



# Evaluation Summary



International  
Labour  
Office

Evaluation  
Office

## *Support to National Efforts towards a Child Labour-free State, Bahia-Brazil - Midterm Evaluation*

### Quick Facts

**Countries/Regions:** *Brazil*

**Midterm Evaluation:** *04/2011*

**Evaluation Mode:** *Independent*

**Administrative Office:** *DWT/CO-Beirut*

**Technical Office:** *IPEC/DED*

**Evaluation Manager:** *Peter Wichmand*

**Evaluation Consultant(s):** *Mauricio Benito Durá &  
Karina Andrade*

**Project Code:** *BRA/08/50/USA*

**Donor(s) & Budget:** *USDOS (US\$ 4.9 million)*

**Keywords:** *Child Labour*

### Background & Context

#### **Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure**

The Project was implemented by the International Programme for the Eradication of Child Labour (IPEC) of the International Labour Organization (ILO). The project implementation began in September 2008, with a budget of US\$4,900,000 and duration of 48 months. Despite the findings of this report, which focused on project activities in these first 30 months, the impact analysis cannot disregard the work done under the Time-Bound Programme (TBP) completed in 2009, or IPEC's 20-year presence in Brazil.

#### **Methodology of evaluation**

The evaluation took place between 13 March and 19 April, with an evaluation team composed of two persons. During a period of 18 days, the team was in Brasilia, Salvador and two municipalities in the target territory chosen by the project for direct intervention (Ribeira do Pombal e Euclides da Cunha). Some 178 interviews were conducted with the project's technical team, ILO/IPEC's technical staff and other projects also funded by USDOL, other ILO/Brazil officials, government representatives, labour unions, employers' organizations, members of organizations executing the Action Programme (AP), girls, boys, adolescents and parents, recipients of the AP. There were four group interviews, with two girls, boys and adolescents, and two with parents of beneficiaries, totalling 48 people.

The information collected during these interviews was complemented by the data gathered from the discussions and presentations made during the evaluation workshop with key partner institutions which was held in Salvador on 7 April.

#### **Design**

Project design benefited from IPEC's 20-year legacy in Brazil, as well as its national projection, lessons learned from the previous implementation of a TBP support programme, a nationwide experience in implementing projects to combat child labour (CL) within a favourable legal framework, social programmes and installed capacities.

The project aims at delivering 14 outputs under the following five Immediate Objectives (IO):

IO 1. *By the end of the project, a gender-, race- and ethnicity-sensitive knowledge base on CL in Bahia will be expanded.*

IO 2. *By the end of the project, awareness would have been raised and there would be changes in the perception of CL based on a gender-, race- and ethnicity-sensitive communication strategy incorporated into the Bahia Decent Work Agenda.*

IO 3. *By the end of the project, legal, political and institutional frameworks for the prevention and protection of girls, boys and adolescents from CL will be strengthened.*

IO 4. *By the end of the project, the capacity of national, state, municipal public and private institutions, employers', workers' and civil society organizations will have increased to contribute to the achievement of a "child labour-free state".*

IO 5. *By the end of the project, existing gender- and race-sensitive models for withdrawal and prevention will have been adapted and enhanced to facilitate the provision of services by the state social safety network to victims of CL.*

The project development objective is *"To contribute to the prevention and elimination of child labour and its Worst Forms in the State of Bahia, Brazil"*.

There is an observable alignment of the project with national policies regarding the eradication of CL which was essential for achieving project results.

### Main Findings & Conclusions

In general, the project shows important progress both at national and state level as evaluated by project partners. From the national partners' point of view, both the support provided by the project team through qualified technical assistance to national processes, as well as the important role the project performed in the liaison with different actors, was seen as extremely positive. In terms of local impact, it is worth mentioning the project's contribution to the elaboration of the Decent Work Agenda in Bahia (BDWA) where the issue of CL was given priority, as well as the initiative by the project in the implementation of a pilot experience in the semi-arid region.

1. The project is clearly stated and there is consistency among activities, immediate goals and

development objectives. The strategy is well defined, prioritizing the strengthening of national capacities although respecting the existent institutional dynamics and focusing on the socio-economic causes of CL. The performance of the programme, expected to be implemented at four levels (national, state, territories with a collective identity, and municipal) is well articulated. Nonetheless, it is overly ambitious considering the timeframe and available resources. In some instances, the proposed activities and defined objectives greatly override the capacity of the project.

2. The large fluctuations of the United States dollar and the imbalance among its very ambitious goals allocated in the budget have negatively impacted the capacity for action and the quality of its products.

3. The lack of quality information on the nature and manifestations of CL in Bahia is a concern among stakeholders, and they have not received a satisfactory answer. The need to understand the complexity of the issue among family subsistence farming where CL is seen as something positive (outstanding reality among territories with a collective identity of the project) is of high priority.

4. The project has not been able to incorporate gender, race and ethnicity into its implementation; consequently these topics do not appear to be considered in the policies and actions being executed by the stakeholders in the state of Bahia.

5. The project has contributed with methodologies for the process of identification and registration of working boys, girls and adolescents and their families, as well as with the creation of monitoring instruments, resulting in the establishment of the Mercury system.

6. There is a Communications Plan to eradicate CL, which integrates the actions of diverse stakeholders participating in the implementation of Bahia's Decent Work Agenda (ABTD), which should result in the creation of a communications strategy for Bahia.

7. The work with institutions at national level has become a key issue in the articulation with the state government and municipalities when implementing social policies.

8. The technical support to institutions in Bahia has been highly valued. Nonetheless, considering the existing challenges and installed capacity, this technical assistance has proved insufficient.

9. The "Caravan against Child Labour" became the main reference of the project. Since it allowed the presence of such a complex thematic issue in a

territory where the participation of the state is weak and generated effective lines of communication and dialogue, this initiative is highly valued.

10. The strategy to define the target population per Programme for the Eradication of Child Labour (PETI) criteria has proved effective. Once the necessary networks were established, the project was able to gather the anticipated information, and even surpassed the proposed goal, on the number of girls, boys and adolescents who are working or at risk and getting assistance from the various social programmes.

## Recommendations

### Main recommendations and follow-up

1. To consider the need to concentrate more on the intervention in the next phase of the project, to the extent of available resources, ensuring the quality of the expected results. In this sense, its presence in Bahia should be strengthened by providing support and technical assistance to the state and municipal stakeholders. The purpose would be to increase institutional capacities for the implementation of the State Plan for the Eradication of CL and further stabilize the activities in the territory and replicate them in the state of Bahia. In this context, it would contribute to the creation of a CL-free state.

2. Without changing the current outputs and immediate objectives, some project target goals should be revised in order to better match available resources. Along the same lines, some sources of verification should be reviewed so as to ensure that indicators can be easily confirmed.

3. To carry out activities that promote the inclusion of reflexion and concrete actions for the incorporation of gender, race and ethnicity into social policies, taking advantage of the forums provided by the State Secretariat of Education and the possibility to carry out more studies and research.

4. To include the Secretariat for Promotion of Equality and the Secretariat of Policies for Women in the elaboration of a gender, race and ethnicity strategy.

5. To search for efficient use of the project resources by dividing expenditures among other IPEC projects in Brasilia working on similar issues, such as national labour.

6. To reinforce the element of knowledge production. To revise the original proposal on studies in terms of the new existing demand, giving priority to research that will give input to the implementation of Bahia Project direct actions.

7. To render technical assistance to the Secretariat of Communication and the Secretariat of Labour, Employment, Revenue and Sports of Bahia (responsible for the coordination and implementation of the ABTD) for the design and implementation of a Communications Strategy based on IPEC's previous experience and the methodology tools produced.

8. To give continuity to the process of raising awareness among community leaders to reach as many families as possible, using training of trainers and peer education methodologies. In this regard, the work with the State Secretariat of Education within the framework of its Plan on Human Rights should be made a priority. Teachers should be trained to address the issue in class and to identify and effectively refer those cases.

9. Organize with the Ministry of Education and Culture (MEC) the extension of coverage to students enrolled in full-time quality programmes, ensuring that the 18 municipalities comprising the pilot programme in Bahia get assistance from the "*Mais Educa  o*" (More Education) Programme.

10. One of the main challenges the project faces is to accurately define its level of contribution to the elaboration of "exit routes" for the beneficiaries of the "*Bolsa Familia*" Family Allowance Programme. The expertise of the ILO on issues like first job professional training programmes, cooperatives and employment generation, should be linked with the Ministry of Agrarian Development (MDA) and the National Rural Training Service (SENAR) experience in the creation of mechanisms to generate alternative forms of production, income and Decent Work for families, working boys, girls and adolescents.

### Lessons learned

- The recognition of IPEC's historical work in Brazil is a valuable asset when it comes to driving new initiatives and mobilizing stakeholders;
- The promotion of project activities within the national institutional framework may mean, in the short term, a delay in the development of the originally-proposed goals and a further redefinition of actions and strategies. Nevertheless, in the medium and long term, it allows the project a

higher degree of performance and sustainability potential, as opposed to working solely in the state of Bahia;

- The inter-institutional liaison at local level represents a key element for the implementation of successful active research and further recording process of working boys, girls and adolescents.

### **Potential Good Practices**

- The implementation of the “*Caravana*” mission throughout the territory, which was very positively valued by all actors and led the state of Bahia to its replication in target territories, is currently planning a third phase;
- Involvement of all social actors (education, social assistance, health care) in an “active search” effort for the house-to-house identification of girls, boys and adolescents in labour activities or at risk of entering such activities. The “active search” offered families the possibility of including their children in the PETI programme.
- The approval of Law n. 11,479 of July 2009, a government initiative of the state of Bahia, which “imposes restrictions in the granting and maintenance of state funding and tax incentives to employers that do not adopt Decent Work practices”. The law includes in its “Decent Work practices” concept those referring to the “fulfilment of standards to combat child labour”.
- The actions of surveillance of the Labour Prosecutor’s Office in concurrence with the State Government of Bahia to ensure the fulfilment of their obligations concerning the combat against CL, especially regarding budget allocations for CL eradication public policies.