



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

“Combating child labour through education” and “Combating child labour through skills training for older children” – Final evaluation summary

Quick Facts

Countries: *Bolivia, Indonesia, Mali, Kenya and Uganda*

Final Evaluation: *April 2016*

Evaluation Mode: *Independent*

Administrative Office: *FUNDAMENTALS*

Technical Office: *FUNDAMENTALS*

Evaluation Manager: *Peter Wichmand*

Evaluation Consultants: *Rafael Muñoz Sevilla (team leader), Grace William Maiso (national consultant, Uganda), Samuel Munynwiny (national consultant, Kenya), Mamadou Boukassoum Traore (national consultant, Mali), George Martin Sirait (national consultant, Indonesia) and Ana María Seleme (national consultant, Bolivia)*

Project Code: *INT/10/07/NET & GLO/14/27/NET*

Donor & Budget: *The Netherlands*

Keywords: *Child labour Education Skills training*

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

At the global Conference on Child labour held in The Hague during May 2010 the government of the Netherlands announced its intention to support a new ILO-IPEC project which has been working to

strengthen the policy and programme links between efforts to tackle child labour and to promote education as part of a broader strategy to tackle child labour. An agreement of November 5 2010 between the Netherlands Ministry Of Foreign Affairs (MOFA) and ILO established the project Combating Child Labour through Education, which includes both global level work and work in four countries, Bolivia, Indonesia, Mali and Uganda.

The project received a positive mid-term evaluation and was extended from June 2014 to June 2015. Also, in December 2013 the ILO was contacted by the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs concerning the possibility of IPEC developing a new project focussed on skills training for older children, building on the work of the ongoing project on child labour and education. Subsequently the project Combating child labour through skills training for older children in rural areas was developed and became operational in July 2014 and is expected to end by September 2015.

The evaluation was conducted from March 30th to June 30th, 2015. The evaluators reviewed project documents, developed data collection instruments, and prepared for the fieldwork between March 30th and April 10th. Also, interviews with ILO staff in Geneva were conducted by the team leader from April 8th-10th. Fieldwork was conducted in Uganda, Kenya, Mali, Bolivia and Indonesia between April 12th and May 23rd.

The evaluators interviewed representatives from the International Labour Organization (ILO); IPEC project management team and staff in Uganda, Kenya, Mali,

Indonesia and Bolivia; key stakeholders, community members and project beneficiaries in all five counties; and utilized secondary data that refer to documentary evidence that has direct relevance for the purposes of the evaluation and that have been produced by the ILO, other individuals, or agencies for purposes other than those of the evaluation.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Project design

The evaluation found some weaknesses in the project design. Despite these weaknesses, the project was nonetheless able to adapt the planned actions to meet the specific contexts and needs of each country and the project followed solid intervention strategies.

Project Management

Looking at the wide geographical range of the projects, the great amount and complexity of their actions, and the large number of stakeholders involved, staffing seems to have been scarce at all levels: HQ and countries. The evaluation also learned that the burdensome ILO financial and administrative rules and procedures did not contribute in supporting the project's implementation.

However, the evaluation found the overall project management satisfactory. Project staff, both at ILO HQ and in the countries adapted to the needs of each situation and the impact of constraints was minimized.

Relevance

Both the *education* and *skills* projects were highly relevant. Not only is quality education key in preventing and fighting child labour, but also child labour seriously hinders school enrolment and attendance. In the countries where it was implemented, the project turned out to be fully relevant and resulted in the withdrawal of many children from working conditions and in their increased attendance to school or skill training programmes.

Regarding the projects' current relevance, at the global level, the ILO has a key role to play and its potential to contribute to the global efforts on child labour and education/skills training is of great importance. At the

national level, the project remained highly relevant during its implementation but there is still room to continue mainstreaming child labour issues in the education and TVET policies and programmes; to fully develop or reinforce key partner involvement; and to improve the quality of interventions. Concerning their potential to be scaled up and replicated the "Dutch Projects" have contributed to test and validate effective strategies that link education and skills training to the fight against child labour. Therefore, the potential for scaling up and replicating the project is not only very strong, it is also highly recommended.

Effectiveness and efficiency

The evaluation considers that the *education* project has been effective in achieving its intended goals and finds that: it had significant influence on national policies, debates and institutions that are involved in child labour issues; demonstrated to be effective in promoting/strengthening international partnerships and advocating against child labour; and was successful in developing a useful guide, with relevant information, to increase knowledge on child labour and education issues and support skills-training activities.

The *skills* project has been very effective in delivering the planned training programmes to children within ages 14-17 in the selected countries; taking significant steps towards strengthening the capacities of the training providers; and contributing to an improved knowledge base in rural areas concerning child labour, skills and youth employment issues.

Regarding the efficiency, the evaluation concludes that project implementation was indeed carried out with a high level of efficiency and that the costs are fully justified by the results obtained.

Major contributions towards impact

The evaluation believes that the project's results and achievements contributed to eliminating child labour by enhancing access to education and by enhancing access to decent work for children who have reached the minimum age of employment. Moreover, the project has generated and has the potential to continue generating significant impacts related to national education and TVET policies; capacity building; enhanced access to quality education and skills training; and withdrawal and prevention of children from child labour.

Sustainability

The main strategy for assuring sustainability of project results was mainstreaming child labour into national education plans and programmes. The skills training project intended to link its interventions to broader normative frameworks by raising the issue of the need for skills training of older children. Efforts in this line are ongoing but they have not yet reached their goals. Considering that these approaches are indeed relevant, further efforts should be invested in both strategies.

Recommendations

A. General recommendations

1. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC, national stakeholders and donors: *Maintain support to national efforts in current “pilot” countries*, in order to improve the use of generated outputs for strategy and policy formulation, and to consolidate ongoing education and skills training initiatives
2. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC: *strengthen the ILO’s role in the international/global arena*. The ILO-IPEC holds a privileged status to guarantee that child labour and education become a high priority on the international agenda and that national actions receive the necessary support. It is also recommended that the ILO establishes strategic long-term partnerships with current and new allies.
3. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC: *Design a “Global Programme” on quality education and skills training to combat child labour*. The FPRW-IPEC should design an integrated and ambitious long-term programme on *quality education and skills training to combat child labour*, regardless of the funding arrangements of its actions at the different levels.
4. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC and national stakeholders: *A greater degree of anchoring is required for the Programme in the different countries*. The design process should be based on participatory consultations and should also take into

account the different national contexts, needs, and constraints.

5. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC: *develop a funding and sustainability plan for the Programme*. It is recommended to begin with a complete budget of all the activities that are covered by the project and to include a funding strategy that can assure their effective implementation (viability) and guarantee their continuity (sustainability).
6. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC: *Well-performing monitoring processes and instruments need to be put in place*. This could be done by designing and implementing: a) Comprehensive Monitoring and Evaluation Systems (CMES); b) End-line surveys; c) Impact evaluations; d) Tracer studies.
7. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC: In order to allow project activities to make the necessary adjustments in response to the needs and evolution of specific national/local contexts, it is recommended to make room for more flexibility in the administrative and financial procedures and to permit a higher degree of autonomy for the Country Offices.

B. Specific recommendations: *while recommendations 8 to 11 apply to all countries, recommendations 12 to 16 refer to very specific and significant issues in each of the countries selected for this project.*

1. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC and national stakeholders: *Improve education quality*. The evaluation strongly advises to reinforce project activities aimed towards increasing the quality of education.
2. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC and national stakeholders: *Increase the relevance of the training programmes*. The main criterion for designing the curriculum of skills-training courses should always be the relevance of its content with regards to market opportunities. It is also necessary to adapt times and duration of the courses. It is also important to systematically integrate a gender approach to skills

training programmes. Additionally, it would be convenient to strengthen systematic follow-up procedures of internship programs and to improve employment counselling and intermediation.

3. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC and Employers' organizations: *Establish cooperation agreements with Employers' Organisations.* To include these organisations in developing sensitisation campaigns for their members, participating in direct intervention initiatives and facilitating apprenticeships, internships and employment opportunities for skills training participants.
4. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC and Workers' organizations: *Strengthen the participation of trade unions.* Education trade unions should be strengthened for the purpose of: carrying out awareness raising campaigns; contribute to the formation and sensitization of teachers; and advocate for mainstreaming child labour issues into education policies and programmes. A global, strategic and long term partnership with Education International could be very helpful to achieve these goals.
5. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC, DNA, APEJ and FIDA. *Mali: take advantage of the existing opportunities and resources to strengthen skills training in rural areas and establish strategic partnerships with the DNA, the APEJ and the FIDA in order to reinforce and find new ways of providing training in rural areas.*
6. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC and the Ugandan Ministries of Labour and Education. *Uganda: reinforce the operation capacities and effectiveness of the joint committee on child labour and education.* Provide support to the Ministries of labour and Education in order to reinforce the operational capacities and effectiveness of the joint committee on child labour and education.
7. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC and national stakeholders. *Bolivia: Strengthen the formal (educación regular) and non-formal (educación alternativa) education complementarities and linkages, in order to consolidate and expand good practices in skills training.* Skills training programs and good experiences could be mainstreamed into the development framework of humanistic and technical education according to the law in Bolivia, as long as these experiences are seen as relevant enough to be integrated in the education sector.
8. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC and national stakeholders. *Indonesia: focus at the decentralized level; strengthen coordination to implement the roadmap; and link One Roof Schools with skills training.* It is suggested to focus advocacy efforts on the province level (especially with the education services) and to intensively engage local policy making in order to achieve significant changes. It is also, recommended to establish coordination mechanisms among relevant parties in order to contribute to implementing and monitoring the *Roadmap towards a Child Labour-Free Indonesia*. Finally, there is an opportunity to provide alternatives for One Roof School graduates who may be interested in specific vocational training. Experiences drawn from the project could be replicated in One Roof Schools where the project is present. These schools could collaborate with project IAs and government training providers (BLKs).
9. Addressed to: the ILO/IPEC and NITA. *Kenya: Official Certification.* There is urgent need to bring on board institutions such as the National Industrial Training Authority (NITA) that can offer official certification for skills training programmes.

See the full report for lessons learned and good practices.