



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Enhancing the Labour Administration Capacity to Improve Working Conditions and Tackle Undeclared Work – Final evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries:	<i>Ukraine</i>
Final Evaluation:	<i>24 Sep. – 06. Dec 2019</i>
Evaluation Mode:	<i>Independent</i>
Administrative Office:	<i>DWT/CO-Budapest</i>
Technical Office:	<i>Labadmin/OSH Branch</i>
Evaluation Manager:	<i>Emil Krstanovski</i>
Evaluation Consultant(s):	<i>Thomas Vasseur</i>
Project Code:	<i>UKR/16/03/EUR</i>
Donor & Budget:	<i>EUD Ukr. (US\$ 1,130,000)</i>
Keywords:	<i>OSH, Labour inspection, Labour relations, Social Dialogue, Employment, International Labour Standards, ILO Conventions, Gender, anti-discrimination, Ukraine,</i>

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The project is funded by the EU Delegation in Ukraine, under the European Neighbourhood instrument, with a value of € 1 million granted for an initial duration of 24 months. The action started on 1 July 2017 and ended on 31 December 2019, including a six-month extension period.

The Development Objective aims for the Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine, and in particular the State Labour Service, to contribute to safer and healthier working conditions for Ukrainian workers and to tackle “undeclared work” through the following outcomes:

1. Proposed revised legislation, procedures and policies, with a special focus on OSH and labour inspection, are in line with the EU Acquis and ILO Conventions.
2. The ability of the MSP and the SLS to enhance working conditions and fight against undeclared work is improved.

The following multipronged strategy was applied:

- Approaching Ukrainian legislation to the EU Framework Directive on OSH and its main specific directives whilst paving the way for the ratification of ILO Convention 187;
- Assisting the Ministry of Social Policy in the alignment of the UA legislation with a selected number of EU directives on working conditions;
- Providing the SLS with a robust corpus of knowledge, intelligence and training of labour inspectors to tackle undeclared work and,
- Improving the performance of the labour inspection by ensuring a full implementation of ILO Conventions No.81 and No.129, providing training to labour inspectors and giving technical assistance to the management of SLS for the

labour inspection to be in line with EU good practices.

Present Situation of the Project

The action has been completed on 31 December 2019 and has successfully reached its initial objectives while exceeding several original targets. A follow-up phase “Towards safe, healthy and declared work in Ukraine” has received the continued support of the EUD in Ukraine, is planned to start on 1st January 2020 for a period of 36 months, with a budget of 2 million euros.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The evaluation’s purposes involved supporting improvements in future programmes and policies, promoting accountability to ILO key stakeholders, donors and promoting learning within the ILO.

Its aims included: (a) determine project effectiveness (b) assess the project implementation efficiency; (c) establish the relevance of the project outcomes and the level of sustainability attained; (d) provide recommendations toward the sustainability of project outcomes and initial impacts; (e) identify lessons learned and emerging potential good practices for key stakeholders. This evaluation covers the implementation period since the project start until the time of the field visit, encompasses all results, and spans all levels of achievements in its analysis, from activities to the achievement of objectives. Gender and anti-discrimination dimensions also are under the scope of this external review. The evaluation took place from 24 September until 6 December 2019. The primary clients of the evaluation include constituents of the ILO, project partners and stakeholders – in particular, project management, the ILO Office in Budapest, the ILO Regional Office for Europe, the LABADMIN/OSH Branch in Geneva, the EU, the MSP and the SLS.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation has applied ILO guidelines in relation to evaluation standards, methodology and ethics. The data collection involved a mixed method of research: the collected data was

organized and guided by an evaluation matrix tailored for this assignment. The information was collected through direct individual and focus group interviews and completed by a review of project and contextual documents and enriched with additional web-based research. The assessment process has involved an inception phase that entailed a desk review and analysis of the project documentation and relevant literature and the drafting of an inception report featuring a detailed methodology, a field phase where individual and focus groups stakeholder interviews were conducted in Kyiv during the week of 21 to 26 October 2019 as well as remote interviews with ILO employees from the Budapest regional office and ILO headquarters in Geneva. A presentation of the initial findings and feedback session to stakeholders concluded the field phase on 26 October 2019. The final phase of the evaluation involved the submission of a evaluation report.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Relevance: This project has enjoyed a strong design and its logic of intervention and the degree of detail about the process provided a strong framework for establishing durable change. They are the result of a long-standing history of stakeholder relation-building and technical assistance provided by ILO in Ukraine, and a permanent consultative and open exchange with Ukrainian institutions that allows for a deep understanding of root problems and shapes a response that privileges the construction of the change process and the sustainability of results over rapid but fragile outcomes. While the project design enjoyed a relevant logic of intervention, the longer-term strategic vision and deeper analytic work has been realised during implementation: Analytic rigour and knowledge production were applied to the project from its onset. Numerous strategic publications were made available to stakeholders in order to show the value of change and flesh out the core values of the project just as change began to unfold in this first project phase.

While gender equity and anti-discrimination policies were addressed by the project, the strategic definition of objectives and identification of results to capture the project's contribution to these issues should have been better elaborated in the project design.

The analysis of the problems in OSH and UDW has been translated into a valid response, the implementation of which has gone into a remarkable level of analysis of the legal, institutional and operational environment, so that it supports most, if not all, of the prominent strategic and policy instruments shaping the context of intervention: its international layer (ILO Conventions, ILO Global Decent Work strategy, SDGs), its regional characteristic (EU Neighbourhood Partnership Agreement, ILO Decent Work priorities in Eastern and Central Europe) as well as its national and local prioritization of programmatic responses to OSH, labour inspection and UDW situations (ILO Decent Work Country Programmes, national priorities of Ukraine).

Effectiveness: This activity-intensive project has met its original expectations during its implementation. The intervention logic proposed a strong level of transformation involving substantial work, and the project has performed impressively, reflected in the quantity, timeliness and quality of deliverables. Indeed, delivering the core activities necessary to reform the labour administration in Ukraine within 30 months or less was a substantial task.

The project had produced substantial achievements that have contributed to a shift in the mind-set of those stakeholders who demonstrated a strong awareness of and supportive engagement in the project effort. Notably, the legal foundation of OSH has been changed in Ukraine thanks to a Concept of OSH Reform adopted by the CMU, as well as a national profile with project recommendations approved and analysis of the degree of concordance between the national legislation of selected EU directives and ILO Conventions on labour relations – a draft CMU resolution adopting the EU-ILO Project-supported Action Plan to Tackle UDW, the transposition of

EU directives, among other key outputs as well as numerous capacity-building activities equipping labour inspectors to change the way they perform and the sense of their work.

Tireless project team dedication and professional and relevant expertise from ILO staff have been key to ensuring a qualitative and timely implementation of a dense and ambitious project design. The presence of the project team at SLS premises gave the institution direct access to a formal and informal level of support that truly makes a difference from occasional technical support.

Institutional reorganization and newly appointed staff meant some of the expected institutionalization of results was at risk. This situation has underlined the need for the project and ILO in general to maintain a strong advocacy effort coupled with the need to educate and communicate to a wide spectrum of institutional decision-makers on the negative consequences of UDW and a weak labour inspection environment.

Efficiency: While the review appreciates the project's intrinsic value and the patience required to build durable answers, the efficiency of the project must be understood as an opening move to lay the foundation for a longer-term investment: changing current practices and creating effective actions to tackle UDW will only bear fruit toward the end of the change process. Therefore, a way to measure the project so far is to verify if it fulfilled the primary steps of change (aligned legislation, strategic vision for the SLS, national action plan, and so on). With a modest budget primarily composed of human resources costs of a small project team, external experts and the organization of capacity-building activities, a more stripped-down, low-cost budget is difficult to conceive. Indeed, behind the value of the intervention stands a uniquely mandated, experienced, expert and dedicated agency to do the work: the ILO.

Sustainability and impact orientation: The obtained results confirm that the intervention is on track to generate durable impacts in OSH, UDW and labour inspection in the long run. The preconditions to produce lasting changes have

been established successfully. Early indicators of durable change include an increased awareness and mindsets of key stakeholders, a strong Institutional engagement, Legislative validation of project achievements and strong stakeholder engagement. The project has laid the foundation for a longer-term implementation that is expected to produce durable improvement in the OSH, UDW and labour inspection systems. The vision, strategy and method have been developed.

Conclusions: The project has been unanimously recognized by its partners and stakeholders for setting the stage for important changes. Its numerous achievements to date passed an important first milestone that confirms this intervention is on track to reach its long-term objective. The project, crucial to the well-being of workers in Ukraine, has advocated for long-term support for the intervention while enjoying a period of donor understanding and backing. But the need to gain a wide and clear understanding that they are no noticeable, durable results without the patient work of the “pros” remains an issue. The project has adopted a proactive communication and advocacy stance which has brought about results, underlining the need for professional communication support.

The human factor, essential to this project, has been a strong element in stimulating the stakeholders ‘understanding of the project and their commitment.

The project does address the gender dimension of its work, but it has insufficiently reported or communicated much about it.

Recommendations

Main recommendations and follow-up

Key recommendation 1: Promote the project results (and process) through a more powerful communication.

¹ See link: <https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/safety-and-health-at-work/programmes-projects/safety-health-for-all/lang--en/index.htm>

Define a communication strategy aiming at – among other goals – to secure an adequate level of funding for the long-term support of the intervention (and ideally to a portfolio of interventions support of ILO DWCP country programme outcome).

Develop various visible supports targeting a non-expert audience conveying clear, strong messages illustrating the long-term benefits of the intervention and highlighting the link between the action and its impacts (visuals).

Integrate ILO’s added value and identity so the agency’s identity is associated with concrete, impactful results. The evaluation acknowledges ILO, at the HQ level, has already made significant efforts towards a more impactful communication. The recent material on ILO’s Flagship programme on OSH is an example of this.¹

Key recommendation 2: Develop an advocacy strategy targeting the appropriate higher political level (ministerial or as appropriately identified) to ensure the timely validation of future planned results (envisaged by the new project).

Key recommendation 3: Formalize the gender equality and anti-discrimination dimension of the future project through the formulation of a gender and anti-discrimination strategy.

Key recommendation 4: Promote the project as a relevant model of intervention for the countries from Eastern Neighbourhood Partnership sub-region through regional mechanism.

Key recommendation 5: Ensure that the new project (and future potential successive) phases propose (measurable) indicator-based capacity-focused outcomes, allowing to identify the depth of change realized by the project and the formulation of realistic changes.

Key recommendation 6: Preserve the mainstreaming of ILO Conventions by systematically linking the promoted EU directives to its related ILO Convention.