



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Applying the G20 Training Strategy: A Partnership of the ILO and the Russian Federation (Phase 2) Project Independent Mid-term Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: Armenia, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Jordan, Viet Nam and Russian Federation

Mid-Term Evaluation: 5 November – 19 December 2018

Evaluation Mode: Independent (Mid-term)

Administrative Office: Skills and Employability Branch, Geneva

Technical Office: Skills and Employability Branch, Geneva

Evaluation Manager: Sharon Chitambo

Evaluation Consultants: Svetlana Bronyuk, Kira Godovanyuk, Julia Melnichouk

Project Code: INT/16/01/RUS

Donor(s) & Budget: Russia (US\$ 12,000,000)

Keywords: skills development, vocational education, technical education, national plans, regional planning, sectoral planning, technical cooperation

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The project “Applying the G20 Training Strategy: A Partnership of the ILO and the Russian Federation” Phase 2 (the G20TS Project, or the Project), is a 36-month, US\$12 million second

phase initiative, funded by the Russian Federation and implemented by the International Labour Organization (ILO). The Project aims to strengthen the capacity of relevant Governments, Employers’ and Workers’ organizations (Social Partners), competent bodies, sectoral organizations and stakeholders to review, develop and implement changes in National and Sectoral Skills Development Systems in six (6) participant countries.

During Russia’s Presidency of the G20 in 2013, Human Resources Development (HRD) was identified as a main objective of its Development Working Group. The Project, “Applying the G20 Training Strategy: A partnership of the ILO and the Russian Federation”, Phase 2, is continuing the implementation of the G20 Training Strategy: A Skilled Workforce for Strong, Sustainable and Balanced Growth in the Project Countries. The G20 Training Strategy underlines the need for identification of employers’ demand for skilled workforce and developing a mechanism for planning of enrolments in Skills Development institutions.

Phase 2 continues to target five countries that benefitted from technical support during Phase 1, Armenia, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan, within the Commonwealth Independent States (CIS) block of countries, as well as Jordan in the Middle East and Viet Nam in Asia and expanded to include five regions in the Russian Federation.

The Project aims to further strengthen national skills development systems, policies & strategies to improve employability of women and men, to promote their equal access to employment opportunities and treatment, for inclusive and sustainable growth”. The Project also actively reinforces sub-regional and global knowledge-sharing and peer learning in skills development.

Present Situation of the Project

Phase 2 of the Project is intended to continue the support for implementing the G20 commitments on HRD agreed at the Leaders’ Summit in September 2013, namely: 1) to enhance national capacities to meet labour market needs, and 2) to develop regional and international cooperation for training.

These objectives include assistance for low-income and middle-income countries to assess their Skills Development needs and build up national capacity in delivering quality training, including through inclusion in training programmes of specific components raising participants’ awareness and equipping them with the knowledge and practical skills that would allow them to pay special attention to those groups facing the greatest barriers to finding or remaining in employment such as youth, women, long-term unemployed, low skilled workers, single parents, people with disabilities, older workers.

The Project Management Team consists of a Central Project Management Office (PMO) based in Geneva, with National Project Coordinators in each of the participating countries (except Russian Federation). The PMO is managed by a Chief Technical Adviser, supported by a Project Programming Officer, Technical Specialist, along with Administrative and Finance support staff.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The evaluation covers the duration of the Project since in the signing of the Agreement between the Russian Federation and ILO in December 2016 [and the start of its inception phase in February 2017] until September 2018, and its full

geographical coverage at both Headquarters and Country level. All countries were assessed as a part of the desk review, with four countries – Jordan, Kyrgyzstan, Russian Federation and Viet Nam selected for in-depth analysis and field visits for meetings with the Project partners, stakeholders and beneficiaries. The evaluation was conducted from 05 November to 19 December 2018, with final evaluation report submitted to the ILO on 30 January 2019. The goal of the Mid-term Evaluation is to review the project performance and enhance learning within the ILO and among stakeholders.

The Mid-Term Evaluation will serve the following clients’ groups: Project Advisory Committee, Project National Steering Committees, ILO Employment / Skills, ILO DWT/CO-Moscow, ILO DWT-Beirut / CO - Jordan, ILO DWT-Bangkok / CO- Vietnam.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation applied a mixed-method approach, with the main focus being on the qualitative techniques, including quantitative data obtained through the review of the project documents and reports, monitoring matrices and survey feedback results of the participants of the workshops. The primary data was collected directly from the stakeholders through interviews conducted via Skype and in person, focus group discussions, site visits in Viet Nam, Jordan, Krasnoyarsk and Khabarovsk regions in the Russian Federation as well as observations during the Sub-Regional Workshop in Bishkek on November 15-16, 2018. Project reports and documents, including evaluation reports from the first phase of the project, key policy papers, country strategic plans and research reports were analyzed as secondary data sources.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The main strategy of the project is capacity development of national stakeholders. The capacity building strategy of the Project is

measured by key success indicator which aims at targeting over 1,460 participants by involvement in various capacity development, pilot implementation and knowledge sharing activities by the end of the Project (30 November 2019), including at least 30% females. At the time of the Mid-Term Evaluation, 50% of this target was achieved - more than 750 persons trained, out of them 36% are women.

In terms of qualitative assessment, the knowledge products developed by the Project, technical assistance provided to the policy makers and the capacity building events have resulted in the firm willingness of the governments to enhance national strategies, policies, legislations and educational standards in line with the requirements of the international HRD policy instruments and the 2030 Developmental Agenda.

Relevance and strategic fit: Strategic fit and relevance of the project has been rated as high by key stakeholders and constituents from all countries. The project is well-aligned with the countries' national and regional priorities, strategies and plans, the ILO and other international development assistance programmes as well as the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) 4, 5, 8, 17.

Effectiveness: The project shows quite good progress thanks to effective project management arrangements, ILO and SKOLKOVO technical capacities and high relevance/fit to specific national contexts and environments. The project has rather modest results in advancing gender equality and human rights. At the same time, the project shows high effectiveness on advancing international labour standards. In terms of strengthening social dialogue, the project shows good performance on cooperation with businesses and employers in Viet Nam and Jordan.

Efficiency of resource use: To date, the project resource utilization has proved to be efficient, including resource allocation across outputs. Human (project staff and external collaborators) and budget resources have been allocated and used

efficiently and strategically to achieve the expected results. In terms of time allocation and use, the original project work plan is not followed due to delay with the actual start of implementation and external risks faced by the project, which remain outside its control.

Impact orientation: Government institutions fully support the initiatives undertaken by the project, and all ILO Constituents have been involved in the implementation of the project. The project shows high potential of achieving significant long-term results at the economic and social level if all planned activities are implemented; its results analyzed and proper exit strategies are formulated and implemented.

Project sustainability: The project has been effective in securing national ownership of the project results. Participatory and needs-based approach adopted by the project allows the results of the project to be sustained after its end.

Recommendations

Main recommendations and follow-up

1. **To ensure that the results of the mid-term evaluation are shared and discussed.** ILO Project Management Team, with support from the National Project Coordinators should discuss the results of the MTE with the national stakeholders and partners in all countries, to inform project implementation and decision making on project extension;
2. **To conduct thorough internal review and assessment of the work plans and budgets to consider four-six months' project extension.** ILO Project Management Team, with support from the National Project Coordinators should carefully review current status of implementation of the activities which are delayed and consider four to six months' project extension, to enhance its impact and increasing visibility of the project results;
3. **To enhance project visibility and external communication to promote project results and donor's visibility,** ILO Project Management Team, with support from the National Project Coordinators should revise and

update the Communication Plan, at both global and national level. Project website and promotion tools developed with the support of the project should be used, along with mass media sources and social media channels for promoting the results for the project and raising awareness on the ongoing reforms;

4. **To develop a Gender Mainstreaming Strategy for the Project**, taking into account The ILO Strategic Plan for 2018-21 and ILO Action Plan for Gender Equality 2018-21. ILO Project Team should introduce at least one gender-relevant topic in each Project's activity, along with capacity building activities for Project staff and its constituents on integrating a gender-sensitive approach in policy development, programming and implementation;
5. **To develop a Non-Discrimination Strategy for the Project** based on the ILO's 2014–2017 Disability Inclusion Action Plan. ILO Project Team should ensure support to development of gender-sensitive and inclusive policies and programs to better address needs of those groups facing the greatest barriers to finding or remaining in employment, including workers with disabilities;
6. **To improve project design, data collection and reporting, especially on outcomes**. ILO Project Team should update project M&E tools and progress reporting templates, including developing specific indicators on the vulnerable groups; additional complementary indicators to capture progress on immediate objectives levels; introduce gender disaggregated data to project progress reporting at the global level; adding sections on project progress on gender mainstreaming, inclusion and support to achieving the SDGs in project progress reports;
7. **To continue active promotion and dissemination of the knowledge products developed under the Outputs 1 among regional government stakeholders on the CIS regional level** (Interparliamentary Assembly CIS, CIS Executive Committee, Eurasian Economic Union) and expert organizations like Russian International Affairs

Council and including them in the list of the beneficiaries of the project capacity development activities;

8. **To organize capacity development activities for the social partners, in particular, employers in the CIS region**. The ILO Project Team, in cooperation with ACTEMP should organize capacity development activities aimed at enhancing knowledge and skills of the social partners, with particular attention to the needs of the employers in the CIS countries to successfully engage in the social dialogue, to enhance their skills in developing research tools, conducting surveys, developing policy proposals and engage in advocacy effort, while continuing such engagement with the workers;
9. **To organize final global high visibility event with participation of the stakeholders from all countries**. The ILO Project Team, with support from the National Project Coordinators should organize final global level event to discuss the results of project implementation, present good practices and lessons learnt on a global level and develop recommendations to inform future initiatives;
10. **To organize one final event on the national level for the stakeholders from Russian regions**. SKOLKOVO should enhance peer-to-peer learning, experience sharing and identifying best practices, government representatives, TVET managers and employers from the Russian regions should be brought together, to discuss the results of project implementation, lessons learnt, disseminate information and developing recommendations to inform TVET reform in other regions of Russia;
11. **To involve social partners in project implementation in the regions of the Russian Federation**. SKOLKOVO should discuss and identify the opportunities for more active collaboration with the Russian Union of the Industrialists and Entrepreneurs (RSPP), Federation of Independent Trade Unions of Russia (FNPR) and Confederation of Labour of Russia (KTR) in implementation of activities in

the regions of the Russian Federation, to see how their potential could be utilized.