



International
Labour
Organization

► Evaluation Office



i-eval Discovery



The Inclusive Growth through Decent Work in the Great Rift Valley Project, Public Private Development Partnership (PPDP) – Independent Final evaluation

QUICK FACTS

Countries: Kenya

Evaluation date: 25 September 2023

Evaluation type: Project

Evaluation timing: Final

Administrative Office: ILO Country Office for the United Republic of Tanzania, Burundi, Kenya, Rwanda and Uganda

Technical Office: DWT/CO Pretoria

Evaluation manager: Elmira Bakhshinyan

Evaluation consultant(s): Dr. Edwin Ochieng Okul (Lead Consultant) and Dr. Margaret Wanjiku

DC Symbol: KEN/17/01/SWE

Donor(s) & budget: USD\$ 7,760,414 (Sida contribution: USD 4,870,000 & Partners contribution USD 2,890,414)

Key Words: Public Private Development Partnership (PPDP), Green energy, Education, Skills and Capacity building, Economic activities and Entrepreneurship, Social inclusion, protection and security, Gender and Labour and employment



BACKGROUND & CONTEXT

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The project aimed to address poverty, exclusion, lack of employable skills, gender inequality, and inadequate public services. The project was designed to create decent jobs through vocational training centers, foster business development through relevant skills and access to finance, promote workers' rights, and strengthen communities' capacity to advocate for improved public and social services. It employed skills development, community mobilization, advocacy, and research as key means of action.

It focused on specific areas in the Great Rift Valley, namely Suswa and RapLands in Nakuru and Narok Counties, and involved various villages/communities. The primary beneficiaries were young people, women, and vulnerable community members.

The project operated under a Public Private Development Partnership model with funding from the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida). The International Labour Organization (ILO) implemented the project with support from ForumCiv. Governance and technical guidance were provided by a Partnership Steering Committee (PSC) and Partnership Advisory Committee (PAC). A Skills Technical Working Group Committee (STWG) and Sub-Committee offered technical assistance.

Present situation of the project

The project developed and implemented demand-driven courses in different fields and youth from Vocational Training Centers (VTCs) pursuing these courses were assessed and certified, while VTCs received new tools and equipment for practical training. Trainers completed Training of Trainers (ToTs) courses, and industry experts provided mentorship to trainees. Partnerships with companies enabled trainees to gain pre-employment training through attachment and internship opportunities.

Women and youth have received business development training, with several of them connected to financial services and other business development support. This resulted in the initiation of sustainable enterprises and the creation of jobs. The project equipped communities with skills for advocacy and lobbying, including the development of Community Action Plans and the presentation of proposals to duty bearers. The project established dialogue platforms and decision-making spaces, increasing community awareness of government processes. The communities implemented projects and engaged in the social auditing process. The project successfully mobilized funds through partnerships, exceeding the expected contribution and a second phase of the project has been initiated.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

The primary purpose of the final independent evaluation was to provide an unbiased assessment of the project's overall coherence, relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, and sustainability. The final evaluation assessed the project's outputs and outcomes during its entire implementation period, from May 10, 2018, to May 19, 2023. It focused on the alignment of these outcomes with County Integrated Development Plans, national policies, and programs, specifically in Narok and Nakuru counties. The evaluation examined various project-related documents and analyzed six key themes: environmental sustainability, gender equality, conflict mitigation, life skills, social dialogue, and international labour standards.

The primary users of the evaluation were the Nakuru and Narok County Governments, Kenyan ministries, employer and trade union organizations, vocational training authorities, and private sector project partners. Additionally, the evaluation findings were expected to benefit a wide range of stakeholders, including government institutions, civil society organizations, donors, UN agencies, international organizations, and other units within the ILO, by generating valuable knowledge.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation methodology followed rigorous guidelines and employed diverse data collection methods in line with ILO, UNEG, and OECD/DAC standards. It used a mixed-methods approach combining quantitative and qualitative analysis through site visits, desk reviews, consultations,

and workshops with stakeholders. Triangulation of sources and techniques ensured validity. The evaluation encompassed theory-based, process, and impact evaluation approaches. Theory-based evaluation assessed the project's theory of change, process evaluation examined delivery and effectiveness, and impact evaluation compared baseline and endline data. Data collection focused on RapLands in Nakuru and Suswa in Narok County, using random sampling and purposive selection. Stakeholders were engaged through discussions and interviews, ensuring gender representation. A survey was conducted using the Kobo Collect platform. Limitations were overcome without compromising quality. A workshop involving beneficiaries and partners refined the report's and findings, with the consultants incorporating feedback to improve quality.

MAIN FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS

Relevance: The ILO's Inclusive Growth and Decent Jobs Programme, implemented through the Public Private Development Programme (PPDP) approach, is highly relevant to Nakuru and Narok Counties, aligning with their development plans, the ILO's programs, and the SDGs. It aims to reduce poverty and improve living conditions by addressing youth unemployment and social exclusion. The project effectively tackles these challenges, supports the government's priorities, and targets youth in vocational training. It demonstrated flexibility during the pandemic and collaborated with multiple stakeholders. The project's design effectively establishes vocational training centers, creates jobs, and enhances community participation.

Effectiveness: The project has been effective in its unique concept of providing vocational training and entrepreneurship opportunities. It achieved outcomes related to increased enrollment in Vocational Training Centers (VTCs), business creation, improved profitability, community participation and advocacy, and partner engagement. Challenges included limited financing, dropouts among girls, coordination issues, and delays. The project effectively addresses cross-cutting issues, including climate change, gender equality, and disability inclusion. Positive outcomes include environmental conservation, increased gender equality, improved inclusion of persons with disabilities, and mitigation of conflicts. Partnership arrangements involving political leaders, county governments, private sector partners, and trade unions contributed to the project's success. The mid-term evaluation recommendations were effectively addressed, including the inclusion of persons with disabilities and an extension due to COVID-19 interruptions.

Efficiency: The project's cost efficiency was bolstered by effective partnership arrangements but hindered by challenges in securing expected funding, while issues like limited stakeholder engagement and unclear committee mandates may have affected overall efficiency. The project demonstrated efficiency through catalytic funding, grassroots institution development, and effective resource utilization. However, partner contributions posed challenges, requiring comprehensive discussions and commitment.

Impact: The project made a significant impact in reducing poverty, improving living conditions, and supporting the SDGs.

Sustainability: Sustainability measures include an exit strategy, strong partnerships, knowledge transfer, continuous learning, and alignment with national and county priorities. The project's ownership and financial contribution from the government indicate sustainability, and a Programme Sustainability Committee has been established.

Cross cutting Themes: The project prioritized gender equality, empowering women and addressing SRHR and gender-based violence. It emphasized gender mainstreaming in project management through staff training. Collaboration with ILO, private sector, and trade unions ensured inclusivity. Successful partnerships with various stakeholders contributed to project achievements. The project aimed to improve labor conditions in local communities, particularly

focusing on the geothermal sector. Engagement and conservation efforts were conducted through climate change assessments. However, the project lacked strong environmental sustainability measures, impacting mitigation and adaptation efforts.

Conclusion.

Relevance: PPDP showcased relevance by effectively mobilizing stakeholders for inclusive economic growth and achieving notable accomplishments in vocational training, teaching quality, internships, and jobs. Community engagement and sub-grants encouraged civic dialogue on governance, with potential for sustained initiatives through strengthened dialogue platforms with increased budgets and extended implementation periods.

Effectiveness: PPDP effectively addressed gender equality, flexibility, infrastructure, and maternal/child health, necessitating a comprehensive approach for transformative impact, including policy changes and enhanced support mechanisms, especially for women entrepreneurs. Long-term engagement with women's organizations is vital for ongoing success.

Efficiency: Effective partnerships enhanced cost efficiency, although funding challenges were encountered. Limited stakeholder engagement and unclear committee mandates may have affected overall efficiency. Engaging governors and county assemblies needs improvement in committee structure and roles to enhance efficiency.

Impact: PPDP had a significant impact, improving beneficiaries' knowledge, skills, capacities, and job opportunities. The project notably impacted the geothermal sector, emphasizing workers' rights, labor conditions, and community engagement.

Sustainability: A critical milestone was achieving a sustainability plan and establishing a sustainability committee, ensuring continued activities post-project closure and incorporating lessons for future scaling.

Crosscutting Themes: The project prioritized gender equality, SRHR, and gender mainstreaming effectively. A tripartite approach involving ILO, private sector partners, and trade unions ensured inclusivity and successful partnerships, contributing to project achievements. However, there was a lack of prioritization and robust measures for environmental sustainability and climate resilience, impeding efforts to mitigate environmental impact and promote sustainable practices.

RECOMMENDATIONS, LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

Recommendation

1. ILO working with county government actors to create synergies, should **implement a business incubation initiative** in interventions beyond this project to provide support for VTC graduates, including skills-building, value chain development, business financing, and starter kits, with the involvement of additional private actors like financing institutions.
2. ForumCiv, partner CBOs and ILO should **prioritize community mobilization, advocacy, engagement with male and female community members**, and collaboration with grassroots women's groups, CBOs, and networks, as it also lays the groundwork for other crosscutting themes.
3. ILO should **include industry expert-led career talks and role models** to be involved by the partners (TVETS and Industry) to help students gain exposure, learn, and develop the right attitude for the industry.
4. All project partners (TVETA, NITA, VTCs, ILO & ForumCiv) based on their respective mandates, should **integrate environmental sustainability and climate resilience considerations** by setting specific targets, adopting climate-friendly practices, and introducing courses on biogas technologies and solar energy technicians in VTCs. This should include building on the green transition and adapting VTCs' courses to needs for new, emerging job opportunities in the greening of the economy.
5. All PPDP partners should actively **include grassroots communities in project discussions and decision-making processes** to understand their needs and provide targeted solutions.

6. Partners (including ILO, ForumCiv, private sector actors and government institutions) should consider **bundling human rights and business approaches**.
7. ILO and ForumCiv should **involve top county government officials, such as governors and county assemblies in project activities**, and consider designating the county secretary's office as the focal point, facilitating buy-in and counterpart funding release.
8. Core PPDP partners (ForumCiv, ILO, National and County Government) should review the PSC and PAC composition, addressing stakeholder concerns about mandates, roles, and inclusive participation.
9. All PPDP partners should identify and address the specific needs and barriers faced by PWDs, and advocate for their inclusion in decision-making processes.
10. ILO and Partners should strengthen the project's focus on Sexual and Reproductive Health (SRH) and Sexual and Gender-Based Violence (SGBV) by expanding community-level advocacy and sensitization efforts.

Main lessons learned and good practices

Lessons Learned

- The inclusion of public and private sector stakeholders in the PPDP project led to diverse perspectives, expertise, and resources, enabling comprehensive problem-solving and innovative decision-making. This inclusivity ensured consideration of varied interests and needs, resulting in inclusive and sustainable solutions.
- Demonstrating early benefits and impacts of the partnership inspires commitment and motivation among stakeholders, fostering continued engagement.
- Building trusted relationships and engaging in dialogue was essential for promoting mindset and practice changes in the PPDP. This required a significant investment of time and resources.
- The demand-driven approach as seen in the PPDP ensured local relevance and sustainability by aligning programming with the needs and interests of beneficiaries.
- Limited governor and county assembly involvement underscores the need for proactive engagement to integrate projects effectively into local governance structures.

Good Practices

- The PPDP project by design employed a participatory approach, engaging all stakeholders and innovatively addressing skills development, micro-enterprise development, and access to public services through rights advocacy. Regular partner meetings facilitated fruitful discussions on supporting youth and women.
- The PPDP project fostered integration among stakeholders and sectors within the counties. The pooling of expertise, resources, and networks from various stakeholders enabled a more coordinated and coherent implementation of project activities. The integration of stakeholders and sectors not only strengthened the impact of the project but also created a solid foundation for future collaborations and sustainable development efforts within the counties.
- The management team prioritized partners and stakeholders taking ownership of project activities. This strategy helped to sustain the project components undertaken by government agencies.