



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Achieving Reduction of Child Labour in Support of Education- (ARISE II) Zambia - Independent Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries:	<i>Zambia</i>
Evaluation timing:	<i>Final</i>
Evaluation Mode:	<i>Independent</i>
Administrative Office:	<i>CO-Lusaka</i>
Technical Office:	<i>FUNDAMENTALS</i>
Evaluation Manager:	<i>Dereje Alemu</i>
Evaluation Consultant(s):	<i>Stephen Chipala</i>
Project Code:	<i>ZAM/14/02/JTI</i>
Donor(s) & Budget:	<i>JTI (US\$ 1,283,776)</i>
Keywords:	<i>Child Labour, Prevention, withdraw & Referral</i>

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

In October 2011, Japan Tobacco International (JTI), the International Labour Organization (ILO) and Winrock International signed an agreement under which JTI would support the project; 'ARISE – Children's Opportunities through Investment in Community Education' in Brazil

and Malawi. In 2012 Zambia was added as a third country to implement the ARISE project.

The ARISE project engaged communities and other social partners to raise awareness on child labor and together find solutions to the challenges. The project managed to set the ground for consolidated, concerted community and multi-sectorial efforts in addressing child labor in Kaoma and Nkeyema districts.

In phase II (ARISE II), the project aimed at scaling-up the gains of the first phase through a capacity building approach with a focus to building sustainable models. The ARISE II is part of IPEC and was funded by Japan Tobacco International. The project budget totaled USD 1,283,776. ARISE II continued with the same strategic thrusts and built on the objectives of the first phase which are as follows:-

- 1: By the end of the project, the capacity of community members and stakeholders on child labour issues and their role as change agents and monitors is strengthened;
- 2: By the end of the project, target community structures, schools and households in tobacco-growing communities undertake IGAs; and
- 3: By the end of the project, national and local capacity to implement and enforce the legal,

regulatory and policy frameworks for the elimination of child labour and promotion of education will be enhanced.

The project used the Integrated Area Based Approach (IABA) to implement the activities. Multi actors were involved, such as government departments, NGOs, traditional leadership and the church.

The Project was implemented in Kaoma and Nkeyema Districts of Western Province. In Kaoma, it covered the following communities: Namaloba, Kamuni, Mulalila, Chitwa, Kajejeje and Kanabilumbu while in Nkeyema, the project was implemented in Munkuye A, Shimano, Kamasisi, Kandende, Kambwize and Kamungomba.

The project was managed by the ILO Arise II project team. A regional office in Kaoma headed by the M&E Project assistant oversaw the implementation of the project using implementing partners (IPs). The project staff coordinated the activities through the District Child Labour Committees (DCLC) at the district level while using the Community Child Labour Committees (CCLCS) at community level.

For the SHGs and IGAs the implementing partners through Field agents managed the activities with the help of the Departments of Community Development, Education and Social Welfare.

Present Situation of the Project

The project was phased out at the end of September, 2018. Currently, the activities of the project in the aftermath of the cessation of the fund are being overseen by the DCLC. Additionally, government departments such as Community Development, Social Welfare, Labour, and Zambia Police services – Victim Support Unit (VSU) have continued to implement some activities in order to sustain the results of the project.

At community level Community Child Labour Committees have continued to sensitize community members on the issues of child labour. Furthermore, the committees have also continued to supervise the SHGs, household and school IGAs.

The CCLCs have continued working with the DCLC in the two districts. Reports on issues of child labour are generated by the CCLCs at community level and communicated to the DCLC.

The JTI Leaf Production Technicians have also continued to monitor issues of child labour as they carry out their routine duties in the farming communities.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The end of project evaluation assessed the project's outcome, using the OEDC criteria relevancy, validity, efficiency, effectiveness and impact, sustainability and possible future impact by comparing end of project data after the three years of implementation with baseline information and through utilization of other means such as group discussions and Key Informant Interviews.

The final evaluation serves two main purposes:

- a) Give a final assessment of the project in achieving project objectives and delivery of results; strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints and opportunities; and
- b) Provide recommendations for future similar project in terms of strategies, institutional arrangements, and any other area.

The evaluation focused on the implementation period November 2015 – September 2018. The evaluation assessed all key outcomes and outputs that have been produced since the start of the project by all implementing partners.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation used a classical approach due to time constraints and the nature of the season in the two districts. Classical approach in evaluation focuses on assessing managerial and organizational inconsistencies emphasizing the position and organization structures and how results are achieved rather than individuals. It is mainly concerned with assessing the efficiency and effectiveness of organizational structures, systems, procedures and regulations and based on management practices, and results being achieved¹.

As a result, a judicious combination of quantitative and qualitative techniques was used with a particular emphasis placed on the latter, given that the majority of the objectives and results pursued by the project were based on strengthening of capacities. In this case, a qualitative approach was vital to the evaluation.

3.2 Methods of data collection applied

For the application of the tools mentioned above the following criteria will be used:

- a) **Literature Review:** The Consultant reviewed the available documents that include the technical progress/status reports, key performance indicators reports, other studies and research undertaken. The review provided highlights of what has been written about child labour, the gaps and the reason/void for the current study.
- b) **Structured Interviews with Key Informants:** Interviews were conducted with key actors: ILO ARISE Project staff, WI staff, JTI Zambia staff, representatives of ZCTU, ZFE, MLSS, ARISE implementing partners, school managers, traditional leaders and school focal point persons.

- c) **Focus Group Discussions:** This instrument was utilized to collect data from homogeneous groups representing different community groups, such as the DCLC, CCLC, JTI extension officers and leaf technicians, parents, household beneficiaries, pupils, teachers and staff of ARISE implementing partners.
- d) **Transect Walk:** This instrument was used to check on the tangible results, such as the fish ponds, piggeries, cassava fields, goats and poultry houses.

For structured interviews and focus group discussions interview guides were developed to guide the evaluation.

There were several limitations to the study that include the following:

- i. Rainy (farming) season
- ii. School and annual holidays
- iii. No school administration data
- iv. No group records on the performance of the SHGs and IGAs

Main Findings & Conclusions

- i. Overall, the Project has been perceived by project partners and beneficiaries as relevant and is aligned with country priorities and needs and SDGs targets and indicators. The project results met the needs and expectations of the target groups and addressed the identified problems. However, the initial needs and problems continued to exist and new ones have emerged.
- ii. Links were established with other activities of the UN or non-UN international development aid organizations at local level.

¹ Effective Project Management (2000)

Through these links, 49 prevented and withdrawn children are being sponsored to formal education through KWT in Grades 8 and 9 at Kalumwange and Lunyati Secondary Schools in Kaoma District.

- iii. The evaluation results show that the project objectives are still valid as the main causes of the child labour still exist. In addition, the needs and problems that were identified still exist and new ones are emerging. It is also apparent that GRZ organizations dealing with child labour need more capacity building.
- iv. The ARISE II Project made effort towards being cost-efficient. The project cut costs where possible by sharing necessary resources like vehicles when carrying out activities in the target communities and using government infrastructures such as schools for the training for SHG and IGA members in various training interventions. Additionally, the project used local trainers from member departments belonging to the DCLC, such MOA, MOE, MLSS and MCDSS to conduct most of the training courses.
- v. The financial resources were made available on time for project implementation depending on the submission of the activity reports, which were very positive for the success of most of the activities. However, some budget lines were insufficient for certain activities, and activity implementation had to be revised in some instances. One of the areas that were adversely affected by insufficient budget line was the project monitoring by the DCLC and IPs that had insufficient budget line.
- vi. The evaluation results indicated that the project was effective in terms of awareness-raising on child labour issues. Some

communities that were not targeted by the project are demanding for the project to be scaled and replicated in their areas so that their children and parents benefit from the support rendered by the project. Additionally, the involvement of JTI leaf production technicians and GRZ departments in sensitization campaigns assisted in the dissemination of the child labour messages in the communities. The use of the traditional leaders as ambassadors of child labour had a telling influence, too.

- vii. The evaluation identified unintended results of the project. Nevertheless they did not have any effects on the intended project results. One of the unintended results was the unwillingness of some prevented and withdrawn children in assisting their parents/guardians in home chores. Parents/guardians complained that the awareness of their rights to some extent has encouraged children being lazy and at times rude.
- viii. A total of 48 SHGs have been formed, out of these groups 58% are active in saving and lending. The members of each group are also involved in small businesses. The groups are monitored by the Field Agents/ Community facilitators. Some of the groups performed well with their savings and are doing well in their individual member businesses, especially in Nkeyema. According to the JCM final report, the current cumulative savings for 24 SHGs in all the six communities in Nkeyema stands at US Dollar 5,463.5. In all the six communities in Kaoma, the active 11 SHGs had cumulative savings of Us Dollar 1,390 at the time of the evaluation. Lack of commitment to saving among members coupled with lack of profitable business opportunities in their communities

contributed to the inactivity of the other (42%). Additionally, members of the inactive groups stated that it was difficult to find ready market for the agricultural products.

- ix. The evaluation findings show that the project results will be sustained in the long term. This is evidenced by the structures that have been put in place at district and community levels and most of the activities that were undertaken by the project are being done by GRZ departments.

included in the vocational and business management skills curriculum.

- v. There is need for ILO to conduct a study one year after ARISE II phased out to determine the impact of the SHGs and IGAs in the communities.
- vi. There is need for ILO to verify any data on child labour in Zambia with the Ministry of Labour and Social Security before publishing it as there are many organizations engaged in child labour but with poor data collection systems in place.

Recommendations

Based on the findings of the evaluation herewith are summary points of the recommendation:

- i. The Government of Republic of Zambia (GRZ) should integrate SCREAM Manual in the Pre - Service Teachers' Training Curriculum;
- ii. MLSS should lobby the GRZ for a budget line for the DCLCs;
- iii. GRZ and JTI should consider increasing classroom space by building new schools, particularly secondary schools, in the two districts to cater for the increased number of children in the communities. They should also consider introducing transitional literacy classes for children (7-14 years) who have never been in school before enrolling them in schools;
- iv. ILO and JTI should improve the quality of education offered by the Community Vocational Skills Centres and Business Management Skills by engaging qualified trainers. Additionally, robust youth mentoring programme for the trainees should be part of the programme to be

Main lessons

- i. Integrated, area based and multi actor approach is clearly achievable when all key stakeholders involved in the project play their roles accordingly and follow the planned activities.
- ii. It is difficult to convince communities when trust is lost. It requires social mobilization that is enhanced through community involvement and consensus building

Main good practices

- i. Complementarity of the core activities of the project with others is very cardinal.
- ii. The permanent national steering committee to oversee the implementation of the CL-NAP together with community empowerment, advocacy and local level capacity building for social partners holds the greatest promise for sustainable change.
- iii. The registration of CCLCs with the Registrar of Societies as legal entities enables the CCLCs to access incentives, such as funding, and agricultural inputs through farmers input support program (FISP).