



Evaluation Summaries

National programme for the prevention and elimination of child labour in Jamaica and SIMPOC study

Quick Facts

Countries: *Jamaica*

Final Evaluation: *June 2004*

Mode of Evaluation: *independent or internal*

Technical Area: *Child Labour*

Evaluation Management: *IPEC DED*

Evaluation Team: *Moses Peart*

Project Start: *Oct 2001*

Project End: *June 2004*

Project Code: *JAM/01/50/USA*

Donor: *United States*

Keywords: *Child Labor, Statistical Survey*

Extracted from the full report executive summary

Background to the Project

The International Labour Organization (ILO), through its International Program on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) and in cooperation with the Government of Jamaica, implemented a National Program on the prevention and elimination of child labour in Jamaica, which began in October 2001. The program was initiated when the Government of Jamaica and the International Labour Organization/International Program for the Elimination of Child Labour (ILO/IPEC) signed a related Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) in September 2000.

Funding for this project was provided when the United States Department of Labour (USDOL) approved the initial sum of US\$562,687.00 for implementation of the program over a two year

period. In addition to the USDOL funding, Norway and UNICEF provided US\$39,188 and US\$32,407 respectively, as contributions specifically to support the National Survey on Child Labour, under the Statistical Information Monitoring of Program on Child Labour (SIMPOC). The Ministry of Labour and Social Security (MLSS) Jamaica provided in-kind counterpart contribution of approximately US\$66,600.

The National Program in Jamaica
Jamaica's national program has the following objectives:

Development Objective: to contribute to the progressive elimination of the worst forms of child labour in Jamaica.

Immediate Objectives :

The creation of a comprehensive information system that incorporates quantitative and qualitative information on child labour to be used for policy and programme development.

The strengthening of relevant institutions of the Government of Jamaica and civil society to enforce child labour laws and to develop and implement policies/programs toward the prevention of child labour

The withdrawal and rehabilitation of 600 children from hazardous work and preventing 300 others from engaging in child labour.

Enhanced awareness of the complex problems associated with child labour that will affect social attitudes towards children and their educational rights.

The National Program that gave effect to the Memorandum of Understanding included the following activities:

Rapid Assessment and Baseline Studies;

- A national survey on Child Labour in Jamaica;
- A National Steering Committee to provide guidance and policy coordination;
- Ratification of ILO Conventions 138 and 182;
- Institutional capacity building in participating organizations.
- Awareness raising in the public about child labour issues.
- Action Programs on withdrawal and prevention of child labour.

Major Findings of the Evaluation

1. The Project Design:

The design of the ILO/IPEC Project (JAM/01/50P/USA) was assessed to be solid in terms of definition of the problems and context in which they would be addressed, clarity of purpose, specification of objectives and related performance outputs, profiles and roles of the managers/coordinators, partners, recipients, beneficiaries, and implementing agencies. It also established a clear institutional framework in which it should operate, with clear and measurable performance indicators. Overall, the project design was adequately responsive to the identified problems.

There were, however, a few basic weaknesses in the project design:

- Some missing/unwritten but critical assumptions that had implications for the implementation of the project (e.g., about the availability of some inputs & tools; and about the delivery of certain outputs critical to other outputs/events).
- The lack of any built-in transition mechanism or provision to indicate how the implementation would move through its distinctive stages. For example, it was unclear what would/should happen after certain interventions, and there was no provision for withdrawal retention. There was therefore no clear procedural model of how the project interventions were or should be executed.

2. Project Implementation:

All major commitments of financial and technical resources and other contributions in kind from the international and national donors were secured and delivered for the project implementation. These included:

- The United States Department of Labor (under its ILO/IPEC arrangement) contributed the sum of US\$562,687.00
- UNICEF provided approximately US\$31,000.00 to support the data collection and knowledge base improvement aspect of the program.
- The Government of Norway contributed approximately US\$35,000.00
- The Government of Jamaica contributing approximately US\$66,000.00.
- Overall management of the project by the ILO/IPEC office in the MLSS.
- Overall guidance and coordination by the National Steering Committee.

3. Rapid Assessment and Baseline Studies:

A rapid assessment of children involved in prostitution in Jamaica (by Dr. L. Dunn); and three baseline studies on child labour, (by Dr. E. Wint & Ms. F. Madden; and by Doegazon-Johnson Associates; and by Mr. R. Cooke, Worker management Services and Children First) were conducted and their findings used to inform the ILO/IPEC project design and public awareness program.

4. Ratification of ILO Conventions:

The Government of Jamaica ratified ILO Conventions 138 and 182 in September 2003. This was formally communicated to the ILO in October 2003. The Child Care and Protection Bill, to provide the legislative framework for enforcement of the tenets of Conventions 138 & 182, received Parliamentary approval in March 2004. The Occupational Safety and Health Bill, complementary to the Child Care & Protection Act and designed to give effect to the monitoring and inspection functions of MLSS inspectors, is at an advanced stage in the Parliamentary review process.

5. Capacity Building:

Under Capacity Building, the major developments included:

- Initial orientation on implementation, monitoring, and reporting conducted with partners.
- Training seminars for regional labour officers/inspectors conducted by technical experts from ILO/IPEC regional & Geneva offices, with follow-up training for local inspectors.
- Orientation/training and follow-up meetings held with representatives of NGO's workers and employers organizations; and these have served as a pressure group to influence Government's action regarding child labour related legislations.
- Training in project accounting and reporting was conducted for members of the NGO's implementing the action program by a specialist from ILO-IPEC Regional Office.
- The NSC has initiated strategic planning with the MLSS towards a National Action Plan.

6. Awareness Raising:

- A significant quantity of child labour related materials have been produced for use in awareness activities and general public education; and an awareness raising theme song was produced in October 2003.
- A mobile display featuring essential information & promotional highlights of child labour concerns and initiatives was produced for public expositions, seminars, and meetings.
- A dynamic media sensitization drive has developed from a few feature promotional efforts, and as a follow-up, several interested media houses have done voluntary (no-cost) features on the ILO/IPEC program on their news-magazines, talks shows and public affairs programs.

- The local ILO/IPEC Office has established several linkages with international, regional, and local media houses that have done features on Jamaica's efforts and project interventions against child labour. For example: i) The BBC (3 times); ii) Trinidad & Tobago Radio Station; iii) First Edition, (Jamaica); iv) Beyond the Headlines (Radio Jamaica); National Wide (Power 106 – Jamaica); and the CPTC - (Jamaica).
- Several newspaper features on the ILO/IPEC project have been done by the major print media in Jamaica; and the Gleaner Newspaper in particular has also included a feature on the ILO/IPEC Project in Jamaica on one of its public "Round-Table" discussions.
- Some partners (e.g., employers and workers organizations) who have benefited from orientation to child labour issues have used the mechanism of newsletter and internal meetings/seminars to extend the awareness program in their organizations.
- The Ministry of Labour and Social Security has played a significant role in facilitating public awareness and promotional activities for the ILO/IPEC project. Extra inputs and support have been given to child labour expositions, at events such as the annual Denbigh Agricultural and Cultural shows.
- The direct involvement in children affairs in Jamaica by the ILO/IPEC Program Manager, who has been serving as Chairman of Child Month, has played a strategic and important role in enhancing the overall child labour awareness program.

7. The Action Programs:

- 503 (84%) of the targeted 600 children¹ have been withdrawn from child labour.
- 852 (284%) of a targeted 300 children were prevented from engaging in child labour.

- 117 (46%) of the targeted 255 parents benefited from a variety of training/orientation interventions - (including preparation for income generation opportunities).
- Community meetings were held in all Action Programs; but ranged from few to several.
- A wide range of community organizations (including churches, service clubs, community health-care givers, and business operators) participated in child labour activities, but to varying degrees across the three action programs.
- Overall, media coverage of child labour activities has been significant and encouraging.

8. Management and Coordination:

- Management of the program seemed fairly well organized and effectively coordinated by the very active national program manager. However, one obvious indicator of inadequacy in this area was the shortage of staff for required coverage of the various activities, particularly with regards to the necessary process monitoring and internal (in-process) evaluation of the program.
- The Ministry of Labour & Social Security provided adequate financial, physical, and material resources to support the program, but the need for more support staff in the program was perhaps seriously underestimated. As a result, there were some gaps in management coverage, and some opportunities missed in terms of the useful practical experiences that the program could have provided for MLSS staff.
- A significant level of support for the program was provided by resource persons from ILO International and Regional offices, in respect of technical inputs for orientation and training of members of the implementing agencies in program management and reporting

functions – particularly to do with financial report.

Guidance from the National Steering Committee for the program and coordination of policy development was inadequate due to the absence of a practical mechanism for such direct inputs into the management of the program. However, because of their strategic locations and positions of influence in the relevant government ministries and non-government organizations, these leaders indirectly contributed to keeping the project on track through their advocacy for the legislative provisions; and through their reviews/assessments of reports and updates from the action programs.

- Management of the Action Programs by implementing agencies varied significantly on levels of efficiency and effectiveness. While all the implementing agencies seemed to have management capabilities for executing projects such as this, there were some inefficiencies in aspects of the program management, as manifested by:
 - i) serious underestimation of the scope of some activities;
 - ii) poor scheduling of some activities and their deliverables;
 - iii) inadequate allocation of resources for some activities;
 - iv) little attention to internal monitoring and evaluation.
- There were some interactions between the main partners, primarily through the orientation/training workshops and meetings of the national committee; but very little interaction was achieved between the NSC partners and the implementing agencies. Very few NSC members actually visited the action program sites.

Recommendations

For ILO/IPEC:

R1: Given that the results of the pilot project are already very impressive; and given that valuable lessons can be learned from the experiences of this project (both positive and negative), it is recommended that the necessary resources should be provided to facilitate the conducting of case studies of at least the actions programs, to provide documented success stories for the project.

For the MLSS/Govt. of Jamaica:

R2: Given that the required strategic planning process for developing the National Action Plan on Child Labour has already been initiated by the National Steering Committee, it is recommended that Minister of Labour and Social Security rename the NSC as: The National Task Force on Child Labour; and commission this body to manage the necessary inputs to produce the National Action Plan – which should also include a work plan for executing the “Time-Bound” initiative.

R3. As an extension of R2, it is further recommended that the Ministry of Labour and Social Security should produce an information booklet on the Government’s comprehensive program to address child labour related issues. This product should be used as an integral source document in the continuing awareness program; and could also form part of an information kit from the MLSS.

R4: Given that the MLSS has taken ownership of the Child Labour program, it is recommended that a comprehensive orientation program be now packaged and conducted with MLSS staff at all levels, to begin to fully integrate child labour issues and concerns into the Ministry’s mission and functions.

For the NSC & Partners:

R5: As an extension to R4, the partners should develop a strategy for incorporating inputs and involvement of all partners, interest groups and

related agencies into the overall national strategies and programs against child labour.

¹ **NOTE FROM IPEC:** The figures presented in this executive summary and in the rest of the report are based on action programme reports revised by the evaluation consultant. After the evaluation was conducted and based on more thorough monitoring, the implementing agencies corrected some of these figures. According to the latest available information, the number of children withdrawn and prevented is 590 and 893 (98% and 231% of the targets), respectively, while the number of parents that benefited from the project is 263.

Final Evaluation of the IPEC National Program in Jamaica, June 2004 v