



Enhancing occupational safety and health standards in construction sector in Cambodia – Independent Final Evaluation

QUICK FACTS

Countries: Cambodia (and subregional activities in selected ASEAN countries)

Evaluation date: 29 November 2022

Evaluation type: Project

Evaluation timing: Final

Administrative Office: RO-Asia and the Pacific

Technical Office: DWT-Bangkok

Evaluation manager: Dilki Palliyerguruge, M&E Officer; ILO CO of Sri Lanka and the Maldives

Evaluation consultant(s): Dwight Ordóñez (Lead) and Veyara Chhieu

DC Symbol: KHM/17/01/JPN

Donor(s) & budget: The Government of Japan (Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare); US\$ 2,109,386.26

Key Words: Occupational Safety and Health



BACKGROUND & CONTEXT

Summary of the project purpose, logic, and structure

The project’s objective is “To improve the safety and health of construction workers in Cambodia through effective implementation of policy and legal framework in construction sector; and promote and share best practices on OSH through training and capacity building programmes”. The project geographic scope is that of the 25 provinces of Cambodia.

The project rationale is that by establishing legal safeguards and labour rights protection, and providing training and capacity building programs, construction sector workers will benefit of improved OSH protection. The project implemented a variety of activities covering the areas of knowledge generation, technical assistance on OSH-related planning and implementation, capacity building, support to legal reform, support to institutional development, social dialogue on OSH, and awareness raising.

The project established a tripartite mechanism to oversee its implementation: The Project Advisory Board (PAB). ILO’s Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (ROAP) provided technical expertise on OSH, management systems and support to policy development through the work of the CTA and the OSH Specialist. At country level, a National Project Coordinator, an Administrative and Financial Officer, and international and national consultants provided specific support to the implementation of project activities.

Present situation of the project

This project is the second phase of a more generic one, which run between 2012 and 2015. The current project duration implementation period was April 2017 to March 2020. The project duration was later extended to December 2022, and it is now coming to an end. The project is implemented under the framework of the ILO's Flagship Programme *Safety + Health for All*.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The final evaluation’s **purpose** is to assure accountability and learning to the ILO constituents and key stakeholders. The findings and recommendations will be used as organizational learning to improve the design and implementation of future relevant project and programmes.

The **overall objective** of the final evaluation is to assess the coherence, relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability of the interventions, strategies, and approaches of the

	<p>project to enhance Occupational Safety and Health Standards in Cambodia.</p> <p>The evaluation scope covered project activities implemented at national and provincial level in Cambodia between April 2017 and October 2022.</p>
Methodology of evaluation	<p>The evaluation used a mix of evaluation approaches to ensure triangulation of information, basically: A results-based approach to examine the project’s outcome achievements; mixed methods to ensure the validity and reliability of the findings; and a participatory approach.</p> <p>Data collection methods included an exhaustive review of documents; key informant interviews (KII) and collective meetings; focus group discussions (FGD). The evaluation data collection work was performed face-to-face in both Phnom Penh and its surrounding areas, and in a remote way using conference calls as relevant, when participants were not directly accessible.</p> <p>Due to contextual factors (interference of national holidays and an ASEAN Conference that produced an extended holiday), the number of available days for data collection was reduced in practice by 30%. The evaluation team compensated this by utilizing remote means to interview some stakeholders, and it managed to access most of the participants intended for the evaluation.</p>

MAIN FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS	<p><u>General Conclusion</u></p> <p>After an extended implementation period, the project has attained most of its expected outputs and it has contributed to strengthen OSH national capacity in Cambodia. However, more time and efforts are needed to enhance and expand implementation of OSH measures in the sector around Cambodia.</p> <p><u>Validity of the Intervention Logic</u></p> <p>The timeframe, resources allocated and intervention strategies¹ were adequate for achieving the planned project’s outcomes and objectives. The project wrongly assumed that the implementation of a training-of-trainers (TOT) scheme would be enough to create an increasing, non-interrupted trickle-down effect; however, there are</p>
----------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

¹ E.g., building knowledge, providing technical assistance to government and social constituents for the elaboration of legal framework, raising awareness, and developing capacity building through training and adapted tools.



certain economic/ contractual factors that impede, in practice, the effective flow of training to construction workers, particularly those working for small subcontractors.

Coherence

While most key governmental, private sector and workers' organizations were part of the project's PAB, the project also coordinated activities with some Cooperation Agencies in Cambodia, such as the Australian People for Health Education and Development Abroad (APHEDA) and CARE. However, the project did not coordinate activities with other two key international cooperation agencies which were carrying out significant work in the OSH field in Cambodia, such as the Korean Occupational Safety and Health Agency (KOSHA), and the Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (ADFAT).

Relevance

The project is aligned with ILO's *Flagship Programme Safety + Health for All*, and it is in line with the expectations of the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MoLVT), employers' organizations and trade unions. The project is linked to various outcomes and indicators of the UNDAF, several Sustainable Development Goals (SDG), the ILO Programme and Budget, and the Royal Government of Cambodia's (RGC) Decent Work Country Programme. The project is consistent with the RGC's *National Strategic Development Plan 2019-2023*, the *Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Equity, and Efficiency: Building the foundation toward realizing the Cambodia Vision 2050 - Phase IV, 2018*, and the *National Social protection Policy Framework 2016-2025*.

Effectiveness

After an extended implementation period, the project has attained most of its expected outputs and it has contributed to strengthen OSH national capacity in Cambodia. The Project's most relevant achievements include:

- The completion and publishing of the 2nd National OSH Profile; the review of the 2nd OSH Master Plan and the preparation of a draft of the 3rd OSH Master Plan and the formulation of the National OSH Policy (pending MoLVT approval) and review of

four key OSH, construction-sector related *prakas* (pending MoLVT approval)

- The completion of the Cambodian 1st and 2nd National Asbestos Profile (CNAP), and the preparation of the Cambodian National Roadmap and Action Plan to prevent asbestos exposure and diseases for workers and community 2023-2026; the dissemination of the Guidelines on Safety of Chemical Substances at the Workplace; and the observation of World Day for Safety and Health at Work, as well as other awareness-raising events on OSH and on asbestos
- The adaptation to Khmer of relevant ILO training material on OSH in Construction (e.g., WISCON and WILCON); organization of WISCON training-of-trainers for circa 111 trainers, including 22 women, among DOSH labour inspectors and trade unions', employers' organizations and enterprises representatives, as well as WILCON training of 395 members of the Board of Engineers (of which 26 women), as well as 20 labour inspectors from DOSH; the replication of WISCON training with workers in construction sites 900 construction workers; a training-of-trainers course on the Japanese hazard prediction method for staff of the NTTI, NPIC and the Preah Kossamak Polytechnic Institute (PPI).
- Technical and financial assistance to MoLVT in the organization of an ASEAN OSHNET workshop on good practices on OSH in small and medium enterprises and the informal economy in October 2022
- A comparative study on OSH policy and legal framework in Cambodia, in support of ratification and application of ILO Convention 187.

Efficiency of Resource Use and Effectiveness of Management Arrangement

Human and financial resources have been used in a rational, ad-hoc way, following the requests of MoLVT and project planned objectives. However, while the project had a well-established tripartite mechanism to oversee its implementation (e.g., the PAB), and ROAP and local project staff provided technical expertise on OSH, management systems and support to policy development, results-based management was used by the project to a very limited extent.

Orientation Towards Impact

The project contributed to layout some key elements for a national OSH strategy. However, while some actions in favor of OSH are in development, the country still lacks an occupational safety and health prevention culture. As a result of project interventions, both intended and unintended impacts have occurred both within and outside the scope of the project.

Sustainability

By the end of project life (end of 2022), apart from a few project deliverables (OSH profile, national asbestos profile), few project elements would remain sustainable. While technical capacity has been created in DOSH/ MoLVT, further technical support and financial resources would be needed to institutionalize and expand WISCON and WILCON trainings around the country.

RECOMMENDATIONS, LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

Main Recommendations

Addressed to the ILO/ Japan Programme

Recommendation 1: Coordinate more closely ILO strategies and activities with other cooperation agencies working on OSH-related topics in Cambodia, such as KOSHA and ADFAT, and inhouse projects (*addressed to: ILO/Japan Programme, ROAP; priority: High; timing: Short-term; resources: Within current project resources*).

Recommendation 2: Help clarify roles and responsibilities and foster cooperation between MoLVT and MoLUPC (*addressed to: ILO/Japan Programme and other cooperation agencies; priority: High; timing: Short-term; resources: Within current project resources*).

Recommendation 3: Support efforts to promote the ratification of ILO Conventions 187 and 155 by the RGC (*addressed to: ILO/Japan Programme, with support of Phnom Penh CO; priority: High; timing: Medium-term; resources: Within current project resources*).

Recommendation 4: Focus more clearly project efforts on gender responsive OSH approach and measures (*addressed to: ILO/Japan Programme; priority: High; timing: Medium-term; resources: Within current project resources*).

Addressed to the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MoLVT)

Recommendation 5: Prioritize the approval and launching of the pending National OSH Policy and the enactment of four construction sector-related *prakas* (addressed to: ILO/Japan Programme; priority: High; timing: Short-term; resources: Within MoLVT current resources).

Recommendation 6: Establish clear and actionable monitoring and evaluation mechanisms within the design of the of the 3rd OSH Master Plan (addressed to: MoLVT; priority: High; timing: Short-term; resources: Within MoLVT current resources).

Recommendation 7: Establish reporting system on occupational accidents and diseases (addressed to: MoLVT; priority: High; timing: Medium-term; resources: Increased investment by RGC).

Recommendation 8: Institutionalize and expand OSH training nationwide. Establish a national certificate/accreditation system on OSH compliance and/or training (addressed to: MoLVT; priority: High; timing: Medium-term; resources: Increased investment by RGC; support from ILO/ Japan Programme).

Recommendation 9: Make workers' training on OSH mandatory during worktime without wage deduction (addressed to: MoLVT; priority: High; timing: Short-term; resources: Within MoLVT current resources).

Recommendation 10: Strengthen the OSH inspection system and decentralize competencies on prevention, supervision, and enforcement of OSH issues to PDoLVT (addressed to: MoLVT; priority: High; timing: Medium-term; resources: Increased investment by RGC).

Addressed to the MoLVT, employers' organizations and trade unions

Recommendation 11: Develop annual awareness raising campaigns on OSH, and particularly in construction, using public media and social media. Explore working with APHEDA, KOSHA and other agencies, as well as other inhouse initiatives, to carry out joint media campaign activities (addressed to MoLVT, employers' organizations and trade unions; priority: Medium; timing: Medium-term; resources: Increased investment by RGC; support from ILO/ Japan Programme).

	<p>Recommendation 12: Promote development of joint workplace OSH committees, as well of workplace risk assessments and management, as part of a gradual approach to the development of OSH management systems (<i>addressed to MoLVT, employers' organizations and trade unions; priority: High; timing: Medium-term; resources: Within MoLVT current resources</i>).</p>
<p>Main lessons learned and good practices</p>	<p>Lessons Learned</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The functions of the existing National OSH Committee could be re-defined to include the coordination role on OSH law and policy development with a view to exploring synergies, avoiding duplication of efforts and resources, and identifying potential areas for collaboration and joint implementation between and among the members from the relevant ministries and institutions and the development partners.• To facilitate consensus building and in ensuring for the best outcomes of dialogue and consultation/or discussion, the members of the National OSH Committee should have relevant technical and at least practical knowledge and experience working in the field of OSH.• The existing OSH standards that have been successfully and effectively implemented by some big construction companies could be adopted/or tailored to meet the needs of the small construction companies that have limited resources or knowledge about the OSH standards. <p>Good Practices</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Regular meetings of the PAB provided a shared space to implement tripartism and for the exchange of innovative ideas and good practices on OSH prevention measures that can be replicated and applied at the construction sites across the country.• The guidance given by the Prime Minister of the RGC, on forming a joint-inspection team among the relevant ministries and institutions can be used as a basis for future discussion between the MoLVT and the MLUPC to conduct in the future joint-inspection on OSH measures and standards in Cambodia.