



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Global Action Programme on Child Labor Issues - GAP11 - Independent Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: Global

Final Evaluation: April 1 – July 18, 2017

Evaluation Mode: Independent Final Evaluation
(with elements of ex-post and specific focus on sustainability)

Administrative Office: ILO Geneva
(FUNDAMENTALS)

Technical Office: ILO Geneva (FUNDAMENTALS)

Evaluation Manager: Rafael Peels

Evaluation Consultant(s): Smita Premchander (team leader), Clara Ariza

Project Code: GLO/11/11/USA

Donor(s) & Budget: USDOL (USD 15,900,000)

Keywords: Child labour, Children in domestic work, Forced labour,

Background & Context

Summary of the Project Purpose, Logic and Structure

Through a competitive bidding process, The International Labour Organization (ILO) secured a 3-year grant to execute the Global Action Plan on Child Labor Issues (GAP11) project of the United States Department of Labor (USDOL).

Project interventions were organized around three expected outcomes:

Outcome 1: Improved legislation, enforcement and policy coordination on child labour and forced labour as well as national capacity to implement policy initiatives to increase access to quality education and sustainable livelihoods for vulnerable populations.

Outcome 2: Innovative research and monitoring systems to guide policy development and program design.

Outcome 3: Strengthened protections to children in domestic work.

The first component involved assistance to identifying and addressing legal and regulatory gaps in the areas of child labour and forced labour, and strengthening accompanying monitoring and enforcement mechanisms. It also supported national action plans on the two issues, and promoted mainstreaming of child and forced labour concerns into broader sectoral policies. The activities integrated within Component 1 were implemented in 22 countries.

Component 2 involved the management of data related to regional and/or country specific statistics on child labour and forced labour, in 23 countries.

Component 3, implemented in 12 countries, sought to strengthen the protection of child domestic workers through a series of awareness raising and advocacy activities in line with the relevant international legal instruments, especially Convention 189 on Decent

Work for Domestic Workers¹. It also supports the formulation of enabling regulatory and policy frameworks and the development of pilot intervention models for protecting child domestic workers.

The three components together consist of 12 subcomponents, which are expected to contribute towards the three expected outcomes. The activities under the components were conducted primarily by several units of ILO integrated now under the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work branch (FUNDAMENTALS): International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), including IPEC- Statistical Information and Monitoring Programme on Child Labour (SIMPOC), the Special Action Program on Forced Labour (SAP-FL) and the Understanding Children's Work Programme (UCW). IPEC's responsibility was primarily for technical inputs for Component 1 in support of National Action Plan (NAP) development, monitoring and legislative interventions and, regarding Component 3 outputs, on protection of child domestic workers. The other were share with the other units.

Present Situation of the Project

Purpose, Scope and Clients of the Evaluation

This evaluation has been commissioned by the ILO and carried out in accordance with ILO evaluation and the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)/ Development Assistance Committee (DAC) evaluation criteria and addresses the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability of GAP11. The evaluation covers the completion of activities during the period from November 2015 to March 2017, and focusses on examining sustainability. The strategic focus of this evaluation is on organizational learning regarding the implementation modality of the programme and the contribution to sustainable action in the targeted countries for ILO constituents.

Methodology of Evaluation

The findings of this evaluation are based on a review of documents, initial briefings and consultations with ILO Geneva, field visits and Skype interviews. Six countries were selected for case studies; two were visited by consultants, while detailed evidence from the others was gathered over Skype. Ecuador and Philippines were selected for visits, while Indonesia, Mongolia, Paraguay and Togo, were selected for Skype calls. A sample of 53 individuals was drawn. Interviews were conducted with ILO staff (23), ILO constituents and other stakeholders (30). The evaluation was completed between April 1 and July 18, 2017.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Relevance to context and project design

The evaluation team found that GAP11 activities for addressing issues of child labour, forced labour and children in domestic work (CDW) are relevant and well aligned with the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) and Decent Work Country Programme (DWCPs, broader framework of ILO strategic goals) in the case study countries.

Efficiency

The efficiency of the project has been assessed on the dimension of implementing of one or more components in a country. It was found that the presence of all three components increases efficiency, in terms of staff usage, and combining of activities across components.

Another dimension of efficiency was the adaptation to the changes in the context and priorities in the countries where the project was implemented, on which the project was found context sensitive, responsive and flexible.

¹ Hereafter referred to as Convention 189.

A third efficiency factor was the integration of GAP11 within the ILO structure at the headquarters (HQ) and in countries.

The project team collaborated well the ILOs country offices, and leveraged funds from other ILO projects, and was able to cover 46 countries instead of the 42 indicated in the initial project document.

Effectiveness and Sustainability

GAP11 has had several positive outcomes. It has conducted research, reviews of laws on child labour and/or forced labour, dissemination and bringing stakeholders together to develop road maps or NAPs, for CL, CDW, and Forced Labour (FL). In over 15 countries, GAP11 has contributed to the mainstreaming of NAPs in national development plans, mainstreaming of CDW in NAP-CL and subsequently in the national development plans, as well as mainstreaming of forced labour into national protective policy frameworks. It has been possible to strengthen research and monitoring mechanisms at the national level, and strengthen the implementation, monitoring, vigilance and support systems at the local levels.

Towards achieving Expected Outcome 2, GAP11 contributed to strengthened research capacities in government and research institutions.

Towards achieving Expected Outcome 3, GAP11's activities comprised of multiple modalities for protection of child domestic workers, namely through the creation of a protective policy framework for CDW, through the creation of a stand-alone NAP on CDW as, or integrating a CDW component into the existing NAP-Child Labour (CL) of the country. Focus on CDW has resulted in improved protection for child domestic workers. Also of importance is the practical guide and toolkit, which is a resource created for global use. The work on CDW was very well coordinated with Component 1, with the legal reviews and policy changes being done together in countries where both components existed.

Forced Labour

GAP11 addressed the issue of forced labour in all 22 countries covered for Component 1, by ensuring that the legal reviews covered both child labour and forced labour. GAP11's work on forced labour contributed to knowledge development on laws and enforcement mechanisms, i.e. to Expected Outcome 1. Further work was taken up in eight countries: Paraguay, Cameroon, Ecuador, Mongolia, Namibia, Timor-Leste and Indonesia. Significant outcomes were achieved, at the policy level in Paraguay, and at policy and enforcement mechanisms in Ecuador. In other countries, work on forced labour needs more follow-up with the national governments to have significant impact on policy or implementing mechanisms.

Alliance 8.7

With knowledge creation, data collection, improvement of data collection systems, capacity building of a wide range of national stakeholders, and efforts towards ratifications of Convention 189 and the Forced Labour protocol, GAP11 has laid good ground work towards Alliance 8.7, contributing to the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) target 8.7.

Among the case study countries, Philippines has made a commitment to remove 1 million children from labour by 2025 under the SDG goals. Ecuador has been collaborating regionally to join the Alliance 8.7 and make firm commitments by end of 2017. Countries such as Ecuador and Philippines have also been able to allocate budgets for elimination of child labour and forced labour, showing that ownership and commitment of local stakeholders enhances sustainability of the outcomes.

Good Practices

The good practices which emerged from the activities under GAP11, especially from the case studies covered in this evaluation are as follows:

- Common members across National Child Labour Committees (NCLCs) and the National Development Plan Committees, and appointment

of focal points helped to mainstream the child labour agenda into wider national policy

- Focusing on specific sectors helped to improve policy outcomes
- Flexibility to tailor activities to a country makes interventions more efficient, relevant and the effectiveness of the project
- Capitalising on ongoing research for social protection and education, e.g. conditional cash transfers, impacted child labour

Lessons Learnt

The lessons learnt from GAP11 experience are as follows:

- Projects are more effective when project activities are aligned to a strategic framework on child labour and forced labour
- Project interventions need to be customised to country needs
- A critical minimum level of intervention per country is needed
- Migrants need to be a focus due to their vulnerability to bondage and forced labour
- Adequate provisions need to be made for monitoring and evaluation systems and staff

Recommendations

The key recommendations include:

1. **Need for country-focused design and intervention:** Country selection should be based on: a) identified needs, b) an enabling environment and c) longer-term engagement of ILO or other institutions in projects on the specific thematic area. In case of countries where previous ILO projects have been done, inputs should be taken from the same.
2. **Conduct consultations prior to project design:** Projects must be designed after a consultation process, within regions and countries, and involving key stakeholders. This helps in ownership and consensus building among the stakeholders.
3. **Link projects with interventions in education, social protection and livelihoods:** Interventions

in areas related to child labour and forced labour, such as education, social protection and livelihoods, should be undertaken to increase the overall effectiveness of efforts to promote decent work.

4. **Ensure country-wise critical minimum number of activities:** Effective and efficient country projects require a critical minimum number of activities, sufficient resources, and a long-term staff in the country who would maintain the relations with key stakeholders.
5. **Address issues on migration:** Migration increases vulnerability to forced labour and trafficking and thus needs to be addressed with equal importance.
6. **Articulate mini theories of change within an overarching strategic framework:** Project activities need to be aligned to an overarching strategic framework that include mini theories of change for the elimination of child labour and forced labour.
7. **Country consultations before implementation:** Country consultations before implementation enable stakeholder collaboration and design changes if needed.
8. **Flexibility in change of activities or countries:** There should be ample scope for change in both the country selection as well as activities within the country to best suit the effective implementation of the project.
9. **Establish Partnerships:** The ILO needs to establish partnerships with a wide range of stakeholders such as government departments, police and judiciary, border control and other enforcement agents, Nongovernmental Organizations (NGOs) and academic institutions for effective implementation of the projects to eliminate child labour and forced labour.
10. **Raise funds proactively and restrain from responding to bids:** Fund raising should be done proactively according to a clearly outlined strategic framework. It needs to be country specific. Proposals for activities should be based on research indicating need, and technical support should be budgeted for.