



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

PROMOTE: Decent Work for Domestic Workers to End Child Domestic Work – Final Joint Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries:	<i>Indonesia; and Asia region</i>
Final Evaluation:	<i>27 September, 2017</i>
Evaluation Mode:	<i>Independent joint evaluation</i>
Administrative Office:	<i>CO-Indonesia</i>
Technical Office:	<i>FUNDAMENTALS</i>
Evaluation Manager:	<i>Pamornrat Pringsulaka</i>
Evaluation Consultant(s):	<i>Ruth Bowen (ILO consultant) and Mei Zegers (USDOL consultant)</i>
Project Code:	<i>INS/12/12/USA</i>
Donor(s) & Budget:	<i>US Department of Labor (US\$ 4,999,970)</i>
Keywords:	<i>labour, domestic work, child labour, decent work</i>

Background & Context

In Indonesia domestic workers commonly lack the status of “workers” and are not protected by labour law or social security provisions. In 2012 the ILO estimated that 2.6 million women and children were engaged in domestic work in Indonesia, many of whom were vulnerable to exploitation. The PROMOTE project was funded in December 2012 with the aim of reducing child domestic work significantly by building the institutional capacities of domestic workers organizations to

promote decent work for domestic workers (DWs). PROMOTE works in Indonesia and also incorporates strategies at the regional level in Asia. Due to delayed national approval the project duration was extended until September 30, 2017 through two no cost-extensions. The project is intended to meet the following objectives:

- 1) Strengthened capacities of domestic worker organizations (DWOs) to more effectively address child domestic work (CDW) and promote decent work for DWs in Indonesia;
- 2) Innovative partnerships with business and civil society entities built to reduce the prevalence of child domestic work and promote decent work for DWs in Indonesia;
- 3) Systems to transfer knowledge and practical tools on the promotion of decent work for DWs exist in Indonesia and other countries in Asia;
- 4) Regional alliances for far reaching change in perceptions and action against child domestic work and recognition of decent work for DWs;
- 5) DWs including child DWs linked to a communication system enabling them to have ready access to information and support services;
- 6) An enhanced knowledge base to promote decent work for DWs and reduce CDW;

- 7) Robust and accessible knowledge sharing systems on CDW and the promotion of decent work for DWs in place to improve transparency and accountability.

PROMOTE partners with three umbrella networks of organizations working on domestic worker rights and child rights. These main partners are the National Network for Domestic Workers Advocacy (JALA PRT); the Network of Indonesian Child Labour NGOs (JARAK); and the Action Committee for Protection of Domestic Workers and Migrant Workers, an alliance formed by the major trade union confederations. The central strategy of the project was to build the capacity of these strategic networks to reach out to domestic workers to raise their awareness of their rights, mobilize them to form grass-roots domestic worker groups, and provide life-skills and vocational training, and to advocate for legal protection of domestic workers' rights.

The project also engages with a wide range of other trade union and civil society groups such as the teachers' and financial institutions unions, the National Women's Congress, journalists, religious leaders and youth to raise awareness of the rights of domestic workers; and also with the Indonesia Association of Domestic Worker Suppliers. The activities were implemented at national level and in Greater Jakarta, East Java, South Sulawesi and Lampung provinces.

Regionally, PROMOTE works with the International Federation of Domestic Workers (IDWF) to promote capacity building and knowledge sharing among regional and global DWOs; and also with the ILO Bureau for Workers' Activities (ACTRAV) towards support from the regional trade union movement for domestic workers' rights and capacity to organize.

The project is managed by a National Chief Technical Advisor, supported by a team of four provincial coordinators who also share technical advisory roles on advocacy and capacity building, as well as a monitoring and evaluation officer and administrative staff.

The project received a mid-term evaluation in November 2015.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The final evaluation of PROMOTE was commissioned and managed jointly by ILO and the US Department of Labor. It was conducted by a team of two international evaluators, with support of a national consultant. The USDOL evaluator was contracted through a task order with O'Brien Associates International.

The evaluation was intended to provide ILO and USDOL with an independent assessment of the project performance, to document learning and good practices, and make recommendations toward enhancing the project's sustainability and improving future development efforts on the rights of DWs. The evaluation questions addressed issues of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation was conducted between June and September, 2017. The methodology was primarily qualitative, including a desk review and field work in Jakarta and in three of the four implementation provinces. The evaluators conducted 40 individual and group interviews in total, with project staff, national and local government stakeholders, implementing partners, including domestic worker organizations and their members in three of four project locations, as well as ILO and USDOL officers. Ten focus group discussions were held with domestic workers participating in project supported activities.

The field work culminated in a stakeholder workshop in Jakarta where the evaluation team presented their initial findings and solicited further inputs. The report drafting included review by the Project team and partners, the ILO and the USDOL.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Relevance

The analysis of the barriers to decent work for domestic workers in the design was sound and the strategy of working with domestic workers to empower them to improve their working conditions was valid. However, the evaluation found that the designed interventions could have been more focused on the specific causes of child domestic labour. Furthermore, the formulation of the project intervention logic, while it adhered to the USDOL solicitation for grant applications, did not follow results-based management principles in the formulation of objectives, and did not lead to a strong performance framework for monitoring and evaluation purposes. The evaluators concluded that the project would have benefited from a strategic review of the objectives and performance indicators through a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation planning process during the inception period.

Most of the Indonesia and regional partners were positive about the relevance of PROMOTE to their goals. However, the key government stakeholder, the Ministry of Manpower, did not at first offer unreserved support for the strategy of working through DWOs, but became more engaged as the project progressed. The project won the support of provincial and district government, especially for the vocational training pilots that aligned with the national competency standard for domestic work.

Effectiveness

Under **Objective 1**, PROMOTE has provided the opportunity to the main advocacy networks for domestic workers to expand their outreach to domestic workers and enrolled more than 3,000 domestic workers in groups for life-skills training and self-empowerment. Through innovative outreach methods and group organizing the DWOs provided their members with effective training on the right to decent work, occupational health and safety in the workplace, vocational skills to improve their bargaining position, as well as legal aid in cases of dispute or exploitation. Many of the group members expressed a transformation in their confidence to negotiate with employers and knowledge of their rights.

The project partners also implemented pilot vocational training courses for domestic workers in target locations that enabled the trainees to gain certificates recognized by the Ministry of Manpower.

The outreach efforts and group organizing ultimately mainly supported live-out domestic workers. While the partners tried to contact live-in workers, few joined DW organizations. Most were not able to join due to a lack of free time or permission from their employers. Thus, the evaluators found that the central strategy of working through DWOs to reduce child labour in domestic work has not yet proven effective. The partners carried out some advocacy on the minimum age for domestic work, but focused their advocacy and organizing efforts on the rights of adult workers and reached few child workers. The number of children in domestic work continues to warrant attention, but the dispersed nature of child labour and the particular hazards that young domestic workers face suggests there is a need for specialized methods to identify and support children who are working as domestic workers.

One of the project's strategies observed to have good potential to identify child domestic workers and provide them with referral to appropriate services was the Community-Based Monitoring (CBM) model (**Objective 2**). Volunteer neighbourhood teams identified where DWs were employed and monitored their working situations. These teams raise awareness among the employers and provide guidance on occupational safety and health for workers as well. Community-based monitoring was considered an emerging good practice, demonstrating multiple benefits for improving domestic workers' conditions and identifying cases of under-age workers.

PROMOTE engaged a wide range of DWOs, unions and civil society partners in advocacy for a law to be enacted to protect the rights and conditions of domestic workers, (**Objectives 1 & 2**). So far, the law remains to be discussed and passed by Parliament, suggesting that more intensive efforts are required to win support for the passage of the draft bill.

Also under **Objective 2**, PROMOTE enabled a range of innovative strategies through the media, unions and civil society groups to influence public opinion towards the recognition of domestic workers as “workers” and not “helpers”.

The efforts of the Association of Indonesian Domestic Worker Suppliers towards regulating the recruitment of domestic workers and their working conditions through a Code of Conduct was found to be a significant step towards improving the regulation of the sector.

With regard to regional capacity building for domestic worker NGO and trade union alliances, (**Objectives 3 and 4**) PROMOTE funded the publication of valuable resource materials, including the ILO/IWDF publication: “Decent Work for Domestic Workers: Eight Good practices from Asia” and supported improvement of IWDF’s online communication platform. Two regional workshops for trade unions helped advance discussions on domestic worker issues and informality.

Efficiency

The project was managed effectively and efficiently. PROMOTE staff brought a wide range of technical skills as well as strong commitment to the project. They went beyond their assigned roles to support the development of high quality training materials such as an occupational safety and health checklist and social media applications for domestic workers.

Sustainability

The pilot training programmes generated interest among local level Ministry of Manpower in the target districts, particularly in Malang in East Java. Local government committed funds and facilities in some target areas, and there are also avenues for Ministry of Manpower and Ministry of Education grants for the partners to continue providing vocational training once they qualify as registered providers.

District level government authorities also expressed interest in seeing the CBM groups continue and expand, though this will require ongoing guidance from the implementing partner.

Recommendations

Main recommendations toward sustainability:

Strengthen and sustain the community-based monitoring model. Provide on-going support to the CBM groups to ensure that their expertise is nurtured, and ensure mechanisms are in place to monitor and support them beyond the project.

Strengthen the sustainability of the outreach centres and domestic worker schools for decent work rights and life-skills training. Prioritise planning to ensure the centres and schools are self-sustaining.

Reaching live-in domestic workers. Ongoing efforts of the ILO, DWOs, and other constituents to secure decent work for all domestic workers should place greater emphasis on reaching live-in domestic workers with rights awareness and organizing, using targeted outreach strategies.

Expand the availability of vocational skills training for domestic workers through seeking local government support in terms of funding and integrating the courses within government vocational training centres.

Replicate and Support Dissemination of Domestic Worker Suppliers’ Code of Conduct.

Share PROMOTE experience regionally. Provide support for a regional workshop to share the lessons from the PROMOTE experience, including DW organizing, community based monitoring, and skills training.

Future efforts:

Targeting child domestic labour. Future projects aimed at ending child labour in domestic work in Indonesia or elsewhere, should place more focus on the particular causal factors and situation of child domestic workers.

Project design and inception process: All projects granted through competitive bidding should be required to develop and document an explicit theory of change as part of a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation planning (CMEP) process or similar.

Collective organizing of domestic workers and their services. DWOs in Indonesia and elsewhere could explore the benefits of collective forms of organization for delivery of domestic services to households, learning from domestic workers' cooperatives in Korea, for example.