



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation Unit

Empowering Vulnerable Groups through Education, Employment and Training (EET) – Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: *Pakistan*

Final Evaluation: *24 December 2013*

Mode of Evaluation: *Independent, External*

ILO Office Administratively backstopping the Project: *CO-Islamabad*

ILO Technical Backstopping Office: DWT-Delhi (Skills & Labour Market Information); Enterprise in ITC-ILO (Know About Business); Disability ILO Geneva (Polio-Plus initiative)

Evaluation Manager: *Neetu Lamba*

Evaluation Consultant: *Samia Raoof Ali*

Project End: *31 December 2013*

Project Code: *PAK1003MOUF*

Donor & Project Budget: One UN (US \$ 1,600,772)

Keywords: *KAB, LIMS, Forced Labour, Social Protection, Disabilities*

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The EET project has three components, first, entrepreneurship through applying ILO's Know About Business (KAB) tool, second, to promote Decent Work, implement employable Skills Programs and Labour Market Information & Analysis, third, Education and Legal Empowerment of Poor & vulnerable groups especially bonded labour & child labour. Each of the three components of the project had their internal logic and was well

established. However, the cohesiveness of these three components among each other were not very clear at the design stage and also during the implementation.

The first immediate objective on entrepreneurship (KAB) was well knit at the outputs level as these were well defined and clearly contributing to the higher level results. The three outputs of the second immediate objective do not necessarily complement each other. Its first output focuses on skills, second output on promoting decent work, and third output on the labour market information analysis. The project design does not make any effort to link these together. There might be some broader overlaps however these outputs could have been designed in a manner that these collectively help produce better results at the immediate objective level.

Similarly, the outputs of the third immediate objective do not resonate with each other for the collective result. One output focuses on bonded and child laborers another output focuses on disability and still another output address the polio prevention efforts. Clearly, strengthening polio prevention efforts is beyond the mandate of the ILO and the outputs could have focused more on the disabled workers and their rehabilitation.

The project strategy has been primarily strengthening institutional capacity building of the public sector institutions (skills training providers, labour departments, social security providers) and to lesser degree at the community level.

The project's geographical coverage has been in all the four provinces of Pakistan. However, project rolled out its all three components in Punjab province, two components in the Sindh Province, and smaller interventions in Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa provinces. In the last year of the project implementation, the additional funds for polio awareness and vaccination were used in Khyberpakhtunkhwa to promote polio vaccination of children that was beyond the mandate of the ILO.

Present Situation of the Project

The EET Project has now completed its interventions. It received its budgets from the ONE UN funding arrangements. The project's three components were designed separately in the different One UN thematic working groups, and then stitched together for the ILO's administrative purposes.

Despite the fact that project attempted to address ranges of issues (KAB, LMIS, Value Wool Chain and Decent Work, Employment Trend Reports, Mainstreaming Decent Work Agenda in the Literacy Curriculum, Linking Brick Kiln Workers with Social Protection, Polio Awareness, Rights of Workers with Disabilities) and has managed to achieve reasonable degree of success. The project has been completed as of 31 December 2013.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The final evaluation of the EET project has been organized as per the ILO policy. The ILO assigned its official, at Islamabad office, Ms. Neetu Lamba as the Evaluation Manager and hired the services of Ms. Samia Raoof Ali as an independent consultant to carry out the evaluation of the project. Ms. Pamornrat Pringsulaka, Regional Evaluation Officer of ROAP Bangkok provided the overall technical backstopping to this evaluation. The project evaluation has assessed the effectiveness of this intervention, its execution, and development impact. The evaluation has reflected on the lessons learnt and successes achieved, capacity building, policy/advocacy, partnerships and sustainability of project interventions. The evaluation has covered the

unique aspect of the project, as there were a number of smaller projects/components added under the bigger umbrella project through the implementation period.

The evaluation, based on its document review and field work though limited, has produced analysis and provided recommendations and lessons learnt to inform ILO and contribute towards the overall Delivering as One Programme.

As identified in the Terms of Reference of the final evaluation, the primary users include donors, ILO's implementing partners, ILO's constituents including federal and provincial governments, employers and workers organizations, right holders including men, women, girls and boys in the project communities, academia/ research organizations, NGOs and CSOs, private partners including skills providers and media.

Methodology of Evaluation

The evaluation methodology relied on both primary and secondary sources of information. The evaluation has reviewed the various project documents that have been made available. Moreover, one to one interviews have also been conducted with key stakeholders and discussions with project beneficiaries were also held. The evaluation had to work under an extremely tight time line that only allowed three days field visit to only one field location (Lahore, Punjab Province) out of the total three locations. The field location visited had all the three project interventions rolled out. The stakeholders from other provinces were either interviewed on telephone or during their Islamabad visit on Human Rights Day and consultation workshop. One to one meetings were held with key stakeholders from Karachi, Quetta and Peshawar. The evaluation has observed evaluation norms, standards and ethical safeguards.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The ILO's Project Empowering Vulnerable Groups through Education, Employment and Training (EET Project) is a unique project. It

is not a one project but a group of various smaller projects that cover diverse issues like entrepreneurship development, labour market information analysis, skills training and its linkage with the market demands, legal empowerment of brick kiln workers, literacy and decent work, rights of workers with disability and the awareness on Polio vaccination among others. In many ways the EET project proves a “catch all” project for all One UN related funding to the ILO.

This innovation in the project design where it was set to achieve three almost distinct targets proved its strength. It allowed the project to develop flexibility in better responding to the One UN demands both on resource allocation and also on expanding targets, as Polio was added during the last 14 months of the project’s cycle. Project has responded well and contributed significantly to the One UN’s Delivering as One targets of Joint Programme Education and Joint Program Agriculture Rural Develop and Poverty.

The Project has made excellent initial interventions in introducing ILO’s entrepreneurship tool “Know About Business” at the Sindh and Punjab TEVTAs, and Punjab Vocational Training Centers (PVTs). The project efforts have helped in building capacities at the provincial level on the labour market information analysis and this lead to the publishing of Punjab Employment Trends Report and Sindh Employment Trends Report. The project has also helped sensitize the managers of skills training in the Sindh and Punjab provinces to relook at the regime of skills training and make it responsive to the demands of the market.

The Project has also mainstreamed the Decent Work agenda into the curriculum of Punjab Literacy Department so the message could reach to the brick kiln and other informal sector workers. An innovation of the project has helped demonstrate that the brick kiln workers and their employers could be convinced to register for the social security cards for the workers. Moreover, the project has also done some excellent research and advocacy work to highlight the rights of disabled workers.

The project faced challenges in terms of limited One UN funding. Moreover, some funding was either too small or came very late in the project life thus making it challenging for the project to have meaningful impact on those area. However, the EET project can be described as a good model for the ILO to replicate with additional One UN funding under the new delivering as One UN modality.

Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Main recommendations and follow-up

For the ILO:

1. The Punjab Employees Social Security Institute needs ILO’s technical support in scaling up the project pilot to help brick kiln workers obtain social security cards
2. ILO’s Support to Brick Kiln workers should be continued in some form since the sensitization of owners is very important which can only be done through the support of an organization like ILO.
3. ILO to extend technical support to the provincial Departments of Social Welfare and the Labour to ensure that labour legislation for workers with disability is well implemented, especially 2% employment quota.
4. The technical assistance to extend the work to promote Know about Business (KAB) should also be introduced with the Provincial Education Departments at the secondary and/or higher secondary level.
5. The ILO to extend technical support to Labour Departments of Balochistan and KPK to establish Labour Market Information System replicating Sindh and Punjab experience.
6. Training Institutes of the two provinces of Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa should be assessed and if need for KAB exists given the situation it should be introduced

Government:

7. The Punjab Literacy Department to provide additional technical support in training all of its teachers on the Decent

Work toolkit and how to integrate it during the lessons plans on literacy.

8. The Punjab Labour Department must replicate the Employment Trend Reports and ensure the findings help improve policies and programs to provide better services to the target groups especially youth.
9. The interest of other organizations to implement KAB is encouraging but some mechanism should be evolved where the quality of KAB is not compromised.

Important lessons learned

(This should be a concise list of important lessons learned summarized from the main report.)

1. Successful innovation to link women and men brick kiln workers with the Punjab Employees Social Security Institute (PESSI) of the Government of Punjab.
2. Introduction of Know about Business at the Technical Education and Vocational Training Authorities (TEVTA) in Sindh and Punjab Province.
3. Capacity building of the Punjab Labour Department to introduce Labour Market Information System at the provincial level.