



# Evaluation Summary



International  
Labour  
Office

Evaluation  
Office

## *Supporting the National Policy and Programme Framework for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labour in Lebanon and Yemen - Final Evaluation*

### Quick Facts

|                                  |   |
|----------------------------------|---|
| <b>Countries:</b>                | <i>Lebanon and Yemen</i>  |
| <b>Final Evaluation:</b>         | <i>07/2008</i>  |
| <b>Evaluation Mode:</b>          | <i>Independent</i>  |
| <b>Administrative Office:</b>    | <i>DWT/CO-Beirut</i>  |
| <b>Technical Office:</b>         | <i>IPEC</i>   |
| <b>Evaluation Manager:</b>       | <i>IPEC/DED</i>   |
| <b>Evaluation Consultant(s):</b> | <i>Taghrid Khuri, Team Leader; Mouna Hashem, , Lebanon; Abdul Karim Alaug, Yemen; Habbouba Aoun, , Lebanon.</i> |
| <b>Project Code:</b>             | <i>RAB/04/51/USA</i>  |
| <b>Donor(s) &amp; Budget:</b>    | <i>US DOL (US\$ 3,000,000)</i>  |
| <b>Keywords:</b>                 | <i>Child Labour</i>   |

### Excerpt from the Executive Summary

Toward the end of the IPEC's Project for "Supporting the National Policy and Program Framework (SNPPF) for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labor in Lebanon and Yemen" the Design, Evaluation and Documentation (DED) section of ILO/IPEC commissioned an independent external consultant team to carry out an independent evaluation of the project. The project was scheduled to end in March 2008, however due to delays caused by various factors the end date was extended to May 2008. The evaluation team was composed of four members: a team leader who also carried out the evaluation fieldwork in Yemen, an international evaluation

consultant who carried out the evaluation in Lebanon, and two national evaluation consultants in Lebanon and Yemen. Annex (1) presents the TOR for the final independent evaluation.

The purpose of the independent evaluation is to ascertain that program objectives have been achieved in both countries and the extent of which the program benefits have accrued to the target group(s) with a focus on gender composition. The Evaluation would guide the recommendation for the preparation of a tentative future proposal for possible further assistance toward combating child labour (CL) benefiting from the lessons learnt from the previous phases. Emphasizing ILO/IPEC's 'tripartite' structure, the evaluation obtains the views of all partners: government, employers' and workers' organizations and NGOs, mainly those who were directly involved in the implementation of action programs.

The evaluation work produced two country evaluation reports and a synthesis report of the two country reports. The present synthesis report summarizes and synthesizes the findings of both country evaluation reports and tries to assimilate the lessons learnt and good practices as well as depict the similarities and/or differences of significance.

The findings of the evaluation offer several lessons which can contribute to future project interventions:

1. The timeframe of the project correlates with sustainability of the project. Project design should take into consideration the nature of the outcomes to be achieved in relation to the allocated time of the project. A project such as addressing the problems of child labour which requires multidimensional interventions at the macro and micro levels needs a significant period of time to achieve its objectives and sustainability. At the

macro level, activities involving policy change and legislation involve lengthy bureaucratic procedures; that also applies to capacity building of government partners. At the micro level, changing social behaviour -- particularly that of parents and employers -- and providing appropriate interventions such as rehabilitation, educational and income generating for both children and parents also require considerable time to have an impact. Allowing sufficient time for project implementation to build capacities ensures sustainability. This was demonstrated in the extension of project interventions from Phase 1 which included KYJCSC, ARC and ALI. As the evaluation found, these projects are now sustainable.

2. Project budget also affects the quantity and quality of the expected outcomes. In this case, project funds were insufficient to reach a target group of 6,900 children in different geographic areas and implement all activities. Furthermore, limited financial resources for APs placed financial burdens on implementing partners, which should not be the case.

3. National statistics on child labour are critical to develop a baseline data to assess the magnitude of the problem, design appropriate solutions and measure their impact. Case studies are useful in providing specific information but cannot substitute for a national databank.

4. Teacher-student interaction is an important factor affecting student dropout/retention. It is assumed that students drop out of school mainly because of their failing grades.

5. Partnerships with local NGOs, which already have child-focused activities to work on child labour is a resourceful means for reaching a wider scope of working children in different areas in the country. In addition, it builds capacities in sustaining activities efforts in combating child labour.

6. The lack of effective child labour inspection, especially in the informal sector where the majority of children work, allows a significant number of children vulnerable to WFCL to fall through the cracks.

7. An effective inspection system on child labour necessitates a multi-sectoral approach to facilitate collaboration between inspectors from the CLU, MOI, NGOs, employers, schools and community members. In other words, effective inspection should consist of a network of partners to identify children at risk, share information, withdraw children, punish violators and enforce the law.

8. Training workshops are a cost efficient and cost-effective means for capacity building. They also present an opportunity for implementing partners to learn about each other's activities, network and establish collaborations.

9. Raising awareness activities need to be customized according to their target group. For example, awareness programs for working children and their parents should be relevant to their socioeconomic setting and rely on situations that they can identify with to gain their attention. ALI conducts special awareness campaigns for industrialists that have been effective in sensitizing employers about child labour.

10. The project's multi-sectoral approach linking government and civil society leads to a comprehensive and integrated format in combating and preventing the WFCL child labour.

11. Poverty and unemployment are challenging factors that make parents dependent on their children's economic participation. Consequently, offering parents a substitute for their children's work such as income generating activities or micro credit programs are important to lessen their dependency on their children's labour.

12. The social environment and services offered by an NGO is important for retaining children in a program until they graduate from the project. Extracurricular activities such as arts and crafts for younger children and/or counselling and rehabilitation for withdrawn children are also valuable in dealing with emotional problems.

### **Lessons Learnt / Yemen:**

13. IPEC has been successful in fostering coordination between government institutions, donors and development programmes. This is manifested in the vital role played by IPEC office in coordinating efforts to implement the 1<sup>st</sup> national survey on Child Labour. The survey will be implemented by the Central Statistics Organization authorities, with the technical support of ILO/SIMPOC, and the financial support of UNICEF and the Social Fund for Development. Such partnerships would expand the possibilities for the project to utilize secondary resources already available for further development of its activities and achievement of its goals.

14. A good example of coordination was found in Sana'a WCRC where cooperation and coordination were established between the Center, the Child Protection Initiative (CPI) and the Women's Economic Empowerment Association (WEEA). The coordination

resulted in the organization of training programmes for the working children's families in income generating skills. Furthermore, the IPEC office and the Sana'a WCRC are members in CPI's Steering Committee. Being part of the local council system (the Municipality Sana'a) was one of the main positive and good lessons learned during phase two. The Municipality which includes executive branches of all ministries provides the forum within which all obstacles facing Sana'a WCRC are discussed and coordinated solutions are identified. However, it has been clear that the affiliation of Sana'a WCRC with the Municipality of Sana'a (considered as a government institution) has prevented the Center from receiving direct financial assistance from international and donor agencies. In order to be eligible for this fund the status of the Center should be modified to be a nongovernmental organization.

It is evident from the above that Lebanon managed to gain more experience due to the length of the first and second phases of the project combined. Furthermore, the capacity of the various staff members and their assimilation to the children's difficult circumstances led to creative interventions that expanded the effectiveness of the project.

#### **Good Practices / Lebanon:**

Good practices are those identified in the project as effective means and methods in achieving the desired outcomes and are replicable. Some of those in Lebanon were:

1. The effectiveness of the Remedial classes in improving student performance and reintegrating children into formal education.
2. NGOs that solicit youth as mentors to assist in targeting, follow-up, services and offering advice on issues such as drug use, sex education and raising awareness is an effective strategy to win attention of beneficiaries.
3. Partnerships with local NGOs, which already have child-focused activities to work on child labour is a resourceful means for reaching a wider scope of working children in different areas in the country. In addition, it builds capacities of civil society which has long-term benefits in sustaining efforts in combating child labour.
4. Social workers who use social and communication skills in raising awareness campaigns and meetings with parents can be influential in gaining parents' commitments to the project.
5. Community participation in elimination of child labour and the WFCL by means of networking and

establishing partners such as those between NGOs, schools and parents, is critical for targeting children and for sustainability.

6. Extracurricular activities are important for children in motivating them to learn and participate socially and academically.

7. The welcoming environment of NGO staff and their sense of commitment to child labour are key to the success of recruiting and retaining beneficiaries.

8. ALI and workers syndicates' commitment and involvement play an important role in reaching employers and child labour.

#### **Good Practices / Yemen:**

9. Considering the piloting nature of the APs, the project design managed to diversify the type of partners' structures to include government institutions, NGOs, municipalities, and independent unions. This is clearly evident in the nature of the three partners administering the WCRC in Aden, Seyoun and Sana'a. In Sana'a, partnership was established with the Mayor's office – as mentioned earlier, whereas in Aden with both the Mayor's office and a local NGO (Combating Child Labour Organization). In Seyoun, partnership was established with the local NGO AlNahda Cultural and Social Charity Organization, and to diversify the sources of financial support to the WCRC, those Organizations succeeded in establishing -through public donations- an endowment from which the interest was used to cover the cost of some of the WCRC's activities especially when the IPEC payments were delayed.

10. The establishment of local-level subcommittees is a conducive mechanism to help identify and target working children as well as to provide a sense of responsibility and ownership by the local communities. Such sub-committees were formed by the three WCRC centers in Sanaa, Seyoun and Aden.

11. At the local level, the Aden rehabilitation center has established a multi-sectoral committee which has met three times and the Sana'a 's committee has met once. The CLU has been further strengthened by the second NSC meeting which discussed projects problems and means of solving them.

12. The recruitment of volunteers in the targeted communities to establish a close monitoring and follow-up system of the targeted children, and their re-enrolment in the formal educational system (Aden WCRC).

13. Part of the main positive good practices is that the CL service centers work two shifts/periods (morning and

afternoon) to be able to balance between the school time for those children and their activities and classes at the center.

14. The recruitment of national consultants to carry out some of the main activities of the project has been a successful strategy to overcome the difficulties encountered in the recruitment of international consultants. National experts were recruited to perform a range of assignments including the implementation of a number of baseline studies (working girls in agriculture study in Seyoun, working children in fisheries in Aden, and working girls in agriculture, entertainment and street children). The mapping of national laws relevant to child labour as well as the capacity building efforts at CLU are a good first step to continue with harmonizing the CL-related laws.