





# Mongolia – MNG 176: Formal Employment is promoted for inclusive and diversified economic growth

## **QUICK FACTS**

**Countries:** Mongolia

Evaluation date: 29 June 2022

Evaluation type: External Evaluation timing: Final

Administrative Office: ILO Country Office – Beijing Technical Office: EMP/INWORK ACTEMP ACTRAV

Evaluation manager: Narendra Nadh Choudary, Bollepalli

**Evaluation consultant(s):** Svetlana Bronyuk

DC Symbol: MNG/18/01/RBS

Donor(s) & budget: Regular Budget Supplementary Account (RBSA), USD 764'200

Key Words: employment policies; youth employment; formal employment; collective bargaining <u>Use themes as provided in i-eval Discovery</u>





| BACKGROUND & CONTEXT                                |   |
|---|---|
| Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure | (This should cover the objectives, brief outline of intervention logic, strategy and main means of action; geographic coverage and management structure of project.)  |
| Present situation of the Project                    | (Key information for the reader about the current state of the project)  The project "Formal employment is promoted for inclusive and diversified economic growth in Mongolia" is a 24-months, USD 764'200 initiative, funded by Regular Budget Supplementary Account (RBSA) of the International Labour Organization (ILO).  The project aims at increased capacity of government, workers' and employers' organizations in Mongolia to accelerate formalizing employment in line with the ILO Recommendation No. 204 on Transition from the Informal to the Formal Economy.  Due to variety of reasons, for example, COVID-19 pandemic related lockdowns and restrictions and its effects and change of the Government, to align the project's timeline with development of CCA and UNSDCF for Mongolia, the project received two no-cost extensions until 31 December 2021.  |
| Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation        | Current evaluation exercise is an independent End-Term Evaluation of the project "Formal employment is promoted for inclusive and diversified economic growth in Mongolia". Purposes of the evaluation are for two folds. Firstly, the final evaluation serves the purpose of accountability to the donors and ILO constituents. Secondly, the evaluation findings and insights will contribute to internal learning within the ILO. The exercise is conducted in line with the ILO Evaluation Policy Guidelines ILO Policy Guidelines for results-based evaluation <sup>1</sup> and the UN Norms and Standards for Evaluation <sup>2</sup> . The evaluation scope covered the whole project period from the start on 1 January 2019 until the end of the Project, 31 December 2021. It encompassed the linkages of this RBSA project and its relevant and contribution to the achievement of MNG176 under DWCP Mongolia and to the related P&B outcomes and to the related SDGs. |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms 571339.pdf

<sup>2</sup> Norms and Standards for Evaluation (2016). URL: http://www.uneval.org/document/detail/1914





The evaluation integrated gender equality, disability inclusion and other non-discrimination issues as a cross-cutting concern throughout its methodology, analysis and deliverables. Gender concerns were addressed in accordance with the ILO Guidance note 4, "Integrating gender in monitoring and evaluation of projects". Finally, the evaluation paid special attention to how the Project is relevant to the ILO's Programme and policy frameworks at the national, regional and global levels, relevant Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), UNDAF and national sustainable development strategies and other relevant national development frameworks, including relevant sectoral policies and programmes.

The findings of the evaluations and its recommendations will be used by the ILO and its stakeholders to enhance organizational learning.

# Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation applied a mixed-method approach, with the main focus being on the qualitative techniques, including quantitative data obtained through the review of the project documents and reports and video materials produced by the Project. The primary data was collected directly from the stakeholders through individual and group interviews conducted with the stakeholders via virtual mode and through the focus group discussions conducted with the Project's beneficiaries. To validate the evaluation findings the workshop was held with the stakeholders including representatives of the tripartite constituents.

Project reports and documents as well as key policy papers and country strategic plans and research reports were analysed as secondary data sources. The evaluation applied the OECD/DAC evaluation criteria of relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and impact potential.

# MAIN FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS

The Project has been impacted greatly by the COVID-19 pandemic. The 24-months intervention with the budget of 764 400 USD faced







the crisis after 15th months of the implementation. In the first quarter of 2020, knowing that Mongolia would go in a strict lockdown, the Project's management made the decision to carry on with the planned activities in a virtual mode. The comprehensive training on dispute labour resolution system in the cooperation with ITC in Turin was specially designed in Mongolian language to be delivered through the online mode for the constituents in Mongolia. The project also supported the constituents by development of the specific materials to ensure safe working conditions during the health crisis.

Relevance and strategic fit: Strategic relevance of the project has been rated as high by all key stakeholders and constituents who confirmed great extent of the facilitated social dialogue across strategic directions of the project. The project is well-aligned with countries' national priorities, strategies and plans: the Mongolia Sustainable Development Vision 2050, the ILO's strategy as well as the SDGs 8 and 16.

**Coherence:** The Project demonstrated high level of coherence with the tripartite constituents, UN and youth-led initiatives to address emerging concerns and challenges faced by workers and economic units operating in the informal economy. Gender Equality and Human Rights approach were addressed by the project in synergy with various range of stakeholders to achieve SDGs 8 and 16.

Validity of Design: The Project's design is based on the Results Based Management approach (RBM) even though the Results Framework has not been developed in the conventional logframe. The indicators are appropriate in most cases and aligned with the ILO P&B Outcomes and relevant targets. Project's design failed to inform the Theory of Change on Risks and Assumptions. Absence of the baseline data limited the evaluability of the Project in relation to the progress of the targets set.

**Effectiveness:** The Project provided technical support and resources to support the organizations of workers and employers'







organizations to implement improved and effective services to the economic units and workers operating in the informal economy to facilitate their formalization. The technical support provided to tripartite constituents including the government resulted in the development and adoption of two major policies —National Action Plan on OSH and new Labour law which extend protection of workers and economic units working in informal economy. The RBSA intervention has not succeeded in its advocating efforts on the part of the government to ratify the remaining governance conventions related to labour inspection, in particular C81 and C129. In terms of assessing the Project's effectiveness based on the ILO corporate indicators RBSA project achieved several indicators under MNG 176, MNG 801, MNG 802.

Efficiency of resource use: The project has been efficient in provision of the direct technical assistance to the government and tripartite constituents in the development and adoption of the key policy documents – the revised Labour Law and National Action Plan on OSH. It has also successfully pulled the resources to support the constituents in raising awareness of the population about social insurance, with high focus on workers in informal economy, and promoting new labour law through targeted campaigns and outreach services at relevant low cost. Major research products were completed by the end of the Project failing to be used and applied during the course of the Project's implementation timeframe.

Impact orientation: The Project's implementation impacted new labour law of Mongolia through the change of the scope of the law which now is extended to the informal workers. The latter have also now access to the labour dispute settlement system. The knowledge gained during this RBSA project on informal economy was used to develop 10-year Social Development targeted Policy, which is one of the seven 10-year development policies until 2030. The RBSA Project strengthened social dialogue and promoted among youth benefits of the membership in the trade unions and the collective bargaining.







Young men and women supported by the trade unions improved their working conditions strengthened voice in the labour market. **Project's sustainability:** The results of the RBSA project have the potential to impact lives of men and women working in the informal economy through the contribution the SDG's targets 8.3, 8.5 and 8.8. The social partners adopted relevant strategies and implemented actions plans contributing to SDG targets 8.3 and 8.5.

The developed and adopted National Action Plan on OSH and tripartite committee on OSH will be able to contribute to safer working environment for men and women, including herders, working in the informal economy, provided that relevant action plans are adopted and implemented on the part of social partners as well. The Project achieved high ownership of the results demonstrated by the presence of the strategies and actions taken by the tripartite constituents to address challenges of workers and economic units operating in the informal economy

### RECOMMENDATIONS, LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

### Main recommendations

- **1. To the ILO National Coordinator.** To ensure that the ETE results are shared and discussed with the stakeholders.
- 2. To the CO-Beijing. To conduct consultations with tripartite constituents on feasibility of the development large-scale intervention aimed at addressing informality through the development of the state strategy with measurable indicators, an action plan and monitoring and evaluation plan
- To the CO-Beijing. To build on achieved results and support constituents in promoting new labour law through outreach services and dissemination of the developed materials at the nation-wide level
- **4. To the CO-Beijing.** To continue advocacy efforts in promoting ratification of the governance conventions C81 and C129
- **5. To the ILO-BKK, Programme Department.** To improve project design, data collection, reporting and monitoring performance of future RBSA interventions.





- 6. To the CO-Beijing and ILO Mongolia National Coordinator.
  To continue active promotion and dissemination of the knowledge products and tools developed by the project at high level events organized at the national and regional level
- 7. To the MLSP and RILSP. To improve data collection on informality by integrating specific questions in LFS and conducting regular periodic research followed the RILSP study to monitor the situation on informal economy in comparison with the baseline data collected in 2021
- 8. To the CO-Beijing and ILO Mongolia National Coordinator. To advocate ratification of C190 - Violence and Harassment Convention, 2019 (No. 190) among the ILO constituents in Mongolia

# Main lessons learned and good practices

#### **Lessons learnt:**

- The nation-wide research on informality driven by the state research institution guided by the technical expertise on the part of the ILO is a lengthy exercise challenged by the different approaches and communication but worthy of these efforts as it builds capacity of the national research institutions, generates ownership of the research and enhances potential for replicability of similar research by the state;
- 2. Strategies on tackling informality developed by the social partners supported by the focused interventions resulted in raised capacity to address issues of informality and demonstrated commitment to implement the strategies at the nation-wide level.

#### **Emerging good practices:**

1. The MLSP developed online training on OSH for microentrepreneurs adapted for persons with disabilities to be studied any time, at self-paced mode, at any location





- 2. The GASInsurance conducted awareness raising campaigns for wide population through the series of videos explaining benefits of social insurance
- 3. The Decent Work for Youth Network developed awarenessraising campaign to promote benefits of the new labour law for youth based on typical characters representing young men and women facing challenges in the labour market including young persons with disabilities.