



# Evaluation Summary



International  
Labour  
Office

Evaluation  
Office

## The Way Forward After the Revolution - Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia

### Quick Facts

**Countries:** *Egypt and Tunisia*

**Final Evaluation:** *May-June 2018*

**Mode of Evaluation:** *Independent Final*

**Administrative Office:** *DWT/CO-Egypt*

**Technical Office:** *EVAL*

**Evaluation Manager:** *Marwa Salah-Abdou*

**Evaluation Consultant:** *Nahla Hassan*

**Project End:** *31 March 2018*

**Project Code:** *RAF/12/01/FIN*

**Donor & Project Budget:** *Finland US\$ 3,808,747*

**Keywords:** *Egypt, Tunisia, Decent Work for women, women entrepreneurship, women representation, women in business, employer organization and worker organization.*

### Background & Context

#### Background

In response to the changes in Egypt and Tunisia, the International Labour Organization (ILO) designed and implemented the “Way Forward after the Revolution: Decent Work for Women in Egypt and Tunisia” project. The project started in June 2012 but initiated its activities in January 2013 and was completed (after 5 extensions, including one cost extension) on 31st of March 2018. The project aimed at strengthening women’s position to participate in the labour market in Tunisia and Egypt.

#### Project Description

The Way Forward after the Revolution is an ILO implemented project. The project responded to a demand among constituents for supporting the promotion of gender at the work place and strengthening of women economic empowerment.

The project had an approved budget of €2,500,000 that was complemented by an additional financial contribution of € 622,023`in 2016. The total project budget was hence increased to US\$ 3,808,747. It started on 1st June 2012 and ran until 31st of March 2018

The project has four immediate objectives as follows:

1. Sensitizing social partners and a wider audience on gender issues and inequalities in the world of work
2. Increasing the capacity of and institutional setting for females to equip them with necessary skills to engage in social dialogue and collective bargaining processes for advancing gender equality, non-discrimination, and increased female representation in trade unions
3. Increasing women’s skills to enhance their employability.
4. Capacity building for labour market institutions to better serve women and increase women’s access to these institutions.

#### Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

According to the TORs, the stated **purpose** of this evaluation is:

1. Give an independent assessment of progress the results achieved by to date of the project across all the outcomes; assessing performance as per the foreseen targets and indicators of achievement at output and outcome levels as well as

- strategies and implementation modalities chosen; partnership arrangements, constraints and opportunities in implementing the project
2. Provide recommendations for Phase II of the project.
  3. Document lessons learned and good practices in order to maximize the experience gained.

## **Methodology of evaluation**

The scope of the final evaluation includes a review and assessment of all activities carried out under the project agreement/contract. All activities that have been implemented from project launch through the time of evaluation fieldwork were considered. The evaluation assessed the positive and negative changes produced by the project – intended and unintended, direct and indirect, as well as any changes in the social and economic environment in the country – as reported by respondents. Performance was assessed based on the OECD-DAC Criteria. More specifically and as specified in the terms of reference the evaluation assessed: relevance and validity of project design; project progress and effectiveness; efficiency; impact orientation and sustainability of the project; and effectiveness of management arrangements.

## **Main Findings & Conclusions**

### **Relevance**

The Way Forward after the revolution was designed and started its implementation at a time of major changes in Egypt and Tunisia. The project was timely and relevant to the needs and priorities of both countries. The project aimed to prioritise gender in discussions and actions in both countries thus integrating equality and equity in discussions around women and their rights in all aspects of society.

The expected results of the project are also well suited to the objectives and priorities of the International Labour Organisation (ILO). The project theory of change focuses on advancing the rights of women at work which is inherent in the objectives and priorities of the ILO's decent work agenda globally, regionally and in Egypt and Tunisia. The ILO has been addressing gender issues

for many years. With the advent of the Arab Spring in 2011, the ILO developed a North Africa Strategy to respond to the events unfolding in the region. The Strategy includes references to gender, social dialogue and youth employment. Gender and youth employment were and continue to be a priority for governments, donors and international organisations in North Africa.

The Way Forward after the Revolution embodies several elements of the ILO North Africa Strategy with its focus on strengthening the work of social partners, integrating concepts of equality and representation and women employability, the project is relevant and well suited to the context of its design and implementation in Egypt and Tunisia especially until the end of 2014.

The final evaluation concurs with the findings of the mid-term evaluation related to the coherence of the results framework as written. As presented in the project documents, the results framework is ambitious and difficult to measure due to the way in which some of the objectives are formulated. The phrasing of objectives is general and broad and the selected outputs (some read more like objectives) do not always reflect a causality.

A review of the entire results framework indicates that Immediate Objective 3, its outputs, indicators and targets are coherent and well developed. The remaining two immediate objectives (1 and 4) could have used a revision to reflect the actual work carried out by the project.

It is also worth pointing out that immediate objective 2 focusing on Women Entrepreneurship Development (WED) studies and immediate objective 4 focusing on increasing the knowledge base through capacity building and research are very well connected and should have been merged at mid-term. It is difficult to understand whether the activities and outputs developed and implemented by the project as part of the WED research and subsequent publication and advocacy is part of immediate objective 2 or 4.

### **Effectiveness**

The project was able to achieve or partially achieve the majority of its objectives and targets. The project worked both at the policy level through its first two objectives, the implementation level

through objective 3 and on the strengthening of the knowledge base related to women and work through objective 4. It is noted that an even distribution of targets and achievements was not required in the project document. This flexibility allowed the project to work on what was possible in each of the two targeted countries. This was one of the most successful implementation strategies of the project which enabled it to navigate the challenges and changing contexts especially in Egypt.

The Way Forward after the Revolution strategy of complimenting the work of the ILO in Cairo was effective in engaging the Federation of Egyptian Industries (FEI). The project supported the establishment of the Women in Business Unit at FEI. This helped the FEI review their structure, role and work. The project helped raise awareness of the strategic partners of the ILO.

In Tunisia the project was able to use the opportunity of the presence of a strong tripartism and the strong role of the three partners/constituents. According to project management, in Tunisia there were many champions for gender equality and the project worked well with them. Moreover, due to the relatively enabling environment in Tunisia, the project formed a Project Advisory Committee (PAC) composed on all relevant stakeholders. This was an effective strategy to ensure coordination, complementarity and engagement of all relevant stakeholders in Tunisia. This increased knowledge about project activities on all levels and supported the objectives and approaches of the project.

The project adopted a strong component for capacity building of a wide range of stakeholders and beneficiaries. This was an effective strategy focusing on improving skills, increasing knowledge and building a strong advocacy platform for women's issues. By June 2017, the project's capacity building activities had reached 705 government officials and employers' and workers' representatives.

### **Efficiency**

The project encountered many challenges and difficulties in implementation resulting from the changes in the operating environment and the

context in which it was operating. Nonetheless, the project is commended for not experiencing significant delays in implementation or delivery of activities. All delays noted during the evaluation are normal and are normal in light of the context.

Project staff were committed and dedicated to the work which enabled the project to implement its activities and deliverables in a timely fashion. The cost and no-cost extensions were useful in allowing the project to continue its activities and follow-up on the various activities, however at certain times some staff members chose to leave the project (which is normal).

The project did not have a staff member dedicated to monitoring and evaluation. The project maintained a monitoring system for the results framework and reporting was conducted regularly and in a timely fashion with support from the programme unit in ILO Cairo office. According to the project team, this is because the M&E is an independent function, and as for similar ILO projects, this function is filled by the Programming Unit and the presence of a Senior Administrator who fulfilled this role during the implementation period. Most ILO projects do not have indeed an M & E except in case of large projects or if this is a precondition for the donor. In addition, the strong cooperation with the specialists have ensured the quality and pertinence of interventions. However, M&E is a core function of any project and should be independent of project management and implementation to allow for regular review and assessment of project interventions which was rather absent from this project.

The project team received adequate and efficient support from ILO specialists in Cairo. The project coordinated and communicated effectively and efficiently with the workers' and employers' specialists in Cairo. In addition, the project coordinated its activities with the Social Protection specialist in Cairo, ENTERPRISES specialist (who left in April 2018) and the OSH Specialist based in Algiers (ex. GBV work).

The project's partnership approaches were efficient and effective. The project partnered with a wide

range of stakeholders. Some are the typical ILO partners, and in some cases the project developed new partnerships with relevant stakeholders.

In Egypt, the project worked well and strengthened the partnership with social partners as previously discussed. In addition, the project started and nurtured a working relationship with NCW which would allow for further development of this partnership in the future. The project also worked with various CSOs and business-service providers such as the Industrial Modernization Center (IMC) to improve the business skills of newly established Cooperatives in Upper Egypt and the Red Sea.

In Tunisia, the project-maintained sound working relationships with the ILO social partners from government, workers and employers' associations. The project also worked with the women at the grass-root level by providing training and capacity development for women working in the medicinal and aromatic plants production.

### **Impact and Sustainability**

The final evaluation is a good opportunity to review project outcomes, achievements and potential for sustainability of results. The results of the Way Forward after the Revolution have been numerous especially at the strategic level. The project worked systematically with trade unions in Egypt and Tunisia to promote the development of a quota for women in the various bodies of each trade union.

In Egypt, and as a direct result of the project activities and interventions, during the general assembly of EDLC, the union has endorsed the establishment of a quota for women which will eventually lead to better representation of women inside the trade union. Furthermore, although ETUF did not adopt a quota, yet discussions with women members of ETUF reveal that as a direct result of the project they believe that they can play a more active role within the union. They explained that they have nominated themselves in the union elections and hope that they can play a much more pronounced role in the future including the lobbying for a women quota inside ETUF. In Tunisia, one of the biggest and most acclaimed outcome of the project has been the reform of the UGTT statutes which was supported by the project, and the introduction of a quota of 2 seats for women in the higher executive council which was adopted

at the general assembly of the UGTT in January 2017.

At the level of employers' organisations, the Way Forward after the Revolution improved the services offered by the associations in Egypt and Tunisia. In Egypt, the project supported the establishment of the Women and Business Unit within the FEI and the establishment of the Gender and HR Academy within the FEI. In Tunisia, the project supported significant changes within the CNFCE (creation of an academy for women entrepreneurs, training of businesswomen provided by the CNFCE through the Academy of Women Entrepreneurs).

The project invested many resources in building the capacities of different stakeholders on a variety of topics and issues. However, the outcomes of these capacity building efforts are not apparent in project documents. It is not clear to what extent has the membership in the cooperatives impacted the lives of women (financially and otherwise), it is also hard to establish what were the outcomes of the Gender and HR Academy in Egypt, the outcomes of the CNFCE supported academy in Tunisia, or how the labour inspectors have started to change their work approaches as a result of the training. This is not to suggest that these activities have not resulted in concrete outcomes, rather that the monitoring system of the project needs to regularly and systematically collect this data to indicate the impact of these interventions.

All interviewed stakeholders in the two countries expressed satisfaction with project interventions. Workers' and employers' association in both countries were satisfied with the communication and involvement of the project and requested additional support to ensure sustainability and continuation of activities developed through the project.

The Way Forward after the Revolution did not develop an exit strategy and/or a sustainability plan. This could be due to the fact that the project intended to design a second phase and as such believed that it might be pre-mature to develop an exit strategy while more activities are foreseen in the near future.

Nonetheless, there are many results that the project has supported or achieved that are likely to be sustained. These include the established women quotas in EDLC and UGTT which will lead to

increased representation of women within these two institutions. In addition, the improved research capacities and dissemination of ILO technical guidelines are likely to have a far-reaching effect on the outcomes of future research on gender and other topics in Egypt and Tunisia.

## Lessons Learned & Recommendations

**Good Practice 1:** Flexibility of implementation strategies leads to the ability of projects to meet its targets and at times overachieve. This requires the adequate development of relationships amongst the different stakeholders.

**Good practice 2:** Gender is an enabling topic that if and when used in a none-political way can serve as way to bring together conflicting partners. This enables the building of relations and trust amongst them and paves the way for tackling more contentious issues.

**Lesson Learned 1:** Monitoring and Evaluation is a core function of any project. The presence of a dedicated officer focusing on this function enables the regular management and adjustment of project interventions leading to more effective implementation strategies and approaches. Using times of change (cost and no cost extensions) as an opportunity to revise logical frameworks and results framework would allow projects to better present outcomes and achievements.

**Lesson Learned 2:** Multi-Country projects presents a myriad of opportunities for learning, capacity development and building of solidarity amongst like-minded institutions and individuals which could help advance the cause of women employment at the regional level. This opportunity should be capitalised upon in an innovative manner and ensure maximum outcome.

### Recommendations

**Recommendation 1:** It is recommended that the project management and M&E team uses a three levelled approach (Goal, objectives, outputs,) and develop appropriate indicators for each level to ensure an ease of project management and monitoring. It is a high priority recommendation

that Phase II of the project revises the results-framework for the project to ensure logic, coherence and accurate representation of project achievement as soon as possible. Additional funds may be allocated for a consultant to conduct a review of the logical framework. (*Project Management, High Priority, immediate implementation; Medium financial resources required*)

**Recommendation 2:** Multi-country implementation models are an excellent opportunity for exchange, learning and building solidarity around women's issues and labour rights. It is recommended that the project management and ILO offices capitalises on this opportunity by increasing exchanges and learning between Egypt and Tunisia through more structured study tours, internships and other innovative models. This is a high priority recommendation that will not add extra recourses and need to be considered over the life of the project. (*Project Management, ILO Offices; High Priority, Medium- and Long-Term implementation; Low financial resources implications*)

**Recommendation 3:** The project team in Tunisia should follow-up the work already conducted with the labour inspectors by providing follow-up training and TOT to the Ministry of Social Affairs in Tunisia. It would also be useful to support the ministry in revising its administrative forms and procedures to ensure the inclusion of gender specific indicators and increase the development of gender data. These activities should be reflected in the workplan of Phase II of the project and budgeted from within the capacity building activities already planned.

(*Project Team in Tunisia; Medium Priority, immediate implementation; Low financial resources required*)

**Recommendation 4:** The project team in Tunisia is advised to support the development of a general understanding and synthesize of violence against women in the workplace and consider the advocacy of integrating elements to address within the work of all social partners during the life of the project.

This is not likely to require additional resources just a reformulation of existing workplans. (*Project Team in Tunisia; Medium Priority, immediate implementation; Low financial resources required*)

**Recommendation 5:** The project team in Tunisia should continue to advocate for the adoption of maternity benefits during the life of the project through advocacy and lobbying to ensure the buy-in of all relevant stakeholders in Tunisia. This is not likely to require additional resources just a reformulation of existing workplans. (*Project Team in Tunisia; Medium Priority, immediate implementation; Low financial resources required*)

**Recommendation 6:** The project team in Egypt is advised to build stronger and more formal relationship with NCW to ensure consistency with national approaches during the life of the project. This is not likely to require additional resources just a reformulation of existing workplans. (*Project Team in Egypt, High Priority, Immediate to Medium-Term implementation, Low financial resources required*)

**Recommendation 7:** Provide support, through phase 2 or other ILO projects, to the cooperatives in Upper Egypt to ensure sustainability and continuity of intervention. This may require adjustment of budgets and coordination between the different ILO staff members working on similar issues. (*Project Team in Egypt, Medium Priority, Medium- and Long-term implementation, Medium financial resources required*)

**Recommendation 8:** The project team should strengthen and institutionalize the HR academy within FEI to ensure its continuity. This will require the team to dedicate time and resources to working with FEI. It is also recommended that a strategic plan for workers organizations in Egypt be developed and ensure that work plans are in place that lead to the implementation of this vision. (*Project Team in Egypt, Medium Priority, Medium- and Long-term implementation, Medium financial resources required*)

**Recommendation 9:** The ILO management in Cairo should increase the relevance of the multi-country model by increasing exchange and learning between the different countries. This should be adopted as a strategy for all multi-country or regional projects and adequate resources should be developed from the conceptualization phases of any project. (**ILO Management Team in Cairo, Medium Priority, Medium- and Long-term implementation, Medium financial resources required**)