work at the grassroots level. Following are the key recommendations to revise the communication strategy:
 - Electronic media should be used for key messages for a larger audience including those men and women who cannot read and write but have a role in women's economic empowerment. Pakistan television and Radio Pakistan are two such channels that are cost effective and have a very wide outreach: FM radio can also be used.
 - Community street theaters, puppet shows, radio spots, talk shows, signature campaigns, photo exhibitions at district level would constitute an effective way to inspire and implement social change with content based on the local needs and culture. The girls' trainees of the 'Online Earning' project should be involved in developing media and advocacy campaigns as media strategy. The colleges can serve as platforms for disseminating key messages in the communities and amongst various stakeholders including public representatives, media and government.
 - The face book and twitter accounts of the project need to be made more vibrant by taking on an activist approach towards gender equality. Key messages comprising an inclusive approach towards the 'right to work' and the 'right to decent work' should be relayed through FB and twitter more forcefully.
 - Inter Media the implementing NGO is not obliged to follow the UNDSS security alerts or guidelines. Therefore Balochistan journalists; who have been excluded due to security should be included by identifying a few districts from Balochistan including Quetta.
 - For learning and linkages the project needs to enquire on some of the projects implemented by other development partners including UN agencies (Annex 8)
 - In discussion with partners during review of the communication strategy the Hollywood Documentary "Miss Representation" should be discussed for replacement by a local version which is palatable with images of Muslim/ Pakistani women. This is necessary for changing perceptions and creating ownership of the issue of negative portrayal of women in media.
 - The gender harassment policy framework should be integrated through the media component in all training and relevant materials and code of conduct disseminated, this would also require monitoring.

Planning and Monitoring

- 9. An extensive midterm review with all the partners should be done to agree on what should be done during the remaining period of the project and also develop the missing interrelationship between the three components.**
 - A Project Implementation Plan till the end of project is strongly recommended and the project should engage its implementing partners in developing sustainability plans culminating in the sustainability plan of the project at the GE4DE.
 - The project should undertake an assessment of poverty levels (not just income poverty) using Human Development or Multiple Deprivation Index in project areas. Without this the project is unable to demonstrate the context in which it is operational.
 - The project should avoid one off ideas and focus more on in depth and holistic work on some of its successful projects. There are stories of success yes, but what next is vague in terms of impact and can be possible through better integration; because the buy in of the stakeholders will in itself be the impact.
- 10. The project M&E requires strengthening with respect to more systematic and uniform analysis and data that can help to analyze for the purpose of reporting as well as corrective action.**
 - The project would benefit during implementation and in assessment of impact as well as bridging the gap of lack of cohesion amongst the three objectives/components through the formulation of a monitoring plan that (i) other than the project results identify the indicators, the persons, organizations responsible for collecting information and a tentative time frame. (ii) identifying the ILO and project staff and the NGO and govt staff in monitoring activities. (iii) The plan should be supported by a budget and (iv) project should consider joint programming in this plan by stakeholders particularly those responsible for sustainability.
 - The planning indicators in the PMP & results framework should be redefined and made more concrete for tracing progress and assessment of efficiency at the time of final evaluation and also include qualitative indicators. Similarly planned MOVs should be strengthened. The use of these two documents Results Matrix and PMP which are quite extensive could be challenging and the project can consider bringing them together at least in terms of establishing common indicators and MOVs.
 - Developing monitoring tool(s) would help capture interesting and hidden aspects of this very diverse project, either specific tools or a major tool can be developed having sections on gender quality, decent work, indirect effect on children, vulnerable population etc.
 - The project document assumption is that ‘district governments adopt M&E mechanism to monitor the progress of the outcomes at the district level’ this should be taken up by the skills development implementing partners.
 - Project reporting requires specific attention with a conscious stress on self-reflection and critical analysis. This can be improved by way of progress review meetings which are open to analysis and the same should be documented in the progress reports. Furthermore project reporting should capture women’s lived realities and quality issues as distinct from quantitative targets. Sex (and other variables) disaggregated data should be reported, allowing the assessment of differential results on lives of women and men. Subsequently the activities can be adjusted on how the projects are affecting the different population groups. This kind of analysis allows building of broad based knowledge (role of women in economy) and knows how on which future interventions can take shape.

- According to the project team discussions held with women community members and monitoring reports of RYK (a district reporting high incidence of early marriages of girls and the infamous camel jockeys recruitment) brought to the fore that they were mostly opposed to early marriages, and invest income in their children's education. This needs to be further substantiated through a study under the project post MTE which can provide new evidence to the development partners.
- **The project should assign one of the SPOs the role of a provincial coordinator and also induct an M&E specialist or M&E officer.**
- The project should document indirect beneficiaries; one set of such beneficiaries are the 200 women trained by the direct beneficiary trainees in Karachi coastal communities. This is a remarkable achievement.

Annex 1.

MTE - Terms of Reference

1. Introduction

Promoting Gender Equality for Decent Employment (GE4DE) is a five year project, funded by the Canadian International Development Agency. Implementation began in July 2010 and is expected to be complete by April 2015. The project is now therefore, half way through its cycle. An independent mid-term evaluation is required at this stage to assess progress towards objectives, the effectiveness, relevance, efficiency and sustainability of its strategies and recommendations for the rest of the project. The mid-term evaluation will comply with UN evaluation norms and standards following all ethical safeguards. There will also be a final evaluation at the end of the project.

2. Background

The project team is located in Islamabad, with the National Project Coordinator as the head. Technical backstopping is provided by the ILO Office as well as technical specialists, primarily the Gender Specialist, on the Decent Work Team in the sub-regional office, New Delhi. A national steering committee, comprising of representatives of employers, workers, provincial department of labour and non-government organisations, and led previously by the Secretary, Ministry of Labour, and now after devolution, the Secretary, Ministry of Human Resources Development, provides overall advice and guidance.

GE4DE aims to contribute to two strategic outcomes:

- Pakistani women have greater access to equal employment opportunities and decent working conditions in selected economic sectors; and
- Stakeholders have increased understanding of and favorable attitudes towards working women's issues.

The project aims to contribute to these outcomes through work across three objectives:

1. Strengthening national mechanisms to promote equal employment opportunities for women.
2. Enhancing skills and employability of poor women in rural and urban areas of selected districts
3. Strengthening capacity of media to raise awareness on issues related to working women.

The project, GE4DE, has initiatives all across Pakistan. There are four provinces and several special territories in Pakistan, including the Islamabad Capital Territory, The Federally Administered Tribal Areas and the Northern Areas. The Northern Areas was recently renamed Gilgit-Baltistan (GB) and through the GB Empowerment and Self-Governance Order 2009 given semi-provincial status. Therefore, for the purposes of the project, GB is referred to as the fifth province.

Work under objective 1 is focused on the capitals of all five provinces, Quetta, Balochistan; Peshawar, KPK; Lahore, Punjab; Karachi, Sindh and Gilgit, Gilgit-Baltistan. Skills development work under objective

2, is in seven districts in all five provinces, Hub, Balochistan; Charsadda, KPK; Lahore and Rahimyar Khan, Punjab; Thatta and Karachi, Sindh. Training of media under objective 3 has been in all the above mentioned districts along with additional work in Sukkur and Rawalpindi, and will be extended to a further 25 districts around the country.

The project contributes to the ILO Office's Decent Work Country Programme, which prioritises 8 areas of work with ILO constituents. GE4DE contributes in particular to the Country Programme Outcome 1, *Access to employment, including for vulnerable groups improved*, but also contributes, through its work with constituents, to CPO 3, *Employers have strong, representative, independent organisations*; CPO 4, *Workers have strong, representative, independent organisations*; and CPO 7, *Strengthened capacity of member states to ratify and apply international labour standards and to fulfil their reporting requirements*.

3. Overview of progress on implementation

The project is currently mid-way through implementation. Work under all the objectives is based, as far as possible on research to establish baselines and collect evidence, and interventions designed accordingly.

Under the first objective, GE4DE is working with government, employers and workers to strengthen their understanding and application of gender mainstreaming in their work. Gender Units with staff have been established in all provincial Departments of Labour. Through research and advocacy, selected employers have been introduced to the business benefits of promoting gender equality with some firms showing positive change. Women workers, in particular, have received training to help them promote gender equality in their organisations through focused action plans, with some showing good progress.

Under the second objective more than 4000 women and men have been trained or are under training. Those that have completed training have shown good results in terms of finding decent employment as a result of and commensurate to the training received. Several particularly inspiring success stories have emerged highlighting the social and economic empowerment that individuals have felt.

Under the third objective, 800 working and aspiring journalists have been trained or are under training on gender responsive reporting in what is said to be the largest theme based training of its kind. More than 100 senior media managers have expressed their commitment to promoting gender responsive reporting on women and work through a national media declaration. Some changes in the way reporting is done and the issues that are chosen have been documented.

Work across the objectives is also integrated as far as possible in different ways such as through sectoral strategies, for instance research on gender equality in the garment manufacturing sector followed by advocacy with garment manufacturers on why and how to promote women's employment, training for the sector and employment of women in unconventional positions and linking media to good stories from the industry.

Details of the project background and activities under each objective are provided in the Project Document, annex 1. Progress from July 2010 to December 2012 is shown in the Technical Progress Report in annex 2.

4. Required Qualifications

The evaluation will be undertaken by an independent consultant, who should have the following qualifications and experience

- University degree in social/economic development
- Demonstrable experience and understanding of gender equality and women's empowerment
- Experience of leading (for the team leader) and participating in (for the team member) evaluations for the UN or other international development agency
- Experience of designing and conducting project evaluations
- Experience of conducting/facilitating focus group discussions as part of evaluations
- Familiarity with the ILO's mandate
- Work experience in Pakistan
- Fluency in English and Urdu

5. Purpose of the evaluation

The mid-term evaluation will:

- review the ongoing progress and performance of the project (extent to which immediate objectives have been achieved and outputs delivered)
- examine the likelihood of the project achieving its objectives
- examine the delivery of the project inputs/activities
- understand the nature and magnitude of constraints affecting project implementation
- analyse the factors contributing to the project's success

The mid-term evaluation should serve as a learning tool for the project management team and provide all stakeholders an assessment of the work done so far. It should identify existing or emerging good practices and give recommendations if required, to revise work plans, strategies, objectives, partnership arrangements and resources. The evaluation should also take into account how well the project is aligned or has contributed to the ILO Office's Decent Work Country Programme (2012-15).

6. Scope

The mid-term evaluation will focus on the GE4DE project, its achievements and its contribution to the overall national efforts to achieve the women's economic empowerment and gender mainstreaming, including in the context of the Delivering as One UN initiative in Pakistan. The evaluation should cover all the activities that have been implemented since the start of the project, taking the whole project strategy into consideration. Given the strategic aim of contributing to gender equality in the world of work and creating conducive environment for working women, the evaluation should take into account external factors and developments in the national process, such as legislative changes that have occurred that might have facilitated or hindered GE4DE in achieving the strategic outcomes.

The consultant would be expected to undertake some field travel to meet implementing partners and rights holders. Suggested districts in Punjab would include Lahore, where work with government, media and past and current skills development initiatives can be assessed; Rahimyar Khan, where work on rural

skills development initiatives can be reviewed and in KPK, Peshawar or Karachi, Sindh, where work with government can be reviewed. Telephonic interviews/skype calls with implementing partners in other districts such as Skardu (GB), Thatta and Karachi (Sindh), will be arranged by the ILO.

7. Aspects to be addressed

The evaluation will be conducted following UN evaluation standards and norms, and the ILO Guidelines for the Preparation of Independent Evaluations of ILO Programs and Projects and ILO Guidelines for the Integration of Gender Issues into the Design, Monitoring and Evaluation of ILO Programs and Projects.

In line with international good practices for evaluations, the ILO expects that the evaluation will assess the key concerns of effectiveness, efficiency, relevance, impact and sustainability. A further description of what each criterion is expected to cover is attached at annex 3. Suggested questions for each criterion are attached at annex 4. In the inception report, the evaluator can suggest additional aspects to be examined/questions and add them to the evaluation instrument subject to agreement with the ILO.

The evaluation should examine project design, implementation, lessons learned, replicability and recommendations for future programmes design and any specific recommendations.

Furthermore, the evaluation is required to analyse findings from the point of cross-cutting concerns including gender equality, human rights, capacity development, knowledge sharing and results based management.

8. Methodology

The evaluation team will be asked to use standard evaluation instruments that the ILO has developed and the project is using to document achievements.

The evaluation should apply the following main methodological elements

- Desk review to establish the specific evaluation instrument. An indicative description of documents that could be reviewed is attached as annex 5
- Visits to project sites for consultations with project staff, project partners, rights holders and other key stakeholders
- Data collection through workshops/discussions, surveys and interviews
- Quantitative and qualitative presentation of data using sex disaggregated data, gender analysis and tools such as case studies.

All data must be sex disaggregated and all analysis must be gender mainstreamed.

9. Expected Outputs of the Evaluation

a) Inception Report and Evaluation Instrument

Based on a desk review of project documents including the project proposal and progress reports, the evaluator will develop an Inception Report of up to 5 pages with details of the evaluation methodology, proposed field plan showing visits to implementing partners, timelines for the whole assignment and the evaluation instrument, which could include surveys and FGDs.

b) Meeting with key stakeholders/National Steering Committee

The inception report and initial findings/hypotheses will be presented to key stakeholders, principally the ILO constituents – government, workers and employers – to secure their inputs and feedback.

c) Draft Evaluation Report

After the evaluation mission is complete, the evaluation team will prepare a draft evaluation report describing the findings with all annexes, according to the given format in annex 6. The draft report will be reviewed by the ILO and other stakeholders who participated in the evaluation and comments provided to the evaluation team.

d) Presentation of Draft Report

The draft report will be presented to stakeholders including focal persons identified from different project initiatives (eg implementing partners, Gender Focal Persons in Departments of Labour) to serve as a review and guidance for them and to take into account their feedback.

e) Final Evaluation Report

After receiving feedback from the ILO on the draft report, the evaluator will submit the final report according to the given format.

f) Debriefing

The evaluator will be required to give a debriefing on the findings to the ILO and CIDA.

10. Timelines

The evaluation is expected to start in January 2013 and the total duration of the evaluation process including submission of the final report is expected to cover two months. The consultant will be engaged for 30 person days, of which about 10 days are for field visits.

Indicative timelines for activities are as follows:

Activity	Time
Contract signed	First week of January, 2013
Inception Report	To be submitted within 7 days of the start of the assignment (mid-January)
Meeting with key stakeholders/National Steering Committee	Late January
Draft Evaluation Report	Mid February
Presentation of Draft Report	Mid February
Final Evaluation Report	End February

Debriefing	End February
------------	--------------

The inception report is to be submitted within seven days of the start of the assignment, and the timelines for the subsequent activities will form part of the inception report. The ILO will provide feedback to the inception report and the subsequent reports within five days of submission.

11. Management Arrangements

The National Project Coordinator GE4DE will be responsible for managing the evaluation in Pakistan, supported by the ILO Office Pakistan Evaluation Focal Person. The Evaluation Manager will supervise the evaluation to ensure it is undertaken in a manner consistent with ILO policy guidelines and will provide technical inputs as required.

12. Roles and Responsibilities

The evaluator/ consultant will be responsible for the design and conduct of the evaluation. The ILO will provide logistical support in arranging meetings, accommodation and travel and other administrative assistance such as details of implementing partners and access to project documents and ILO guidelines. In the first instance, the evaluator can discuss any technical and methodological matters directly with the National Project Coordinator.

13. Budget

The consultants will be paid a daily fee for 30 work days. In addition, the ILO will cover all costs related to local and international travel for the assignment on an actual basis, according to ILO standard rules and regulations. The ILO will pay a daily subsistence allowance in line with ILO standard regulations for up to 10 days field travel out of Islamabad. The ILO will also arrange the debriefing session.

14. Expression of Interest

From a long list of about 10 possible consultants, a shortlist of 3-5 candidates will be drawn up between the Evaluation Manager and CO- Islamabad and these candidates will be contacted to ascertain their interest and availability. A suitable consultant will then be identified and subject to no objections from the REO and EVAL, a contract would then be issued by CO-Islamabad.

15. Additional Information

All drafts and final outputs, including supporting documents, analytical reports and raw data should be provided both in paper copy and in electronic version compatible for Microsoft WORD for Windows. Ownership of the data from the evaluation rests with the ILO. Use of the data for publication and other presentation can only be made with the agreement of ILO. Key stakeholders can make appropriate use of the evaluation report in line with the original purpose and with appropriate acknowledgement.

Annex 2

Check list DOLs

Mid Term Evaluation GE4ED

1. Gender FP Male or Female
2. 2 Gender experts Male or Female
3. Activity Plan
4. Mainstreaming Gender in
 - Programme
 - Projects
 - Budgets
5. Impact Assessment
6. Gender disaggregated data in:
 - Design
 - Planning
 - Implementation
 - M&E
7. Networking with other gender focused partners
8. Knowledge and Media Management
9. Collect and disseminate Info on gender issues and best practices through
 - News Letters
 - Press Conferences
 - Brochures
10. Decent and Gender Friendly Work Environment in DOL
11. Gender Mainstreaming capacity building training to
 - planners and
 - labour inspectors
12. Coordination with ILO
13. Gender Mainstreaming Plan and LFA
14. Work on legislation and Policy – Policy on HBWs

Annex 3.

Gender Equality Checklist at workplace (for Women Workers)

Mid Term Evaluation GE4DE

1. Work life Balance
2. Equality in Career Development (Training, promotions, appraisals)
3. Health
4. Safety and Security
5. Equal Pay for Equal Work
6. Equal Opportunities and Treatment in Employment
7. Representation and Voice
8. Child Care
9. Transportation
10. Job Security
11. Family
12. Recreation
13. Constraints (eg lack of education)
14. Equality in participation in decision making
15. Freedom of Association
16. Collective Bargaining
17. Women with Disabilities

Annex 4.

Field Visits

Location	Activity
Lahore (PRGTTI, COTHM, Salt and Pepper)	Meetings with Director PRGTTI and COTHM, FGD with trainees at PRGTTI Meeting with 2 trainees at COTHM, Interviews with documentary makers of “Women of Courage”
Lahore (DOL and Geo TV office)	Interview with DOL Gender Focal Point and Labour Inspectors. Interview with resource person screening of “Miss Representation”
Lahore (WDD, Manawan and a nearby Village)	Meeting with the Secretary Women Development Department FGD with Community Change Makers FGD with community members Meeting with ECI coordinator Meeting with one Media Trainee
Karachi (DOL, PC & Sheraton)	Interview with DOL Gender Focal Person Interview with Former Secretary Department of Labour Meeting with PDI Meeting with a woman member of PWF
Karachi (Korangi and EFP)	Visited Training institute and met trainees of BISP Presentations by heads of training Institutions Presentation by EFP and FGD with EFP
Karachi (Coastal Areas) TRCC project	FGD with trainees
Rahim Yar Khan (Dera Jatta)	Visit and interactive session with trainees and managers of the training center
Rahim Yar Khan	Visit and Presentation by PIHR
Rahim Yar Khan	Visit Training Institutes - 2 FGDs with girl students on e-earning training.

Annex 5.

List of Key Persons Consulted

ILO & CIDA

Graeme Buckley	Evaluation Manager	ILO - HQ
Margaret Reade Rounds	Programme Analyst & Evaluation Focal Point	ILO - Pakistan
Jason Tulk	First Secretary Development	CIDA
Fareeha Umer	Gender Equality Advisor	CIDA
Frida Khan	National Project Coordinator	ILO - GE4DE
Saad Gillani	Senior Programme Officer	ILO - Pakistan
Shajila Sohail Khan	Gender Advisor	ILO - GE4DE
Munawar Sultana	Senior Programme Officer	ILO - GE4DE
RabiaRazaq	Project Manager	ILO - EET
Hassan Rizvi	Senior Programme Assistant	ILO - GE4DE
Mohammad Anwar	Project Assistant	ILO - GE4DE
Ghulam Ahmed	Finance Assistant	ILO - GE4DE
Shama Maqbool	Programme Officer	ILO - EVG
Saadya Hamdani	Former Regional Gender Advisor ILO RO - Phone Call	

ILO Constituents

Dr.Sabahat Akram	Project Coordinator	Ministry of Textiles
Kanwar Usman	Joint Secretary	Ministry of Textiles
Irum Bokhari	Secretary	Women Development Department – Punjab
Zahida Parveen	Chairperson Women’s Wing	Pakistan Workers Federation
Fouzia Aslam	Member	Pakistan Workers Federation
Mrs. Tasneem Anwar	General Secretary	Cooperative Insurance Staff Union
Syed Saud Alam	Acting General Secretary	Employers Federation of Pakistan
Zaki Ahmed Khan	Vice President	Employers Federation of Pakistan
KM Nauman	President	Employers Federation of Pakistan
Ejaz Ul Haq Siddiqi	Finance Secretary	Pakistan Workers Federation
Tahir Manzoor	Gender Focal Person & Deputy Director Labour	DOL Punjab
Wajiha Ali	Research Officer	DOL Gender Unit - Punjab
Mahjabeen Khan	Labour Inspector	DOL Gender Unit - Punjab
Arif Elahi	Former Secretary	Department of Labour - Sind
Ghulfam Memon	Gender Focal Person & Additional Secretary Labour	DOL Gender Unit -Sind
Akhter Muhammad	Gender Focal Person & Director Labour	DOL – Gender Unit – Balochistan
Irfan Ullah Khan	Gender Focal Person & Director Labour	DOL- Gender Unit, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa - Phone

Media

Nighat Dad	Master Trainer	
Ghazanfar Iqbal Tarar	Deputy Manger Productions	Sach International
Mohd Ilyas	Bureau Chief	Express News
Abdul Rauf	Group Director	Geo TV
Irfan Ul Haq	District Correspondent	DAWN News

Implementing Partners

Shaiyane Malik	Chief Executive Officer	Samnazar
Farida Jamot	Project Coordinator	TCCR
Mrs.TanveerTabasum	Principal	VTC for Women Korangi Karachi
Mrs. Nahid Nasir	Principal	VTC for Buffer Zone
Naheeda Naseer	Principal	S-TEVTA
Abu ul Fazl	Project Manager	PIHR
Kamran Sandhu	Project Director	PRGTTI
Shehnaz Kapadia	Advisor	Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund
Tasneem Raza	PO	ECI
Baber Shiekh	Director Coordination	COHTM
Sheher Bano	Editor Supplements	The NEWS
Irfan Abdullah	Director	Specialized Business Services
Dr. WaseemJaved	Managing Director	Al Barkat Group of Colleges RYK
Sikander Brohi	Executive Director	PDI
Saima Hassan	Project Coordinator	PDI
Reema Maak	Social Organizer	PDI
Ume Laila	Director	Home Net
Zaigham Khan	Executive Director	Civic Action Resources
Adnan Rehmat	Executive Director	Inter Media
Nasir Baloch	Project Manager	SOHB

Consultants

Sabeena Ahmed	Chief Executive Officer	Value Resources
Rukshana Rashid	Independent Consultant	

Trainees

Abida Malik	Chef	COHTM training
Sonai Bokhari	Trainee	COHTM training
Salma	Manager Zardozi project	ILO Skills Plus training
Several trainees on media training		

Annex 6

Workshop Programme

Mid Term Evaluation

February 7, 2012

Introduction of Participants		09:30 – 09:35	
Over view of Project	Presentation	09:35 - 09:45	Frida Khan
Introduction to MTE and key findings from Lahore visit	Presentation	09:45 – 10:15	Salma Jafar
Workshop Objectives and Methodology	Presentation	10:15 – 10:25	Salma
Tea Break		10:25 – 10:40	
Good Practices	Plenary Discussion Objective 1, 2 and 3.	10:40 – 11:40	Moderator Salma, Frida and Shanzila
Lessons Learned	Plenary Discussion Objective 1, 2 and 3	11:40 – 12:30	
Lunch Break		12:30 – 01:15	
Integration of Human Rights	Plenary discussion (PWDs, Human Rights)	01:15 – 02:15	Moderator Salma
Vote of Thanks		02:30	Greame Buckley

Annex 7

CIDA Projects relevant to GE4DE

The project 'Pathways and Purse strings' is being implemented by Mennonite Economic Development Associates (MEDA) that aims to increase income of 10,000 homebound women. This project is implemented in Rahim Yar Khan and Lahore till 2012 which are common districts to GE4DE.

Similarly 'Community Infrastructure Improvement' aims to support economic and social empowerment of women 3750 (Care Canada and Care intl Pk) through rehabilitation of rural infrastructure which is being implemented in Thatta a common district till 2015.

'Financial Literacy and Development Services' is being implemented by Kashf Foundation targeting 900,000 women in Pakistan till 2016. The linkages with GE4DE are missing despite geographical overlaps.

Annex 8

Media Work undertaken by other agencies

An innovative initiative of UNDP has trained 400 media professionals, helping them develop ways to present women in Pakistan in a new light in programmes aired by the Pakistan Television Corporation and ensure that all the corporation's productions are sensitive to the issue of gender and avoid reinforcing biases against women. The project has established a system to monitor how women are portrayed on television. It commissions TV productions including Tele Theater on gender issues, has helped integrated gender issues into television training curricula. The initiative also helped in organizing regional and international film festivals dealing with gender themes. In 2011 Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA) initiated a media development programme, which aims at mainstreaming gender in the Pakistani media industry as well as working towards creating a more balanced report on gender issues in Pakistan. In 2007 'Through the Gender lens' – a year long project – brought together a diversified group of Pakistani students within the age demographics of 15-25, with an equal representation from all provinces. Students were taught the correct terminology to use when discussing GBV. These student members were then divided into respective print, radio and television mediums, after which the trained youth further held interactive peer training programmes in Punjab, Sind, AJK, Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in what they referred to as the 'Domino Effect' – hence, kick-starting the concept of gender, discrimination and violence to vast groups of young individuals who were previously not aware of the cause-effect of GBV. This was a courageous initiative by Uks in collaboration with UNFPA (United Nations Population Fund) that focuses on empowering the Pakistani youth to design new media content on gender-based violence to counter the negative impact of existing media content.