

Evaluation Summary



Evaluation Office

Office

Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Economic Empowerment (WEDEE) – Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda

Final Evaluation: September 2015

Mode of Evaluation: Independent

Administrative Office: *DWT/CO-Dar*

Technical Office: SME unit

Evaluation Manager: Sabrina de Gobbi

Evaluation Consultant: Karin Reinprecht

Project End: 31 December 2015

Project Code: GLO/14/53/IRL & RAF/14/50/IRL

Donor & Project Budget: Irish Aid (GLO:

384'817 USD; RAF: 1'539'648 USD)

 $\textbf{Keywords:} \ \textit{East Africa, entrepreneurship, women's}$

empowerment

Background & Context

The Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Economic Empowerment project (WED-EE) mainly contributes to the achievement of ILO's P&B Outcome 3 'Sustainable enterprises create productive and decent job', with a view to contributing to the promotion of employment opportunities (Outcome 1), the strengthening of employers' organizations (Outcome 9), and the elimination of discrimination in employment (Outcome 17). It builds on an earlier project phase (2012 – 2013), and indirectly on the WEDGE project for supporting the growth of

women operated enterprises, both carried out under the ILO/Irish Aid Partnership Programme. WED-EE received an estimated total budget of €1.5 million for 2012-2013 and an additional €1.5 million for 2014-2015. Each phase of WED-EE had specific outcomes and outputs but phase II aimed to build on what had been done in phase I.

The objectives of this phase are: CPO KEN130: Young women's and men's entrepreneurial skills for self employment and SME activities enhanced/ increased, CPO TZA 102: Young women's and men's entrepreneurial and SME activities enhanced, and CPO UGA 128: Young men's and women's entrepreneurship for self employment and productivity increased. WED-EE aims towards achieving the following outcomes: Outcome 1: Women-led businesses increase their performance; Outcome 2: Selected policies and programmes are reviewed by policy makers to mainstream WED; and 3: Selected WED Outcome tools approaches are available beyond the project's lifespan.

PURPOSE, SCOPE & CLIENTS OF THE EVALUATION: This is the final evaluation of WED-EE, a four-year project, focusing on phase II considering the mid-term evaluation of phase I.

The key evaluation clients are:

- Irish Aid as donor of the projects
- ILO as executor of the projects
- Project management and staff
- Members of the national Project Advisory Committees

METHODOLOGY OF EVALUATION:

Information has been collected through field visits and other tools (surveys, interviews, etc.) in all three project countries (Kenya, Tanzania and Uganda). The global component of the project has been fully considered in the evaluation.

All aspects of this evaluation have been guided by the ILO evaluation policy which adheres to the OECD/DAC Principles and the UNEG norms and standards. The evaluation will be based on the OECD/DAC criteria of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and evidence of impact and sustainability through the analysis of the project implementation and outputs. The evaluation criteria 'Coherence' has been added by the ILO evaluation unit, to ensure the assessment of the logical connection of all planning and implementation levels.

RELEVANCE: WED-EE is aligned to Outcome 3 and is RELEVANT to four other Outcomes (8, 9, 16, 17) of the ILO Programme and Budget Plan 2014 - 2015. The alignment of WED-EE Objectives with the respective Country Programme Outcomes is assessed to be excellent. The logical and STRATEGIC FIT and COHERENCE within the planning hierarchy is very good. The selection of ultimate beneficiaries is assessed to have been fair and relevant to the needs of the target communities.

While the overall goal of WED-EE is women focussed, the project team and implementation partners took a gender relations perspective in the direct work with ultimate beneficiaries. This was done with the idea that gender

equality is best achieved with the involvement of both genders. Due to the close cooperation with YEF, female youth has been considered and included strongly in WED-EE activities (31% in Uganda, 32% in Kenya, 48% in Tanzania). In turn, WED-EE influenced YEF in giving more consideration to gender, thus increasing the participation of female youth in YEF activities.

WED-EE is aiming specifically at inclusive economic growth with its focus on skills development of women entrepreneurs especially in rural areas, facilitating networking exchange among the targeted entrepreneurs, on gender-responsive relevant policies and on sharing specific lessons learnt on inclusive entrepreneurship development. Ensuring that labour standards are respected for employees as well as self-employed people has been discussed in training activities for women entrepreneurs.

WED-EE contributes to tripartism and social dialogue in all three countries by involving government, employers' and workers' organisations in the implementation of its activities. These joint discussions and work on women entrepreneurship forge mutual understanding and connections for future reference.

EFFECTIVENESS: All targets have been overfulfilled by WED-EE - and that already six months before the end of the project. The approach for Outcome 1 seems to have been successful, as women entrepreneurs report an increase in business performance plus additional women empowerment effects. It is estimated that the majority of the women entrepreneurs reached by the project access more markets and increased their income. To mainstream women entrepreneurship development, action plans have been prepared with government and other stakeholders, the discussion process in itself being regarded as capacity building. More capacity building for

implementing the action plans is planned in the remaining project period. Outcome 2 to review policies has thus been reached. Accompanying the actual implementation could be part of a future intervention. Outcome 3 aims at sustainability of the intervention by making WED tools available after the projects lifespan. Trainers have been certified, trainers' networks formed. agreements with implementers signed, sustainability plans made, and policy briefs on sustainability issues such as formalisation and involvement of men have been prepared. The basis has been built; how many of the involved partners will be able to implement follow-up activities without some accompanying measures by the ILO after the end of the project remains to be seen. No UNINTENDED OR UNEXPECTED EFFECTS have been observed by the evaluator.

GLOBAL PRODUCTS: Knowledge developed by WED-EE such as policy briefs, videos, studies and a randomised evaluation of the GET Ahead tool are shared through ILO and partners' (NAC) networks and websites, special events and newsflashes. As communication has not been budgeted for, wider communication efforts cannot be made at the moment.

The core of WED-EE's strategy has been to create **SYNERGIES**, and thus enhance the funds and resources available to the project. High effectiveness has been achieved by leveraging the work of other ILO projects such as on youth (YEF in three countries), where WED-EE had a pivotal role in bringing about the inclusion of young women and girls, or in an ILO/HIV project in an international transport corridor in Tanzania. WED-EE has contributed also to interventions of other UN organisations, such as UN Women's (Tanzania) work with crossborder trade in the EAC and on Eastern African regional approaches to women entrepreneurs'

development, or in contributing to the implementation of UNDAP (UN as one) plans, or in being pivotal to a turn-around in entrepreneurship development of a UNESCO-led project in the Usambara National Park in Tanzania. National bodies such as Vision 2030; private sector organisations such as TIGO in Tanzania or Serena Hotel in Kenya, which WEDEE supported in achieving its local supply goals; and NGOs such as Catholic Relief Services in Uganda also benefited from WED-EE interventions.

EFFICIENCY: WED-EE is very efficiently managed through close cooperation with ILO-YEF and a systemic approach to management engaging intermediaries to contribute resources. Value has been added as outcomes defined in the Logical Framework of WED-EE have been achieved by more than 100%. Benefit-cost efficiency at the level of the final beneficiaries is good, in the case of two years until benefits for the ultimate beneficiary offset costs of the GET Ahead training. There is scope for improvement (a different approach maybe), at the higher range of 6 years until benefits off-set costs, which the evaluation of GET Ahead also found possible.

Management of the project is efficient with one project manager (CTA) between WED-EE and YEF, one National Project Coordinator per country plus a technical officer in headquarters. Also, the National Advisory Committee composed of the three ILO constituents plus civil society is shared by WED-EE and YEF. To facilitate reporting, a monitoring and evaluation system has been established. A Scorecard on the basis of the WED-EE Logical Framework has been developed by the project team which captures the extent to which targets are met. Different baselines have been established in cooperation with partners in all three countries. With additional funding a large-scale randomised evaluation of the GET Ahead tool (being part of similar evaluations

done in other parts of the world) is carried out by WED-EE with the support of partners. Irish Aid suggests improvements to the yearly progress report, which makes it clearer which results have been achieved.

IMPACT: Women entrepreneurs targeted by WED-EE changed their business behaviour and practices which result in positive business outcomes. They can now find creative solutions to business problems and barriers. As women entrepreneurs are aware of the reasons (feedback cycles) leading to these positive results, and as their behaviour is embedded in the system in which they operate, it is likely that longer-term development impacts have been achieved. The clear majority of the ultimate beneficiaries of WED-EE benefited from project's interventions and their welfare has been increased. However, the scale of the project needs to be expanded, learning from the systemic approach which WED-EE adopted in involving a wide variety of public and private sector organisations.

SUSTAINABILITY: What will remain of WED-EE's interventions is close to 2500 women entrepreneurs, whose businesses became more competitive and thus more sustainable; a network of organisations having access to a wide variety of women, who learnt more conducive training approaches for business; action plans and partly a mind-set change of policy makers in government administrations. WED-EE's approach of intervening in systems and building the capacity of systems' actors, rather than focusing all attention on the ultimate beneficiaries at grass-root level, has been geared towards sustainability, additionally to focussing one outcome of phase II on sustainability. With its interventions, long-term and sometimes irreversible changes have been achieved, and WED-EE inputs are rendered sustainable.

Main Findings & Conclusions

RELEVANCE: The alignment of WED-EE Objectives with the respective Country Programme Outcomes is assessed to be excellent. The logical and STRATEGIC FIT and COHERENCE within the hierarchy is very good. The selection of ultimate beneficiaries is assessed to have been fair and relevant to the needs of the target communities. Female youth has been considered and included strongly in WED-EE activities.

EFFECTIVENESS: All targets have been over-fulfilled by WED-EE – and that already six months before the end of the project.

EFFICIENCY: Value has been added as outcomes defined in the Logical Framework of WED-EE have been achieved by more than 100%. Benefit-cost efficiency at the level of the final beneficiaries is good, in the case of two years until benefits for the ultimate beneficiary offset costs of the GET Ahead training.

IMPACT: Women entrepreneurs targeted by WED-EE changed their business behaviour and practices which result in positive business outcomes. The clear majority of the ultimate beneficiaries of WED-EE benefited from project's interventions and their welfare has been increased.

SUSTAINABILITY: With its interventions, long-term and sometimes irreversible changes have been achieved, and WED-EE inputs are rendered sustainable.

The positive results achieved can be strengthened and rendered more sustainable in time through the following suggested actions.

Recommendation and lessons learned available in the full report.