



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

“Improved labour migration governance to protect migrant workers and combat irregular migration”

Quick Facts

Countries:	<i>Ethiopia</i>
Final Evaluation:	<i>May-July 2021</i>
Evaluation Mode:	<i>Independent</i>
Administrative Office:	<i>ILO Country Office for Djibouti, Ethiopia, South Sudan, Sudan and Somalia</i>
Technical Office:	<i>MIGRANT</i>
Evaluation Manager:	<i>Inviolata Chinyangarara</i>
Evaluation Consultant(s):	<i>Sten Toft Petersen (International Consultant), Jonse Bane Boka (National Consultant)</i>
Project Code:	<i>ETH1602GBR</i>
Donor(s) & Budget:	<i>United Kingdom (US \$ 3.589.020)</i>
Keywords:	<i>Labour migration, governance, migrant workers, irregular migration, domestic workers</i>

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

This current project, under evaluation, was based on the experience gained from implementing an EU funded project on “Development of a Tripartite

Framework for the Support and Protection of Ethiopian Women Domestic Migrant Workers going to the Gulf Cooperation Council States, Lebanon and Sudan” that was phased out on July 31, 2016. The current project which is seen as a second phase of the EU funded project aimed to improve the governance of labour migration and to strengthen the protection of migrant workers’ rights.

The project’s objective was to address and reduce irregular migration by improving labour migration governance and by making regular labour migration more accessible and desirable to potential migrants in Ethiopia. This was pursued through two outcomes:

Outcome 1: Migrant workers are better protected through improved access to support services that empower them to make informed decisions and to claim their rights.

Outcome 2: Improved access to protection services of migrants is provided by Ethiopian missions and other relevant institutions.

A Project Steering Committee composed by ILO constituencies and a Technical Working Groups were established to follow the implementation of the project-**Present Situation of the Project**

Ethiopia is characterized by high level of youth unemployment, social unrests and conflicts and frequent droughts that affect livelihoods of households in rural and urban areas. These challenges coupled with the inducement from smugglers and traffickers and limited awareness or incorrect information from informal channels on consequences of crossing border via irregular channels among potential migrants, Ethiopian youths and women decide to informally migrate – mainly to the Middle East – to seek better job opportunities. These informal labour migrants are subject to several abuses, exploitations and harassments in the destination countries. The ILO recognizes the numerous decent work deficits faced by

Ethiopian labour migrants in the Middle East and Gulf States and it implemented the project: “Improved labour migration governance to protect migrant workers and combat irregular migration in Ethiopia”, funded by the British Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office. The project aimed to support the efforts of the Government of Ethiopia (GoE), social partners and civil society, to improve labour migration governance and to strengthen the protection of migrant workers’ rights, by making regular labour migration accessible and desirable to potential migrants, so that they do not opt for irregular migration. Under this project, the ILO supported the GoE and its partners in addressing irregular migration and the protection risks faced by migrants in countries of origin and destination, by working on legal and regulatory frameworks for fair recruitment, by strengthening and building the capacity of federal, regional, zonal and woreda government offices, as well as Ethiopian foreign missions, migrant communities and migrants themselves.

The project should have come to an end by December 2020, but due to the pandemic a non-cost extension to end of September 2021 was granted.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The independent evaluation had the following purposes:

- a) Establish the relevance of the project design and implementation strategy in relation to the ILO, UN and national development frameworks (i.e. SDGs and UNDAF) and final beneficiaries’ needs;
- b) Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives and expected results, while identifying the supporting factors and constraints that have led to them, including strategies and implementation modalities chosen, partnership arrangements;
- c) Identify unexpected positive and negative results of the project
- d) Assess the level of implementation efficiency of the project.
- e) Assess the extent to which the project outcomes will be sustainable;
- f) Analyze the project impact at institutional level as well as at the level of the final men and women beneficiaries
- g) Identify lessons learned and potential good practices, especially regarding models of interventions that can be applied further;
- h) Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to promote sustainability and support further development of the project outcomes

The focus is also to assess the impact, and emerging impact, of the interventions (either positive or negative) and the sustainability of the project’s beneficiaries as well as the local partners’ strategy and capacity to sustain them. It also examines the strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and challenges and any external factors that might have affected the achievement of the immediate objectives and the delivery of the project’s outputs. This final evaluation also assesses the extent to which the project responded to the Recommendations of the Mid-Term Evaluation, made in July 2019.

The evaluation took into account all of the geographic areas covered by the labour migration project (four national regional states namely Tigray, Amhara, Oromia and SNNPRS and Addis Ababa city Administration). It looked at, specifically, two locations of intervention: namely Areka and Werabe in SNNP regional state. It paid particular attention to any synergies between the components and contributions to national policies and programmes. This evaluation was intended help to understand how and why the project obtained or did not obtain specific results, from outputs to potential impacts.

The primary clients of the evaluation are the ILO national constituencies and partners, the ILO, and partners, as well as other relevant stakeholders and the donor.

The evaluation team integrated gender equality as a crosscutting concern throughout its deliverables and process, with special attention being paid to women workers. Likewise, it assessed tripartite issues and ILS.

Methodology of evaluation

This independent final evaluation aimed at assessing the extent to which the project objectives were achieved; analysing the impacts of the project on direct and indirect beneficiaries and identifying and documenting lessons-learned and good practices for both accountability and learning for possible similar interventions in the future. The final evaluation took into account all of the geographical areas covered by the labour migration project to generate all relevant information from relevant stakeholders at various levels via participatory and consultative approaches. Secondary data were also generated from several sources and triangulation of information from different sources was carefully made. The COVID-19 regime in place had a significant impact on the methodology chosen. The International Consultant could not conduct a field mission and the National Consultant’s possibilities for travel were also limited by the security situation in the country. This especially limited the

access to end-beneficiaries so some important inputs and perspectives may not have been obtained. The fare majority of interviews were conducted remotely.

The independent final evaluation complied with all of the evaluation norms and standards, and followed all ethical safeguards, as specified in the ILO's evaluation procedures. The ILO adheres to the United Nations Development Group's (UNDG) evaluation norms and standards, as well as their Evaluation Quality Standards.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Overall, the program's major impact is its contribution to reviewing and implementing the policy on labour migration. It also promoted safe migration and assisted institutional capacity building, in such a way that safe labour migration has become a natural and integrated part of the social, economic and political context within Ethiopia.

Relevance:

The relevance of the labour migration project was high. The objectives and outcomes of the project are very consistent with the beneficiaries' requirements, as the project was intended to support the implementation of the Proclamations and to protect migrant workers and their families, both overseas and in the pre-departure phase.

Coherence and validity of the Project design

The project was coherent with national and international policy developments. Because of the nature of the current project, the involvement of workers and especially employers' organisations in the project's implementation were relatively limited. The evaluation finds that the complex number of interventions, both from the current and the previous phase were effective in promoting fair and safe migration.

Effectiveness

The indicator of achievement talks about percentage increases in regular migration with a baseline of 17%. The target increase was 35% and a 48% increase was achieved. The evaluation finds that the project contributed well to an increase in regular migration.

The first Outcome: Migrant workers are better protected through improved access to support services that empower them to make informed decisions and to claim their rights.

The indicator for this outcome is the percentage of migrants who accessed support services in Ethiopia with a baseline of 56% (after Phase 1 of the project), and a target increase of 20%. This was well-achieved

as it was at 85% by June 2021. Another indicator was the number of regions with fully decentralised migration services. The target was four regions and two city administrations, and the project achieved four regions and one city administration.

The second Outcome: Enhanced capacity of government and relevant institutions to enhance protection of migrant workers and improve coordination with major countries of destination.

Seven diplomatic missions and diaspora groups are currently providing quality services to migrant workers. The project's target was three. This must be seen as a major achievement, and probably also indicated the good cooperation that is in place between ILO and MoLSA/MoFA. The project sees it as an achievement that 48% of migrants received improved services from diplomatic missions and relevant institutions, up from a baseline of 21%.

Financial and organizational efficiency

In terms of budget use efficiency, the project did well with a rate of budget use of nearly 100%, from 2017-2019 and above 100% in 2020. However, the budget use rate for 2021 is about 31% by June and the remaining funds are allocated for use before end of September when the project comes to an end. There are no implementation partners, in terms of finances. The project handles all financial and administrative matters itself.

Some planned activities were cancelled and the funds reallocated to COVID-19 humanitarian initiatives. They were – among others – used for shelters (renting and repairing) in Jeddah and Dubai. Resources were also allocated for victims who had been forced to return to Ethiopia. The COVID-19 emergency assistance, which amounted to more than 20% of the total budget, was delivered through partners (the diplomatic missions). However, all activities are prepared in close cooperation with the partners.

Impact orientation and sustainability

With updated policy and the governance instruments in place, efforts should now be made to secure the implementation of the policy. It will be important to follow any possible new trends in migration, post-COVID-19 and to be open to additional reforms and adjustments, as migration patterns change.

The CoC for OPEAs has been established, but its potential for protecting migrant workers against abuse and exploitation is still not being used. The CoC could become a strong tool for promoting safe and successful labour migration.

The GoE's policy is to increase the number of skilled migrant workers over time. The evaluation finds that

the project could have advised the government on how to find a way forward, using the strong expertise on employment and skills development available within the ILO. Taking into account the importance of remittances to the national economy, it is important to note that the experience from many (other) countries is that skilled (male) workers send relatively less money back to their families than low-skilled (female) workers. It is the evaluation's view that the labour migration policy would benefit from being seen as an integrated part of the national employment strategy.

Recommendations

1) The ILO should consider establishing a reporting format for project management to report on quality and impact of capacity building activities in their Program Performance Reports. The format used in the current project did not allow for such reporting even the staff conducted pre/post assessments in each capacity building activity.

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO	Medium	Medio	Low

2) The ILO should consider supporting an independent study of the new trends in labour migration, including the issue of women and men's undocumented migration both to the Middle East and Gulf states and to African countries South of Ethiopia where most male labour migrant are heading. Based on this, together with the constituents, it should develop adequate initiatives.

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO	High	Short-term	Medium

3) The GoE together with the ILO and possible other stakeholders are recommended to invest in securing that qualified staff and management in Overseas Private Employment Agencies with an understanding of the benefits of ethical, fair and safe regular migration is in place. Such well qualified staff will be essential to minimize the negative consequences of labour migration and increase the benefits for all parties.

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO and OPEA association	High	Medium	High

4) Establishing a negative list of agencies, which are in non-compliance with given rules and regulations, is considered in Ethiopia. Such an approach would require strong legal procedures and principles and could have some negative consequences. However, promoting a positive listing of those agencies in compliance could have a positive impact on the agencies' behaviour. It is recommended jointly to establish such a positive list.

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
GoE and OPEA association	Medium	Long-term	Low

5) To secure a gender balance among participants in project activities there is a practise of setting a target with "equal" participation in the capacity building activities (if it is not about empowerment of women where there could be only women participants). This approach however does not always make sense in the current project with 90% of potential domestic worker migrants being female an "equal" participation does not make sense. ILO GEDI (Gender Equality Diversity and Inclusion) should develop a guideline how to act in cases where "equal" participation does not make sense.

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
ILO GENDER (Dep.)	Medio	Long-term	Low

6) It is recommended that skills' recognition and certification be institutionalised by the application of international standards. Market intelligence should be developed to identify the market needs and standards of destination countries. Long- and short-term requirements should be identified. These initiatives should be seen as a part of a comprehensive national employment strategy.

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
GoE and ILO	High	Long-term	High

7) It is recommended to ensure that infrastructure including electricity and internet is available before investing in hardware requiring stable electricity and internet connection to be placed with partners. In this project investments were made in hardware, but electricity was not available in MICs meaning the equipment was not in use.

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
MoLSA/ILO	High	Short-term	Low

8) The focus of protection of labour migrants should also cover male migrants. Large outflow of male labour migrants towards the Southern parts of Africa are often not in a better situation than the women going to Middle East and Gulf states. Male migrants heading for Middle East and Gulf states also often find themselves in bounded labour situations and therefore also are in need for attention from Ethiopia. Informants found that the current project would have benefitted from paying more attention to male migrant workers; it was felt that the lack of attention is likely to push more into irregular migration.

Addressed to	Priority	Time frame	Resources
MoLSA/ILO	High	Long-term	High