



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Public-Private partnership (PPP) between the chocolate and cocoa industry and the ILO in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire - Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana

Final Evaluation: May 2016

Evaluation Mode: Independent

Administrative Office: GOVERNANCE/
FUNDAMENTALS/IPEC and field offices

Technical Office: FUNDAMENTALS/IPEC

Evaluation Manager: Evaluation and Impact
Assessment (EIA) unit of FUNDAMENTALS

Evaluation Consultant(s): International Evaluator:
Rafael Muñoz Sevilla (team leader);
National Evaluators: Kingsley Arkorful
(Ghana) and Charles Kapie (Cote d'Ivoire)

Project Code: RAF/11/01/GIG & RAF/11/04/GIG

Donor(s) & Budget: Global Issues Group, USD
2,060,000

Keywords: Child Labour

Background & Context

The Project “Combatting Child Labour in Cocoa Growing Communities in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire (PPP)” is implemented under the FPRW-IPEC strategic programme on child labour (CL) in West Africa/ECOWAS region and in the context of the Declaration of Joint Action to Support Implementation of the Harkin-Engel Protocol.

Regarding the West Africa Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work (FPRW)-International Programme

on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) strategy the project is particularly aligned to the projects “ECOWAS I and II”, which ended in April 2014, and ‘Towards Child Labour Free Cocoa Growing Communities in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana through an Integrated Area Based Approach’ (CCP) and the Project “Creating a protective Environment for Children in Cocoa Growing Communities in Soubré, Cote d'Ivoire”. These projects have been/are under a common management structure, aiming at the same development objective and working in some cases with the same stakeholders. The CCP and PPP mutually reinforce and leverage from this close coordination. Among key linkages are, work to strengthen the child labour Monitoring Systems (CLMSs) in both countries, strengthen NSCs and provide direct support to communities.

The PPP seeks to support Ghana’s and Cote d'Ivoire’s plans to eliminate child labour and to contribute to workforce continuity in cocoa growing farms by younger generations. The project is a partnership between the ILO and a number of companies in the chocolate and confectionery industry that have committed to contribute to the implementation of the 2010 Framework of Action to Support Implementation of the Harkin-Engel Protocol on child labour (CL) in cocoa.

The Development Objective of the project is “To accelerate progress in the elimination of child labour, with a focus on its worst forms, in cocoa growing communities in Cote d'Ivoire and Ghana”.

The evaluation was conducted between October 15 and November 21, 2014. The evaluators reviewed project documents, developed data collection

instruments, and prepared for the fieldwork during the week of October 15. Also, interviews with ILO staff in Geneva and the donor were conducted during that week. Fieldwork was conducted in Ghana from 21 to 29 October and in Cote d'Ivoire from October 27 to November 5.

The evaluators interviewed representatives from the International Labour Organization (ILO), the cocoa industry; IPEC project management team and staff in Ghana and in Cote d'Ivoire; key stakeholders, community members and project beneficiaries in both countries; and utilized secondary data that refer to documentary evidence that has direct relevance for the purposes of the evaluation and that have been produced by the ILO, other individuals, or agencies for purposes other than those of the evaluation.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Project design

There is consensus among stakeholders on the appropriateness of the project design and, from the primary and secondary data gathered, the evaluators conclude that the overall project design has proved to be highly appropriate in addressing child labour challenges in the cocoa sector within Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire.

Relevance

The PPP Project constitutes a significant contribution of the funding companies commitment to reduce the worst forms of child labour in the cocoa sector in Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire and is aligned with the national policies, efforts and commitments in preventing and combating child labour. The ILO/IPEC strategy and the PPP project itself have proved relevant and effective, holding a strong potential for scalability that should be fostered in order to better contribute to achieve the objectives and targets defined by the Framework of Action; the *Roadmap for achieving the elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour by 2016*; the *ILO Global Action Plan on Child Labour*; and, more recently, by the *Brasilia Declaration of the III Global Conference on Child Labour*. Furthermore, scaling-up the CLMSs is crucial in order to have comprehensive data on child labour at the national level, to cover other sectors that could be affected by the worst forms of child labour (WFCL) and to accelerate elimination of all forms of child labour.

Effectiveness and efficiency

The PPP was executed with high degree of effectiveness, delivering most of the expected outputs, which greatly contributed to a high degree of effectiveness in reaching the project's immediate objectives.

The PPP project has proved effective in strengthening Child Labour Monitoring Systems (CLMS) in Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire, by providing support to national, district and community level CLMS operations in both countries. ILO/IPEC contributed significantly to strengthening coordination and institutional capacities, especially through support to the Ministries of Labour and the National Steering Committees (NSCs), and to reinforcing cooperation with other relevant stakeholders at the national and decentralized levels in both countries. This contributed to significant progress in national/district/local capacities to strengthen the technical and institutional environment in order to tackle child labour. PPP direct interventions to prevent and eliminate child labour were also very effective. In both Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire 2577 children were withdrawn or prevented from child labour. The project promoted increased awareness on child labour and education and was able to build consensus on the need to prevent and eliminate child labour and enrol and keep children at school.

Regarding the efficiency of the project, taking into consideration that the project has been carried out in two different countries, at national, district and local levels, the scope of activities executed (policy-level, direct intervention, institutional capacity building, support to CLMS, etc.), the quality of the outputs generated, the number of beneficiaries reached, and the project's role in supporting the CCP, the evaluators conclude that the relationship between the financial resources invested and the results obtained is satisfactory.

Gender issues

In its implementation, the project took into account the positions and roles of women in target cocoa-growing communities and their relation to child labour issues, and oriented these interventions towards their empowerment and benefit. Women were motivated to become active members of their communities and decision-making bodies and processes. The PPP project also assured equal access to direct services to all child beneficiaries, both boys and girls.

Major contributions towards impact

The evaluators consider that the project's results and achievements contributed to *accelerate progress in the elimination of child labour, focusing on its worst forms, in cocoa growing communities in Cote d'Ivoire and Ghana*. Furthermore, the project has generated and has the potential to continue generating significant impacts related to national and district capacity building, local community development and withdrawal and prevention of children at work.

Sustainability

In general, the project has successfully provided a basis for future sustainability. However, the degree of the long-term continuation of the results obtained by the PPP project will depend mainly on national and district ownership and resource allocation (financial, technical and human). Given the current available national resources, and the fact that the structural, institutional and cultural change necessary for increased ownership requires a long period of time, the evaluators believe that further external support will be needed in the short-medium term.

Recommendations, Good Practices and Lessons Learned

Recommendations

1. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC, national stakeholders and donors: A follow-up project would help guarantee the sustainability of the project's results and ensure that target communities remain child labour free in the long term and could also contribute to a broader child labour strategy for the cocoa sector.
2. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC and the cocoa companies: It is essential to continue the ILO/IPEC and cocoa industry collaboration and to reinforce the role of ILO-IPEC, at national and decentralized levels (districts/departments), in the awareness-raising and mobilization of the industry.
3. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC and the cocoa companies: ILO/IPEC could and should be a privileged partner of the industry in the conception, design and implementation of the Cocoa Action Plan.
4. Addressed to: the ILO, national stakeholders and donors: Awareness raising about the harmful effects and risks of child labour needs to be sustained until it forms part of the cultural DNA of the communities and in order to achieve a change in attitudes and practices that ensure that children remain out of work and in schools.
5. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC, national stakeholders, and donors: CAP development and implementation also requires prolonged support until CCPCs develop full implementation, management, and sustainability capacities of CAPs.
6. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC, national stakeholders and donors: Future initiatives should continue to work to strengthen the institutional capacities and roles of the CCPCs so that they can fulfil their roles and mandates and also reach a level of autonomy at which they can foster advocacy in favour of their communities. At the national level, continuous support to NSCs is essential in order to ensure they fully achieve their mandates so they can effectively coordinate stakeholders and implement National Action Plans (NAPs) in these countries.
7. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC, national stakeholders and Industry: ILO-IPEC's work with Industry partners could help identify new areas for advocacy to improve the cocoa sector. Government coordination should be enhanced. Enterprises at all levels must be clear about their commitment to respect for all fundamental rights at work and their readiness to engage with trade unions to promote decent work, including the elimination of child labour and the ILO can support them in that regard. Similarly, ILO-FPRW/IPEC should continue to support the capacity of trade unions to integrate child labour concerns fully into their policies and activities.
8. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC, national stakeholders, donors and the Governments of Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire: CLMSs should be extended nationwide. An operational and costs analysis, a resource mobilization strategy and strategic plan could be carried out. Efforts towards simplifying the data collection and analysis and linking with public data bases, social programmes and company monitoring systems must be fast tracked. CLMS implementation should become part of the core activities of District/Departments ensuring the availability of its staff.

9. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC, national stakeholders and donors: Enhanced livelihoods of farmers, Good Agricultural practices (GAP), Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) and local economic development initiatives should be supported.
 10. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC, national stakeholders and donors: More efforts should be taken in order to guarantee access to school or educational services of children in or at risk of entering child labour. Improving educational infrastructures and equipment, access to water and sanitation, teacher training and capacities and school management systems is recommended. Catch-up or literacy programmes, school support and back-up and relevant technical and vocational education and training (TVET) alternatives for adolescents are also important.
 11. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC, national stakeholders and donors: Gender empowerment is another interesting aspect to focus on at community level since it is likely to improve livelihoods, decision-making and may even generate positive spill-overs for the cocoa sector.
 12. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC, national stakeholders and donors: More flexibility in the administrative and financial procedures and a higher degree of autonomy for the ILO Country Offices is needed to help future initiatives to better adjust to the scheduled time-frame or be able to foresee these delays more accurately.
3. When selecting beneficiaries in local communities we have learned that it is important to include all of the children in the community as well as their families (as direct or indirect beneficiaries). This avoids tensions within community members and increases support to project activities and instruments such as Community Action Plans (CAPs), Community Child Protection Committees (CCPCs) and other forms of involvement in the fight against child labour.
 4. Addressing child labour with an integrated approach is a possible entry point for the industry to address some of the challenges that affect the cocoa supply chain, improve the cocoa sector and the living standards of the local communities. In this sense, IPEC could be a key partner for the industry, as it is uniquely qualified and experienced in the area of child labour.

See the full report for good practices.

Lessons Learned

1. Key processes and results need an extended period of time to be developed and consolidated and therefore it is important to carefully outline the project's implementation procedures in order to better align them with the administrative and funding processes and take into account possible delays (which are more likely when working in tandem with other project timelines).
2. Child labour interventions are often conducted without coordination or cooperation between agents to support each other's actions and unite efforts. But in this sense, we have learned from ILO-IPEC's interventions in this sector that the best strategy for addressing child labour is an integrated approach.