



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation Unit

Technical and Vocational Education and Training Reform in Bangladesh (TVET-R) - Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

Country: *Bangladesh*

Final Independent Evaluation: *Sept 2014*

Mode of Evaluation: *Independent*

ILO Administratively *CO-Dhaka*

ILO Backstopping Office: *DWT-New Delhi*

Evaluation Manager: *Mr Natanael Lopes, ILO
Country Office for Brazil (CO-Brasilia)*

Evaluation Consultant: *Sustineo Pty Ltd (Ms Sue
Allan and Ms Mary Mertin-Ryan)*

Project End: *December 2015*

Project Code: *BGD/06/01/EEC*

Donor: *European Union 1 million*

Keywords: *Technical and Vocational Education*

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose

From 2007 the European Union (EU) funded the 'TVET Reform Project' (TVET-R) in order to set the policy framework for Technical and Vocational Education in Bangladesh. TVET-R was implemented by the International Labour Organization (ILO) in partnership with the Government of Bangladesh (GoB). EU funding was for 14 million Euros and the ILO and GoB both contributed 1 million Euros to TVET-R.

TVET-R Project Development Objectives:

TVET-R's Development Objective is to support the pro-poor growth agenda of Bangladesh's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper by creating more employment opportunities for the poor and strengthening

the capacity to tackle the competitive challenges of the country.

Purpose: A market-oriented and flexible TVET system, which responds to the demand for competitive skills of the modern sector as well as to the needs of youth and underprivileged groups.

TVET-R has five interrelated components:

1. TVET policies, systems and legislation reviewed and strengthened at the central and decentralized levels;
2. Enhanced flexibility, quality and relevance;
3. Strengthened TVET institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers;
4. Improved skills development resulting in enhanced productivity and competitiveness in key growth and export-oriented industries in the formal industrial sector;
5. Increased access of underprivileged groups.

Expected Outcomes:

- New national TVET policy that will allow the TVET system to function more effectively at the central and decentralized levels.
- New national qualifications framework for TVET.
- New skill standards and curriculum in priority occupations.
- New quality assurance arrangements for training organizations.
- Enhanced links between industry and TVET.

- Strengthened TVET institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers.
- Improved skills development resulting in enhanced productivity and competitiveness in key growth and export-oriented industries in the formal industrial sector.
- Increasing access of underprivileged groups.

Project Implementation Arrangements:

- The EU Delegation to Bangladesh has an assigned Program Manager based in Dhaka.
- The ILO Country Office in Bangladesh (CO-Bangladesh) has oversight of all in country projects, including TVET-R, with an allocated Senior Program Officer assigned to this role. The TVET-R project is part of the ILO's Decent Work Country Program (DWCP) for Bangladesh.
- Project Steering Committee (PSC) and TVET-R Monitoring and Coordinating Committee (PMCC). Both the PSC and the PMCC had important roles as forums for discussion, decision-making and coordination.
- The TVET-R Implementation Team is based in Dhaka in its own office. The current small team managing the extension to December 2015 comprises a Senior Specialist (formerly the Chief Technical Advisor to TVET-R), a Program Officer and an Administrative Assistant. Throughout the duration of TVET-R until June 2014, a large team of National and International staff was recruited for their particular technical and sectoral expertise aligned to their allocated Component. Short-term international and national advisors were brought in for specific tasks throughout TVET-R implementation as required.
- The TVET-R Team is also technically backstopped by the Skills Specialist based at the Decent Work Technical Support Team in New Delhi.
- Geographical: The TVET-R Project undertook Program Trials and Pilots in Dhaka, Chittagong, Barisal, Rangpur,

Khulna, and outlying areas of Dhaka (Savar, Mirpur, Gazipur).

Present Situation of the Project

There were significant hold ups to Project activities at times, especially relating to the extensive consultation and long approval processes by Government, most notably during a particularly politically volatile period in 2013. These and other delays relating to the quality of work by some consultants that had to be redone slowed down the start up of the Pilot Programs. Other hold ups included identification of a greater lack of resources and equipment in some Pilot Institutions and the need to provide additional training for trainers to improve their skills and competencies in areas such as computer use.

Despite these challenges TVET-R has done remarkably well to achieve its intended results across the 5 inter-related components - with all objectives on track for completion by the end of the current extension period. The management of TVET-R has been of high standard, evidenced by three 'no cost' extensions having been approved, the last of which is to the end of 2015. The extension justified by the Government and key participants of the PSC, given the high priority accorded to Skills Programs. The key objectives for the next 18 months are to ensure all materials and documents are translated into Bangla, and to implement a broader communications exercise to build up profile and recognition of TVET-R reform measures.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The evaluation sought to assess the key achievements of TVET-R as per project framework, including its Five Strategic Components. It has examined the extent to which TVET-R partners in Bangladesh, tripartite constituents, local communities, and trainees have benefited, and will continue to benefit, from TVET-R's outputs, strategy and implementation arrangements. It has also aimed to highlight positive outcomes and strengths, areas for improvement, recommendations for sustainability, lessons

learned and good practice.

Clients of the evaluation include: the European Union; the Dhaka TVET-R team, Bangladesh Office and Regional and HQ staff; tripartite Constituents, and other stakeholders.

Methodology of evaluation

The methodology followed ILO Policy Guidelines for Results-Based Evaluation and its technical and ethical standards. The TVET-R Project undertook Program Trials and Pilots in Dhaka, Chittagong, Barisal, Rangpur, Khulna, and outlying areas of Dhaka (Savar, Mirpur, Gazipur). A final evaluation workshop held over one full day was held with key stakeholders in Dhaka with representatives from all tripartite constituents, including ILO, EU, Government representatives, Employer groups, Workers and Workers Representatives and TVET sector stakeholders.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The TVET-R Project has without doubt achieved its Program Purpose and Component Results. TVET-R has been granted a no cost extension to the end of December 2015 in order to finish off the translation of all materials and documents into Bangla and to work further on a promotion and communication strategy for TVET until its completion. The foundations for TVET Reform in Bangladesh have been built and tested. This is a remarkable achievement and has been tackled across five major components.

Key achievements

1. The key achievement from the perspective of every person interviewed throughout the evaluation process was ‘the successful formulation and formal adoption of the National Skills Development Policy’.
2. Other significant achievements included: drafting legislation for the new TVET Act, development of a new structure and coordination mechanism in the National Skills Development Council (NSDC) for the TVET system, strategies for promoting gender

equality and working with people with disability, all of which are ground breaking achievements in the Bangladesh TVET sector and directly attributable to TVET-R.

3. Another major outcome of TVET-R was the formulation and adoption of the National Technical and Vocational Qualifications Framework NTVQF, and the Quality Assurance Systems for use in private, NGO and Government training institutions.

4. TVET-R’s aim to create the systems and foundation in order to strengthen institutions through improved knowledge and skills of managers and teachers has also been demonstrably achieved. TVET-R completed the development of training materials and courses, and the upgrading of skills, competency and experience of management, master trainers, assessors and teachers.

5. ILO has used its particular expertise to facilitate and support Private Public Partnerships. TVET-R linkages have been formed between Government and training institutions with Industry and assisted Industry Skills Councils to be established in the five industry sectors of leather and leather goods, transport equipment, agro-food processing, information technology, and tourism and hospitality. Both the leather and agro-food Councils incorporate a Centre of Excellence, the first of their kind in Bangladesh.

6. TVET-R has achieved impressive results in its aim to increase access of underprivileged groups to TVET and in helping to promote the value of TVET to communities. It has partnered with other skills and development projects working with ‘the most vulnerable’ and helped to create alternative pathways for working children, for example through informal apprenticeships.

7. Other achievements include the NTVQF established for pre-vocational training, on the job training, and pilot programs for women with disability. Models created for increased inclusion, including mainstreaming of gender considerations, and leadership on the development of the National Policy for Promoting Gender Equality in TVET, and the Strategy for people with disability are also highly significant achievements of TVET-R.

Conclusions: The TVET-R has been a highly ambitious and very successful Project and has consolidated ILO's reputation as a leader in TVET Reform in Bangladesh. The expertise, determination and commitment of ILO personnel and the Organization as a whole was key to its success. The ILO's ability to broker and facilitate partnerships and trusting relationships has enabled TVET-R to arguably become the most well-known and successful TVET project in the country. TVET-R has achieved its stated objectives and managed to do so within budget. However, extra time was required to complete TVET-R with no cost extensions granted until December 2015.

Challenges: TVET-R faced complex challenges, including capacity of Government and other partners, bureaucratic delays, a level of reluctance to embrace change in the technical education system, and the lack of human and physical resources limiting stakeholders' ability to engage fully in the process of reform. There are also still achievements to be made by TVET-R with regard to addressing needs of the underprivileged in TVET, and in gender mainstreaming.

Sustainability: The two main factors that support the likelihood of sustainability of TVET-R efforts are the continuation of Project activities in a limited way under a no cost extension to the end of 2015, and Canada's funding of the Bangladesh Skills for Employment and Productivity Project (B-SEP) with ILO, which will focus on the implementation of the National Skills Development Policy and scale-up of many of the activities from TVET-R.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

1: The ILO reviews the support required for the TVET-R industry sectors (in particular transport, agro-food and IT) to transition to self-sufficiency.

2: The ILO leads the development of a plan and timetable for the implementation of the RPL system in TVET.

3: The ILO drives the implementation of gender equality in TVET: supporting NSDC in implementing priority areas outlined in the National Strategy for Gender Equality.

4: The ILO should capture more quantitative data on outcomes and impact for both TVET-R and B-SEP.

5: Canada, as Co-Chair, Skills Development Working Group, continues to take a leadership role in Skills Development generally, and in the implementation of the National Skills Development Policy Action Plan.

6: Canada continues to aim for the high public profile given by the EU to TVET.

7: All donors for Skills Development in Bangladesh work closely with the NSDC and support the NSDP Action Plan.

8: The Government of Bangladesh finalizes all outstanding legislative requirements.

9: The Government of Bangladesh moves quickly to resource the NSDP Action Plan especially fully staffing and resourcing the NSDC Secretariat, BTEB and DTE.

10: Industry continues to take a leadership role in TVET through the Industry Skills Councils and Centres of Excellence.

11: Training Institutes continue to show leadership by promoting and adopting the NVTQF, CBT and RPL.

12: Training Institutes take a leading role, with Government and industry, to find solutions to the cost of CBT so that greater elements of society have access to training.

13: NGOs continue their strong engagement with the Skills Development Sector and ISCs to advocate on behalf of the disadvantaged, women, and people with disability to facilitate skills development and employment opportunities.

14: Employee Group Representatives take a stronger role with the Skills Development Sector, and ISCs, to advocate for decent work conditions for employees.

Important lessons learned can be accessed in the full report.