



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

More and Better Jobs for Women: Women's Empowerment through Decent Work in Turkey

Midterm Independent Evaluation

Quick Facts

Countries: Türkiye

Mid-Term or Final Evaluation: Midterm- 2022

Evaluation Mode: Independent Midterm

Administrative Office: ILO, Ankara-Türkiye

Technical Office: GEDI

Evaluation Manager: Ms. Özge Berber-Agtaş

Evaluation Consultant(s): Ms. O. Gökçe Baykal

Project Code: TUR/18/03/SWE

Donor(s) & Budget: Swedish International
Development Cooperation Agency (SWEDEN)
3,281,991.83 USD

Keywords: gender equality, women's economic empowerment, decent work, rights at work, active labour market policies

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The 2nd phase of the project on "More and Better Jobs for Women: Women's Economic Empowerment through Decent Work in Turkey" has been implemented by the ILO funded through Sweden. The overall objective of the Phase II of the project is to increase the number of women working with decent

conditions in Türkiye. More specifically, Phase II aims (i) to support effective implementation and monitoring of National Action Plan (NAP) and Local Action Plans (LAPs) on Women's Employment by İŞKUR, (ii) to support adoption and implementation of measures for decent working conditions for women (special focus given to *gender pay gap*, *gender-based violence at workplace*, *reconciling work-life balance* and *women's leadership*) by Ministry of Labour and Social Security (MoLSS), social partners and by pilot enterprises.

Phase II of the Project includes two interrelated outcomes that contributes to: (Outcome 1), which is *more and better work opportunities for women jobseekers in Türkiye*, where all of the interventions implemented together with İŞKUR and (Outcome 2), which is *improving working conditions for women*, where this outcome focuses on building capacity of MoLSS, worker and employer organizations, pilot enterprises on gender equality and decent work conditions for women (focusing on gender pay gap, gender-based violence at workplaces, reconciling work-life balance and women's leadership) as well as on effective communication skills and coalition-building to promote women's opportunities for decent work.

Present Situation of the Project

Compared to other developing countries and as a recently urbanized country with 75% of the population living in urban areas, Türkiye has a very low female labour participation rate. Based on the ILOSTAT 2020, female labour force participation rate is 30.8 per cent,

well below the average of among countries with similar income levels. While most women remain out of the labour market, many women are in fact working in the informal economy in Türkiye. An important result of informal employment is the lack of social protection which is a core element of decent working conditions. Another issue around female labour force participation in Türkiye is gender pay gap. According to the joint study by ILO Office for Türkiye and TURKSTAT, gender wage gap is 15.6% in Türkiye, where gender wage widens as age increases and educational level decreases.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

This evaluation serves both assessment and organizational learning purposes. We understand the primary rationale to be to analyse outcomes and draw lessons from the experience of the ILO regarding the project, to contribute to further project development and help define what and how the ILO contributed to strengthening the capacity of governments and social partners as well as private sector in promoting gender equality in the world of work.

The first (primary stakeholders) are those involved in implementation of the project – including ILO project staff involved in the implementation of project, donor, and relevant national stakeholders including İŞKUR, MoLSS, and workers' and employers' organizations, private companies, who benefit directly from the contributions of the project, and civil society organizations working on these themes.

Methodology of evaluation

This mid-term evaluation is predominantly a qualitative one. However, the qualitative data is coming various sources which allows us for triangulating the findings. This evaluation used three data collection methods, including (i) reviewing key level documentations; (ii) analysing of existing quantitative data; (iii) conducting key informant interviews with stakeholder. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, the fieldwork for the qualitative data collection was conducted online between March 2022 and April 2022. We conducted 22 KIIs with ILO project staff in Türkiye Office and other key informants in beneficiary organizations including worker's and employer's organizations, private companies, İŞKUR

and MoLSS and plus academicians, experts working in the project and finally, donor.

Main Findings & Conclusions

The project indicates a high alignment/relevancy both with ILO's mandates, policies, strategies, project and budget documents, and with Türkiye's main strategic documents underpinning empowerment of women including United Nations Development and Cooperation Strategy (UNDCS) 2016-2020 and UN Sustainable Development Cooperation Framework (UNSDCF) 2021-2025, 10th and 11th National Development Plans. The emphasis of the programme on women labour force participation, care policies overlap with the priorities and/or main features of the current context, current themes of this post-COVID-19 era. Therefore, the projects have been keeping its relevancy and still getting attention and interest of various internal and external stakeholders.

ILO's contribution to policy development through partnership under Outcome 1 has enhanced and strengthened technical capacity of its partner on gender sensitive employment services and result based management approach. However, it is important to note that the implementation of the activities has been progressing steadily but slowly than expected.

ILO has been quite successful to reach out the most relevant partners and contributed to the stakeholders' technical capacity on gender sensitive employment policies, gender equality, and improved working condition of women. However, it is important to note that the project is engaged into the embedded issues, such as gender in Turkish society, which will take some effort and time to change the overall mentality on gender equality. Therefore, it is essential to conduct follow up trainings, making these training a part of the institutions' capacity development programmes.

The progress of the project has been slower than usual due to COVID 19. The negative consequences of COVID-19, structural change taken place in stakeholder organization, resulted in the delays in getting results under Outcome 1. Outcome 2 progressed more efficiently taking into attention willingness of the partners, particularly private companies. The reach out technique that was used during the interventions with private companies

worked out efficiently and the targeting of the workshops fit perfect for the purposes of the project.

There is a significant synergy created between the previous, particularly Phase I of the Project & ongoing ILO's projects and the project being evaluated here on providing decent work opportunities, facilitating the access of women into labour market. ILO's experience of having partnerships and work experience with other stakeholders, local partners, and private companies, and national partners, MoLSS, İŞKUR, has also contributed to the outcome of the project.

In the private sector side, the companies are very well prepared and very willing to sustain the outcome of the project and proved their willingness to ensure sustainability of gains. On the public institutions side, the capacity building in partner institutions is important for longer-term goals of the program. The digitalization of the training materials through ILO Academy will provide an important opportunity for the sustainability of the trainings.

The International Labour Standards (ILS) and Social Dialogue policies of the ILO are strongly embedded in the project design, which has been successfully implemented so far. The project activities and output have been specifically contributing to this end with a particular emphasis on decent work principles of ILO. The project strongly facilitates continued policy dialogue and implementation within its tripartite constituents, including government, employer, and worker representatives.

Recommendations

Main recommendations and follow-up

- 1- The identification of the target group in any of the trainings and any of the relevant capacity building exercise is quite crucial in reaching project's objectives, not in quantitative terms solely but also in qualitative terms.
- 2- Targeting of the capacity building activities, the content of these activities and the language of these interventions (while not sacrificing the content and significant points) might create more results, more impact on the beneficiary and organization side, if it is planned meticulously and targeted better.

- 3- ILO should continue to carry out advocacy activities to develop and ensure ownership and leadership of relevant partners for the results.
- 4- ILO should think and plan on how these institutional capacity building exercises, all the strategies, all these models coming out of intensive research can reach out to women in the field. ILO should do brainstorming with the relevant partners to plan the next stage of turning this knowledge into a life, practise in the field for a longer and permanent term.
- 5- Implementing the model within a selected, pilot municipality while ILO technically backing up the implementation, therefore it would be a good practice and might encourage other municipalities to implement such a model on early childhood care. Regarding gender pay gap, ILO together with Türkiye's leading sectors could work on models where selected unions take a lead to diminish gender pay gap with a more hands on work model.
- 6- An immense data was collected on domestic workers. The next step should be working on applied models that will affect workers' lives in a better way. Organizational models on how to bring domestic workers together can be studied, again with technical support of ILO.
- 7- An exercise of sharing a well-planned, clean work plan even from scratch including activities, progress, expected outcomes need to be shared and discussed with İŞKUR.
- 8- The **stakeholder meetings** are necessary to update each other about the project' progress, conduct brainstorming sessions, initiate partnerships or at least create a network to introduce institutions to each other. In addition to tripartite dialogue, they should be coordinated and carried out bilaterally as well.
- 9- As a very significant actor in gender issues **non-governmental organizations** working, advocating for female labour force participation need to be considered as direct partners in some engagement level.