



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Green enterPRIZE Innovation and Development in Zimbabwe – Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries:	<i>Zimbabwe</i>
Final Evaluation:	<i>May – July 2021</i>
Evaluation Mode:	<i>Independent</i>
Administrative Office:	<i>ILO Country Office Harare</i>
Technical Office:	<i>ILO Decent Work Team Pretoria</i>
Evaluation Manager:	<i>Perihan Tawfik</i>
Evaluation Consultant(s):	<i>Southern Hemisphere</i>
Project Code:	<i>ZWE/17/01/SWE</i>
Donor(s) & Budget:	<i>Sweden: SEK 3, 113,400 / USD 2, 867,379</i>
Keywords:	<i>Sustainable enterprise, development, entrepreneurship, youth, TVET, green jobs, SMEs, gender inclusivity, skills development</i>

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The overall goal of the Green enterPRIZE Innovation and Development Project in Zimbabwe was the creation of green and decent jobs for women and men, and especially young people, through sustainable enterprise development. The project formed part of other approaches by the ILO in Zimbabwe through the Decent Work Country Programme framework to promote job creation

through skills and entrepreneurship development targeting the informal economy composed by many informal micro and small enterprises (MSEs) as well as more formal small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs.)

It had a three-pronged strategy to achieving the overall goal of job creation, as outlined below:

- Component 1: Greening TVET and Skills Development aimed at expanding access to skills for green jobs and markets for green products and services.
- Component 2: Green enterPRIZE challenge looking to support green, growth-oriented SMEs through an Innovation Challenge and Business Development Programme.
- Component 3: Sustaining Competitive and Responsible Enterprise (SCORE) training programme to enhance productivity and competitiveness through workplace cooperation.

The project was implemented across Zimbabwe and targeted all ten provinces. It was implemented in partnership with the Government of Zimbabwe, Employers Organizations (Employers' Confederation of Zimbabwe and Confederation of Zimbabwe Industries), Workers Organisations (Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Unions), Non-Governmental Organisations and SMEs, technical vocational education, and training (TVET) institutions, business development services

(BDS), training providers, media and communication agencies.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation was to facilitate accountability, learning, planning, and building knowledge. Specifically, the evaluation had the following objectives: 1) Establishing the relevance and coherence of the project design and implementation strategy in relation to the context, the national development frameworks, ILO, UN and final beneficiaries; b) Assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives and expected results, while identifying the supporting factors and constraints that have led to them; c) Identify unexpected positive and unexpected results of the project; d) Assess the implementation efficiency of the project; e) Assess the extent to which the project outcomes will be sustainable; f) Identify lessons learned and potential good practices, especially regarding models of interventions that can be applied further; g) Provide recommendations to project stakeholders to promote sustainability and support further development of the project outcomes.

The evaluation covered the entire project period from 1st December 2017 to 30 June 2021, all three project components, as well as project implementation across all target regions in Zimbabwe.

The primary intended use of the evaluation is to learn lessons for future programming. The primary clients of the evaluation are the ILO constituents. These include at national level the primary users of the evaluation are the Government of Zimbabwe, as implementer and recipient country, the project implementing partners (BDS providers and TVET institutions) as well as the ILO tripartite constituents, the ILO project technical unit, the ILO CO-Harare, the ILO DWT Office in Pretoria, the ILO Regional Office for Africa (ROAF), and the relevant technical units in ILO Headquarter and the donor, the Swedish government.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation used a variety of methods to incorporate both qualitative and quantitative

information. Secondary information included relevant programme documents, internal and external monitoring and evaluation reports, relevant background, and policy documents. Information and experiences were gathered from 56 respondents (33 males and 23 females) through 31 individual interviews and 5 FGDs. In total, 12 Innovation Challenge beneficiaries and five SCORE training beneficiaries were interviewed, which constitutes a sample of 16% (out of 75) and 14% (out of 35) entrepreneurs, respectively.

The COVID-19 pandemic imposed certain limitations to the evaluation, most importantly, it forced virtual primary data collection, which in remote and under resourced settings was not free of challenges; in addition, the short timeframe of the evaluation and multifaceted scope of the project, meant that not all aspects could be assessed with the same level of detail. Eventually, a flexible approach to data collection, the extensive use of secondary data and the focusing of the data collection process on primary project recipients, allowed for the evaluation team to successfully address all limitations, and arrive at valid and reliable evaluation findings.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The evaluation found that the project was well-aligned with applicable national, ILO and donor strategies. Intended project objectives were highly relevant and in line with stakeholders' priorities. While the underlying theory of change was helpful to guide design and implementation, the project overly relied on job creation targets for the tracking and reporting of project performance. The evaluation found that the approach used for Component 1 was highly appropriate: a multi-sectorial, consultative, and locally driven strategy for skills development, which has served to institutionalise the sustainability of the results of the project. Regarding Component 2, the project's

strategy was purposeful and customised to tap into entrepreneurs' innovative potential and to build BDS provider capacity in the green economy. Certain design elements limited the project: assumption that sufficient innovative and growth-orientated enterprises ('gazelles'¹) that would deliver the required number of new jobs could be identified. Entrepreneurial ecosystem building was a secondary focus and efforts in this area (such as working with business associations and potential financiers) were not properly captured through M&E efforts. For Component 3, the use of SCORE training programme leveraged on a tried-and-tested model, which was found to be relevant to the needs of Zimbabwean businesses as well as government's environmental priorities.

Regarding effectiveness, the Green enterPRIZE project has broadly been implemented according to plan, most outputs and some outcomes have been achieved. Five new fully registered TVET courses in renewable energy and agriculture-related fields have been developed, 77 lecturers have been trained and as a result, the new courses are already open for teaching and learning; 500 MSMEs received various levels of BDS training, of which, 83, received both business development services and financial assistance. Thirty-five enterprises have been trained under the SCORE productivity capacity development programme. As a result, Component 1 was a source of new awareness and knowledge around green skills, green economy and environmental sustainability according to TVET stakeholders interviewed. BDS beneficiaries as well as BDS implementing partners and mentors involved in Component 2 experienced immediate benefits from the project including, new awareness and knowledge about the green economy and environmental practices, exposure to opportunities in the green economy, access to much-needed finance, new business

knowledge and skills (marketing, business management, etc.), new training approaches and new networks.

Key deviations experienced by the project include various implementation delays due to set-up challenges, and the negative impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. While the project managed to accelerate delivery in Year 2 and adapt implementation to fit social distancing requirements, outcome level training and job creation targets were not met. It is likely that student training targets will be met before the end of 2021.

In terms of efficiency, the evaluation found that the use of human and financial resources was appropriate despite the project facing internal and external challenges.

Regarding the project's impact orientation, the evaluation concluded that the project had a purposeful strategy towards long-term impact. In the short-term, the project has contributed to raising awareness and increasing knowledge around environmental sustainability business practices, green skills, improved business management practices, access to much needed funding for MSEs, new BDS training approaches as well as enhanced connections. There is also evidence of unexpected positive results in the areas of improved collaborations and networks for BDS service provision as well as agenda policy setting.

The sustainability assessment revealed that while component 1 had in-built sustainability features, components 2 and 3 may require further support for emerging results to be sustained. The sustainability of the results achieved by Component 1 will depend on appropriate funding becoming available for course roll-out (toolkits,

¹ While there's no widely accepted definition for 'gazelle', they are traditionally recognised as high-growth SMEs, where growth is measured over a specific period of time.

demonstrations sites, etc.) and ongoing capacity building of TVET lecturers and other staff. After project close-out, the challenge for businesses participating in component 2 will be for BDS providers to make their services financially viable, and for participating MSEs and SMEs, to retain new jobs created and continue newly acquired business practices in the tough Zimbabwean business context. The sustainability of SCORE training provision in Zimbabwe (Component 3) was enhanced by the registration of a legal entity by SCORE certificated trainers to continue the work after project close-out; while the feasibility of fee-based SCORE courses is unknown, the ILO has already shown its support to SCORE trainers to be able to develop a suitable business strategy.

Lastly, the project's gender and non-discrimination strategy was found to be purposeful and integrated; however, additional work is required to change entrenched unequal patterns and practices. Similarly, the evaluation found that the project greatly integrated tripartite issues and the promotion of international labour standards in its overall design and implementation.

Recommendations

Recommendation 1 (ILO Country Office; ILO Regional Office; ILO Global Offices)

Continue to embed curriculum development projects in local education systems by ensuring strong policy and regulatory alignment and promoting local ownership. Involving policymakers, future TVET users, industry and union representatives in the process ensures that the new curricula is modernised, while being rapidly institutionalised and demand driven. *Level of urgency: High priority; Level of resources: Medium; Timeline: Medium-term.*

Recommendation 2 (ILO Country Office; ILO Regional Office; all tripartite partners)

Consider providing ongoing support to BDS partners and SCORE trainers to ensure sustained

benefits from the project. This could involve partial funding of BDS and training programmes for businesses most in need, while incentivising self-funding by more established companies; continued brokering of networks and funding partnerships among organised business, labour, government and other international donor agencies to promote high quality and sustainable BDS provision. *Level of urgency: High priority; Level of resources: Medium; Timeline: Medium-term.*

Recommendation 3 (ILO Country Office; ILO Regional Office;)

Consider designing follow-up work on gender-sensitisation for TVET lecturers, building on the awareness raised by the project. Now that materials have been developed and lecturers have been introduced to the importance of gender equality, there is a 'window of opportunity' to leverage on the unbiased curricula to address insensitive attitudes and practices in the classroom, as well as at the level of the institution and the community. This could be done by supporting the provision of follow-up training and mentorship of TVET lecturers grounded on the practical gender dynamics in the classroom and in the communities of origin. *Level of urgency: High priority; Level of resources: Medium; Timeline: Long-term.*

Recommendation 4 (ILO Country Office; ILO Regional Office)

Prioritise a project's feasibility stage, especially when considering innovative projects. This could involve allocating additional time in the project's overall timeline for conducting rigorous project scoping studies such as partner due diligence and feasibility studies. *Level of urgency: High priority; Level of resources: Low; Timeline: Short.*

Recommendation 5 (ILO Country Office; ILO Regional Office; ILO Global Offices)

Adjust project staff resourcing (human and financial) more closely to project scope to avoid teams being overstretched and/or under capacitated and ensure ILO teams have the capacity to manage project implementation

effectively and efficiently. *Level of urgency: High priority; Level of resources: Low; Timeline: Short.*

Recommendation 6 (Zimbabwean government; Employers' associations)

Prioritise the resourcing of green skill courses at project partner TVET institutions to enable appropriate implementation. While five green curricula have been made available, TVET institutions will require additional infrastructure and material support to acquire demonstration sites, start-up kits and ongoing maintenance thereof. *Level of urgency: High priority; Level of resources: Medium; Timeline: Short.*

Recommendation 7 (Zimbabwean government)

Consider supporting TVET institutions in replicating suitable elements of green skill courses to other TVET schools towards the progressive greening of curricula. *Level of urgency: Medium priority; Level of resources: Medium; Timeline: Medium.*

Recommendation 8 (Zimbabwean government)

Continue supporting the business sector by realising enabling legislation that supports productivity enhancement, cost reduction, environmental protection, and gender equality. This could follow on from the policy advancements made with the 2021-2025 National Micro Small Medium Enterprise Policy framework, as well as formulating new legislation incentivising businesses to transition towards the green economy. *Level of urgency: High priority; Level of resources: Medium; Timeline: Medium.*

Recommendation 9 (Swedish Embassy to Zimbabwe)

Assist funding applicants in meeting agreement requirements and setting realistic project parameters by interrogating proposed goals, targets and timeframes with the experience and learnings gained from previous projects in the portfolio and other relevant research. *Level of urgency: Medium priority; Level of resources: Low; Timeline: Short.*

Recommendation 10 (Swedish Embassy to Zimbabwe)

Consider strengthening the legacy of the Green enterPRIZE project by prioritising support to Zimbabwean government in developing conducive legislation for business and environmental protection. *Level of urgency: Medium priority; Level of resources: Low; Timeline: Short.*