



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

To Contribute to Developing National Capacities to Achieve the 2015 National Child Labour Reduction Targets in Cambodia by 2016 – Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries:	<i>Cambodia</i>
Final Evaluation:	<i>Nov 2012</i>
Evaluation Mode:	<i>Independent</i>
Administrative Office:	<i>DWT/CO-Bangkok</i>
Technical Office:	<i>ILO/IPEC</i>
Evaluation Manager:	<i>ILO-IPEC/DED</i>
Evaluation Consultant(s):	<i>Mei Zegers (Team Leader) and Sok Somith</i>
Project Code:	<i>CMB/08/50/USA</i>
Donor(s) & Budget:	<i>USDOL (US\$ 4'310'000)</i>
Keywords:	<i>Child labour; Time bound programme</i>

Executive summary of the report

The Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) and other committed entities have been working towards the elimination of child labour, especially in its worst forms for over a decade. The country set targets to reduce child labour among children aged 5-17 from 16.5% in 1999 to 8% in 2015. The RGC has, further, committed to ending all WFCL by 2016. These two goals are usually referred to as Cambodia's "Twin Goals" to address child labour. Among other projects that the International Labour Organisation (ILO) has implemented (with the support of a number of donors), two, both supported by the United States Department of Labor (USDOL), have specifically supported the RGC towards the eventual achievement of the Twin Goals. An expanded final

evaluation of the second phase of the ILO International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) project was conducted from September to October, 2012.

The project concentrates on several key areas of focus to support Cambodia in eliminating exploitive and worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in the country. Key areas include:

- contributing to the revision and alignment of the Cambodia national frameworks to achieve national and international targets,
- strengthening the knowledge of all stakeholders on child labour,
- strengthening capacities of project partners to address exploitive child labour, and
- developing replicable community-based models to combat exploitive child labour in Cambodia.

The primary purposes of the expanded final evaluation are to:

1. Establish the relevance of the project implementation strategy;
2. Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives at outcome and impact level, implementation effectiveness and efficiency of the Project;
3. Identify unintended changes, both positive and negative, in addition to the expected results;
4. Identify the level of sustainability of the results of the project;
5. Identify lessons learned and potential good practices
6. Provide recommendations to project stakeholders

To ensure a thorough evaluation the evaluator used a combination of methods so that a well-rounded evaluation could be carried out:

- Document review, individual interviews and/or focus group discussions with stakeholders from a wide range of groups including national, provincial, district and local education policy makers and providers, local authorities, project partners, and community based organizations, and communities, parents and children.
- The evaluation has expanded to include a sub-study on the Enabling Environment to Reduce Child Labour with special focus on two of the project implementation provinces, Kampot and Kep. The sub-study has separate Terms of Reference (TOR) and was designed to contribute to the overall expanded final evaluation described in the current report.
- Observation of the stakeholders and their work in different settings as well as their networking actions. This was combined with field visits and individual interviews as well as focus group meetings.
- Stakeholder meetings at provincial and national level where initial findings were presented, discussed, and enriched with additional input from the participants.

The project design was valid overall and supported the achievement of the project goals as set out in the Project Document and is appropriate within the context including cultural and gender issues, economic and political contexts. The needs of stakeholders including specific target groups (sectors, institutions, community-based groups) were considered including poverty and gender issues. The design provides good support to address remaining gaps identified at the end of the first phase of the ILO IPEC project to support the National Plan of Action on the Worst Forms of Child Labour Phase I (NPA-WFCL I). Under the current project, the design moved away from focusing on the individual child to integrating the family, community and other stakeholders across a broad framework at different structural levels. The design recognises the need for a multi-sectoral, cross cutting and multi-level approach to effectively address child labour issues in Cambodia.

The project sectors, target groups, districts and locations were appropriately selected based on various studies from project phase I, information from different stakeholders and experience from project phase I. Some government interviewees also added that other types of child labour need to be addressed, such as sand collection and children in agriculture. The need to address the special problems of children of internal migrants and of girls was also raised by one national and some provincial interviewees.

The project was able to largely achieve its objectives and related outputs. The project has contributed to the revision and alignment of several key national frameworks to achieve child labour targets. The project has also significantly strengthened knowledge and

awareness on child labour although a need for continued intensive awareness raising exists. The capacities of stakeholders have been strengthened, particularly at national and provincial levels. At commune and community levels more work is needed to strengthen capacities to attain the twin goals of reducing child labour by 2015 and eliminating the WFCL by 2016. While sustainable community-based pilot initiatives to combat exploitive child labour/WFCL models were developed, the implementation quality of some elements was challenging. Particularly effective Direct Action models included the development and strengthening of local coordinating mechanisms; capacity building; advocacy and awareness raising in partnership with employers and workers' organizations and other groups. Most of the challenges faced were due to small budget allocations which had an impact on implementation and also limited follow up support to the Implementing Agencies (IAs) and Action Programs (AP). It is possible that the models would have been more effective if budget allocations had been larger to allow for more intensive implementation efforts by local stakeholders and technical support.

The project was very active through advocacy and technical support for the integration of child labour in policy and legal frameworks. Although progress has been made, some elements still require further attention, such as the finalisation of the NPA-WFCL II and adaptation of the labour law. A zero draft of the NPA-WFCL II is ready and includes input provided through technical support from the project. A project supported consultant analysed gaps and issues to be addressed in the labour law. Government commitment to eliminating child labour is relatively good as compared to other countries although budget allocations and adaptation of the labour law still need to be realised. The actual enforcement of existing laws and regulations was not as fully achieved as the project had anticipated. Several reasons exist for the still limited enforcement of existing national laws and regulations. Reasons include the lack of human resources in the labour inspectorate. There is also a need to continue to improve the understanding of labour inspectors, police and other enforcement agents regarding their roles and responsibilities for enforcing hazardous child labour elimination.

A child labour monitoring system (CLMS) that will be used over the long term to identify, monitor and follow up on children was developed and formally adopted in June, 2012. The CLMS is to be implemented from the community level through the village committees all the way to the national level where data collection and analysis will take place. The full implementation of the CLMS is expected to be challenging so it will require a great deal of close support from child labour and other

national and international specialists on child protection related subjects. Challenges include the limited number and coverage of labour inspectors and workplace monitors, budgets to cover costs, identification of children in mobile and hidden sectors, capacities of community and other monitors, accurate reporting systems and data processing at all levels. Effective and detailed referral systems also need to be clarified.

The project has supported or provided input into research on a range of subjects related to child labour. The project used information from the various surveys to provide input into capacity strengthening efforts. Information was distributed in written form but also discussed at meetings and in training workshops to help stakeholders integrate relevant information into their work.

The project strengthened capacities through training workshops, dissemination of research, technical support in Action Programs and meetings, and direct contacts. The capacities of institutions were also strengthened to develop structures and coordination mechanisms to address child labour issues. The capacity strengthening provided with project support was well received. Evaluation interviewees indicated that they found that their capacities to address child labour had been strengthened substantially even if it was not always easy to implement what had been learned. Implementation was hampered in some situations by the need for yet further capacity strengthening, such as on institution building, and to increase understanding of the difference between child labour and child work. Commune Councils were trained on mainstreaming child labour into their local budgets but, due to the small amounts available in local budgets, actual allocation is still limited.

Key Recommendations

Development of Policies and Legal Framework, Systems and Resource Mobilisation

1. Finalise and implement the NPA-WFCL II. (Government, Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, ILO, other child labour project agencies)
2. Adapt and implement/enforce the labour law to address remaining legal gaps on child labour issues. Develop additional Prakas on other exploitive and hazardous child labour such as domestic child labour.
3. Continue to mainstream child labour into policy and strategy documents on issues such as child protection, social protection, education, gender issues, agriculture, service and industrial development, informal economic

development, local economic development, private sector social responsibilities, HIV issues, and decent work as relevant. (Government with input from Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, ILO and other child labour project agencies)

4. Develop detailed descriptions of roles and responsibilities for the referral, monitoring, and follow up systems of the CLMS. Include in descriptions potential linkages of NGOs and civil society groups to government CLMS. Clear integration of the CLMS is needed into government referral systems in the areas of social protection, child protection, education, and health. Provide close technical support for the full implementation of the CLMS through child labour and other specialists. (Government with input from Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)

5. To ensure that the CLMS is correctly implemented, clarity on the difference between child labour and child work will need special attention. Laws, regulations, policies and strategies need to reflect the meaning of these terms in the Cambodian context and in accordance with the ILO International Conventions 138 and 182. Awareness raising but most especially good training about laws and regulations and their application will also be essential to ensure that those involved in the CLMS will interpret and apply the definitions correctly.

6. Explore possibility of establishment of an independent national fund for the elimination of child labour to ensure that adequate funding is attributed to the various components of the NAP-WFLC II. Include or organise a conference to discuss the establishment of such a fund. Conference can include potential donors, government agencies, private enterprises, and others to identify entities that can also take responsibility for funding different components once the NPA-WFCL II is formally adopted. (Government with input from Employers', Workers', Civil Society organisation, ILOs and all other relevant stakeholders)

Capacity Strengthening

7. Continue to strengthen the understanding of labour inspectors, police and other enforcement agents regarding their roles and responsibilities for enforcing hazardous child labour elimination. Ensure that they are aware of relevant laws, regulations, different types of child labour and child work. (Government, child labour project agencies)
8. Stimulate and provide capacity strengthening to community members to conduct advocacy to integrate child labour into Commune Council decision making.

(Government, Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)

9. Focus intensively on capacity strengthening of the Community Based Monitoring Agents (CBMA) and other community leaders on the implementation of the CLMS system. Ensure that they are well aware of their roles and responsibilities. (Government, Civil Society Organisations)

Awareness Raising

10. Ensure that mobile and other populations are aware of the laws and regulations by continuing to scale up awareness raising using mass media and all other means to ensure that the entire Cambodian population is reached. (Government, all other relevant stakeholders)

Education – Vocational/Skills Training- Livelihoods

11. Provide vocational skills training in responding to market demand and create a link to appropriate micro finance institutions. Include emphasis on Occupational Safety and Health measures and work in agribusiness. (Government, vocational and skills training centres, Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)

12. Increase development of appropriate services to support parents through livelihoods and self-help groups. (Government, Civil Society organisations, child labour project agencies)

Additional specific recommendations are included in the main report in section 7.4.