



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Combating worst forms of child labor by reinforcing policy response and promoting sustainable livelihoods - Final External Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries:	<i>Egypt</i>
Final Evaluation:	<i>Dec 2014</i>
Evaluation Mode:	<i>Independent</i>
Administrative Office:	<i>DWT/CO-Cairo</i>
Technical Office:	<i>IPEC</i>
Evaluation Manager:	<i>IPEC/DED</i>
Evaluation Consultant(s):	<i>Dr. Mona Saad (WFP)</i>
Project Code:	<i>EGY/11/01/WFP</i>
Donor(s) & Budget:	<i>World Food Programme (US\$ 9,500,000)</i>
Keywords:	<i>Child labour, income-generating activities, education</i>

in agriculture and providing 3,000 children over the age of 14 with apprenticeship opportunities. In addition, the project sought to provide 5,000 households with livelihood services. WFP worked in partnership with the International Labour Organization (ILO) and United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) to address child labor in agriculture in five Egyptian governorates: Assiut, Menya, Sohag, Fayoum and Sharqia.

This is a final evaluation of that project carried out by an independent consultant. The evaluation included a review and assessment of all activities carried out under the USDOL cooperative agreement with WFP. All activities that have been implemented from project launch through the time of evaluation fieldwork were considered. The evaluation assessed the achievements of the project toward reaching its targets and objectives as outlined in the cooperative agreement and project proposal. This is a qualitative evaluation and its findings reflect trends and issues pertaining to the project sites visited during fieldwork.

From the Executive Summary

In 2010, the US Department of Labor (USDOL) awarded a four-year Cooperative Agreement, worth US\$ 9.5 million, to the World Food Programme (WFP) to combat exploitative child labor in Egypt through a project called Combating Worst Forms of Child Labor by Reinforcing Policy Response and Promoting Sustainable Livelihoods and Educational Opportunities in Egypt (CWCLP). The project aimed to provide 16,000 children with direct educational services in order to reduce their vulnerability to child labor (CL), including preventing 8,000 children at risk from entering the worst forms of child labor (WFCL)

The evaluation used both qualitative and quantitative data collection methods. Fieldwork was qualitative and participatory in nature. Information regarding the outcomes and outputs of the project were collected from project staff, stakeholders and beneficiaries (teachers, parents and children) through field visits, individual interviews and focus group discussions. Sample findings were discussed with nongovernmental organization (NGO) staff in each governorate using the win-win approach. This approach concentrates on positive aspects and overcoming negative aspects by using simple

statements which reflect positive way of thinking. Quantitative data, which complemented the use of qualitative analysis, was drawn from project documents including the Technical Progress Reports (TPR), midterm evaluation, impact evaluation, and other reports to the extent available.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Relevance

CWCLP developed a comprehensive, holistic approach to combating child labor in agriculture by providing educational and livelihood services as well as Take Home Rations (THR), an incentive for families to enrol their children in appropriate education services. Parallel to these strategies, the project put effort into raising awareness and building institutional capacity to guarantee sustainability.

The most positive feature of the project design was addressing the agricultural sector, which had been resistant to intervention because of cultural restrictions. The project focused on the poorest governorates and those with the highest rates of child labor in the agricultural sector. It also relied on strong NGOs in each governorate as an umbrella for the grassroots associations. The latter had a deep reach in local communities and particularly in target villages.

However, the project adopted some assumptions which did not seem to prove accurate, mainly: (a) the agricultural sector turned out not to be more reachable than the informal industrial sector, and (b) poverty was not the only the root cause behind child labor in agriculture.

Effectiveness

According to the fieldwork results, the living situation of most beneficiaries has improved compared to what it was before participation in the project. The project's impact extended beyond this to improve the general economic and social level of the small hamlets and villages in the governorates included in the project. In the evaluator's estimation, according to results in the field it can be said that the project has achieved the desired results at a rate of 75% on the whole. The remaining 25% can be attributed to composite reasons, including the political situation in

the country and instability which reigned for a period of one and a half to two years.

Umbrella NGOs and field staff demonstrated a depth of awareness and understanding regarding the problem of child labor and hazardous work in agriculture, as well as in other manufacturing and urban sectors. However, not all of the grassroots associations had the same level of awareness or adherence to clear criteria used to determine the target group and set a list of priorities for the child and mother.

The innovative methods employed by civil society associations to attract target groups were very efficient and used various means and approaches that were suited to the local culture. Nonetheless, these innovations sometimes led to a watered down version of the concept of exploitation in some cases and within some intervention strategies.

Withdrawal from Child Labor: Complete withdrawal of children from agricultural work in rural areas and within families' duties was not achieved. From the evaluator's point of view, this would be unrealistic due to the beliefs and acceptance of this in Egyptian culture, especially in rural, marginalized areas. However, the project was successful in decreasing the number of hours children spent working and in replacing working hours with schooling hours. The project also tailored its interventions to the specific needs of boys and girls and gave priority to girls' education.

The evaluation has not found that any child over the age of 15 was withdrawn from intolerable or hazardous work. Partial withdrawal of children under the age of 15, by providing them with non-formal educational opportunities, proved successful in guaranteeing the child's right to education, diminishing hours spent on farm work, and raising awareness among the children and their families about risks and hazards in the agricultural sector.

Educational Interventions: Community Schools (CS) were well established and teachers were dedicating effort to dealing with this difficult category of children. The board trustees in these schools were also working as child protection committee (CPC) members at the same time.

Efforts to prevent children from dropping out of Formal Schools (FS) were carried out by NGOs, but many factors impeded the project's ability and creativity to enhance the educational level of the children in these schools. This led some umbrella NGOs in Menya and Assiut to build interventions within FS on the rights-based approach, which proved to have significant impact.

Awareness Raising Interventions: Stakeholders at all levels of project intervention experienced a change in attitude, understanding and awareness about the consequences of hazardous work by children in agriculture. All of the mothers met in these governorates during fieldwork were more convinced about the importance of education for their children, experienced more confidence in themselves and their ability to improve their family's living conditions, were less likely to push their children to work and were more likely to encourage them to attend school regularly. Nevertheless, there is still a lot of work needed to change the cultural conception prevalent in some sectors that children are "property of the family" and that families have the right to decide as they please regarding a child's situation.

Livelihoods Interventions: The results of the livelihood component showed that project strategies were efficient. A variety of trainings were carried out which provided many enriching experiences for mothers. The living conditions of mothers in Assiut, Menya, Sohag and Fayoum governorates have improved as a result of the project's livelihoods component. Thus, this component is a good candidate for expanding its scope into other small, poor remote villages and/or those villages with deteriorated basic services.

While the trainings provided by the project improved the general life skills, awareness level and negotiation skills of the working children, they could not be considered as a vocational training linked to any specific trade or as part of "a non-formal apprenticeship system." Similarly, the Apprenticeship Grading Contract (AppGC) reviewed during the evaluation did not express the various components and mechanisms needed for assessing the gradation of skills improvement over the years during which a child works for an employer.

The THR intervention was both a means and an end for small and extremely poor villages in Fayoum, Sohag, Menya and Assiut. It was a successful method for negotiating with the family and for attracting mothers to participate in the livelihood component. It was also important in providing material support and social assistance for the family until either the mother could find a way to improve her income or until families in extreme poverty could be referred to the Ministry of Social Solidarity (MoSS).

Policy Interventions: The CPC and other innovative legal interventions created by the umbrella NGOs had critical importance, including: transforming the conviction among families regarding child protection; improving awareness and understanding among government officials; and transforming children's awareness and skills to protect their rights. There is a current debate over whether the CPCs should be part of the National Council for Motherhood and Childhood or part of the MoSS. This can be considered evidence of the change in officials' attitudes and their increased understanding about the importance of this issue.

Project Monitoring and Research: Some limitations were noticed in the project's information system which affected all aspects, from the beginning of its procedures and during all project phases. These include: the fragmentation of the information system between the three main stakeholders; a lack of simple, general criteria for identifying project beneficiaries; and a lack of geographical positioning maps to coordinate the distribution of project interventions. Finally, the TPR also gave priority to reporting on the main quantitative direct targets which are children and mothers. This type of reporting underestimates the set of indirect or qualitative components included under expected outcomes in the logical framework.

The system for monitoring and reporting on child labor status and the project's direct beneficiaries was seamlessly designed so that it was accurately received at local level and interpreted at central level. It was also sufficiently clear about when and what type of services children received as well as the reason for continuing or ending a service for a child or mother. However, there was an absence of a linkage between the child's information and the mother's information in the system. As a result the

project was unable to access data specifically on families or mothers.

Recommendations

A. Recommendations for a sustainable phase-out of the CWCLP project:

- There is a need to secure the stability of community schools in order to assure sustainability of the impact on targeted children. **(Grantee)**
- ILO should continue efforts with the MoMM; the AppGC, SMSC and non-formal training component for working children above 15 years old requires some revision. **(Grantee)**
- The THR and livelihood components need to be expanded and proliferated due to their powerful effects. **(Donor)**
- Priority should be given to unifying sources of information on child labor and to sharing experiences between local and international entities regarding the criteria for identifying project beneficiaries. **(Donor and Grantee)**
- Financial support to CPCs is needed in order to continue its institutionalization and guarantee the impact of needed cultural change. **(Donor)**

B. Recommendations for future child labor projects in Egypt or similar environments:

- Governorates, villages and beneficiaries should be targeted based on correct compound criteria that are simple, general and consistently applied between agencies. **(Donor and Grantee)**
- Attention should be paid to the MoSS role. A memorandum of understanding and much effort to cooperate with this ministry is recommended. **(Donor and Grantee)**
- Male heads of households should be included in livelihoods training because the unemployment of fathers and the seasonal nature of urban work is one of the factors leading to child labor in the family. **(Donor and Grantee)**

- The combination between different types of intervention is preferable in general, and the combination between the Rights approach with children who combine education and work is of great importance especially at the local level. **(Donor)**

- The information systems of projects with many components should be linked to each other. **(Grantee)**

- Geographical positioning maps should be used to coordinate project components. **(Donor and Grantee)**

- Agricultural institutions should play a bigger role in projects' targeting of the agriculture sector. **(Donor and Grantee)**

(This should be a concise list of the main recommendations.)