



Evaluation Summary



Evaluation
Office

Livelihood restoration and protection and sustainable empowerment of vulnerable peasant communities in Sindh Province – Independent final evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: *Pakistan*

Final Evaluation: *May 2016*

Mode of Evaluation: *Independent*

Administrative Office: *CO-Pakistan*

Technical Office: *DWT-Bangkok*

Evaluation Manager: *Rakawin
Leechanavanichpan, Regional Office-Bangkok*

Evaluation Consultant: *John G. Connell and
Raja Hasrat*

Project End: *30 June 2016*

Project Code: *PAK/13/01/HSF*

Donor & Project Budget: *UNTFHS (US\$
4,698,544)*

Keywords: *Natural disaster, livelihood recovery,
tenancy, gender, conservation agriculture, disaster
risk reduction.*

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

In July, 2010, monsoon rains caused flooding affecting the length of Pakistan. Sindh was the most severely affected province with Dadu one of the Districts suffering highest losses. Widespread heavy rains in August 2011 again resulted in

devastating flooding across Sindh with Mirpur Khas one of the most affected districts. Thirty-five percent of the affected population had been affected by the 2010 floods.

In response to the devastating floods, the International Labor Organization (ILO) in collaboration with Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) and UN-WOMEN under the OneUN launched a three year project (2013-2016) titled “Livelihood Restoration, Protection and Sustainable Empowerment of Vulnerable Peasant Communities in Sindh Province” in 120 villages of Dadu and Mirpurkhas Districts.

The project overall objective was “to restore and protect the livelihoods and empower the poor and vulnerable peasants (men, women, boys, and girls) dependent on feudal and tribal landholding and farming systems and affected by droughts, floods and insecurity”

This was to be achieved through the following strategies/outputs (a) improving the livelihoods and economic security; (b) enhancing skills and knowledge; and (c) empowering peasant organization and building resilience against further shocks.

The project was worth USD 4,698,544.37 (FAO as lead agency getting 2,863,400.88, ILO getting 1,056,617.55 and the UN Women getting 777,525.94). The United Nations Trust Fund for Human Security (UNTFHS) funded the project.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The evaluation aims to promote accountability and organizational learning among the stakeholders including the ILO, FAO and UN WOMEN. The evaluation visited selected sites where beneficiaries, local government partners and ILO’s institutional

partners (i.e. FAO and UN WOMEN) were involved as key informants.

The clients of the evaluation are the ILO, FAO and Un WOMEN Country Offices and Project Team; Technical specialist of ILO, FAO and UN WOMEN DWT-Bangkok and Headquarters; tripartite constituents; and the donor (UNHSTF).

Methodology of evaluation

This included; (a) desk study of relevant documents ; (b) Field visits for interview with stakeholders and direct observations (24 May – 02 June, 2016); (c) Feed-back and consultation with stakeholders to confirm findings.

Limitations

Due to limited resources, a tight time scale and long travel distances only 4 of the 60 target villages in Mirphu Khas and 2 of the 60 target villages in Dadu were visited. Data collection at these sites was restricted to single-visit interviews. A number of technical reports were not available (eg PMG feasibility studies, training curricula, early annual reports). Due to lack of cross-referencing between activities, the evaluation used the data sheets to assess overlap of beneficiaries across activities to reach an assessment of final beneficiary numbers.

Main Findings

Strategic fit

The project addressed the immediate effects of rehabilitating the flood victims while at the same time addressing endemic constraints to Human Security in Sindh province. In particular it addressed the issues of an entrenched tenancy system, inequitable gender balance and poor access to services of the vulnerable. In doing this has provided ground breaking initiative for transparent tenancy agreements based on the Sindh Tenancy Act 1950, and Sindh Industrial Relations Act 2013, which could have a profound effect long term implications for hari farmers.

Validity of Design

The project activities were reinforcing and coherent

- Enabling of agriculture production, through rehabilitation of irrigation infrastructure
- Improve productivity of the rehabilitated systems through improved practices and conservation strategies
- Gain additional income from agriculture through supporting micro-enterprise added-value, along with micro finance, savings groups and development of entrepreneurial skills.
- Development of skills for off-farm employment, through vocational training.
- Address the structural problems that underwrite the sustainability of benefits, through: written tenancy agreements; recognition of women's rights and capacities, disaster risk reduction, enabling social dialogue and building of community organizations.

This was an excellent example of the Human Security and well implemented by OneUN to bring the rage of necessary skills; namely FAO; ILO and UN WOMEN.

The project design nicely structured activities to build upon base activities and to reinforce impacts (eg sub-sets of HHs included in irrigation rehabilitation, received additional assistance to develop PMG). This did mean that there was overlap in HH and or members of the same HH. As such the Human Security approach makes it difficult to assess discrete beneficiaries. Thus, while the approach is commendable, it does require careful structuring of the log frame and its indicators to enable informed management and final assessment of discrete beneficiaries. The structure of the logframe and indicators is something that could be examined for similar projects.

Project effectiveness.

The project reached 120 villages across the districts Mirpur Khas and Dadu. It exceeded target beneficiaries for most outputs and for the overall project objective, 12,200 rural families (103%) benefiting compared to the target of 11,800. However the number of hari family beneficiaries 7,838 (89%) were less than the target of 8,800. This was partly due to the overlapping activities, and men and women beneficiaries for separate

activities within the same family. But also due to high inclusion of non-hari families to ensure some activities (e.g. micro-finance, PMGs) were successful.

Impact

The impact of activities on livelihoods and addressing the structural issues was impressive. The project had profound effects in many areas.

These combined to provide an overall sense of opportunity for the beneficiaries. This was expressed as follows during a focus group interview in one village:

“our lives have changed from making-do, to one of prosperity, where we can begin to think of new opportunities” (trans).

This was they thought achieved through; *“the real way that we have changed and gained benefits, is through learning to plan and work together in various ways”*. (This is captured in Lessons Learnt 2#)

Agriculture: the repaired and installed irrigation systems increased delivery of water compared to before flooding, enabling an increase in land cultivated by 20-30%. Improved practices enabled increases in crop yields of typically 50 and as high as 100%. Similarly, diversification and multiple cropping further increased returns to land. ***Overall these increases are sufficient to move hari out of bonded tenancy, have surplus to sell and position them to explore new opportunities. Application of these practices saw rapid scaling-out with additional independent adopters of 50-100% within a single year.***

PMG: these were not fully operational when the evaluation visited, and so impacts had not accrued and could not be assessed. The farmers involved were well trained and aware of many operational issues. As such the activity is likely to provide significant value-added to the products, but for a quite small of, and better-off farmers

Micro-finance: This went mainly to fattening cattle, with modest returns. For hari recipients (40% of total microfinance beneficiaries) this enabled them to shift move into independent cattle ownership.

Vocational training and enterprise development: trainees gained employment (97%) within 12 mths, mostly at modest rates 500 PKR/mth. However this added to their confidence and positions them to seek further work within a growing market for skilled labour. Several had set up their own shop and employed others. Several received further training and set-up small-enterprises, bakery, IT shop, etc. trained others and so enabled them to seek work themselves.

Gender Imbalance: women had gained registration for National Identify Cards and thence access to services previously denied; they were better seen within the home and community as contributing to family welfare; had begun to step-out and engage in marketing; with Home Based Workers successfully conducting group negotiation for their labour. Altogether very significant results against entrenched views and systems.

Tenancy: this is long regarded as an intractable obstacle to livelihood development in the area. The ‘transparent tenancy agreements were achieved for 2414 (1200 HHs, by FAO and 1214 by UN Women) directly provided security of land access to vulnerable farmers. At a more profound level provided an entry point to begin to address the inequitable tenancy system.

Disaster Risk Reduction: introduced practical measures to consolidate dwelling through use of local materials (lime, brick dust etc.), skills in preserving food, revolving funds, etc. The most important intervention has been the development of Village Disaster Management Plans (with women included in the committees), which have been tested and will enable the village member to work together in event of new disasters.

Project Efficiency: The project suffered delays in start-up of at least eight months. Despite gaining a no-cost-extension of only 6 mth, the project team were still able to complete all activities. The average cost per beneficiary was about \$120/person. Two activities vocational training and micro finance were higher (\$460 and \$590 respectively), due to additional training costs and distribution of start-up kits.

Such costs apply to the direct beneficiaries only, and do not take into account the significant scaling-out effects. The agriculture activities and vocational training were already seeing very substantial scaling

out adding at least 50% through indirect beneficiaries. The value of the structural changes, such as improved gender balance, increased security through transparent tenancy agreements can't be assessed in monetary terms.

Sustainability: As indicated the agriculture and vocational activities are already being scaled out indicating the will persist and even continue to have wider impact. Some watch needs to be kept on agriculture as intensified cropping may be limited by soil fertility. However overall the establishment of various community organisations should play a key role in maintaining the application of improved practices not only in agriculture but also in other areas (e.g., Village Disaster Management Plans, etc.)

Recommendations

Main recommendations and follow-up

Project Design

1. Continue to use the Human Security framework for project design, and using the OneUN, employing FAO, ILO and UN WOMEN.
2. The project has provided various models that should be applied generally within the district and Sindh province, such as transparent tenancy agreement and gender equity. Design of a follow-up phase should apply these models but deliver them in more cost-effective ways and ways that build capacity of local government agencies. This can be done through;
 - design activities so that government agencies are progressively responsible for management and delivery
 - delivery mechanism such as FFS and WOS were effective to introduce new practices, but broader application can build on the now existing example and use other methods such as farmer2farmer approaches, which will build networks between communities at the same time

Project efficiency

3. Where the OneUN or multi-agency approach is used, it should be structured that; (a) there is overall project manager to coordinate all activities, and (b) a consolidated monitoring and evaluation system is used to track outputs and for reporting from all activities; and (c) the M+E system should include a family based tracking system to indicate the overall number of HHs and what activities each HH is engaged in.

Sustainability

4. The interventions that challenge the status quo, such as gender equality and transparent tenancy agreements, should be supported by studies that show the longer term macro-economic benefits to influence local decision makers.
5. To clarify the legal options for transparent tenancy agreements that will be manageable by farmers in case of conflict, the OneUN agencies responsible for this activity (FAO and UN WOMEN) should conduct a study that examines the legal options and the best pathways to deliver this in practice.