Evaluation Summary

Combating Abusive Child Labour II (CACL II) – Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries:	*Pakistan*
Final Evaluation:	*12//2013*
Evaluation Mode:	*Independent*
Administrative Office:	*CO-Islamabad*
Technical Office:	*IPEC*
Evaluation Manager:	*ILO-IPEC/DED*
Evaluation Consultant:	*Mei Zegers*
Project Code:	*PAK/08/03/EEC*
Donor & Budget:	*Europe Aid (US$ 4,750,000)*
Keywords:	*Child labour*

Background & Context

Pakistan has been working in collaboration with a variety of donor-supported actions to address child labour (CL) concerns in the country for about 20 years. The enormity of the challenges, however, means that much work remains to be done to fully eliminate the worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in the country. Many lessons have been learned over the years, which were linked together to design the 'Combating Abusive Child Labour II' (CACL II) project. The overall project development objective of the CACL II project is: "To contribute to the elimination of child labour, with special focus on the elimination of the abusive/worst forms of child labour in Pakistan." The project has an increased focus on developing a sustainable enabling environment at provincial and district level. Downstream actions on withdrawing and preventing children from CL were concretely planned and integrated to serve as replicable district models within the provinces.

The CACL II project has been funded by the European Commission and was implemented by the International Labour Organization (ILO) in Pakistan together with a range of national stakeholders. The project implementation period was from April 2008 and it will end on 31 December 2013. The project was evaluated over a period spanning from September until December 2013.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

In accordance with this approach, the project has three Immediate Objectives (IO):

1. A sustainable and holistic district model developed to reduce and gradually eliminate abusive CL across sectors.
2. The institutional and technical capacity of target district governments, four provincial Child Labour Units and one Federal Child Labour Unit strengthened to effectively combat CL.
3. The knowledge base on CL and its worst forms expanded and awareness increased to promote CL-friendly policies.

Implementation activities were planned with a focus on three main areas: direct assistance to child workers and poor families who involve their children in WFCL, capacity building for government labour administration, employers, workers and civil society, building a knowledge base on CL in the country. Under IO 1 children were to be withdrawn or prevented from CL in formal and informal sectors including auto-workshops, domestic labour, rag-

picking, street children, and agriculture. The CACL II project targeted other forms of hazardous CL as indicated on a list of 29 hazardous occupations that had been identified in 2002 through tripartite consultations. Under the original project document 6,500 children were to be withdrawn (5,500) and 1,000 or prevented from WFCL. These numbers were later increased as the project sought to attain additional results. After a project revision the CACL II project aimed at withdrawing 7,500 and preventing 1,500 children from WFCL.

The project focuses on the provinces of Punjab, Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and Balochistan. The districts of Sahiwal in Punjab and Sukkur in Sindh were selected — with input from the key stakeholders — to serve as district models for potential replication.

The primary purposes of the expanded final evaluation are to:

1. Establish the relevance of the project implementation strategy.
2. Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives at outcome and impact level.
3. Identify the supporting factors and constraints that have led to any achievements or lack of achievements.
4. Determine the implementation effectiveness and efficiency.
5. Identify the supporting factors and constraints that have led to any achievement(s) and/or lack of achievement(s).
6. Identify unintended positive and negative changes at outcome and impact levels.
7. Assess the sustainability.
8. Identify lessons learned and potential good practices.
9. Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to support the completion, expansion or further development of initiatives.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The overall project design, as reflected in the project Logical Framework and narrative, was highly relevant and appropriate to the context. The design was valid and assisted the achievement of the project goals as set out in the Project Document and its Logical Framework.

The project took the economic, cultural and political situation into account at the time of the design. Problems and needs were adequately analysed taking lessons learned from previous CL projects into account. Most of all, government officials, authorities and educators stressed the importance of *the key strategy of focusing on creating synergistic networks to attain project objectives.* Government, employers' and workers' representatives who were familiar with previous CL projects in the country saw the design as a logical progression from past projects to the current design that focuses more on the enabling environment. During the previous projects, efforts were concentrated on addressing sectoral CL issues whereas the current project design moved to an area-based approach in line with transferring responsibility to the Government. The project established institutions in the form of Provincial Child Labour Units and district committees to focus on CL and education. Two districts were selected to serve as models for the integrated area-based approach (IABA).

The project design fits well with existing government initiatives on CL and was in support of the priorities under the Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP). The subsequently developed Decent Work Country Programme 2010-20156 continues to reflect CL as a priority area, with the project as the key element supporting the DWCP.

The project Logical Framework included risks and assumptions several of which, ultimately, did prove to be problematic. Adjustments in the practical implementation of the project needed to be made due to security challenges and changes in devolution processes (See Section 5.1 of the report for details). The original assumption was that the Government would continue to devolve to district level but this situation changed. Instead governance responsibility devolved even more strongly away from federal to provincial level than was expected with less devolution to district level than envisaged. This situation had a profound impact on project methodologies. The project was, however, able to revise the pertinent project components to meet this changing situation.

Risks identified in the Logical Framework related to security and natural disasters proved to be true. Security challenges and natural disasters (floods) resulted in the need to make further implementation changes. These included the implementation of a district model in Punjab instead of in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa as originally planned.

Selection of Implementing Partners for the actions on direct withdrawal and prevention of CL and to support households with economic empowerment was conducted in a participative and transparent manner. Government entities at provincial and district level, employers' and workers' organizations as well as two national NGOs implemented the Action Programmes (APs). The evaluator thus notes that AP implementation included a good representation of actors from the ILO constituents and from civil society.

Children were selected in line with the ILO/IPEC criteria of children in the WFCL or at risk of WFCL. Mothers included in the project economic empowerment component were the mothers of beneficiary children.

The project functioned well to achieve its overall objective of contributing to the elimination of CL with special focus on the elimination of the abusive/worst forms of CL in Pakistan. Evidence from the individual and focus group discussions, sub-studies, other documents, as well as observations, all support the conclusion that the project generally attained the overall as well as IOs. The project mobilized the tripartite constituents of government, workers and employers. Individual APs, research and policy projects, and awareness raising were effective to different degrees but all contributed to overall positive results. The only area where the result fell slightly short of the target was in the area of access to micro credit or grants with 91 per cent of the target achieved.

For IO1, a sustainable and holistic district model was developed to reduce and gradually eliminate abusive CL across sectors in were developed in one model district in Punjab and Sindh each. Government-funded replication is already being launched. The two model districts achieved their targets and can truly be called "model districts". Downstream actions on withdrawing and preventing children from CL were concretely planned and integrated into education systems to serve as replicable district models within the provinces. Networking and establishment of synergistic actions have been among the project's most important successes.

A total 10,500 children were withdrawn (8,354) or prevented (2,146) from CL with support from the project (See Result number 10 and 11 in the report). This figure substantially exceeds even the higher target set by the project after the project revision. The project attained the goal of withdrawing or preventing approximately equal numbers of boys (5,098) and girls (5,402) from CL. Children below the age of 14 were withdrawn or prevented from CL through enrolment in Non-Formal Education with the majority subsequently mainstreaming into formal education. Most of the children in the age category 15-17 received six month literacy training and 81 per cent also received vocational/skills training. Some of the older children (146) benefitted from working under improved conditions and were thus withdrawn from WFCL. Health services had been provided which was reported to benefit the children and their families.

Results in terms of mainstreaming of children out of CL and into education were generally positive. Stakeholders considered that project inputs and services provided were sufficient overall to keep beneficiary children regularly attending school and out of CL. The mainstreaming of children after NFE (transitional education) into formal education appeared to be successful with most children obtaining long-term results. Despite these overall positive results, however, there is still room for improvement as some children appeared to still be working. The sub-study team on economic empowerment, the enabling environment sub-study consultant, and the team of international team leader with the national consultant all found some instances of continued CL. The sub-study team on economic empowerment included a sample of 422 mothers of which 13 per cent still had children in CL. Due to evaluation time limitations it was not possible to ascertain if any of these children were working under improved conditions. Although these findings may appear disappointing, the evaluator still noted good results compared to CL projects in other countries.

Literacy and vocational/skills training were successful but longer training was needed for some while the range of options and market linkages could have been improved. Economic empowerment was useful in reducing household dependence on CL but there was still considerable need for additional training for mothers: micro finance and grants and market linkages for products and services. The project literacy and vocational or skills training for older children ages 14-17 included types of training such as sewing, embroidery, beauty/barbering, motorbike or mobile phone repair, and electric motor winding. The project had tried to match the types of training provided to local labour market needs through informal assessments in communities and at Union

Council level. No formal study was conducted, however. While children did have a choice of trades, children interviewed stated that the range of possibilities they could choose from was limited. This was mostly because of availability of trainers in the localities but, in addition, there is a need to further develop innovative ideas for the types of training.

The Economic Empowerment sub-study did find that 57 per cent of mothers in Sukkur and Sahiwal reported that children aged 15-17 who obtained literacy/vocational training and/or toolkits were able to find employment or start their own work. A full post-project impact study may be useful to learn more lessons about the different elements implemented in the literacy/vocational/skills training. In some locations and for some types of work, children reported earning a decent income that is at least equivalent to the money they could earn in CL.

The project engaged in very interesting work on OSH in an effort to improve working conditions for older children. Workplaces where conditions are adequate, including acceptable working hours, can serve as good choices for training and youth employment. Under the OSH component, the project worked with the Centre for the Improvement of Working Conditions and Environment (CIWCE) and the Employers' Federation of Pakistan (EFP) to establish safe work auto and agricultural model workshops. Materials and awareness raising on OSH were disseminated. The work of CIWCE is clearly well organized and implemented by competent individuals with good support from EFP. As discussed in the main body of the report, some aspects could be studied further to ensure full compliance.

To help address poverty, mothers of child beneficiaries were provided with Business Management Skills Training (BMST), Livestock Management Skills Training (LMST), or Sewing and Stitching Training (SST) along with micro credit or grants. Some families were linked to the Zakat and Bait-Ul-Mal grant schemes for scholarships. The evaluation economic empowerment study found that, while the mothers' economic empowerment results are not perfect, they do indicate that the training and the micro finance had a positive impact on over half of all households. This positive impact was found to contribute to enabling mothers to keep their children out of CL. In Sahiwal, approximately 79 per cent of the mothers started their own work and 3 per cent worked for someone else subsequent to their training:

18 per cent of them did not work after training. In Sukkur, around 36 per cent of the mothers started their own work, while 18 per cent were employed elsewhere: 47 per cent did not work after the completion of their training. Training had a 33 per cent positive increase on income levels in Sahiwal, equal to Rs. 1,725. In Sukkur, this impact was an 11 per cent increase, translating to Rs. 975.

For IO2, evaluation stakeholders who had participated in institutional and capacity strengthening indicated that a great deal had been accomplished. Institutional and personal capacities were strengthened through training and direct technical support from the project and implementing partners. Government at provincial and district level, teachers, employers' and workers' organization representatives all indicated that they were in a better position to address CL issues as a result of the project. Other evidence for the relative success of IO2 exists. This includes the quality of these stakeholders' actions and their planned replication.

The project provided significant capacity and institutional strengthening through training, technical support by project staff and networking among different project partners. Child Labour Monitoring Systems (CLMS) were made operational in 135 Union Councils (UC) of the model districts of Sukkur and Sahiwal. Much work remains to be done to fully institutionalize them. Less formal community-based CLMSs had been established early during the project implementation to identify, track and report on project beneficiaries. Teachers, districts officials, and other stakeholders have indicated that they will continue to implement this beneficiary specific system. The project successfully networked with other entities such as the World Wildlife Fund (WWF) with which they coordinated to implement the CLMS in Sukkur District.

Project IO3 results were ultimately strong on awareness raising within institutions, which reinforced the results of IO1 and IO2. Stakeholders interviewed for the evaluation wholeheartedly emphasized awareness raising as one of the project's major successes. The project engaged in some standard as well as some very interesting and innovative activities on awareness raising. These included a photography contest and the development of videos on CL issues by media students in seven universities. Evaluation interviewees could clearly describe CL and the difference with child work as

well as the detrimental effects of CL on well-being and national development. The Enabling Environment Sub-study consultant did find some confusion among some interviewees but this was limited.

Under IO3, the knowledge base on CL and its worst forms was expanded even if an originally envisaged national CL survey could not be carried out. The project baseline could have been more useful if it had been completed at an earlier project stage. The primary reasons were lengthy discussions on methodologies and the eventual devolution of federal labour implementation responsibilities to the provinces.

The content of the studies intended to inform the project (and expand the knowledge base) were relevant but not as effective as they could have been. The baselines were delayed although the project was able to collect useful information in the field through networking with stakeholders to ensure actions were adequately informed. The district CLMS database and Rapid Assessments that were added to the project after the revision were implemented late in the project.

In terms of gender, the project included almost equal attention to boys and girls, with good impact on both. Ultimately, however, the direct actions with boys are likely to have more long-term potential than those with girls. This is primarily because boys can publicly market their products and services while girls may be working primarily from home. Teacher training was successful in raising awareness of gender issues as clearly noted in evaluation interviews with teachers in different settings. Stakeholders still indicate that much more effort is needed to educate girls since, as a head teacher pointed out, "an educated girl will raise a whole family and it will have a positive effect on all of them".

Project coordination and management was well implemented overall. The project staff were able to address most of the challenges resulting from the interplay between security issues, national disasters, and staffing. The project worked efficiently to maximizes — and even exceed — planned results using the available budget of about 4.8 million Euro. The efficiency is furthermore confirmed in the funding allocated by the Punjab Government to replicate the actions in four new districts as the amounts are not dissimilar to those spent in the model districts. The generally effective and comprehensive project monitoring system was comprised of the

project monitoring plan (PMP), work plans, data collection and processing, analysis and reporting. Recording of children in the DBMR was carefully carried out and they were only recorded as withdrawn/prevented if they had been mainstreamed for at least three months. Some improvements with respect to data entry of parents who access credit or grants were needed. Where mothers and fathers both accessed these and their names were different, it resulted in some unintended double counting.

Recommendations

Project Design and Data Management

1. A continued technical presence of ILO/IPEC is needed in Pakistan to provide technical support for replication of the district models developed under the project. That is, Government, employers' and workers' organizations still request that at least one ILO technically-experienced CL expert be available to the country to continue to provide technical support to the established institutions (Government, ILO, donors,).

2. The DBMR system should attribute a single code per household even if there is more than one child who is enrolled in the project. Each child can still have his/her own code within the household. When data is collected in communities, field officers need to verify the exact household to which each person accessing credit or other services is linked and list the person using the household code (ILO and all implementing entities).

Federal Action, Provincial and District Institutions and Replication

3. Review establishment possibilities for a federal level unit on CL in Pakistan to coordinate data-gathering, ensure that indicators are comparable, organize inter-provincial exchanges and mutual exchange of learning of experiences with other countries. This should be a tripartite body to monitor and guide CL activities (Government).

4. Review potential of conducting a National Child Labour Survey in Pakistan and conduct survey. Such a survey would help to provide national data for sharing with others countries, to adequately inform planning in each province, and to provide a

comparable baseline for comparison with future progress (Government, ILO).

5. Replicate district IABAs as much as possible in other areas of Pakistan. Advocacy to finance replication and sustainability of existing model districts needs to continue with special focus on advocacy by stakeholders (Government).

6. Source continuing human and financial resources to implement important actions such as data collection, data entry and analysis on the CLMS in Pakistan. While labour officers have been assigned to address CL, there will be a continuing need for additional staffing for full effectiveness (Government).

Awareness Raising and Capacity Strengthening

7. Widely replicate project actions using various competitions such as photography and video. Where feasible, work with universities to develop future journalists' knowledge on CL: conducting research and preparing videos is useful to create awareness. CL projects could replicate similar competitions with students on specific CL issues such as on the use of Occupational Safety and Health efforts and model workshops (ILO, Government, donors, employers, organizations, workers' organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organizations).

8. Replicate sub-study on Economic Empowerment in other settings and countries to increase knowledge and understanding of the best methods to provide skills training and micro finance/grants to reduce dependence of households on CL (ILO, donors).

Education and Economic Empowerment

9. Improve labour market and market linkages research to ensure appropriate matching of vocational/skills training and local needs. Conduct brainstorming exercises involving a range of stakeholders to identify more and innovative types of economic activities. (Government, ILO, employers, organizations, workers' organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organizations).

10. In economic empowerment actions, provide a combination of training courses and micro finance or grant provision (Government, ILO, donors,

employers, organizations, workers' organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organizations).

11. Address gender issues in the context of vocational/skills training on sewing/beauty for girls and more technical trades for boys. While engaging girls in the technical trades might be challenging in the Pakistani context, identifying some more gender neutral trades could be useful in future initiatives (Government, ILO, donors, employers, organizations, workers' organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organizations).

Occupational Safety and Health

12. Widely disseminate and replicate the project occupational safety and health approaches. This includes using a system of risk assessment in different sectors, development of appropriate OSH equipment/materials and implementation in model workshops (including in other countries) (Government, ILO, employers, organizations, workers' organizations, NGOs/Civil Society Organizations).

Knowledge Base Development

13. Develop database of child labourers in districts at an early project stage to ensure that projects have appropriate information for all actions to be implemented. Integrate data into an overall referral system linking CL, other areas of child protection, education and health (Government, ILO, NGOs).