



# Evaluation Summary



International  
Labour  
Office

Evaluation Unit

## *Independent Final Evaluation Projects to Support the Decent Work Country Programme of Mozambique MOZ/08/02/FLA and MOZ/09/01/FLA*

### Quick Facts

**Countries:** *Mozambique*  
**Final Evaluation:** *Dec 2012*  
**Mode of Evaluation:** *Independent*  
**ILO Administrative responsibility:** *CO-Lusaka*  
**Technical Area:** *EMP/SEED and DIALOGUE*  
**Evaluation Management:** *Belinda Chanda,  
Programme Officer, CO Lusaka*  
**Evaluation Team:** *Francesca Romana Pastorelli  
& João de Azevedo*  
**Project Code:** *M.250.10.139.901 and  
M.250.10.139.902*  
**Donor:** *Flemish Government (US\$2'309'338)*  
**Keywords:** *Social dialogue, women's rights,  
enterprise creation,*

### Background & Context

The Project to Support the Decent Work Country Programme in Mozambique was funded by the Flemish Government through its agency FICA, under an agreement signed between the Flemish Government and the ILO in 2009. The ILO prepared the project in January 2009, under the responsibility of the Director of the ILO Lusaka offices, containing two separate components, covering the fields (1) Social Dialogue and (2) Women Workers' Rights and Women's Entrepreneurship Development.

#### Project Objectives

Contribute towards poverty reduction in Mozambique, through the creation of decent jobs, women's economic empowerment and gender equality.

**Specific Objective 1:** Promote within the Mozambican society a mind-set that recognizes the role of women in the workplace and provides support for their actions as entrepreneurs and as workers.

**Specific Objective 2:** Create an enabling policy environment in which the tripartite constituents may play an important role in promoting and protecting the rights of working women, and promoting their potential as entrepreneurs, making gender equality a reality in policies and actions.

**Specific Objective 3:** Strengthen the capacity of local organizations to provide support services for women workers and women entrepreneurs, taking into account the educational levels of each target group in business development services.

**Specific Objective 4:** Educate women workers and women entrepreneurs about their rights and responsibilities in the workplace, and empower them to take advantage of the existing mechanisms, structures and institutions.

The project comprises three components, namely:

- **Component 1, Women's Entrepreneurship Development,** aims to promote female entrepreneurship as a way of empowering women, creating productive and decent work and reducing poverty.
- **Component 2, Women Workers' Rights,** aims to empower women workers and to facilitate advocacy campaigns so that these rights have a practical effect. Particular emphasis will be given to the promotion of the four ILO Conventions on Gender Equality.
- **Component 3, Social Dialogue,** aims to strengthen the capacities of the Government and of the unions to use social dialogue as a

strategic way of promoting decent work for women.

The project has a clear gender approach with the main target group being women workers both from the formal and informal sectors. The project focuses its activities in three selected provinces, namely Maputo, Nampula and Sofala.

### **Project Management Arrangements**

After consultations with the social partners between June and October 2010 it was decided that the Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) had to be composed by the subcommittee of the CCT (Comissao Consultiva do Trabalho) with the presence of other selected members from stakeholders. For this reason the project document slightly differs from the actual management arrangement. The project has to submit quarterly report and workplan to the TAC for guidance and approval. Currently the project is managed by a Project Coordinator with the assistance of a National Project Coordinator and a Finance Administrative Assistant.

### **Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation**

The main objective of the final evaluation is to assess the results achieved during the implementation of the Project to support the Mozambican Decent Work Country Programme. The final independent evaluation covers all outcomes/objectives of the DWCP Support Project and assesses all key outputs that have been produced since the start of the project. The scope of the evaluation in terms of time is the period from the start of the project implementation in November 2010 to December 2012. It builds on the findings of the mid-term self-evaluation carried out in May 2012 and in assesses to what extent the programme has taken on board the recommendations made by the mid-term evaluation. The clients of the evaluation are the key stakeholders involved in the Programme implementation, as represented by the Project Technical Advisory Committee (TAC), the donor (FICA), the ILO, the Tripartite Constituents and other relevant stakeholders in the project who would use the evaluation findings and lessons learnt.

### **Methodology of evaluation**

The evaluation exercise was based on stakeholder's participation and was guided by core evaluative questions addressing:

i. the *relevance* and strategic fit of the project;

- ii. the *validity of design*;
- iii. the *effectiveness* of individual interventions at the level of the project as a whole;
- iv. the *efficiency* measured both in administrative costs and timeliness of execution;
- v. the *effectiveness* of management arrangements and efficiency of resource use;
- vi. the *sustainability* of results and of the project contribution to the institutional development of the national constituents; and
- vii. *lessons learned* from the project and recommendations and future prospects for similar projects in same domain.

The evaluation work went through an initial phase consisting of careful reading of the project documentation, mainly produced by the project over the 41 months of its implementation.

A visit to Nampula helped to interview key local partners working in the Women's Entrepreneurship Component and to visit some of the Micro Enterprises supported by the project. Were used a range of participatory approaches fitting to particular circumstances taking into account lessons learned from field practice. The preliminary findings based on the desk review, the individual interviews, focus groups and questionnaires were presented to the Project Technical Advisory Committee as per ToRs.

## **Main Findings & Conclusions**

**Validity of the Design:** The project design had a relative validity at the time the proposal was drawn up. However, previous consultations with a higher number of actors at local level should have been included as part of the proposal-making activities. The main weaknesses of the design are associated with a not-too-precise appreciation of the magnitude and characteristics of the problems. Nevertheless, the new project document (Work Plan, Logframe) approved in October 2010 is redesigned to coincide with the requests of national partners and has shown to be operational. The idea of merging the three components under a unique project helped to better understand the intervention's logics and to avoid duplications. The design reviewed foresees the establishment of a control and monitoring body for the activities, which was performed by the Technical Advisory Committee (TAC), in representation of the tripartite constituents and other project partners. The new work-plan approved included indicators and means of verification, but did not include an operational monitoring system. Finally, it is noted

that the project design does not include provisions for a post-project phase. The lack of such a designed phase endangers the sustainability of the actions and their results, in terms of expansion of activities still on-going, results and impacts expected.

**Relevance and Strategic Suitability:** The project is coherent with the national global objective of “Reduced poverty and disparities to improve the lives of the most vulnerable people in Mozambique by 2015”, under Government leadership, as stated in the Poverty Reduction Action Plan (PARP, 2011-2014) and with the general objective of promoting decent employment, as a way of facilitating and developing micro, small and medium-sized enterprises. It is widely recognized as a valid contribution by supporting and expanding comprehensive services to provide entrepreneurial guidance, training and financing to local entrepreneurs, with focus on women. The project is also a direct contribution to the UNDAF, 2012-2015, namely by systematically following the principle of the implementation of a culturally sensitive and gender responsive, human rights based approach ensuring a focus on women.

**Project Effectiveness:** Overall the project has done quite well despite the more than one year delay in start-up, due to the process of consultation with constituents on project management arrangements, revision of work plan and staff recruitment. The levels of sensitivity among the actors involved in national political beneficiaries of project actions on the rights and responsibilities of women in the workplace increased. 88% of these actors have increased their appreciation of the role played by women in the workplace. A study on the legislation and existing policies under the ILO Conventions 100 and 111 was completed and validated by the social partners. Three studies on minimum wage were implemented by organizations of workers and employers. Negotiations led to an increase in the minimum wage for each sector, a minimum of 6% to 15%. A study on the regulation of labour law conducted by the Employers' Federation was performed. A study on the barriers faced by women in accessing their rights, gender disparities and the gaps in their rights, with a focus on the agro-processing industry (cashew) was conducted and validated in Nampula, in October 2011. The project supported the social partners in campaigns for the ratification of the Convention on Maternity, including a meeting between the Minister of Labour and the organization Women's Forum, the Women Committees of the Trade Unions and debates on

national radio. 317 people were trained in issues of social dialogue, 45% of participants being members of the women committees of the two unions. 74 of their members trained in advocacy, negotiation techniques. 75 beneficiaries enterprises were formally recognized; a total of 25 enterprises created and the sample of 50% of the women trained in April 2012 showed that an estimate of 68 enterprises increased their revenue. Out of 282 people trained on Get Ahead during the period 143 were interviewed, showing a very positive trend after the training with an increase in the revenue, preparation of business plan and creation of new jobs. 25 organizations of the target provinces trained to provide the Get Ahead training: 329 people trained in Get Ahead and in SIYB in Sofala. Trained 90 people (80% women) by INEFP in 3 districts of Sofala province in SIYB. Mobile units were provided in Nampula and Sofala. The Cooperative Caixa Mulheres of Nampula has been selected to manage a revolving fund for women emerging entrepreneurs in Nampula. 100 women were trained by INEFP. 100 women established contacts with MFIs. 100 members of the Cooperative Caixa das Mulheres received credit. 100 people enrolled in courses INEFP. In April 2012, a survey sample contacted 143 people (50% of total graduates Get Ahead in 2011) estimates the creation of 58 jobs, 27 businesses. A new survey is performed during December 2012.

**Efficiency measured both in administrative costs and timeliness of execution:** The resources of about 2 million USD have been reported sufficient for project purposes. National stakeholders reported that disbursements showed some administrative ‘heaviness’. With regard to use of resources, current financial reports showed that the resources were allocated to provide the necessary support and to achieve the broader project objectives, the merging of the two projects avoided efforts and resources duplication and permitted a timely execution of the project activities.

**Effectiveness of Management Arrangements and Efficiency of Resource Use:** In spite of the existence of innumerable bottlenecks in the administrative procedures and in inter-institutional relations, the outcome of the project implementation had a relative level of efficiency that allowed it to overcome barriers and implement most of its activities. Several technical support missions undertaken by ILO's Lusaka and Pretoria offices were appreciated by most partners, despite the limits imposed by the language. When necessary to rely on specialized contributions, the

project resorted to the support of specialized consultants; the ILO team had the support of several Mozambican consultants, experts in several areas, including data collection and analysis, legal issues, communication, training, coordination of institutional actors, monitoring and evaluation of activities.

The ILO's efforts to create synergies with the government and private sectors, as well as with other international cooperation organizations, has been the driving force of the multi-sectorial work necessary to implement the DWCP positively.

**Perspectives for sustainability:** The project presents important sustainability perspectives at social and technical levels, as well as partially at financial level, having to improve certain aspects in this last field. The initiatives generated from the project have established long-term commitments and targets in the Plan of Action for the DWCP. However, the technical sustainability of interventions under the DWCP needs to be re-worked, for a more accurate and better concentration of the target groups, the phases of the process and the specification of their results. The partners must have a higher level of autonomy on decision making on actions to be undertaken and on the allocation of resources.

## Recommendations & Lessons Learned

### Main recommendations and follow-up

1. Concerning the working language of the project and the ILO in Mozambique: The ILO regional offices should acquire language skills appropriate to the tripartite development work in Mozambique. The continuation of ILO operations in Mozambique recommends hiring staff that are fluent in Portuguese at regional level, including at least one back stopper-expert.
2. Concerning the design, planning and financial management of projects: In future, projects should be dynamically identified based on the needs as perceived by the partners, hence developing the project documents by small tripartite committees through the use of specific participation techniques and implemented through tripartite annual and quarterly programming, with likelihood of revisions in the light of developments in the national context, and with budgetary and financial details.
3. Concerning the post-project plan and immediate activities: The project team should propose to hold a working session with the PPTD's TAC before 25 February 2013, for discussion and approval of a

post-project plan, appropriately documented, including a proposal for follow-up activities still underway. Among these are the activities linked directly to the results expected by the DWCP Action Plan, with a budgetary forecast for their follow-up, at least through the year 2013.

4. Concerning the Monitoring and Evaluation System of the project and its sustainability: The current M&E system was not designed with a clear view of it's to sustainability neither of its future management by the partners. Hence, it is recommended that in future the M&E system is steered to a subsystem tailored to partners' capacity, with custom-made sustainable indicators such as CREAM. e.g.: Clear, Relevant, Economical:, Adequate, Measurable.

5. Concerning ILO technical assistance to the Labour Consultative Committee to reinforce tripartism, in the light of the needs for technical support (at central and decentralized levels) to further improve Women Workers' Rights and Social Dialogue in Mozambique: it is recommended that the CCT and the ILO Office/Lusaka, with the direct support of the TAC, prepare a document clearly formulating the technical reinforcements needed to operate (including objectives, outputs, activities and budget) with both parties (CCT and ILO) making a joint financing request.

6. With regard to the activities at risk (Cooperative of Women of Nampula): it is recommended that the ILO/Lusaka (with the technical contribution of the CTA), the TAC/CCT and the Agency FICA consider and define practical arrangements for the continuation of the support provided to the women's cooperative Caixa Mulheres of Nampula, formulating a post-project document to be submitted for appreciation and decision by FICA.

### Important lessons learned

Various interviewees evaluated the lessons learned from 40 months of the project life: The active involvement of partners to implement the project was vital for the project itself. The project progressed from the moment it took into account the views of the partners. It was understood how important it is to involve the partners in the design stage to agree jointly on the project objectives and strategy of the project in general. For future projects it is important to prepare everything before starting the project, or hire staff when the project is already underway, so that time is not lost.