



# Evaluation Summary



International  
Labour  
Office

Evaluation Unit

## Protecting and promoting the rights of China's vulnerable Migrants – Final Joint Evaluation

### Quick Facts

**Country:** *China*

**Final Evaluation:** *1/2012*

**Type :** *Independent*

**Technical Field :** *MIGRANT*

**Evaluation Management :** *Fondes de MDG*

**Consultant :** *Hongwei Meng*

**Project Code :** *CPR/09/50/UND*

**Donateur :** *Fondes de MDG – US\$ 6,600,000*

**ILO:** *1,696,823*

**UNFPA:** *494,929*

**UNICEF:** *1,080,629*

**UNESCO:** *1,089,667*

**UNIFEM:** *331,358*

**UNDP:** *1,482,960*

**WHO:** *423,634*

### Summary from the main report

#### The **Executive summary**

This report provides a final evaluation of the MDG-F Joint Programme on Protecting and Promoting the Rights of China's Vulnerable Young Migrants (YEM), which started on 11 February 2009 and was completed in mid-February 2012.

The report sets out the findings and recommendations of the final evaluation following the MDG-F secretariat recommended structure for Evaluation Reports. Following a consultation process and feedback from the UN and national

programme managers and coordinators, the report addresses the specific issues raised in the Terms of Reference for the evaluation, both those of the YEM programme within the context of the China, and those raised within the context of the MDG-Fund thematic windows.

The YEM final evaluation ran from July 2011 to February 2012, starting with an initial briefing meeting in the YEM Programme Management Office in Beijing on 2 August, de-briefing with the UN coordinator on 27 August and meetings with programme staff between 7 and 27 September 2011. According to the proposed itinerary and agenda of field visits for the final evaluation of YEM, the consultant visited Tianjin, Xi'an and Cangzhou from 13 to 28 October 2011.

This evaluation was summative in nature. It seeks to measure the extent to which the joint programme has fully implemented its activities, delivered outputs and attained outcomes, particularly with regard to the impact and sustainability of the various interventions. It is also intended to identify the best practices and lessons learned from the YEM programme that could be useful to other development interventions at the national (scale up) and international level (replicability).

#### **Major findings:**

##### **Relevance & Design:**

1. The overall objective and the expected outcomes of the YEM project precisely covers the theoretical and practical issues that the Chinese

government is facing with regard to developing a harmonious society and the government's immediate objectives regarding the improved protection of migrant workers and the achievement of China's MDGs on poverty, education, gender equality, maternal health and HIV/AIDS. YEM was firmly rooted in the development priorities indicated in the 2006-2010 UNDAF, and the MDGs.

The overall design of the Programme focused on support for the Chinese Government in managing the positive and negative effects of internal labour migration, through the joint effort of nine UN agencies using their diverse and cross-sectoral expertise and experience, rather than through any single UN agency. It offered a useful opportunity to help the Chinese Government strengthen cooperation between Ministries and Departments.

The evaluation noted that the target groups were in line with the aims of the programme, focusing on young migrants in major sending and receiving areas in China and were consistent with the general pattern of distribution of the migrant population reported by the National Population and Family Planning Commission in 2011.

#### **Process & Efficiency:**

The outputs of the YEM programme demonstrated a high level of efficiency in implementing and managing the programme, particularly for such a complex design, the short period of implementation and with so many agencies and organizations involved.

#### **Results & Effectiveness:**

Looking at YEM's achievements against the three outcomes and ten outputs listed in the YEM Programme Document, the programme is likely to fulfil the objectives of all activities proposed. Of course, for such an ambitious and complex programme, there is room for further improvement.

With the great commitment and active participation of the implementing partners, the past three years have witnessed an impressive array of activities delivered under this very complex joint programme, including policy

dialogues, research, materials development, piloting training, service, and advocacy campaigns, promotions and information sharing, etc. Around 400,000 individuals, including young migrant workers, rural youth, migrant children, civil servants, community workers and service providers have directly benefitted from the YEM Joint Programme

The YEM programme has had a significant impact at the local level, giving the YEM programme a wide geographic impact and an opportunity to maintain YEM's current operations in most of the pilot sites. Feedback from the local authorities has confirmed their interest and further support after the end of the programme. This is seen as a positive development and fully in line with the expectations of the YEM programme.

#### **Ownership & Sustainability:**

Focusing on the social inclusion of migrant workers, the piloted initiatives of YEM such as a study on migration trends, institutional services, protection mechanisms, and existing initiatives and the registration of migrant children have led to policy recommendations which were reflected in the 12<sup>th</sup> national five-year plan and related sector plans concerning population and social development, as well as relevant national policy on the implementation of a residence certificate system.

YEM activities that offered opportunities for university volunteers to mentor migrant children provided enriching experiences for both parties, as well as a feasible and replicable model for the "Young Volunteers Caring for Migrant Children Action" launched in 2010, and currently being implemented in more than 2700 pilot counties across the country.

YEM flexible courses showed good prospects of sustainability. Relevant UN and national partners will continue to carry out training of trainers and deliver flexible courses to rural youth. Outstanding cases and good practices will be collected and documented to develop a "trainers' manual" guiding the trainers and delivery of training. The flexible courses will be further improved and updated as well.

## **Recommendations:**

**Recommendation 1:** The design of the joint project should include the details of how to join outputs together including the testing areas, the distribution of funds and the evaluation of results.

**Recommendation 2:** Enhanced dialogue between UN agencies and senior Chinese leaders could improve the impact and sustainability of the project through the further application of the policies tested through YEM.

**Recommendation 3:** Future programmes such as YEM should consider the selection of joint pilot sites to make cooperation among the related departments relatively easier and to increase the impact of the interventions. UN organizations should discuss cooperation mechanisms with government counterparts to ensure proper coordination.

**Recommendation 4:** Proper funding for a joint project office should be ensured to upgrade project office management and monitoring capabilities.

**Recommendation 5:** The design process of UN projects should be long enough and the project proposal should be detailed enough to cover all the output activities. Such a process would not only benefit project implementation, but also the evaluation of the comprehensive effect (impact) of outputs and activities. If possible, a comprehensive, overall review of the project design led by the project office could mitigate the shortcomings of the earlier design.

**Recommendation 6:** For large-scale cross-sector comprehensive projects like YEM, a longer implementation period would allow establishment of solid coordination mechanisms and increase the impact of the project. The first year could be dedicated to coordination and preparation of the project launch, the second year to start pilots, the third year to review and modify the project results for comprehensive coordination and re-piloting, and the fourth year to summarize project results. Contracts of the project experts and administrators should continue long enough after the official end of the project to enable them to complete reporting and closure requirements.

**Recommendation 7:** Building the capacity of appropriate domestic organizations to manage information and carry out monitoring and evaluation could improve governance ability in the long term, by improving cooperation mechanisms among government departments and contributing to evidence-based decision-making.

**Recommendation 8:** To ensure the sustainability of results, the project design should consider the feasibility of national ownership – and funding – of successful pilot experiences after the programme is finished.

**Recommendation 9:** The programme design should include project management training for the personnel in implementing organizations, for example, accounting procedures, regulation of shared responsibilities and funds, how to write reports etc, while hosting joint activities. In addition, for future projects, a Chinese version of project management guidelines should be August 8, 2012 provided at an early stage to the domestic partners, especially local partners, who participate in implementing activities.

**Recommendation 10:** Based on the participatory training concept and practice brought out by YEM, the UN organizations may wish to pay further attention to building up a professional team to promote participatory training in China, as a new concept for project management and design.

**Recommendation 11:** The establishment of a joint project technical team to provide the necessary training and support and utilizing available domestic and international experts, would have contributed greatly to the sustainability of the project. The development of such an expert team would become an important domestic human resource over time.

**Recommendation 12** The impact of YEM has been noticeable and widespread as a model of a comprehensive response to young migrants' issues in China. An international high level forum describing the successful outcomes of the YEM Programme in China could be initiated with the help of UN agencies under the overall framework of UNDAF 2011-15 as one avenue to make YEM approaches more effective, efficient and sustainable.