



Evaluation Summaries

Gender Equality in the World of Work

Quick Facts

Countries: *Ukraine*

Final Evaluation: *June 2011*

Mode of Evaluation: *independent*

Technical Area: *Gender Equality*

Evaluation Management: *DWT/CO Budapest*

Evaluation Team: *Ms. Lotta Nycander (Team Leader); Ms. Inna Bayda*

Project Start: *August 2008*

Project End: *August 2011*

Project Code: *UKR/08/02/EEC*

Donor: *European Commission (1,214,897 Euro)*

Keywords: *gender equality; gender and employment; gender-sensitive labour market policies*

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The project took off in the wake of adoption and implementation of gender equality goals in Ukraine. It aimed at developing, implementing and monitoring gender-sensitive employment policies and locally adapted tools to promote gender equality and women's empowerment in the world of work. The project had the following four specific objectives:

1. To enable governmental authorities and social partners (employers, trade unions) to promote, implement and monitor relevant international commitments, national legislation, policies and programmes for ensuring of gender equality and women's empowerment in the world of work;
2. To improve the capacity of labour market institutions and social partners in developing and implementing gender-sensitive labour market policies, programmes and services;
3. To build the capacity of the Labour Inspection Service (LIS) and trade unions to effectively monitor gender equality provisions in the workplace and redress rights violations;
4. To contribute to women's economic empowerment, in particular through support of women's entrepreneurship.

The project utilized numerous approaches to achieve its aims, combining ILO methodologies with new methods developed specifically for the Ukrainian context. It aimed at addressing women's vulnerability in suffering from multiple forms of discrimination and gender inequality due to insufficient national experience with gender equality law implementation and gender-sensitive policy development.

The project activities were designed to help Ukrainian actors accumulate hands-on experience with gender-sensitive policy development and implementation.

The main strategies of the Project to address the core issues included (but were not limited to) undertaking studies, determining suitable stakeholders and implementing organisations and raising awareness among stakeholders about the subject matter of gender equality in the work place.

The Project developed and translated/adapted training materials (guides/manuals), organised Training of Trainers and training of representatives of target groups in various courses/workshops. Dialogue was maintained with the government, constituents, social partners, EU projects, external collaborators and media.

The EU fielded a monitoring mission to the project in October 2009 (overall there were two EU monitoring missions). This was followed by a revision of the Project's action plan to adapt it to the perceived needs of the project stakeholders. The Project's tripartite Steering Committee endorsed the revised plan in December 2009. The changes made relate to the number and duration of the training sessions, number of beneficiaries to be targeted. Training sessions targeting employers were also added.

The overall management of the project was under the responsibility of the ILO Decent Work Team and Country Office for Central and Eastern Europe, in Budapest, Hungary. At the country level, the project was implemented by the project team based in Kiev.

The main outputs of the project included:

- 159 training sessions and workshops for 7 target groups;
- one study-visit;
- 4,000 persons (trade unionists, employers, labour inspectors, PES staff and women's entrepreneurs) who benefited directly all over Ukraine; and
- 57 publications (including 22 training tools, 26 resource materials and 9 working documents).

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The stated purpose of the evaluation was to:

- Assess implemented activities and their effectiveness with regard to indicators of achievements and the overall objectives and objectives of the project;
- Identify problems encountered during implementation and means undertaken by project staff to overcome these problems;
- Document lessons learned and good practices; and
- Develop recommendations for similar interventions in the future.

The scope was to evaluate the whole period and the entire implementation of the project. The clients of this evaluation were: the ILO tripartite constituents, including direct beneficiaries of the project action; Development partner/donor agency (European Commission); business training institution and women-entrepreneurs trained under

SIYB programme within the project; other national counterparts and EU-funded 'sister' projects; ILO DWT/CO-Budapest and Headquarters and ILO project staff.

Methodology of evaluation

The methodology included the following elements:

Desk review

The assignment included a comprehensive documentation review. The key documents were the Project's steering documents, such as the Project Document, the Addendum and Logical Framework Matrix, Work Plans/Budgets and Progress reports. Technical reports, NGO reports, training manuals, guidelines, written presentations, e-mail correspondence and relevant websites.

Interviews using the evaluation instrument

The evaluation team gathered information through consultations, briefing sessions and in-depth interviews with officials in Geneva, Budapest and Kiev, including interviews through the electronic media.

Round Tables and Steering Committee Meetings

The evaluation team attended a Round Table (23/06/11), a Project Closing conference and a Steering Committee Meeting (both held on 29/06/11), organised by the Project. In the two first events the team was able to pose questions related to the respective subject matter, while in the latter meeting the team presented its preliminary findings to the steering committee. The presentation was followed by a discussion and the comments gathered by the evaluation team were accounted for in the Inception report.

Inception report

The evaluation team submitted an Inception report to the ILO evaluation manager in Budapest and received comments on it.

Research limitations

The original plan to visit ex-trainees of the women entrepreneurship development component could unfortunately not be followed due to time limitations of the evaluation team. In the end, the team only had one in-depth interview with one of the former trainees, which although proved to be very valuable, still is a limitation. The evaluation team tried to make up for this through discussions with trainers and other stakeholders in workshops and meetings in Kiev.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The overall conclusion is that the Project performed very well despite the external challenges it faced resulting from the changes in the Ukrainian Government and its Ministerial set up after the election in 2010. The Project's capacity building activities, involving all the key stakeholders and all administrative levels with all-Ukrainian coverage for most of training events, were impressive.

Its contributions in the area of policy dialogue were also recognised by this evaluation. The project was able to acquire public recognition to the fact that gender inequality in Ukraine is a systemic problem and that actions by the government, ILO's constituents and partners in the world of work were necessary.

With the help of media campaigns, public awareness has been raised on the need for change to achieve increased gender equality in the work place.

The project drew the attention of the Parliament to the issues of non-compliance with ILO Conventions 100 and 111 (equal payment, harassment at workplace etc.). The social partners now seem to speak a common language on gender-related issues as a result of the project intervention. Highly qualified and professional trainers, and their interactive approaches to training delivery, have played an important role in achieving the capacity building goals of the project.

The evaluation assessed that the Project's Objectives 3 and 4 were attained. Objectives 1 and 2 were partially attained, due to factors beyond the control of the project. The assessment is therefore that the project has been effective and efficient, despite the fact that it was not able to "reach all the way" in terms of meeting all its stated objectives, mainly due to external factors beyond its control.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

1. The ILO, and the donor agencies, should ensure that Projects, before launching and start-up have a proper structure and Project Documents include Logical Framework matrices before the launch and start-up of activities. The matrices should include clear narratives and logic in their chain of objectives, outcomes, outputs (or results),

indicators (at immediate objectives and output levels) and means of verification.

2. The ILO should be more attentive when stating that it will assist in setting up monitoring systems in the participating organisation, as the work is usually time-consuming, often complicated thus sufficient time must be devoted to making it work and be owned by the stakeholder organisations in question.
3. The ILO should ensure that the size of the project team is proportionate to the ambitions and the work to be performed.
4. As the ILO and its Partners cannot predict the outcome of political or administrative changes resulting from national elections - "assumptions" are an important element of the Logical Framework set-up and must be narrated in Project Documents along with risk analysis.
5. The ILO (and the EU) should closely follow-up the developments within the Government in Ukraine. It should continue on the path to support gender equality, specifically gender equality in the world of work, once the administrative reform has been completed.

Important lessons learned

1. New country-based projects need time to prepare for implementation, normally 4-6 months before they can be fully operational. Sufficient duration should be given to projects of this kind in order to enable them to develop monitoring systems and ensure that they are firmly established at the level of constituents/social partners.
2. The funding of the "Women's and Children Rights" Programme (14 million Euros) is essential. It is critical that EU identifies and consolidates achievements and issues to follow-up from the programme as a whole to avoid losing momentum.
3. Communication and information dissemination and visibility actions represent the core activities in gender-related projects. Similar interventions in the future should include a project post for a communication specialist.