



Evaluation Summary



International
Labour
Office

Evaluation
Office

Final Independent Clustered Evaluation of Policy Outcome 8 (Protecting workers from unacceptable forms of work) and Cross-cutting policy driver on Gender equality and non-discrimination

SIDA-ILO Partnership Programme - Phase I, 2018-2019

Quick Facts

Countries: *Global, Bolivia, Guatemala, Cameroun, Bangladesh*

Evaluation Date: *March 2020*

Evaluation Mode: *Final Independent Clustered*

Administrative Office: *WORKQUALITY; DWT/CO-Lima; DWT/CO-San José; DWT/CO-Yaounde; CO-Dhaka; GED*

Technical Office: *Conditions of Work and Equality Department (WORKQUALITY), Gender, Equality and Diversity Branch (GED)*

Evaluation Manager: *Nita Neupane and Patricia Vidal*

Evaluation Consultant(s): *Sadie Xinxin Yang and Esther Rouleau*

Project End: *March 2020*

Project Code: *GLO/18/61/SWE, GLO/18/63/SWE, BOL/18/50/SWE, GTM/18/51/SWE, CMR/18/51/SWE, BGD/18/50/SWE and GLO/18/55/SWE*

Donor(s) & Budget: *SIDA (US2.3 million)*

Keywords: *Unacceptable Forms of Work, Gender Equality and Anti-discrimination*

Background & Context

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

The SIDA-ILO Partnership Programme (the SIPP, or the Programme) for 2018-21 is based on the objectives and principles shared between Sweden and the ILO, underpinned by a human rights-based approach and support for increased effectiveness and results-based management. Phase I of the Programme covered the period of 2018-19, aligned to ILO's P&B for 2018-19. For this phase, SIDA provided a contribution of SEK 87 million (USD 9.7 million), from which USD 1.5 million were allocated to Policy Outcome 8 Protecting workers from unacceptable forms of work (UFW) and USD 790,409 to cross-cutting policy driver (CCPD) on gender equality and non-discrimination (GEND).

Present Situation of the Project

The SIPP supported a portfolio of integrated interventions at country and global levels under Outcome 8 and CCPD on GEND. At the country level, the SIPP supported initiatives in Bangladesh, Bolivia, Guatemala, and Cameroon. These initiatives aimed to strengthen the protection of workers from indigenous communities, with a focus on indigenous women in female-dominated sectors and occupations (i.e. domestic work in Cameroon and Guatemala, and tea leaves picking in tea plantations in Bangladesh), in the urban informal economy (in

Bangladesh), and in traditionally male-dominated sectors (construction in Bolivia). At the global level, the SIPP mainly supported the operationalization of the Equal Pay International Coalition (EPIC), the promotion of the Violence and Harassment Convention 2019 (No.190), and work in the care economy.

Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation

This evaluation focuses on cluster interventions under Policy Outcome 8 and on the CCPD on GEND, particularly in consideration of the close alignment between their respective strategies and the close synergies between these two work streams. The evaluation covers the period from January 2018 to February 2020 to create an accurate and comprehensive picture of the SIPP's context and development. It has a dual-purpose: accountability and organizational learning. It is expected to examine the links between various country projects and global components. The primary users of this evaluation are: SIDA as the project donor, the ILO as executor of the project, project stakeholders, particularly the ILO's tripartite constituents, and other project partners.

Methodology of evaluation

The evaluation applies a theory-based approach and follows the Development Assistance Committee criteria of relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, and evidence of impact and sustainability of contributions made through Programme support. The evaluation team used a combination of qualitative and quantitative methodologies to collect data. The following activities were carried out: extensive document review, field visits to Bangladesh and Cameroon, key informant interviews with 66 stakeholders, two focus group discussions, and the distribution of surveys to participants in CCPD on GEND activities.

This evaluation faced the following challenges: short timeframe and unavailability of data, coincidence with the submission of the SIPP annual report, and the outbreak of Covid-19. In spite of all these challenges, the evaluation team still received strong support from both EVAL and the operational team at the ILO.

Main Findings & Conclusions

Relevance. The design of SIPP interventions has been closely aligned with the strategy of Outcome 8 and CCPD on GEND set in the ILO P&B 2018-19. Its interventions have focused on sectors and occupations in which women and workers from disadvantaged communities are predominantly employed, paying specific attention to indigenous workers and migrant workers who are most vulnerable to discriminatory employment practices and exploitative working conditions. The underlying country selection logic was not only to address the needs of target beneficiaries but also to address the root causes of UFW and GEND as development challenges. The SIPP interventions have been strongly relevant to the national development plan, UNDAF and SDG of the project countries. They have also contributed to the ratification and implementation of specific ILO conventions aimed at promoting employment creation, social protection, gender equality and social dialogue at the country level.

Design and Coherence. Knowledge creation and sharing was identified as a strategic focus of SIPP 2018-19. Horizontally, the SIPP interventions were anchored in strictly selected countries and sectors. It has further encouraged and facilitated cross-fertilization of ideas among different countries to allow for learning to continue beyond project-specific contexts. Vertically, the SIPP was designed from the onset to build a strong link between the global products and CPOs.

The SIPP resources allocated to each CPO was no more than US\$230,000. To address this financial restraint, the SIPP 2018-19 formed various synergies with existing ILO funding and interventions in order to leverage multiple resources and elevate the collective impact to a new level, particularly in the implementation of Global Products. The SIPP activities were closely aligned with those that would be supported under the ILO's regular budget priorities through RB and RBTC. This funding mechanism allowed for diversification of resources and minimized the risk of dependence on single-source funding, while broadening the coverage or in-depth of the interventions.

Gender dimension and non-discrimination considerations were important factors in selecting target sectors, in determining beneficiary groups of workers in each country project, and in designing the global products of the SIPP. A main target group of the SIPP was indigenous and tribal women, who according to a recent ILO study, are at the bottom in terms of socio-economic indicators. The programming approach and budget allocation at the country level was more fund-driven than need-driven in some cases. This has resulted in failure to meet the national priorities in Cameroon and the dispersion of limited resources in Bangladesh.

Effectiveness. According to the ToC, the SIPP's achievement can be best presented by its contribution to the indicator of Outcome 8.

Contribution to the development or revision of laws and/or policies to protect women and men workers from UFW. The SIPP provided training to constituents on national labour legislation and relevant international instruments, and advocated for the ratification of relevant ILO conventions. In Cameroon there was progress in preparing bills regulating wages and hours of work, and also in protecting domestic workers from violence and harassment. Bolivia adopted a legislation granting compulsory accident insurance to women and men workers in construction, while in Bangladesh, working conditions were enhanced for tea plantation workers, including women workers, through a collective agreement. At the global level, in June 2019, the Standard-Setting Committee on Violence and Harassment in the World of Work adopted the Violence and Harassment Convention 2019 (No. 190) and its accompanying Recommendation (No. 206), the first international labour standards on violence and harassment in the world of work. Pre- and post-Convention No.190 legal reviews and tripartite consultations supported the standard setting process and the promotion of the Convention.

Contribution to strengthening constituents' institutional capacities to protect workers from UFW, especially those in vulnerable situations. The Programme interventions aimed to enhance the capacity of constituents to apply employment

and labour law provisions, increase their knowledge of the challenges faced by indigenous men and women at work, and improve knowledge dissemination so as to enable key stakeholders to influence change. All four project countries have implemented activities under this outcome area, as discussed in different sections of this report. Worker's organizations and women workers consulted by the evaluation explained that the workshops conducted by the ILO have helped women workers to better understand and defend their labour rights in sectors where these rights are often not respected.

Contribution to developing partnerships to protect workers. The SIPP supported the creation of coalitions and platforms mandated to protect workers from UFW. It sought to do so by supporting the conduct of activities such as the launch of public campaigns at national events, training to strengthen the leadership skills of indigenous women workers, and capacity building workshops to strengthen the processes and mechanisms of organizations that defend the rights of vulnerable workers. Partnerships, sometimes involving the media, have also helped amplify the outreach and better tailor awareness-raising efforts to protect the rights of domestic workers (Guatemala and Cameroon). At the global level, the Programme contributed to the establishment of several partnerships, most notably the operationalization of the EPIC and its support of Alliance 8.7.

Measured by the ToC, the SIPP has also extensively contributed to consolidation and wide promotion of the ILO centenary Women at Work Initiative under the CCPD on GEND by reinforcing the data and evidence-based knowledge that guide policy action for the future of women at work, at the global, regional, and country levels. Firstly, the Programme has contributed to raising the profile of the issue related to equal pay for work of equal value at the international level through the EPIC. Interventions in this area have focused on raising awareness, building capacity, sharing knowledge, and embracing innovation and scaling up initiatives.

Secondly, in the area of providing better protection for women in the care sector, the Programme was essential to generate a dialogue at the global level on the importance of maternity protection and the need to extend such protection to workers in the informal economy. As a result, a revived attention to Convention No. 156 on Workers with Family Responsibilities and Convention No. 183 on maternity protection has been translated into actions at the country level. Finally, the Programme was of pivotal importance for the adoption of the ILO Violence and Harassment Convention and its accompanying Recommendation through amending legislation, supporting social dialogue, producing and promoting technical briefs and awareness-raising materials, and supporting legal reviews and tripartite consultations.

Through these interventions, the SIPP has developed the ILO constituents' capacity to influence regional and national dialogues on gender equality in the world of work and capitalized on partnerships with other ILO departments, UN agencies, regional commissions, and active community-based organizations. In particular, the SIPP has been instrumental to the advocacy for the ratification and implementation of international labour standards, in particular those specifically related to gender equality and non-discrimination, i.e. Convention No. 100, Recommendation No. 090, Convention No.111, Recommendation No.111, Convention No. 156, Recommendation No. 165, Convention No. 183, Recommendation No.191, Convention No.189, Recommendation No. 201, Convention No.190, and Recommendation No. 206.

Efficiency. The SIPP interventions were conceived as activities closely connected with the mainstream agenda of the organization. This programming approach enabled the SIPP to secure support from the ILO's human resources, financed by the regular budget. At the country level, efficient use of human resources is further evidenced by the fact that the implementation of the SIPP involved ILO regular staff as technical backstopping, such as gender specialists, ILS and

labour law specialists, and wage specialists. In spite of these efforts, lack of human resources specifically at the country level was identified as a serious parameter that limited Programme achievements. The overall level of development and capacity of recipient countries also introduced limitations to the efficient use of resources.

In both Bangladesh and Bolivia, the SIPP interventions were complementary with existing development cooperation projects, and resulting in economies of scale. Coordination with other development partners is less evidenced in Cameroon. At global level, partnership with the European Commission, UN Women, UNICEF, WHO and the International Leave Policy Network in the area of maternity protection, and with Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing in the area of informality have been important to raise the profile of these issues at global level. Moreover, the interventions under global products and country interventions have reinforced each other, as can be shown in the work related to the care economy, indigenous women, and the EPIC knowledge platform.

Compared with many traditional development cooperation projects, the reporting requirements under the SIPP were very light. As the progress was only reported annually and did not require detailed analysis of performance, problems or issues impairing the project's performance, these standard annual reports themselves can only provide limited information on any required adjustments, necessary adaptations, and measurements of results.

Impact and sustainability. The interventions are well integrated into the mainstream agenda of the ILO that is carried out under the ILO regular budget. At the institutional level, long-term impact has been well considered and articulated into SIPP design, implementation, and the follow-up actions. At the country level, using relevant ILS as the guiding framework to shape the work on the ground also generated long-term impact on improving the working and living conditions of the target beneficiary groups of the SIPP. Learning from previous lessons, the Programme has made an

effort to identify the root causes of UFW and discrimination, as shown by various research and knowledge outputs. However, measurement and demonstration of the expected impact is still insufficient. This is caused by several factors. Firstly, the resources available under the SIPP was limited and prioritized to implementation rather than monitoring and reporting. Secondly, as many interventions were co-financed by the SIPP and other resources, sometimes, isolating the analysis of the SIPP's contribution to ILO-specific, institutional-level impact would be unrealistic and not comprehensive. That being said, certain improvement can still be made, such as collecting sex-disaggregated data, generating in-depth analytical reports reflecting the achievement of major regional and global interventions, as well as conducting follow-ups to monitor intermediate- and long-term changes as a result of these interventions. Lastly, the donor and the ILO should conduct open discussion on this issue in order to set reasonable expectations and devise practical and mutually agreeable tools to address this shortcoming.

In spite of all the above-mentioned achievements, the Partnership Programme has encountered various **internal and external challenges**, which threaten its long-term sustainability and impact. The risks associated with the overreliance on a single source of funding was identified and addressed during carrying out the global products of GLO247 and GLO249. Many interventions were co-funded by the SIPP and the regular budget at the ILO, such as RB and RBTC. This practice has effectively broadened and increased the depth of SIPP interventions, as well as enabled the ILO regular staff to build synergy between the SIPP and other ongoing endeavours in their respective portfolio related to UFW and GEND.

However, the programming approach and budget allocation at the country level was more fund-driven than need-driven in some cases. This has resulted in failure to meet the national priorities in Cameroon and the dispersion of limited resources in Bangladesh. The country offices have made an effort to build synergy between SIPP interventions and other development initiatives. On one hand, good practices have already emerged from projects

in Bolivia and Bangladesh. On the other hand however, this would not fundamentally solve the limitations caused by short-term funding, such as ensuring an authentic commitment from local partners. Recruitment and retention of staff is another ensuing challenge at the country level, as short-term positions could not motivate long-term career commitment, and subsequently jeopardize the institutional knowledge and implementation capacity of country offices.

Among the external factors that negatively affected the achievement of the Programme's results, limited local capacity and political instability were the two major issues. The former has been observed in most project countries, particularly from unions and beneficiary work groups. This demonstrates that capacity building interventions need to be long-term and integrated into the ILO's DWCPs rather than in ad-hoc projects. In both Bolivia and Cameroon, political instability and frequent turnover among government representatives has hindered the achievement of outcome level results, especially in law and policy development, while longer-term support is needed to continue the advocacy process among newer administration to ensure the approval of draft laws and regulations.

Recommendations

Recommendation 1. Strengthen the engagement with ILO country offices

- A clear link should be built between the global agenda and the country agenda in order to strategically prioritize the agenda items and streamline the actions.
- Country needs and priorities should be fully taken into account when selecting project countries.
- ILO country level capacity to implement SIPP interventions should be further strengthened in order to achieve an optimal level of impact.

Recommendation 2. Build coherent monitoring and reporting systems to better appreciate the impact of the SIPP

- To bridge monitoring and reporting gaps, indicators for both CPOs and global products

should focus on the outcome level, not the output level.

- A result-based M&E system should entail a shared database fed by the data gathered under different interventions by different ILO work streams.

Recommendation 3. Enhance internal coordination among different work streams at the ILO

- The ILO should also adjust its institutional coordination and reporting practices in order to better detect and analyze the potential impact of the SIPP interventions.
- The ILO should give proper training on the interactions between UFW, gender, ethnicity, and other relevant factors to its staff and consultants involved in delivering results through an intersectoral approach.

Recommendation 4. Mainstream new ILS and other instruments into the ILO's country programmes in order to consolidate and accelerate changes

- The new phase of the SIPP should further strengthen partnership with various formal and informal networks to share knowledge and advocate for new norms and standards related to UFW and GEND.
- There is also a need and an opportunity to integrate these new norms and standards into the ILO's country programme in some ILO member states, where the commitment and capacity is there.