



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Youth4OSH: Occupational Safety and Health for Young Workers and Young Employers in Global Supply Chains – Building a Culture of Prevention

Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: *Indonesia, Myanmar, the Philippines,
Viet Nam*

Final Evaluation: 28 June 2019

Evaluation Mode: *Independent*

Administrative Office: *ILO Country Office for
Indonesia and Timor Leste*

Technical Office: *LABADMIN/OSH*

Evaluation Manager: *Pamornrat Pringsulaka*

Evaluation Consultants: *Ruth Bowen*

Project Code: *RAS/16/05/USC (105880)*

Donor(s) & Budget: *Disney Company
(USD\$ 1 million)*

Keywords: *occupational safety and health, youth,
young workers, global supply chains,
communications, construction, manufacturing,
agriculture*

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose and structure

The project focuses on reducing the occupational injuries and fatalities among young workers, aged 15 to 24 years, who suffer up to 40 per cent higher rates of non-fatal occupational injuries than older workers according to ILO reports.

Youth4OSH sought to address one of the key factors contributing to high injury rates among young workers: the lack of awareness on occupational safety and health (OSH) among young workers as well as among young employers. The project was implemented in conjunction with the ILO Safe Youth at Work Project, funded by the US Department of Labor, which also addresses youth OSH and focuses on the improvement of national systems and institutional capacity to enhance youth occupational safety and health as well as awareness raising efforts.

The goal of Youth4OSH was to increase preventative safety and health actions by young workers and young employers in Indonesia, Myanmar, the Philippines and Viet Nam. The project was delivered through three components:

- 1) Create communication tools to educate young workers and young employers on OSH issues and pilot them in one or more sectors.
- 2) Empower young workers and young employers through their representation at the XXI World Congress on Safety and Health at Work to promote public engagement on OSH issues and increase popular demand for safer and healthier workplaces.

3) Collaborate with national and regional partners to develop and activate “networks of intermediaries” -- including young workers and young employers -- to effectively promote OSH awareness and action in their workplaces and communities.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation was to support accountability and to contribute to organizational learning of the ILO, the donor and implementing partners. The scope included all implementation areas and all activities implemented until the time of the final evaluation.

The objectives were to assess the design validity, relevance, effectiveness of interventions, efficiency of resource use, sustainability, and potential impact of the project. Additionally, the evaluation was intended to document lessons learned and good practices and make recommendations to enhance the achievement of this project and towards improving future projects.

Evaluation methodology

The evaluation was based on a triangulation of information from qualitative interviews with project stakeholders and a desk review of documentation. Interviews were conducted with ILO constituents in Indonesia, youth participants in Indonesia, Viet Nam and the Philippines, Country Office staff in Indonesia, former project staff, ILO specialists in Geneva, Safe Youth@ Work project staff, Myanmar CO staff, Philippines CO staff, and external collaborators in Bangkok and the Philippines. The evaluator conducted face-to-face interviews in Jakarta and Hanoi and remaining interviews were held via Skype.

The main field work was conducted in Jakarta from 13 to 17 May 2019. A stakeholder validation workshop was held in Jakarta on 16 May, with participants from the Ministry of Manpower (OSH Sub-Directorate), trade union confederations, the Indonesia employers’ association and youth champions, where the preliminary findings were presented and discussed.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Design and relevance

The focus on creating OSH communications tools for young workers and capacitating relevant networks to

use them in advocacy was sound and feasible within the timeframe. The three component outcomes were well linked to each other but could have been more clearly specified and distinguished from each other. However, the project outcomes were limited to building the capacity of intermediary partner networks to use the new communication tools. The timeframe was too short to extend to the usage of the tools with young workers and young employers themselves, which would have increased the potential project impact.

The geographic targeting of the four countries in Asia where the Safe Youth@Work project operates was relevant, but the four-country scope was too broad given the available human and financial resources.

The empowerment of youth champions for OSH for young workers in the target sectors, one of the key outcomes, was intended to raise broad public awareness and demand for safer workplaces. This objective was valid, but the recruitment strategy did not target youth champions with institutional linkages to young workers and employers in the targeted sectors, which may have increased their effectiveness as advocates.

The focus on young workers’ occupational safety and health was perceived as highly relevant to tripartite and civil society participants in Indonesia and the Philippines, based on consultations with the constituents in Indonesia and key informants in the Philippines. In Viet Nam and Myanmar the relevance of Youth4OSH strategies to constituents was more difficult to determine as the project did not gain a strong foothold in its own right; but in both countries the constituents were well engaged in the Safe Youth@Work ‘partner’ project. In Myanmar the project was represented on the OSH portfolio advisory group which promoted stakeholder consultation across the related projects.

The project’s comprehensive assessment of preferred communications channels and OSH issues among young workers and young employers provided a sound basis to ensure that the communications media and contents will be relevant to the ultimate beneficiaries in each country.

Effectiveness of the interventions

Overall, the project was most successful in Indonesia and the Philippines where, toward the end of the project, several networks were committed to applying the project's toolboxes with young workers and had improved their capacity to do so. In Myanmar the collaboration with the Vision Zero Fund project enabled adaptation and application of Youth4OSH materials to train employers' and workers' organizations for the ginger and garments supply chains. In Viet Nam, some of the project's communications materials were shared among tripartite partners but the project did not engage directly with intermediary networks, in part due to strict government regulations governing international cooperation projects. Overall, the project's achievements were limited by the implementation strategy which did not give early priority to progressing components 1 and 3.

Per component:

Component 1. Youth4OSH developed an innovative online, interactive communications portal by the end of the project. The project benefited from a comprehensive assessment process to develop a relevant communications strategy, delivered principally through an online portal with social media interactive facility, known as the Youth4OSH communications platform. This was enriched by ILO know-how on occupational safety and health for young workers.

Component 2. The coaching and mentoring of youth participants at the WCSH in cooperation with Safe Youth @Work brought unexpected dividends. Youth4OSH together with Safe Youth@Work, succeeded in generating significant media coverage and social media mobilization around its key themes, putting OSH for young workers on the agenda of key regional forums such as ASEAN OSHNET conferences, and on the global agenda at the XXI WCSH. The youth delegates who participated in the WCSH were inspired by 'design thinking' coaching at the congress. The Philippines youth champions were empowered to subsequently establish an OSH for youth NGO. Indonesian and Philippine youth champions also replicated the 'safe jam' awareness raising method; while Vietnamese and Myanmar youth remained active on social media following the Congress. While the youth champions proved to be an excellent channel to reach young activists, university students, and some workplaces, their composition, based on selection through a media competition, did

not result in a representation of young workers from the target sectors. A more targeted recruitment strategy could have included a higher representation of trade union youth and young employers.

Component 3. The project made substantial progress in engaging relevant networks for outreach to young workers in Indonesia and the Philippines. The project identified a wide range of potential advocacy networks at country level and regionally. In Indonesia it made substantive progress in engaging the National OSH Council (DK3N), the trade union confederations and the Indonesian Employers' Association and gained their commitment to utilize the communications tools produced. In the Philippines, the youth champions and their new NGO group are fully engaged to carry the work forward and the OSH Center, trade unions and Employers' Confederation are interested to use the platform. In Myanmar and Viet Nam the project's role in activating advocacy networks was not evident.

Management and resource efficiency

The effective implementation of the project was hindered by limited staff resources which made it highly challenging to progress activities evenly across the four countries and at regional level. Coordination with the Safe Youth@Work Project was successful for specific jointly conducted activities, but would have been improved by an overall coordination strategy. Overall, financial resources were used efficiently.

Sustainability

The evaluation suggests the main communications product, the Youth4OSH communications portal will be able to operate successfully provided the ILO makes transitional support available to the Indonesian National OSH Council. The networks of youth champions, particularly in the Philippines and Indonesia, have good prospects of continuing their advocacy actions beyond the project life. The main impacts of the project together with the Safe Youth@Work project are seen in raising the priority of OSH for young workers on the agendas of national constituents, regional and global OSH bodies.

Emerging good practices

1. Design thinking approach to developing creative OSH solutions

Both the Youth4OSH and Safe Youth@Work projects benefited from the design thinking approach

introduced by the communications consultants. Design thinking is a problem solving approach that allows participants to brainstorm problems and come up with innovative and practical solutions. The youth champions found the method to be highly effective and empowering for them in developing and presenting OSH solutions.

2. Fostering and empowering youth champions to raise awareness of OSH in the wider society

The intensive coaching and mentoring of youth champions by the project resulted in core groups of youth leaders in the target countries who have continued to take action on the issue of OSH for youth in their spheres of influence almost two years after their initial participation in the World Congress.

3. Online platform for knowledge sharing and advocacy among youth. The Youth4OSH portal with social media interactivity is an emerging good practice for dissemination of OSH and decent work messages to young members of society including young workers and advocates.

Lessons learned

1. It is necessary to engage project staff in-country in multi-country projects and match geographical scope with available resources. The project achievements were hindered by the lack of locally based project staff in Viet Nam, the Philippines and Myanmar.

2. The design and implementation of projects aimed at raising young workers' OSH awareness need to actively involve and reach vulnerable young workers.

Recommendations

Recommendations to enhance project achievements

1. ILO Jakarta should provide technical follow-up support to the OSH communications portal

- Provide transitional technical support to the DK3N through consultancy of the web designer while its designated personnel are gaining familiarity with the web portal and the content editor role.
- ILO and DK3N review the usage and operation of the portal together at regular intervals in the first year of operation.

2. Promote the Youth4OSH communications portal widely among constituents, youth

champions and OSH networks in the target countries, the SEA Region and beyond

- ILO Jakarta should ensure that the ROAP Senior OSH Specialist is familiar with the Youth4OSH communications platform who can promote it among regional OSH networks (e.g. ASEAN OSH-Net) and ILO OSH projects in the region.
- Promote the OSH portal among vocational training schools (ILO/National OSH Council)
- CO-Philippines together with Youth Champions should use social media to promote the portal among potential users.

3. Promote the voice of youth champions in national tripartite OSH bodies and facilitate linkages with tripartite-constituents in Indonesia and the Philippines

Prior to and following the end of the project, ILO Jakarta should engage with DK3N to facilitate the formation of the Youth Taskforce within the DK3N and engage the youth representatives in the content editing and promotion of the OSH portal.

4. Promote the 'OSHnopoly' board game to educate young workers on OSH issues and reproduce in hard copy and digital version

- ILO Jakarta should invest in the production of a digitized, multi-player version of the game that can be used in multiple languages.
- ILO Jakarta in conjunction with country offices in Viet Nam and Myanmar should promote the testing and dissemination of the game among relevant networks in Viet Nam and Myanmar.

Recommendations for future projects:

5. Engage young workers and employers from high risk sectors in OSH advocacy and peer training

- Include representation of workers with institutional links to the targeted vulnerable sectors among youth advocates for young workers and OSH and other decent work rights.
- Engage young workers from high risk sectors as peer trainers in their workplaces, in partnership with trade unions and employers' organizations.
- Future projects should engage with young entrepreneurs as OSH advocates, focused on the principle that OSH is the primary responsibility of the employer..

6. Engage with vocational training colleges and other training providers to reach future workers and future employers in high risk sectors by integrating innovative OSH training modules in vocational training and business course curricula.
7. Develop and disseminate gender-specific messaging in future projects on awareness of OSH for youth and messaging applying to persons with disabilities.