

# **Evaluation Summary**



International Labour Office

Evaluation Office

### Decent Work for Sustainable and Inclusive Economic Transformation in Mozambique – Mid-term evaluation

#### **Quick Facts**

**Countries:** Mozambique Mid Term Evaluation: October-December 2019 **Evaluation Mode:** Independent Administrative Office: CO Lusaka, Zambia **Technical Office:** ILO DWT &; EMP/INVEST, Geneva **Evaluation Manager:** Baïzebbé Na Pahini Evaluation Consultant(s): Raquel Cabello, Rui Vasco MOZ/16/01/SWE **Project Code: Donor(s) & Budget: Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA)** (US\$ 9.5 Million)

Keywords:Unemployment,PublicEmploymentProgrammes,LabourIntensiveApproaches,Capacitydevelopment,EmplyementPolicy,Market systemdevelopment (MSD)

#### **Background & Context**

#### **Present Situation of the Project**

The ILO and the Government of Mozambigue with funding from the Government of Sweden are implementing a project on the promotion of Decent Work for Sustainable and Inclusive Economic Transformation in Mozambique, also known as the "MOZTRABALHA " project, justified by the recognized issue that the poverty challenges are closely linked to the employment situation. The total expected contribution from the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA) is 8.6 million USD (actual cost due to exchange rate) for 5 years, starting from 1<sup>st</sup> December 2016.

The project responds to the priorities identified in the National Employment Policy (NEP). It aims at creating opportunities for poor people, particularly women and young people in rural areas. Opportunities to start and run commercial business will also be enhanced. The interventions proposed will empower the poor and provide them with appropriate tools for improvement of their living conditions. The project also addresses pertinent issues related to labour rights and social dialogue mechanisms and structures in Mozambique.

The project MozTrabalha entails three objectives:

**"Immediate Objective 0" (Inception Phase): Project** is fully operational with a sound understanding of critical constraints which result in adverse employment, in selected sectors and geographic areas

**Immediate Objective 1.** Strengthen national policy and institutional environment leadings to increased promotion of decent employment and sustainable economic transformation.

**Immediate Objective 2**. Sectors are stimulated to create decent, sustainable and green employment opportunities for Mozambican women and men, in particular youth and those living in rural areas.

The project seeks to create and improve employment outcomes in both urban and rural areas, by focussing on a) implementation of employment-intensive market infrastructure investments, b) stimulate green jobs through small to mid-size enterprise (SME) development, and c) create opportunities and reducing constraints to accessing productive employment for women and female-headed households.

#### Purpose, scope and methodology of the evaluation

The main purpose of this mid-term independent evaluation is to provide an independent assessment of the progress to date, through an analysis of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, effects and orientation to impact of the project. The specific objectives of the evaluation are:

- Assess the implementation of the project to date, identifying factors affecting project implementation (positively and negatively). If necessary, propose revisions to the expected level of achievement of the objectives.
- 2. Analyse the implementation strategies of the project with regard to their potential effectiveness in achieving the project outcomes and impacts; including unexpected results.
- Review the institutional set-up, capacity for project implementation, coordination mechanisms and the use and usefulness of management tools including the project monitoring tools and work plans.
- 4. Review the strategies for sustainability.
- 5. Identify the contributions of the project to the National Development Plan, the SDGs, the ILO objectives and its synergy with other projects and programs.
- 6. Identify clear lessons and potential good practices for the key stakeholders.
- 7. Provide strategic recommendations for the different key stakeholders to improve the implementation of the project activities and the attainment of project objectives.

#### Scope of the evaluation

The mid-term evaluation covered the period January 2017-October 2019. The evaluation covered all the planned outputs and outcomes under the project, with particular attention to synergies between the components and contribution to national policies and programmes.

#### Methodology of evaluation

This mid-term evaluation took a systemic approach to understand how the project was on track to attempt its objectives and the causal relation established among inputs, outputs, and outcomes. To this end, a consultative and transparent approach has been adopted with internal and external stakeholders throughout the evaluation process, using a variety of methods for data collection and analysis to gather evidence, using primarily qualitative tools and methods.

The evaluation has followed the norms and standards of United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) and took into consideration the guidelines and methodologies of ILO EVAL office and the Glossary of key terms in evaluation and results-based management developed by the OECD's Development Assistance Committee (DAC).

#### Main Findings & Conclusions

#### Relevance

The project demonstrates relevance for supporting the implementation of the National Employment Policy (NEP); its action plans provide some examples of approaches to promote job creation, especially in support of fulfilling the Mozambique government's ambition to create three millions jobs in next five years. MozTrabalha is also relevant in supporting the country to fulfil its national priorities and international engagements.

The project has close links with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) framework, most prominently SDG #8 to "Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all". In doing so, it also contributes to the accomplishment of several other SDGs, such as #1 (end poverty), #2 (zero hunger), #5 (gender equality), #10 (reduced inequalities). Furthermore, the project is closely harmonised with the Mozambique UN Development Assistance Framework 2017 – 2020 (UNDAF); more specifically with outcomes 2, 4, 7, 8, 9 and 10.

Moreover, during the implementation the project has forged a relevant network of partnerships. Greater efficiency and effectiveness have been achieved, in some cases in a coordinated manner, in addition to achieving greater legitimacy and visibility of the project and the approaches and methodologies that it is proposing.

#### Effectiveness

Overall, the level of effectiveness at the time of the mid-term evaluation differs from one outcome to another. In general, the project is well-implemented, especially outcome 1 under which the project has supported the improvement of the capacity of Mozambican institutions, especially Ministry of Labour and Social Security (MITESS), the Labour Market Observatory (LMO), The National Institute for Employment (INEP) and the Labour Mediation and Arbitration Commission (COMAL). It has leveraged several events and processes, with one of the most relevant being the elaboration of the Action Plan for the NEP, using the methodology of multisector working groups. Indeed, the training provided by ILO to all social partners and the work done with COMAL has contributed significantly to the decrease of social conflict.

In addition, MozTrabalha has made crucial contributions to understand and manage the labour market in Mozambique through the support provided to the Labour Market Observatory (LMO) and the National Institute for Employment (INEP).

The other outputs of the first outcome are on track and will be completed by the end of the project. In this sense, the results of the pro-employment budgeting and labour-intensive investments approach promoted by the project are already visible, with an increasing interest from ministries on MozTrabalha support. In addition, the Enabling Environment for Sustainable Enterprises (EESE) process is well received and appreciated by all stakeholders involved.

The project is more focused on outputs than on outcomes/objectives. There is no actual monitoring of outcomes indicators but of the outputs indicators.

Regarding outcome 2, the pilot interventions were an excellent example of the approaches proposed, and with the potential of scaling up. However, they were not yet replicated. The project continues to promote them. Also, the analysis of the output 2.2 (Support provided to emerging, new and existing SMEs (incl. employing farmers) and Cooperatives in sectors that contribute to structural transformation and to improve environmental sustainability productivity, working conditions and formality of enterprise owners and their workers) is at an initial state and so it shows some limitations for its assessment. However, according to the evidence collected by the evaluation team, the construction materials value chain seems to be on the right track. On the other hand, regarding the agribusiness value chain, there are some elements that may jeopardize the Market System Development (MSD) approach promoted and presents some threats to the smallholders and ultimate beneficiaries that should be mitigated.

The management and governance structure have effective participation of tripartite constituents and has contributed to strength indirectly the Labour Consultative Commission. Despite the limited resources for communication, the MozTrabalha project team has been able to properly develop and implement a communication strategy.

The monitoring system (MRM) has been developed and implemented, and though it presently fits the needs of the project. There is scope of improvement to make it more user-friendly and avoid mistakes, such as use some data base at the same time doubting which one is the last updated one. This MRM is more focused at output level than at outcome level, as it happens with the project as a whole.

Overall, the level of operationalization and implementation of the Project document work plan is very high. The project team is focused on its implementation, sometimes in a very rigid way. The Project document allowed some flexibility but the project did not take advantage of the inception phase to adapt the implementation strategy and to define more realistic targets to the actual capacities and resources.

#### Efficiency

In general, the allocation of the resources is coherent with the goals and principles of the project, and the delivery of the project very appropriate, regarding the level of accomplishment. Therefore, the project efficiency is reasonably satisfactory given the resources available and correspondingly used.

#### Impact and likelihood of sustainability

In one hand, MozTrabalha's impact has been evident in the increased knowledge and technical know-how amongst partners including Government, employers, employees and donors; despite the observation that the NEP has not sufficiently been integrated within different ministries, which is out of the project's control.

On the other hand, there is not yet a formal institutionalization of the project's proposed tools and methodologies. For the remaining years of the project, it will be crucial to boost them, taking into account that some ministries and institutions are already very interested.

Finally, there are issues that the project should address in a potential exit strategy to ensure impact and sustainability. These include the lack of mainstreaming/integration of the NEP in all ministries that have potential of jobs creation, focus on the replication of the project's successful intervention and revise the way of the implementation of the MSD component.

#### The validity of the design

The logical framework establishes the logic underpinning the project design, which is coherent and in alignment with overall objectives. However, without a developed theory of change, there is not a clear definition of how to fulfil or implement this logic and why the interventions would lead to the expected outcomes and final goal.

In general, the project design is quite realistic, especially regarding outcome 1 (A strengthened national policy and institutional environment leads to increased promotion of decent employment and sustainable economic transformation). Regarding outcome 2 (Sectors are stimulated to create decent, sustainable and green employment opportunities for Mozambican women and men, in particular youth and those living in rural areas), the only component that proved too challenging and ambitious in the project is the MSD approach.

## Gender approach and International Labour standards

A strong commitment of the project unit with gender mainstreaming and non-discrimination is visible and strong since the beginning of the project implementation. The project engagement to include women as beneficiaries in project pilots is one example.

The Gender Mainstreaming Strategy developed during the inception phase of the project is being implemented, but the work with women associations in Mozambique has not yet started, which in some way reduces its impact.

This project supports the ILO national constituents, including the Government of Mozambique to implement and develop the already ratified Conventions on International Labour Standards, and ensure that these principles are respected and promoted.

#### **General conclusion**

Overall, the MozTrabalha project has arrived at its mid-term stage with insightful relevance, adequate efficiency and reasonable efficacy. The component of value chains has undergone some delays but is now ready to take off faster.

#### Recommendations

**R1.** Ensure a second phase to consolidate and further develop project results to achieve the expected outcome: The Swedish International Development Agency, ILO Decent Work Team in Pretoria, and ILO headquarters should consider developing a second phase of the project to ensure that outcomes will have a long term deeper impact, and preventing a long gap missing the existing window of opportunity for promoting the creation of job now in Mozambique. Project formulation takes time, such as was the case for MozTrabalha. A

second phase shouldn't arrive too late after the closure of the project and there should be continuity between the two phases.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO project team, DWT, ILO HQ and Swedish International Development Agency	High	High	Medium-term (before the end of the project)

**R2.** Take advantage of the actual window of opportunity to promote pro-employment budget and EII methods: With the presidential promise of creating 3 million jobs, and the corresponding openness of the new Government in Mozambique, MozTrabalha should increase efforts to encourage the development and implementation of pro-employment budgeting, including projects using EII techniques. This should be done especially with the new ministries more likely to use these approaches to create jobs through public employment programs, namely Ministry of Public Works and Water Resources, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, Ministry of Industry and Trade, and, of course, the Ministry of Economy and Finances.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
Project team, GoMz	High	Medium	Short-term/
and private sector			long term

**R3. Elaborate a risk analysis of the intervention with ACEAGRARIOS and if necessary, review its agreement between MozTrabalha:** The evaluation has raised enough causes to initiate a risk analysis, maybe by an external consultant of the agribusiness value chain strategy through in agreement with ACEAGRARIOS. Therefore, to validate the approach and prove its importance towards feasible and propoor sustainable changes in a market, it is crucial to mitigate the potential threats and to ensure that no smallholder, the primary beneficiaries, may be economically harmed.

It is vital to create a good implementation environment of the MSD approach and thus, avoid potential harm to the communities in the future. It is equally imperative to ensure that the agreement with ACEAGRARIOS is in accordance with the expected objectives. MozTrabalha, together with its partners, should strategize to achieve a common understanding of the MSD approach and its procedures, to make sure that no one is left behind.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO Project team	High	Low	Short-term

**R4.** Adjust implementation and its monitoring system (MRM) to be outcome-oriented. Revise the expected outcomes; define clear indicators and targets, which should be in agreement with the Steering Committee, and adjust the project to be more outcome-oriented than output-oriented. Follow the MRM manual to elaborate impact indicators and include a realistic target to be achieved by the end of the project, and an accurate and accessible source of information to track it.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO Project team	Medium	None	Short-term

**R5. Develop an exit strategy:** To consolidate the project results through an exit strategy that focuses on the sustainability of results of component 1, and promotes replicability of pilot projects of component 2.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO project team	High	Low	Short-term (by December 2020)

**R6.** Develop the project theory of change to unpack the project logical framework: Develop a robust and realistic result chain in all projects, considering the expected results in relation with the inputs provided and the context in which the project should be implemented, which means further developing the logical framework to include a robust Theory of Change.

This theory of change will explain how and why the project is going to reach the expected outcomes. It

should be a participatory exercise that includes not only the project team, but also other stakeholders involved in its implementation. It could be updated periodically to adapt to the changing environment if deemed necessary.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO and donors	Medium	Low	Medium- term; include in all project formulations

**R7: Work with Mozambican women associations.** In order to integrate Mozambican women's needs, it would be pertinent to work increasingly with the women associations in the country.

Addressed to	Priority	Resource	Timing
ILO project team	Medium	Low	Short-term