



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Joint programme for the support of the public authority of manpower in Kuwait - Final joint evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: Kuwait

Final Evaluation: July till October 2017

Evaluation Mode: Joint Independent Final Evaluation

Administrative Office: Regional Office for Arab States (ROAS)

Evaluation Manager: Nathalie Bavitch

Evaluation Consultant(s): Stephanie Hodge

Project Code: KUW/87/622/34

Donor(s) & Budget: Total cost: \$ 2,412,627 (IOM: \$ 866,700, ILO: \$ 870,040, UNDP: \$ 642,000)

Keywords: Kuwait, Public Authority of Manpower, UNDP, ILO, IOM, GSSCPD

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

Kuwait aspires to be a regional trade and financial hub according to the 2035 national vision for the State of Kuwait. One major factor impeding Kuwait's economic development is the imbalance within the work force. Understating the scale of the problem, the Kuwaiti government has established the newly founded Public Authority

of Manpower (PAM) as the entity responsible for foreign and private sector labor. Towards achieving this vision, the PAM is recognized for its value of promoting a conducive business environment whereby the private sector could flourish with new opportunities that could contribute directly to economic growth through the diversification of revenue sources as was stipulated in the National Mid-Range Development Plan (2015–2016). The Kuwait Government represented by the General Secretariat of Supreme Council for Planning and Development (GSSCPD), UNDP, ILO and IOM recognized the concerns and objectives of the Kuwaiti government and, as a result, developed a joint program, capitalizing on the experience of the three agencies to support PAM in its efforts to achieve Kuwait's desired goal.

This is the final evaluation of the Joint UN support and intends to document the results as per the original agreement, the lessons learned and the recommendations arising from the cooperation.

Evaluation Background & Methodology

Purpose of the evaluation:

- Determine the extent to which the outcome and outputs of the joint program components have been achieved.
- Assess IOM, ILO and UNDP's contributions to the outcome.

- Document the achievements, best practices and lessons learnt during the course of implementation of the outputs to inform future decisions in design, implementation and management of follow up or similar joint programs.
- Provide recommendations for future programming based on the results from the components outputs while taking into account the aspirations of the Country Office to rationalize its portfolio to have few, large and more coherent programs during the period.
- Examine stakeholder perception of the value-added of the program, and its impact in terms of developing the capacities of national constituents to advance gender equality in the world of work.
- The project document did not have a strong overarching theory of change, or predesigned mechanisms for inter-agency coordination and operational procedures, necessary for a new joint UN modality.
- The log frame was used as a management tool, but adaptive management was instituted by the Project Management Unit (PMU) and Project Board to better suit the implementation context and the donor/beneficiary. Many inputs were creatively changed along the way and were adapted.
- An important design assumption was that PAM had sufficient capacity to build capacity, which was not always true. Other assumptions were that PMU would be empowered to manage/monitor the entire technical implementation for outcome level results. These assumptions were tested and found to be needing further context.

Main Findings

I. Relevance (rating is highly satisfactory):

- The joint UN program support has been highly relevant supporting the Kuwait's National Development Plan directly and in relation to its international commitments.
- While a transition plan was delivered and vetted, this project did not plan for the longer term capacity strengthening needs but rather had been designed as a contribution to a longer term change effort that is assumed to be carried forward by the government partners.

Validity of the design:

- The program support is demand-based, and the document was prepared quickly on request of the Minister of Labor and Social Affairs by the UN agencies to provide PAM with institutional strengthening support. It was timely in line with the government's current interest.
- The document has been designed with five separate (and interlinked) components each led by a different UN agency based on its comparative advantages.

II. Effectiveness (rating is highly effective):

- The project support to PAM has been thorough but moderately effective in terms of amount of inputs and deliverables produced.
- The project delivered an intensive capacity development program and delivered overall training for 274 participants. It entailed a combination of learning through doing and participation in the planned technical research projects and sectoral assessment activities.
- The amount of capacity training delivered to the country was on time. The respective agencies had delivered the training as per their comparative advantages.
- Women were adequately included in the activities either as leads of sections receiving technical support or in trainings.
- The high quality project management was a key factor in the experimental joint UN - PAM program delivery modality success, especially considering the uniqueness of the UN modality and the readiness of PAM to implement and carry forward the expected results at the start of assistance.

- The project implementation was given excellent guidance and oversight with commitment and follow up of the GSSCPD and Secretary General on the implementation of the project and sitting in each and every single board meeting.
- The program implementation begun before the outputs and strategies had been validated by the Project Board, and a Project Manager was on board six months after ILO and IOM begun implementation.
- The project design and implementation approach, which was focusing on PAM's institutional strengthening, could have benefited from a more cross-sectoral perspective both in the original design and in implementation/ oversight.
- PMU and the Project Board adopted an adaptive management to deliver the program outputs, consulting with the counterparts. As a consequence, many favorable results were unplanned. Many strategic communications were delivered and have served to position Kuwait nationally, regionally and internationally.
- While the monitoring plan with expected outputs delivered by agencies was closely adhered to, partners lacked a coordinated strategic approach to result based monitoring. While approaches were good for input delivery, there was need for strategic approach to results monitoring around system wide change and policy.
- The communications (unintended result) and capacity building from program support has been contributing to the positioning of Kuwait and supporting Kuwaiti participation in global and international debate concerning International Labour standards.

III. Efficiency (rating is highly efficient):

- The joint UN modality was a good experimental modality to capture the comparative advantages of the UN agencies. The implementation approach with three UN agencies, each with its own management

arrangements and mixed modalities, has presented many lessons learned. This experience of having a one UN project modality is reflecting the growing UN global push to implement through an UNDAF approach.

- The project delivered all agreed planned deliverables on time and has been cost effective as per implementation and overall expected results. The value for money is considerably high when considering the amount of strategic and targeted deliverables and expertise delivered.

IV. Sustainability (rating is likely):

- The program has excellent potential for longer term development impacts but risks institutional sustainability. The project was over ambitious in scope and in the absence of concrete PAM baseline, budget and timeline for anchoring the systems work with leadership. PAM will amalgamate with MGRP in the near future, becoming responsible for the entire Kuwaiti labor force. This new merger is strategic for longer-term comprehensive approach to labor management and will play an important role in the current development plan of the government of Kuwait.
- For economic sustainability, the project requires resources and direction from leadership in planning.

Recommendations

Recommendations are listed according to the following entities:

GSSCPD:

1. To support PAM to take forward the law review and the project lessons in relation to the planned merger with civil service commission and MGRP, the lessons concerning business processes, change

management and institutional development **(High Priority)**.

2. To enhance the systems interoperability and to ensure cross-sectoral coherence and coordination between the labor sector information management and labor law in the labor sector **(Medium Priority)**.
 3. To enhance and follow up on the implementation of the capacity building and **(Low Priority)**.
-

PAM:

4. To develop KPIs for the remaining PAM sectors, and complete and publish to users **(Medium Priority)**.
5. To complete the national OSH profile within the protection sector **(Medium Priority)**.
6. To take forward the work on ISIC and ISCO classification and alignment on the national level, following up the UNDP/IOM joint support on how to support PAM and MGRP to adopt ISIC. PAM had been reportedly struggling with the urgency of implementation of the new standards and integration with the Ministry while it is still using the old standards to register and renew business licences. The recommendations for this key piece of work are to establish a central repository for all classifications on the national level, develop a central Meta data service managed by the Central Statistical Bureau (CSB) and establish a national committee formed by key stakeholders to oversee the full implementation of the standards **(High Priority)**.
7. To follow-up work on the business process maps needed for the remaining sectors. Moreover, to work on labor sector Governance model **(Medium Priority)**.
8. To follow-up the work on PAM Human Resource Management and structure in line with the assessment and reports **(Medium Priority)**.

United Nations:

9. To develop an SOP and case study for joint project implementation by all agencies led by UNDP **(Medium Priority)**.
 10. To create a technical oversight team between all three UN agencies around a single results monitoring plan in future activities **(High Priority)**.
 11. To undertake a post-project capacity impact study in one year. While the 23 courses were generally evaluated and assessed by participants as beneficial and have served to increase their awareness and skills, there is still a need for a comprehensive review for impact over time towards outcome level results **(Medium Priority)**.
 12. ILO to work with PAM on OSH to undertake the profiling not completed under this stage **(High Priority)**.
 13. UNDP/ ILO to develop a strategy for training the trainers follow-up and capacity leveraging at PAM **(Medium Priority)**.
 14. IOM to generate a case study on its work with PAM government shelter for foreign labour in Kuwait for further positioning **(High Priority)**.
 15. IOM to provide its thoughts on the labour estimation system and how it can be enhanced based on process manuals developed **(Low Priority)**.
 16. UNDP to provide final accounting statement and refund the overcharge of GMS to the GSSCPD when the CDR and PDRs of all UN accounts can be settled in 4 months from now **(Medium Priority)**.
-