



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia - Final Evaluation

Quick Facts

| | |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Countries: | <i>Somalia</i> |
| Final Evaluation: | <i>Nov. – Dec. 2021</i> |
| Evaluation Mode: | <i>Final Independent</i> |
| Administrative Office: | <i>CO-Addis Ababa for Ethiopia, Somalia, Sudan, South Sudan and Djibouti</i> |
| Technical Office: | <i>ILO-DWT Cairo and HQ Geneva</i> |
| Evaluation Manager: | <i>David Dorkenoo</i> |
| Evaluation Consultant(s): | <i>Edwin Okul, PhD & Abdinur Abdikadir</i> |
| Project Code: | <i>SOM/18/02/ITA</i> |
| Donor(s) & Budget: | <i>Italian Agency for Development Corporation (AICS) – US\$ 852,547</i> |
| Keywords: | <i>Decent Work; Peace; Resilience; Social Partners; Tripartite</i> |

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The project 'Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia' was implemented by ILO and funded by the Italian Agency for International Cooperation (AICS). It addressed challenges for social dialogue in Somalia that stem from the skills gaps in the area of social dialogue among union leaders and the weak institutional capacity, especially of unions, to undertake effective organization, recruitment and retention of workers; and difficulties in organizing marginalized and vulnerable groups of workers, including informal economy workers and

underemployed workers in industries. There is also inadequate capacity of the trade unions to effectively engage policy issues such as national employment, labour law reform, constitutional review process and other labour related policies/laws. Coupled with widespread decent work deficits and gender disparity in representation and treatment in employment. This is besides the challenge of integrating and mainstreaming women, youth and workers with disabilities in trade union movement, social dialogue mechanisms and activities.

Present Situation of the Project

The project, through FESTU progressively has achieved a remarkable progress by increasing its membership from 72,000 members in 2018 to 148,520 members (57,235 paying membership fees and 91,285-book membership) in 2019. This represents a growth of 206% across 12 affiliated unions. As of 30 April 2021, FESTU membership recruitment drive has achieved a record high of 158, 820 members in 12 unions.

FESTU has reactivated its website where press releases and other vital information on its activities and the project are regularly updated. The website is used as system/tool to record information for the national partner (FESTU).

The project has also contributed to the capacity of the national partner (FESTU) by establishing 5 functional offices and training centre. The training centre is used in training leaders and members of FESTU.

The project has also supported the development of the following key national policies and laws for Somalia: Occupational Health and Safety Policy; National Environmental Policy; Sexual offences Bill (SOB); Environment Law; review of the Labour Code; FESTU's position paper on union action on climate

change: the road to Glasgow, preparations of the UN Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework; Access to information Bill and National Development Plan. The project also established women trade union committee to address the critical gender gaps and parities in the sector and contributed to Somalia's ratification of seven ILO conventions at ago in June 2021 besides strengthening the voice of trade unions in the on-going DWCP process and democratic dispensation in Somalia.

A Committee of Women Trade Unions established to regularly review situation of women in the labour market and in trade union movement and make efforts for addressing their challenges. The project oversaw establishment of a Committee of Women Trade Union which collaborated with the National Women Committee in advocating for policies and addressing the critical gender gaps and parities in the sector.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The purpose of the evaluation was to establish the relevance of the project design and implementation strategy in relation to the ILO, UN and national development frameworks (i.e. SDGs and UNSDCF) and beneficiaries' needs and to assess the extent to which the project has achieved its stated objectives and expected results. It also sought to identify unexpected positive and negative results and assess the level of implementation efficiency of the project as well as the extent to which the project outcomes will be sustainable. It also aimed to assess the project impact at institutional level as well at the level of the final beneficiaries, identify lessons learned and potential good practices and provide recommendations to project stakeholders.

The evaluation covered the entire project duration, from May 2019 to October 2021. Within this timeline, the evaluation assessed project outcomes at all levels: including all result areas, implementing partners and project stakeholders.

The evaluation integrates gender equality and non-discrimination as a crosscutting concern throughout its deliverables and process, with special attention to women workers. It should be addressed in line with EVAL guidance note n° 4 and Guidance Note n° 7 to ensure stakeholder participation.

The primary clients of the evaluation are the, the government, social partners including FETSU, The donor, ILO as well as other relevant stakeholders. The

Office and stakeholders involved in the execution of the project would use, as appropriate, the evaluation findings and lessons learnt.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation employed a robust approach appropriate for the scope of the project, resources, and audience and had three key approaches: a theory-based evaluation approach, a process evaluation approach and an impact evaluation approach. The methodology was participatory, engaging different stakeholders in meaningful and appropriate ways to ensure inclusion, reflecting on and respecting stakeholder diversity. It adopted both qualitative and quantitative methods to collect and analyse data from both primary and secondary sources.

The evaluation collected information from beneficiaries, stakeholders who have project responsibilities, including representatives of ILO Country Office, Project Management Team Members, Technical Backstopping Members, Implementing Partners and Government Lead agencies. Triangulation was adopted, and the data collection methods included but was not limited to a survey, desk review and key informant interviews / structured individual interviews. Content analysis and other appropriate quantitative and qualitative data analysis procedures were used to analyse the data generated from the documents, FGDs and KIIs.

The evaluation was carried out in adherence with the relevant parts of the ILO Evaluation Framework and Strategy; ILO Policy Guidelines for Evaluation: Principles, Rationale, Planning and Managing for Evaluations and UNEG Principles. In particular, this evaluation followed the ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation; and the ILO EVAL Policy Guidelines Checklist 3 "Preparing the inception report"; Checklist 4 "Validating methodologies"; Checklist 5 "Preparing the evaluation report" and Checklist "6 Rating the quality of evaluation report"

The Covid-19 situation remained the greatest risk to the execution of the evaluation. The basis of this evaluation was self-reports by stakeholders in the project for Key Informant Interviews and facilitated Focused Group Discussions. For that reason, the evaluators corroborated responses and the validity of responses was assessed. Self-report being retrospective tests on respondent's memories that might or might not be relied upon. Where there was

limited information, this was addressed through use of multiple data collection and analysis approaches to enable an in-depth understanding of the evaluation questions.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Relevance and strategic fit

The project activities addressed the priority needs of the beneficiaries (trade unions, and by extension, the Somali workers). It addressed the skills gaps in the area of social dialogue among union leaders and the weak institutional capacity, especially of unions, to undertake effective organization, recruitment and retention of workers. The project was well aligned with the social pillar of the country's National Development Plan (NDP 2017-2019). It was implemented in orientation with the United Nations Sustainable Development Framework which informs a team approach on the part of all UN agencies in delivery to support the efforts of the country. It was also consistent with and promoted FESTU's engagement with ILO under ILO's Transitional Support Plan for Somalia (decent work, labour rights, social protection and freedom of association human rights, safety of employees, international conventions, decent employment creation, strengthening tripartism and social dialogue, and institutional capacity building).

Validity of design

A pre-implementation needs assessment was carried out to establish the prevailing status of the trade unions and capacity of government institutions which informed the project design. The recruitment of workers into trade unions as a major strategy led to an increase in union membership which gave rise to an increase in FESTU's earnings from member contributions. By leveraging the worker reach of trade unions, the government acquired useful statistical research on Living Standard Index of the population that informed government projects aimed at social protection and economic empowerment.

Project progress and effectiveness

Trade Unions are capable to undertake advocacy and training support to workers and contribute to development policies. The project supported FESTU to establish regional secretariat offices in Garowe, Baidoa, Galkayo, Beledweyne, and Dhusamareb. The policy advocacy conducted through engagement with FESTU included the Sexual Offences Bill, Occupational Health and Safety Policy, and lobbying for the Information Bill through the Journalist Union.

FESTU spearheaded the process that led to development and adoption of the Employment policy. Similarly, Trade Union members from FESTU attended the Glasgow Forum on Climate Change which helped them provide input for the government to draft a National Environment Policy and climate law.

Trade Union members of FESTU have developed plans for promoting rights at workplaces. In collaboration with FESTU, the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs and the Somali Chamber of Commerce and Industry, the project conducted 6 tripartite trainings in which more than 840 members benefitted. The trainings raised awareness on decent work, skills development for future of work, Occupational Health and Safety Management. Trade unions are now playing an important role in protecting the rights of workers, thereby contributing to sustainable growth and development. At enterprise level, the trade unions have been able to secure improved working conditions for the employees/workers.

Tripartite Policy Dialogues organized on different dimensions of Decent Work - where Trade Unions participate actively in terms of providing evidence and workers' aspirations. Active participation of Trade Unions in Tripartite Policy Dialogues were organized to discuss the different dimensions of decent work resulted in drafting of a revised Labour Code in line with International Labour Standards and renewal of collective bargaining agreements between FESTU unions and employers. Workers gained knowledge and skills which led to improvement in their terms of work, increased wages and improved working conditions.

A Committee of Women Trade Unions established to regularly review situation of women in the labour market and in trade union movement and make efforts for addressing their challenges.

Efficiency of resource use

Resources were utilized efficiently with consideration for value for money with activities planned in advance and budgets utilized according to approved plans and within budget ceilings. There were however reports of bureaucratic bottlenecks, with the ILO. For instance, after the finance and administrative assistant moved on from the project in 2020, it took about six months to recruit their replacements.

Organization management arrangements

Preceding the start of the project, the steering committee formulated a Terms of Reference for the

tripartite arrangement, bringing together all the key actors including donor partner organization, the ILO and their counterparts, and trade union organization in Italy. The ILO's failure to provide administrative and finance support staff to oversee adherence to the standard of ILO financial rules posed a challenge to implementers who had to spend much time reviewing ILO standards throughout project implementation in order to ensure compliance.

Orientation to impact and sustainability

The increased enrolment of workers in trade unions has enabled workers to benefit from the collective push for decent working conditions in the country. The tripartite/bipartite agreements and social dialogues further emboldened workers and created awareness of their rights. The project also equipped Secretariat offices in different regions of the country with state-of-the-art furniture and modern equipment that will be used for a long time without being worn out. The workplace educators trained by FESTU on active learning and participation techniques enabled them to conduct active trade union trainings.

Conclusions

The "Occupation and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience in Somalia" project was generally successful and the objectives were largely met. Most of the beneficiaries embraced the increased role in policy dialogues and constitutional reform process as the actions emboldened workers' activism. There were key achievements in the thematic areas including membership growth, strengthened institutional capacity, amplified workers' voice, advocacy for decent work agenda in Somalia and in the international community, more understanding of International Labour Standard (ILS), enhanced respect for labour rights, Capacity building for Trade Union workers and Gender and inclusiveness.

Recommendations

Main recommendations and follow-up

1. **Although this project contributed a lot towards levelling the playing field for Trade Unions in Somalia, the project's scope was modest compared to the monumental national challenge facing Somali workers-employers' relationship.** Given the complexity of the Somalia context, many hurdles still abound. These include political interference, harassment from both state and non-state actors, workers' apathy and non-involvement of all employers in enterprise-level participation.

These issues require a longer duration of project cycle, beyond the two years that was the timeline of this project.

2. **Policy making in Somalia remains largely prescriptive and driven by powerful external influences, leaving little room for the workers and trade unions to make significant contributions.** Workers that attended training and understand the labour rights concept should be supported by the government through deliberate policies to continue spreading information to co-workers at the workplace and during interactions at trade union meetings in order to increase awareness.
3. **For this project, the implementing partners did not receive adequate training of financial management. This led to delays in preparation of financial reports and disbursement of subsequent tranches of funds. The ILO should train personnel from the implementing partners on management of a large pool of project funds. Similarly, the ILO should train partners on ILO financial policies and procurement compliance and possibly assign an ILO technical observer to monitor adherence to financial guidelines.**
4. **The union's capacity in six core domains i.e. governance, leadership & program development, monitoring & evaluation, human resources, financial management, procurement and supply chain should be improved through further capacity building.** Established structures such as the regional secretariats, social dialogue platforms and government-chamber of commerce-trade union dialogue platforms should be monitored by FESTU and relevant state agencies to ensure improved growth and sustainability.
5. **Government and private sector should facilitate labour union workers to occupy executive positions in federal and state level governance structures and take part in implementing rectified conventions and amplify the union's voice and objectives in governance.** This includes lobbying the Somali government to rectify more conventions and empower justice service providers in the Supreme Court and district courts to provide workers with effective legal representation.